



**ISAI** International Symposium of  
Journal Antropologi Indonesia

THE 7TH INTERNATIONAL  
SYMPOSIUM OF JOURNAL ANTROPOLOGI INDONESIA

Fakultas Ilmu Budaya, Universitas Gadjah Mada, 23-26 Juli 2019

**PROCEEDINGS**

# **The Use and Abuse of Diversity** Anthropological Responses to the Threat of Disintegration



Proceedings the 7th International Symposium of Journal Antropologi Indonesia

**Journal Antropologi Indonesia**  
Department of Antropologi  
Faculty of Social and Political Sciences  
Building B Floor 1 Universitas Indonesia  
Depok 02178881032  
[journal.ui.ac.id/jai](http://journal.ui.ac.id/jai) - [journal,ai@gmail.com](mailto:journal,ai@gmail.com)

ISBN 978-602-52482-6-9



9 786025 248269

ISBN 978-602-52482-6-9



The 7th International Symposium of  
Journal Antropologi Indonesia  
Proceedings

Faculty of Cultural Sciences  
Universitas Gadjah Mada  
Yogyakarta, 23-26 July 2019

Dave Lumenta & Bambang Hidayana  
(Editors)

Published by:



Departemen Antropologi Universitas Indonesia  
2020



The 7<sup>th</sup> International Symposium of Journal Antropologi Indonesia Proceedings

Editors : Dave Lumenta & Bambang Hidayana  
Publisher : Departemen Antropologi Universitas Indonesia  
Cover : Arief Wicaksono  
Layout : Raymond Michael Menot  
ISBN No. : 978-602-52482-6-9

ISBN 978-602-52482-6-9





## Table of Contents

Opening Remarks .....	13
Rector of Universitas Indonesia .....	13
Rector of Universitas Gadjah Mada .....	14
Sambutan Kehormatan .....	15
Simposium Internasional Jurnal Antropologi Indonesia dan Festival Adat-Istiadat dan Seni Budaya .....	15
The Use and Abuse of Diversity: Anthropological Responses to the Threat of Disintegration .....	18
<b>THE SYMPOSIUM RESUME .....</b>	<b>19</b>
Context of the Symposium .....	19
Some points of Discussions .....	19
Methodological and Theoretical Reflections .....	20
Practical and Policies Implications .....	20
<b>THE COMMITTEES .....</b>	<b>21</b>
Steering Committee .....	21
Scientific Committee/Panel Coordinators .....	21
Organizing Committee .....	22
The Panels .....	24
Dealing with Diversity in (Digital) Urban Contexts: From Concepts to Engagement .....	26
Coordinators: Dayana Lengauer (Austrian Academy of Sciences) .....	26
Chair: Martin Slama (Austrian Academy of Sciences) .....	26
Bandung's School of Peace: An Alternative Space Addressing Interfaith and Minority Groups Through Dialogue and Cooperation .....	26
LISMA: Forming Political Bonds Through Social Media Among Muslim Women in Yogyakarta 27	
Fostering Inter-Faith Engagement through Civic Crowdfunding in Contemporary Indonesia... 27	



Mediating Piety: Hadhrami Religious Authority in a Changing Indonesia .....	28
Coordinators: Ismail Fajrie Alatas (New York University) & Martin Slama (Austrian Academy of Sciences) .....	28
Mediating Authority: A Hadrami Sufi Shaykh in Multiple Media.....	28
Young Indonesian Hadhramis and the Quest for Religious Authority .....	29
Facing New Models of Islamic Authority: On the (Un)Popularity of Hadhrami Preachers in Indonesia.....	29
Ziarah Kubra: Reconnecting The Global Sufism, and Revitalize the local Islamic Identity .....	30
Disintegration from within? Marginal Groups and the failure of Indonesia as a Common Project .....	30
Coordinators: Greg Acciaioli (The University of Western Australia) & Riwanto Tirtosudarmo (Indonesian Institute of Sciences/LIPI) .....	30
A Nation in Contradiction .....	31
The Dilemmas and Marginalization of Female Porters in Pabean Surabaya Market .....	35
Analysis of Factors Causing Poverty in Fishing Community in Pajala Village, Maginti Sub-District, West Muna Regency.....	38
The Potential of Disintegration and the Spirit of Nationalism for People of Natuna Regency...40	
Development as Exclusion, its Impacts and Community Responses: The Orang Rimba and the Orang Baduy Compared.....	45
How Development and Conservation Interventions May Both Exacerbate and Mitigate Marginality: Shifting Power Relations on the Lindu Plain, Central Sulawesi .....	46
Role of Digital Ethnography in Indonesian Online Society .....	51
Coordinator: Anggun Susilo (Universitas Brawijaya) .....	51
ISIS and "Virtual Caliphate": An Anthropological Analysis on the Rise of Cyber Terrorism in Indonesia.....	51
"Part of the Spectacle" Political Buzzers and the Performing of Digital Propaganda.....	59
Indonesian Youth and Social Media: A Study About Political Preferences in Digital Era .....	63
Push Rank and Keyboard Warrior: Violence, Luddism, and Free-Labour of Contemporary Indonesian Gaming Culture .....	65
Dependence and Displacement .....	66



Coordinators: Tony Rudyansjah (Universitas Indonesia) & Clare Cameron (University of California, San Francisco).....	66
Sejit (God’s Birthday Ceremony) A Form of Cultural Hybridity in the Ceremonies .....	67
"Dependence and Displacement”: Case of Orang Kayo Pulau in Jayapura City.....	69
Blasphemy: Shrinking Religious Freedom and Tolerance in Indonesia.....	70
Amphibious Life and the Political Economy of Moving Earth .....	70
The Use and Abuse of Drinking Culture .....	71
Coordinator: Raymond Michael Menot (Universitas Indonesia) .....	71
Tradition of Drinking Arak .....	71
The Cultural Value of Minahasa People About Liquor "CAP TIKUS" .....	72
The Water of Words: The Conviviality of Drinking and Reciting on Rote .....	72
Alcohol Lifestyle as Anti-Structural Manifestation in the Sentani Papua Community.....	74
Beverage of the Spirits .....	74
You Give Love a Bad Name: The degraded meaning of baram among the Dayak of Central Kalimantan.....	77
Relation Between Alcohol Misuse and Crime .....	78
Moral Politics of Nationhood: Examining The Politics of Diversity and The Management of Unity .....	80
Coordinators: Ratna Saptari (Leiden University), Anton Novenanto (Universitas Brawijaya), & Mia Sisawati (Universitas Indonesia) .....	80
Reframing and Demonizing: Moral Politics of the Powerless .....	81
Politics of Othering: Post-Authoritarian State`s Repression on Critical Literacy Activism.....	84
Traveling with Kebaya: Reading Women, Reading Indonesia.....	84
Politics of Belonging and Strategies of Perseverance: Indonesian Political Exiles and Migrant Workers Within and Beyond the Nation-State .....	87
Ancestor Worship at the Tropenmuseum: An Investigation into the Repatriation of West Papuan Cultural Heritage .....	88
Clash within ‘Civilization’: Understanding Politic of Diversity in Indonesia by Tracing Genealogy of an Epistemic Community .....	89



The Dynamics of Recognition of the Rights of Indigenous Peoples in Trap of Colonial Law Legacies and Social Change.....	101
Religious Freedom and The Restriction to Imply Religious Freedom .....	101
Criminalization of Agrarian and Environmental Movement activist in the post new order era .....	102
The Dynamic of the Interaction between the Modern Medical System and the Traditional Medical System: Finding a Way for Establishing a Harmonious Collaboration of the Two Systems for the Social Justice for the People .....	103
Coordinators: Meutia F. Hatta, Rhino Ariefiansyah & Dea Rifia Bella (Universitas Indonesia)	103
Dukuns and Doctors - Finding Ways of Working Together .....	103
Medical Pluralisms Practice to Treat Non-Communicable Diseases in Rural and Sub-urban Villages of West Java.....	107
The Dynamics of Abortion Treatment as an Effort to Harmonization between the Modern Medical System and the Traditional Medical System.....	110
Sando Pea: Between Tradition and Health Challenge among Kaluppini Indigenous People ...	115
Traditional Knowledge on Health and Fulfillment of Reproduction Health Rights of Bawean Women.....	123
An Ethnographic Study on Maternal & Newborn Health in Dayak Siang-Murung Community: Skilled Midwives' Working Spirit of 'Tira Tangka Balang' and their Collaboration with Traditional Midwives .....	124
Disturbed by Ghosts: Behind the Explanations and Narratives on One's Continual Encounter with Supernatural Beings.....	130
Behind The Secret Of "Bungkus Daun Tiga Jari": Ethnography research in Irarutu community, West Papua .....	131
Promotion and Prevention TB with Community participation in Muaro Bungo, Jambi, Indonesia.....	133
Three Spirit Permeates the Balian .....	133
Anthropology and The Recentralization of Natural Resource Policies.....	134
Coordinators: Semiarto Aji Purwanto (Universitas Indonesia), Pinky Saptandari (Universitas Airlangga), & Pawennari Hijjang (Universitas Hasanuddin).....	134
Women in Perhutani Forest: Ethnography Study in Palintang Hamlet, Cipanjalu Village, Cilenggang Sub-District, Bandung, West Java.....	135



Improving Community-based Coastal Management in Papua: Searching for sustainable and socially just natural resource governance in Indonesia's changing legal context.....	135
Impact of Mangrove Forest Logging to the Tobati Livelihood System in Teluk Youtefa, Jayapura Selatan District, Jayapura City, Papua .....	136
Forty Years of Swidden Cultivation in Sahu, Eastern Indonesia .....	138
Mining Decentralization and Recentralization: Musing on the Construction of Nusa Tenggara Timur as a Province .....	141
The Chance for Improvement of Rural Women Human Resource and Leadership Quality by Means of Women School.....	142
Post formalization and recentralization of mining policies: The case of mining regulations and their impacts in Central Kalimantan, Indonesia .....	142
Subjectivity and Forest Fires Governance in Indonesia: The Making of Environmental Inmates? .....	143
Protected Assumption: Care for Culture Behind the Ecological Vocational Community of the Mountain Community in Allakuang Village .....	144
Structuring Diversity: Values, Political-Economic Order and Inter-Societal Relations in an Indonesian Archipelago .....	144
Coordinators: Imam Ardhianto (Universitas Indonesia) & Geger Riyanto (Heidelberg University).....	144
Palm Oil Tree Fetish: A Plantation God in the Process of Construction in West Kalimantan ..	145
Pagatan Woven Textile: The Inheritance of Malay Cultures into The Banjarmasin Court.....	145
Assimilating Stranger, Exemplifying Value: The Realization of Ideal Cultural Representation and Upland-lowland Relationship in North Seram, Eastern Indonesia .....	146
Adaptation Both Side: When the <i>Gereja Kristen Jawa (GKJ)</i> Multiculturalize itself .....	146
Competitive Hospitality: Adat (Custom), Religion and Ecological Degradation in a Periphery Indonesia .....	147
The Parallel and Sequential Emergence of Hierarchy and Egalitarian Socio-Religious Formation: Intra/Inter Denominational Relation among Christian Kenyah in Central Borneo .....	149
Caring Diversity in the City of Jakarta.....	149
Processing Banana to Cross State Border: Economic Development of the Community in the Border of North Kalimantan.....	154
The development of identity in Javanese-white Australian families living in Australia.....	155





Modernity and Cultural Values in Minahasans Society .....	163
The State of Anthropology of Indonesian Education: Critical Reflections on Theories and Methods .....	164
Coordinators: Jessica Peng (University of Pennsylvania), Jenny Zhang (University of California, Berkeley), & Askuri Ibn Chamim (Indonesian Consortium for Religious Studies) .....	164
The Decline of Lecturers' Critical Consciousness under Neo-Liberal and New Managerialism Regime in Campus.....	164
Closing the Gap: Educating Muslim Girls to Bring About Social Change- lessons Learnt from Indonesia.....	166
Literacy in Development Discourse and Practice.....	167
The Pedagogical Labor of "Development from the Margins": Education, Labor, and Infrastructures in Indonesia .....	170
An Ethnographic and Linguistic analysis of Science Education in Islamic Schools in three Javanese regencies: a preliminary report .....	173
Learning (to use) the languages of being youths and becoming adults: Reflections on research in vocational high schools in Central Java.....	174
State education and the funnel effect: Changing dynamics in gamelan music learning.....	178
Methodological Dilemma on Studying Diversity .....	182
Coordinators: Elan Lazuardi (UNSW Sydney), Des Christy (Radboud University), & Wahyu Kuncoro (Universität Zürich).....	182
Methodological Dilemma of Doing Fieldwork among Fishers in the UK .....	182
On How Not To Do an Autoethnography: Studying Changing Urban Infrastructure in Indonesia.....	183
Working at the Margin: Lone Wolf Anthropologist in Public Health .....	183
Research without Doubts: Doing Research in Welfare States .....	184
Methodological and Ethical Considerations of Digitally Based Cross-cultural Research.....	187
Decentralized Education in Indonesia: Spark of Hope from an Innovative District.....	196
"Who am I?": Methodological dilemma in the field of Transnational Islamic Movement.....	198
Collective Violence, Peace Building and Reconciliation: Anthropological Perspectives.....	199
Coordinators: Yustinus Tri Subagya (Universitas Sanata Dharma), Herry Yogaswara & Cahyo Pamungkas (Indonesian Institute of Sciences/LIPI) .....	199



Familial Terrorism: An Analysis on Familial Suicide Bombings in Surabaya 2018.....	199
Communal Violence as A Strategy of Local Communities to Resist the Extractive Mining Operations in Morowali, Central Sulawesi.....	211
Tracing the Root of Violence and Peace Building in Papua.....	211
Harmony in Diversity: Conflict Management in the Outer Island of Enggano, Bengkulu.....	215
Changing Times and Changing Patterns of Collective Violence in Sumba, NTT.....	219
Exit from Violence: Reconciliation and Peace Making in Indonesia.....	223
Rethinking the Politics of Difference in Indonesia: Ethnicity, Religion, Class Relations.....	223
Coordinators: Budi Hernawan (Driyarkara School of Philosophy), & Thung Ju Lan (Indonesian Institute of Sciences/LIPI).....	223
Unity in Which Diversity? Examining Class and Identity in Contemporary Indonesian Politics.....	224
In Fear of Purification in Representational Sense: Reshaping Political Preferences in Young Chinese Indonesians post-Ahok Era.....	227
Disintegration from Within and Open Indonesian Identity.....	228
Politics of Difference: Ethnicity and Social Class Within the Indonesian Middle Class in Digital Era.....	239
Host, Guest and Stranger: Exoticization and Exploitation at Tourism Indonesian Practice.....	240
Coordinators: Irfan Nugraha, Sundjaya, & Febrian (Universitas Indonesia).....	240
Host and Middle East Guest Interaction.....	241
Who Govern The Grave: The Contestation Between Government and Local Communities in Managing Religious Tourism Places.....	242
Dieng Culture Festival: Repackaging Local Traditions to Strengthen Tourism Image Destinations.....	244
<i>Lingko Lodok</i> Tourism Development in Manggarai, East Nusa Tenggara: Blessing or Curse... ..	244
Exoticization of Local & Global: Exploitation at West Java Tourism Practice.....	245
The Power of World Cultural Heritage: In between Hegemony and Conservation of Subak, Bali by UNESCO.....	253
Meaning of Sikka Ikat Weaving Motif in the Eyes of Young Weavers.....	256
Originality Revisited: <i>Rumah Adat</i> and Tourism Development by The State.....	257



Surfing the Ambivalences: Human-Waves Relationship in Mentawai’s Surf Tourism .....	260
This is us: Toward Tourism Imaginaries Construction in Siak and Singkawang .....	261
Oral Tradition in the Discourse of Ethnic, Race, and Religion Diversity .....	264
Coordinator: Pudentia Maria Parenti Suniarti (Asosiasi Tradisi Lisan), Ninuk Kleden & Sri Murni (Universitas Indonesia).....	264
The Expression and Emotions of Madurese as an Austronesian Language.....	265
Adat Narratives, Ritual and Community Civilization .....	271
The Preserve of Larungan Ritual in Suryabahari Vellage, Pakuhaji District, Tangerang Regency, Banten .....	271
Inculturation in Tensions between Tradition and Religion: Case Study of the Silek Tiger Case in Painan, West Sumatra.....	272
Oral Tradition: The Samin People’s Moral Dilemma on Wayang Art Performance.....	272
Madihin Preservation of Local Tradition and Politic.....	273
Dodengo as A Document of Memory .....	276
Safeguarding of Mak Yong as Shared Cultural Heritage .....	277
Narrative about <i>Jew</i> .....	277
The Betawi <i>Oncel-Ondel Phenomenon</i> : The Future and The Transforming Society of Jakarta	278
Sahibul Hikayat – Betawi Oral Tradition Capturing the Heart of the Multicultural Ethnics in Jakarta .....	280
On The Making of Commodities Under Category: Resource Exploitation.....	280
Coordinator: Rahardhika A. Utama & Perdana P. Roswaly (Northwestern University) .....	280
Atomization of Production and Workers' Fragmentation in Indonesia's Commodity Politics .	281
Making Money Through “Dompeng”: Small-scale Mining and Local Livelihood in Jambi.....	281
Guardian of Mother Earth: Shifting Ideas of Progress Among Small Farmers in North Kendeng .....	284
Into the Land: Bajo People at the Cultural Intersection .....	289
Coffee and Identity: Consuming Coffee, Building Identity, Maintaining Variety (Case Study in Palintang Community, Cipanjalu Village, Cilengkrang Sub-district, Bandung District, West Java) .....	292



Beyond Disciplinary Diversity and Debates in Parallel Universes: Anthropology and Political Science in Conversation.....	293
Coordinator: Gde Dwitya Arief Metera (Northwestern University), & Iqra Anugrah (New Mandala) .....	293
Patron-Client Relationship: Between Anthropology and Political Science .....	294
Straddling between Different Worlds: Navigating Diverse Fieldwork Modes .....	294
A Multistage Strategy for the Integration Ethnographic and Qualitative Methods in Anthropology and Political Science .....	295
Performative Acts in Indonesia’s Electoral Democracy.....	297
Governmental Practices in Indonesia: Non-Calculative Modality, State Power, and the (Im)Possibility of Politics.....	297
Coordinator: Hestu Prahara (University of Auckland), Sari Ratri & Sindhunata Hargyono (Northwestern University).....	297
Discussant: Jesse H. Grayman (University of Auckland).....	297
Corporate Governmentality and the Will to Accumulate: Anthropology of Corporation in the Lapindo Mudflow Disaster .....	298
The Conspicuous Face of Punishment: Spectatorship as a Mode of Governance in Public Caning in Aceh, Indonesia .....	306
From effective to affective brokers: Rethinking development brokers in the implementation of community development in Indonesia .....	309
Islamic difference and public religion in the bureaucratic era.....	312
Dialogical Politics: Gendered Subjectivities and Public Speaking in West Timor.....	313
“They Call It a Revolution”: Affect in Reproductive Governance and Health Politics in Indonesia .....	318
The Aesthetic Turn in Indonesian Border Governance: Border-Crossings Beautification, Infrastructural Violence, and Generative Ruin.....	322
Youth and Social Life of Chemicals.....	324
Coordinator: Nurul Ilmi Idrus (Universitas Hasanuddin) & Anita P. Hardon (University van Amsterdam).....	324
“Is It Necessary to Take Postinor Too?”: The Use of Postinor-2 by Indonesian Youths and The Imagination of Efficacious Contraceptive Method.....	325
Somadril, “Mainannya Perempuan” .....	325



“Fit on the Body, Fit for the Pocket”: Internal Code, Effect of Chemical Use, and Trial Practices among Youth in Maros, South Sulawesi .....326

*Sinte'*: Reasons, Self-Control, and Repentance .....327

Beauty Products and Social Existence.....327

Totality in Cosplaying .....328



## Opening Remarks

### Rector of Universitas Indonesia

Distinguished Speakers and Participants,

It is my privilege and great pleasure to welcome you all to the 7<sup>th</sup> International Symposium of Journal Antropologi Indonesia, and I would like to send our gratitude for all of your participation. I would like to say as well my appreciation to the many people who worked on planning and executing this symposium that you will see this week.

Ladies and gentlemen, International Symposium of Journal Antropologi Indonesia is perhaps one among many other symposia in Indonesia that has a long history. First initiated in 2000, with the title: *The Beginning of the 21st Century: Endorsing Regional Autonomy, Understanding Local Cultures, Strengthening National Integration*, it followed afterward another five symposiums that were being held in various location in Indonesia. The symposiums were covering national, regional, and global themes of interest and involved many international collaborators and as well as diverse disciplinary background. It addressed up-to-date issues and responding both theoretical and applied interests.

Today, we are witnessing the seventh symposium about to be started almost twenty years after its first launch. This year's conference recalling again one of the important remark on the first symposium titled: *National Integration*. Reflecting on the increasingly polarized and divisive Indonesian political campaign of 2014 and 2019 Presidential election, many anthropologists start to realize the urgency to discuss the threat to diversity and the predicament brought by the engineering of hatred and sectarianism in our political experience during the last decade. The general elections have already heightened socio-political tensions marked by heated debates on the national ideology, on rising socio-economic inequality and its consequences, as well as rising sectarianism that has already openly entered formal political processes. Many fear that these developments will lead to the 'disintegration' of the Indonesian nation-state project.

Ladies and gentlemen, Indonesia provides a comprehensive anthropological case of a highly diverse geographical, cultural and social formation that is hardly an ideal setting for nation-building. The symposium, in its 7<sup>th</sup> event, will be used as a momentum for reflection by the anthropological community to critically re-examine assumptions, concepts and theories as well as seeking academic engagements in response to the future of the Indonesian nation-state project. Besides reflecting national problems mentioned before, the symposium as well aim to disseminate and discuss contemporary research findings based on anthropological as well as multi-disciplinary studies undertaken in Indonesia in a comparative inter-local as well as inter-regional basis; to link local anthropological debates and scholarship to a wider international academic community.

Ladies and Gentlemen, Distinguished Participants of the Conference, please allow me now to wish you all the best for the next four days of this important gathering of social sciences scholars. I hope that you find this year's symposium welcoming, exciting and inspirational.

**Prof. Dr. Ir. Muhammad Anis, M.Met**  
Rector of the Universitas Indonesia



## OPENING REMARKS

### RECTOR OF UNIVERSITAS GADJAH MADA

Distinguished Speakers and Participants,

It is an honor for me to welcome you to the 7<sup>th</sup> International Symposium of Journal Antropologi Indonesia. Precisely 19 years after its first initiation, I am beyond happy to be a witness to this year's symposium in Yogyakarta. I would first like to send my gratitude to all the participants and speakers for your participations. I would also thank the many people who have put their best efforts into making this symposium happen.

Ladies and Gentlemen. Today, we can see how diversity in Indonesia resembles a two-edged sword. If handled injudiciously, diversity could be a reason for conflicts therefore it is considered as a threat to Indonesian national integration. However, if we see it wisely, diversity could be something that colors nation-building processes. It is this issue's relevance to Indonesia's social landscape that inspires this symposium' theme of "The Use and Abuse of Diversity: Anthropological Responses to the Threat of Disintegration".

The symposium serves as an agora for scholars, activists, as well as practitioners to exchange ideas about the threats and opportunities posed by our diversity from an anthropological perspective. It is also a great thing to see how anthropological discourse in the country has developed in many directions. The many papers about to be presented in this very symposium cover diverse issues both in rural as well as urban areas. It is with high hopes that this year's symposium could contribute and complement the ways to strengthen our bond as a nation.

Ladies and Gentlemen. Social sciences and anthropology in particular, might have often been overlooked in Indonesia's academic landscape as a discipline with a little contribution to national development. In reality, anthropology has contributed many things to understand our society. Anthropology's cultural sensitivity and in-depth approaches to society have enabled it to see phenomena around us in a thorough, non-judgemental way. In a diverse country like Indonesia, anthropology is therefore very much needed.

Ladies and Gentlemen. I think it is also worth mentioning that the organizing universities that make this symposium possible, UI and UGM, are two universities with huge significances in Indonesia's intellectual history and development. Founded in 1924 and 1949 respectively, UGM and UI have since becoming the sources of intellectuals and practitioners in various disciplines in the country, including in the discipline of Anthropology. Therefore, the collaboration between these two academic giants shows a synergy in the spirit of intellectualism that is worth recognizing.

Ladies and Gentlemen. This symposium is about to begin, please allow me to wish you all the very best of luck. I hope these four days of the symposium will leave you with a wonderful, inspiring, and enriching experience.

**Prof. Ir. Panut Mulyono, M.Eng., D.Eng., IPU, ASEAN Eng.**  
Rector of the Universitas Gadjah Mada



Gubernur

Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta

SAMBUTAN KEHORMATAN

SIMPOSIUM INTERNASIONAL JURNAL ANTROPOLOGI INDONESIA  
DAN FESTIVAL ADAT-ISTIADAT DAN SENI BUDAYA

Yogyakarta, 23 Juli 2019

Assalamu'alaikum wr. Wb.

Salam sejahtera bagi kita semua,

Yth. Direktur Jenderal Kebudayaan Kemendikbud RI,

Yth. Rektor UI bersama Rektor UGM,

Yth. Para Tamu Undangan, Pembicara Kunci, Pembicara Utama serta Peserta Simposium Internasional dan Penggiat Festival Seni Tradisi yang berbahagia,

ADALAH suatu kehormatan dipilihnya Yogyakarta sebagai ajang Simposium Internasional tentang Antropologi yang mempelajari keragaman manusia secara holistik dan trans-disiplin dalam tiga dimensi waktu.

Kajian tentang keberagaman ini dinilai penting di saat adanya tren yang ingin membentuk wajah dunia dengan identitas homogen yang terbawa oleh gelombang globalisasi budaya dan aliran Islam trans-nasional. Tren ini merupakan tantangan yang hendaknya bisa dijawab dari rangkuman hasil 21 tema Diskusi Panel Simposium ini.

Dalam hal ini, kajian *reflektif Antropologi* sebagai ilmu, dan *perspektif Antropologinya* merupakan pendekatan yang memungkinkan untuk menjawab tren dunia tersebut. Pertanyaannya: Bagaimana menginsersi pendekatan itu ke dalam Diskusi Panel yang memuat 21 tema yang *rigid* dan sudah melalui kajian sebelumnya.

Merefleksi masa lalu, Nusantara dikenal sebagai bangsa dengan tingkat peradaban yang maju. Kita telah berhasil membangun kejayaan dengan berlandaskan beragam nilai dan agama yang saling *berkontestasi*, dan akhirnya membentuk sintesa baru.

Pramoedya Ananta Toer dalam buku *Arus Balik*-nya memotret peradaban masa lalu, bahwa Nusantara adalah patron peradaban dunia selatan, "*Bawah Angin*", yang tak jarang melakukan penetrasi ke utara, ke "*Atas Angin*", yang kemudian surut, dan diabstraksikannya seperti ini:

*"Sekarang makin lama makin sedikit kapal-kapal Jawa berlayar ke utara, ke Atas Angin, ke Campa ataupun ke Tiongkok. Arus kapal dari selatan semakin tipis. Sebaliknya arus dari utara semakin deras, membawa barang-barang baru, pikiran-pikiran baru, agama baru"*





Kejayaan Nusantara mulai memudar seiring masuknya kolonialisme, dan meredupnya berkelanjutan. Kita sebagai bangsa, belum pernah lagi merasakan kebangkitan peradaban yang berbasis pengetahuan, kebudayaan dan tradisi sendiri. Sosiolog Emmanuel Subangun menamainya sebagai “evolusi terbalik”.

Mengutip hasil kajian dari Paul Bairoch yang membandingkan rata-rata kekayaan negara-negara Barat dengan negara-negara berkembang, kekalahan dunia ketiga berlangsung baru dalam 200 tahun terakhir. Menurutnya, dengan nilai tukar dolar tahun 1960, pendapatan per kapita negara-negara Barat pada 1800 sebesar USD 213 berbanding USD 200 di negara-negara berkembang. Bahkan, China telah melampaui Barat, mencapai USD 226.

Nusantara, Aceh sebagai contoh, seperti Anthony Reid dalam bukunya *Trade and the Problems of Royal Power in Aceh*, di abad ke-16 semasa Al Kahar, Aceh memiliki bandar-bandar besar, menguasai Selat Malaka, dan jalur perdagangan sampai ke Laut Merah. Bahkan Agustin de Beaulieu melukiskan rumah-rumah orang kaya Aceh dihiasi meriam di depan pintunya. Daerah-daerah Nusantara yang lain juga mengalami kemakmuran tinggi. Kawasan Indonesia Timur, pantai Timur Sumatera, dan pantai Utara Jawa adalah imperium perdagangan yang maju.

Lalu kemana lenyapnya kecemerlangan pendahulu kita itu? Soal masa kegelapan inilah, menurut hemat saya, yang harus terjawab dari kajian para antropolog kita.

Oleh sebab itu, Simposium Internasional ini adalah momentum yang tepat guna menemukan jawaban atas pertanyaan itu: Bagaimana cara bangsa Indonesia bisa memasuki masa kebangkitannya kembali. Hal-hal apa yang perlu dipersiapkan agar bisa menjadi alas pijak yang kokoh untuk meloncat jauh ke depan?

Dari pengalaman negara maju, tidak ada lompatan yang terlalu besar dalam tahap perkembangan teknologi. Lompatan besar, jika tidak berbasis *human capital* yang sarat ilmu, justru punya risiko tinggi dan bisa timbul *opportunity cost* yang besar.

Proses meniru di Jepang, Korea, dan Taiwan berjalan sukses, tetapi loncatan teknologi di Brazil tahun 1960-an justru menempatkannya dalam posisi *set back*. Padahal saat itu, dengan basis yang sesungguhnya sudah memadai, Brazil telah tergolong negara industri baru.

Bertolak dari fakta empirik itu, diharapkan setiap panel bisa disisipkan sub-tema tentang kebangkitan Indonesia! Yang sejatinya kita hanya bagaikan memutar sinema lama, *second run*. Sebuah film sejarah bangsa Indonesia yang sudah pernah kita putar sebelumnya!

Para Hadirin, Peserta Simposium yang saya hormati,

DENGAN harapan seperti itu, sejatinya saya ingin mengatakan, agar pengembangan ilmu yang ditanamkan di *hulu* dapat digunakan sebagai basis untuk memanen hasil manfaat di *hilir* bagi masyarakat. Menjadikannya spiralisasi pengetahuan yang berguna. Dalam ungkapan Jawa: “*Mipunani tumraping liyan*”. Ilmu tak hanya untuk membangun “*menara gading*”, atau ilmu bukan untuk ilmu semata, tetapi memiliki kegunaan bagi masyarakat.

Menurut John Dewey dalam *My Pedagogic Creed*, sesuatu yang penting harus juga terlihat kegunaannya. Pertanyaan “*what-is*” dalam dunia makna, harus diubah menjadi “*what-for*” dalam



dunia nyata. Teori hanyalah alat untuk bertindak, agar tidak terbelenggu dan *mandég* dalam teori itu sendiri.

Teori yang tepat adalah teori yang siap-kembang dan siap-guna, sebagai modal untuk bertindak. Implementasi nilai-nilai ilmu itu digambarkan sebagai gerak transformasi dari kategori tematis, berupa konsep, dan teori, menjadi kategori imperatif, berupa norma-norma, dan berlanjut menjadi kategori operatif, berupa praktik hidup. Bukankah *Sêrat Wédâtâmâ* telah menerakan dalam ungkapan: “*ngélmü iku kalakoné kanthi laku*”?

Sebagai penutup, saya mengajak seluruh Hadirin mengucapkan Bismillahhirahmannirahim, sebagai doa pembukaan Simposium Internasional Jurnal Anthropologi Indonesia dan Festival Adat-Istiadat dan Seni Budaya yang akan diresmikan bersama Dirjen Kebudayaan serta Rektor UI dan Rektor UGM dengan penanda bunyi-bunyian alat musik tradisional kita.

Semoga Tuhan Yang Maha Kuasa berkenan melimpahkan berkah dan rahmat-Nya, agar kedua kegiatan ini berlangsung lancar dalam penyelenggaraan dan memberi manfaat-hasilnya bagi masyarakat. Akhir kata, saya ucapkan: “Selamat dan semoga sukses!”

Sekian dan terima kasih.

Wassalamu’alaikum wr. Wb.

Yogyakarta, 23 Juli 2019

GUBERNUR

DAERAH ISTIMEWA YOGYAKARTA

**HAMENGGU BUWONO X**



## The Use and Abuse of Diversity: Anthropological Responses to the Threat of Disintegration

The year of 2019 will be an important time as it coincides with the political year, when Indonesia organizes general elections and the local and national parliament (DPR/DPRD) members. A year before the election, the socio-political atmosphere in Indonesia is marked with conversations on national ideology, a heated discussion of development and its outcomes, socioeconomic inequalities, and other political debates that are feared to bring Indonesia to a disintegration.

Since it will be the 7<sup>th</sup> event, the symposium will also be used as a momentum for reflection by the community of anthropology to test and provide concepts and theories as a contribution to the issue of national disintegration. Indonesia provides a comprehensive case of a nation's journey. Coming from an imagined community with different ethnic, cultural and religious backgrounds, unity becomes an important concept for this nation. In the course of history, the emphasis on unity has once made the state trapped in singular, centralized, and denial to diversity. During the sixth symposium, we have discussed how changes brought by *reformasi* have enable Indonesia to experience series of experiments to live in diversity. The expressions of various ethnic, religious, ideological, and religious symbols such as finding time to rise

The public discussion on the differences and tolerance of the differences takes place every day, both at the political or in the community elite level. We, for example, see how the expression of difference surfaces in the debate over a particular ethnic group. Local variants appear to be a new cultural identity that encourages the strengthening of different ethnic subgroups. Exploration in sexual expression has led us to the emergence of various groups with sexual orientation and preferences that are not just simply masculine and feminine. Similarly, in religious expression; some events show how religious life, keeping purity of religion, and obedience to full practice of religion have brought each group into exclusivity, even in the same religion. The availability of media and Internet network support has made the exposure of the expression of difference in the public sphere to be high; on the other hand, the media is not only an instrument but an active entity manipulating various issues for a particular interest.

The attempt to express the difference, and on the other hand, considers the difference as a necessity, at some point has resulted in the group's exclusivism to thicken and in turn implicate the disintegration of the nation. Some parties intentionally use the diversity as their strategic way to campaign and promote their different interests, while at the same time, neglect the right of others to stay different. Some expressions on the basis of religious, sexual preferences, ideological difference, and ethnicity have led to heaten up social and political life in current Indonesia. This time the Symposium will be specifically a proposal, discussion, and debate about the contribution of anthropology in analyzing and offering solutions to the problem of disintegration of the nation. Anthropologists, or other experts with ethnographic approaches and interests, will meet and discuss the use and abuse of diversity in the academic, social institution, media, and advocacy fields.



## THE SYMPOSIUM RESUME

### Context of the Symposium

- This 7<sup>th</sup> International Symposium of Jurnal Antropologi Indonesia in Yogyakarta is a collaboration between the Department of Anthropology, Universitas Gadjah Mada and Department of Anthropology, Universitas Indonesia.
- The year of 2019 is an important political year; as we saw the rise of unprecedented articulation of sectarian politics, which coincides with the larger global context where sectarianism, conservatism and ultra-nationalism has emerged as a powerful political articulation of discontent.
- The socio-political atmosphere prior to Indonesia's 2019 elections is marked by debates and contesting interpretations over national ideology, heated discussions on development and its outcomes, socio-economic inequalities, and other political debates that are feared to bring Indonesia to a 'disintegration'.
- During the previous (sixth) symposium, we have discussed how changes brought by *reformasi* have enabled Indonesia to experience series of experiments in how to address issues related to socio-cultural diversity. Political expressions have increasingly emerged through the articulation of identity politics such as ethnicity, religion and ideology.
- In these past four days, we had the opportunity to discuss as well as to test and provide various appropriate theoretical frameworks in providing solutions to current socio-political tensions associated with societal / national 'disintegration'.

### Some points of Discussions

- The practice of tolerance in managing socio-cultural differences in everyday life is diverse, both in the political and communal spheres.
- Indonesian anthropologists face different challenges in engaging the increasing politicization of communities by identity politics.
- The idea of multiculturalism as a practice remains problematic in the everyday life of Indonesians:
  - The strengthening of religious puritanism in both public and private spheres has increased social exclusivity, even among adherents of same religions.
  - While the internet as an open communication platform has brought about the strengthening of democracy, it has also enabled the engineering of identity politics for short term political purposes
- We are currently living in an unprecedented acceleration of landscape transformations that have unleashed feral processes that affect both human and non-humans alike. This brings forward the importance of active engagements in rethinking and anticipating the future of our planetary existence
- Critical perspectives and new methods to understand development ideologies, policies and practices have become important in understanding how marginality and social differences are reproduced.



## Methodological and Theoretical Reflections

- Anthropological concerns about diversity has extended beyond humans. Inter-disciplinary approaches are becoming more important in understanding and engaging with our current more-than-human anthropocene.
- We cannot ignore the importance of online social and mass media in influencing and framing socio-cultural diversities by competing interests.
- The need for Indonesian anthropologists to develop a responsive methodological awareness of positionality and intersectionality has become increasingly important in enhancing mutual understanding between researchers and communities studied.
- The curricula of anthropology in Indonesian universities has to accommodate contemporary debates on socio-cultural differences within the framework of multiculturalism, plurality, and relativity to enrich our understanding on this subject
- The need to see plurality from the third person's perspective in managing social differences. More research on inter-island migration in Indonesia and its effect on social interaction and management of social differences is needed.
- The particular challenge of Indonesian (or Southeast Asian / Asian) anthropologists is their longstanding entanglement with the morality of a nationalist-developmental ideological baggage, which needs to be unpacked, criticized and addressed. This has methodological implications in how Indonesian anthropologists formulate questions, position and articulate themselves within the context of both the wider academic community and society.

## Practical and Policies Implications

- The management of social differences should move beyond mere recognition, but should be empirically understood and addressed through the building of friendship, empathy, and solidarity.
- Anthropological engagement is not mere ethnographic research that is strictly bounded by institutional traditions. The way to move anthropology forward is to create new methodological and life-changing possibilities through transdisciplinary research, social engagement through the arts, activism and politics that should be acknowledged as new modes of knowledge creation that is open, democratic and accessible for all.
- The future orientation of (Indonesian) anthropological training should be geared towards inter-university collaboration on formulating responsive academic curricula, and the incorporation of trans-disciplinary approaches through increased institutional collaboration at local, regional and international levels. The curricula should be responsive to issues related to ethnicity, religion, gender & sexuality, labour, class, multi-scalar migration, and the anthropocene.

Dave Lumenta, Ph.D.  
Dr. Bambang Hidayana



## THE COMMITTEES

### Steering Committee

Prof. Yasmine Zaki Shahab	(Universitas Indonesia)
Prof. Meutia F. Swasono	(Universitas Indonesia)
Prof. Yunita T. Winarto	(Universitas Indonesia)
Prof. PM. Laksono	(Universitas Gadjah Mada)
Prof. Heddy Shri Ahimsa-Putra	(Universitas Gadjah Mada)
Prof. Irwan Abdullah	(Universitas Gadjah Mada)
Dr. Pujo Semedi Hargo Juwono	(Universitas Gadjah Mada)
Dr. Semiarto Aji Purwanto	(Universitas Indonesia)
Dr. Setiadi	(Universitas Gadjah Mada)
Tony Rudyansjah, Ph.D	(Universitas Indonesia)
Dr. Bambang Hidayana	(Universitas Gadjah Mada)
Irwan M. Hidayana, Ph.D	(Universitas Indonesia)

### Scientific Committee/Panel Coordinators

Anggun Susilo	(Universitas Brawijaya)
Anita P. Hardon	(University van Amsterdam)
Anton Novenanto	(Universitas Brawijaya)
Askuri Ibn Chamim	(Indonesian Consortium for Religious Studies)
Budi Hernawan	(STF Driyarkara)
Cahyo Pamungkas	(LIPI)
Clare Cameron	(University of California, San Francisco)
Dayana Lengauer	(Austrian Academy of Sciences)
Dea Rifia Bella	(Universitas Indonesia)
Des Christy	(Radboud University)
Elan Lazuardi	(University of New South Wales)
Febrian	(Universitas Indonesia)
Frans Ari Prasetyo	(Independent Researcher)
Gde Dwitya Arief Metera	(Northwestern University)
Greg Acciaioli	(The University of Western Australia)
Herry Yogaswara	(LIPI)
Hestu Prahara	(University of Auckland)
Imam Ardhiyanto	(Universitas Indonesia)
Iqra Anugrah	(New Mandala)
Irfan Nugraha	(Universitas Indonesia)
Ismail Fajrie Alatas	(New York University)
Jenny Zhang	(University of California, Berkeley)
Jessica Peng	(University of Pennsylvania)
Martin Slama	(Austrian Academy of Sciences)
Meutia F. Hatta	(Universitas Indonesia)
Ninuk Kleden	(Universitas Indonesia)
Nuria W. Soeharto	(Universitas Indonesia)
Nurul Ilmi Idrus	(Universitas Hasanuddin)



Pawennari Hijjang	(Universitas Hasanuddin)
Perdana P. Roswaldy	(Northwestern University)
Pinky Saptandari	(Universitas Airlangga)
Pudentia Maria Purenti Suniarti	(Universitas Indonesia)
Rahardhika A. Utama	(Northwestern University)
Ratna Saptari	(Leiden University)
Raymond Michael Menot	(Universitas Indonesia)
Rhino Ariefiansyah	(Universitas Indonesia)
Riwanto Tirtosudarmo	(LIPI)
Sari Ratri	(Northwestern University)
Semiarto Aji Purwanto	(Universitas Indonesia)
Sindhunata Hargyono	(Northwestern University)
Sri Murni	(Universitas Indonesia)
Sundjaya	(Universitas Indonesia)
Thung Ju Lan	(LIPI)
Tony Rudyansjah	(Universitas Indonesia)
Wahyu Kuncoro	(Universität Zürich)
Yustinus Tri Subagya	(Universitas Sanata Dharma)

## Organizing Committee

### *Coordinator:*

Dave Lumenta, Ph.D. (Universitas Indonesia)  
Suzie Handajani, Ph.D. (Universitas Gadjah Mada)

### *Secretary:*

Adlin Nur (Universitas Indonesia)  
Khidir Masanto (Universitas Gadjah Mada)

### *Members Universitas Indonesia:*

Sri Murni  
Raymond Michael Menot  
Sri Paramita Budi Utami  
Imam Ardhianto  
Kahardityo  
Dewi Zimarni  
Arif Wicaksono

### *Members Universitas Gadjah Mada:*

Bambang Hidayana  
Setiadi  
GR. Lono Lastoro Simatupang  
Atik Triratnawati  
Laksmi AS.  
M. Yusuf  
Pande Made Kutaneegara  
Wiwik S.  
Realisa D. Masardi  
Sita Hidayah





Destha Raharjana  
Agus Indy  
Kendal  
Mubarika Dyah  
Tutik Sri Handayani  
Agung Wicaksono  
Zamzam Fauzanafi  
Sarwo Pribadi  
Mujiono

*Collaborator Institutions*



THE UNIVERSITY OF  
WESTERN  
AUSTRALIA



UNIVERSITEIT VAN AMSTERDAM

*Supported by:*







## The Panels

Panel 01. Dealing with Diversity in (Digital) Urban Contexts: From Concepts to Engagement

*Coordinators: Dayana Lengauer (Austrian Academy of Sciences) & Frans Ari Prasetyo (Independent Researcher)*

Panel 02. Mediating Piety: Hadhrami Religious Authority in a Changing Indonesia

*Coordinators: Ismail Fajrie Alatas (New York University) & Martin Slama (Austrian Academy of Sciences)*

Panel 03. Disintegration from within? Marginal Groups and the failure of Indonesia as a Common Project

*Coordinators: Greg Acciaioli (The University of Western Australia) & Riwanto Tirtosudarmo (LIPI)*

Panel 04. Role of Digital Ethnography in Indonesian Online Society

*Coordinator: Anggun Susilo (Universitas Brawijaya)*

Panel 05. Dependence and Displacement

*Coordinators: Tony Rudyansjah (Universitas Indonesia) & Clare Cameron (University of California, San Francisco)*

Panel 06. The Use and Abuse of Drinking Culture

*Coordinator: Raymond Michael Menot (Universitas Indonesia)*

Panel 07. Moral Politics of Nationhood: Examining The Politics of Diversity and The Management of Unity

*Coordinators: Ratna Saptari (Leiden University) & Anton Novenanto (Universitas Brawijaya)*

Panel 08. The Dynamic of the Interaction between the Modern Medical System and the Traditional Medical System: Finding a Way for Establishing a Harmonious Collaboration of the Two Systems for the Social Justice for the People

*Coordinators: Meutia F. Hatta (Universitas Indonesia), Rhino Ariefiansyah (Universitas Indonesia), & Dea Rifia Bella (Universitas Indonesia)*

Panel 09. Anthropology and The Recentralization of Natural Resource Policies

*Coordinators: Semiarto Aji Purwanto (Universitas Indonesia), Pinky Saptandari (Universitas Airlangga), & Pawennari Hijjang (Universitas Hasanuddin)*

Panel 10. Structuring Diversity: Values, Political-Economic Order and Inter-Societal Relations in an Indonesian Archipelago

*Coordinators: Imam Ardhiyanto (Universitas Indonesia) & Geger Riyanto (Heidelberg University)*

Panel 11. The State of Anthropology of Indonesian Education: Critical Reflections on Theories and Methods



*Coordinators: Jessica Peng (University of Pennsylvania), Jenny Zhang (University of California, Berkeley), & Askuri Ibn Chamim (Indonesian Consortium for Religious Studies)*

Panel 12. Methodological Dilemma on Studying Diversity

*Coordinators: Elan Lazuardi (UNSW Sydney), Des Christy (Radboud University), & Wahyu Kuncoro (Universität Zürich)*

Panel 13. Collective Violence, Peace Building and Reconciliation: Anthropological Perspectives

*Coordinators: Yustinus Tri Subagya (Universitas Sanata Dharma), Herry Yogaswara (LIPI), & Cahyo Pamungkas (LIPI)*

Panel 14. Rethinking the Politics of Difference in Indonesia: Ethnicity, Religion, Class Relations

*Coordinators: Budi Hernawan (Driyarkara School of Philosophy) & Thung Ju Lan (LIPI)*

Panel 15. Host, Guest and Stranger: Exoticization and Exploitation at Tourism Indonesian Practice

*Coordinators: Irfan Nugraha (Universitas Indonesia), Sundjaya (Universitas Indonesia), & Febrian (Universitas Indonesia)*

Panel 16. Digital Ethnography - Do we need offline approach?

*Coordinator: Nuria W. Soeharto (Universitas Indonesia), Imam Ardhianto (Universitas Indonesia) & Rhino Ariefiansyah (Universitas Indonesia)*

Panel 17. Oral Tradition in the Discourse of Ethnic, Race, and Religion Diversity

*Coordinator: Pudentia Maria Purenti Suniarti (Asosiasi Tradisi Lisan), Ninuk Kleden (Universitas Indonesia), & Sri Murni (Universitas Indonesia)*

Panel 18. On The Making of Commodities Under Category: Resource Exploitation

*Coordinator: Rahardhika A. Utama (Northwestern University) & Perdana P. Roswaldy (Northwestern University)*

Panel 19. Beyond Disciplinary Diversity and Debates in Parallel Universes: Anthropology and Political Science in Conversation

*Coordinator: Gde Dwitya Arief Metera (Northwestern University) & Iqra Anugrah (New Mandala)*

Panel 20. Governmental Practices in Indonesia: Non-Calculative Modality, State Power, and the (Im)Possibility of Politics

*Coordinator: Hestu Prahara (University of Auckland), Sari Ratri (Northwestern University), & Sindhunata Hargyono (Northwestern University)*

Panel 21. Youth and Social Life of Chemicals

*Coordinator: Nurul Ilmi Idrus (Universitas Hasanuddin) & Anita P. Hardon (University van Amsterdam)*



## Dealing with Diversity in (Digital) Urban Contexts: From Concepts to Engagement

Coordinators: Dayana Lengauer (Austrian Academy of Sciences)

Chair: Martin Slama (Austrian Academy of Sciences)

Nowhere else in Indonesia is diversity so discernable as in its metropolitan centers. There, diversity is manifested in socio-economic, educational, political, ethnic, gender, and religious difference. Diversity, in the urban context, poses a challenge not least since the rise of digital technologies and freedom of expression facilitated the permeation of divergence into the everyday life of ordinary urbanites. It is not without a reason that some of the most elaborated argumentations for tolerance (*toleransi*) and peace (*perdamaian*) have emerged from the educated circles of urban centers, like Yogyakarta or the capital city of Jakarta. Yet, encompassing concepts, like the national motto *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika*, do not offer practical, enduring solutions to the oftentimes practical challenges of diversity. The panel invites papers that discuss diversity from the perspective of creative and sustainable practices in urban centers. They shall be able to portray how different agents in the city position themselves with regard to diversity, starting from individuals, to activist groups, including private and government institutions. Papers submitted to this panel shall discuss not only emerging awareness of frictions related to difference but also the historical conditions that shaped urban realities that are both cosmopolitan and entrenched in local ethnic structures. Papers are welcome to discuss the presence or absence of practical solutions that deal with diversity as well as the challenges related to them, such as community contestation on horizontal as well as vertical levels; multiple, overlapping networks of collaboration; uneven distribution and occupation of public space; inconsistent mediation of difference online and offline; lacking representation of divergent/minority groups; etc. Papers are encouraged to present ethnographic case studies as well as results of on-going research projects.

BANDUNG'S SCHOOL OF PEACE: AN ALTERNATIVE SPACE ADDRESSING INTERFAITH AND MINORITY GROUPS  
THROUGH DIALOGUE AND COOPERATION

*Fanny Syariful Alam*  
*Bandung School of Peace*

The prevalence of radicalism and discrimination against minority groups in Bandung over the past two decades is undisputable. Former city mayor Ridwan Kamil's claim that Bandung is a city of human rights is questioned, particularly due to numerous violations towards religious minorities, like blocking the building of houses of worship and other discriminative regulations. Discriminative environments in Bandung emerge partly due to the negligence of the city's officials which results in the tendency to allow for intolerant groups and their movement to grow stronger. The officials' disregard along with the support of intolerant groups produce cases such as the delay of the Monologue of Tan Malaka, or the arrest of Wanggi Hoed's at the celebration of International Body Day, both in 2016. Well-informed anticipation of such cases is key to halt emerging intolerant and discriminative practices in the future. Through direct observation, group conversations, literature study, as well as dialogue and cooperation with various stakeholders in minority and activists' circles, Bandung's School of Peace provides an alternative space for students to engage critically



with Bandung's discriminative environments. The weekly meetings contribute to a bottom-up movement of tolerance along the acceptance and engagement with various groups of society, regardless of their religious, ethnic, political, or social backgrounds.

*Keywords: Bandung; discrimination; human rights; intolerance; minority groups*

#### LISMA: FORMING POLITICAL BONDS THROUGH SOCIAL MEDIA AMONG MUSLIM WOMEN IN YOGYAKARTA

*Ach. Fatayillah Mursyidi*

*Center for Religious and Cross-cultural Studies (CRCS)*

*Graduate School of Universitas Gadjah Mada (UGM)*

LISMA (Lingkar Studi Mahasiswi Muslim) Peduli Negeri is a faith-based, tech-savvy woman only community in Yogyakarta. As membership is limited to Muslim women only, their regular events are also designed exclusively for that group. However, instead of restricting the topics of their agenda to women's and religious affairs, they mostly discuss general and up-to-date issues which are also available to the broader publics, such as those related to current political developments, or national history. Social media has a very significant role, both in advertising their agendas and recruiting new members. Most members and participants in fact have gained the information about LISMA from the internet.

Drawing on the group's specific features, in this paper, I argue that concepts of 'imagined community' and 'conversed community' are not sufficient to portray the impact of social media on such communities. Rather, I suggest that Ferdinand Tönnies' categorization of community and society might shed additional light on the character of such groups. Finally, through findings resulting from informal interviews I conducted with several members of LISMA, I argued that the bond that sustains the group is rather political than communal.

*Keywords: community, LISMA, political bond, social media, Muslim women*

#### FOSTERING INTER-FAITH ENGAGEMENT THROUGH CIVIC CROWDFUNDING IN CONTEMPORARY INDONESIA

*Bhirawa Anoraga*

*University of New South Wales*

This study aims to investigate the recent scholarly discussion on whether Islamism is on the rise in contemporary Indonesia. Over the last two decades, scholars have observed that Islamic conservatism has been growing in the country. For instance, van Bruinessen (2013) argues that Indonesia is experiencing a 'conservative turn' which to some extent has been spurring exclusivism and inter-faith tension. In other words, there is a growing fear of the nation's disintegration which involves the anxiety between the Muslim majority and religious minorities in Indonesia. In contrast to the existing studies that observe the 'conservative turn' in Indonesia, this study will highlight the trend where inter-faith engagement is embraced by the youth through civic crowdfunding practices. Civic crowdfunding is defined as the citizens' participation in social projects either by donating, volunteering or proposing a social program through a 'crowdfunding platform'. This study draws from cases of the largest crowdfunding platform in Indonesia, Kitabisa, as part of my PhD project. My argument is that the young people involved in civic crowdfunding have felt grievance towards rising religious tensions reflected in the spread of hatred and hoaxes



in social media. These youths are the active users of social media in Indonesia. Hence, they are the most directly impacted by current sectarian trends. As a result, the tech-savvy youth see civic crowdfunding as the practice of *gotong-royong* in an increasingly digitalised Indonesia. By this practice, they aim to unite Indonesians in social activities regardless of their religious affiliations. This development indicates a 'post-Islamist' trend in Indonesia as also observed by Bayat (2013) in other Muslim majority countries. This paper thus provides an insight that, despite pervasive Islamic conservatism in Indonesia, an opposite trend which seeks the joint engagement of Muslims living in a religiously plural society is growing in parallel.

*Keywords: civic crowdfunding, conservative turn, inter-faith engagement, post-Islamism, youth*

## Mediating Piety: Hadhrami Religious Authority in a Changing Indonesia

Coordinators: Ismail Fajrie Alatas (New York University)  
& Martin Slama (Austrian Academy of Sciences)

The panel is concerned with the role of the Hadhrami community in mediating Islam in contemporary Indonesia. For centuries, scholars and preachers of Hadhrami descent have been influential figures in the religious life of Indonesian Muslims. In the late colonial and post-colonial periods, internal divisions as well as external contestations from other Muslim actors and communities have led to an unprecedented fragmentation of Hadhrami religious authority and their Islamic institutions. Against this historical backdrop, the panel investigates more recent developments of Hadhrami religiosity in its relation to Indonesia's transforming Islamic field. In particular, it considers expressions of Islamic piety embedded in everyday practices, as well as the use of social media and new communication technologies. It asks how Islamic authority is mediated today by Indonesian Hadhramis within their community and in Indonesia's wider public. How do Hadhrami Islamic figures reposition themselves in relation to Indonesia's dynamic mediascape? To which new forms of Islamic sociality do they (have to) adapt, to become or remain influential among Indonesia's younger generations of Muslims? How do they balance offline and online presence? How do they deal with the transformations of scholar/preacher-follower relationships that one can observe in Indonesia today? What role do they play in the changing fields of Islamic finance and charity work? The panel welcomes contributions that can relate to these or to similar questions concerned with Islamic authority and religiosity among Hadhramis in contemporary Indonesia.

MEDIATING AUTHORITY: A HADRAMI SUFI SHAYKH IN MULTIPLE MEDIA

*Ismail Fajrie Alatas*

*New York University*

This paper examines the intersection between the career of a Sufi Shaykh and the media. It focuses on Indonesia's most influential contemporary Sufi scholar of Hadrami-descent, Habib Luthfi bin Yahya (b. 1947), particularly on his engagement with different media forms over the course of his career. Habib Luthfi began as a Sufi Shaykh and a mobile preacher who provide religious guidance to rural Javanese communities. Many of his audience has joined his *tariqa* (Sufi order/brotherhood) to become formal disciples. In 2003, a newly established bimonthly Islamic magazine, *AlKisah*, introduced a Q&A rubric dedicated to Sufism and requested Habib Luthfi to



become its expert host. Having his own rubric allowed Habib Luthfi to become known as an authority of Sufism outside of his traditional *ṭarīqa* circle. His answers to various questions relating to Sufism has been collected into a widely-circulated book that has been reprinted multiple times. With the increasing popularity of social media, however, the market for Islamic magazine dwindled, and *AlKisah* closed down. In 2010, however, several of Habib Luthfi's disciples established the official website, facebook page, and twitter account of their spiritual master with the aim to spread his ideas. By presenting a short history of Habib Luthfi's engagement with different media forms, this paper observes and compares the contrastive relationship of authority formed in and through different media engagement. Rather than treating media simply as channels of communication and dissemination, the paper interrogates how distinct forms of mediatization qualitatively transform a relationship of authority in contrasting ways, generating excitement on the one hand, but also anxiety.

#### YOUNG INDONESIAN HADHRAMIS AND THE QUEST FOR RELIGIOUS AUTHORITY

*Fatimah Husein*

*State Islamic University Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta*

This paper observes the activities of two young Hadhrami preachers in contemporary Indonesia. The first, Ustadzah Halimah Alaydrus (Jakarta), runs some regular meetings and *majelis shalawat*. The second, Ustadz Muhammad Anies Alhabsyi (Solo), leads a weekly study group (*majelis taklim*). The paper focuses on how the two preachers adapt their preaching strategies, styles, and themes in light of the changing public demands. Concurrently, it explores how both actors use different social media platforms to attract wider, and younger, audience. By comparing the two cases, the paper offers some grounded observations on how contemporary Hadhrami preachers reconfigure their religious authority in relation to the changing proclivities of their Indonesian Muslim audience.

*Keywords: Indonesian Hadhramis, changing religious authority*

#### FACING NEW MODELS OF ISLAMIC AUTHORITY: ON THE (UN)POPULARITY OF HADHRAMI PREACHERS IN INDONESIA

*Martin Slama*

*Institute for Social Anthropology at the Austrian Academy of Sciences*

The paper attempts to locate Hadhrami models of Islamic authority within a changing landscape of Islamic proselytization in Indonesia that is highly informed by the utilization of a variety of media. It asks how Hadhrami models have become adapted to these developments and to which extent Hadhrami preachers had to strike new paths to secure their place in Indonesia's increasingly diverse Islamic field. The paper is particularly interested in Hadhrami preachers who are regular users of social media, thus following in this regard the model of the media-savvy Indonesian celebrity preacher, but who have not (yet) gained a similar status of popularity. It examines their relative unpopularity by looking at their actual preaching and social media uses and by comparing them with the outreach strategies of some of Indonesia's most popular preachers. Seeking for a better understanding of the position of Hadhrami preachers in Indonesia's Islamic field, the paper points out how different models of Islamic authority meet different levels of popularity and attract different audiences.





## ZIARAH KUBRA: RECONNECTING THE GLOBAL SUFISM, AND REVITALIZE THE LOCAL ISLAMIC IDENTITY

*Ahmad Syarif*  
*Bower Group Asia*

Global Islamic idea from Arab countries has been accused of belittling or diminishing local culture in Indonesia, this perspective comes with the narrative of Arabization of Indonesia Islam, particularly after the fall of authoritarian era in Indonesia. This paper finds otherwise, local culture in Indonesia has revived by interacting with foreign idea and culture. By empirically analyzing the pilgrimage of *Ziarah Kubra* in Palembang—which is attended by Muslims from Southeast Asia and the Middle East, arguably the biggest pilgrimage in Sumatera Indonesia’s second most populated Island—this article provides an alternative point of view on how Muslims from different cultures and languages interact with each other. This article argues that *Ziarah Kubra* connects global Sufism through the teaching of *Tarigah Alawiyah* that is based in Hadrawamt, Yemen, at the same time the custom reaffirms domestic Islamic culture and the Palembang Sultanate as the guardian of Islam in Palembang. Additionally, it documents how this interaction helps to revitalize local culture in post-authoritarian Muslim society in Indonesia and explains the currents of globalized Islam that infuses local politics and notions of power.

*Keywords: Hadrami, Palembang, Islamic identity, Southeast Asia, Malay World*

## Disintegration from within? Marginal Groups and the failure of Indonesia as a Common Project

Coordinators: Greg Acciaioli (The University of Western Australia)  
& Riwanto Tirtosudarmo (Indonesian Institute of Sciences/LIPI)

In a public lecture given after 27 years of being banned from entering Indonesia, Ben Anderson in 1999 argued strongly that Indonesia should be seen as a common project. From the perspective of current developments, Indonesia seems to be moving away from the idea of Indonesia as a common project in which inclusiveness should be the norm underpinning healthy social relationships and wellbeing among all citizens. Various groups in society have been subjected to increasing marginalization that reflects a process of disintegration from within and the sign of failure in upholding Indonesia as a common project. Inspired by Anderson's idea of Indonesia as a common project, this panel is an attempt to gather studies and research findings as well as reflections concerning the predicaments of marginal groups in Indonesia, such as women, labourers, LGBT, ethnic and religious minorities, and others. It is expected that the panel could not only contribute to vigorous academic debate and a deeper understanding of social, economic, historical and political processes, such as the various forms of populism that have characterised different eras of Indonesia’s history, but also provide recommendations for policy and wider social impact that could help to mitigate the threat of disintegration from within and the failure of Indonesia as a common project.



A NATION IN CONTRADICTION<sup>1</sup>

(Draft only, not for citation)

Riwanto Tirtosudarmo

Indonesian Institute of Sciences (LIPI)

Various activities and events organized by the state and civil organizations to celebrate diversity as the genuine character of the people and society in this archipelago appear to contradict the long cry from the elites to maintain homogeneity and unity of the nation. Constant tensions seem unavoidable between the idea of oneness (*kesatuan*) and togetherness (*persatuan*). Desires to enhance diversity and fears perceiving it as a threat have created an ambiguity in the treatment of minorities and marginal groups. Communitarianism manifested in populist politics could constitute an impediment in transforming the people (*rakyat*) into the citizen (*warganegara*). This paper is an attempt to unpack the contradiction within the nation by exploring major discourses underlying the nation-state building processes. As a nation constructed on the basis of diverse communities and a vast archipelagic geography, the state is by nature confronted by the challenge of maintaining unity or promoting federalism. Controversies on the form and structure of decentralization, such as whether autonomy should be granted at the provincial or the district level of government, show the different views among the political elites and reflect a fundamental embedded contradiction within the nation. This paper argues that unless the contradiction within this great nation is resolved the fate of minorities and marginal groups will continue to be jeopardized.

*Keywords: nation, contradiction, diversity, citizen, marginal group.*

In a passionate obituary to her longtime colleague, Ben Anderson, Ruth McVey expresses her admire and reflect on Ben's famous book "Imagined Communities".<sup>2</sup> Ruth McVey, that continually struggles to unpack the tension between "state" and "nation"<sup>3</sup>, cannot leave her concern and noted as the following in the obituary:

...there was a fundamental conflict between these two concepts. "Nation" meant community, a sense of togetherness, a striving towards the realization of a common self. "State," however, was about control and the entrenchment of a hierarchy. In the nation-state that replaced royal dominion as the legitimate source of rule, the state seized the collective dreams of community...

Indonesia is indeed created in an emergency situation. The days prior to the declaration of independence on 17<sup>th</sup> of August 1945 were very tense. The abrupt changes after the Japanese surrendered to the allies were a political vacuum that provided room for a group of young revolutionary nationalists to exert their demand for declaring the independence. It has become a legendary heroic history when the youth decided to kidnap Soekarno and Hatta and urged them to make a proclamation for independence. Several months before the declaration of

<sup>1</sup> An extended abstract prepared for the panel 03 (Disintegration from within: The failure of Indonesia as a common project), The 7th International Symposium of Journal Anthropology Indonesia at Faculty of Cultural Sciences University of Gadjah Mada, July 23-26, 2019.

<sup>2</sup> Among others, see Ruth McVey. 1996. 'Building Behemoth: Indonesian Construction of the Nation-State', in Daniel S. Lev and Ruth McVey (eds.) *Making Indonesia: Essays on Modern Indonesia in Honor of George Mc T. Kahin*. Ithaca: Cornell Southeast Asia Program; Ruth McVey, 2003, "Nation versus state in Indonesia", in Damien Kingsbury and Harry Aveling (eds.) *Autonomy and Disintegration in Indonesia*. London and New York: RoutledgeCurzon.

<sup>3</sup> Ruth McVey, 2016, "Ben Anderson and the Imagining of Indonesia", *Indonesia*, No. 101 (April), pp. 15-20.





independence, under the auspices of the Japanese military general, the nationalist leaders – representing different political factions – conducted a series of meetings to prepare the state constitution of their imagined nation. The debate on the ideological foundation was intense and contentious. As the Japanese surrendered, the meetings ended and the constitution’s draft has to be finished. It was agreed in the final meeting that the constitution – known as UUD 1945 – is temporary and later will be revised. The UUD 1945 is therefore an unfinished constitution and therefore leaving many important issues unresolved.

The constitution opens with a preamble that is a slight elaboration of the five principles in which the notion of *persatuan* rather than *kesatuan* is incorporated. Both words derive from the Indonesian *satu*, meaning “one”, but while *persatuan* means, roughly, the process of becoming one, *kesatuan* means the condition of being one. Put another way, *persatuan* emphasises the process of unification from diversity, whereas *kesatuan* emphasises homogeneity. While *persatuan* implies the importance of differences and heterogeneity, *kesatuan* emphasises the concepts of oneness and uniformity. The strong engagement of the first generation of nationalist leaders with civic nationalism rather than ethnic nationalism constitutes their commitment to the enhancement of political diversity rather than just uniformity. Such nationalist feelings imply an appreciation of the “federal idea” as the basis for state formation, despite unitary structures.<sup>4</sup> The political abruptness surrounding the birth of the Indonesian state heavily influenced the provisional construction of the Indonesian constitution.<sup>5</sup> Although the Dutch were successful in reclaiming a large part of the territory through military action during the period 1947-49, they failed to establish a federal state. Their attempts to do so triggered a strong reaction from the masses and stimulated strong opinions about unity and unitarism. This was the beginning of a prevailing perception that Indonesia had to be formed as a unitary state.

A fragile political agreement between a strong nationalist group (the Republicans) and those promoting federalism was temporarily formed. The Republicans asserted that the formation of a federal state was only a Dutch strategy to weaken the nationalist movement to explain their rejection of the imposition of a federal state format on the young republic. Sporadic protests against the Dutch in Makassar and Medan around this time led to the collapse of the agreement. On August 17 1950, the deal between the Republicans and the so-called Federalists ended, as the nationalist leaders decided to form a unitary state rather than following the federal idea. The perception among the Indonesian nationalist leaders that the Federal State of Indonesia was only part of hidden Dutch tactics to recolonize the country left a strong negative impression surrounding federalism in Indonesia, presenting major difficulties for those who attempt to advocate the federal idea in Indonesia today.<sup>6</sup> The idea of *persatuan* implied in the preamble of the constitution subsequently shifted towards the idea of *kesatuan*, in which the notion of unity is advocated and differences should be avoided.<sup>7</sup> The format of the Indonesian state moved from

---

<sup>4</sup> I borrow the term “federal idea” from Rae (2003). Robert Rae argues that the “federal idea” provides more room for discussion while the “ism” in federalism has a way of limiting debate and understanding.

<sup>5</sup> According to Schiller’s (1955: 4) study of the process of formation of Indonesia’s federal state, the first constitution of the Republic of Indonesia was based on the federal constitution of the United States of America.

<sup>6</sup> On the rejection of the federal idea, Schiller wrote in 1955 that “recent writers have rightly recognized that opposition to the federal state in Indonesia was largely due to the fact it was ‘Dutch-inspired’, or ‘Dutch-imposed’, rather than because of absence of intrinsic merit in the pan” (Schiller, 1955: 9).

<sup>7</sup> I would like to thank Dr. Edward L. Poelinggomang, a historian at Hasanuddin University in Makassar, for his insightful inputs into the discussion of this contentious issue of *persatuan* vs *kesatuan* during a conversation with the author in mid- September 2006 in Makassar.



the Republic of Indonesia (1945-1946) to the Federal State of Indonesia (1947-1949) and finally to the Unitary State of Indonesia (1950-present). August 17 1950 was thus a defining moment in the history of state formation in Indonesia.

In 1955, a decade after its abrupt declaration of independence, Indonesia's first general election was conducted to elect peoples' representatives to the parliament. The first task of the elected parliament was to draft a new constitution. However, the long process of political debate and deliberation among the members of parliament on the one hand, and the increasing regional rebellions on the other, created a feeling of distrust towards the politicians within the military elites. This, in turn, pushed the president to issue a decree on July 5 1959 abolishing parliament and returning to the first constitution of Indonesia.<sup>8</sup> Indonesia then entered its long period of authoritarian government. Since then, military influence over the nation has been pivotal in Indonesia politics.

The tensions between the military and the communist party that resulted in the tragic loss of life of 1965 forced then-President Sukarno into a corner and elevated Suharto to become the new president, enabling the authoritarian regime under the first constitution to continue. The Suharto period of government strongly based on a centralistic bureaucratic polity, economic technocracy and military leadership, intensified the mystification of the unitary state format. Indonesia that is born with strong spirit of civic nationalism that promises to enhance plurality and differences is currently facing new challenges to survive its ideal. In the analysis of political development demography—in particular its composition by ethnicity and geographic distribution—is rarely considered as having an important influence in the dynamics of the politics both at the national and local levels.

The recent political development in which decentralization has become the most contested notion Indonesian observers also failed to understand how the politics of decentralization and the violent communal conflicts that followed is in fact cannot be understood without seriously considering the politics of demography that is deeply involved. Every region, province or district, is a small part of a very big country namely Indonesia. Although its seemed becomes truism that communal conflict that occurred—religious or ethnic—is 'highly locally concentrated'. Isolating communal conflict and perceive it mainly constituting local dynamics however would be misleading as the event clearly show the interconnectedness between the national decentralization politics and the local responses. The implementation of new regional autonomy laws has restructured the distribution of power and authority in the region. These new political situations open the opportunity for the local elites to manipulate locals' grievances as a means to achieve their economic and political short term goals. The expression of local grievances is varies according to their differences in the dynamics of its local politics that in some instances influence by the ethno-religio-demographic configuration of the society and population.

Politics in Indonesia after Suharto have gone into the seemingly new politics in which the member of the society and the regions can articulate their political aspiration with greater freedom than before. The state management no longer in the hand of one person or the central government but has been disperse into a diverse political organization, most notably the parliaments and the local government. A series of new amendments to the constitutions have been ratified that provide a new basis for the creation of new political system that in theory should have a better

---

<sup>8</sup> See Ricklefs (1983), especially Chapter 18.



chance to accommodate the people's need rather than only serving the ruling elites. The new political system that is characterized by strong drive for decentralization have proliferated local enthusiasms as reflected in the creation of substantial number of new districts. The creation of new territorial boundaries as a response to the new regional autonomy laws however could be seen as a process of the fragmentation of the nation-state. In this process of "disintegration from within", ethno-religio-demographic configuration is becoming a crucial factor that is potential for political manipulation.

Insular ethno-religio sentiments that began in the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century as the new impetus for the educated indigenous population to form social and political organization seemingly to revive in the beginning of 21<sup>st</sup> century in the form of identity politics following the demise of Suharto from power in 1998. The long contending source of power since the colonial time, orthodox Islam, resurgence and challenged the civic principles of the nation-state. Islam that was described by Wertheim (1980) as the majority with minority mentality has been asserted its muscle throughout the New Order after Sukarno and the communist was defeated.<sup>9</sup> In the last five years, mass mobilization led by small but fanatical Muslim group, most prominently FPI (Front Pembela Islam or Islamic Defender Front) have successfully, among others, toppled down Ahok, a Chinese Christian Jakarta Mayor, in the election against Anies Baswedan, a Muslim Arabic descend, in 2016. A similar move is adopted in the 2019 presidential election against Jokowi by backing up Prabowo, but failed.

The recent mobilization of Islamic orthodoxy in the guise of populist politics is flagging up the embedded contradiction of the nation as embodiment of a common self. Furthermore, its encroachment into various states' institutions is a strong sign of possible penetration of Islam in expanding its control into the social fabrics. The resurgence of Islam as a representation of majority religion constitute the ruptures of the nation-states as indicated by Ruth McVey that in turn will further marginalized the conventional minority groups, such as other religions, Islamic religious minorities, indigenous or folk religions, ethnic minorities and adat communities; as well as the new marginal groups such as LGBT.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

McVey, Ruth 1996. 'Building Behemoth: Indonesian Construction of the Nation-State', in Daniel S. Lev and Ruth McVey (eds,) *Making Indonesia: Essays on Modern Indonesia in Honor of George Mc T. Kahin*. Ithaca: Cornell Southeast Asia Program.

-----2003, "Nation versus state in Indonesia", in Damien Kingsbury and Harry Aveling (eds.) *Autonomy and Disintegration in Indonesia*. London and New York: RoutledgeCurzon.

-----2016, "Ben Anderson and the Imagining of Indonesia", *Indonesia*, No. 101 (April), pp. 15-20.

Rae, Robert, 2003, "Federal Idea and Secession". Paper presented at Bandaranaike Peace Institute, Colombo, Sri Lanka, 27 July.

---

<sup>9</sup> John T. Sidel (2006) have provided a comprehensive analysis on increasing phenomena of religious violence between 1995-2003 in his book *Riots, Pogroms, Jihad: Religious Violence in Indonesia*, especially chapter one "From Ethnic Conflict to Islamic Terrorism?".



- Ricklefs, Merle, 1983, *A History of Modern Indonesia*. London: McMillan.
- Schiller, A. Arthur, 1955, *The Formation of Federal Indonesia 1945-1949*. Bandung: W.V. Hoeve Ltd.
- Sidel, John T. 2006, *Riots, Pogroms, Jihad: Religious Violence in Indonesia*. Ithaca New York: Cornell University Press.
- Wertheim, W.F, 1980, "Moslem in Indonesia: Majority with Minority Mentality", in South East Asian Studies Committee, James Cook University, Townsville.

#### THE DILEMMAS AND MARGINALIZATION OF FEMALE PORTERS IN PABEAN SURABAYA MARKET

*Miranti Dwi Yuniarti*

*Department of Anthropology, Universitas Airlangga*

Marginalization often occurs in Indonesia, and it makes people gradually consider marginalisation as a natural phenomenon. Female porters are one of the marginalized groups in Indonesia. They have been marginalized by others, but they do not realize it. This paper analyzes and describes the dilemmas and kind of marginalization faced by female porters in Pabean Surabaya market. The methods used in this study were qualitative, including direct observation and in-depth interviews. The results suggest that female porters marginalized by getting differential treatment by other people, they cannot negotiate their wages with customers which makes the income they earn incommensurate with their hard work, which is also exacerbated by the wage differential between female porters and male porters. They also face some dilemmas related to their work such as having double burden as housewives and workers, limited skills so they cannot choose better job for them, insufficient income for daily needs, social pressure from fellow workers and other people.

*Keywords: dilemma, marginalization, female porters*

#### INTRODUCTION

Diversity of cultures makes Indonesia become a rich and beautiful country that has its own uniqueness compared to other countries. It rich of local languages, traditional foods, traditional clothes, traditional dances, etc. Since it is very diverse, the cultural values are also diverse. Each cultural group has its own values. As a consequence, sometimes the diversity also brings some problems that may harm the unity and cause a disintegration from within. Marginalization is one of the problems caused by diversity. It is not only happening in rural area, but also in the big city such as Surabaya, the second biggest city in Indonesia.

Eventhough Surabaya is a metropolitan city with all the modern facilities to provide the community life, but traditional markets still have not lost its charm as the best place that sell groceries with low price. The customer is not only the commoners but also people who have large business in food sector. Since, there are many people from many social classes come to traditional market, the marginalization can happen even without them realize it. That is because marginalization has happened in a long time and in many places in Indonesia. In this paper, the research was focused on female porters in Pabean Surabaya Market because Pabean Surabaya Market is the oldest traditional market in Surabaya also the sellers and porters from this



traditional market are quite diverse in ethnicity, such as Chinese, Javanese, and Madurese which is very interesting to be learned.

## RESEARCH METHODS

To understand the problems faced by female porters in Pabean Surabaya Market thoroughly, ethnographic approach was needed. Ethnography is a method used to understand people in their cultural setting, the way they act and interact in their social and cultural environment. Ethnography gives description that reveal various explanatory models created by human (Spradley, 2007). The type of this research is qualitative which including direct observation and interview to achieve thick description about their job and their problems from the female porter's point of view. In this research, there were six female porters, two sellers, Head of Pabean Market, and some market staff interviewed. Words and acts from the people we observe or interview are the main source of data (Moleong, 2008). Therefore, interview is very important because from that we can obtain many information from the cultural actors themselves, while from direct observation we can see how they act in their cultural environment. The direct observation was done in Pabean Surabaya Market and also in some female porter's houses. Secondary data were collected from Pabean market office.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### *Female Porters in Pabean Market Surabaya*

Female porter is actually quite common in Indonesia especially in Java. We can find female porters in many traditional market, such as in Klewer Market in Solo, Beringharjo Market and Giwangan Market in Yogyakarta, Traditional market in Selotinatah village in Magetan, etc. In Pabean Surabaya Market, the female porters are called *kuli panggul*. *Panggul* means carrying on the shoulder or head. They usually carrying 30-50 Kg of goods for several times in a day. They carry fishes, onion, garlic, chillies, vegetables, etc. and they get paid Rp.2000- Rp.5000 (\$0.14- \$0.35) per work. It is about 90% of the female porters in Pabean Market are Madurese and the rest is Javanese. Eventhough there's different ethnic among the female porters but there's no ethnic conflict happened.

### *Marginalization of female porters in Pabean Surabaya Market*

Female porters are marginalized by other people because of several factors, such as:

a. Low formal education

Female porters are mostly graduate from elementary school or middle school. Even some of them are couldn't go to formal school because the family were too poor to afford formal education. Some of them have worked since childhood. Because of that, other people always underestimate them by treat them harshly or do not give respect for female porter's hard work.

b. Negative stereotypes from other people

Most of people do not recognize porter as a job. Since porter is seen as a rough job and people only see them from the surface, they look down on female porters. As a result, female porters always think little of their selves. It makes them cannot express their selves more. As mention before, most of female porters are Madurese. Since their characteristic is seen from many



point of views, negative stereotype can appear. Madurese sometimes is seen as people who have harsh and fierce trait by other ethnic, though it is not really true. They only fierce if people offend their pride (Rochana, 2012). Because of that stereotype, people often look down on them.

c. Female porters do not know their rights

They always think little of their selves, so they tend to accept no matter how much people pay for their work. As it has mentioned before, their payment is low that it is not worth their hard work. However, they do not raise the cost of their payment because they are afraid that they will not get many customers. The payment is even different between the male porter and female porter, because male porter can lift more weight than female porter so people prefer to use male porter's services.

*The Dilemmas of Female Porters*

There are also some dilemmas of working as female porters in Pabean Surabaya Market:

a. Double burden

As women who live in patriarchal culture, female porters have to work not only in Pabean Surabaya Market, but also work as housewives when they are home. They have to do all the house chores, despite all those hard and rough work in the market. If they do not do it, their husband and other people would think that they have neglected their family. Women have to make home comfortable and tranquil for their husband and children (Saptari and Holzner, 2016).

b. Social pressure from fellow female porter

Female porters commonly work in a group of 4-6 persons. Eventhough they are coworkers, when one of them get more money than the others, some of them will get envy and accused her for stealing. Female porters in a group mostly come from the same kin or neighbourhood, so it is hard for a new person to work there. Whenever there is newcomer, they will treat them as stranger and sometimes the old female porters will ask money to the newcomer or the male porters will harass them, especially to the young one.

c. Limited individual skill

Based on the interview results, female porters actually dislike their job, but they do not have other option as they need to fulfil their daily needs while it cannot be covered only from the husband's income. They also have limited skill and education to get a better job. They have to work for the sake of their family, husbands, and children.

CONCLUSIONS

Porter is not an easy job because it requires strength and skill to do it, but in Pabean Surabaya Market, many porters are women instead of men. While they do their hard work, they also have to face marginalization such as being treated differently by other people who look down on them because of their education and ethnicity, they don't know their rights because they think little of their selves. They also face some dilemmas, such as they cannot choose better job because they have limited skill, their hard work is not incommensurate with the hard work and the wage is even different between male and female porters, meanwhile they have to fulfill the daily needs of their family.





## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Moleong, Lexy J. 2008. *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya Offset.
- Rochana, Totok. 2012. Orang Madura: Suatu Tinjauan Antropologis. *Humanus*, 9(1), pp. 46-51.
- Saptari, Ratna and Brigitte Holzner. 2016. *Perempuan, Kerja, dan Perubahan Sosial*. Jakarta: Kalyanamitra.
- Spradley, James P. 2007. *Metode Etnografi*. Yogyakarta: Tiara Wacana.

ANALYSIS OF FACTORS CAUSING POVERTY IN FISHING COMMUNITY IN PAJALA VILLAGE, MAGINTI SUB-DISTRICT, WEST MUNA REGENCY  
*Akhmad Marhadi, Arman, Samsul, & Raemon*  
*Universitas Halu Oleo*

Poverty is a problem that still becomes an obstacle until now in the development process. In overcoming the problem of poverty in society, it is necessary to have a planned, integrated and comprehensive resolution in all aspects of life. Poverty is one of the social symptoms that gives various kinds of gaps in people's lives, especially for fishing community groups. This fact is also found in the community in Pajala Village, Maginti Sub-district, West Muna Regency, where the people only rely on marine results as a reinforcement of all aspects of the family's economic resilience. The situation of the sea which is erratic and changes every time has an impact on the economic condition of fishermen in Pajala Village that is becoming unstable. On the other hand, the low quality of education and their lack of access to the outside world make the Pajala Village fishing community increasingly left behind and trapped in poverty. The poverty of fishing community in Pajala Village, Maginti Sub-district, West Muna Regency is not only caused by one factor, but is also caused by several key factors so that the poverty has not been properly addressed until now. The root of the problems of poverty in fishing communities needs to be systematically explored in order to produce a concept that is truly capable of lifting and improving the standard of living of fishing communities, especially those in Pajala Village, Maginti Sub-district, West Muna Regency.

This research used a qualitative research method in the form of a description to provide an overview of the problems discussed in this research, namely analysis of factors causing poverty in fishing community in Pajala Village in Maginti Sub-district. According to Patton in his book Moleong (2001: 103) states that data analysis is the process of arranging data sequences, organizing in a pattern, category and large description units. Analysis of qualitative research data is an analysis of primary and secondary data obtained in the main form and not using statistical rules. The data that have been collected in the research were analyzed in several stages, starting with organizing the data, by making the transcript of the interview results into sections in the form of written descriptions. After that, grouping was done based on categories, themes, and patterns of answers according to the research problems. The stages of presenting the data began with exploratory data, data triangulation and finally made the conclusion.

This research was conducted in Pajala Village, Maginti Sub-district, West Muna Regency. This area was chosen as the research area because some of its people work as fishermen and at the same time make the work of fishermen as the main job in fulfilling their needs. There were three data collection techniques used in this research, namely interview, observation, and document study



techniques. Interviews were used to get information from informants using interview guidelines. Observations were done by observing the daily activities of fishermen's life to obtain data on the causes of poverty. Meanwhile, document studies were used to support existing data by integrating with libraries, or several scientific articles that supported this research. The fishermen in Pajala Village are still categorized as poor society.

Pajala Village is one of the villages in Maginti Sub-district, West Muna Regency, where the majority of the population has main jobs as traditional fishermen. This resulted in the community that is becoming vulnerable to poverty. The uncertainty of income earned from fishing is a very worrying thing for family members of fishing communities. On the other hand, the higher level of needs is not directly proportional to the people's lifestyles which tend to be more consumptive. This then gradually makes the fishing community of Pajala Village worse off and increasingly retarded and shackled with the poverty space. This phenomenon needs to get serious attention from various parties in order to improve the lives of fishermen communities to get better and out of the shadow of poverty. Therefore, an analysis of factors causing poverty in fishing community in Pajala Village in Maginti Sub-district, West Muna Regency, is relevant to be studied.

The lives of these fishermen are very vulnerable to poverty. Working as a fisherman is a very seasonally determined job. When the calm season arrives, the fishermen can carry out their activities to make a living. However, on the contrary, if bad weather comes, fishermen cannot make a living. This can at the same time cut off the fishermen's income chain so that there is no income. This condition is what triggers the deterioration of the lives of fishermen. Sharp, et. Al. (1996) in Kuncoro (2006: 120) said that basically the causes of poverty among fishermen are caused by three things, namely 1) on a micro basis, that poverty arises because of the inequality of patterns of resource ownership resulting in imbalanced income contributions. The poor people only have limited resources and low quality; 2) poverty arises due to differences in the quality of human resources. Low quality of human resources means low productivity, which in turn low wages. The low quality of human resources is due to low education, the fate of disadvantaged people and the existence of discrimination; and 3) poverty arises due to differences in access in capital.

The result found that poverty in the community in Pajala Village, Maginti Sub-district, West Muna Regency occurs because of several factors, namely: weak human resources, lack of good financial planning or there is no investment owned by fishermen, low income owned by fishermen, debt bondage, some limitations in terms of capital ownership so that they experience difficulties in developing their business, there are no alternative jobs other than working as fishermen so that when they enter a famine season or cannot go fishing, they cannot produce anything. In addition, the technology used by fishermen in Maginti Village is relatively traditional in nature so it cannot increase the productivity of the catch and automatically makes their income does not increase.

*Keywords: factors, poverty, fishermen, Pajala village*

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

Kuncoro, Mudrajad. (2000). *Ekonomi Pembangunan: Teori, Masalah dan Kebijakan*. Yogyakarta: UPP AMP YKPN.

Moleong, Lexy J. (2001). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.





## THE POTENTIAL OF DISINTEGRATION AND THE SPIRIT OF NATIONALISM FOR PEOPLE OF NATUNA REGENCY

*Budiana Setiawan*

*Center for Policy Research of Education and Culture Ministry of Education and Culture*

Natuna Regency in Riau Islands Province is one of the outer islands of the Republic of Indonesia. So, it is considered to have potential for disintegration. Even more, Malaysia has contested Indonesian ownership of Natuna Islands by reason of geographical and history proximity. Historically, Natuna Islands were once part of the Johor Sultanate since 1597. Geographically, the Natuna Islands are closer to Malaysia than the rest of Indonesia. As a result, economic, social and cultural interaction of Natuna people is more oriented to Malaysia

Even though the Natuna Islands are economically, and socio-culturally closer to Malaysia, it has not caused the spirit of Indonesian nationalism to diminish and make the Natuna people desire join Malaysia. This is due to Natuna people's perspective upon Indonesia. They assume Indonesia is a large country with a wider area and larger population than Malaysia.

National inclusion of Natuna people requires examining both citizenship and ethnicity. In regard to the former, Natuna people are part of the citizenry of the Republic of Indonesia. In regard to the latter, most of Natuna people are Malays, an ethnic group spread across Indonesia, Malaysia, Singapore and Brunei Darussalam. The spirit of nationalism of Natuna people is quite solid, although their ethnic ties are not restricted to one country only.

Nevertheless, if the Government of the Republic of Indonesia does not pay attention to Natuna people's welfare, such that they are left behind other regions, the potential for disintegration can be increased, constituting a threat to the territorial integrity of the Republic of Indonesia. Therefore, the government has recently made efforts to develop Natuna Regency. There are five ministries that have priority to deal with development in Natuna Regency, namely: Fisheries and Marine Affairs, Defense and Security, Tourism, Forestry and Environment, and Energy and Mineral Resources.

*Keywords: disintegration, nationalism, Malaysia, Republic of Indonesia, the outermost territory*

### BACKGROUND

Natuna Regency geographically is one of the outermost territory of the Republic of Indonesia. The group of Natuna Islands have been incorporated into Indonesia territory based on the Decree of Republic of Indonesia Delegation, as a part of Central Sumatra Province, on May 18, 1956.

Tracing its history, Malaysia once claimed that the group of Natuna Islands should be a part of their territory. Nevertheless, Malaysia's claims have never really become a conflict over territory between Indonesia and Malaysia. People of Natuna Regency has never openly released issue of wanting to break away from Indonesia and join to Malaysia. Whereas, as a region that geographically closer to Malaysia and historically related to Johor Sultanate, economic and socio-cultural influences were more pronounced from Malaysia than Indonesia in the past.

The problems in this paper as follows. First, how does spirit of nationalism of people in Natuna Regency, both juridically and administratively become a part of territory of the Republic of Indonesia, but geographically, economically, and socio-culture is closer to Malaysia? Second, is there a potential disintegration of people of Natuna Regency, then choose to become a part of



Malaysia? Third, what is government's efforts to protect Natuna Regency, so it cannot be separated from territory of the Republic of Indonesia's sovereignty?

#### OBJECTIVE

The purpose of this paper is, first, to find out factors that determine spirit of nationalism of people in Natuna Regency is stronger to Indonesia than Malaysia. Second, to get an idea of whether or not there is a potential disintegration of people of Natuna Regency. Third, knowing government's efforts to safeguard of Natuna Regency as a part of Indonesia's sovereignty.

#### DESCRIPTION

The London Treaty in 1824, which was an agreement between British and Dutch regarding division of colonies, did not include the group of Natuna Islands explicitly into British and Dutch colonies. Thus, the group of Natuna Islands to be a part of the Republic of Indonesia's territory was not based on the London Treaty. The claim of the Government of the Republic of Indonesia towards the group of Natuna Islands has caused a dispute with Malaysia. Malaysia states that the group of Natuna Islands should belong to Malaysia. First, based on history, since 1597 the group of Natuna Islands are a part of the territory of Johor Sultanate, one of sultanates of Malaysia's territory now. Second, geographically the group of Natuna Islands is "flanked" between western Malaysia (Peninsular Malaysia) and eastern Malaysia (Sabah and Sarawak). Thus, both geographically and historically, people of Natuna Regency have close relations with Malaysia than Indonesia.

Malaysia also considered that the London Treaty of 1824 could not be used as legal basis for control of Indonesia to possess the group of Natuna Islands, because it had never been truly controlled by the Dutch. Otherwise, Indonesia claims the group of Natuna Islands as a part of its territory because there was evidence of traces of Dutch control to the islands. The existence of Dutch control was an airfield in Subi Island, which was actually built by Japanese Government when it occupied Indonesia in 1942. When Japan lost in second World War, the airfield was taken over by Dutch forces. The Dutch attack on the airfield in Subi Island was "the only evidence" of Dutch control in the group of Natuna Islands.

#### FINDINGS

Consider to the history, economic, social, and cultural daily life of Natuna people closer to Malaysia than Indonesia; certainly raises question: What do their spirit of nationalism? All of them are not impossible to bring consequences for weakening nationalism of Natuna people. This is coupled with a fact that developmental by central government has not reached to the group of Natuna Islands. The infrastructure and superstructure in Indonesia's foremost islands are still far behind other regions, especially in Java. If the spirit of nationalism of Natuna people are not well fortified, it is not impossible to threat national integration of Indonesia.

The interesting thing is condition that mentioned above does not make Natuna people want to join Malaysia. Even though their geographically closer to Malaysia, they have never made an effort to break away from Indonesia and join to Malaysia. This seems to be influenced by their perspective of both countries. For them, Indonesia is a big country, with a bigger area and a larger population than Malaysia. In addition, Natuna people see Indonesia is one of countries that pioneered independence from colonies territory in Asia region. In early era of independence of



both countries, Indonesia became a more respected country by others countries in Asia region than Malaysia. It seems to be an attractiveness for Natuna people choose to be a part of Indonesia.

Natuna people have not seem to think seriously about their past history that was once part of Johor Sultanate and Riau Sultanate. In this case, Natuna people seems to be "not too attached emotionally" to two sultanates. This is caused by their region as a part of North Natuna Sea, far away with capital of Johor Sultanate and Riau Sultanate. Thus, nationalism of Natuna people as a cultural phenomenon rather than a political phenomenon, as stated by John Hutchinson (2004). Their nationalism is fluidier, because it is rooted in history and ethnicity of Malayness, which is influenced by Johor sultanates and Riau sultanates.

Among six types of nationalism, as stated by Retno Listyarti, state nationalism type is seen suitable to be applied to Natuna people, which is a combination between citizenship and ethnicity. In this case, in terms of citizenship, Natuna people politically legitimate as a part of Indonesian citizens. Ethnically, the most of Natuna people are Malays ethnic. In this case, Malay ethnic group not only exists in Indonesia, but spreads across several others countries, namely: Malaysia, Singapore, Thailand, and Brunei Darussalam. Thus, Natuna people naturally has ethnic ties with Malay ethnic group who inhabit in Indonesia's territory, especially Malay people in Riau Islands, east coast of Sumatra, and west coast of Kalimantan.

Regarding to existence of the outermost islands that bordering to other countries, the Government of Republic of Indonesia has issued Presidential Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 78 of 2005 concerning Management of the Outermost Small Islands.

In this regard, strengthening spirit of nationalism as a part of Indonesian nation is impossible for growing in Natuna people as long as the central government never gives attention and development to them as a community who inhabitant in the outermost islands. But in reality, even though it has been a part of Indonesia since 1956, for decades there has not been significant development in the group of Natuna Islands. Massive development has only begun to occur in recent years. This developmental is in accordance to Nawacita program from regime President Joko Widodo and Vice President Jusuf Kalla. There are five ministries that are prioritized to handle development in Natuna Regency, namely: Fisheries and Marine, Defense and Security, Tourism, Environment and Forestry, and Energy and Mineral Resources. Ministry of Fisheries and Maritime has built a *Sentra Kelautan dan Perikanan Terpadu* (Integrated Marine and Fisheries Center) in Lampa Strait, North Natuna District. Ministry of Defense and Security makes vulnerable for security disturbances and to be territory of defense against infiltration from other countries. Ministry of Tourism is conducted with a consideration that Natuna Regency has many beautiful places that can be developed as tourist destinations. Ministry of Energy and Mineral Resources will develop oil and gas production in East Natuna Block. Ministry of Forestry and Environment has role of conducting a study and evaluation of impact of development on environmental and community aspects in Natuna Regency.

## CONCLUSION

Malaysia had sued Indonesia as ownership of the group Natuna Islands region by reason of geographical proximity and history. Tracing its history, the group of Natuna Islands have been a part of Malaysia. Geographically, the group of Natuna Islands are closer to Malaysia than Indonesia. This causes economic and social interaction of Natuna people closer to Malaysia than Indonesia. However, it does not cause Natuna people desires disintegration from Indonesia, and



join to Malaysia. This is due to Natuna community's perspective about Indonesia as a large country with bigger territory and larger population than Malaysia. The other reason, Indonesia was seen as a respected country among other countries in Asia.

Natuna people are belonging in state nationalism type, which is a combination of citizenship and ethnicity. Thus, the spirit of nationalism of people is quite strong because their ethnic ties are not restricted to one country only.

Nevertheless, if the government of The Republic of Indonesia does not pay attention to welfare of Natuna people, so potential for such disintegration can increase and threaten territorial integrity of the Republic of Indonesia. Therefore, at present the government has sought development in Natuna Regency. With a touch of development in Natuna Regency, it is expected to minimize potential for disintegration and increase spirit of nationalism of people in Natuna Regency.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

Ahmad Dwi Afriyadi. 2018. *Dorong Pengembangan Gas Natuna, Para Ahli Migas Siap Kumpul Bareng*. Senin, 10 September 2018. Juli 2018. <https://finance.detik.com/energi/d-4204863/dorong-pengembangan-gas-natuna-para-ahli-migas-siap-kumpul-bareng>, accessed on February 8, 2019.

Anderson, B., 1991. *Imagined Communities: Reflection on The Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. London: Verso.

Bachtiar, Harsja W. 1997. "Pengamatan sebagai Suatu Metode Penelitian", *Metode-Metode Penelitian Masyarakat*. Ed. Koentjaraningrat. *Metode-Metode Penelitian Masyarakat*. edisi ketiga, Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.

Creswell, John W. 1994. *Research Design, Quantitative and Qualitative Approaches*. Sage Publications. Inc.

*Ekspor Perdana Ikan Napoleon di Natuna*. 6 Februari 2018. <http://www.menlhk.go.id/berita-10086-ekspor-perdana-ikan-napoleon-di-natuna.html>, accessed on February 18, 2019.

Gustaman. Y. 2017. *Pariwisata di Kabupaten Natuna Tertinggal, Begini Respon PLN*. Kamis, 19 Oktober 2017. <http://www.tribunnews.com/bisnis/2017/10/19/pariwisata-di-kabupaten-natuna-tertinggal-begini-respon-pln?page=2.diunduh>, accessed on February 8, 2019.

Hutchinson, John. 2004. *Myth Against Myth: The Nation as Ethnic Overlay Nations and Nationalism*

*Ini Cara Jitu KKP Bantu Nelayan Natuna, Termasuk Memberi 60 Kapal*. Kamis, 7 Desember 2017. <https://www.merdeka.com/uang/ini-cara-jitu-kkp-bantu-nelayan-natuna-termasuk-memberi-60-kapal.html>, accessed on February 8, 2019

*Kabupaten Natuna dalam Angka 2017*. 2017. Ranai: Badan Pusat Statistik Kabupaten Natuna.



- Kamal, Mustafa. 2014. *Malaysia Ingin Kepulauan Natuna Menjadi Wilayahnya*. [https://www.kompasiana.com/alchemist/malaysia-inginkan-kep-natuna-menjadi-wilayahnya\\_54f7bc7ba333112b6f8b4cc7](https://www.kompasiana.com/alchemist/malaysia-inginkan-kep-natuna-menjadi-wilayahnya_54f7bc7ba333112b6f8b4cc7), accessed on November 27, 2017.
- Kemhan Bangun Sarana dan Prasarana Pertahanan di Pulau Natuna*, Rabu, 8 Maret 2017. <https://www.kemhan.go.id/2017/03/08/kemhan-bangun-sarana-dan-prasarana-pertahanan-di-pulau-natuna.html>, accessed on February 8, 2019.
- Kemen LHK Gelar Rapat Penilaian DELH*. Selasa, 30 Januari 2018. <https://www.haluankepri.com/news/detail/109824/kemen-lhk-gelar-rapat-penilaian-delh>, accessed on February 8, 2019.
- Listiyarti, Retno. 2007. *Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan*. Jakarta: Gelora Aksara Pratama
- Luas Wilayah Indonesia*. <https://www.scribd.com/doc/111362334/Luas-Wilayah-Indonesia>, accessed on October 27, 2018.
- Marshall, Catherine. and Gretchen B. Rossman. 1995. *Designing Qualitative Research*. Second edition. London: Sage Publication.
- Menhan: Pemerintah akan Bangun Pangkalan Militer Terbesar di Natuna*. 10 Maret 2017. <https://www.kemhan.go.id/itjen/2017/03/10/menhan-pemerintah-akan-bangun-pangkalan-militer-terbesar-di-natuna-2.html>, accessed on February 8, 2019
- Mezerik, Avrahm (1965). "Malaysia Says Bloody Revolution Not Only Way to Independence". *Malaysia-Indonesia Conflict: Creation of Malaysia, Indonesia's Confrontation Policy, Philippine and Indonesian Claims, UN Involvement, Indonesian Withdrawal from UN, roles of UK, US, USSR, and China*. University of Michigan Press, *International Review Service*. pages. 108-122.
- Nainggolan, P. P (eds.). 2004. *Batas Wilayah dan Situasi Perbatasan Indonesia: Ancaman terhadap Integritas Teritorial*. Jakarta: Tiga Putra Utama.
- Neuman, W. Lawrence. 1997. *Social Research Method: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon.
- Nuraini. 2008. *Sejarah Terbentuknya Kabupaten Natuna*. Tanjungpinang: Balai Pelestarian Sejarah dan Nilai Tradisional. Kementerian Kebudayaan dan Pariwisata.
- Pamungkas, Cahyo. 2015. "Nasionalisme Masyarakat di Perbatasan Laut: Studi Kasus Masyarakat Melayu-Karimun". *Masyarakat Indonesia*, Vol. 41 No. 2, Desember 2015. Jakarta: Lembaga Ilmu Pengetahuan Indonesia.
- Pengembangan Perikanan: Bangun Ekonomi Maritim dari Natuna*. 16 Januari 2018. <https://kalimantan.bisnis.com/read/20180116/251/726682/pengembangan-perikanan-bangun-ekonomi-maritim-dari-natuna>, accessed on February 8, 2019.
- Purwatiningsih, Annisa, dan Masykur. 2012. "Eksplorasi dan Eksploitasi Pertambangan Minyak dan Gas Bumi di Laut Natuna Bagian Utara Laut Yuridiksi Nasional untuk Meningkatkan Kesejahteraan Masyarakat di Kepulauan Natuna". *Jurnal Reformasi*, Volume 2, Nomor 2, Juli-



Desember 2012. Malang: Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik, Universitas Tribhuwana Tunggaladewi. pages. 59-67.

*Siaran Pers: Festival Senua 2018 Promosikan Pariwisata Kabupaten Natuna.* 1 Juli 2018. <http://www.kemenpar.go.id/asp/detil.asp?c=16&id=4365>, accessed on February 8, 2019.

Susilowati, Endang., Dhanang Respati Puguh, Noor Naelil Masruroh. 2014. "Penanaman Nilai-Nilai Nasionalisme pada Generasi Muda di Kepulauan Natuna" *Humanika*, Vol. 19, No. 1. Semarang: Fakultas Ilmu Budaya, Universitas Diponegoro. pages. 158-170.

*Susilowati, Endang. dan Noor Naelil Masruroh. 2018. "Merawat Kebhinekaan Menjaga Keindonesiaan: Belajar dari Nilai Keberagaman dan Kebersatuan Masyarakat Pulau. Jurnal Sejarah Citra Lekha, Vol. 3, No. 1, 2018. Semarang: Departemen Sejarah, Fakultas Ilmu Budaya, Universitas Diponegoro. pages. 13-19.*

Tampi, Butje. 2017. "Konflik Kepulauan Natuna antara Indonesia dengan China (Suatu Kajian Yuridis). *Jurnal Hukum Unsrat.* Vol. 23 No. 10, Juli-Desember 2017. Manado: Universitas Sam Ratulangi. pages. 1-16.

Tim Penyusun Kamus Pusat Pembinaan dan Pengembangan Bahasa. 1990. *Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia.* Cetakan ketiga. Jakarta: Balai Pustaka, Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan.

Trisna, Yuri B. 2018. *Pulau Subi, Pusat Pertahanan Udara Jepang di Natuna.* 1 Juni 2018. <https://pelantar.id/berita/kepri-ray/natuna/pulau-subi-pusat-pertahanan-udara-jepang-dinatuna/>, accessed on February 25, 2019.

Vero, Adit. 2018. *Bupati Natuna Memakai Program Lima Pilar dalam Percepatan Pembangunan Daerahnya.* 24 Januari 2018. <https://www.wartakepri.co.id/2018/01/24/bupati-natuna-memakai-program-lima-pilar-dalam-percepatan-pembangunan-daerahnya/>, accessed on February 18, 2019.

Witton, Patrick (2003). "INTRODUCTION". *Indonesia. Lonely Planet.* hlm. 28, 944. ISBN 9781740591546.

DEVELOPMENT AS EXCLUSION, ITS IMPACTS AND COMMUNITY RESPONSES:

THE ORANG RIMBA AND THE ORANG BADUY COMPARED

*Dedi Supriadi Adhuri*

*Indonesian Institute of Sciences (LIPI)*

The conventional definition of development sees it as interventions geared towards the improvement of people's welfare. In contrast to this conceptualisation, this presentation will argue that development is a process of exclusion that brings marginalization and creates poverty. In this regard, the paper will provide an example of development in Jambi that has excluded the Orang Rimba from their place of life and livelihoods. The development, which in this context took the form of logging and forest conversion to plantation, not only threatened the survival of the Orang Rimba due to the significant decrease of natural resources upon which the people depended, but also the loss of space where they can express or practice their culture as a system of ideas. After describing some tangible impacts of this exclusion in regard to the Orang Rimba, to





confirm that the condition was really the impact of development, the paper will look at the condition of Orang Baduy who have --to some degree-- rejected such development. The rejection of development by the Orang Baduy has resulted in a relative socio-cultural integrity in the community. Finally, the presentation will close with a discussion of some scenarios of development and its impact upon traditional communities.

*Keywords: development, exclusion, Orang Rimba dan Orang Baduy*

HOW DEVELOPMENT AND CONSERVATION INTERVENTIONS MAY BOTH EXACERBATE AND MITIGATE  
MARGINALITY: SHIFTING POWER RELATIONS ON THE LINDU PLAIN, CENTRAL SULAWESI

*Greg Acciaioli*

*The University of Western Australia*

Among the development interventions of the Indonesian government briefly following independence was a program of 'seeding' numerous lakes across Indonesia with the spawn of Mozambique tilapia (*Oreochromis mossambicus*. i.e. *mujair* or *nila*). This paper traces the chain of consequences across decades of this fish's introduction in Lake Lindu in highland Central Sulawesi beginning in 1951. Initially, this intervention did not provide the enhanced livelihood opportunities to the Indigenous Lindu people intended by the government. Instead, Bugis migrants, IDPs from sectarian conflict in South and Central Sulawesi, used gill nets to intensify harvesting of the species and established a fish marketing system to the Palu Valley and beyond by recruiting kin and clients through chain migration. However, when the Bugis depleted the stock of tilapia in the early 1990s, the Indigenous Lindu people struck back, having been re-empowered by their successful resistance to a hydro-electric scheme (PLTA) at Lindu and by their emergent partnership with the Lore Lindu National Park authority and the park's co-manager, The Nature Conservancy (TNC), recognised through community conservation agreements. Once the lake had been reseeded, the Lindu customary council forced Bugis to adhere to customary *ombo* restrictions on fishing as part of reasserting control of the lake and surrounding resources. This emergent role has also given the Indigenous Lindu some control of further in-migration to the Lindu plain, further countering the socioeconomic dominance of migrants. This process of power reversal was also facilitated by the widening of the trail to accommodate the use of motorcycles by the Central Sulawesi Integrated Area Conservation and Development Project (CSIACDP) and the availability of cheap credit for motorcycle purchase in the early 2000s, which facilitated motorcycle purchases by Indigenous Lindu families and greatly lessened the role of Bugis intermediate marketers for transport of produce from the plain.

*Keywords: Development, Power Relations, Bugis, Ethnic Relations, Protected Areas*

#### BACKGROUND

This paper considers the 'unintended consequences' of various development and conservation interventions. In the context of a developmental state, such as is exemplified by New Order Indonesia, government interventions assumed projected benefit for communities assumed to be homogeneous. However, benefits were not equally shared, as cleavages along lines of ethnicity, religion, livelihood specialisation, language and other dimensions meant that some groups (and individuals) benefited more from development than others. This was particularly the case with regard to the differential benefits between entrepreneurially oriented migrants and marginalised



Indigenous peoples among whom they had settled. Some of the former groups were able to capitalise on the transformations catalysed by development, while many of the latter experienced 'relative deprivation' and an increase in their marginalised status.

Some of these inequalities were reduced or even overturned during the Reformasi and immediate post-Reformasi era due to a number of factors, not least of which was the rise of the Indigenous people's movement and its shepherding by numerous NGOs oriented to Indigenous rights, not least of which was Aliansi Masyarakat Adat Nusantara (AMAN). The intensification of conservation interventions from the 90s onwards also sometimes led to partnerships with Indigenous peoples that gave them some scope for resurrecting resource commons, and their control over these, from their *de facto* open access status. However, the rise of the new developmental state first nascently under Susilo Bambang Yudhono and then blossoming in the Jokowi era has once more reinstated many of the tendencies dominant in Suharto's New Order. The emphasis upon infrastructure development, despite the participatory processes by which some of it has been deliberated under the various types of Program Nasional Pemberdayaan Masyarakat (PNPM) and then the Village Law (UU no. 6 2014), has been implemented without due regard to the implications of such interventions for the exacerbation of power differentials among groups in the communities enjoying the benefits of such interventions and those who are precluded by their circumstances from deriving such advantages.

#### OBJECTIVE

This paper examines the consequences of a series of development and conservation interventions in the Lindu highland plain in Central Sulawesi from the early years of independent Indonesia through the New Order and on into the Reformasi and post-Reformasi periods. The paper highlights how early interventions favoured the migrants from South Sulawesi, facilitating their rise to economic dominance and nascent political dominance, but later interventions during Reformasi reversed these tendencies, creating conditions for the reassertion of political authority and economic power by the Indigenous people of the plain.

#### DESCRIPTION

This study derives its data from long-term participant-observation field work by the author in the Lindu plain, beginning from 1980 and continuing through 2018. It also depends upon consultation of primary sources (e.g. documents relating to the formation and governance of Lore Lindu National Park) and secondary sources, including the author's own articles from 1985 to the present. It is intended to integrate these sources from a perspective of historical anthropology, focusing on relations among competing ethnic groups on the Lindu plain as they have been impacted by a series of development and conservation interventions.

#### FINDINGS

Beginning with the dumping of tilapia spawn in Lake Lindu in 1951 by the Fisheries Department, development interventions throughout the Old and New Order functioned to enhance the position of migrant Bugis from South Sulawesi. These Bugis had initiated their migration to Lindu as IDPs from the *gerombolan* of Kahar Muzakkar in South and Southeast Sulawesi, but had expanded their presence through chain migration of various cohorts oriented to expanding economic enterprises. By the 1980s, the time of the author's initial field work, they had achieved economic dominance in the lake by establishing a system of fish distribution where they controlled





production through patron-client relations and marketing through their position as intermediate marketers, facilitated by their control of horse transport from the lake. They were quickly becoming the major land-owners in the lake through obtaining land, both for wet-rice (*sawah*) near the lake and for cash crop cultivation (*kebun*) in the surrounding hills, through *ganti-rugi* transactions.

This classic exemplification of a frontier of settlement, where settlers dominated the Indigenes among whom they had come to dwell, began to be subjected to a process of defrontierisation when the Indigenous Lindu people, in association with a local NGO, successfully opposed the erection of a hydro-electric dam that would have meant the ousting of all inhabitants from the upland plain. Having assumed a major role in the Indigenous Peoples movement in Indonesia on the basis of this victory, the Indigenous Lindu people were able to begin re-exercising a dominant position on the plain as co-managers of the Lore Lindu National Park through a Community Conservation Agreement and lobbying for the widening of the trail to the plain from the main road into the interior financed by the Central Sulawesi Integrated Area Development and Conservation Project (CSIADCP). The widened road enabled the Lindu people to bring by motorcycles, which they were able to buy through cheap credit made available from distributors in the capital Palu, their own produce – rice, fish, coffee, and increasingly cacao – down to the lowlands for marketing, thus reducing their dependence on Bugis intermediate marketers. The position of the Indigenous Lindu Adat Council as the local adjudicator and enforcer of park regulations facilitated their reassuming control of production from the lake through the imposition of *ombo* restrictions on harvesting fish when overfishing led to dwindling catches of lower-sized fish, thus allowing it to regulate Bugis fishing. These processes culminated in the successful campaign for recognition of Lindu as a separate ‘conservation subdistrict’ (*kecamatan konservasi*) under the auspices of the Reformasi era ‘blossoming’ (*pemekaran*) of new administrative districts. As all offices in the *kecamatan* government were held by Indigenous Lindu, this step effectively witnessed their reassumption of control of the plain as a matter of formal authority.

#### CONCLUSION/RESUME

This consideration of the impact of various development and conservation interventions upon the constellation of power relations at Lindu reveals how any introductions to local environments should be assessed with regard not just to such material criteria as livelihood incomes for local people in the aggregate. Rather, they also need to be considered in regard to how they affect the deployment of power relations among the constituent groups that constitute diverse, complex assemblages rather than homogeneous communities.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Acciaoli, Greg (1985) “Culture as Art: From Practice to Spectacle in Indonesia”, *Canberra Anthropology* 8(1&2): 148-174.
- (1999) “Principles and strategies of Bugis migration: some contextual factors relating to ethnic conflict”, *Masyarakat Indonesia: Majalah Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial Indonesia*, 25(2): 239-268.
- (2000) “Kinship and debt: the social organization of Bugis migration and fish marketing at Lake Lindu, Central Sulawesi”, *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land en Volkenkunde*, 156(3): 588-617.



- (2001) "Grounds of conflict, idioms of harmony: custom, religion, and nationalism in violence avoidance at the Lindu plain, Central Sulawesi", *Indonesia* 72: 81-112.
- (2002) "Re-empowering the 'art of the elders': the revitalization of adat among the To Lindu people of Central Sulawesi", in M. Sakai (ed.) *Beyond Java: Regional Autonomy and Local Societies in Indonesia*. Adelaide: Crawford House Publishing, pp. 217-244.
- (2007) "Strategy and subjectivity in co-management of Lore Lindu National Park (Central Sulawesi, Indonesia)", in N. Sodhi, G. Acciaioli, M. Erb, A.K-J. Tan (eds), *Biodiversity and human livelihoods in Protected Areas: Case Studies from the Malay Archipelago.*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 266-288.
- (2009) "Conservation and Community in the Lore Lindu National Park (Sulawesi): Customary Custodianship, Multi-ethnic Participation, and Resource Entitlement", in Carol Warren and John F. McCarthy, J., eds, 2009 *Locating the Commonwealth: Community, Environment and Local Governance in Reform Era Indonesia*. Oxon: Routledge, pp. 89-118.
- Acciaioli, Greg and Alka Sabharwal (2017) Frontierization and Defontierization: Reconceptualizing Frontier Frames. In *Transnational Frontiers of Asia and Latin America from 1800*, ed. Jaime Moreno and Bradley Tatar. Burlington Oxon: Ashgate – Taylor and Francis. Pp. 31-45.
- Burger, Joanna, Christopher Field, Richard Norgaard, Elinor Ostrom, and David Policansky (2001) "Introduction," in Joanna Burger, Elinor Ostrom, Richard B. Norgaard, David Policansky, and Bernard D. Goldstein, eds., *Protecting the Commons: A Framework for Resource Management in the Americas*, Washington DC: Island Press.
- Hardin, Garrett (1968) "The tragedy of the commons", *Science* 162: 1243-8.
- Harvey, Barbara Sillars (1974) *Tradition, Islam and Rebellion: South Sulawesi 1950-1965*, unpublished thesis, Cornell University.
- (1977) *Permesta: half a rebellion*, Ithaca NY: Cornell Modern Indonesia Project, Southeast Asia Program, Cornell University (Monograph Series Publication No. 57).
- Henley, David (2005) *Fertility, Food and Fever: Population, economy and environment in North and Central Sulawesi, 1600-1930* (Verhandelingen van het Koninklijk Instituut voor Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde 201), Leiden: KITLV Press.
- Kaudern, Walter (1925) *Ethnographical Studies in Celebes: results of the author's expedition to Celebes, 1917-192*, vol. I, *Migrations of the Toradja in Central Celebes*. Göteborg: Elanders Boktryckeri Aktiebolag.
- Kaudern, Walter (1940) "The noble families or maradika of Koelawi, Central Celebes", *Etnologiska Studier* 11: 30-124.
- Kesepakatan Lindu (n.d. [2005]) Kesepakatan Konservasi Masyarakat Dataran Lindu, Kecamatan Kulawi, Kabupaten Donggala. Unpublished conservation agreement held in The Nature Conservancy, Palu



- Khaeruddin, I. (n.d. [2002]) *Kesepakatan Konservasi Masyarakat di Lima Desa sekitar Taman Nasional Lore Lindu Sulawesi Tengah: laporan hasil kegiatan*, Unpublished report, The Nature Conservancy, Palu.
- Li, Tania Murray (2000) "Articulating Indigenous Identity in Indonesia: Resource Politics and the Tribal Slot", *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 42(1): 149-179.
- (2007) *The Will to Improve: governmentality, development, and the practice of politics*. Durham and London: Duke University Press.
- Lucas, Anton and Carol Warren (2003) "The state, the people, and their mediators: the struggle over agrarian law reform in post-New Order Indonesia", *Indonesia* 76: 87-126.
- Lynch, Owen J. and Harwell, Emily (2002) *Whose Natural Resources? Whose Common Good?: towards a new paradigm of environmental justice and the national interest in Indonesia*, Jakarta: Lembaga Studi dan Advokasi Masyarakat (ELSAM).
- Mattulada (1983) "Managemen tradisional dalam Kalangan Usahawan Orang Bugis-Makassar", *Lontara* 17:5-22.
- Ostrom, Elinor (1990) *Governing the Commons: The Evolution of Institutions for Collective Action*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Pelras, Christian (2000) "Patron-client ties among the Bugis and Makassarese of South Sulawesi", *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land en Volkenkunde* 156(3): 393-432
- (1998) *Seeing Like a State: how certain schemes to improve the human condition have failed*, Yale Agrarian Studies, New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Sugiharto, Hasan H., and Yabo, N. (n.d.) *Final Studi: Masalah Agraria di Dataran Lindu, Kecamatan Kulawi, Kabupaten Donggala, Sulawesi Tengah*. Unpublished report held at Yayasan Tanah Merdeka Office, Palu.
- The Nature Conservancy (TNC) and Direktorat Jenderal Perlindungan Hutan dan Konservasi Alam, and Taman Nasional Lore Lindu (n.d. [2001]) *Draft Management Plan: 2002-2007*. 4 volumes. Unpublished document held at the TNC office, Palu.
- Warren, Carol and John F. McCarthy, J. eds., 2009 *Locating the Commonwealth: Community, Environment and Local Governance in Reform Era Indonesia*. Oxon: Routledge
- Watling, Dick and Yaya Mulyana 1981 *Lore Lindu National Park Management Plan 1981 - 1986*. Report prepared by the World Wildlife Fund - Indonesia Programme (Bogor) for the Directorate of Nature Conservation, Directorate General of Forestry, Republic of Indonesia.
- Whitten, T., Mustafa, M., Henderson, G.S. (2002) *The Ecology of Sulawesi*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed., The Ecology of Indonesia Series, vol. IV, Singapore: Periplus.



## Role of Digital Ethnography in Indonesian Online Society

Coordinator: Anggun Susilo (Universitas Brawijaya)

Recently, there has been debate on fake news (or it is known as 'hoax') and how it causes horizontal conflicts in society. To encounter, special task forces are established either by government or civil society. In short, hoax is one of serious issues today. This may become more serious when 2019 election comes. In parallel with technical solution to block hoax, I urge to seriously thinking about how people easily believe on it without careful attention. It is known in academic that such information should be traced and verified prior to use it as reference. However, ordinary people may not do this. It does not say that they have to learn thoroughly about specific methodologies in scientific manner but at least there are alternatives to educate people on how to accept and to use information wisely. Given the present-day of Indonesian online society context, information spreads freely along with increased use of Internet as one of information resources. In this context, some people may use Internet for disseminating hated and provocations. At the same time, Internet users consume this without verification. To prevent misunderstanding and conflicts, anthropologists may purpose digital ethnography approach (DE). As an approach, DE enables people to triangulate such information in order to verify whether the information is valid or not. The panel of DE will consist of researches, practices and innovations under DE rubrics in attempts to encounter hoax. Furthermore, this panel welcomes people with various backgrounds such as from information technology (IT), social researchers, policy makers and academia. The overall objective of this panel is to disseminate DE as alternative solution encountering hoax.

ISIS AND "VIRTUAL CALIPHATE":

AN ANTHROPOLOGICAL ANALYSIS ON THE RISE OF CYBER TERRORISM IN INDONESIA

*Al Chaidar Abdurrahman Puteh*

*Universitas Malikussaleh*

*Herd Sahrasad*

*Universitas Paramadina*

*Although the Islamic State of Iraq and Syria (ISIS) has recently lost its territories and 80% of its revenue base, 30 official and semi-official ISIS channels and chat rooms still emphasize ISIS's longevity and strength in the future. So far, the sharp decline in the area experienced by ISIS has also destroyed ISIS's ability to collect revenues from oil production and smuggling, taxation, confiscation and other similar activities. As a result of ISIS's destruction, ISIS's average monthly income has dropped by 80 percent, from US \$ 81 million in the second quarter of 2015 to only US \$ 16 million in the second quarter of 2017. However, ISIS is still strong in playing its role and existence on social media and the internet. Through the internet and social media, state development efforts by ISIS show everything to domestic and international audiences, from dam construction, digging wells, building infrastructure, to electrification of villages under ISIS control, and inoculating children in hospitals. The use of cyber-terrorism through the internet and social media has been carried out by ISIS and other extremist groups to spread hatred through cyberspace. The internet and social media sites are used as a broad database of what and how to promote violence as their strategy, where individuals can learn about deviant behavior from other groups, so that they obtain an extremism learning categorized by association, definition, differentiation, reinforcement, and imitation.*



## POWER AND STRENGTH OF SOCIAL MEDIA

Social media (Social Media) is an internet-based online media that allows users to interact virtually (in other terms often called cyberspace: *dumay*, acronym of *dunia maya*, cyber-space). In social media, there are accounts to share photos, videos and the latest status, greet and meet each other virtually. The internet, social media and multimedia technology become a unit that is difficult to separate and pushes on new things. The *salafi* radicalism of this century makes the image of Islam in unfavorable situations and conditions, and raises connectivity between Islam and violence, thus harming the Islamic world in general. Even though Islam is a religion that is *rahmatan lil alamin*. The birth of Islam thousands of centuries ago was not even colored with swords, but Islam brought messages of peace brought by the Prophet Muhammad. On the one hand it also labeled radicalism as a very negative understanding. There are two main things that can be concluded:

First, that the internet media takes a very large portion and role in providing information to the public, especially young people to radical ideology. This is compounded by the fact that the recruitment of young people in radical organizations is mostly done using internet media. The fact that terrorist organizations and affiliates have used technology that can make it easier for them to spread propaganda and recruit potential members through the internet is a very sad thing about the progress of the mass media itself.

Second, the mass media plays a key role in deterring and providing information to the public on issues of radicalism so that the public can take precautionary measures to develop extremist movements starting from their own environment. Although basically, Indonesia is a moderate Islamic country and radicalism is difficult to develop in this country, it does not mean that Indonesia is not a target for them, especially the younger generation. Whatever it is, the social media has moral and social responsibility towards the public, although on the other hand the news coverage does indeed benefit these movements as a form of free propaganda, but it also raises mass movements from the community itself to actively play a role and protect the environment from things that can disrupt security and public order without only relying on the government.

The Internet, in the context of violence in the name of religion - acts of terrorism, violence against minorities and cases of conflict between religious communities - is one of the most widely used media to channel the desires of democracy. Meanwhile, many Muslim extremists used the moment and the media to spread the ideology of their jihad. Therefore, all ideas, ideas of radicalism, terrorism are spread easily using technological advances. In the Muslim community, the term *Virtual Islam* was born.

Through the internet many have expressed their own interpretations of Islam and the principles relating to Islam. This has serious implications with the variety of material and perspectives available and randomly in which this information can be accessed. One's first experience with Islam in cyberspace is perhaps what is called a radical (divided division) group of organizations as a mainstream orthodox interpretation.

The results of John Obert Voll's research on terrorist networks are no longer the most important link in the struggle by transforming the politics of Muslim communities around the world, but intellectual networks and the exchange of ideologies through the internet (email). One pattern of terrorism in Indonesia uses cyberterrorism, namely the use of computers and internet networks by terrorist groups in carrying out their actions such as using internet media for the process of radicalization, breaking into financial systems, controlling systems of transportation equipment



such as trains, airplanes. Imam Samudra, began to be active in cyberspace, ahead of the blast of the Bali II Bombing since June 2005 until it was moved to Nusa Kambangan. In the Bali Bomb II, Noordin M. Top and Abdul Azis built a special site as a medium to coordinate all related activities in carrying out acts of terror. Max Fiderman created the anshor.net site from a credit card.

The strength of the internet lies in its paradox and contradiction. Because, cyberspace is a virtual space that is formed through networks between computers. When wandering in it we will find various panoramas full of paradoxes and contradictions; pleasure-fear, evil goodness, falsehood. The paradox of cyberspace is indeed the same as paradox in the real world, but it is extreme, strong, direct, intense.

Jeff Zaleski presents a map of thoughts behind cyberspace by showing various ideas, including paradoxes from various cyberists, cyberreligionists, cyberprogrammers. They are optimistic about the new reality of cyberspace which is considered to be able to replace the existing reality and can become a kind of new religion, new spirituality, new God. In addition, Zaleski described how their fatalist attitude in dealing with various bad and frightening sides of the new world.

On the other hand, Zaleski displays a map of cyberspace users by various real religionist groups (Hinduism, Buddhism, Judaism, Christianity, Islam) how this new world is used as a means of spreading religious teachings, communication between religious people, even as a channel of spiritual energy. How cyberspace is a positive and effective tool for the reality of diversity in this global society.

Mark Slouka, a critic of American culture is very cynical about the people behind information technology by making scathing criticisms of the philosophers and ideologies behind the technology of cyberspace that instill the self-religionists, people who have an obsession to be God. They are people who believe the world of mind can be loaded (made simulated) in a computer. Also believe the future of humans is not in RL (Real Life) but in various forms of VR (Virtual Reality). Even believing cyberspace is a form higher than spirituality.

They are through computer technology as if creating a kind of prophetic movement according to their version. In such conditions, as Judge Bey said in *The Information War*, Media (cyberspace) takes over the role of religion (priest). In his duty to give humans a way out of the body by redefining spirit as information. Though the essence of information in cyberspace is an image whose abstract form seizes the primacy of body principles and stops it with the principle of bodiless ecstasy. The Islamic radicalism movement that has emerged on virtual networks. *Facebook, YouTube, Twitter, Tumbler*, and free application services like WhatsApp have become spaces for new ways to do propaganda, recruitment, training, planning, invitations to the establishment of the Islamic Khilafah. The current strategy that continues to be practiced by "defenders of Islam" influences the way of thinking of Muslim societies. They actively use social media by targeting young people as the majority of citizens on netizens.

#### RADICAL SALAFISM

In recent developments in the Middle East, radicalism among the Salafists has surged sharply, as evidenced by the rise of the Islamic State of Iraq and Syria (ISIS). So far, the Jihadist Salafists and Takfiri have formed the Islamic State of Iraq and Syria (ISIS). Nowadays, although ISIS has recently lost territory and 80% of its revenue base, 30 official and semi-official ISIS channels and chat rooms still emphasize ISIS's longevity and strength in the future. So far, the sharp decline in the area





experienced by ISIS has also destroyed ISIS's ability to collect revenues from oil production and smuggling, taxation, confiscation and other similar activities. As a result of ISIS's destruction, ISIS's average monthly income has dropped by 80 percent, from US \$ 81 million in the second quarter of 2015 to only US \$ 16 million in the second quarter of 2017. However, ISIS is still strong in playing its role and existence on social media and the internet. Through the internet and social media, state development efforts by ISIS show everything to domestic and international audiences, from dam construction, digging wells, building infrastructure, to electrification of villages under ISIS control, and inoculating children in hospitals.

The use of cyber-terrorism through the internet and social media has been carried out by ISIS and other extremist groups to spread the hatred through cyberspace. The internet and social media sites are used as a broad database of what and how to promote violence as their strategy, where individuals can learn about deviant behavior from other groups, so that they obtain an extremism learning categorized by association, definition, differentiation, reinforcement, and imitation.

Mia Bloom and Chelsea Daymon (2018: 1-17) caution that the general use of peer-to-peer encrypted messages by ISIS shows no signs of declining despite early predictions and estimation that the group is in its final turmoil. So far, the Islamic online media platform of the State of Iraq and Syria (ISIS) processes and mixes graphic audiovisual content with religious-ideological writings to justify violent terrorist tactics. In recent years, ISIS jihadist groups have grown and developed its propaganda to open API (Application Programming Interface) platforms such as Twitter®, Facebook®, YouTube®, and Tumblr®.<sup>10</sup>

But ISIS elites and leaders are aware that, platforms such as *Twitter* and *Facebook* have been progressively monitored, and face aggressive monitoring and elimination of accounts, so that *Telegram* has been selected to become ISIS's top priority as a platform for spreading propaganda and recruiting new members. Research investigates how *Telegram* is used by ISIS and its supporters and assesses what kind of threat *Telegram* use might lead to a future when ISIS transitioned to "Virtual Caliphate". The ISIS elites and leaders are aware of the use of social media, the internet, and new technologies, even their risks should not be ruled out, especially considering the encrypted platform is the main means for radicalization, recruitment and planning. As Lucas Kello from Oxford University (2017) said, in the virtual domain, vital strategic operations can be "shrouded in secrecy", causing difficulties for scientific research, security forces, defense operators and policy makers to track them down.

ISIS elites and leaders understand that individuals shape their perceptions of themselves based on identification with groups, core group values, and their emotions. As a result, the continued presence in the online environment can encourage extreme political and religious views, excessive violence, and competition outside the group. In fact, ISIS also creates a spatial echo for radicalization. Among social media and internet sites, *Telegram* applications are increasingly in demand as a platform of choice for clandestine activities of ISIS and its supporters. The uniqueness of *Telegram* in terms of privacy and security made it succeed in reaching up to 100 million users

---

<sup>10</sup> Mia Bloom and Chelsea Daymon , Assessing the Future Threat: ISIS's Virtual Caliphate, journal *Orbis*, May 2018, pp. 372-388



in 2016. *Telegram* is commonly used by ISIS terrorists to recruit and coordinate attacks, including in Brussels, Belgium, 2017. *Telegrams*, among others, are also used to communicate by perpetrators of attacks in Paris in 2015, attacks on 2017 New Year's Eve in Turkey, and attacks in St Petersburg, Russia in April 2017. In Indonesia, a number of terrorism suspects who were arrested in December 2016 claimed to have learned to make bombs by following directions via *Telegram*. ISIS elites and leaders understand that *Telegram* cannot be traced after an attack.

In this case, the use of peer-to-peer encrypted messages by ISIS shows no signs of decreasing despite early estimates that the ISIS group is in its final upheaval. As social media, ISIS understands that platforms, such as *Twitter* and *Facebook*, are progressively monitored by monitoring and deleting aggressive accounts. As a result, *Telegram* remains a top priority for ISIS to spread propaganda and recruit new members.

The US / Western researchers are now investigating how *Telegram* is used by ISIS and its supporters and assessing what kinds of threats from *Telegram* use in the future when ISIS transitioned to "Virtual Caliphate".

Initially, most of its propaganda focused on the development of the Islamic State both physically and figuratively, offering "supra-national brands "Khilafah" (Virtual Caliphate) as legitimizing and moral reasons for their actions and existence. Projections of state buildings are intended to create attractive options for prospective immigrants, but also for the ISIS transition from the rebel movement to the formation of a distinctive "Islamic State", and "Virtual Caliphate".

Even though it is in the form of a Virtual Caliphate, ISIS is able to continue to use various information regarding the area of operation. This ability includes doctrinal military, strategic communication, civil-military relations, engagement of key leaders, supporting operations, and military fraud. (Harleen Gambhir, 2016)<sup>11</sup> ISIS uses this internet capability in physical capacity with respect to the local population and in digital capacity through global communication to their networks and the main supporters. ISIS also utilizes operational security, electronic warfare, and cyber operations in various parts of the world.

Thus, it is clear that even though ISIS has been defeated and cornered due to losing a lot of territory, ISIS is still able to build a 'Virtual Caliphate' which is capable of moving globally, disseminating its agenda, vision and mission to the domestic and international community. Indonesia must not be complacent, and must continue to be vigilant in anticipating the development of terrorism by the Virtual Caliphate, its networks and cells in various parts of the world, including in Southeast Asia. Moreover, it is very possible that ISIS members and sympathizers are in the area around us and are targeting us to be part of their Virtual Caliph's territory.

#### FROM BOOKS TO VIRTUAL WORLD

The existence of social media intensified the war while at the same time expanding the influence of the teachings of the movement that was spread to the community. In this situation, the state can have the right to force its citizens to ideology with the state's ideology, while each individual has their own ideology, then there is attraction between personal ideology on the one hand and

---

<sup>11</sup> Harleen Gambhir , the Virtual Caliphate: ISIS 's Information Warfare , Washington DC: Institute for the Study of War,2016





communal ideology on the other. Against the clash of ISIS ideologies which are considered disturbing the existence of the Indonesian Republic, it should have been taken a position: First, Anticipatory, namely fortifying and confining the teachings and flow of the ISIS movement so as not to expand and massive in the midst of society.<sup>12</sup> Second, Comprehensive, by always instilling Islamic values that are *rahmatan lil alamin* to all components of the nation through imaging and positive information content, especially on social networks. Third, Educative, by conducting an educational movement against religious radicalism carried out starting from the level of early childhood education to tertiary education. Fourth, Participatory, cooperating with all elements of society to be actively involved in counteracting the spread of ideology and the teachings disseminated by ISIS followers, both from the path of social media, television media and other media. Anticipatory efforts on the widespread influence of the ISIS movement through social media were carried out by massively campaigning on various bad news addressed to ISIS. This was done so that there was an awareness that the ISIS movement must indeed be avoided and shunned by all groups besides it also serves to narrow the space for ISIS in Indonesia.

The intensity of the news is carried out in parallel by campaigning for peaceful Islamic issues and the death of *lilalamin* so that the integrity of the information obtained first, religious radical groups that can lead and conduct activities by social media accessors become complete and comprehensive. The internet combines new media forces and political aspirations that Kahn and Kellner<sup>13</sup> say will be increasingly popular and entrenched in the future, where the growth of users is fast and difficult to predict and the variety of facilities provided to produce material and models of democracy. Data released by internetworldstats.com states that there are more than 30 million internet users in Indonesia and the user growth rate is around 12.5 percent per year. Indonesia is also ranked 7th in the world in using Facebook; until this article was written there were at least 11,759,980 Facebook accounts made with the age range of users between 18-34 years.

With this large number of users, the internet is a fertile virtual area for various political activities. It could be that the internet is a powerful medium of political movements in Indonesia. And it could also be that internet users emerged as a new force, a pressure group, and a mass base of democracy that virtually in the enforcement of democracy in this country. The internet is no longer just technological innovation in networks, but has become a medium of political power.

This is what McLuhan said as the Medium is the Message, Facebook transformed into a virtual political party with the most political members compared to all DPR (Parliament) and DPRD (local parliament) members. However, with the ability to construct a virtual identity, this opportunity has the potential to bring out the power of virtual terrorism on the internet. Because terrorism can become anyone with a fake identity, such as name, photo, and other identifying information. This condition opens opportunities for religious radical groups to penetrate themselves in a network of friends in cyberspace.

As a result, secondly, these radical religious groups can carry out recruitment activities and plant radical ideologies for anyone. For example, opening an account on social media such as Facebook allows religious radical groups to make friends with anyone and the next stage determines the

---

<sup>12</sup> Khamami Zada, *Wajah Penerbitan Islam di Indonesia Radikal*, Jurnal Indo-Islamika Volume 1, Nomor 1, 2011/1432:1-19. Noorhaidi Hasan, *Laskar Jihad: Islam, Militansi, dan Pencarian Identitas di Indonesia Pasca-Orde Baru*, Jakarta: LP3ES & KITLV Jakarta, 2008.

<sup>13</sup> Richard Kahn, Douglas Kellner, *New Media and Internet Activism: From the 'Battle of Seattle' to Blogging*, Sage Publications, 2004.



target of individuals who will become cadres or penetrate the understanding of religious radicalism towards the individual.

The virtual world has become an important part in shaping thoughts, behaviors, deeds as well as basic needs (styles) of human life now. Like getting the intake of "oxygen" and "blood flow" these terrorist groups continue to use the internet, social media for their interests continues to grow. Imagine, Gabriel Weimann's research shows that the network of terrorist groups influences more attention on the use of cyberspace. This can be seen from the number and variety of sites managed by jihadi groups which have increased from year to year 2,650; in 2014 shows more than 9,800 sites managed by this jihadist group. Weimann emphasized that the virtual world does offer many advantages that make terrorist groups so serious in managing it.<sup>14</sup>

Among the advantages; easy access, lack of binding controls and regulations, wide audience, anonymity, speed of information flow, can be used as an interaction medium, very cheap to create and maintain, are multimedia (print, sound, photo and video) and that remain its main purpose, the internet has become a mainstream media source.

In addition to the quantity issue of radical sites that continues to grow, but what is very important to pay attention to is the significant development of the form and pattern of terrorism itself. There are at least three stages of development in the form and pattern of the spread of the notion of terrorism in this virtual world; First, the initial stage is only the dissemination of ideology through website facilities. Second, the use of media interaction features such as the creation of forums and chatrooms. Third, the use of social media such as *YouTube*, *Facebook*, *Twitter* is increasingly popular.

Gabriel Weimann's admitted, the shift to the realm of social media carried out by terrorist groups had the purpose of building interaction, appearing more trendy and popular, more touching on the target, and demographically the inhabitants of the social media environment.<sup>15</sup> Responding to the strong influence of the internet, social media used as a medium for learning the attitude of intolerance, radicalism, suicide bombings, such as the results of a study conducted with Brookings Institution and Google Web, published by the *New York Times* there were 46 thousand twitter accounts for ISIS propaganda, twitter blocked 125,000 ISIS-like accounts at the end 2014. ISIS accounts scattered on average have more than 1,000.32 followers.

In the Pew Research Center survey in 2015 showed that in Indonesia, about 4% (10 million people) supported all forms of ISIS actions, most of which were among young people. Compare the results of the Setara Institute surveying 684 students from 114 Middle Schools Public (SMU) in Jakarta and Bandung to find out the views of students about the ISIS movement.

The result, showed 1 in 14 students (9.5 percent of 684) supported the ISIS movement. Regarding the strong influence of the internet, social media has become a new media in disseminating acts of intolerance, radicalism, terrorism in Indonesia: in 2011, the Ministry of Communication and Information and PB NU (Central Board of Nahdlatul Ulama) blocked sites (300 out of 900) containing radicalism content; and in 2015, the Ministry of Communication and Information blocked 22 sites (Islam) that spread radicalism. This blocking was at the request of the BNPT with

---

<sup>14</sup> Gabriel Weimann, *Terrorism in Cyberspace: The Next Generation*, with (Foreword) Bruce Hoffman, Woodrow Wilson Center Press / Columbia University Press (April 21, 2015)

<sup>15</sup> Ibid.



3 criteria: First, using violence in the name of religion. Second, *takfiri* (forgiving others) Third, interpret jihad in a limited way.

BNPT data launches from 2010-2015 there are 814,594 sites already blocked; in the suicide bombing of the Sepunton Solo Full Gospel Bethel Church (GBIS), perpetrator Pino Damayanto (Ahmad Urip), member of the Cirebon Jamaah Ansharut Tauhid (JAT) had time to browse Warnet Solonet; Video entitled "The Light of Tarbiyah on the Earth of the Caliphate"; uploaded a photo that reads "Ansar Khilafah Islamiyah from Ciwalen Garut, West Java Indonesia" which was allegedly taken in the area of Mount Papandayan, Cisarupan Subdistrict Garut.

Polri data reported that there were 514 Indonesian citizens alleged to have participated in ISIS and BNPT notes that there were 10 radical groups in Indonesia that supported the ISIS movement. Indonesia's CNN report on Monday (03/30/2015) showed a day of supporters of the ISIS militant group spreading 100 thousand tweets to plan attacks and propaganda; the perpetrator of the bombing at Alam Sutera Mall, Leopard Wisnu Kumala was a Christian; arrest of Gigih Rahmat (KGR), GRD (31), Tar (21), ES (35) groups in the Batam Center area, TS (46) in Nagoya, HGY (20) and MTS (19) on Jalan Brigjen Katamso, Batu Aji, Batam. If the social media is not properly controlled, it will endanger the existence of a state and religious life.

The rise of radical Salafism is getting stronger after the attack on Al-Qaeda on September 11, 2001 to the New York World Trade Center (WTC) building, in which more than 12,000 were killed. This September 11, 2001 Salafi terrorist act marked a new era in the post-Cold War terrorism movement, an Islam-based terrorism movement. Islam is in the spotlight of the world because in reality acts of terrorism involve a number of individuals or organizations that contain Islamic meanings and symbols of Islam are very attached to acts of terrorism.

As a result, the study of terrorism is a hot issue that is hotly discussed. Because, terrorism has had extensive consequences, not only politically and militarily, but also economically. This September 11, 2001 attack was followed by a series of suicide bombings in Bali in 2002, Madrid in 2004, London in 2005, New Delhi in 2005, Mumbai in 2006. Suicide bombings also occur in conflict zones such as in Iraq, Kashmir, Sri Lanka, Israel-Palestine and Middle East countries. The radicalism of Salafists in the WTC bombing September 11, 2011 became a new era after the cold war which considered terrorism to be synonymous with Islam.

#### CONCLUDING REMARKS

The terrorism movement is no longer a secular organization such as the Japanese Red Army (JRA), the Tamil Tigers in Sri Lanka, the Red Brigade in Italy and others, whereas the terrorism movement is now synonymous with Islam such as al-Qaeda and Jamaah Islamiyah. The Islamist-based terrorism movement is nowadays a real threat throughout the world, including in Indonesia. Terrorism has the nature of political motives and goals, political claims and political struggles. Terrorism is a notion that in order to achieve goals often justifies various methods including violence, intimidation and murder. Indeed, terrorism is not solely based on religious factors but also other aspects concerning the economy, politics and history that are closely linked in the search for identity amid the current of modernization and globalization.

During this time, many people considered the categorization the result of Western creation to divide Muslims and prevent Muslims from unifying and advancing. Therefore, it is not strange if when the Bali I bombing by radical Salafists occurred in 2002 which killed around 200 people from



20 countries in the world<sup>7</sup> and the Bali Bomb II, many Salafist leaders stated that the terrorists were only "fictional" Westerners to damage the image of Islam to always be associated with terrorists and violence.

However, the terror incidents in Indonesia continued in a row, followed by the arrest of terrorists, we witnessed other facts in the form of networks and testimonies formed by them. In Indonesia and Southeast Asia, it is possible that the biggest threat is not from Salafist radicalism or Islamic terrorism (the number of followers of Islamic radicalism in Indonesia and Southeast Asia is relative small compared to the majority of peace-loving Indonesian Muslims), but the biggest threat comes from global information technology, internet and media that exploited and used by the radical Salafist, which are increasingly out of control by the government, while the IT community and social media themselves do not develop a strong self-control system.

It should be noted that there are indeed radical Salafists who dedicate their lives to being terrorists, teach terrorism, galvanize potential terrorists, and convince people to follow a terrorist-style understanding of Islam. From this phenomenon, we can say that radicalism and terrorism are not purely Western creations, but are real facts among the Salafist Muslim because there are those who believe, embrace, and develop them from among the Muslims themselves.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

Mia Bloom and Chelsea Daymon, *Assessing the Future Threat: ISIS's Virtual Caliphate*, journal *Orbis*, May 2018, pp. 372-388

*Harleen Gambhir, the Virtual Caliphate: ISIS 's Information Warfare*, Washington DC: Institute for the Study of War, 2016.

Khamami Zada, *Wajah Penerbitan Islam di Indonesia Radikal*, Jurnal Indo-Islamika Volume 1, Nomor 1, 2011/1432:1 -19.

Noorhaidi Hasan, *Laskar Jihad: Islam, Militansi, dan Pencarian Identitas di Indonesia Pasca-Orde Baru*, Jakarta: LP3ES & KITLV Jakarta, 2008.

Richard Kahn, Douglas Kellner, *New Media and Internet Activism: From the 'Battle of Seattle' to Blogging*, Sage Publications, 2004.

Gabriel Weimann, *Terrorism in Cyberspace: The Next Generation*, with (Foreword) Bruce Hoffman, Woodrow Wilson Center Press / Columbia University Press (April 21, 2015)

"PART OF THE SPECTACLE"

POLITICAL BUZZERS AND THE PERFORMING OF DIGITAL PROPAGANDA

*Pradipa P. Rasidi*

*Department of Anthropology Universitas Indonesia*

*On discussing political manipulation on the internet, there has been not enough examination on how propaganda is performed by the persons tasked to do the work. This paper looks at the performance of political buzzers: individuals employed to manage several social media accounts to disseminate information concerning electoral candidates.*



*The paper argues that the lives of digital propaganda cannot be isolated from Indonesian post-authoritarian experience, where political participation has been limited only to electoral ballot. Being a political buzzer allows a certain kind of civic engagement, where the performers gain a sense of agency in directing political narratives.*

*Keywords: muddle, political participation, political astroturfing, digital propaganda*

## INTRODUCTION

Fiona is one among many fluent political conversationalists on Twitter. A glimpse of her timeline shows frequent commentaries on Jakarta's electoral candidacy on 2017, interspersed between her musings of her daily lives. Tweets like "Ahok [the then-governor who compete in the election] haters have to watch this video!!!" appear in-between personal thoughts like "there is no place like home."

The account named Fiona, however, is not a legible voter for Jakarta election. She is not even an actual jet black-haired young woman as shown in her profile picture. She is one among countless fake accounts that lurk within Indonesian cyberscape, appearing to public only in certain moments like election. The account operator, a man in his late 20s, live in Jakarta's neighboring town. He is employed by a team whose work is to help winning their employer's electoral candidate in Jakarta election.

Studies on digital manipulation for the purpose of politics have seen a significant rise in recent years. Many have discussed its spread, impact, circulation, including the way it is perceived, as it is understood as contributing to the rise of so-called post-truth era, ridden with 'fake news' and 'alternative facts'. (Parahita 2018; Utami 2018; Kristiyono & Jayanti 2017; Mair 2017). Others have discussed its patterns of recruitment and tactics (Rongbin 2015; Paul & Matthews 2016). A significant part on the discussion on digital manipulation of politics put attention on "computational propaganda" (Woolley 2016), that is, the use of machine (bots) to disseminate problematic information. The point of such manipulation is to twist public opinion in favor of the interest of their employer.

Rongbin (2015) has elaborated how digital manipulation workers are motivated by monetary reasons and opportunities to work on state organizations that can strengthen their resume when looking for jobs. But what does disseminating political propaganda mean for the workers themselves? How do they perceive the dissonance of working for candidates they do not favor?

I take an Indonesian case of political manipulation workers in Jakarta 2017 election. They are commonly known as "political buzzers", as their task is to buzz (propagate) opinions about certain issue their employers need to voice to the public. The word buzzer actually has contested meaning, both ethically and emically. Camil, et al (2017), for example, define buzzers as "individual or account who has the capacity to amplifying messages by drawing attention and/or building conversation motivated by certain reasons." They account for possibility of personal, unpaid acts in this definition of buzzer, as long as they intend to promote intensively certain opinions on an issue.

I find it more productive to limit the definition of buzzer under a certain commercial or political interest. The destination of online astroturfer as the closest to my purpose, which is "groups of people that [are] hired to present certain beliefs or opinions ... the goal of the message sender is to convince the receiver that the message content is a heartfelt, rational, and defensible opinion



held by a social peer." (Zhang, et al. 2013: 2 & 4) I categorize buzzers into two kinds: those who operate with their own, usually personal, accounts; and those who operate multiple fake accounts. The former is usually also known as (political) influencers, and the latter I term as fake account operators. In this paper, I use the term political buzzers to refer to those operators.

This paper is informed by interviews with three fake account operators and two digital strategists who coordinate such political campaigns. I also had the opportunity to hang out with one of them in a casual environment. Part of this experience is an observation on Twitter from October to December 2016, closely following activities of fake accounts, influencers, and the way they were interacted with other Twitter denizens--a "deep hanging out" (Clifford 1996) on Twitter cyberspace.

#### DESCRIPTION AND FINDINGS

Fake account operators commonly work in group. The group can consist of 10 to 30 individuals. A group is led by a coordinator who handles day-to-day matter such as content details and communicate with their supervisors. The groups typically are not tied directly to the candidate who compete in election. The candidate campaign team usually hire a marketing firm, where they outsource the work to another group which will handle technical day-to-day matters. Part of this digital campaign structure is "social media volunteers" or "social media activists", who are not officially tied to the campaign team, but are involved in supervising the operation (see also TEMPO 2016; Lamb 2018; Potkins 2019).

Those groups, akin to cells in terrorist network, may or may not know each other. They perform different tasks and work for different purpose in the year-long campaign nearing the election. Some groups work with a regular shift on a certain office (see also Lamb 2018), some others work on the go, completing their task on their spare time. Regardless of where they physically work, they mostly coordinate virtually through WhatsApp groups.

The operation adopted war-like metaphors. From my observation and interviews, Twitter has been described as a "battleground" (*medan perang*). Some social media volunteers declared themselves as "war commander" (*panglima perang*). Some WhatsApp groups are named as "special forces" (*pasukan khusus*) (Lamb 2018) or "task force" (*satuan tugas*). Twitter itself has been described by its denizens as a "bustling city", a network of interconnected strangers where everyone talks without really knowing each other (Rudyansjah & Rasidi 2018). A feeling of familiar strangeness on Twitter verse and costly electoral competition may drive this metaphor.

The on-the-ground operators themselves, however, see their activities differently. Like Rongbin (2015) has suggested, monetary reasons are one of their motivations. But monetary incentive alone is not enough to live in such concerted political efforts. While the task has been described as "easy money", some buzzers may struggle with daily operations. They may participate in spreading problematic information, which factual accuracy is questioned and generally shunned in Indonesian conversations about politics. They may also work for candidates who they do not personally favor.

"We just have to be professional," one buzzer, Rahmat, told me. "We can't make this personal (*kita gak bisa bawa pribadi kita*), if we do that, it would be difficult [to work]." Buzzing work is described as "just business" (*pekerjaan biasa*), indicating an alienation between the worker and their labor. But crafting a fake account who looks like seemingly authentic person participating in





political conversations require a certain dedication. Alternating between political tweets with personal thoughts is one matter. Another matter is the way buzzers have to interact, through their fake accounts, with other Twitter denizens who may agree or disagree with their opinions.

One of their task is to post not only their own tweets, but engage with influencers, be it political influencers on their side, not on theirs, or even non-political influencers who tweeted political materials. Debates, known as *twitwar*, are common on Twitter political conversations. Buzzers are briefed by their coordinators on what kind of opinions on certain issues they have to bring forth, but the details are left to themselves. Thus, they have to improvise when other accounts debate them. Ricky, another buzzer, described it as such:

"We know our target, we take important people, political pundits (*pengamat politik*). If it's random accounts (*akun-akun gak jelas*), the followers are under 50, I'm not concerned with them." Ricky laughed. "Debating them only serves to boost their followers, there is no purpose to it. ... We have to know what we want to argue about, that's why we're given materials [by the coordinator]. [When debating] sometimes it gets too exciting (*seru*). Even when I know I'm wrong, I have to continue arguing my point, wouldn't make sense to defend their point, right?" Ricky let out a big laugh. "But I know they are actually right, so I ask my friends [buzzer colleagues], how should I counter. Sometimes I get too excited."

Buzzers have to make a noise (*buat ramai*) on the opinions they are propagating, in the hope that the narratives would be picked up by mass media. Taking up narratives to gauge popularity on certain topics is a common practice in Indonesia, with Kompas TV (2016) once gauge candidate popularity from conversations on Twitter. That is why debates is crucial element in political buzzing. When there is nothing to debate, it would be necessary to invent it. Ricky continued,

We don't know if it is [social media debates] for show (*settingan*) or not. We don't know what happens behind the curtain, it can be for show. Probability theory, you know, probability. ... I know [debates may be for show] because I occasionally do it. I pretend to be a supporter of someone, use anonymous account. Then I debate other accounts. It became big (*jadinya ramai*). ... On such occasion I would ask my friends [buzzer colleagues] to debate me, and I will debate them back, as if we were supporters of different candidates. Our candidates and teams know of our show [*tahu settingan kita*] so there would be no conflict. We would only be conflicting with outsiders. ... It's legitimate, right (*sah-sah saja, kan*), and they [the candidate] always support us. Making things exciting (*buat seru-seruan*). To make a noise, right? (*Supaya lebih ramai, kan?*)"

Buzzers like Ricky enjoy the work as it allows him to participate in political debates, sporting different perspectives which he may or may not agree. Being anonymous lets him to speak without having to fear repercussion, as he considered Indonesians as "not mature enough to debate about politics". Similarly, Rifad sees the work of political buzzing as an opportunity to participate in political discussions. He elaborated,

"It's exciting, if you like these kind of stuff, it's really exciting. It's like, like becoming one of the politician." Rifad smile turned into a big laugh. "It's like playing a chess. It's really exciting. Attacking opponents, other politicians, doing black campaign. It's exciting because we have the data. We have complete studies (*kajian lengkap*), data, to fight (*berantem*) with others, other people may not have this much data. ... [If someone attacks our candidate] we can counter them, we can crush them. We can do so, because we have the complete data. We can change other people's thinking, 'that's wrong, this one is right.' The media then will take us as their story. It's exciting, like we are becoming politicians, part of spectacle on media (*tontonan di media*). It's full of intricacies."





Politics is composed of "muddle" (Bateson 1948), where the consequences go beyond electoral politics. Buzzers are engaged inside this muddle, but its muddle--"intricacies"--are obscured by the "excitement" (*keseruan*) the buzzers experience while dealing with conflicting arguments. The need to make political conversations go big (*ramai*) also immerses buzzer in a certain kind of performance where they almost convince themselves to agreeing into opinions they personally disagree with. It may be said that to "tidy up" (Bateson 1948) this muddle, buzzers take a spectacle turn in understanding politics.

#### CONSLUSION/DISCUSSION

How did the notion of excitement and spectacle got into the lexicon of buzzers in understanding electoral competition they participate in? One way to explain it may lies on how Indonesian politics is treated--mainly in Jakarta--as a spectacle itself. There is a huge gap between daily lives of ordinary people and the spectacle of electoral politics. Politicians, especially legislative members, lack proper constituency in big cities like Jakarta. They are not engaged with citizens they are supposed to represent. The costly electoral competition is accompanied with politicians' acrobatics displayed on news, with constant arguments and fantastical statements on the state of the affair. Indonesian authoritarian history has resulted in a perception that "politics" is something far away, not directly related to the lives of its citizens, limited only in spectacular entertainment provided by news media (Utomo 2014; Siegel 1984).

What remains is a "floating mass" that favors individual politics (Savirani 2014): political heroes whose publicity stunts in mass media gained traction out of their publicity. Those figures have painted Indonesian electoral politics in recent years, with names like Jokowi and Prabowo as presidential candidates. Citizens rely on great figures, obscuring politics to the hands of the elites. Political buzzing, then, is a kind of engagement in society where political mobilization is shunned and it its place a theatrical performance provided by mass media took over. Thus, for political buzzers, their work is not merely a job, but a "like playing a chess". To make sense of this world, buzzers see their work as "part of the spectacle" in Indonesian political life.

Of course, not all is interested in being entangled too long with such spectacular stunts. Most campaigners I talked to defend their job as a "professional" matter: put away your personal politics, and you will be doing fine. This may not be the case for Rahmat. After three months, he quit the job, despite having opportunity to continue it for the next period. He disagreed with the policies of one electoral candidate he worked for, and during his employment, he had to convince himself that the candidate was doing the right thing. "It felt wrong," he told me. As the work went on, the less he finds the need to argue convincingly. He just followed the brief and stopped there. He claimed that his buzzing experience made him doubt any politicians who appear "too good to be true." Such politicians, "must be one who has buzzers under their strings."

INDONESIAN YOUTH AND SOCIAL MEDIA: A STUDY ABOUT POLITICAL PREFERENCES IN DIGITAL ERA

*Aria Atyanto Satwiko*

*Universitas Indonesia*

#### INTRODUCTION

This paper would like to see how the exposure of information flow in social media affects youth generation's political preferences, because as we have seen, technology and information in



today's age are growing rapidly and are used for many things, such as during election periods, campaigns in the real world go hand in hand with campaigns in the digital world. In Indonesia itself, because of the many political parties that compete to attract votes from different parts of society, the use of the digital world, precisely social media, as part of their campaign tool is a thing that has been commonplace for the past decade. Political contestations that occur in social media often use black campaigns, ranging from the use of racial issues to the use of religious issues as a tool to bring down their political opponents. Youth generation in Indonesia itself can be said to be still vulnerable in sorting out which information is correct and where the information is wrong, because even though they grow up with the digital world, their literacy rate in finding and verifying the correct information is still quite low. The data I use in this paper comes from the research I conducted in 2017 about the attitude and perception of Indonesian youth on their role in Indonesia and the role of Indonesia in religion, in Jakarta and Makassar which are two big cities in Indonesia.

## METHODS

The methods we use in this research are focus group discussions and in-depth interviews at some of the top universities in Jakarta and Makassar. For focus group discussions, we selected 8-10 students from various disciplines and from different ages (mostly born between 1995-1999), ranging from those entering the first year in college to those who have entered the final year, then I chose 3 people whom we feel have a point of view which is interesting enough to be an informant when conducting in-depth interviews. Using these two methods and with the range of different research subjects can certainly represent how the perception of Indonesian youth today.

## FINDINGS

From our findings during this research, I have found some facts that we find interesting enough to make further studies, especially how aspects of the digital world, precisely social media, play an important role in determining political preferences in youth Indonesia. Because if divided into the realm of political ideology in social media, then my informants will be divided into three major spectrums.

The first are those from the left-wing spectrum, in general they are more aware of the various conditions occurring in Indonesia today, as evidenced by the various criticisms and responses they provide to the various cases I throw during focus group discussions. They are more inclined to discuss how the state and society should work together to overcome the problems of those cases and to exclude racial and religious matters. Interestingly, those with this kind of thinking come from relatively wealthy families and have a fairly high literacy rate, their preferences in accessing information come from abroad because they feel the information contained within the country is less able to answer their curiosity about what is going on in Indonesia and in the world.

The second comes from the right-wing spectrum, the opposite of those on the left-wing spectrum, although they are aware of the various conditions and cases currently occurring in Indonesia, they still regard religion and other abstract matters in response over such cases. They have their own preference when they are accessing information in the digital world, mostly domestic news portals, usually the preference comes from people they consider to be legitimate and qualified religiously or influenced by their parents.



And the latter are people who feel impartial to any spectrum. Of the various cases I throw during focus group discussions, they are implicitly saturated with those things and tend to feel that both sides of the spectrum actually have much in common and nothing better between them.

## DISCUSSION

The term of youth generations I use in this paper is based Brosdahl and Carpenter's (2011) categorization of generations, specifically referring to Generation Y (born after 1981). A main characteristic for Gen Y is early and frequent exposure to technology, which has advantages and disadvantages in terms of cognitive, emotional, and social outcomes (Immordino-Yang *et al.*, 2012). Social media in the broadest sense of the term and define it as any online service through which users can create and share a variety of content. Although social media have existed from the birth of Gen Y (1981), they were widely adopted after 2003 (Boyd & Ellison, 2008). They encompass user-generated services (such as blogs), social networking sites, online review/rating sites, virtual game worlds, video sharing sites and online communities, whereby consumers produce, design, publish, or edit content (Krishnamurthy & Dou, 2008).

Some studies suggest that Gen Y actively contributes content, creating and mashing (i.e., combining of content from multiple sources); that they gravitate toward social media sites where they can participate (Dye, 2007) and as the connectivity and mobility provided by the social media increasingly becomes part of everyday routine, its use is reflected in the various aspects of social life, including expressions of opinions. Wattenberg (2008) noted that:

"Young people are almost always in the forefront of new types of activities, and are typically more adventurous and open to novel ways of doing things. If there really is a new kind of political engagement, then it seems reasonable to hypothesize that young people would be among the first practitioners of new means of involvement in the political process"

## CONCLUSION

From these findings, when we are talking about youth in Indonesia we cannot rule out the fact that the interaction that they intertwine is more prevalent in the world of social media. It also makes social media enhanced political participation among the youth of Indonesia through a variety of information that is contained there, an aspect of modernity, is inevitable as Internet connectivity increases and its use becomes more and more indispensable, though there are preferences (e.g. the influence of parents or religious views), which makes political views among the youth split apart into various views.

*Keywords: Indonesian Youth, Social Media, Political Preference, Social Networks*

PUSH RANK AND KEYBOARD WARRIOR:  
VIOLENCE, LUDDISM, AND FREE-LABOUR OF CONTEMPORARY INDONESIAN GAMING CULTURE  
*Irfan Nugraha and Febrian*  
*Universitas Indonesia*

This paper wants to explain the relations on violence, luddism, and free-labor at mobile gaming culture. Indonesia is #16 worldwide in terms of game revenues (Newzoo.com), in 2017, approximately 43.7 million gamers in Indonesia, spending of \$880 Million. However, in the midst of mobile gaming boom, especially Multiplayer Online Battle Arena (MOBA) genre as our focus,



violence behavior becomes a part of technology consuming practice at mobile gaming platform. Based on our survey and qualitative research, violence is not only personal catharsis related to game situation, but also reflecting the gamers' everyday life tension. Censorship and punishment mechanism by developers failed to address certain negative play or what gamers describe as digital toxic and troll. As a mechanism failed, some of gamers uses the violence as an instrument to vandalize gameplay environment. They imagine, their activities someday would collapse certain developers and made pivotal turn for the rise of gamers as main parties in mobile gaming industries. These movement seems revitalize the ideas of luddism. The idea is to fight the game environment to better suits them. However, the gamers' dream seems far from being realized as their effort using a violence behavior as instrument to destroying developer, ironically, reversed by developer as a part of the game itself. Gamers become their free-labor because they also help developers to continue updating the game (longevity) and exploits the way to force gamers spend more for in-app purchases (productivity). Between being free-labor and players, gamers only have two choices: consuming (and purchasing) or uninstalling the game, leaving them no win-win conditions.

*Keywords: violence, mobile gaming, MOBA, luddism, free-labour*

## Dependence and Displacement

Coordinators: Tony Rudyansjah (Universitas Indonesia)

& Clare Cameron (University of California, San Francisco)

In this panel, we take up the concept of dependence to explore new or unexpected relationships that emerge through forms of displacement. We take displacement not just as the process of supplanting physically but consider the kinds of cultural, economic, environmental and political displacements that often, but not always, accompany the displacement of individuals, families, or peoples. In linking dependency to displacement, we highlight the social asymmetries frequently associated with these modes of displacement, leaving open the possibility for mutable arrangements of these asymmetries. In this panel, we are particularly interested in the causes and consequences of international Indonesian migration, as well as immigration to and emigration from Indonesia. The panel understands these different mobilities as related and articulating phenomena, contributing to cascades of displacement that, ultimately, exceed the boundaries of nation and state. However, we also consider the relationship between dependencies and displacements occurring 'in place,' including those related to addiction or cyber media. Papers in this panel might, for example, explore such questions as: How does this moment of widespread access to technologies of communicability and real-time interconnectedness shade a contemporary analysis of displacement and what it means to be displaced? Drawing on Maussian concepts of reciprocity and indebtedness, what theoretical possibilities might dependency – and the temporality of dependence – open in rethinking marginality or precarity? And, if an attention to displacements typically focuses ethnographic attention on movement or change, how, instead, might the lens of displacement be useful in bringing concurrent stasis or continuity into greater relief?



SEJIT (GOD'S BIRTHDAY CEREMONY) A FORM OF CULTURAL HYBRIDITY IN THE CEREMONIES

Celerina Dewi Hartati

Department of Anthropology Universitas Indonesia

This study attempts to explore the consequences of the occurrence of borrowing of and dependency on the other elements upon the Chinese society and cultures in Java. The closeness of the relationship between Chinese culture and Javanese culture is seen in cultural interactions between Chinese and Javanese. This cultural interaction is related to the relations of Chinese people with the values and elements of Javanese culture. In cultural interactions, the Chinese merged into the values and elements of Javanese culture. Cultural reality has shown, in the historical reality that Chinese in the past have met, united, and merged into Java. This is as stated by Rustopo (2007) that the Chinese in Surakarta built a Javanese identity from the end of the 19th century to the 20th century. He stated that the Chinese had placed themselves as both communities and individuals, becoming one in Javanese culture and society. Through the presence of characters that Rustopo called as cultural workers, starting from Gan Kam, Tjan Tjoe Siem, Kho Djie Tiong, Koo Kiong Hie, Tio Gwat Bwee, Koo Giok Lian, Tan Gwan Hien, Liem Sio Nio, Lim Tan Swie to Panembahan Hardjonagoro or Go Tik Swan, not only shows the Chinese people's desire to 'become' Javanese to be accepted by Javanese society, but they are actually Javanese themselves.

The relationship between the two cultures influences each other and here Chinese culture to be accepted in Javanese society is very dependent on Javanese culture. Chinese culture is very varied, Chinese culture in Java is different from Chinese culture in other places, because it has a very large influence on Javanese culture. This paper will show the dependence of Chinese culture on Javanese culture in an example of a ceremony or ritual. Taking cases from rituals carried out in temples in Semarang, including Tek Hay Bio, Grajen, and Welahan will be shown Javanese culture that influences Chinese culture.

In Javanese culture there are many rituals whose purpose is to look for *barakah* (blessing), Javanese usually say it as *ngalap barakah* (hoping to obtain mercy, salvation, happiness, from the ritual). The ceremony or ritual in its implementation contains something that is sacred. Geertz (1976) saw Javanese society as seen from the point of view of implementing religion, environment, and type of work divided into three religious variants namely abangan, santri, and priyayi. Javanese religion has many variations in ceremonies. The ceremony that is often performed by Javanese is *slametan*, a ritual that is always associated with the abangan, but the ritual is also carried out by santri or priyayi. The difference lies in the interpretation of the *slametan* itself. For abangan circles who believe in spirits, such as *memedi*, supernatural creatures, *tuyul*, *demit*, and offerings that they give are addressed to ancestral spirits or other spirits that are believed to sometimes do disturbances. For the santri community, *slametan* is intended as an effort to pray for salvation to Allah SWT. Besides *slametan*, belief in spirits and the treatment of magic also characterize the abangan variant.

Geertz understood Javanese religion through Javanese religious practices and various interpretations of symbols used by Javanese in articulating their beliefs in very complex activities. Religion not only plays an integrative role and creates social harmony in society but also plays a divisive role and reflects the balance between integrative and disintegrative forces that exist in each social system. Religion can create conflict and integration. Conflicts that occur are social conflicts, ideological conflicts, class conflicts, and political conflicts. However, religion also creates



social integration, where there are unifying elements in Javanese society, among which the most important are a sense of culture and a growing force of nationalism, solidarity to hold back social disorganization.

Chinese culture in Indonesia has become a part of cultural treasures in Indonesia. Chinese society in Indonesia is a very heterogeneous society in the sense of origin, historical background, culture, religion, and so on. The diversity of Chinese community groups has started from their ancestral lands, because they came from different regions with different languages. The diversity of Chinese people can be seen from languages that are influenced by their native regions, namely Hokkien, Hakka, Cantonese, Tiociu, and others. Apart from language, the religion of Chinese society is also diverse, there are those who embrace Confucianism, Daoism, Buddhism or a combination of the three called *Tridharma* (samkauw), Islam, Christianity, and Catholicism. The diversity of Chinese people is also influenced by the area in which they live, for instance Chinese people who live in Medan, Singkawang, Surabaya, Sukabumi or Semarang differ from one another because of the area they occupy and this can be seen from the language or dialect used.

On the arrival of the Chinese they first came without bringing their women. But over time they then lived with local women and settled in Indonesia forever. They formed their own communities which were increasingly culturally different from Chinese society in China. After several centuries and several generations, a group formed called the Chinese-Indonesian group. This group is widely known as the “*peranakan*” group, especially on the island of Java.

Java is the first region in the Indonesian archipelago that has bilateral relations with China. The arrival of the Chinese to the Indonesian archipelago was at the beginning of the 5th century AD. In 414, the Chinese who traveled to India were stranded on Java. They were stranded along with the trade relations of the Indonesian archipelago. The Chinese first docked in the city of Semarang, Central Java, aiming to trade. They docked in the Mangkang area, West Semarang district, which at that time could be visited by large junks. Chinese settlements or Chinatowns at that time can be found in Simongan, Mangkang, Ngaliyan, Pekojan, Gang Baru, Gang Besen, and Gang Lombok.

The dependence of Chinese culture on Javanese culture leads to cultural changes, one of which is in the practice of Chinese beliefs. Robbins (2004) in his study of the Urapmin community in Papua New Guinea issued a theory of cultural change that can explain how people can quickly understand new logic without sacrificing coherence from what happened before and how they can live on two sides of culture produced to achieve their life goals as a good person. Moral transformation is a major thing in the life of the Urapmin community. The Urapmin community shows the character of systematic hybridity that is systematic and structured by the competition between two values, namely relationalism and individualism.

Rudyansjah (2018) shows the link between cultural hybridity and cultural change in his studies in two rural community groups on Seram Island, namely Sawai and Masihulan. The people in Sawai become a hybridity group because of its connection with tradition and colonialism which makes it the “legitimate sons” of modernity and globalization, while the residents of Masihulan are trapped in the illusion of pursuing modernity and the ancient traditions that cause it to struggle to adapt (Rudyansjah 2018, 22).

Similar to the case of Chinese belief practices that appear in ceremonies in temples, as Chinese places of worship, ceremonies in Chinese temples in Central Java show a form of hybridity. The dependence of Chinese culture on Javanese culture is shown in a ritual or a birthday ceremony of





the gods in Central Javanese temples. Like the Welahan temples in Jepara, Tek Hay Bio in Semarang during the god's birthday ceremony shows the form of cultural dependencies. This can be seen in the presentation which is the most important thing in a ceremony.

In celebration of the main gods of the Welahan temples, Jepara, on the main altar table is filled with red cone-shaped rice. This cone-shaped rice is a sign of real Javanese culture. The cone-shaped rice in Javanese culture is usually colored and yellow, but in the celebration of a day in Welahan, the cone-shaped rice is red, a color of happiness in Chinese culture. In addition to cone-shaped rice, other offerings are bamboo shoots. Raw bamboo shoots that are sliced are placed in bowls that fill the main altar table. The use of bamboo shoots is not found anywhere other than in Central Java.

In the god's birthday ceremony which is usually held for three days, it is always shown some performances. Temples in Central Java provide entertainment in the form of a gamelan orchestra that serves Javanese songs and *potehi* puppets. Welahan Temple, Jepara, during the god's birthday ceremony Hian Thian Siang Tee presents the performances of gamelan music in the temple yard and holds a *potehi* puppet show. The *potehi* puppet stage is made on the road in front of the temple. The *potehi* puppet was originally an art that was popular among Chinese people on Java, especially in many areas in Semarang. *Potehi* puppets which are a blend of Chinese and Javanese culture can use Javanese language in order to continue to survive in their performances. The story that has usually become the standard of *potehi* puppets can also be changed, such as Sun Gokong's trip to the West which has many versions.

The tradition of washing the *keris* as a sacred thing in Javanese culture also influences the ceremony at the temple. Temples have the tradition of washing their god's statues once a year. Washing the statues of gods with seven-flower water is also a form that is influenced by Javanese culture. In their home country, China does not have a tradition of washing a statue of a god. In addition, there is still a form of tradition that has an influence from Javanese culture, namely the tradition of respect for the weapons. The tradition of respecting weapons in Javanese culture in this case is the *keris* which seen as a sacred object is a characteristic of Javanese culture. Chinese culture doesn't have a tradition of respecting the weapons. Meanwhile, in some temples in Central Java, they place the *keris* as a sacred object and should be respected.

*Keywords: ceremony, dependence, hybridity, sejit*

"DEPENDENCE AND DISPLACEMENT": CASE OF ORANG KAYO PULAU IN JAYAPURA CITY

Hanro J. Lekitoo

Universitas Cenderawasih

The Kayo Pulau ethnic group and other indigenous ethnic groups who lived in the Humboldt bay of Jayapura City are ethnic groups called tribal communities by Keesing, because they do not have centralized political and economic leadership. Previously the Dutch government had established its authority in Jayapura on March 7, 1910. Later when the Second World War broke out, in 1942 the Japanese Occupation Army entered this area and built its military base there as the main base in the Pacific. Two years later, in 1944, the Allied Forces under the command of General Douglas MacArthur destroyed the Japanese base and occupied the area. The rapid changes caused the indigenous tribes who lived there, immediately jumped into a new world.





After the Allied Forces left, the Dutch government proceeded to continue its administration there. The Dutch government then moved the center of government which was originally in Manokwari, to Jayapura. In the Trikora period of 1961, when the Indonesian government entered Papua, the Jayapura area remained the center of government, as the capital of West Irian Province. Change is even greater when many migrants from inside Papua and outside Papua enter this area.

In fact, indigenous people have become marginalized, alienated and deprived of their cultural roots. However, this trait on the other hand is a good thing for Jayapura City whose people now live in harmony and peace, acknowledging and accepting each other. Even though their situation is quite difficult to change, but by using local wisdom, the "reciprocity" above they can survive. This can be seen from how they can still exist and survive in the context of kinship, economy, "politics" (modern), and religion.

*Keywords: Indigeneous, Rapid change, Marginalized, Reciprocity, Survive.*

#### BLASPHEMY: SHRINKING RELIGIOUS FREEDOM AND TOLERANCE IN INDONESIA

*Hyung-Jun Kim*

*Department of Cultural Anthropology, Kangwon National University*

Recently in Indonesia, the blasphemy which has been applied mainly to Muslims, was extended to non-Muslims. The allegations of blasphemy against Christian Ahok, the former governor of Jakarta, sparked mass protests in which hundreds of thousands of Muslims took part, resulting in his losing in election. The protest of a Buddhist housewife that the adzan sound from the mosque microphone was too loud angered Muslims in her neighborhood, and led to an uprising targeting at houses, vehicles and temples. She was later indicted for blasphemy and was sentenced to 2 years in prison.

The application of blasphemy for non-Muslims suggests that there is a growing tendency to force inter-religious harmony as defined by the Islamic perspective of non-intervention and control upon non-muslims. To explore recent process of dealing with blasphemy provides useful information on how religious freedom and tolerance in Indonesian society have been changing

*Keywords: Blasphemy, Meiliana case, Ahok case, Religious tolerance, Inter-religious relations*

#### AMPHIBIOUS LIFE AND THE POLITICAL ECONOMY OF MOVING EARTH

*Joseph R. Klein*

*Department of Anthropology University of California, Santa Cruz*

Land reclamation projects both big and small are redrawing the coastlines of Eastern Indonesia. The island of Sulawesi provides key focus: on the island's west coast Dutch contractors dredge reefs and fisheries to build artificial islands for luxury property development along the coasts of urban centers. On the east coast, layered histories of dispossession hide stories of cities built on swamps. Meanwhile, communities in the coastal hinterland buy displaced earth by the truckload from nickel mines backed by Australian, US, and Chinese capital. When the trucks dump dirt on mudflats and mangroves, certain forms of amphibious life give way to the political economic force of land title. Small coastal villages build land where the sea was to stake a legal claim to a future, and yet in doing so, may destroy the very ecosystems which sustain coastal village economies.



This paper explores the political economy and geography of these big and small land reclamation projects, arguing for attention to the forms of intertidal and amphibious life which they bury.

## The Use and Abuse of Drinking Culture

Coordinator: Raymond Michael Menot (Universitas Indonesia)

Various ethnic groups in Indonesia-ranging from Aceh to Papua- has a drinking culture. Drinking culture present as adaptation mechanism to the cold and windy weathers, social function (togetherness), or as part of religious rituals. Nowadays, the drinking culture get some negative stigma in society and the government. Even today, the Indonesian government is preparing a regulation draft for banning alcoholic beverages. This policy can cause serious socio-cultural problems in the society, conflicts, or even disintegration discourse. This panel will discuss about the existence and function of traditional alcoholic beverages as well as shifting value of it. Keywords: drinking culture, traditional alcoholic beverages, shifting values.

TRADITION OF DRINKING ARAK

Taqyuddin & Hendra Ishander

Department of Geography FMIPA Universitas Indonesia

Good old time social alcohol drink fest can be find in ancient Indonesia Archipelago, both for highlander or in coastal. There Two types of this tropical alcoholic beverages, one can be considering as liquor, with alcohol content less than 10%, still having the taste of its mother raw source, and has high sugar content enhancing its sweet and sour taste, and the other is simply spirits, with 40% proof alcohol content, better the taste of these tropical spirit enhanced with spices or aromatic flower like Kambing Putih Spirits from Batak. There are also some spirits made from distillation of Sugar Wine made *Saccharum arundinaceum* called *Ciu*, these specimen taste rough more robust than is cousins, Rum. The habitat of alcoholic precursor sap is widely distributed from high land to coastal, it's quite weird to understand that many place in Tropical High Land, the low temperature of such place does influence people to create and consume some alcoholic beverage. From ethnographical point of view, the name of these beverage is interesting such as Sagner, Legen, Tuak, Brem, Sopi, Swansrai, Cap Tikus, Lapen dan Ballo. The consumption context of these beverage, some or consume as a part of mystical rituals, other can be the sign of social class, and many are become related with leisure time from hard work, and the problems of the abuse of alcoholic intoxication, but for many, alcoholic drink is not part of daily consumption, more related to special location. And these paper, are trying to find the spatial relation of the source in tropical archipelago, the processes, and its consumption context based from historical materials like literature, manuscript, etc., to explained and to give the picture of good old time ancient alcohol drink fest and rituals in "Nusantara".

Keywords: ancient alcoholic beverage, spatial approach.



## THE CULTURAL VALUE OF MINAHASA PEOPLE ABOUT LIQUOR "CAP TIKUS"

*Maria Heny Pratiknjo*  
*Universitas Sam Ratulangi*

Minahasa is a tribe that inhabits an area in the northeastern part of the peninsula of North Sulawesi. Cap Tikus has been known for a long time in the Land of Minahasa. From the various sources that the author explores, there is no definite record when Cap Tikus began to appear in the treasures of the Minahasa culture since losing. Cap Tikus is a type of liquid with high alcohol content on average 40 to 70 percent. Based on existing data, in North Sulawesi, there is 62,421 ha of seho tree land as a raw material for Cap Tikus Liquor, and there are two million seho trees in southern Minahasa, northern Minahasa, and Tomohon. The number of business actors, special derivative production in South Minahasa, is 1522 households. The 1119 tons of palm commodities are worth IDR 12 billion or 17 percent of the total commodity in Southern Minahasa ". Culturally the old people in Minahasa, the habit of drinking Cap tikus when the morning before the garden with a dose of drink is one sloki (small-sized glass). The value contained is gulping the cap tikus can increase energy and enthusiasm to work. Besides that, it is also taken before eating as an appetite enhancer and warms the body because of the cold air. In general, parents who consume the Cap Tikus at the right dose can live long. Although it is old but still strong in activity and rarely gets sick. The habit of drinking a CAP TIKUS by Minahasa people is also done when building a house, occupying a new residence, in other social activities such as joy and sorrow. There is a term among the Minahasa people about the dose consuming this. Cap Tikus "One shot added blood, two shot upper blood, three shots spilled blood". So the term can actually be input for someone to consume a Cap Tikus. Efforts to minimize criminal acts due to consuming the cap tikus without boundaries were carried out by the North Sulawesi Regional Police and the parties related to the term "Brenti jo ba gate" (stopped drinking CAP TIKUS) led to decreased crime rates but farmers produced reduced Cap Tikus and even lost their livelihoods. In this study using a descriptive qualitative approach

*Keywords: Cultural Value, Drink Habits, Liquor, Cap Tikus*

## THE WATER OF WORDS: THE CONVIVIALITY OF DRINKING AND RECITING ON ROTE

*James J. Fox*  
*The Australian National University/Universitas Indonesia*

### INTRODUCTION: THE ORIGINS OF DISTILLING

Drinking has long been deeply integrated within traditional Rotenese culture. In one of their important origin narratives, the Rotenese claim to have learned the art of distilling from the Dutch at the time of the Dutch East India Company. In this narrative which recounts the journey by the rulers of three Rotenese domains – Ti [Thie], Loleh and Dengka – to Batavia to obtain the knowledge of Christianity. While in Batavia, they also discovered how to distil gin. The crucial passage of this narrative is as follows:

At that time the three Lords of Rote and their followers went out from Batavia (Matabia) to see all fine attractions of the wider area of Batavia. One *temenggong* (Rotenese: *temuku*) from Ti saw arak being distilled on a cooking fire, so he carved a drawing of this on the haft of his knife. When they arrived back on Rote, he made a cooking fire according to the carving on his knife and he taught the people of Ti to distil arak. From that time until now Rotenese know how to distil arak.



From the time of their early contracts with the Rotenese in the mid-17<sup>th</sup> century, the Dutch Company would provide rulers, whom they favoured, with a limited supply of barrels of Dutch gin. By learning to distil, the Rotenese enhanced a tradition they had derived from the Dutch, adapted it to their own needs and made themselves less reliant on the Dutch.

This Rotenese 'gin' (*arak*, Rotenese: *ala*) was distilled from a mash of fermented lontar syrup and thus became readily available throughout the island. Distillation is a simple process. Cooling is achieved by piping the distillate through a long pipe submerged in water contained in a hollow log, generally made from a lontar palm. A lontar fruit is used to cap the pot with the fermented lontar mash adding to the flavour of the distillate. Quality depends on the richness of the syrup-mash and the proportional mix of the distillate from different stages of process. The initial distillate (*air kepala*: Rotenese: *oe langa*) has a higher alcohol content than later the distillate

#### GIN AS A SOURCE OF CONVIVIALITY

Gin was once provided at all feasts but, according to Rotenese adat rules, allowed only to elder men who were served by younger men. Feasts were judged not just by the quantity of rice and meat that was set forth but also by the quantity and quality of gin that was served. Those occasions – such as marriages, funerals, house-completions and origin celebrations at which feasting occurred – required elaborate ritual recitations by master poets and these poets would be expected to drink before they recited. Because of this association of gin and oral recitation, Rotenese gin was frequently referred to as the 'water of words'. When elders gathered and gin was served, there was invariably a recitation of poetry, in a convivial competition. A light tipsiness was to be expected but no drunkenness was tolerated.

#### ETHNOGRAPHIC STRATEGIES IN A CULTURE OF CONVIVIAL DRINKING

Gin production on Rote was strictly regulated by a licensing system given to strategically located local distillers who paid a fee for their license and effectively reported any illicit distilling that threatened their business. However, this changed in the 1990s when a general prohibition on distilling was declared. Many Rotenese were delighted at this new regulation. Surveillance ended and anyone could surreptitiously take up distilling.

After prohibition had been declared, I had to conduct a large mortuary ceremony – a *tutus* -- in Termanu to honour my deceased Rotenese 'father' who had adopted me into clan, Ingu-Beuk. For the feast, I let it be known that I needed to purchase at least 100 liters of gin. In the end, more than 144 liters of high-quality gin were supplied. In keeping with the spirit of the times, I never recorded where that gin came from.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

Fox, James J.

- 1977     Harvest of the Palm: Ecological Change in Eastern Indonesia. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.
- 1981     'Palmwein und Palmschnaps in Süd- und Südostasien' in Völger, G. et al (eds), *Rausch und Realität: Drogen im Kulturvergleich*, pp.182-87. Köln: Rautenstrauch-Joest Museum and Hamburg: Rowohlt Taschenbuch Verlag (1982).



*Keywords: Rote, Arak (Lontar Palm Gin), Conviviality, Feasting, Recit*

#### ALCOHOL LIFESTYLE AS ANTI-STRUCTURAL MANIFESTATION IN THE SENTANI PAPUA COMMUNITY

*Monica Maria Nauw  
Universitas Gadjah Mada*

The alcoholic lifestyle of the Sentani people, especially drunks, is closely related to various acts of structured violence carried out by state government institutions and customary government, but also with ownership, use and management of natural resources, and with freedom of opinion that is both government and customary. As a society that is experiencing a socio-cultural crisis and is marginalized, they become a group of anti-structural liminal. They do things that deviate from the structure by consuming alcoholic beverages as an effort to reduce psychological suffering. This article is the result of field research with a descriptive qualitative case study method with an anthropological approach. The method used for data collection is literature study, observation, and in-depth interviews. Knowledge about producing traditional *khewphu* drinks is one of the local geniuses of the Sentani people. During drunkenness, drinking alcohol helps those who are experiencing liminality as limited as they feel.

*Keywords: Khewphu (intoxicating water), adat structure, anti-structure, psychological suffering, local genius*

#### BEVERAGE OF THE SPIRITS

*Santi Dwiningsih  
Independence Researcher  
Tety Rachmawati  
Ministry of Health of the Republic Indonesia*

#### BRIEF DESCRIPTION

Dayak Ngaju, a tribe who live in the Katingan watershed area Central Kalimantan, have a traditional alcoholic drink called baram. Baram (made from rice, yeast, various types of spices and sugar) playing important role on Dayak Ngaju culture. Sacredly, baram is used as a complement to the Kaharingan religious ritual such as basarah, napesan, and tiwah. Baram in the sacred context is made by mutual cooperation (handep) by the community and will be prayed for by the Kaharingan religious figure called pisur.

Although it is still controversial because it is considered the culprit and the source of social problems, according to some sources, baram is considered part of the Dayak tribe culture and is already mentioned in the Panaturan (Kaharingan religious scriptures), although not explicitly. Because of that, baram is also known as the beverage of the spirits.

This paper will describe about position and role of the sacred baram in the Dayak Ngaju culture. Especially the Dayak Ngaju tribe who live in the Katingan watershed, or commonly called the Katingan people.

*Keywords: Baram, Alcohol, Dayak, Kaharingan, Culture*



## BACKGROUND

In June 2016, authors was involved in a research study of baram at Danum Simak Harum Village<sup>16</sup>, Tewang Sangalang Garing District, Katingan Regency, Central Kalimantan. Baram lost its prestige with factory drinks because baram was considered ancient and illegal. In addition, baram distribution and consumption tends to be difficult to monitor. On the other hand, although it is still controversial, baram is an integral part of the religious practices of Hindu Kaharingan. Baram is like two sides of a coin, it has a good yet bad faces. Unfortunately, the bad face of baram appears more often and sinks the other side which is its good face.

This article tries to describe the sacred side of *baram* in the cultural and religious practices among Dayak Ngaju tribe who embrace Kaharingan religion. Let's get closer to *baram* so that we can reflect, does alcoholic beverages deserve to be called the beverage of the spirits?

## OBJECTIVE

Too many bad stories about baram make its pride fade away among local people, and baram is actually marginalized in its own land. However, baram is part of the culture of Dayak Ngaju tribe which its existence needs to be seen objectively. Concern about baram which are almost always described as destructive and evil drinks, encourage author to display baram from the other side. In this article, the story of baram is based on the authors' experience when interacting with a *Pisur* (Kaharingan religious scriptures), who opens up the insight that baram has a sacred meaning.

## DESCRIPTION

In 2015, the total population of Danum Simak Harum was 1683 people, consisting of 829 Kaharingan followers, Protestant Christians (625 people), Islam (203 people), and Catholics (261 people)<sup>17</sup>. The Dayak Ngaju tribe is very respectful to their ancestor. In the Dayak Ngaju language, ancestral spirits are called *sangiang*, and *basangiang* which means "calling spirits" through a ritual. The summoned *sangiang* is the helping spirits of *Ranying Hatalla*, which is God in the Kaharingan religion. *Pisur* invites the *sangiang*(s) in an interesting way, that is by serving baram.

Baram also appeared in other ceremonies such as *tiwah*<sup>18</sup>, *napesan*<sup>19</sup>, and *basarah*<sup>20</sup>. Moreover, baram is also used as offerings and placed on *pambak* (grave), and *patahu* (small house which is believed to be a place to inhabit the protective spirits of the village and house).

Baram is not explicitly mentioned in Panaturan (Kaharingan religious scriptures). The word that mentioned many times in Panaturan is *behas* or rice. In the *Panaturan* stated, "*Guci Lalang Tambangap Langit yang di dalamnya telah berisi Behas Nyangen Tingang.*" This sentences are considered as a clue that baram is represented through rice which has high spiritual value.

Baram which is made exclusively for ritual and baram which is made for non-ritual occasion, have several similarities that are the raw materials and a taste that is characterized slightly bitter yet sweet. When talking about baram more specifically, especially baram for ritual purposes, the

---

<sup>16</sup>The name of village is disguised for protecting informant's privacy.

<sup>17</sup> RPJM Desa Danum Simak Harum 2015

<sup>18</sup>*Tiwah* is a funeral ritual of Kaharingan follower.

<sup>19</sup>*Napesan* is another kind of funeral ritual of Kaharingan. This ritual is more simple than *tiwah*.

<sup>20</sup>*Basarah* is weekly worship for Kaharingan followers that is done every Thursday in *Balai Basarah*.





difference can be seen from who made it. Baram whips is intended for ritual purposes can be made by a non-spiritual actor and also by a spiritual actor, called *pisur*.

Baram that is made by *pisur* always inserted by prayer, ritual, and made in the way called *handep* (mutual cooperation). Whereas baram that is made by a non-spiritual actor, there is no insertion of anything at all. Need to be underlined, not all *pisur* make their own baram for all of ritual that they lead. The main reason is for practicality, that is why many people nowadays prefer to buy baram from the others instead of making it themselves. Finding a *pisur* who still make baram with his own hands is something rare and valuable.

Authors is very fortunate to have the opportunity to see the baram making process made by one of the oldest *pisur* in Danum Simak Harum village. The *pisur* is a woman around 70 years old. Author calls her *Tambi*, which means 'grandmother' in Dayak Ngaju language.

One time, *Tambi* made baram for ritual purposes that she would lead. The main ingredients used are; white rice, water, sugar and spices. As for various spices used consist of; galangal, cinnamon powder/stem, turmeric, large cinnamon leaves, cloves, chili, tobacco. Except sugar and water, all ingredients are measured according to the taste of the maker.

The first process of making baram is making yeast. The preparation begins by soaking the rice in water for 4 hours, and all the spices are dried in the sun until they are completely dry. After all ingredients are ready, rice and all seasoning are pounded using *lisung*<sup>21</sup> and *halu*<sup>22</sup> until it's become smooth. The pounded result is sifted using a bamboo sieve until a fine brownish-white powder is obtained. The fine powder is then mixed with water, kneaded using a hand, shaped like a gong, sprinkled with yeast bran (*indang rahi*), stored in a closed place until mushrooms appear on it.

The second step is doing baram fermentation by mixing raw water and sugar. Every 10 liters of water requires 1 kilogram of sugar. These two ingredients that have been mixed are put in a large bucket that already filled with yeast from the first process. Every 10 liters of water requires 15 grains of yeast. Several different pieces of yeast then burned until charred, afterwards put it in the same bucket. Next is to cover the bucket with a clear plastic, then cover it with clean sheet of cloth, lastly cover with the bucket lid as close as possible. At the top of the bucket lid, there must be objects as bamboo claws, charcoal, turmeric, and betel nut. All objects must remain during the fermentation process to keep the baram away from the bad influences of spirits who like the aroma of baram.

Baram which has been stored in a bucket, fermented for 10-15 days. There should be no fights or children crying during baram making so that the taste of baram would not sour. Yeast that used for baram fermentation process can be used for a maximum of three times, this process is called *menganding*, and re-used yeast is called *anding*. The first and second process are generally used by all baramers for any purpose, both spiritual and non-spiritual purposes. Baram made by *Tambi* is baram for spiritual purposes, and the striking difference is there is a *handep* in this process.

In *handep* process of making baram with *Tambi* involves 20 peoples consisting of grandchildren, children, relatives, and neighbors. They are not paid and do not need to be informed what they have to do in the process. There is a break during concocting spices process where is *Tambi*

---

<sup>21</sup>*Lisung* in bahasa called *lesung*(mortar).

<sup>22</sup>*Halu* is a log that is used to pound anything inside *lisung*.





sprinkled upwards, in all direction of points of the compass. *Tambi* prayed to *Ranying Hatalla* so that the baram she made would not disturbed by evil spirits. Riwut (2003) said that rice is usually sprinkled into the air or over the heads of humans, with the aim of calling on the helpers of *Ranying Hatalla* named *Putir Selong Tamanang* and *Raja Anking Langit*, which are the rulers of grain and rice.

Baram made by *Tambi* abstinence for sale. If someone needs it for party purpose, *Tambi* prefers to lend it. So, the borrower must return the borrowed baram with the same amount. Authors asked why *Tambi* did that, *Tambi* replied, "I am not a baram seller, I make and drink baram just to respect *sangiang(s)*, the spirits."

#### FINDINGS

From Kaharingan's point of view, *behas* or rice is the link between the sacred and the profane, between man and God (*Ranying Hatalla*), and that is manifested in the form of baram. In this article, baram making process done by *handep*. *Handep* is a reflection of the harmony that exists in society of Danum Simak Harum village.

#### CONCLUSION/RESUME

Baram is a kind of alcoholic drink made in such a traditional way by using rice, yeast, water, sugar, and spices, then fermented for a period time. The crucial role of baram in Kaharingan religion, makes it called beverage of the spirits. Baram is not just an intoxicating drink but full of spiritual values.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

Riwut, Tjilik. 1965. *Maneser Panatau Tatu Hiang*. Edited by Nila Riwut, 2003. Pusaka Lima. Palangkaraya.

RPJM Desa Danum Simak Harum. 2015

YOU GIVE LOVE A BAD NAME:  
THE DEGRADED MEANING OF BARAM AMONG THE DAYAK OF CENTRAL KALIMANTAN  
*Semiarto A. Purwanto*  
*Universitas Indonesia*  
*Sofyan Ansori*  
*Northwestern University*

It is not so easy now for Indonesian to publicly consume alcohol beverages. The market is limited to fancy restaurants and clubs in the big cities. They are not freely sold because of the regulations and pressures from groups of people reject the circulation of alcohol beverages. The later in the most cases are identified as puritan moslem groups. People in rural areas somehow have the opportunity to enjoy traditional alcoholic drinks. Unfortunately, as with many other traditional items, traditional drinks seem unable to compete with drinks originating from the city, which enter as a symbol of modernity. Beer, whiskey, wine, etc. are the choices for the younger generation. Although various types of drinks have long been known but over the past fifty years, they have been strengthened by modern ideas. There was a time when several bottled and canned



beverages were easily available on the market, but at other times they were difficult to access. A group of young people in urban areas are starting to try various bootleg liquor made from a mixture of ethanol, various soft drinks, traditional drinks, and some additional substances that have hallucinogenic effects. This drink, known as oplosan, has been very popular in the last ten years because it often causes poisoning and death.

This paper will explain how baram, native Dayak drinks commonly used in traditional and social ceremonies in traditional societies is slowly banned by the government. Baram is cornered by bad news which actually refers to the negative effects of 'oplosan'. We see that there has been a process of cultural degradation in baram caused by interrelated factors involving modernization, policies to limit alcoholic beverages, pressure by conservative groups, and the emergence of bootleg liquor.

RELATION BETWEEN ALCOHOL MISUSE AND CRIME

*Dadang Sudiadi*

*Department of Criminology Universitas Indonesia*

The results of the study discussing the relationship between consumption of alcoholic beverages and crime, which has been carried out in 2017 in five major cities in Indonesia (Jakarta, Medan, Denpasar, Manado and Surabaya) indicate that statistical data in law enforcement agencies such as police, prosecutors, courts and prisons show a lack of a database about the crimes associated with alcoholic beverages. One of the reasons is because the recording of statistics among law enforcers prioritizes the recording of crimes rather than the background of the cause of the crime. Because it is not surprising that it is very difficult to get complete information about the connection between drinking alcoholic beverages and criminal acts committed. Even though complete information about this is very necessary in the context of compiling criminal policies in relation to liquor, both consumption, production and distribution. Not to mention there are misconceptions that equate oplosan drinks with alcoholic beverages, where oplosan drinks are more accurately referred to as poisons than drinks. Apart from that the lack of statistical data that can show how strong the relationship between drinking alcoholic beverages and crime will lead to the birth of a policy on liquor based solely on assumptions, not based on official facts and data, even though through mass media, official reports, judicial verdicts, demands our prosecutor can get that information. But the information that will be obtained will not be able to prove how much influence alcohol drinks on someone's criminal behavior. The fact is that if the person in question is really drunk, then the person concerned will not be able to commit a crime, stand up and walk even if the person concerned will be in trouble.

So that the presence of accurate information about the relationship between alcoholic drinks and crime must continue to be sought, so that the policy on alcoholic beverages becomes more targeted. Many mass media report that perpetrators of crimes are often indicated as drunk. But methodologically the news statement should be supported by evidence that accurately uses the right measuring instrument. As well as measuring instruments used to measure the content of drugs in the blood. Alcohol should also be like that, when someone is arrested and indicated by the influence of alcohol, it must be proven by a tool that can measure the alcohol content in the person's blood, or testing by asking them to go straight or backward. But the last method can only be used to suspect someone is under the influence of alcohol or not. When indicated, then it must be proven by an accurate measuring instrument to determine the alcohol blood content.



Therefore, the rules regarding consumption of alcoholic beverages can be applied properly if supported by a tool that can be used as a measuring instrument.

However, it is important to think about the importance of what is the definition of motion sickness and drunkenness that can affect bad behavior. In simple terms, it must be proven whether someone is doing crime because they are drunk, so that it can be proven because of drunkenness the person then commits a crime. Or the person really intends to commit a crime and then drink alcoholic beverages. Or the person pretends to be drunk (smearing his mouth with alcohol to think he is drunk) the person then commits a crime. Or someone who is half drunk then commits a crime. Another thing must be understood that if the person is really drunk then the person concerned will be weak, vomit or fall asleep. So the possibility to commit a crime is relatively small

Therefore, consumption of alcoholic beverages in the context of indigenous communities, where such behavior is related to adat or traditional events, must be seen in other contexts. We know that the selection of the five cities in this study is one of them because the city has a drinking culture. In relation to the plan to ban circulation and consumption of alcoholic beverages, it must be done in consideration of the indigenous communities who have the drinking culture so as not to cause unrest. However, it also does not ignore the fact that there are several cases of crime, especially violent crimes, the perpetrators of which are indicated in the condition of being affected by alcoholic beverages. It's just back to the proof mechanism that must be done carefully. Moreover, the presence of oplosan drinks (which must be seen as poisons from alcoholic beverages) which often disrupt the facts about alcoholic and crime-loving relationships.

As an illustration of oplosan can be seen from the following facts: In Manado the mixture is usually Cap Tikus mixed with white beer, black beer, freshness, taste of sari, M 150, cassanova, milk, avocado juice, green tea, tuak mixed with black beer, mixed beer panther, Cap Tikus mixed with trihex medicine, Sunsilk black shampoo. In Surabaya the mix is usually Cukrik mixed with soft drinks (cola) and the soda (Tebis), supplement drinks (Kratingdeng, hemaviton, extra joss) Whiskey mixed with root beer, black beer and white beer, Cukrik mixed with double L, Lexotan, bodrex, spirtus, gasoline or autan. In Denpasar and surrounding areas, kolesom wine mixed with red wine and beer, Arak mixed with cola, tonic water and grape kolesom. In Medan, Tuak is mixed with black beer, laru or durian. In Jakarta, usually Whiskey mixed with root beer, black beer and white beer. As a result of such opulent drinks often have an impact on the death of the culprit. This fact often obscures the relationship between drinking alcohol beverage and oplosan drinks in relation to the crimes committed by the perpetrators.

In a juridical context, the position of alcohol in the Criminal Code can be seen from the following facts: that the stipulation of the article in the Criminal Code refers to the crime committed by the perpetrator, not the influence of alcohol. There is no specific article (rule) governing the relationship of alcohol to crime (alcohol as a cause or as a trigger / intermediary); some articles in the Criminal Code (300, 492, 493, 536) only mention intoxicating drinks and drunkenness, not the process of someone being drunk on alcoholic beverages which then affects his behavior. In some cases, the consumption factor for alcoholic beverages is still included in the Minutes of Examination of the police, but still the article is imposed on the crime. Inclusion of consumption of alcoholic beverages in the Minutes of Examination, can be used as a consideration by the judge in deciding cases, but not an important factor to be considered.

Therefore, when there is a desire to institutionalize the prohibition of circulation and consumption of alcoholic beverages, it must be directed to the circulation and consumption, rather than



prohibiting it. Then it must be remembered, until now the clear regulation regulates about the consumption of complete alcoholic drinks with new alcohol content in Manado (from the 5 major cities studied) while other regulations are still unclear about alcohol blood content (blood alcohol content) which banned. Likewise, with other legal rules, including the Criminal Code. Then a tool that can be used to measure the alcohol content in his blood, defining drunkenness as drunk as what will cause a crime and how to prove it, because a person's physical ability to adapt his body to alcohol also varies. Therefore, it is better to regulate the misuse of alcoholic beverages and their products, rather than prohibiting the consumption of alcoholic beverages and their circulation.

In the literature review that we obtained, crimes associated with alcohol consumption are often identified with the hangover conditions experienced by the perpetrators (Martin, Maxwell, White and Zhang, 2004). According to Pettigrew (2008), the reasons people consume alcoholic beverages are for the purposes of (1) celebration; (2) relaxation; (3) complementary foods; (4) socializing; (5) hospitality to; and (6) diversion of mood (mood alteration). Then it can be said that consuming alcoholic beverages does not aim to commit a crime. Meanwhile there are 5 assumptions about the relationship of alcohol to crime, namely: (1) consumption of alcoholic beverages leads to crime; (2) The act of crime results in the consumption of alcoholic beverages; (3) the relationship between crime and consumption of alcoholic beverages is reciprocal; (4) consumption of alcoholic beverages only becomes a common cause in the sense that the perpetrators of consuming alcoholic beverages and crime are committed but are not a major factor; (5) coincidence model, the existence of alcoholic drinks is merely a coincidence and does not significantly explain the crime done (Pernanen, 1982; White, 1990; in Bennett and Holloway, 2005).

## Moral Politics of Nationhood: Examining The Politics of Diversity and The Management of Unity

Coordinators: Ratna Saptari (Leiden University),

Anton Novenanto (Universitas Brawijaya), & Mia Siscawati (Universitas Indonesia)

The democratic reforms that followed the stepping down of the authoritarian New Order regime, faces a rapidly shrinking space for religious diversity, sexual difference, and critical social movements. The morality of nationhood, epitomized by Indonesia's national slogan of 'unity in diversity', historically refers to a respect for difference within the principle of inclusion. At the moment, however, diversity is increasingly becoming a scapegoat for political and social evils. the anti-LGBT movement, the criminalization of social movements and the religious fatwa against liberalism, secularism and religious minority groups are recent examples of social and political exclusion for the sake of 'saving the nation' or for 'purifying religion'. In order to understand these dynamics, in this panel we will examine the issue of moral politics and the process of exclusion in Indonesia. "Unity" and "diversity" are both concepts that need to be examined critically since within diverse power structures these terms may be used for different purposes. Unity is an overarching rhetoric for solidarity and togetherness, but it may also involve the disregard of different claims and rights to justice. Diversity, on the other hand symbolizes the culture of difference, variations in values, but at the same time involves processes of boundary making and placing individuals or groups in particular boxes. The purpose of this panel is not to look at which term best suits our perception regarding cultural and societal ideals but more to examine the



dynamics behind the cultural politics of unity or diversity and the consequences these have on different groups in society.

#### REFRAMING AND DEMONIZING: MORAL POLITICS OF THE POWERLESS

Anton Novenanto  
Universitas Brawijaya

*The practice of othering indicates the occurrence of power relations between different actors. There is a tendency that such practice is performed only by state actors to their citizens, not the other way around. Learning from the victims of Lapindo mudflow in Porong, Java, the paper addresses how these seemingly powerless actors are indeed very powerful in utilizing moral politics through the practice of reframing and demonizing. Generally speaking, disaster victims are frequently perceived as powerless due to physical and mental sufferings they experience following environmental hazards. These people not only already had to lose their time, energy and materials, but they also must recover and pursuit all the backwardness. Calling from Foucauldian discourse theory and analysis, the paper aims to describe how Lapindo mudflow's victims are actually very creative and, therefore, powerful in inventing own agency to compete in the battle of social construction of the disaster through ongoing, yet unequal power relations with other actors in power, the government and the company. Recalling and challenging some Javanese traditions, narratives, and conception of power, these victims came to a position that it is the time for them to become the subject of power in defining the historiography of the event/process by utilizing the momentum of disaster anniversaries as discursive field to reframe the event as industrial accident as well as demonize actors in power.*

*Keywords: power, powerless, moral politics, demonizing*

#### BACKGROUND

The morning of May 29, 2013, hundreds of Lapindo mudflow victims gathered in the Porong Square. They were preparing a march along the Porong highway from the square to the western embankment as a series of the seventh-year commemoration of the mud eruption. One interesting, attractive, eye-catching object of that march was a five-meter-high effigy, *ogoh-ogoh*, of a male figure wearing a yellow suit, carrying a briefcase full of money, and sitting on a mud-volcano. The procession ended with a finale of victims escorting that *ogoh-ogoh* to the edge of the embankment and throwing it into the mud lake as if after it drowned their problems would end too. One victim yelled to the crowd: "This [throwing the effigy into the mud lake] is a sign of throwing our misfortunes, made by [Aburizal] Bakrie. We dispose misfortunes".<sup>23</sup>

#### OBJECTIVE

This paper aims to trace cultural contexts which enable the procession on that day possible, the contexts which provide values and practices for people to reframe the "official" discourse of the mudflow. Implying Michel Foucault's conceptual framework (Foucault 1972, 1978, 1980), I examine moral politics of the seemingly powerless actors through a critical analysis into commemorative practices. As to Foucault power is not a thing that can be possessed, transmitted,

---

<sup>23</sup> My own translation.



or dispossessed by certain actors (cf. Downing 2008: 90), I examine those practices as if they are statements of the seemingly powerless resisting statements of those in power. Following Foucauldian analysis, I do not examine trueness which statements are true or false but rather to critically show how certain actors impose certain claims and/or exclude other claims from the consideration to be true (cf. Mills 1997: 16).

## FINDINGS

According to my interviews, the *ogoh-ogoh* was inspired by Balinese ritual a few days ahead of Nyepi (the first day of the Balinese New Year). The ritual is aiming to cleanse the community of evil spirits when they enter a new year. The ritual ends with burning down the effigy as a symbol of cleansing their village of evil spirits and bad lucks. Nowadays, in addition to make effigies of mythological creatures (ogres or demons) the Balinese also creatively create some figures of real life who are deemed to be giving bad influences for community's social and cultural harmony.

From Lapindo mudflow victims' point of view, the mudflow occurred because the misbehavior of Aburizal Bakrie. The effigy they made was meant to be a representation of Aburizal Bakrie (a leading figure of the Bakrie family, Lapindo's holding company). Yellow color was a sign of *Partai Golkar* in which Aburizal was acting as the chairperson. With this position, president Yudhoyono appointed him as one key minister of his cabinet. As such, mudflow victims framed him not only as the "bad guy" but even more as the "evil spirit". It is then very obvious that Aburizal become the main target of mudflow victims' anger in the course of various commemorative practices. To most victims I have interview with, Aburizal is not just an alien, evil spirit, but also a demon possessing both the government and society.

In addition to *ruwatan*, the demonization of Aburizal corresponds to Javanese folktale of Timun Mas (golden cucumber) fighting Buto Ijo (green ogre) which ends is the death of Buto Ijo. This folktale has been very famous among the mudflow victims by the fact that one version mentions Buto Ijo sinks into an artificial mud lake. The drowning of Aburizal's effigy in 2013 is a visual representation of how notorious ogre (Aburizal Bakrie, a symbol of powerful political and economic actor) is eventually dead in the hand of oppressed peasant (mudflow victims, the powerless actors).

## DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS

In Java, there is a typical view which interprets environmental hazards as cultural rather than mere natural phenomena. The idea is to view geohazards as the result of individual or collective misconducts (Lapian 1987). They are interpreted to be cultural in the sense that they are the result of some inappropriate manners of some humans to other humans/non-humans. Schlehe, for instance, discovered that Javanese interpreted volcanic eruptions of Mount Merapi in Central Java as the outcome of the power abuse of their rulers, either in local or national level (Schlehe 2009). Geohazard is needed to balance disharmonious relationship between human and nature and among humans.

To some extent, Javanese perceive misfortunes, including geohazards, as a result of evil spirits possessing the communities (Wessing 2010). This understanding relies on a principle that human bodies are understood as containers for spirits. "The problem," Wessing (2010: 53) observed, "is that these containers are thought to be porous, allowing spirits and other influences to move in and out, and leaving the person involved open to a loss of personal spirit or to possession, the





invasion of the body by an alien spirit". Within this logic, misfortunes (including, geohazards) could be prevented if someone or the society could keep original spirit from coming out of one's body and therefore alien spirit(s) would not be able to come into and possess the body. In Javanese societies, if a misfortune had happened there are some rituals to cast out these alien spirits and restore the original spirits back to their bodies (cf. Geertz 1976). This ritual, *ruwatan* (exorcism), was manifested in the commemoration mentioned at the outset.

The Lapindo mudflow in Porong, East Java has become a landmark in the history of human-nature relationships in Java for this time the Javanese rabbles have an opportunity to be part of the production of knowledge concerning such relationships. Works on Javanese culture tend to argue a key role of a noble leader, a savior (*ratu adil*) to empower the Javanese rabbles. The production of knowledge about such relationships has been centering on the courts since the Javanese believe that power is centered in some figures, mainly the kings of the Javanese courts (cf. Anderson 2007). Mudflow victims experience an anomalous situation from this Javanese political narrative for those in power never stand on their side. Instead, they have been protecting the perpetrator by taking over all liabilities to deal with further damages resulted from the mudflow. As a result, to expect a political will from the government to solve their problems is nothing but a wasting of time. It is time for victims to appear as key actors to determine their own version of story by using certain cultural narratives to reframe the situation according to their point of view, although it means that they must demonize someone in power.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- ANDERSON, B. 2007. The idea of power in Javanese culture. In *Culture and Politics in Indonesia* (ed) C. Holt, 1–70. Singapore: Equinox Publishing (Asia).
- DOWNING, L. 2008. *The Cambridge Introduction to Michel Foucault*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- FOUCAULT, M. 1972. *The Archaeology of Knowledge* (trans A. M. S. Smith). New York: Pantheon Books.
- 1978. *The History of Sexuality. Volume I: An Introduction* (trans R. Hurley). New York: Pantheon Books.
- 1980. *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings, 1972-1977* (C. Gordon ed). New York: Pantheon Books.
- GEERTZ, C. 1976. *The Religion of Java*. Chicago: Phoenix Book.
- LAPIAN, A. B. 1987. Bencana alam dan penulisan sejarah (Krakatau 1883 dan Cilegon 1888). In *Dari Babad dan Hikayat sampai Sejarah Kritis* (eds) T. I. Alfian, H. J. Koesoemanto, D. Hardjowidjono & D. Suryo, 211–231. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press.
- MILLS, S. 1997. *Discourse*. London: Routledge.
- SCHLEHE, J. 2009. Cultural politics of natural disasters: discourses on volcanic eruptions in Indonesia. In *Culture and the Changing Environment: Uncertainty, Cognition and Risk Management in Cross-Cultural Perspective* (ed) M. J. Casimir, 273–300. New York & London: Berghahn Books.





WESSING, R. 2010. Porous boundaries: addressing calamities in East Java, Indonesia. *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde* **166**, 49–82.

POLITICS OF OTHERING: POST-AUTHORITARIAN STATE'S REPRESSION ON CRITICAL LITERACY ACTIVISM

*Fuad Abdulgani & Ikram*

*Universitas Lampung*

Repression in literacy activism has still occurred in Indonesia even though the New Order's authoritarian regime has been collapsed. The Reformation period still colored by a series of actions conducted by the state apparatus (military and police) along with mass organizations (*ormas*) to disperse discussions and raiding books. The most frequently targeted are groups and knowledge products that discuss the themes of Marxism, *Partai Komunis Indonesia* (PKI), and the 1965 tragedies—themes which we classify as critical discourse. Repression is carried out arbitrarily and legitimized through a series of claims which sounds: "endangering the state", "disturbing public order", or "opening the wounds of the nation". These claims, we see, is a form of defining "others", carried out by the state and its apparatus, on groups of people and their activities that try to explore and offer critical perspectives and new insights related to the part of history of the nation, which was forbidden to discuss by New Order regimes. In this paper we aim to elucidate the assumptions and forms of ideas behind those claims, by interpreting it based on the Indonesia historical experience regarding Marxism, PKI, and 1965 tragedies. The continuation of repression on critical literacy activities in post-New Order regimes shows that the legacy of New Order authoritarianism is still working in the State structure and strives to dominate the public discourse through the exclusion of activities and production of critical knowledge.

*Keywords: critical literacy activism, authoritarianism, repression, politics of othering*

TRAVELING WITH KEBAYA: READING WOMEN, READING INDONESIA\*\*

*Nita Trismaya*

*Sekolah Tinggi Desain Interstudi*

*Today, there is kebaya as a choice of everyday clothes for women who come from kebaya community in Jakarta, it has difference style among the people who choose modern clothes. When it comes to kebaya as product of tradition, it still alive amidst the contestation between the political of unity and political of differences in Indonesia. Those women who wears kebaya have become to conduct the body politics as it associated with people. Base on experiences in their every single trip, wearing the kebaya is an autonomous right for them to choose their own clothes. Kebaya makes them learning to understand themselves, then find out that kebaya still loved by most of women in Indonesia, but at the same time, it is being abandoned. The research subjects in this paper are members of kebaya community who wearing kebaya as everyday clothes and often traveling frequently. I briefly analyze this topic with theory of power from Foucault by feminism*

---

\*\* We gratefully acknowledge financial support from LPDP (Lembaga Pengelola Dana Pendidikan) Indonesia



*anthropology to explain the political of the bodies as an autonomous individual through the kebaya as their choice, their freedom to travel and their willness to change the way of what most people thinking about kebaya. This topic then raises several questions: why do those women choose kebaya as everyday clothes, not other regional cloth? How do people react to these women and their kebaya as well? Are some actions and reactions able be describe the actual conditions regarding political issues in Indonesia? This research has been carried out since 2017 whose data was obtained from in-depth interviews, supplemented by travel books written by them, online media that written about them and their social media accounts.*

*Keyword: women, kebaya, everyday clothes, traveling, body politic*

## BACKGROUND

Nowadays, there are political situation polarizing some society in Indonesia and dividing them into it. One is carrying unity and another is promoting diversity. Since kebaya presents as a symbol of local tradition, it is carrying two meaning that namely about unity through its position as a national dress and diversity through its cultural roots as a traditional dress. Base on that case, today in some social media as Facebook and Instagram, there is tagline about "The National Movement returned to the national dress of the Archipelago's national identity" which raising various images of women in wearing traditional clothes, mostly in kebaya as Indonesian people known as national dress. That social movement has invite Indonesian women become returning to wear traditional dress, especially kebaya as they love Indonesia as well. According to that movement, in the last few years, some women have been present as they choose to wear kebaya as everyday clothes. They are presenting among people who prefer to wear modern (Western) clothing or some people who choose to Muslim clothing. The kebaya that worn by that women bring an interesting phenomenon, especially when they get traveling and make interactions with other people who they found in every various places. This paper comes from the research that doing by me, kebaya community in Jakarta as my analysis unit and the research subjects are women from that community who love to travel and get traveling as their job.

## OBJECTIVE

The purpose of this paper is to raising the issue about how that women from kebaya community do the body politics and showing their own authority through the freedom of choosing clothes. They express it themselves through kebaya, how their needed about changing the way of people thinking and perceiving kebaya in the trips that women do as they negotiating it with some values in society. Kebaya is not only seen from the aesthetic aspect but what happen behind it. This paper is expected to fill some literature on kebaya from the point of view of anthropology as quoted from Eicher (2000) that the position of clothing in anthropology received less attention but nowadays it is being get more attention because there are so many facts that cloth has lots of meaning in many culture and bringing many symbol to analyse it.

## DESCRIPTION

Those women from kebaya community become agents who influencing to their society through the kebaya that they wear and some activities that they do. In their every single trip, the kebaya that worn get as a readable medium for many people as well as what behind it, namely the character of Indonesian women and the position of kebaya in Indonesian society. For those women from kebaya community, they bring out kebaya to many position that not only as a



medium of self-expression, but also bringing some mission to introduce many people about kebaya as an Indonesian cultural asset. They also want to prove that kebaya does not hinder any activities. Those women had found that many people who they met on their trip had given positive appreciation about kebaya event though some people told them that they did not want to choose it as everyday clothes for some reasons, for example kebaya were impractical and has not in accordance with their activities or their modern lifestyle.

## FINDINGS

The meaning of kebaya while those women from kebaya community got traveling in Indonesia, it has different meaning than when kebaya has get abroad. Mostly, the reaction of the people in Indonesia revolve around that kebaya is synonymous with Javanese culture. While the reaction of the foreign society abroad has become diverse, for example, informant Sabrina who traveled to Myanmar in using kebaya as her cloth as her dress, she was mistaken by local society as a local woman due to the similarity of kebaya with the costumes of the local community. Zoya's informants who consistently wearing kebaya as every day cloth, she gets various reactions from various people she had met, for example, some people thought that she is Javanese or maybe Balinese. Zoya who also love to hiking even get more provokes the reaction from others in a positive way because of she wearing kebaya as a costume to climb a mountain. Risma, who love to riding bicycles or motorbikes as a daily transportation, she wants to prove that wearing kebaya as she does, it is not hinder activities while she introducing kebaya in a unique way. The kebaya model that worn by these women has some adaption to their activities, for example when Zoya climbs a mountain, she wearing 'kain' that wrapped below the knee to make it easier to move, then her footwear is a mountain shoes. Likewise, with Sabrina who wears kebaya with cotton, she has modified wrapping model of *kain* to make it easier for her to move. Due to Risma wearing leggings behind her kain, she needed her legs closed safely when sitting on motorcycle or bicycle. In every traveling, these women carrying kebaya in a more modern sense. They realize that it is not easy to invite other women to love kebaya as they do, moreover there are some people who see kebaya as clothes that bringing sensuality and contrary to religious values. Through their trips, there is some interaction and communication with other people and the local community also, those kebaya women hoping that kebaya will get more appreciation than today. What these women has do, it is related to the concept of power discourse (Foucault, 2017), there is a desire to change the world view of others according to their wishes and spread knowledge about kebaya. According to the perspective of Foucault's power discourse in Jones (2016), there is a strong belief in a free subject spirit that get the basic about dominance of discourse and the concept of agency, there is also a control and supervision in those perspective. According to feminism that see Foucault's concept of power as a form of women's subordination especially to the body (Jones, 2016), feminism is fighting for it. Although in kebaya believe, these women show their femininity and independence.

## CONCLUSION

Base on the concept about discourse of power, kebaya is a vehicle for empowered women to achieve their own goals. They wear kebaya within feminist perspective, kebaya is an easy way to do so many activities, kebaya as a medium of self-expression while there is a fact that preservation of clothing culture laying in women's hand. Kebaya women become agents of culture as well as agencies that using their authority to travel by. Through the journey, kebaya get establish broader and more global interactions that perhaps it has two contrasting things will be found, the kebaya



will survive on their own or the kebaya will disappear by itself and also will be crushed by other cultural influences.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

Eicher, Joanne B (2000), *Anthropology of dress*. Dress 2000. Vol. 27

Foucault, Michel (2017), *Wacana Kuasa/Pengetahuan*. Yogyakarta: Narasi-Pustaka Prometheus

Jones dkk (2016), *Pengantar Teori-teori Sosial*. Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia

Jones, Jackson, ed (2009), *Teori-teori Feminis Kontemporer*. Yogyakarta: Jalasutra

Tong, Rosemarie Putnam (2004), *Feminist Thought: Pengantar paling komprehensif kepada aliran utama pemikiran feminis*. Yogyakarta: Jalasutra

#### POLITICS OF BELONGING AND STRATEGIES OF PERSEVERANCE: INDONESIAN POLITICAL EXILES AND MIGRANT WORKERS WITHIN AND BEYOND THE NATION-STATE

Ratna Saptari  
Leiden University

This study focuses on the relationship between transnational migration, nationhood and citizenship in the examination of two categories of migrants within different periods in Indonesian history, namely Indonesian political exiles in the post 1965 period and migrant workers in the post New Order period who are currently residing in the Netherlands. The two categories allow us to examine both commonalities and differences in terms of the creation of borders and boundaries; the role of the state; and relationships with the family back home. In the period between 1965 – 1967, the passports of hundreds to thousands of people who happened to be abroad to study or to represent the Indonesian government within the Non- Aligned States were revoked by the New Order regime. The role of the Indonesian state in persecuting those who would not affiliate themselves with the New Order regime shaped also the politics of exclusion as they were seen as ‘a danger to the nation’. In the case of the migrant workers, particularly during and after the economic crisis in 1997/1998. migrant workers were referred to as ‘revenue heroes’ (*pahlawan devisa*). However, the fact that hundreds of the migrants were victims of trafficking, highlights another dimension of stigmatization and boundary making, as a large percentage become undocumented workers. In the first case one sees the clear role of the state in shaping the boundaries of exclusion; and in the second case one sees ambivalences in the state’s role. This paper will examine how these divergent roles of the state but also the historical context and moral politics of various political actors have contributed to the strategies of these two categories of migrants in dealing with their trajectories and shaping their politics of belonging.



ANCESTOR WORSHIP AT THE TROPENMUSEUM:  
AN INVESTIGATION INTO THE REPATRIATION OF WEST PAPUAN CULTURAL HERITAGE

*Sophie Faber*

*The University of Auckland*

Indigenous cultural heritage held in museums around the world has become a matter of concern over the past decades for both institutions and previously colonised peoples. The contested nature of cultural objects contained in these institutes has been, and continues to be, linked to notions of colonialism. Consequently, there is considerable pressure from both indigenous peoples and advocates to redress the wrongdoings and injustices perpetrated against their communities during their conquest. This is evident in multilateral conventions including the 1995 *UNIDROIT Convention and UNESCO 1970 Convention on the Means of Prohibiting and Preventing the Illicit Import, Export and Transport of Ownership of Cultural Property*. At a national level it is enacted in legislature such as the USA's *Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act 1990*, New Zealand's *Protected Objects Act 1975*, and *Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga Act 2014*. Therefore, many museums and cultural institutes have begun to pay attention to issues of repatriation due to growing external pressure, carefully considering not only the ethics of curation and display, but also the objects within the collections themselves (Van Beurden, 2012, p.6). Such intentions can be seen in the Museum of New Zealand Te Papa Tongarewa's 2003 government mandated programme for the repatriation of kōiwi- and koimi tangata<sup>24</sup>, Karanga Aotearoa.

This paper will critically evaluate current shifts in cultural repatriation. To achieve this, I shall specifically focus on examples of West Papuan indigenous cultural heritage, particular representations of ancestor figures currently held by the Tropenmuseum in Amsterdam, the Netherlands. I have elected to investigate this museum due to my interest in the long history of Dutch imperialism. I shall investigate the agency of cultural patrimony in my assessment of the necessity of restitution of cultural heritage. By considering the agency of objects we develop an insight into the significant spiritual and social roles that objects hold in indigenous people's lives outside of the context of the museum. This will be developed in reference to Alfred Gell's concepts explored in his work *Art and Agency*. Gell's argument is that 'things' are invested with "social agency vis-a-vis other social agents" (Gell, 1998, p.18). As such, indigenous cultural patrimony not only have their own "personhood" as heritage objects. They also acquire secondary agency through a reflection of the "personhood" of the owner or creator. For instance, when a computer has a system failure when working to a critical deadline, we may feel as if it has personally betrayed us during our hour of need. This attribution of anthropomorphic personality is irrational. Our response is not to blame the computer's manufacturer, but to blame the machine itself. In doing so we have thus provided the machine with agency in this social context. We imbue it with personhood through how we interact with it. The agency imbued within cultural objects differs from that held by individuals, which is innate rather than prescribed. In this way, we contest and manipulate the meaning of objects over a wide range of contexts (Gell, 1998, p.21).

My focus on ancestral representations in the context of this paper is to demonstrate how personhood and agency are attributed to cultural objects. Through the example of Papuan korwar<sup>25</sup> from Cenderawasih Bay,<sup>26</sup> in the northern Province of Papua and West Papua, I will explore agency

---

<sup>24</sup> Māori and Moriori ancestral, skeletal remains

<sup>25</sup> West Papuan ancestral statues that originate from the Cendrawasih and Doreh Bay regions

<sup>26</sup> *Teluk Sarera*, formerly Geelvink Bay



as an impetus for restitution. This is of particular significance in the case of West Papua due to its complex experience of colonialism. Colonised first by the Dutch, it experienced a period of liberation only to be subsequently further subjected to Indonesian control. As an internal minority within Indonesia, West Papuans are subject to both colonial oppression and restrictions of sovereignty over their indigenous lands. This iconoclasm of culture by Indonesia, and the abundance of Papuan patrimony within Dutch museums, serves as a foundation through which we can consider the restitution of Papuan heritage from the Netherlands. Following this, I shall assess why culturally relevant items from West Papua held in Dutch museums have not been repatriated, and whether or not they should be. This shall firstly be explained through a brief history of Papua and the Tropenmuseum. Secondly, I shall provide a background to the Tropenmuseum's repatriation policies, as well as an analysis of the object agency of korwars as a rationale for restitution. I will then assess issues of repatriation from the Tropenmuseum to West Papua, defining these problems of restitution in their relation to socio-politics, legality and finance. Finally, I offer potential solutions to these issues and the problem of equitable representation in colonial museums. This is exemplified through the case studies of the Karanga Aotearoa Repatriation Programme for the respectful resocialisation of Māori ancestral tūpuna<sup>27</sup>, and the Australian Museum's training of indigenous Papua New Guineans and other Pacific Islanders in the technical and provenance aspects of museums, which serve as potential guides for the future repatriation of indigenous heritage globally (McManus, 2016, p.50). The paper concludes that whilst the damage created by imperialism can never be fully redressed, measures can, and must, be found to amend the historical injustices of the colonial museum.

*Keywords: West Papua, cultural heritage, colonialism, the Netherlands, museums*

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Gell, A. (1998). *Art and Agency: An Anthropological Theory*. Oxford, U.K.: Clarendon Press.
- McManus, P. (2016). *Archaeological Displays and the Public: Museology and Interpretation, Second Edition*. New York, U.S.A: Routledge.
- Van Beurden, J. (2012). *The Return of Cultural and Historical Treasures: The Case of the Netherlands*. Amsterdam, The Netherlands: KIT Publishers.

CLASH WITHIN 'CIVILIZATION': UNDERSTANDING POLITIC OF DIVERSITY IN INDONESIA BY TRACING  
GENEALOGY OF AN EPISTEMIC COMMUNITY

*Tri Nugroho*<sup>28</sup>

*Anthropology Graduate, Universitas Indonesia*

*This paper examines the struggle for freedom in Indonesia just before and after the 'Reformasi'. It would be seen from the perspective of an epistemic community namely Utan Kayu Community, a community which later established Salihara Community. The story of the community begun in 21 June 1994 when Tempo magazine was banned along with Detik and Editor media. This created one of crowds that brought Soeharto government into end in May 1998. The community continued*

---

<sup>27</sup> Ancestors, grandparents

<sup>28</sup> Graduated from IPB University, Sussex University at Brighton (UK) and Department of Anthropology, Faculty of Social and Political Science, University of Indonesia. Email: treenug@gmail.com





*to promote freedom of all kinds. It included the promotion of freedom of the press, freedom to established associations, freedom of speech and opinion, freedom of broadcasting, freedom of information, freedom of religions and beliefs and other freedoms under the freedom of thought and expressions.*

*Promotion of freedoms by this community has been contested with other interest groups who have different principles and values, different episteme. On the other side, proposed values by other interest groups that are not in line with theirs have been challenged by this epistemic community. This discourse has been gone through various 'clashes' in Indonesian public sphere, including in social media, in many important national moments, since the Reformation 1998 and still can be seen in the current situation. This is a clash within Indonesia 'civilization', within 'unity in diversity'. All want to be adopted and institutionalized into policies and practices of the state. At the end, this is about the struggle of managing different imaginations of Indonesia. This paper shares an anthropological work for understanding politics of diversity in Indonesia by tracing genealogy of an epistemic community.*

*Keywords: freedom, epistemic community, politic of diversity, Utan Kayu - Salihara community*

## INTRODUCTION

*"The threat faced by Indonesian society today is not a bad theology, but political and cultural battles. We are fighting over space and influences to determine the limits of state power and formulate Indonesianness. The Indonesian nation is a future project, something that did not exist before, but must be built" (I Gusti Agung Ayu Ratih's Cultural Speech, 2008)*

Reformasi 1998 (Indonesian Reform in 1998) had brought down Suharto and the New Order government. Freedoms existed in various aspects of life in Indonesia. They were not taken for granted but to be fought for, challenged and continue to be contested. Public spaces were opened and every citizen had the right to obtain and filled them with various ideas and interests. We could see the struggle for spaces and influences on how Indonesia today and future might be discussed, designed dan created on our everyday environment, on the streets, in the parliament, in the media, and various existing public spaces. Voices of dissent which were not possible to emerge and obtain spaces in New Order era have become a phenomenon that is easy to find at present. After *Reformasi*, there has been an open struggle for meaning and construction on what Indonesia nation was: a formulation of imagined Indonesia.

However, our relatively young democratic experience has stuttered many people with these freedoms. Instead of appreciating diversity that had been existing throughout Nusantara history—reflected in the slogan "Bhinneka Tunggal Ika"—Unity in Diversity—some people used the freedoms to push their views and attempted to create uniformity through power, capital, and, violence.

In certain situations, where some people still have not been able to communicate rationally and prefer to impose their will on others by violence, we often saw clearly the state's inefficacy in addressing these conflicts. This is the problem we faced in Post-*Reformasi* Indonesia, a country that some analysts thought had been more democratic but full of rows (noisy democracy). It stimulated some people to miss New Order's situation that looked more orderly. This is Indonesia today: a country which is being imagined by various parties differently but still felt to be one nation.





## APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY

In this paper I studied about ideas and that important role of ideas in the process of changing society. Toward and during *Reformasi* period up to the present had been influenced by various contestations of thoughts. Some ideas had been promoted by certain institutions. In this study the variables that I considered important were the rise and development of individual networks that formed an epistemic community, which carried a certain episteme. Epistemic community, as stated by Haas (1992: 2-3) is defined as a network of professionals with recognized expertise and competence in a particular domain and an authoritative claim to policy-relevant knowledge within that domain or issue area.

This study examined this phenomenon through a network of civil society who called themselves Komunitas Utan Kayu and Komunitas Salihara, which since *Reformasi* era until today still continue to fight for their ideas on freedom and diversity, attempted to institutionalized them into state's policies, institutions, and practices.

Competing ideas have become common phenomena in post-*Reformasi* and supported by diverse views of different epistemes, which often triggered cultural disputes that lead to social tensions. Such situation happened because of the work mechanism of episteme comprised of three discursive components: scientific disciplines, institutions and figures, and combination of the three produced a machine of truth (Foucault, 1980). While Foucault discussed episteme on madness and validity of truth to tell about it, this study would discuss it on the theme of freedom and diversity within pluralistic Indonesian society.

This study used qualitative data collection methods, and it was conducted by tracing the origin and transmission of ideas in the communities studied, and tracing various intellectual genealogies. The genealogy method that had been applied modestly is both a tool for research and for understanding (Fox, 2002). The concept of genealogy as a study of origin, evolution and network of a group of people through a period of time (Latif, 2005) was useful to observe the movement of diachronic development and intellectual chains between generations, which would help us to understand some contestation of ideas that had been, were, and would be contested to define Indonesia.

In this study I also tried the use of netnography techniques (initiated by Robert Kozinets in 1995), a data collection technique that uses internet-based information and data, through the use of Twitter, YouTube, Blackberry Messengers, blogs, Facebook and the use of internet sites. It is a data collection technique that has its own strengths and weaknesses, but is important to develop in the current era of information technology and social media.

The research was conducted intensively between 2007 and 2012, but I believe that the phenomena were still relevant to current situation and I wanted to propose this approach as part of an anthropologist's efforts to understand politics of diversity in Indonesia, one of central themes in this symposium.

### *From social movement to epistemic community*

Komunitas Utan Kayu was a group of people who were united by history. It was born from a social movement that emerged after the banning of three national news media on June 21, 1994, particularly Tempo magazine. These individuals gathered and united because they opposed the banning of Tempo magazine, which had impeded the right of access to information on the one



hand, and removed the right to publish news, on the other hand. The banning of Tempo and two other media are deprivation on freedom.

The resistance movement was organized by the community at Jalan Utan Kayu 68H using their own field of expertise: information. "There were two kinds of people who were here with me. The Tempo alumni and the underground," said Goenawan Mohamad, editor in chief of Tempo, on situation at that time in Steele (2005). People who rejected the ban on Tempo, who actually were not only media activists but also people from various circles and backgrounds, joined. One and a half months after the banning, the 'Sirnagalih Declaration' was declared on August 6, 1994, and Alliance of Independent Journalists (AJI) was born.

AJI was an independent journalists' alliance that stood up against the Indonesian Journalists Association (PWI) that fired its members who founded AJI instead of defended them. Some signatories of Sirnagalih Declaration and co-founders of AJI were those who were actively involved with Komunitas Utan Kayu.

On December 1994, Institute for the Studies on Free Flow of Information (ISAI) was developed and established in January 1995 ISAI in Utan Kayu residential area. This was the parent institution that later supported a number of important initiatives in Komunitas Utan Kayu. ISAI was the one that published 'fast-paced books' (without permission letter of press publishing or SIUPP), a metamorphosis of Tempo's cover story, that produced journalistic investigations on a number of important issues and events that were impossible to be published in other mass media at the time. From a 'secret office' called 'Blok-M' (to trick intelligence), this ISAI Unit 2 drove the development of underground press.

"Actually, when we look again, the past was very simple. How could it be that the media with blurred pictures like this could brought people into jail. It was a past memory, but if we don't remind ourselves, we will not realize what we get now was what we fight for with our simple ideas at the time." (Ayu Utami, when hosting the opening ceremony of the 70 Underground Press Covers at Utan Kayu 68H on June 21, 2011).



If ISAI is the origin of Komunitas Utan Kayu's emergence that had been actively engaged in arranging and seizing freedom after the three national media had been banned, supporting the underground press, then moved through clandestine operation and partly on the surface, then KBR 68H News Radio is the second generation of Komunitas Utan Kayu which has been moving on the surface and continues to expand networks and initiatives to voice freedom, through the means of radio.



When the study was being carried out until 2012, KBR 68H was relayed by around 800 radio stations throughout Indonesia and around 80 radio stations in Asian countries through the Asia Calling program. Whereas now, KBR 68H is using a digital format (KBR Prime), while the rubric and programs it produces still disseminate the initial ideas that Komunitas Utan Kayu had when it was first established; similar to the “Hang out with Gus Dur” event that they held in their early days.

Another part of Komunitas Utan Kayu is the Liberal Islam Network (JIL). This network originated from a discussion mailing list ([islamliberal@yahoo.com](mailto:islamliberal@yahoo.com)), which was deliberately formed on March 8, 2001 with a mission that included evolving liberal interpretations of Islam in line with the principles adhered to and disseminating them to the widest possible audience, encouraging the opening of a dialogue space that was free from conservatism pressure, which in turn would grow the thoughts and movements of a healthy Islam.

During the initial period of JIL, there was a discourse that drew public attention. It was coming from the writings of Ulil Abshar Abdalla in the Kompas daily on November 18, 2002, entitled “Refreshing Understanding of Islam”. The article has sparked controversy for two consecutive months in Kompas until finally the editorial board used its authority to halt the publication of the long arguments.

This debate was later published through a book titled “Liberal and Fundamental Islam; A Battle of Discourse” (Ulil Abshar Abdalla, 2003). Furthermore, other critical discourses emerged from subsequent writings and publications involving JIL and Komunitas Utan Kayu.

During the time the study was conducted, the active JIL website also continued to voice an array of liberal thoughts about how to understand Islam in a rational and open manner. Facebook accounts of JIL figures generally had close to or more than 5,000 friends. The tweets of these figures were also appearing and conversing lively in Twitter, remarking on latest cases with their views that trigger discourses.

These ideas-loaded writings had driven some Islamic groups to position JIL and Komunitas Utan Kayu as opposing parties. They launched a series of counter discourse and counter movement through the publication of books, video recordings, mailing list networks, opposing Twitter account, demonstrations, evictions, attacks, to the point of sending a book bomb as what took place on March 15, 2011.



Komunitas Utan Kayu founded Teater Utan Kayu (TUK) to fill the arts and literature domains. Teater Utan Kayu functioned as a platform for various activities developed in Utan Kayu 68H after the Tempo Magazine was banned. The theater’s art



activities and painting exhibitions held at Galeri Utan Kayu were part of an effort to cover up the underground movement of this community through the presence of a public crowd.

In addition to Goenawan Mohamad, who was indeed a productive artist, several prominent figures in art and culture who have been involved in the discourses around the profession also joined TUK institution. The organizing of the Utan Kayu International Literary Biennale in 2001, 2003, 2005 and 2007, also had become prestigious regular events with the objective to cater the arts and culture activists.

Nevertheless, the presence and development of this TUK then caused new controversy among activists in the world of art and culture. In fact, on December 20, 2006, veteran poet Taufik Ismail delivered a cultural speech on the stage of Jakarta Academy, under the title "Culture of Shame Eroded by the Movement of Free Desire".

In his 37-paragraph long speech, the Generation 1966 poet protested that he was disturbed by the emergence of a large wave that invaded the nation, namely the wave blown by the Free Desire Movement (that he abbreviated it as GSM – Gerakan Syahwat Merdeka). He said, the movement was not an official organization and did not stand alone, but instead collaborated with a global network, supported by a giant funding, a combination of underlying ideologies, and using print and electronic media as their loudspeakers. Taufik Ismail concluded that GSM had deconstructed morality and social order, with the ideology of neo-liberalism, materialistic views, and supported by the capitalism of the universe.

Taufik Ismail's speech was just one of many criticisms launched against Goenawan Soesatyo Mohamad (GSM) and the presence of TUK, which could symbolize a feud between the two cultural figures who both signed the Cultural Manifesto on August 17, 1963, during the era of Guided Democracy.

Then came the Statement of Opinion from the Writers of 'Ode Kampung' at Rumah Dunia Banten in July 2007, which also hit TUK. The group led by poet Saut Situmorang and his friends tirelessly "stripping" TUK leaders. In Saut's sharp eyes, they did not deserve the title of writers. Saut continued this dispute by pioneering the establishment of "boemipoetra" community, which released "the boemipoetra Manifesto".

The debate had kept on until a new public space at Jalan Salihara Pasar Minggu was inaugurated in August 2008, with parts of the Komunitas Utan Kayu, Teater Utan Kayu and Galeri Utan Kayu metamorphosed into Komunitas Salihara, Teater Salihara and Galeri Salihara. In this new location, works of art, literature, theater and discussions were held intensively and their quality maintained by Teater Utan Kayu figures who were now leaders of Komunitas Salihara, through the institutionalized body of Salihara Council of Curators.

The Salihara Festival was held regularly alternating with Salihara Literary Biennial, in line with a series of art, literature and discussion events that are continuously organized throughout the year. The main message from Komunitas Salihara conveyed through the phrase "Cultivate Freedom Together with the Public" seemed to have generated a community that still reflected the spirit brought from Utan Kayu: a spirit to fight for, and to cultivate, freedom.





*Understanding politics of diversity from an epistemic community and its 'enemy'*

This paper shares the experience of understanding the politics of diversity that is currently taking place in Indonesia by dissecting the issues and discourses that are being discussed and grown in Komunitas Utan Kayu and Komunitas Salihara network.

As an entry point and study area, this community is relatively small. It is therefore easier to manage in 'reading' the broad issue of politics of diversity. This community, in my view, is an epistemic community in the field of culture, a field that is commonly influenced by relative values, as a cultural relativism. Seeing the way this community works in producing and reproducing cultural discourses, and also studying the views of those who oppose them, we can quickly comprehend the things that have become important issues related to the politics of diversity in Indonesia, and also on the global level, since the community's character is part of a global professional network (transnational knowledge-based network).



Essentially, this community can be differentiated into three professional domains on which they actualize, namely 1) the domain of media, including information, print and broadcast media; 2) the domain of art and literature, and 3) religious domain, especially Islam. In these three domains, the main figures emerged in their respective areas and then networked with other figures outside this epistemic community, both at the local, national and global levels. In tracing the discourse of a community, they often clash along the way with other communities (epistemic or interest groups), who have different views and original ideas.

The peak of the feud in the media domain, for example, surfaced when Tempo magazine was banned, and independent press figures joined the Alliance of Independent Journalists (AJI), becoming opposition to the Indonesian Journalists Association (PWI). AJI was boosting press freedom and freedom of expression, while PWI had been known to be the accomplice to the regime that used media banning as their silencer gun.

These figures have been fighting for freedom of the press, and together with a network of other professional individuals they moved to drive policy changes that guarantee freedom of broadcasting and freedom to access public information. They also oppose the Bill of State Secrets and also criticize the heavy monopoly of the media industry in Indonesia. Then the synergy with activists on the issue of diversity also gave birth to new derivative institutions such as the Journalists Union for Diversity (Sejuk, which means cool).

In the domain of art and culture, the figures who are rising currently in Komunitas Salihara are 'professional' individuals who bring their own networks in local, national, and global levels to continuously fighting for freedom of thought, freedom to create, and freedom of expression. The network of these figures also generated a diverse of new knowledge and creativity in literature.



Looking at flashbacks, such disputes in the art and literature domain had actually taken place massively at the end of Soekarno's administration in 1963-1965, when the signatories of the Cultural Manifesto had to confront the leaders of the Body of People's Arts (Lekra), a wing organization under the Indonesian Communist Party (PKI).

In the *Reformasi* era, the rivalry between the two signatories of the Cultural Manifesto, Taufik Ismail and Goenawan Mohamad, could be the evidence of differences in the ideas they believe in, the episteme. Contestation in the domain of art and literature will continue to revolve, although not as starkly as it was at the end of the Guided Democracy period.

One of the events that have arisen and enriched the domain of art and culture was when the works of female writers who were later referred to as the school of Fragrant Literature came to the surface. They openly wrote issues that have been considered controversial for female authors to write, such as politics, religion and sexuality. Ayu Utami is one of the main figures of this literature school.

This phenomenon also led to the Statement of Opinions of the Ode Kampung writers who were also supported by several main writers from the Forum Lingkar Pena (FLP). The dispute could be viewed from different perspectives, between those who think that "the writer is dead" (Barthes, 1967) and its dichotomy, that is: the writer is responsible for his writing even after death.

Meanwhile, on the sphere of religion, the clash of civilizations that Huntington wrote about (1996) presumably also take place in Indonesia. However, this clash does not only take place between civilizations, but also occurs within a civilization and across generations. This intra-civilizational clash is also closely related to the episteme differences of each group, which at the same time reflect similar contradictions that have been, are, and still happening on global level. The emergence of the 'Indonesian Without JIL' movement, is one of the counter movements against JIL.

In his cultural speech at Taman Ismail Marzuki in March 2010, one of the main figures of JIL Ulil Abshar Abdalla conveyed that we should not need to reminisce the past anymore neither hope that religion can be forced back into private space and no longer disturb people's lives. Now we better deal with this phenomenon with a positive stance but still critical. According to Ulil, there has been a rise of religion as a movement of 'reform from within'.

In the context of the rise of Islam, this can be distinguished through the comprehension of (1) salafism or a movement that refer to the past: an awakening that takes the form of 'returning' to what is often viewed as the 'pristine', sacred, and original past, or to a Tradition with a capital T which is considered to represent a religious model that relatively ideal and perfect; and other comprehension referred to as (2) khalafism, or contextualism, the movement that looks to the present, reviews religious teachings under the light of this era. Both salafism and khalafism, according to him, must go hand in hand simultaneously.

The return of religion to the modern social political arena is a reality that is increasingly common in the course of Indonesia as a nation after *Reformasi*. The fight between meanings and competition of public space by using identity politics, have currently been quite disturbing. This is something that people feared could reach its peak as already happened in two other domains. According to Ulil, religion in the Indonesian context, might have been categorized as a cultural



marker, as an aspect of culture that gave a strong sense of ownership and gave rise to identity, which for some people became the imagined of Indonesia in the future.

The incident of Monas during the Sacred Power of Pancasila Day 1 June 2008, prohibition of Hizbut Tahir Indonesia (HTI), the 212 Joint Prayer Action and its subsequent series of demonstrations, which related to the 2017 Jakarta Regional Election until the 2019 National Election which has just ended, are some important events that can describe such condition.

In most of these incidents, the researcher can probe them from the discourse's entry point that has been developing in the epistemic community network being studied: by observing the macro-condition of politics of diversity in Indonesia, from one tiny lens in one corner of Jakarta.

## CONCLUSION

'We are an epistemic community who doesn't start from theory, but from social movement '

(Goenawan Mohamad)

Promotion of freedoms by this community has been contested with other interest groups who have different principles and values, different episteme. On the other side, proposed values by other interest groups that are not in line with theirs have been challenged by this epistemic community. This discourse has been gone through various 'clashes' in Indonesian public sphere, including in social media, in many important national moments, since the Reformation 1998 and still can be seen in the current situation. This is a clash within Indonesia 'civilization', within 'unity in diversity'. All want to be adopted and institutionalized into policies and practices of the state. At the end, this is about the struggle of managing different imaginations of Indonesia.

As a reflection, the definition of epistemic community as formulated by Hass is challenged when it is applied to the area of cultural studies, when placed within the context of 'professional networks with recognized expertise and competencies' in areas loaded with cultural relativity.

Who has the authority claim and who has the right to judge that an artwork (painting or poetry) is more beautiful or worse than the other?

Furthermore, in the religious sphere, who has the claim of authority to declare that someone is a religious expert and the other is not? Just take a look at the presence of celebrities who suddenly become clerics and expert witnesses whose expertise is doubted, as in the Constitutional Court hearing during the Judicial Review of Law No.1/PNPS/1965 regarding blasphemy.

So who has the authority to hold the keys to heaven? Here, the Foucault episteme concept will help complete the analysis of research, in particular those related to power relations and how meaning is determined by power—something that has not been discussed in the concept of Epistemic Community from Hass.

For qualitative research methodology to advance, I share my experiences on netnography for gathering data from various social media, a method that needs to be developed more seriously in this information technology era.

In the end, as stated by Rabinow (1986, in Garnder and Lewis, 1997), anthropology is currently facing a 'crisis of representation', so he called for more studies that are 'looking up' (to study up), studying communities of 'powerful people' in addition to studying 'the powerless': an attempt to





'anthropologize the West'. Within the corridor of the anthropological paradigm of development, development failures do not only need to be examined for constraints on the 'non-elite level' or 'local community'; but also on the 'elite level', which are rulers, donor countries, government officials, civil society, and other development agents, including the epistemic community. This study is part of that effort.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abshar-Abdalla, Ulil

- 2005 Menjadi Muslim Liberal. Jaringan Islam Liberal, Freedom Institute dan Penerbit Nalar. Jakarta.
- 2007 Menyegarkan Kembali Pemikiran Islam: Bunga Rampai Surat-Surat Tersiar. Penerbit Nalar. Jakarta
- 2010 Sejumlah Refleksi tentang Kehidupan Sosial Keagamaan Kita Saat Ini. Pidato Kebudayaan, 2 Maret 2010. Forum Pluralisme Indonesia.

Anderson, Benedict

- 2002 (1991). Imagined Communities: Komunitas-Komunitas Terbayang. Insist dan Pustaka Pelajar. Yogyakarta.

Anonymous

- 2011 70 Muka Pers Bawah Tanah: 70 tahun Goenawan Mohamad. Komunitas Kayu. Jakarta.

Assyaukanie, Luthfi.

- 2002. Wajah Liberal Islam di Indonesia. Jaringan Islam Liberal dan Teater Utan Kayu. Jakarta.

Barthes, Roland

- 1990 Imaji, Musik, Teks. Jalasutra. Yogyakarta.

Barton, Greg

- 1999 Gagasan Islam Liberal di Indonesia: Pemikiran Neo-Modernisme Nurcholis Madjid, Djohan Effendi, Ahma Wahib, dan Abdurrahman Wahid. Paramadina dengan Pustaka Antara, Yayasan Adikarya Ikapi dan The Ford Foundation. Jakarta.

Basyaib, Hamid (Ed.)

- 2006 Membela Kebebasan: Percakapan tentang Demokrasi Liberal. Pustaka Alvabet. Jakarta.

Dewanto. Nugroho (Ed.)

- 2007 Membangun Rumah Keindonesiaan. Seri Perbincangan dalam Program Talkshow Pilar Demokrasi KBR68H Penerbit KBR68H. Jakarta.

Dhakidae, Daniel

- 2003 Cendekiawan dan Kekuasaan: Dalam Negara Orde Baru. Gramedia, Jakarta.

Foucault, Michel

- 1980 Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972-1977 Pantheon Books. New York.



- Fox, James J.  
2002 Tracing Genealogies: Toward An International Multicultural Anthropology. Dalam Proceedings the 3rd International Symposium of the Journal Antropologi Indonesia: 16-19 July 2002, Udayana University, Bali. Antropologi Indonesia. Depok.
- Fukuyama, Francis  
2003 The End of History and The Last Man: Kemenangan Kapitalisme dan Demokrasi Liberal. Penerbit Qalam, Yogyakarta
- Gardner, Katy and David Lewis  
1997 Anthropology, Development and Post-Modern Challenge. Pluto Press. London.
- Haas, Peter M. Winter  
1992 Introduction: Epistemic Communities and International Policy Coordination. International Organization, Vo.46, No.1, Knowledge, Power and International Policy Coordination (1-35).
- Handrianto, Budi  
2007 50 Tokoh Islam Liberal di Indonesia: Pengusung Ide Sekularisme, Pluralisme dan Liberalisme Agama. Penerbit Hujjah. Jakarta.
- Harsono, Andreas dan Setiyono, Budi  
2008 Jurnalisme Sasatrawi: Antologi Liputan Mendalam dan Memikat'. Yayasan Pantau-Gramedia. Jakarta.
- Huntington, Samuel P.  
1996 The Clash of Civilizations: And The Remaking Of World Order, Simon & Schuster Ltd. London.
- I Gusti Agung Ayu Ratih  
2008 Rumuskan Kembali Keindonesiaan Kita: Pidato Kebudayaan: 10 November 2008. Dewan Kesenian Jakarta.
- Ismail, Taufik  
2006 Budaya Malu Dikikis Habis Gerakan Syahwat Merdeka. Pidato Kebudayaan, 15 Desember 2006. Akademi Jakarta.
- Latif, Yudi.  
2005 Intelegensia Muslim dan Kuasa: Genealogi Intelegensia Muslim Indonesia Abad Ke-20. Mizan. Bandung.
- Manji, Irshad  
2012 Allah, Liberty and Love: Suatu keberanian mendamaikan iman dan kebebasan. Renebook. Jakarta.
- Mallarangeng, Rizal  
2002 Mendobrak Sentralisme Ekonomi: Indonesia 1986-1992. KPG-Gramedia, Jakarta.
- Maulana, Amalia E.  
2009 Consumer Insight via Ethnography: Mengungkap yang tidak pernah terungkap, Penerbit Esensi (Airlangga). Jakarta.



Mohamad, Goenawan

- 2005 Setelah Revolusi Tak Ada Lagi. Pustaka Alvabet. Jakarta.
- 2007 Tuhan & Hal-Hal yang Tak Selesai. KataKita. Depok.
- 2011 Percikan: kumpulan twitter @gm\_gm. Gramedia. Jakarta.
- 2011 Marxisme, Seni, Pembebasan. Tempo dan PT Grafiti Pers. Jakarta.

Mujani, Saiful, et.al.

- 2005 Benturan Peradaban: Sikap dan Perilaku Islamis Indonesia terhadap Amerika Serikat, Penerbit Nalar, Jakarta.

Nash, June (Ed.)

- 2005 Social Movement: an Anthropological Reader. Blackwell Publishing. Oxford

Romli, Mohamad Guntur

- 2007 Ustadz, Saya Sudah Di Surga. Penerbit Kata Kita. Jakarta,
- 2010 Muslim Feminis: Polemik Kemunduran dan Kebangkitan Islam. Freedom Institute. Jakarta.

Santoso

- 2005 Gelombang Kebebasan. Kantor Berita Radio KBR 68H. Jakarta.

Setyobudi, Imam dan Laksono, P.M.

- 2006 Analisis Wacana: Polemik Teks Menyegarkan Kembali Pemikiran Islam di Koran Kompas. Dalam Humanika 19(2), April: 163-173.

Situmorang, Saut

- 2009 Politik Sastra. Penerbit [SIC]. Yogyakarta

Saifuddin, Achmad F.

- 2005 Antropologi Kontemporer: Suatu Pengantar Kritis Mengenai Paradigma. Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media

Siregar, Liston P. (Ed)

- 2007 Di Bawah Ancaman Penyerangan: Kumpulan Wawancara dan Talkshow Pilar Demokrasi KBR68H. Penerbit: KBRH68H. Jakarta.

Sjafril, Akmal

- 2011 Islam Liberal 101. Indie Publishing. Jakarta

Stanley

- 2006 Laporan Pertanggungjawaban Kerja ISAI: Periode 2001-2006. Institut Studi Arus Informasi (ISAI). Jakarta.

Steele, Janet

- 2007 Wars Within: Pergulatan Tempo, Majalah Berita Sejak Zaman Orde Baru. Dian Rakyat. Jakarta.

Sudibyo, Agus

- 2009 Kebebasan Semu: Penjajahan Baru di Jagat Medi, Penerbit Buku Kompas, Jakarta

Tempo

- 1994 Buku Putih Tempo: Pembredelan Itu. Jakarta.
- 1995 Mengapa Kami Menggugat. Yayasan Alumni TEMPO. Jakarta.



Tsing, Anna Lowenhaupt

2005 Friction: An Ethnography of Global Connection. Princeton University Press. New Jersey.

Utami, Ayu

1998 Saman. Kalam dan KPG. Jakarta

2010 Manjali dan Cakrabirawa. KPG. Jakarta

THE DYNAMICS OF RECOGNITION OF THE RIGHTS OF INDIGENOUS PEOPLES IN TRAP OF COLONIAL LAW  
LEGACIES AND SOCIAL CHANGE

*R. Yando Zakaria*<sup>29</sup>

*Center of Ethnographic Study for the Rights of Indigenous Communities*

Although the Republic of Indonesia's constitution recognizes the existence of indigenous peoples and their original rights, what happened in the following period was precisely the denial and / or violation of the rights of indigenous peoples (Zakaria, 2000). The 1998 reforms seemed to bring the wind of change. That recognition is increasingly confirmed through Article 18B paragraph (2) and two other articles. After that, there were also 5 Decisions of the Constitutional Court which confirmed that recognition.

Even so, for example, the total area of customary forests that have been officially recognized has not yet reached 25,000 ha. In fact, the Indigenous Peoples Alliance of the Archipelago (AMAN) claims that there are at least 40 million ha. What happened?

So far there have been several studies that show that this has happened because of the weak commitment and institutional capacity of the existing policy implementers. Unlike the argument, this paper shows the main problem lies in the logic of law itself. The legal logic used is trapped in the logic of positivism in understanding customary law that growing and developing since the colonial period, so that it is unable to accommodate social changes that are necessarily faced by indigenous communities.

At the end of the article the author voiced the need for a breakthrough in building a new legal framework / logic that would be used to regulate the recognition of indigenous peoples' rights as mandated by the constitution. Mainly by using socio-anthropological understanding, so that the constitutional mandate can be fulfilled more optimally.

RELIGIOUS FREEDOM AND THE RESTRICTION TO IMPLY RELIGIOUS FREEDOM

*Yossa A.P Nainggolan*

*Ragam Institute*

Although religious freedom has been recognised in Indonesia, religious minority groups still struggle to practise their faith. Case studies reveal how religious minority groups experience

---

<sup>29</sup> Anthropologist, Founder and Researcher of the Center of Ethnographic Study for the Rights of Indigenous Communities/Pusat Kajian Etnografi Hak Komunitas Adat (PUSTAKA)



obstacles in expressing their religion. Meanwhile, the policies that regulate the freedom to carry out worship have been established and are enforced.

This paper will investigate the policy of the *Peraturan Bersama Menteri* (PBM) and analyse these through the lens of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) and its general comment No 22. Those documents delineate the requirements of human rights restriction, such as the restriction should be provided by law and are necessary: (a) For respect of the rights or reputations of others; (b) For the protection of national security or of public order, or of public health or morals.

This paper will show how the PBM are not in line with the requirements imposed on human rights restriction. As a result, there are a couple key issues within the policy design of PBM that pose a burden for religious minorities to regard to building houses of worship: the authority of the head of regency, the procedure of '90/60', and the role of *Forum Kerukunan Umat Beragama* (FKUB). Ultimately, these issues lead this study to encapsulate that the PBM should be rejected due to human rights violations.

#### CRIMINALIZATION OF AGRARIAN AND ENVIRONMENTAL MOVEMENT ACTIVIST IN THE POST NEW ORDER ERA

Suraya Afiff

Universitas Indonesia

In Indonesia, social activists often were victims of the state criminalization activities. The state apparatus, i.e. police or other enforcement officers, "manipulate the law" to target a specific opponent -- i.e. local leaders, members of civil-society organizations, or even academics --who were critical to the government projects or state policies. Using the perspective that crime as a social construct, legal anthropological studies emphasis on the fuzzy boundaries between crime and resistance. Those people who were identified as a criminal, by state, might be, in fact, an activist who was campaigning against the environmental destruction caused by the government sponsor corporate industries. This presentation focuses on the recent use of "communist" stigma as a way to criminalize these social activists. The national laws that ban all the use of attributes and symbols related to the Indonesian Communist Party (PKI) are still pretty much persist as policy even after Suharto's militaristic New Order was ousted in 1998. In the agrarian sector, the communist stigma was often used by the New Order regime to silence those who opposed the implementation of the state sponsor projects. With the change of political climate after 1998, the use of "communist" stigma to criminalize those who were involved in the social protests was no longer enjoyed major public support. Therefore, it is interesting to ask why under the Jokowi's administration that the stigma of communism was used by the enforcement officers as one of the strategies to criminalize Tumpang Pitu local activists who were protesting the activities of the mining companies in their village. This paper explores how the legacy of the 1960s New Order legacy of the "anti-communist witch hunt" and the oligarch interests in the mining project intersect in Tumang Pitu case. The re-emerging strategy of the state use of the communist labeling stigma to undermine grassroot activisms is an attempt to delegitimize the agrarian and environmental movements in Indonesia.

Keywords: Criminalization, Indonesia, stigma, social movement



## The Dynamic of the Interaction between the Modern Medical System and the Traditional Medical System: Finding a Way for Establishing a Harmonious Collaboration of the Two Systems for the Social Justice for the People

Coordinators: Meutia F. Hatta, Rhino Ariefiansyah & Dea Rifia Bella  
(Universitas Indonesia)

The rich traditional medical system of the Indonesian multicultural societies has been known for long since the ancient cultures. Meanwhile, the modern medical system was mostly introduced to Indonesia during the Dutch colonial period. The interaction of traditional and modern medical system in Indonesia is shown through the hierarchy of resorts in choosing curative practices based on people's cultural consideration in their living environments. Contemporarily, however, evidence of problems in achieving harmonious collaboration programs between the two medical system still occurs, such as false definition on medical concepts which previously non-existent, causing obstacles in implementing some essential health programs like vaccination. Some caused unsuccessful results in collaborating health care programs between both systems, in prevention, cure or rehabilitation aspects. What efforts have been made to eliminate false conception and practices derived from the misinterpretation on new ideas of outside cultural influences, due to the improper acceptance of rapid development of science, technology and digital communication. Equal information on new development approaches and methods of prevention, curing and rehabilitation between physical and mental health problems is also urgently needed, in response to the contemporary socio-cultural, political, economic activities and changes which increase situations full of violence, conflicts, injustice, and suppression towards the poor and powerless societies. There are also questions on whether the new health policies and regulations prove to cause more dissatisfaction for some people, rather than giving peaceful life, assurance and justice? We hope to have papers from scholars of different disciplines: anthropologists, sociologists, psychologists, medical doctors, psychiatrists, experts in social welfare and public administration, to provide their theories and opinions, for the improvement of the national health policies and implementation programs.

DUKUNS AND DOCTORS - FINDING WAYS OF WORKING TOGETHER

David Mitchell

Monash University

The new Governor of Bali Wayan Koster has announced he will set up kiosks in public hospitals to make traditional healing available there. This will not be easy since in Bali there is great diversity in the healers available where the word *balian* is used instead of the Indonesian *dukun* to identify their traditional healers. Balinese healers range from *balian usada* who study traditional palm-leaf texts to *balian taksu* who go into trance to access supernatural influences, to *balian manak* who assist women with birth, *balian uwud* who massage and manipulate for muscle and joint problems, and *balian tulang* who deal with fractures and dislocations - to name just a few of many categories.

One source of difficulty for Governor Koster will be managing the competing interests of the doctors and the dukuns. The formal health sector supported by the government also covers a





diverse group of healers. It includes physicians, surgeons, nurses, pharmacists, imaging specialists, laboratory scientists and public health managers - to name just a few of many categories. It is hard to see resources and funding from Indonesia's centrally controlled national health programs being diverted to support traditional healing methods so the Governor may find himself working with budgets controlled by Provincial and District governments.

The Governor is responding to a two-sector health care system which is paradoxical in many ways. Modern health care based on international medical science has been very successful in Indonesia and is supported by a well developed medical education and research system, yet in spite of this, traditional healing survives and flourishes and is still appreciated and well used in Bali. Similar paradoxes are apparent in the economics and politics of the two sectors, with the informal traditional health care sector operating without government funding, and organised more by custom than by government regulation.

The attitude of many Balinese doctors was set out by dr. A.A. Gde Muninjaya some years ago. While they believe that modern medicine achieves better results than traditional methods, they appreciate that traditional healers often have a better, more holistic approach, taking the patient's cultural background into full account and considering the whole family, not just the individual patient. While such considerations of quality of care are important, simple practical matters also play a major role. Many traditional healers consulted are highly accessible and inexpensive, live within walking distance of the patient's home, and being part of the same village community, they already understand the patient's circumstances and history. It is very easy to consult the traditional healer first, and then go to the modern health sector later if the problem is not resolved.

The two-sector health system can thus work in the interests of healing the sick in so far as they are complementary as well as being competitive. Complementarity is driven by individual patients and family decisions about where they seek help. Patients and families are usually quite pragmatic and practical in choosing between available traditional and medical healers, trying one and then another until the patient has recovered. This pragmatism combines with a strong cultural commitment to avoiding open competition and conflict, and families take responsibility for the choices they make. This creates a system operating without organised formal cooperation between the two sectors, and without letters of referral between the doctors and traditional healers.

My own experience working as an Indonesian government doctor for four years in West Sumba in Nusatenggara Timur and for one year in Bali provided me with many examples of how the two sectors worked together in complementary ways. The system does of course have problems as mistakes and tragedies occur in any complex system, but it was evident that the outcomes of having two complementary sectors were mostly favourable. I noticed that the nurses who worked in the hospitals often played useful roles in family decision-making since they were well informed about both health sectors. They could very discretely and diplomatically advise where the best dukuns and the best doctors could be found. In these ways the conference theme of "Uses and Abuses of Diversity" is reflected in a health system in which patients and families are able to maximise the uses and minimise the abuses of the diversity that they find in health care.

To further explore the topic, two examples can illustrate how traditional and modern sectors interact, one in the field of psychiatry and one in the field of orthopedic surgery.



I remember one evening in Bali when I was called to a house about 300 metres from the Mengwi Tani Health Centre where I was working in 1975. There I met a young unmarried woman who had been brought home from her work as a builder's labourer in a semi-conscious state. This could indicate a serious medical or neurological condition needing urgent hospital admission but the history from her family and gentle examination of her reflexes and conscious state revealed no signs of major neurological danger. By that time, I had learned, in Bali, how to recognise a trance state, which in Australia was a condition known only in the performances of hypnotists and practically never seen in a hospital or clinical context. Although she had at first been unresponsive and uncooperative, a gradual and gentle approach revealed that she could actually sustain a sitting position and then take a sip of water. I could then tell the family that I thought their daughter did not need an urgent and expensive hospital admission. She probably had a "Balinese illness" not a "hospital illness" and traditional healing was likely to be more effective and much cheaper in ensuring her full recovery. If she deteriorated or traditional treatment was ineffective then we would be standing by at the Health Centre for further involvement, and one of my nursing colleagues monitored her recovery at home.

While she would likely have recovered in hospital also, hospital admission can be more traumatising and prolonged than treatment in her own home by traditional rituals and healing methods. Trance states occur in Bali in a number of different forms and different circumstances, as described in detail by Suryani and Jensen in their book on this topic.

A second example comes from the island of Sumba in East Nusa Tenggara Province. It concerns the healing practice of a locally famous traditional bonesetter known as Pagadoso. This is not a personal name but a term effectively meaning "The Specialist". While I was visiting him a patient arrived unexpectedly, escorted by his family. The patient was a young man who had fractured his lower leg just above the ankle in a car accident 4 weeks earlier treated in the first instance by a nearby bonesetter. Although it was a compound fracture with an open wound where the skin had been torn over the fracture, the first bonesetter had applied a traditional herbal poultice and re-aligned the bones and applied a bamboo splint. This was a serious deviation from present day practice since an open wound is a sign that the family should take the patient directly to the hospital.

It was only after a week when pus began to seep from the wound that the family realised their mistake and took him to the hospital. There antibiotics and surgical cleaning of the wound had resolved the acute infection, but as soon as the patient was discharged home the family again wanted traditional treatment as well and took him straight to Pagadoso. He examined the fracture site and alignment carefully and added his own healing oil, but seemed satisfied with the work the hospital had done. His main contribution in this case was to conduct a shamanistic ritual, making contact with the supernatural world to beg protection and blessings. The family then left to return home, apparently satisfied. The supernatural protection may well have been what the family was seeking since I knew, and Pagadoso knew, that Sumbanese families often fear that a car accident and injury may have been caused by some ritual infringement or alternatively by black magic. However, these family anxieties were not openly discussed as far as I could discern. With luck I will be able to meet with the family again and uncover more of their story.

These examples instance some potential problems in a health system involving two separate sectors with different healing methods. Governor Koster will need great skill managing issues like these as he adds another layer to a system already providing a diverse and nuanced health service. He can be assured that his kiosks will be quickly checked out by the public. Patients who are helped will return in due course with offerings of thanks at the hospital's temple for Dewi Saraswati, the



goddess of healing, since all healers, modern and traditional, gain their skills through their dedication to learning the healing arts.

## CONCLUSIONS

The contemporary health system that has evolved in Indonesia allows for an informal sector of traditional healers to survive and flourish in the community alongside the formal system of modern medical care which the government regulates and subsidises. Although modern medicine has displaced traditional healing in many areas, the persistence of traditional practices suggests that the overall quality of care is being maximised by the coexistence and interaction of these two healing sectors.

The healing roles of traditional and modern healers are largely complementary as well as being somewhat competitive, as a result of the common family practice of choosing one system or the other according to the symptoms the patient displays.

Evaluation of this situation requires a multi-disciplinary approach engaging the skills of medical anthropologists together with the experience of clinicians in various medical specialties.

## RESUME

This paper reviews some important features of health care in Indonesia today, particularly the coexistence of modern and traditional healing systems, and the interactions between them. It seems that culturally-embedded traditions have their own advantages and successes which have allowed them to survive and flourish even while scientific medicine has been developing and delivering great advances in modern health care.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

A.A Gde Muninjaya in *Indonesian Medical Traditions, Bringing Together the Old and the New*, edited by David Mitchell, Monash University, 1982

Suryani, Luh Ketut and Jensen, Gordon D. *Trance and Possession in Bali*, Oxford University Press, New York, 1993.

Linda Connor, *Balinese Trance Seance*, an ethnographic film, Canberra

Leo van Bergen, Liesbeth Hesselink and Jan Pieter Verhave (eds) *The Medical Journal of the Dutch Indies 1852-1942, A Platform for Medical Research*, Indonesian Academy of Sciences, Jakarta, 2017

Pols, Hans, *Nurturing Indonesia, Medicine and Decolonisation in the Dutch East Indies*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2018.



MEDICAL PLURALISMS PRACTICE TO TREAT NON-COMMUNICABLE DISEASES IN RURAL AND SUB-URBAN  
VILLAGES OF WEST JAVA

*Erna Herawati*

*Department of Anthropology, Universitas Padjadjaran*

## BACKGROUND

Non-communicable disease (NCD) is a disease that is not directly transmissible from one human to another. The most common NCDs are cardiovascular diseases (like heart attacks and stroke), cancers, chronic respiratory diseases (such as chronic obstructive pulmonary disease and asthma) and diabetes mellitus. NCD is also known as chronic diseases and are the result of a combination of genetic, physiological, environmental and behaviours factors. The diseases disproportionately affect people in low- and middle-income countries where more than three quarters of global NCD deaths (World Health Organisation, 2018).

The prevalence of non-communicable diseases (NCDs) in Indonesia including in the West Java Province, is on the rise in recent years (Arsunan, 2012; Nur dan Warganegara, 2016; Raksanagara dan Raksanagara, 2016). Popular NCDs in Indonesia such as cancer, diabetes mellitus, stroke, cardiovascular diseases, and hypertension have caused morbidity and mortality among the majority of Indonesian. Finding the effective and affordable medicine to treat the NCDs has become the first priority of the sick and the family. They often use more than one forms of medication; biomedicine, folk-medicine, or other complementary and alternative medicine.

A quantitative study (based on secondary data from Indonesian Family Life Survey), found age, residential location, and health facility are strongly associated with people's tendency to use traditional medicine. People who are at older generation; who are living in rural areas where there are no health facilities are tend to use traditional medication compare to those who are at younger age; living in non-rural areas or places where health facilities are available (Jennifer and Saptutyningsih, 2015). People at older age usually suffer from chronic disease which requires long treatment. This lead them to choose treatment and medicine at low cost, including traditional medicines using medicinal plants.

A study in Central Java found that preference to traditional medicine strongly associated with cost. Most people prefer to traditional medicine because it is affordable than modern medicine (Triratnawati, 2010) and because it is easy to obtain (Purnama, 2016). Meanwhile, people tend to prefer modern medicine for disease which symptoms are visually and easily to be recognized (Setyoningsih and Artaria, 2016), such as influenza among children, bone fracture, or open wound. Meanwhile for supranatural diseases, people prefer to ask help from *dukun* (supranatural healer) (Ardani, 2013; Fanani and Dewi, 2014).

## OBJECTIVE

This study aimed at exploring and describing reasons of practicing medical pluralism to treat non-communicable diseases among the local residents of Desa Mekarsari, a rural highland village located at the tea plantation area of Bandung regency; and Desa Cipacing (sub-urban villeges), a sub-urban area located in lowland of Sumedang regency, West Java. This study focused on treatment for the most common disease(s) found at the research areas.



## METHOD

This study applied qualitative method in particular ethnography. Data collection techniques include in-depth interview and focus group discussions with local residents having family or self-experience of non-communicable diseases.

## FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

In the West Java, people differentiate diseases into two types: *panyawat enteng* (light/common disease) and *panyawat abot* (serious / severe disease) (Supardi and Notosiswoyo, 2012; Iskandar et al, 2003). In the research areas, people defined common disease refers to those can be easily treated by self-medication using *obat warung* (non-prescribed drugs), or home-made remedies made of medicinal plants growing at the home garden. Among this type of diseases are influenza, light fever, cough, light-headache. Serious disease refers to those cause severe effect to the sufferer and threatening the life; not easily treated; and need the help of health professional, herbal healer, supranatural healer, or *ajengan* (religious healer). Stroke, cardiovascular disease, cancer is among the serious diseases. Diseases that are known as related to supra-natural power, are diseases due to *parabun* (sorcery similar to voodoo). Supranatural diseases are considered as serious diseases.

This study found hypertensions and diabetes mellitus are the most common NCDs among local residents at the research areas. Hypertension has been known as *tensi* and diabetes mellitus known as *kencing manis* in local terms. They consider these two as diseases of elders and inherited disease; and it falls into medium level disease, except for diabetes mellitus where the sufferer has already bed-ridden.

People knew they are hypertensive or having high blood sugar when they were diagnosed by health practitioners. Usually, they visited health facilities when they suffer from severe symptoms such as headache (the most common symptoms of hypertension); or when they bed-ridden due to high-level of blood sugar. Local residents at the research areas apply ethno-medicine and biomedicine (modern medicine) all together to treat their diseases in order to to make their treatment more effective.

Hypertensive people in two research areas consume Amlodipine, a pharmaceutical drug for hypertension, many of them consume it years long on daily basis. They found it effective to control their blood pressure so they can do their routine activities. Furthermore, the drug is easy to obtain at the nearby drugstore at low prices (more or less 5000 rupiah per 10 tablets). They can also get it for free at village health post. However, hypertensive people tend to discontinue taking amlodipine for a certain period. They worry of the side effect of taking drugs for a long period. Whenever their hypertension symptoms disappear, they replace Amlodipine with herbal remedies such as by drinking water solution extracted from boiled avocado leaves or from *sintrong* (*Crassocephalum crepidioides*) leaves, or by drinking *cangkudu* (*Morinda citrifolia*) juice or celery juice.

People with Diabetes Mellitus depend on drugs prescribed by health practitioners. Most of them could not remember the name of prescribed drugs. Unlike hypertension, drugs for Diabetes Mellitus is not easy to obtained and cost higher. People with diabetes must visit health practitioner whenever they need the drugs. Thus, they prefer to use traditional medicine in order to reduce cost. Some traditional remedies that people use are water solution extracted from boiled leaves



and flowers of *kumis kucing* (*Orthosiphon aristatus*) or a glass of tea made of dry leaves of *ki pahit* (*Tithonia diversifolia*).

In some cases, people suffering from Hypertension or Diabetes Mellitus do not respond well to any medication designated for the disease; they bed-ridden, and enter the latest stage of their illness. The family usually relates the irresponsiveness of medication to super natural power or to misbehavior of the sick in the past. The family usually help the sick to do repentance for their possible mistake or sin the past. In this process, an *ajengan* (religious healer) would help the sick. In some other cases, people relate disease that is difficult to treat with sorcery. In order to treat supranatural disease, people visit *dukun* (supranatural healer for getting treatment).

In terms of knowledge and practice preservation on traditional remedies and herbal remedies, gender play important role. Women are the one to take care of the sick in the family and to prepare herbal remedies. They are also the one who usually cultivate medicinal plants in their home garden. While men, are less likely to take such role.

## CONCLUSION

There are reasons of using several types of medication: 1) effectiveness of the medicine (*manjur*) to treat their non-communicable diseases; 2) the affordability of the medicine (*murah*), and 3) the feasibility to obtain the medicine (*mudah*). They do not problematize about the source of the medicine, either from 'modern' or 'traditional' healer. People tend to choose medicine they know and belief is effective for NCD, no matter it is traditional or modern.

This study concluded that people in rural and sub-urban West Java value and belief in the effectiveness of both modern and traditional medicine. This medical pluralism practice demonstrates the dynamic practice of 'modern' and 'traditional' medicine in contemporary Indonesia which at the same time shows the harmonious collaboration between the two systems.

*Keywords: Medical Pluralism, Medicine, Non-Communicable Diseases*

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Ardani, I. (2013). Eksistensi Dukun dalam Era Dokter Spesialis. *Jurnal Lakon*, 1(2), 27-32.
- Arsunan, A. A. (2012). Epidemiologi Penyakit Tidak Menular. *Buletin Jendela Data Dan Informasi Kesehatan*. <https://doi.org/ISSN 2088-270X>.
- Fanani, S; Dewi, T. K. (2014). Health belief model pada pasien pengobatan alternatif supranatural dengan bantuan dukun. *Jurnal psikologi klinis dan kesehatan mental*, 3(1), 54-59.
- Jennifer, H., Saptutyingsih, E. (2015). Preferensi Individu Terhadap Pengobatan Tradisional Di Indonesia. *Jurnal Ekonomi & Studi Pembangunan*, 16(1), 26-41.
- Iskandar, J., Suryana, Y., Ramlan, A. (2003). Studi etnobotani pemanfaatan jenis-jenis tumbuhan sebagai bahan obat tradisional oleh masyarakat di Desa Cibunar Kecamatan Rancakalong Kabupaten Sumedang-Jawa Barat. *BIOTIKA Jurnal Ilmiah Biologi*, 2(1).
- Nur, N. N., & Warganegara, E. (2016). Faktor Risiko Perilaku Penyakit Tidak Menular. *Medical Journal of Lampung University (MAJORITY)*.





- Purnama, Y. (2016). Kearifan Lokal Masyarakat Jatigede dalam Pengobatan Tradisional. *Patanjala: Jurnal Penelitian Sejarah dan Budaya*, 8(1), 69-84.
- Raksanagara, A., Raksanagara, A. (2016). Perilaku Hidup bersih dan Sehat sebagai Determinan Kesehatan yang Penting pada tatanan Rumah Tangga di Kota Bandung *Jurnal Sistem Kesehatan*. <https://doi.org/10.24198/jsk.v1i1.10340>
- Setyoningsih, A., Artaria, M. D. (2016). Pemilihan penyembuhan penyakit melalui pengobatan tradisional non medis atau medis. *Masyarakat, Kebudayaan dan Politik*, 29(1), 44-56.
- Supardi, S., Notosiswoyo, M. (2012). Pengobatan sendiri sakit kepala, demam, batuk dan pilek pada masyarakat di Desa Ciwalen, Kecamatan Warungcondang, Kabupaten Cianjur, Jawa Barat. *Pharmaceutical Sciences and Research (PSR)*, 2(3), 134-144.
- Triratnawati, A. (2010). Pengobatan tradisional, upaya meminimalkan biaya kesehatan masyarakat desa di Jawa. *Jurnal Manajemen Pelayanan Kesehatan*, 13(02).
- World Health Organisation. 2018. Non Communicable Disease. <https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/noncommunicable-diseases>

THE DYNAMICS OF ABORTION TREATMENT AS AN EFFORT TO HARMONIZATION BETWEEN THE MODERN  
MEDICAL SYSTEM AND THE TRADITIONAL MEDICAL SYSTEM

*Hanifatul Salwa*

*Department of Anthropology, Universitas Gadjah Mada*

*This paper explores the phenomenon of abortion in women constructed based on social culture and media technology. This paper seeks to show that anthropology is a discipline aimed at understanding and dealing with cultural differences and critical analysis of health issues in traditional medical and traditional medical frames. Meanwhile, knowledge, prevention and healing are still cultural heritage that varies from culture to culture, from time to time. In this social phenomenon of abortion in Yogyakarta, a health issue is embedded, both medically modern and one of them is recorded through media technology, as well as medically traditional, which is still very closely related to the culture of the local community.*

*Through this article, the author wants to explain how the treatment of abortion can be a bridge between traditional medical and traditional medical roles, especially in the Yogyakarta region. Apart from the stigma of the local community regarding abortion actions carried out by women of various professional backgrounds and various ages, this paper tries to eliminate the conceptions and practices that are not appropriate which come from the misinterpretation of the development of science, technology and media. Until then, the phenomenon of abortion represented at least the narrative and context, while opening space to the concept of women's body health. That way, collaboration between aspects of prevention, healing and rehabilitation between physical and mental health problems for abortion women can be the strength of the medical system offered. The approach in this paper is adjusted to (con)text the narrative delivered. The phenomenon of abortion which is part of women's reproductive health eventually emerged with its optimism as an effort to harmonize modern medical dynamics with traditional medical in a broader context, namely in Indonesia.*



*Keywords: Abortion, modern medical, traditional medical*

## INTRODUCTION

Briefly, medical systems are “patterns of social institutions and cultural traditions that involve intentional behavior to improve health” (Dunn, 1976: 135). What is the function of the medical system? The answer is clear, to restore patient health (Foster and Anderson, 1986: 52). The medical system is formed from the overall health knowledge, beliefs, skills, and practices of community members that cover all clinical and non-clinical activities, as well as formal and informal institutions in the health sector. The emergence of various human groups creates new adaptation strategies in managing health and illness problems (Foster and Anderson, 1986: 44-45).

As is the case with many rural and urban communities, there is promiscuity (*samenleven*) until an unwanted pregnancy (KTD) occurs which requires women to choose between continuing a pregnancy or aborting a fetus. According to Bennet (2001), Indonesian teens prefer to do sexuality spontaneously rather than openly discussed. Although the freedom of sex between men and women has existed for a long time, there is not even a rule that prohibits anyone from dealing with the desired partner, which is called by Koentjaraningrat (1958: 70) as a *promisquitet*. In that case, 22% of students in Yogyakarta agreed to having sex outside of marriage, 76% had read books and magazines about sex, and 44% often watched blue films (Mudjijono, 2005: 15).

Unfortunately, many people do not understand the Medical Standard Operating Procedure. In addition, the closed access to medical and open abortion services results in many unsafe abortions, such as by drinking certain concoctions or being massaged to ‘dukun beranak’ (Ikhsanudin, 2005: 3). Based on data from the Indonesian Family Planning Association (PKBI) Yogyakarta and the Women's Health Foundation (YKP) Jakarta during June to December 2002, in one month there were an average of 100 abortion cases for women aged 15-35 years (Kompas, 10 October 2003). This number does not include cases of abortion by dukun or self-abortion.

According to a WHO report on maternal deaths worldwide, maternal mortality rates related to abortion annually reached 4.7% -13.2%. Meanwhile, Indonesia is known as a country with the highest maternal mortality rate in Southeast Asia. Abortion is estimated to contribute 11.1% to the maternal mortality rate. In fact, according to the Director of Community Health of the Ministry of Health, reaching 50% (Kedaulatan Rakyat, 3 January 2005). Unsafe abortion contributes between 35-50% of maternal mortality rates in Indonesia. Until 2005, the number of abortions in Indonesia reached 2.3 million per year (Ikhsanudin, 2005: 3).

The number is quite large, and it can be estimated that most women seek their own way out or ask for help from a dukun with all the risks. This is further compounded by the discovery of over-the-counter medicines that can abort the fetus only in a short time without pain and without being sedated first. The number of women who died as a result of surreptitious surrender will increase the high maternal mortality rate in Indonesia. However, knowledge, prevention, and treatment of reproductive health are very important in supporting the proper application of the medical system of abortion. Therefore, through this study, the author will briefly explain how a phenomenon of abortion can be explained as a form of effort to apply harmonization between modern medical systems and traditional medical systems.



## OBJECTIVE

This paper aims to realize a policy paper on health policy in overcoming social problems in rural and urban communities –in this case the problem of handling abortion in women who experience unwanted pregnancies. Basically, this paper appears as an effort to awaken all parties to achieve improved public health, while controlling the process and power in the journey of the medical system in Indonesia. As Foucault (2002) said that the medical world in fact applies as a medical regime that perpetuates power due to lack of knowledge. In this context, the discourse on reproductive health (sexuality) is often associated with the discourse of power. The manifestation is that sexuality is also used as an indicator of morality. Through the flexibility of the mind above, this paper intends to open a perspective on the phenomenon of abortion in women from various professional and age groups who are far more open, and explore into a variety of more flexible perspectives. This is certainly in order to generate new knowledge about the reality of the health of people who continue to move and change dynamically without stopping, especially those built in the medical framework. This paper is here so that we do not become a medical blind society and then feel the impact of morality from negligence, including neglect in knowledge of reproductive health until the occurrence of abortion.

## DESCRIPTION

Starting from the word “hysteria” which means the womb, before when there were no doctors, medical science had not yet developed, the affairs of women giving birth were always synonymous with screams. Finally, until now the word “hysterical” is always identified with a scream (Abdullah, 2006: 225-226). Basically, women who undergo abortion are the same as women who give birth to babies normally. This is in line with the reality that abortion is still a hysteria in today's community phenomena.

Abortion with the official term *pregnancy termination* is the deliberate termination of pregnancy (*abortus provocatus*) for a reason. This is clearly different from miscarriages, which means that pregnancy stops without being intended (*spontaneous abortus*), or not because of anyone's decision. Miscarriage is more of a natural event, while abortion or abortion is carried out by one's will (Burns, et.al., 2009: 314). In fact, married women find it easier to get a medical recommendation for a “therapeutic abortion” (*abortus provocatus-artificialis therapicus*) when pregnancy threatens the health of the mother. In contrast to abortion done intentionally (*abortus provocatus criminalis*) without the basis of medical indications to end the pregnancy that is not desired from the results of *samenleven*. There are also expressions that specifically emphasize abortion surgery procedures which are referred to as ‘*non-anesthetic surgery*’ (Wolf, 1997: 189).

The practice of abortion, according to George Devereux, is a universal phenomenon that occurs in modern and ancient societies (Shaw, 2010). Magnus Hirschfeld, former director of the Institute for Sexual Research in Berlin, said, “abortion is carried out by competent specialists in hospitals with proper prevention, and does not involve deadly dangers confirmed in the law.” Conversely, what makes abortion risk serious for women is the way to do it under existing conditions. The lack of ability of experts in performing abortions, as well as bad conditions when they operate causes many accidents which are fatal (Beauvoir, 2016: 302-303). At present gynecological knowledge, surgery is not dangerous if carried out by specialists with sterile techniques and anesthesia (Beauvoir, 2016: 306).



## FINDINGS

In an article written by Hull et al. (1993), before 1965, the practice of abortion was carried out using traditional and medical methods. The traditional method in question is by massaging or hitting a woman's abdomen, drinking herbal concoctions or herbs (for example, 'jamu telat bulan' or 'jamu peluntur'), inserting foreign objects such as leaves, stems, iron, needles, or other objects into the vagina to provoke uterine contractions, or even by injecting vinegar into the uterus and injecting it into the bladder. In addition, according to Mudjijono (2005: 87) there is also what is known as *ngruntuhke* (destroying the life of the fetus), *plethet* (pressed and sorted out), *pijat*, and *sogok* (by inserting the papaya tree midrib into the cervix to force the fetus out). There is also a standard treatment that is by drinking a concentrated soap mixture, then running for a quarter of an hour. Treatment like this often kills mothers when trying to eliminate a baby's life (Beauvoir, 2016: 308).

Meanwhile, medically the method is widening the cervix and wrapping the uterine wall with curettage (Beauvoir, 2016: 309), suctioning with *cannula*, regulating menstruation using a *vacuum aspirator*, dilating and evacuation (D and E), *saline injection*, Prostaglandin, Misoprostol (Cytotex, Invitec, Gastrul, Chromalux), Mifepristone (RU-486 or 'Pil Prancis'), and Methotrexate (Hull et al., 1993; Burns, et.al., 2009: 322). The medical method carried out before 1965 was carried out by doctors who opened clinics and offered abortion services. However, more people are now shifting from modern medical systems to alternative forms of medical care to meet their clinical and psychological needs (Foster and Anderson, 1986: 47).

Even though there are many treatments for abortion, it turns out that Gerdts and Hudaya (2016) found that many women are looking for ways to get abortion services. In this context, helplines or aid telephone operators have an important role in providing information to women who want abortion. Likewise, advertisements for 'telat haid' and 'telat bulan' are widespread in the public areas in Yogyakarta. Gerdts and Hudaya (2016) also show that women prefer to do medical abortion compared to surgical abortion. The medical abortion is meant by using Misoprostol and/or Mifepristone. Medical abortion procedures can be done at home or in a place where women feel comfortable (*home abortion*). Jelinska and Yanow (2018) say that abortion pills create a universal opportunity to get access to safe abortion without having to pay attention to applicable laws.

Unfortunately, the use of drugs offered through such advertisements ignores the prescriptions of expert doctors. Not only that, these medicines do not even fit the actual designation. Obstetrics and Gynecology Expert in RSUP Dr. Sardjito, Dr. Risanto Siswosudarmo, SpOG (K) (2017), said that the types of drugs commonly circulating for unsafe abortion are actually ulcer drugs, gastric ulcer drugs, or to treat wounds in the intestine, some of which are actually anti-drug cancer, like the Methotrexate (Tribune Jogja, 2017).

Some anti-abortion drugs given to women have shown an increase in uterine cancer for more than two decades. So that it can be said that drugs are actually a bad result of medical progress. The consequence of the anti-abortion drugs is the 'dehumanization of treatment'. Then how do people evaluate if medical technology has entered the modern world with a variety of deep humanitarian problems, which have caused an increase in medical costs and caused serious ethical and legal topics? (Foster and Anderson, 1986: 165-167).



Some community subjects describe the happiness and suffering of a woman during childbirth is natural; but if he describes the case of abortion, he is accused of wallowing in sin and showing inappropriate humanity (Beauvoir, 2016: 302). Therefore, other unofficial medical techniques are public confession, which reflects the extent to which a woman's actions are considered dangerous, not only for her but also for the community. Besides being an emotional cleansing and guilt, confession can be part of the treatment system (Torrey, 1972: 64-66).

## CONCLUSION

Qualitative research on the medical system in health anthropology finally resulted in thick description so as to be able to uncover the context of the socio-cultural processes that occur in a society. In its development there has been acculturation between modern medical systems and traditional medical systems that present harmonization between the two, especially in the treatment method of healing or treatment. Some traditional medical therapies have adopted modern medical therapies.

Abortion has its own special medical procedures, so sociologically, there are two choices: given stigma or following the rules. The social aspect becomes very important because in the selection of decisions, norms and values have a very decisive role. In other words, women –in this context women who are going to have an abortion, are pressured by these two things which are construction in society. An adequate support system eventually becomes very important for women in this vulnerable position.

The large number of deaths and injuries was experienced by women but it is not known to be due to the treatment of abortion that was carried out secretly and improperly according to medical rules. In short, medical systems cannot be understood solely from their own meanings, both the meaning of modern medical systems and the meaning of traditional medical systems. Only if both are seen as part of the overall pattern of culture, can the medical system be understood and be harmonious with each other in supporting public health.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Abdullah, Irwan. 2006. *Konstruksi dan Reproduksi Kebudayaan*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Anonim. 2003. "Kehamilan Remaja." *Kompas*. 10 October.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2005. "Aborsi Remaja Masalah Moral atau Sosial?" *Kedaulatan Rakyat*. 3 January.
- Beauvoir, Simone de. 2016. *Second Sex: Kehidupan Perempuan*. Yogyakarta: Narasi & Pustaka Prometheus.
- Bennet, Linda Rae. 2001. "Single Women's Experiences of Premarital Pregnancy and Induced Abortion in Lombok, Eastern Indonesia." *Reproductive Health Matters*, 9(17): 37-43.
- Burns, A. August (et.al.). 2009. *Bila Perempuan Tidak Ada Dokter*. Yogyakarta: INSIST Press.
- Dunn, Frederick L. 1976. "Traditional Asian Medicine and Cosmopolitan Medicine as Adaptive Systems", in C. Leslie (ed.), *Asian Medical Systems: A Comparative Study*, pp. 133-158. Berkeley: University of California Press.



- Foster, George M. and Barbara G. Anderson. 1986. *Medical Anthropology*. John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Foucault, Michel. 2002. *Power/Knowledge: Wacana Kuasa/Pengetahuan*. Yogyakarta: Benteng Budaya.
- Gerdt, Caitlin. and Inna Hudaya. 2016. "Quality of Care in a Safe-Abortion Hotline in Indonesia: Beyond Harm Reduction." *American Journal of Public Health*, 106(11).
- Hull, Terence H., Sarsanto W. Sarwono, and Ninuk Widyantoro. 1993. "Induced Abortion in Indonesia." *Studies in Family Planning*, 24(4): 241-51.
- Ikhsanudin, M. 2005. *Jika Ulama Mengkaji Aborsi: Antara Muhammadiyah dan NU*. Yogyakarta: Kerja sama Ford Foundation dengan Pusat Studi Kependudukan dan Kebijakan Universitas Gadjah Mada.
- Jelinska, K. and Yanow, S. 2018. "Putting Abortion Pills into Women's Hands: Realizing the Full Potential of Medical Abortion." *Contraception*, 97(2): 86-89.
- Koentjaraningrat. 1958. "Metode-Metode Antropologi", in *Penyelidikan Masyarakat dan Kebudayaan di Indonesia*. Jakarta: Universitas Indonesia.
- Mudjijono. 2005. *Sarkem: Reproduksi Sosial Pelacuran*. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press.
- Shaw, D. 2010. "Abortion and Human Rights." *Best Practice & Research Clinical Obstetrics & Gynaecology*, 24(5): 633-646.
- Torrey, E.F. 1972. *The Mind Game: Witchdoctors and Psychiatrists*. New York: Emerson Hall.
- Wibowo, Yosep H. 2017. "Liputan Khusus Obat Telat Haid: Praktik Penjualan Mengarah Aborsi Ilegal." *Tribun Jogja*, 27 Maret 2017.
- Wolf, Naomi. 1997. "Gegar Gender, Kekuasaan Perempuan Menjelang Abad 21". Omi Intan Naomi (terj.), *Fire with Fire, The New Female Power and How it Will Change the 21<sup>st</sup> Century* (1993). Yogyakarta: Pustaka Semesta Press.

SANDO PEA: BETWEEN TRADITION AND HEALTH CHALLENGE AMONG KALUPPINI INDIGENOUS PEOPLE

Nurbaya

Nutrition Department, Poltekkes Kemenkes Mamuju

Wahyu Chandra

Department of Anthropology, Universitas Hasanuddin/Jalin Institute

*Sando pea is a term for traditional birth attendant among Kaluppini indigenous people in South Sulawesi, Indonesia. The presence of traditional birth attendants is considered as one of the factors mother's delaying in accessing health facilities that impact the high maternal mortality rate especially in a developing country like Indonesia. The study aimed to explore and to describe the role of traditional birth attendants among Kaluppini indigenous people and health challenges faced by this community to access health facilities. By using a qualitative approach, data were collected through in-depth interviews and focus group discussions by using an interview guideline. A total of 6 sando peas were purposefully selected in the study area and 67 mothers were involved*





*as informants. Sando pea plays a crucial role both in the indigenous health system particularly in maternal-child health care and customary rituals. Mothers prefer delivery at home and assisted by sando pea not only because they follow their traditional beliefs. They feel shame delivering at health facilities, difficult access to health facility and a lacking available midwife make sando pea more accessible and become the only one choice. The role of sando pea was still dominant among Kaluppini people both in assisting mothers' delivery. A good understanding of the complexities of the traditional culture is the first strategy to engage mothers and to raise their awareness on giving birth healthy and safe. Next, a comprehensive strategy is needed to increase the accessibility, availability, and affordability of maternal health services among indigenous people.*

*Keywords: Indigenous people; traditional birth attendant; maternal health, qualitative.*

## BACKGROUND

One of the big homework of the Indonesia government in term of health issue is to reduce the maternal mortality rate (MMR) which is still high based on the World Health Organization (WHO) on 2013. WHO reported that Indonesia managed to reduce the MMR by only 56% from the targeted of 75% under the MDGs. This progress is considerably slower compared to other South East Asian countries.<sup>1</sup>

The Indonesian government through the Regulation of Minister of Health No. 97 of 2014 regulates health services for women, starting from before pregnancy, during pregnancy, delivery, and postpartum period, and contraceptive services, until sexual health services. The government is responsible for these services well implemented as they should. The services aim to ensure that every mother can give birth to a healthy and good quality generation. This regulation is a form of government commitment in an effort to reduce maternal and newborn death lift.<sup>2</sup>

Indonesian government identified the utilization of skilled birth care such midwife as one of the strategies as being crucial for saving the lives of pregnant women and as an indicator for progress in the reduction of maternal mortality. Although the government regulate that all pregnant mother must deliver at health facilities and assisted by skilled midwife but women especially in rural and indigenous community continue to deliver at home with the assistance of traditional birth attendants (TBAs).<sup>3</sup>

Basic Health Survey (Riset Kesehatan Dasar) 2018 stated that there is about 10.9% of mothers was assisted by TBA during delivery.<sup>4</sup> Some regions, such as in Maluku, West and Southeast Sulawesi, even have up to three times higher percentage in utilizing TBA compared to the national level. Mothers, especially in indigenous community and in rural areas, still prefer delivery at home and assisted by TBA.<sup>5</sup> Studies found that difficult access and financial limitation are some of the major barriers that prevent mothers to access and utilize the trained midwife and public health service center.<sup>6</sup>

In general, traditional healers or traditional birth attendants, are people who are trusted by the community to traditionally examine their health problems. WHO defined TBA as a traditional, independent healer with non-formal training who provide care during pregnancy, childbirth and the postnatal period.<sup>7</sup> They have detailed knowledge of community norms and practice it in a traditional way.



Kaluppini is one of the indigenous communities in Enrekang District that is still hold strongly in carrying out their tradition, including their belief on TBA. Kaluppini people had their own tradition and belief related to rituals and traditional practices in relation to mother and child health. Within a year there are 13 mandatory rituals that must be performed in a certain order. They also have ritual called *Pangewaran* which is the highest tradition in this community that celebrated every 8 years.<sup>8</sup> There are also rituals related to mother and children that reflect the process of human life and related to the role of the TBA.

TBA in Kaluppini people is well known as *sando pea* plays an important role in carrying out some rituals. The role of TBA is strong among the Indonesian people, especially among indigenous community who still cling to beliefs and customs that have been passed from generation to generation. The primary aim of this research is to know the role of *sando pea* among Kaluppini people in relation to maternal health and health challenge faced by this indigenous community.

## METHODS

A qualitative explorative design was used to explore the role of *sando pea* and the health challenges faced by Kaluppini indigenous people. This study was carried out in the Kaluppini customary area so-called *Tanah Onko Sa'pulo Tallu* located in Enrekang district, South Sulawesi, Indonesia. This customary area covers five villages namely Kaluppini, Lembang, Rossoan, Tobalu and Tokkonan.

This indigenous community was selected due to Kaluppini people are well known as one of the oldest indigenous community in South Sulawesi and still perform the customary law, tradition as well as rituals for years. This study received ethical approval from Health Research Ethics Committee of Health Polytechnic Makassar.

This is a qualitative study involving semi-structured in-depth interviews (IDIs) and FGDs. FGDs were only conducted among mothers. Participation was voluntary and written consent was obtained from each participant. Interviews were conducted after providing brief information about the purpose of the study and after obtaining informed consent for participant.

The confidentiality of the participants' data in this research was maintained by not including their real names. We strived to recruit a maximum variation sample to include diverse experiences in the study while ensuring that the maximum sample size is determined by saturation.

The participants in this study were traditional birth attendants (TBAs) and mothers who live in Kaluppini area during data collection. They have to have a self-identification as Kaluppini people to ensure that data collected was a genuine information from Kaluppini people. Participants were recruited using purposive and snowball sampling strategies. The study was conducted from January to May 2018.

Preliminary analysis was carried out during the data collection process at the research location aimed to summarize and ensure that all the information needed had been fulfilled and as an evaluation material for subsequent interviews. All interviews were audio-recorded and transcribed verbatim. Data analysis used *Dedoose*, a web-based application for qualitative analysis. Emerging themes were identified, and the data were organized by theme, concept, and category. These themes formed the basis for further data synthesis and inference.



## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A total of 33 interviews and 6 FGDs were conducted involving a total of 81 participants. The 33 interviews were 5 *sando peas* and 28 mothers. We had six FGDs with equally distributed among the various participant characteristics. Informants of mothers aged between 15-49 years. While *sando peas* reported being aged between 60 and 90 years with 20–50 years of experience. Studies in Nepal found that TBAs were between 35 and 60 years old. They have worked as TBAs for 5 to 45 years with an average of 15 years.<sup>7</sup>

In general those who become TBAs are elderly women and aged more than 50 years old.<sup>9</sup> Unlike the TBA in Kaluppini indigenous community, most of them were elderly men. Four out of five *sando peas* interviewed were male. There was only one female *sando pea* interviewed. This is because the male *sando pea* in her village has died and there is no regeneration anymore.



Figure 1. Interviewing one of the Male *Sando Peas* in Kaluppini

TBAs are not only acting as those who helps the delivery and child care process. They have a more sacred role such as leading certain rituals, giving wise advices to the community in relations between humans, nature and the Creator.<sup>10</sup> TBAs involve in some customary rituals, especially rituals related to mother and children. Most of the indigenous peoples perform rituals and live their life based on their customary laws and traditional beliefs.<sup>11</sup> Kaluppini people had two kinds of rituals i.e. *Rombu tuka* and *Rombu solo*. *Rombu tuka* is all rituals that related to life and happiness and conversely *Rombu solo* is all ritual that related death or sadness. Some of these rituals conducted annually or accidentally particularly for *Rombu solo* that related to death.

Although *sando peas* do not include in the customary leadership structure of Kaluppini so-called as *Tau Appa'*<sup>8</sup> but they involve in some rituals such as *ma'cera ba'tan*, *ma'paka'tan*, and



*ma'cera*.<sup>12</sup> These three rituals classified as *Rombu tuka*. This is because *sando pea*s are recognized as informal leaders who have respected power and authority in society.<sup>13</sup>

*"The ritual of ma'cera 'ba'tang aimed to pray for the salvation of the children in the womb. We invite the sando pea and reading pray for us" (Mother, 38 years old, IDI)*

*Ma'cera ba'tan* is a ritual that held when pregnant mother had reached 7 or 8 months of gestational age. They held it at the pregnant mother's house. In this moment, the pregnant mother would speak to the *sando pea* and ask for his willingness to assisting the pregnant mother to childbirth later.

*"We hold a ritual of ma'cera 'ba'tang at the 7 or 8 months of pregnancy. In this moment I and mother invited sando pea and asked for his willingness to become my birth attendant and help me during childbirth." (Mother, 41 years old, IDI)*

After receiving willingness, the *sando pea* usually begins to massage the womb of the pregnant woman in a traditional way. This process is called *manguru'*. In *manguru'* process, the *sando pea* checked the position of the fetus in mother's womb and to ensure the fetus is in normal position. If he found that the fetus position was not proper, he would message the belly of the mother. He would do *manguru'* for up to three times or at least *sando pea* was sure that the fetus position had been right.

*"I go to sando pea to massage my belly because my mother said that fetus's position in my womb is not appropriate" (Mother, 25 years old, FGD)*

*"If the position of the fetus is good, I usually do manguru' only once. But if the fetus' position is reversed, sometimes up to 7 times until the fetus' position is good. I usually start doing manguru' at 6 or 7 months." (Sando pea, male, 55 years old)*

If *sando pea* found that the fetus position was proper, he would not do anything to the mother. *Sando pea* only gives *wai pejappi* (water blown with reading a prayer by *sando pea*) to pregnant women. Kaluppini people believed this *wai pejappi* aimed to make easier the labor process later. In the tradition of the Kendari community in Southeast Sulawesi, they also recognize the term *jampe-jampe* whose purpose is the same as that of *wei pejappi*. The goal is to provide positive suggestions so that mothers can give birth smoothly.<sup>13</sup> TBA are believed to be able to provide concoctions such as *wai pejappi* or *jampe-jampe*, prayers, and traditional rituals that can provide sense of security and comfort during the delivery process.<sup>14</sup> Some of the traditional practices identified in this study are similar to those in other cultures such in Nigeria, TBAs do womb massage and gave some herbal drinks to pregnant women.<sup>15</sup>

Studies mentioned that the implementation of rituals is very important in traditional health aspects. The ritual or ceremony related to health is a manifestation of the continuity of health and balance between humans, culture and nature to indigenous people. The existence of cultural continuity through the implementation of rituals has a positive impact on the health and welfare of indigenous peoples.<sup>16</sup> The traditional medicine practices in the community is carried out side by side with the implementation of rituals as an integrated health promotion system.<sup>17</sup> These cultural beliefs and attitudes then influence women's reproductive health preferences and practice. This has become a tradition passed down from generation to generation.

Kaluppini people believed that *sando pea* has skills in helping mothers giving birth and treat various diseases in traditional ways. The skills to treat and assist the birth process are obtained



from oral traditions for generations and practical learning from parents to children or from other close family members.<sup>14</sup> Some are even obtained from dreams.<sup>10</sup> They work voluntarily, as explained by Suparlan that those who work as traditional birth attendants work voluntarily and fulfil moral responsibility for the knowledge and skills they have. Not to seek income.<sup>13</sup>

In the Kaluppini indigenous people, not all of those who recognize as *sando pea* will provide services to all pregnant women. There is a *sando pea* that only helps their children or closest relatives for delivery. There is also a *sando pea* who serves all mothers who come to ask for their help. They will help mothers from the period of pregnancy until delivery and afterwards.

Although the government has issued a regulation on maternal care that all pregnant mother must give birth at health facilities and assisted by trained health workers. Homebirth was a common among Kaluppini people. Available evidence showed that despite the availability of primary health care centers in the settings used for the study, most mothers patronize the *sando pea* for delivery.

Mothers of Kaluppini indigenous people still have a strong belief in the *sando pea* rather than childbearing at *pustu* or hospital. They felt more save and convenient to homebirth. As majority mothers stated that they preferred homebirth and help by *sando pea*. Even though midwife still assisted together with the TBA during delivering but mother felt more save and more relax when childbirth at home and assisted by the TBA. This then becomes a challenge for health workers to engage the community in safe reproductive health care efforts for mothers.

*"I gave birth at home because it was safer. It is difficult to childbirth at pustu because it is far. There are no vehicles to use. Moreover, there are also sando pea who help me give birth. I felt safer." (Mother, 35 years old, IDI)*

This prior study is in line with a study conducted in West Sumatra that traditional hereditary beliefs are the dominant factors that influence mothers to prefer dukun as their birth attendants.<sup>18</sup> In some studies explained that pregnant women feel more comfortable being helped by a TBA because the he gives quality time to pregnant women.<sup>19</sup>

This study also revealed that indigenous mothers felt more confident delivering at home because they considered home is a privet room. They felt ashamed childbirth at *pustu* that they consider as a public space where many people will know that they are going to delivery.

*"We feel ashamed of giving birth in Pustu. Many people will know that we are going to give birth. We feel ashamed if many to see us. At home, there are only mother and sando pea. And it is closed too, so not many know." (Mother, 35 years old, FGD)*

Other study explained that mother and their families preferred to give birth at home because close to their family in the round houses, the place that houses heirlooms, corn harvest and symbols of fertility, and is the domain of women where they feel comfort. TBA and members of family were often present during the labor and provides positive support and assisted the mother in the post-partum time and prepared special food for the mother.<sup>20</sup> Postpartum care was also carried out including washing clothes from maternal puerperal blood and bathing the baby.<sup>13</sup>

Besides of traditional reason, the far distance and difficult access to reach *Pustu* (Puskesmas Pembantu/Community Health Sub-center) as another reason why mothers and their families decided to child birth at home and assisted by the *sando pea*.

*"I bear my baby at home. Only my family and sando who help me. It was night and it was difficult to go the Pustu. We don't have a vehicle. And no midwife was available at the time. (Mother, 28 years old, FGD)*





There were only two *Pustus* within the customary area, but it was difficult to access due to damaged roads and the location was remote. Therefore, it became barrier to access health service among Kaluppini people. And the fact in the field is that the number of TBA is far more numerous and is always available at all times and the costs are relatively cheaper compared to births assisted by midwives.<sup>7</sup> In addition, the age of midwives who are relatively young are often considered to be inexperienced so that they are difficult in gaining public trust.<sup>14</sup> This is exacerbated by the absence of transportation and the distance traveled to the *puskesmas* making it more difficult for indigenous people to access appropriate health services.<sup>3</sup>

In Kaluppini, even though, mothers preferred childbirth at home but midwives also existed to help and accompany the *sando pea* to help mother childbirth. Midwives and *sando pea* work together to save the mother during childbirth. But this study revealed that most mothers were helped by the *sando pea* rather than assisted by a midwife.

*"Sando pea assisted me childbirth at home because the midwife came one day after I gave birth"*  
(Mother, food insecure, IDI)

Another role of *sando pea* is cutting the umbilical cord. Cutting the umbilical cord is a process that is not less important than the process of assisting the delivery process. *Sando pea* will cut the baby's umbilical cord soon after the baby born and *sando pea* do it after making sure that mother is in good condition. This is to ensure that the mother does not experience bleeding.

*"When the child is born, I first must confirm the condition of the mother. If she is good then I immediately cut the baby's umbilical cord using turmeric and bilah"* (Sando pea, female, IDI)

The process of cutting the baby's umbilical cord also has its own procedure. *Sando pea* will look carefully at the markers and the umbilical cord line that must be cut. The process of cutting the umbilical cord uses 3 main tools, namely turmeric, *owan*, and *bilah* (blade of split bamboo). Newborn care practices were similar among TBAs in Asian countries.<sup>21</sup> Cord care was similar among TBAs. It was believed that cutting the cord before the delivery of the placenta would cause the cord to get stuck inside the mother and *'hurt or kill her'*. Few TBAs applied mustard seed oil to the umbilicus immediately after cutting; most applied oil to the umbilicus during full-body oil massage after bathing.<sup>7</sup>

However, despite these positive attributes to the *sando pea*, it is probable that some routine TBA practices are potentially harmful to pregnant mother and the bay, especially womb massage, and cutting the baby's umbilical cord with inadequate personal, tools and environmental hygiene. Massaging the womb could cause uterine rupture, hemorrhage, still birth, fetal distress, rupture of placenta and even maternal death.<sup>22</sup>

And when labor complications occur at home, arranging referral and transport to the nearest health facility is a challenging that will delay mothers to receive emergency care and even potentially cause death.<sup>23</sup> There are multiple factors which can act as barriers to accessing emergency maternal care that classified into "Three Delays" i.e. (1) delay in the decision to seek care, (2) delays in arrival at a health facility; and (3) delays in the provision of adequate emergency care. And study resulted that the delay in the decision to seek care is determined by socio-cultural factors, and the delay in reaching a health facility is strongly influenced by economic and geographic factors. The same situation also faced by the Kaluppini people that need to take action.

Traditional health practices among Kaluppini indigenous people are so deeply rooted in their local culture. The results of this study have implications for health promotion and reproductive health





policy for the indigenous people. Therefore, health policy maker should consider traditional, cultural beliefs and practices as the important factors that healthcare practitioners should focus on.

#### CONCLUSION

TBAs played a major role in assisting in childbirth. Belief, customs and the role of sando pea in the indigenous Kaluppini community greatly influence the practice of caring mother and children. This is a challenge for health workers to take innovative and more effective approaches to promoting health and nutrition while respecting cultural customs in indigenous peoples. They should acknowledge the traditional cultural and consider the role of TBA and the sensitivity of women's preferences, in order to effectively engage women in safe reproductive health care.

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENT

This research was fully funded by Neys-van Hoogstraten Foundation, Netherlands. The researchers thanked to all informants and Kaluppini people in general for their good cooperation and warm welcome in their customary area.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. Cameron L, Cornwell K. *Understanding the Causes of Maternal Mortality in Indonesia.*; 2015.
2. Kementerian Kesehatan RI. PMK No. 97 tentang Pelayanan Kesehatan Masa Sebelum Hamil, Masa Hamil, Persalinan, dan Masa Sesudah Melahirkan, Penyelenggaraan Pelayanan Kontrasepsi, serta Pelayanan Kesehatan Seksual. 2014.
3. Titaley CR, Hunter CL, Dibley MJ, Heywood P. Why do some women still prefer traditional birth attendants and home delivery?: a qualitative study on delivery care services in West Java Province, Indonesia. *BMC Pregnancy Childbirth*. 2010;10(43).
4. Kemenkes RI. Laporan Nasional RISKESDAS 2018. *Riskesdas 2018*. 2018.
5. Pyone T, Adaji S, Madaj B, Woldetsadik T, Van Den Broek N. Changing the role of the traditional birth attendant in Somaliland. *Int J Gynecol Obstet*. 2014;127(1):41-46.
6. Ramli N, Purwita E. Study of maternal mortality risk factor 2016 in Aceh Province. *Int J Soc Sci Humanit Invent*. 2018;5(06):4776-4780.
7. Thatte N, Mullany LC, Khatri SK, Katz J, Tielsch JM, Darmstadt GL. Traditional birth attendants in rural Nepal: knowledge, attitudes, and practices about maternal and newborn health. *Glob Public Health*. 2010;4(6):1-16.
8. Chandra W. Komunitas Adat Kaluppini: Menjaga Alam, Melestarikan Tradisi. In: *BaKTI News*. Vol April-Ma. ; 2016:5.
9. Crivelli V, Hautecouer J, Hutchinson C, Llamas A, Stephens C. Improving indigenous maternal and child health. 2013.
10. Tumanggor R. *Gerbang Agama-Agama Nusantara*. Depok: Komunitas Bambu; 2017.
11. Nurbaya. Violation of Women's Rights, Food Insecurity, and The Future of Indigenous Peoples. In: *Best Essays of 2016*. Vol 1. 1st ed. Jakarta: ISRSF - Indonesian Scholarship and



Research Support Foundation; 2017:21-30.

12. Nurbaya. Eksplorasi praktik pemberian prelakteal pada Bayi di masyarakat adat Kaluppini di Sulawesi Selatan. In: *Widyakarya Nasional Pangan Dan Gizi (WNPNG) XI*. Vol 1. ; 2018:229-236.
13. Anggorodi R. Dukun bayi dalam persalinan oleh masyarakat Indonesia. *Makara Kesehatan*. 2009;13(1):9-14.
14. Tim BASICS. *Panduan Penerapan Praktik Cerdas Kemitraan Bidang Dukun Bayi Dan Kader Posyandu*. Jakarta: Department of Foreign Affairs, Trade and Development (DFATD); 2014.
15. John ME, Esienmoh EE, Nsemo AD, Yagba J. Traditional reproductive health practices among women in South-South Nigeria. *Nurs Prim Care*. 2019;1(2):1-6.
16. Auger MD. Cultural continuity as a determinant of indigenous peoples' health : a metasyntesis of qualitative research in Canada and the United States. *Int Indig Policy J*. 2016;7(4).
17. Koithan M, Farrell C. Indigenous native American Healing traditions. 2010;6(6):477-478.
18. Agus Y, Horiuchi S, Porter SE. Rural Indonesia women's traditional beliefs about antenatal care. *BMC Res Notes*. 2012;5(1):1. BMC Research Notes.
19. Agus Y, Horiuchi S. Factors influencing the use of antenatal care in rural West Sumatra , Indonesia. *BMC Pregnancy Childbirth*. 2012;12(9).
20. Belton S, Myers B, Ngana FR. Maternal deaths in eastern Indonesia : 20 years and still walking : an ethnographic study. *BMC Pregnancy Childbirth*. 2014;14(39).
21. Withers M, Kharazmi N, Lim E. Traditional beliefs and practices in pregnancy, childbirth and postpartum: A review of the evidence from Asian countries. *Midwifery*. 2018;56(March 2017):158-170.
22. Bayou N, Gacho YH. Utilization of clean and safe delivery service package of health services extension program and associated factors in rural Kebeles of Kafa Zone, Southwest Ethiopia. *Ethiop J Health Sci*. 2013;23(2):79-89.
23. Byrne A, Caulfield T, Onyo P, et al. Community and provider perceptions of traditional and skilled birth attendants providing maternal health care for pastoralist communities in Kenya: A qualitative study. *BMC Pregnancy Childbirth*. 2016;16(1):1-12.

TRADITIONAL KNOWLEDGE ON HEALTH AND FULFILLMENT OF REPRODUCTION HEALTH RIGHTS  
OF BAWEAN WOMEN  
*Pinky Saptandari*  
*Universitas Airlangga*

Traditional knowledge is a nation's intangible cultural wealth that supports human life cycle and sustainability, including that of fulfillment of health rights. Fulfillment of healthy life is inseparable aspect of traditional knowledge and cultural practices which also covers beliefs, taboos, and myths on health including woman's reproduction health. This paper was developed from the research in 2016 on "Values and Cultural Practices on Woman's Health Fulfillment" conducted at the Districts of Tambak and Sangkapura, Bawean, two regions in Gresik Regency, East Java, Indonesia. The



research employed qualitative method using in-depth interview and focus group discussion involving productive age female informants, village midwives and 'dukun bayi' (traditional midwives). The paper was intended to describe traditional knowledge on reproduction health and fulfillment of health rights within the Bawean women amidst the presence of developing modern healthcare service. Traditional knowledge system on reproduction health is a part of culture perceived by Bawean people that can be categorized as naturalistic medical system, with variety of beliefs, myths and taboos suggest the existence of traditional knowledge on health including Bawean woman's life cycle. Bawean women tend to refer to traditional knowledge and practice for fulfillment of their rights for reproduction health. Various beliefs, myths and taboos related to menstruation, pregnancy, delivery and post-delivery strongly affect their reasoning pattern and health behavior. They prefer to resort to the traditional midwives locally known as *Balian* for assistance in delivery process especially that of post-delivery medical issues, which also explains that not all beliefs, myths and taboos are considered as a form of cultural restriction unfavorable to health.

*Keywords: traditional knowledge, naturalistic medical system, rights for women's reproduction health.*

AN ETHNOGRAPHIC STUDY ON MATERNAL & NEWBORN HEALTH IN DAYAK SIANG-MURUNG COMMUNITY:  
SKILLED MIDWIVES' WORKING SPIRIT OF 'TIRA TANGKA BALANG' AND THEIR COLLABORATION  
WITH TRADITIONAL MIDWIVES

*Rachmalina Soerachman, Setia Pranata, Syarifah Nuraini*  
*National Institute of Health Research and Development*

*M. Gullit Agung.W*  
*Freelancer Anthropologist*

*Salahudin Muhidin*  
*Macquarie University*

## BACKGROUND

This ethnographic study focuses on the Dayak Siang-Murung community in their efforts to reach a better health development, especially with maternal and neonatal health. Considering different perceptions about skilled and traditional midwives within the Dayak Siang-Murung community, this study attempts to identify challenges and possible solutions to reach the health development goal in this region. The Maternal Mortality Rate (MMR) and Infant Mortality Rate (IMR) in Indonesia are still quite high compared to other ASEAN countries. The 2007 Indonesian Demographic Survey (IDHS) provides data that MMR is 228 per 100,000 live births and IMR is 34 per 1,000 live births. Based on the 2000 MDGs (Millennium Development Goal) agreement, a decline is expected in MMR to 102 per 100,000 live births and IMR to 23 per 1,000 live births by year 2015. Based on the results of the 2007 Public Health Achievement Index (PHAI) using 20 health indicators, ratings were obtained for each district according to its health. Of the 20 health indicators, there are 8 indicators that are closely related to the health of mothers and children or toddlers. From this PHAI ranking, clear distinctions are seen between districts with good PHAI and districts with poor PHAI that need intervention to improve. Departing from this PHAI ranking, this maternal and child health study was conducted. The government is expected to take action in the form of policies or appropriate interventions for regions with low PHAI ratings, especially those concerning maternal and child health as the most important indicators in the PHAI. One of the



districts focused in this research is Murung Raya Regency, which is one of the districts in Central Kalimantan Province. Murung Raya Regency, based on the 2007 PHAI ranking results, is at no. 423 of the total 440 districts in Indonesia.

Based Murung Raya Health Service profile in 2011, Murung Raya District's main goal of health efforts is directed at reducing the three indicators that describe the level of community health, namely infant mortality, under-five mortality, and maternal mortality. These three indicators show a number that is still quite high. In 2011, there were 43 infant deaths from 2,560 live births (16.8 per 1,000 live births) in Murung Raya. This figure is lower than in 2010, which was 17.5 per 1,000 live births. While for under-five mortality, in 2011 there were 44 under-five deaths or 17.3 per 1,000 live births, compared to 2010, which was 19.4 per 1,000 live births. The under-five mortality rate is the number of infant deaths and deaths of children under five in 2011, consisting of 43 infant deaths and 1 child mortality. Data on maternal mortality rates at the Murung Raya District Health Office are obtained from reports of hospitals and health centers. This data shows the number of maternal deaths as many as 6 cases of maternal deaths from all births in 2011 or by 23.4 per 100,000 KH. Looking at these figures, research is needed to look at the factors that cause high mortality rates in infants, toddlers, and mothers, especially the local cultural factors. The purpose of this study is to look at cultural images related to maternal and child health. The district was also chosen because it was considered to have a very distinctive culture and could still be said to be original compared to other villages in the work area of the Saripoi Health Center. The majority of the villagers are Dayak Siang-Murung tribes who still embrace the Kaharingan religion and hold on to traditional values.

#### METHOD

An ethnographic design was conducted in a village (Dirung Bakung) and interviewed several informants, including skilled birth attendant (*bidan kampung*), traditional village midwives (*bidan desa*) and village leaders. The respondents were asked their perceptions and experiences in dealing with the issues and practices of maternal and new-born health in the village. Collected information from those respondents were thematically and contextually analysed. This study uses several ways or techniques to collect data for accuracy. The way to get a general picture of a subject of research is by observing participation. In this case, observation and participation is carried out by being directly involved with all daily activities carried out by the community in Dirung Bakung Village, especially behavior related to maternal and child health. Direct observation by living together with the community was carried out for 70 days. Participatory observation is carried out by following all the daily activities of the community, both daily activities at home, work activities, activities related to health in general, maternal, and child health – to the rituals and ceremonies being carried out in the village. By making observations, researchers believe in the reality that is in the field and the data obtained (Moleong, 2005: 174-175).

To dig deeper information from informants, the researchers conducted interviews using in-depth interviewing method, namely the process of question and answer face-to-face between researchers and informants. In this way, in addition to getting information, researchers also get an understanding of the lives of informants, as well as experiences or circumstances such as what the informants themselves say (Bogdan and Taylor, 1984: 74). In-depth interviews were conducted with informants, including pregnant mothers, mothers who had babies and toddlers, mothers who were undergoing postpartum period, husbands, teenagers, community leaders, religious leaders, and health workers. The selection of informants was adjusted to the type or



question of the researcher. In addition to collecting primary data, researchers also used secondary data. The data are in the form of district profile, general health data, data on KIA from the Murung Raya District Health Office, maternal and child health data from Saripoi District Health Center and from the Auxiliary Health Center, demographic data from BPS, books, literature, and searches from various information published in electronic and print media.

## RESULTS

Findings from this study show that the majority of Dayak Siang–Murung society are still seeking health cares (especially relating to maternal and newborn health care) from the traditional healers, both local traditional midwife as well as traditional birth attendant (*dukun beranak*), rather than from the skilled village midwife. This is more or less influenced by the mothers' trust in health cares as well as the selection of health workers in their village. Having the working spirit of '*Tira Tangka Balang*' (Commit to Work and Reach the Ultimate Goals), fortunately, such situation has not discouraged the skilled midwives to reach the better health goal. Moreover, the Puskesmas in the village has encouraged the skilled midwives to approach the traditional midwives. It has been done by having a close relationship or collaboration between those two, especially during the delivery process or during home visit to a pregnant mother. Both skilled midwives and local traditional midwives are continuing to collaborate for the sake of advancing the health status of the Dayak Siang–Murung society in Dirung-Bakung Village.

### *The concept of sickness, disease and healing beliefs in the Dirung Bakung community.*

In the point of view of the people of Dirung Bakung Village, a person is said to be seriously ill if he has a disease such as tuberculosis or a disease caused by *pulih*. *Pulih* is a kind of poison given by someone to another person through food or drink. Pain caused by *pulih* can only be cured by certain people, namely people who have or keep the *pulih* itself. People affected by *pulih* usually recover not by using medical drugs, but traditional medicine. There are some restrictions that should not be violated when someone is in the healing process because they are recovering. If the taboo is violated, the pain caused by *pulih* will recur.

For the people of Dirung Bakung there are two kinds of diseases, namely magical diseases and pathological diseases. Pathological diseases are diseases caused by viruses or diseases in the form of wounds. Magical diseases, which occur due to *pali* violation and due to interference from evil spirits, can even lead to death. Diseases that is considered mild in the view of the people of Dirung Bakung Village are cough, flu, and malaria. These diseases are classified as minor diseases because many people who choose to buy drugs in a shop to treat them, or even just left to recover by themselves. If the illness becomes more severe, they go to the nearest health center or to the hospital in Murung Raya.

There are a number of alternative cures carried out by the people of Dirung Bakung Village. One alternative is to use traditional medicine formulated by themselves or ask for help to *basi* by carrying out the Balian ritual. Balian rituals are rituals of treatment performed by *basi*. Diseases that are cured by Balian methods are usually believed to be diseases caused by occult things – due to witchcraft or or *kepuhunan*. However, it does not rule out the possibility that Balian rituals will be carried out to cure pathologic diseases, such as malaria, typhoid, and *pehe kongge* (myalgia). *Pehe kongge* can be classified as a medical disease, but it can also be classified as a magical disease caused by *lio* (the soul of the dead). According to their belief, if *lio* brings the soul or spirit of someone who is still alive in the world, that person will experience different kinds of pain, one of



them is *pehe konge*. Therefore, healing *pehe konge* can only be done by Balian rituals through the services of a *basi*. *Basi* is a person who is trusted by the community to have supernatural abilities because they can communicate with spirits that are considered good.

Aside from *basi*, the people of Dirung Bakung Village also has other traditional healers, namely village midwives. The village midwife is not only responsible for assisting a mother in labor, but also helps maintain and restore the health of the mother and child during the process of pregnancy and postpartum, and helps maintain the health of the child after birth. The village midwife does her job using traditional medicine and performs several rituals which are believed to be able to maintain the health of the mother from the start of labor to delivery. A village midwife's skill is usually obtained based on heredity. As a traditional healer, *basi* and village midwives may work together in carrying out their duties. For example, when a mother is about to give birth, the local community believes that there will be powers or demons that can interfere with the delivery process. The village midwife and the family take the initiative to use *basi* services to drive away the evil spirits. The people believe that evil spirits that interfere with childbirth cause diseases that can complicate a delivery process which may not be done by the village midwife.

#### *Pregnancy Period for Dirung Bakung People*

Pregnant women in Dirung Bakung Village have enough awareness to get their pregnancies checked into a supporting clinic in the village. But unfortunately, Pembung Dirung Bakung clinic is rather difficult to reach by some people because the distance is quite far. This auxiliary health center is only easily accessible by residents located near the clinic. For pregnant women who are rather far away, they have difficulty checking their pregnancy at the village health center. Coupled with the poor road conditions, it made them a little reluctant to do prenatal follow-up in Dirung Bakung clinic. The prenatal follow-ups conducted by the village midwife were carried out together with the *posyandu* activities for children once a month at the clinic. However, it is also possible to check outside the scheduled date, because midwives are now beginning to make effort to do home visits.

Despite doing prenatal follow-up with village midwives in the clinic, many still believe in village midwives. The precise number of village midwives in Dirung Bakung Village is not known, but it is known that the number village midwives exceeds the number of clinic midwives and nurses. Village midwives are also evenly distributed all over Dirung Bakung area, making them the initial choice for prenatal follow-up.

Age maturity and experiences in assisting childbirth caused the community to continue referring to village midwives as an option in conducting examinations during pregnancy – even in finding out whether a mother is pregnant or not. The village midwife is even considered capable of knowing the position of the baby just by holding the mother's stomach without using any tool. They can also do massage to restore the mispositioned baby. Village midwives are also considered able to serve these mothers at any time. Services provided by village midwives, namely in the form of body massage can be done whenever they want. In addition, mothers are more satisfied in follow-ups with the village midwife, because of the body massage given – rather than only taking blood boosting medicine, a treatment given by clinic midwives. Fee is also their main reason for checking the pregnancy to the village midwives, who rarely charge fees for pregnant women who want a check-up or a massage.





The distance, transportation, and weather factors were the reasons mothers choose not to have their pregnancies checked into the sub-district health center or hospital in the city. The travel time they have to travel to reach the sub-district health center or hospital requires approximately 1 to 2 hours. High rainfall makes the road condition often impassable. In addition, most pregnant women feel they do not need to have a pregnancy checked up to the hospital. According to them, they will do a pregnancy check up at the hospital if they really feel very sick or are referred by the village midwife because they are deemed to need further examination. As long as they feel that their pregnancy is good, or if the illness can still be handled by the village midwife or *basi*, visiting the hospital is deemed unnecessary. However, there are pregnant women who are encouraged to have their pregnancies checked by a midwife or even go to the hospital because they have bad experiences during their first pregnancy. As stated by the following informant "J":

"I feel obliged (to check my health) due to fear. Previously, I did not get my pregnancy checked in the clinic. My child was died when he was born, said the village midwife, indeed my child had died before it was born. I am afraid this will happen again. "

However, there are also some pregnant women who check their pregnancy to both the village midwife and the clinic midwife. They state that each has their own skills that can help them maintain their health during pregnancy that one or the other do not have. Village midwives with their ability to massage mothers and availability to provide services are the main reason for customer satisfaction. While clinic midwives, through the medical drugs they provide, can help maintain the health of pregnant women that they do not get if they only check their pregnancy at the village midwife. This is as illustrated by the following informant "D":

"Yes, of course it is different between village midwives and *Mama Eki*. Village midwives give massages, but *Mama Eki* gives medicine. I'm satisfied with both services. "

In some cases, not only one village midwife is called to assist in the delivery process, but it can also be two people. The reason people are still using the services of village midwives is their psychological closeness with the village midwife. The adjacent houses and the close relationship bonds make them feel more comfortable with the village midwife. In addition, village midwives are mostly elders and therefore well-respected by the people in the village.

#### *Delivery Period in Dirung Bakung Community*

In Dirung Bakung community, the traditional labor process is directly led by the village midwife. If rupture of membrane is found, known as *putit saran danum*, the village midwife will sit in front of the birth canal. The seat used by the village midwife is made of wood, measuring forty to sixty centimeters with a height of about twenty centimeters. During that time, the mother was led by the village midwife to push. The two feet of the village midwife press onto the perineum to prevent the perineal tear.

During the delivery process, the village midwife has already collaborated with healthcare officers, by having understood the sterility of the delivery equipment and the correct labor process. This village midwife usually calls a clinic midwife/other health officer to assist a labor. Then, the clinic midwife will help deliver the baby and conduct Dirung Bakung usual traditions. According to some village midwives, so far they have often deliver their own labor without assistance from the clinic midwife. They feel that their ability to help mothers in childbirth is enough. However, there are



times when they are no longer able to continue the labor process, so they usually ask for help from clinic midwives. This is also reinforced by the following statement from a clinic midwife:

"If we are called, we usually do it, but we're often called only when the labor gets hard, when the village midwife is no longer able. If it's normal labor, we won't even be called from the start."

Based on an interview with one of the Head of Clinic in Dirung Bakung Village, the clinic had basically given an appeal to the clinic midwife to approach the village midwife. This relationship approach is carried out so that later in the labor process, if a laboring woman calls the village midwife, the village midwife can participate in inviting the clinic midwife. This cooperation program was already running in the Saripoi Sub-District Health Center and several auxiliary health centers under the Saripoi Health Center, but unfortunately, the collaboration program between these midwives has not worked yet in Dirung Bakung village.

## DISCUSSION

The Dayak Siang-Murung community dominantly seeking health services of traditional healers, both village midwives and *basi*, especially related to maternal and child health. This is influenced by the mothers' trust in village midwives and the presence of health workers in this village. Based on the results of interviews with mother informants (starting from mothers who are in pregnancy, mothers after childbirth, and mothers who have babies or toddlers) the following important information can be obtained:

1. Based on their abilities, health services are considered to be sufficient in fulfilling their health efforts. During pregnancy, the mothers have believed that going to the village midwife or to the clinic for a check-up is important in maintaining their pregnancy.
2. During delivery, the clinic midwife and village midwife or *basi* are also considered 'already capable' and 'trusted' in helping the process. However, the selection of labor by village midwives still dominates because most mothers state that village midwives have more experience than clinic midwives. This is an advantage of traditional healers compared to village midwives.
3. Based on informants' interviews, there has been dissatisfaction towards health officers, the clinic midwives, in the local clinic. The informants stated that they were only limited to getting a pregnancy check-up without being given a detailed explanation. The village is lacking in clinic midwives – which led to short sessions during check-ups. Mothers were given Maternal & Child Health (MCH) handbook but were not educated in using them. The 'lack of explanation' also happened during their children's immunization. The mothers considered the clinic midwife or nurse uninformative about the purpose and after effects of immunization. Consequently, post-immunization fever is considered negatively by mothers.
4. One reason for their dissatisfaction with the services of local health clinic in this village is the presence of health workers. They complained that health workers were often not available (in the village) so that when they needed health services, they could not be fulfilled. Poor road conditions, frequent rains, and difficult transportation reduce their chances of going to a hospital in Puruk Cahu to get health services. Automatically, they prefer to remain in the village and go to traditional healers (village midwives or *basi*). Likewise, during the delivery process, several informants stated their desire to give birth with the help of the village midwife, but because of the absence of the clinic midwife. The family who helped select the labor services usually runs to the village midwife, because



they are always available. Families sometimes do not want to make an effort to go to clinic to pick up something (in this case clinic midwife) that is uncertain. They immediately chose to pick up the village midwife.

## CONCLUSION

1. The Dayak Siang-Murung tribe in Dirung Bakung Village, the subject of this study showed that their culture indeed became one of the factors that determine the degree of public health. Based on field data, it turns out that in addition to the cultural factors themselves, there are two other factors that influence the shaping of MCH health seeking behavior, namely natural, geographical, and health facility factors.
2. Traditional healers, namely village midwives and *basi* compared to health workers, are chosen as their go-to health services. This is due to their 'health and disease concept' which relates to the presence of spirits. Both are considered to have the ability to provide protection by spells, installation of amulets, or through certain rituals that they do.
3. In addition to the reasons above, village midwives are still chosen to help deliveries because they have a more intimate relationship with the mothers compared to the clinic midwife. The community also felt that giving birth to a village midwife was cheaper and payment could be delayed. There is still dissatisfaction with the services of local clinic services and health workers.

Basically, the community already understood the importance of maintaining health, especially concerning MCH. The most influential factor in shaping their behavior is the health knowledge system they trust. This system is related to the their 'health and disease concept', including in maternal and child health, and the search for help from the Village Midwife or Clinic Midwife/Health Officer.

DISTURBED BY GHOSTS: BEHIND THE EXPLANATIONS AND NARRATIVES ON ONE'S CONTINUAL ENCOUNTER WITH SUPERNATURAL BEINGS

*Ratna A. Fabrian*  
*Universitas Indonesia*

In Jakarta, stories of people experiencing ghosts are not uncommon nor peculiar. A number of people have recounted their experiences seeing a ghost on one occasion. Some even claim they constantly see and sense ghosts, while a few also assert they are often disturbed by ghosts. Seeing ghosts in eerie places is thought to be normal and expected. Having the ability to know and feel the existence of ghosts is a gift, a given sixth sense. Meanwhile, being disturbed repeatedly by ghosts is regarded as a bad luck, or as one possible consequence of having a sixth sense. Those who are repeatedly disturbed by supernatural beings share their responses on their supernatural experiences that vary from a person to another. They narrate their paranormal incidents as a spooky encounter, a thrilling event, or an ordinary occurrence. Furthermore, they believe their sensitivity to supernatural beings is either a heredity from their forefathers or a curse from other persons who detest them. Therefore, their methods to prevent further supernatural disturbances also vary depending on their interpretation. However, there is a similarity in their stories; they have endured significant painful experiences before becoming susceptible to ghost disturbances. This paper retells the narratives on ghost disturbances of four individuals from different backgrounds and statuses who live in Jakarta. It focuses on their life histories as well as their emic



belief on supernatural beings. From their narratives, it is evident that their intriguing ghost stories are essentially a sign of something more than a mere supernatural phenomenon.

*Keywords: supernatural experiences, painful experiences*

BEHIND THE SECRET OF “BUNGKUS DAUN TIGA JARI”:  
ETHNOGRAPHY RESEARCH IN IRARUTU COMMUNITY, WEST PAPUA  
*Setia Pranata*  
*National Institute of Health Research and Development*

Indonesia’s health development shows its stagnancy towards their achieving goal. Government’s effort to improve universal health coverage remains far from expectations. Statistics data indicates high rates for some indicators such as: maternal mortality, infant mortality, and underfive stunting. By this, such a sector determining health as socio-cultural has not been observed and studied yet.

This socio-cultural aspect becomes a focus for National Institute of Health Research and Development to conduct a specific study named Health Ethnography Study. This study has developed in order to understand the societal values, beliefs and the practices related with health problems. The setting was originated from Indonesian Ethnics Encyclopaedia (Melalota, 1995), which described that Indonesia consists of 500 ethnics (Iema). In addition, Community Health Development Index is included. After all, some ethnics were to set priorities to be observed.

One of the ethnics was Irarutu located in Kaimana, West Papua. Information on Irarutu was out of reach. Most information is derived from internet sources as data. The data reported Kaimana was one out of seven huge ethnics in West Papua. Based on the uniqueness and specific problems which potential for the region, as a researcher we are interested in the unique sex behavior among Papuans, which called “wrapping” phenomenon. This was closely related to reproductive health. By Ethnography method, this study was conducted to obtain information about the Irarutu sexual behavior related with the *bungkus*

The local Irarutu perceived *bungkus* as a taboo. By conducting rapport, we known that *bungkus* is the traditional technology to enlarge penis by using leaves which Papuans known as *daun tiga jari*, is a local name for the plant which has 3 leaves on the stalk. This vines are common in Irarutu.

The leaves are used as an herb. There are many ways to wrap penis. First, curry leaf surface and than wrap up. Second, pounded until shatter and wrap with cloth. Third, squeeze the leaf and affixed at apart of genital organ. Those are usually practiced by local Irarutu.

The efficacy of the *daun tiga jari* herb is not figment of imagination. This is well observed as no more myth that the herb may produce the extended size of penis. Local Irarutu believed the bigger male sexual organ correlated to a concept “power” of a male sex. A man sex must be expressed powerful and manly. This expression is represented by utilising *daun tiga jari* herb.

The effect of wrapping is hot around the penis. If the local misuse the herb, the organ will be scaid and may cause inflammation and infection. They are often delayed referring their infection to health workers that may damage the physical and functions of their male sexual organ. The risk is straight to individual health.



Another risk is come from Kaimana's local development. The government then broadly develop and build Kaimana as economic zone by connecting one area to another that cause a urbanisation phenomenon Nowadays, Kaimana is massively facilitated by such entertainment spot as: bar and lounge, cafe, karaoke, restaurant, and localisation. The growing Kaimana comes into great changes of local, especially sexual habit. They became so expressive with their habit that made them vulnerable. From a conversation to a commercial sexual worker, she confessed that her client loved to play with different sex partners. She often served client with "huge size... small ones... wrapped." This vulnerability was also described in increasing trend of adolescent intercourse as well as frequencies of marriage by accident.

A major concern on sex behavior growing in Iratutu was the effect of extending size towards domestic violence. A story told a wife let his husband to explore his sexual desire towards another. In addition, another was a wife escaped out as an impotency to fulfill husband's need. Informant uttered that intercourses were basically began by a force.

Permissive sexual behaviour stereotype towards free sex has most likely correlated to the concept of "power" or "strong" of a male. Culture made males in West Papua an open-expressive towards their sexual desire. Iratutu showed its similarity. Male is the subject so that free sex was growing rapidly. This shaped a culture that male could freely do their sexual activity without any permission to his legal partner of life.

Extending size is a free. However, the local must obey the instruction and treat it carefully as well. If they unfollow the order, having intercourse to a woman with HIV/AIDS, a risk for the transmission is inevitable. Overall, this case was well reported on Kaimana's government. Government realised the risk of HIV/AIDS. They even socialised this by conducting health promotion such as: posters, flyers, and balihos. The spots were roads, hospitals, offices and health centres. Another way was distributing condoms to all commercial sex workers around 22 sites. Peer educators and social workers were provided to assist HIV/AIDS program.

In conclusion, I would like to say that the local Iratutu have a strong believe that sex behaviour is such a privacy. It must be in line by the rules of tribe and religion. However, patriarchy dominates. To show the hegemony, male usually express their desire by "bungkus". This behaviour was started from teenages. Unsafe "bungkus" and sexual intercourse may harm to their reproductive health as well as HIV/AIDS transmission. After all, government have difficulties to control this phenomenon.

Based on fields finding, I would like to recommendations for *bungkus* phenomena. First, all authorities in a Kaimana district such as: government, public and religion figures as "three stones in a stove" conduct intervention so that their people are safe and far from sexual transmitted disease. Male become a focus of intervention. Second, social engineering should be implemented by empowering communities to find, analyse and solve their problems. Third, the *daun tiga jari* should be intensively explored. Ministry of Health has to analyse the potency in terms traditional medicine. The recommendations are needed to solve Kaimana's health problems. The collaborations among government, universities, and NGO must be intertwined. Action is keyword to make a successful program.



PROMOTION AND PREVENTION TB WITH COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN MUARO BUNGO,  
JAMBI, INDONESIA

*Sipin Putra*

*Universitas Kristen Indonesia*

*Rachmalina Soerachman Prasodjo*

*National Institute of Health Research and Development*

TB is still one of the deadliest infectious diseases in the world. The study of TB prevalence in Indonesia in 2013-2014 found the prevalence of TB for all types and ages per 100,000 population = 660 (95% CI: 523-813) estimated to have 1,600,000 (95% CI: 1,300,000 - 2,000,000) people with TB in Indonesia 1,000,000 occurrences of TB per year (Ministry of Health, 2014). The optimal procedure in TB control efforts is quite complicated; starting from seeking treatment, diagnosis of TB suspects by doctors, diagnostic tests, confirmation and finally treatment to completion. The accuracy of the results has an influence on the epidemiology of TB transmission in the community. The Stop TB Initiative is whose strategy to eradicate TB that has been promoted since 1998 with regard to the relationship communities. TB surveillance is still a health problem. This study aims to empower local communities to promote TB in their area. Transfer of knowledge and skills by training local communities in Jambi quite successfully. Through their local leaders stop TB promotion through gym, recitation, discussion and arts activities. The local community participated and implemented the stop TB promotion because in Jambi was the center of TB. They have started to maintain personal hygiene and control of community health services.

*Keywords: TB, Community, Participation, knowledge*

THREE SPIRIT PERMEATES THE BALIAN

*Sri Murni*

*Department of Anthropology, Universitas Indonesia*

Trance spirit is part of the Balian Hirek ritual procession. Balian hirek is a ritual of the Dayak Ngaju people, who adhere to the Kaharingan belief system, intended to ask for ancestral blessings. A Balian will be possessed by spirits summoned through mantra recitations and offerings. This paper describes the ritual procession of hospitalization of incurable patients, children who go abroad, and children who have just entered school. The research was conducted in Sai Hanyo village, Kapuas Hulu sub district, Kapuas District, Central Kalimantan. Data collection was through in-depth interviews and observations, especially direct observation of the Balian Hirek ritual procession and interviews with Balian and Kaharingan priest. The spirits that possess the balian body are different and alternate according to the purpose of "healing" by balian.

*Keywords: balian hirek, ngaju, ritual, kaharingan*





## Anthropology and The Recentralization of Natural Resource Policies

Coordinators: Semiarto Aji Purwanto (Universitas Indonesia),  
Pinky Saptandari (Universitas Airlangga),  
& Pawennari Hijjang (Universitas Hasanuddin)

Indonesian citizen has a great opportunity to play roles in the policy-making process and the possibility to organize the government at the local level as a result of the democratization brought about by the Regional Government Law No. 22 of 1999. Followed by Law No. 4 of 2009, the regional government at the district level received a large portion of policy making for natural resource management. District level is the level of government closest to citizens in various regions that have abundant natural resources. With decentralized system, they get opportunities for vertical political mobilization. Head of the districts and their officials as well as and the members of the district parliaments were almost all of them local. Unfortunately, corruption and environmental damage due to bad management changes the good picture. Decentralization at the district level has in many cases resulted in a small portion of the local elite being upheld. The severity of their behavior is corrupt and enriching themselves becomes a common trend. It is often reported in the news that some district leaders and local parliaments members must end their careers in prison. On the other hand, the damage of the natural environment is uncontrolled. Wild encroachment is increasing in higher number. Departing from this concern, the state revised the Regional Government Law. This new law, which is the Regional Government Law No. 23 of 2014, particularly in the article 14-15, has a recentralization idea of power delegation in natural resource management. The newer law issued as the Regional Government Law No. 2 of 2015 has reinforce the idea. They attracted delegates to district authority in several natural resource extractions to the provincial level; some of them are directly handled by the central government. This panel will exercise the processes that occur at the bureaucracy and community levels after the enactment of the Regional Government Law which has recentralized the authority of natural resource management. In particular, papers on bureaucratic adjustments due to changes to the Law; dynamics between actors at the regional level; the impact on the management of natural resources at the community level; and various other possibilities related to the recentralization will be presented. Ethnographic findings and anthropological analysis will be directed at efforts to answer what is the best explanation for this phenomenon and how we can provide solutions to this arised problems.



WOMEN IN PERHUTANI FOREST: ETHNOGRAPHY STUDY IN PALINTANG HAMLET, CIPANJALU VILLAGE,  
CILENGKANG SUB-DISTRICT, BANDUNG, WEST JAVA

*Budiawati Supangkat*

*Department of Anthropology, Universitas Padjadjaran*

*Rahman Latif Alfian*

*Alumnus of Postgraduate of Department of Anthropology, Universitas Padjadjaran*

*Johan Iskandar*

*Department of Biology, Universitas Padjadjaran*

The study about man farmers involved in the farming in the forests has been carried out by scholars. But the study on the involvement of women farmers in forest especially in the non-rice farming, including mixed-garden system in the forest has rarely conducted. Therefore, the study on this aspect is considered to be very important. This paper focuses on women in involving in mixed-garden farming of the Perhutani Forest in Palintang hamlet, Cipanjalu village, Cilengkrang sub-district, Bandung district, West Java. This research used ethnography approach, with some techniques of collecting data: observation, participant and interviews with competent informants were applied. The result of study showed that women formers has been very active in involving in mixed-garden system of the vegetables and coffee farming of high land of Palintang hamlet, Bandung, West Java. They have been involving in the mixed-garden system in the Pehutani forest that is caused by dynamic socio-economic-cultural aspect changes, including modernization and commercialization of the farming as well as local ecosystems, including forest ecosystem changes. Since the women have intensively involved in the management of the mixed-garden system of the forest, the government should pay attention to gender and active participation of women in management of the Perhutani forest or any kind of forest which may support the high-land sustainable agricultural development and the forest management in Indonesia.

*Keywords: Perhutani forest, Palintang hamlet, farmer, women in agriculture, vegetable and coffee farming.*

IMPROVING COMMUNITY-BASED COASTAL MANAGEMENT IN PAPUA:  
SEARCHING FOR SUSTAINABLE AND SOCIALLY JUST NATURAL RESOURCE GOVERNANCE IN INDONESIA'S  
CHANGING LEGAL CONTEXT

*Dedi Supriadi Adhuri*

*Indonesian Institute of Sciences (LIPI)*

*Dirk J. Steenbergen*

*University of Wollongong*

*Cliff Marlessy*

*Indonesia Locally Managed Marine Area Foundation*

This presentation discusses the complexity of improving community-based coastal management in Papua, eastern Indonesia. We draw from experiences of a project of the Indonesia Locally Marine Managed Area Network that aims to establish new locally robust community-based coastal management through integrating traditional and government institutions. To do so co-management partnerships are built upon to craft and pass village regulations (*peraturan desa*) on coastal management. We argue that the resulting village regulations are not merely a codification



of tradition but rather a combination of several processes; including processes of (i) re-framing traditional norms and practices into a resource management context, (ii) blending science-based management instruments with traditional ones, and (iii) formalizing oral tradition into legal text. Consequently, governance elements are selectively drawn from both traditional (*adat*) and central state institutions. From our analysis we argue that firstly, socializing such new community regulations into communities, and integrating them into contemporary practice, requires facilitators to go beyond simplified rhetoric of 'returning rights people once had', but instead consider deeper how the process of co-constructing and installing new regulations came about and changed the status quo. Secondly, the legalization of village regulations requires harmonization with the Indonesian legal system to gain legitimacy on part of the government. This is challenged by the changing nature of Indonesian legal policy, particularly in reference to new laws that withdraw the right of authority and decision making by lower government levels (e.g. district/municipality) to manage inshore coastal waters, in favor of more centralized provincial coordination.

*Keywords: Community-based coastal management, Papua, Legal system.*

IMPACT OF MANGROVE FOREST LOGGING TO THE TOBATI LIVELIHOOD SYSTEM IN TELUK YOUTEFA,  
JAYAPURA SELATAN DISTRICT, JAYAPURA CITY, PAPUA  
*Agustina Ivone Poli, Subekti Wibowo, Lisy I. Zebua*  
*Cenderawasih University*

Mangrove forest is one of the coastal resources that plays an important role in development. Mangrove forests for the Tobati tribe sound direct and indirect economic values, for example as building materials utilized by residents as building piles, fuel wood used as an energy source and others. Youtefa Bay area is very profitable and has the potential of natural resources that have priority to be developed. Since 1974, logging and stockpiling have occurred in the mangrove forest area. Youtefa Bay is intended for residential areas, market development or road construction. Utilization and management of mangrove forests is carried out, without any effort to preserve it. This tendency arises because of the overlapping of Government Policy towards the management of mangrove forests in Youtefa Bay, which lacks attention to the principles of ecology, and the socio-cultural values of the local community. The problems faced as a result of logging of mangrove forests on livelihoods are in terms of obtaining the catch or collection of shellfish (snails), mangrove crabs and fish.

Many negative effects or impacts from forest destruction, especially mangrove forests. Physically, mangrove forests have a role as a fortress or protector of the coast from attacks of wind, currents and waves from the sea. Mangrove forests can be relied upon as a stronghold against waves that can damage the coast and land in its entirety. so that if there is no such fortress, it can cause erosion of the land by sea water. In addition, ecosystems in the area are also disrupted and will result in a decline in the economic value of the forest and productivity of the land, and a decline in biodiversity. Therefore, forest damage must be taken seriously immediately. For this reason, this paper will focus on the discussion of the socio-cultural impacts experienced by the Tobacco Engross community on the logging of mangrove forests found in Youtefa Bay, so that they can formulate policy recommendations in their handling.



The results of the study indicate that with the logging of mangrove forests in the Teluk Yoetefa area, it clearly greatly influences the culture of the Tobati Tribe, greatly influencing the livelihood system which seems to have an impact on daily life as experienced by Fishermen before logging of mangrove forests can get catches sea fish are quite good but after logging of mangrove forests the income of fishermen is greatly reduced and dropped dramatically. In general, the life of the Tobati tribe who work hard as the backbone of the family is a woman, so that it affects the Tobati tribe (Mama-mama) in obtaining or collecting the results of shellfish (snails), mangrove crabs and fish, this looks significant before logging mangrove forests but after logging of mangrove forests there is very little catch such as: fish, marine biota and mangrove crabs.

The occupants of the Mangrove forest in Entrop and along the current Hamadi coast are inhabited by many people from the Biak tribe and the Waropen tribe who have livelihoods such as cutting wood in the mangrove forest area and selling it for firewood and even making building houses, while indigenous people of the Tobati tribe still survive like fishermen, gathering, looking for biota and mangrove crabs every day. Mangrove Forests in the Gulf Region The competent competencies play an important role in the survival of the residents of Enggros village (Tobati Tribe) and have ecological benefits and functions that consist of various functions of environmental protection of land and sea ecosystems and the habitat of various types of fauna

The results of non-timber mangrove forest up to now have not been widely developed in Indonesia. Even if it is examined properly, the potential of non-timber mangrove forest resources in Indonesia is very large and can support the management of mangrove forests in a sustainable manner. Improving the quality of human resources (local community) and knowledge in the utilization of mangrove forests for the economy. The priority of handling the mangrove forest area which is classified as moderately damaged by the regional government. Planting mangrove seedlings in the abrasion area with stakes. Improvement of the hydrological flow of the Mammpie area so that the distribution of mangrove seedlings runs normally. Rehabilitation of the mangrove forest area which is in the medium category.

Then, based on the assessment that has been carried out, the recommendations offered are: It is necessary to maintain sustainable management of mangrove rehabilitation in order to guarantee the improvement of habitat in it. Management can continue to plant mangroves, especially in areas facing the open sea, because to prevent widespread abrasion and expand mangrove areas and carry out existing mangrove care so that aquatic biota communities can be maintained in the mangrove ecosystem. Even though there are some inappropriate habitat parameters, but mangroves in the Gulf of Yoetefa region can be maintained with the occurrence of natural mangrove growth. The Firm Status of Youtefa Bay as a tourist park. Because of its beauty and to save the bay and mangrove forests, the Government in this case, the Bapedalda of the city of Jayapura must notify all the people who are in the vicinity of the Youtefa Bay area that this region is a Friend of Tourism by Minister of Agriculture Decree No. 273 / Kpts / Um / 6/1978 on June 9, 1978. The function of the appointment of Taman Wisata is as a Nature Reserve and Cultural Reserve.

GREEN BELT area needs to be immediately established, green lines to prevent the extinction of mangrove species and coastal abrasion in the Youtefa Bay region. However, there is also a need for decisive action from the government, especially the Governor of the Regional Head of the First Province of Papua, the need for cooperation with the Police (Papua Regional Police) in Law Enforcement, for violators who do not comply with the applicable laws and regulations, because



it is so important about status Youtefa Bay as a Tourism Park as well as Nature Reserve and Cultural Heritage to the surrounding community (customary owners) and also outside communities (investors), about logging illegal mangrove forests, because it will damage ecosystems and habitats, mangrove forest structures for the lives of indigenous people in Youtefa Bay The remaining area of mangrove forest needs to be rehabilitated with a plant enrichment system. Continuous counseling and training activities need to be carried out on the management of mangrove ecosystems by the government, the private sector, and academics to increase people's desire to protect the remaining mangrove ecosystems.

#### FORTY YEARS OF SWIDDEN CULTIVATION IN SAHU, EASTERN INDONESIA

*Leontine E. Visser*

*Wageningen University*

This paper focuses on four decades of social history of swidden cultivation of the Sahu, Halmahera. Although Sahu is the vastest swidden rice growing area of the North Moluccas, its story is hardly known. Swidden rice farming can be characterized as rotational, with fallows between 7 - 12 up to 50 years. During the 19<sup>th</sup> century Sahu served as the 'granary' for the sultanate of Ternate. At the turn of the 20<sup>th</sup> century rice had already replaced sago as the staple food, although other food crops remain widely available until today. Swidden rice cultivation and land use practices are closely interrelated with a patrilineal organization of access and rights to land. This historical organisation has ongoing relevance to sustain tenure security at the level of the family cluster and the Sahu domain as a whole. Also, the important role of women as linkages between affinal landholding groups, and the changes in the gendered organisation of agriculture will be discussed. The Sahu are pretty food secure and food sovereign. But the modern need for a constant, short-term flow of money and growing individualism result in a shift away from food production toward cash cropping, and related shifts in gender participation in agriculture.

*Keywords: Swidden cultivation, land rights, gender, government intervention, Eastern Indonesia*

#### BACKGROUND

Continuous anthropological field research was carried out during 20 months (1979-1981), monitored during the 1990s, and taken up again during several fieldwork visits since 2015.

#### OBJECTIVE

Anthropological research seldom provides extensive, longitudinal accounts of land use and agricultural practices. This paper focuses on four decades of agronomic and social development of swidden rice cultivation and copra production by the Sahu on the North Moluccan island of Halmahera. Results have recently been published in the first Indonesian language monograph on the North Moluccan island of Halmahera (Visser 2019a).

#### DESCRIPTION AND FINDINGS

Halmahera societies were subordinate to the Sultan of Ternate, and Sahu provided the Sultan's court and his staff with rice. When the Dutch government replaced rice tribute with land taxation in 1876, rice became the staple food for the Sahu themselves. Marketing rice is tabooed. Until



today rice is grown on rotational swidden or ladang plots of about 0.8 ha, with fallows from 7 to 12 years.

Access to forested land and swidden rice cultivation are organized by large landholding groups (*'garana'*). These groups are vital to sustain tenure security of the family clusters (*rera*) and of the Sahu domain as a whole. Swidden land is regarded as 'living' or mobile, both in a physical and a social-cultural way. Land should ideally rotate through time and space between family clusters within landholding groups. These are the very same social units that also exchange brides and adoptive children. The annual harvest ceremony in the adat house or *sasa'du* of the Sahu villages testifies to the social organisation of these groups and the notion of fertility of land and humans bestowed upon them by the ancestors and the Christian God (Visser 1989; 2019a).

In the 1980s there were still as many as nine different types of land rights' transfer between family clusters. Today, only four of these remain. The only time land can be 'bought', preferably from affines and for 'pocket money', is when it is transferred together with the coconut trees planted on it. Coconut palms and the production of copra have been a major source of cash income in Sahu from the 1950s onward. In 1983-84 and 1984-85 the Agricultural Land Use Service implemented a land clearing project via the sub-district government and village heads. The dwarfed hybrid palms produced quicker, and yield more and richer fruits than the existing tall palms. Interestingly, the hybrid coconut project appears to have had two important social effects: i) It acted as a land redistribution mechanism between different family clusters and, ii) Together with the ownership rights to economic trees, transfer of ownership rights to land is recognised, but exclusively between affines. Suddenly farmers' incomes increased in Halmahera. Unfortunately, the joy was short-lived. Already after three years, harvests decreased considerably and after 10 years most of the hybrid palms were exhausted or dead. Sahu farmers returned to the tall coconut palms inherited from their forefathers. Unfortunately, copra prices have dropped to a non-sustainable income level.

In 1986-87 the government introduced hybrid cocoa seedlings together with an initial package of fertiliser and fungicide. In the early 1990s harvests were good, but cocoa was yet another crop to be attended, in addition to the time-consuming activities in the rice swiddens and copra plantations. Moreover, after the second year, farmers were expected to buy fertiliser and fungicide themselves, which often did not happen. Farmers complained that the quality of the seeds was low and that many seedlings grew into trees that did not bear fruits. Nevertheless, it is hard to tell which party is to blame. The provision of nutmeg seedlings in 2013 is the most recent intervention to raise farmers' incomes and the export value of Halmahera.

Eastern Indonesia in general, and Halmahera in particular came in late to attract the political-economic attention of the central government. As a result of reformasi and pemakaran policies at the turn of the 21<sup>st</sup> century, financial resources became more widely available at provincial and district levels. Particularly after "religious" clashes in Halmahera between 1999 and 2002, rural development was seen as a road to peace. Anak daerah were elected Bupati and Camat, and district funds for infrastructure, education, health and agricultural services improved dramatically.

Unlike in Kalimantan, Sulawesi, Aceh, and Papua food producing estates, industrial oil palm or cocoa plantations are not (yet) causing social and economic inequality and the risk of exclusion to the local farmers in Sahu. Sahu society today still largely depends on the rotation of cash in function of the rotation of land and crops and the exchange of women and labour. Monetization





through cash cropping still exists alongside subsistence agriculture, but the need for a continuous income is tilting the balance from swidden farming to tree cropping.

The priority shift towards cash cropping implies that women become more involved in harvesting and post-harvest production of cocoa, nutmeg and mace. Women also take their share of the money that has become available. A positive side effect is the improved food security of children because their mothers are more at home. A negative effect is that the availability and consumption of home grown rice is reduced. Also, the move away from collective rice swiddening weakens the agricultural work teams based on kinship. However, this does not necessarily imply a weakening of social ties, but it does give space to individualist tendencies and tension within family clusters. Since the 1990s the relative income boom from better sales of copra from hybrid coconut palms and the first cocoa harvests stimulated the short-term demand for a regular cash flow. This trend drastically increased after 2004. Houses were improved or newly built. In addition to daily household needs, children's secondary and sometimes tertiary education and the church demanded monthly payments. As copra and cocoa harvests did not cover the costs, families started to sell their chinaware and heirloom cloths (Visser 2019b).

## CONCLUSION

Individualisasi has become a concept with a particular local content. Given Sahu social organisation of inheritance groups (*rera*) and a history of collective swidden rice farming, the primary meaning of individualism is the weakening of kinship-related work groups. Sahu was recognised by AMAN as an adat community in 2004. However, effective consolidation of their communal rights depends on positive action from the Sahu landholding and inheritance groups together with the sub-district and district governments.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Cairns, M. (ed.) with B. Hill and T. Kurupunya (2017) *Shifting Cultivation Policies. Balancing Environmental and Social Sustainability*, CAB International, Wallingford.
- Clercq, F.S.A. de (1890) *Bijdragen tot de kennis der residentie Ternate*. Brill, Leiden.
- Colfer, C.J. Pierce, R. D. Minarchek, M. Cairns, A. Aier, A. Doolittle, V. Marshman, H. H. Odame, M. Roberts, K. Robinson, P. Van (2015) 'Gender analysis. Shifting cultivation and indigenous people', in M.F. Cairns (ed.). *Shifting Cultivation and Environmental Change. Indigenous People, Agriculture and Forest Conservation*: 920-937.
- Duncan, C.R. (2013) *Violence and vengeance. Religious conflict and its aftermath in Eastern Indonesia*. Cornell University Press, Ithaca/London.
- Fitzpatrick, D. (2007) 'Land, custom and the state in post-Suharto Indonesia: a comparative legal perspective', in J. Davidson and D. Henley (eds), *Adat revivalism in Indonesia's democratic transition*: 116-135. KITLV Press, Leiden.
- Fortgens, J. (1905) 'Vier weken onder de Tabaru en Waioli van Noord-West Halmahera'. *Mededeelingen vanwege het Nederlandsch Zendelinggenootschap* 49: 1-53.
- McCarthy, J.F. and K. Obidzinski (2017) 'Framing the poverty question: Policy choices and livelihood consequences in Indonesia', *Journal of Rural Studies* 54: 344-454.



- Patlis, J.M. (2005) 'New legal Initiatives for Natural Resource Management in a Changing Indonesia: The promise, the Fear and the Unknown', in Budy P. Resosudarmo (ed.) *The Politics and Economics of Indonesia's Natural Resources*: 231-247. Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, Singapore.
- Resosudarmo, B.P. (2009) 'A note on socio-economic development in Maluku', in Budy P. Resosudarmo and Frank Jotzo (eds). *Working with nature against poverty. Development, resources and the environment in Eastern Indonesia*: 74-93. Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, Singapore.
- Visser, (1989b). *My rice field is my child. Social and territorial aspects of swidden cultivation in Sahu, eastern Indonesia*. Verhandelingen KITLV 136. Dordrecht: Foris Publications.
- Visser, L.E. and C.L. Voorhoeve (1987). *Sahu-Indonesian-English Dictionary and Sahu Grammar Sketch*. Dordrecht, the Netherlands: Foris Publications.
- Visser, Leontine E., 2019a. *Sejarah Pertanian dan Kebudayaan Sahu, Halmahera*. Yogyakarta: Penerbit Ombak.
- Visser, Leontine E. 2019b. The Historical Path of Sahu Textiles. *Archipel* 98 (forthcoming).

MINING DECENTRALIZATION AND RECENTRALIZATION: MUSING ON THE CONSTRUCTION  
OF NUSA TENGGARA TIMUR AS A PROVINCE

Maribeth Erb

Department of Sociology, National University of Singapore

In September 2018, the newly elected governor of NTT province, fulfilling a campaign promise, announced a moratorium on all mining in the province, opening a review of all the mining contracts issued at the kabupaten level during the previous decade. From 2007 to 2013, hundreds of licenses to mine for manganese and gold in the province had been given out by bupati, newly empowered by decentralization regulations and the 2009 Mining Law, giving them rights to allocate concessions (IUP). Many NGOs in the province had hoped that this moratorium would result in the closing of mining as an industry, given their belief that mining was an inappropriate and dangerous industry for the province, consisting of unstable small and relatively heavily populated islands. Before the new Mining Law was introduced in 2009, foreign mining companies hoped the new law would restore the "dependability" and "generosity" of the New Order resource management, however many powerful actors in Indonesia had pressurized the government to implement laws benefitting national interests. Although the new law made some provision for community mining, the rights of communities to reject mining, however, were by no means clear; the law could be and often was interpreted by government officials in NTT, as not only prohibiting rejection, but making it unthinkable. The implementation of Law no 23 of 2014, however, destabilized some of the certainty of regional and national actors towards the rights to exploitation of natural resources. In this paper I will examine the effect of this law in NTT province and how mining has contributed to shaping a particular idea of what NTT is as a particular place. With the governor newly re-empowered to control mining licenses, what has it meant for the mining licenses and contracts already held? What has the governor's new role meant to the communities of NTT, their right to accept, reject, or even mine these resources themselves? The experience of mining for different actors in NTT is extremely varied, and with this exploration of



the new law controlling natural resource management, I attempt to explore the way mining over the past decade in NTT province has contributed to a new sense of the meaning of the province as a particular location of both national and local identity.

*Keywords: Mining, Nusa Tenggara Timur, Recentralization, Natural Resources*

THE CHANCE FOR IMPROVEMENT OF RURAL WOMEN HUMAN RESOURCE AND LEADERSHIP QUALITY BY  
Means of WOMEN SCHOOL

*Pinky Saptandari*

*Universitas Airlangga*

Empowered community, especially empowered women is the key to a nation development success in particular for the purposes of reaching an equal justice for all. Empowered women will serve as important actors in forming sustainable development goals (SDGs), especially in support to 'no one is left behind' principle. There are various ways to help improve women empowerment. Women schools in rural areas in Indonesia become an important chance to reach the target, namely the sustainable development. Through the Women Schools, women living in rural areas get empowered as they gain more access to and direct involvement in the process of development. Gresik Women School is one such schools established by Institut KAPAL Perempuan in collaboration with the KPS2K (Kelompok Perempuan dan Sumber-Sumber Kehidupan = Women Group and Life Resources) institution. Gresik Women School has become a model for grass root women empowerment by means of life time learning and training process. The paper particularly discusses and criticizes the role of Women Schools in improving women human resource and leadership, using qualitative method in feminist perspective. In view of politics, they start to voice their rights including their active involvement in campaigns against prevention of child marriage. In term of social movement, they are able to strengthen gender solidarity and escape the patriarchy dominance for their individual and family empowerment. Economically, they are capable of dealing with unfavorable household issues, among others by developing sustainable agricultural as source of earning for them and their family.

*Keywords: women empowerment, women leadership, practical and strategic gender interest satisfaction.*

POST FORMALIZATION AND RECENTRALIZATION OF MINING POLICIES:  
THE CASE OF MINING REGULATIONS AND THEIR IMPACTS IN CENTRAL KALIMANTAN, INDONESIA

*Semiarto A. Purwanto*

*Universitas Indonesia*

Changes in mining policy in Indonesia in the past forty years have been numerous and varied; often contradict each other. This paper will look at how some events that underlie and then occur after changes in mining policies in Central Kalimantan. In particular, I will put more emphasis on responses at the local government and community level.

During the process of political reform that began in 1998, the mining business underwent major changes. The enactment of the law No 22/1999 on regional government, became the basis for the government at the district level to grant business licenses in the mining, forestry and other business



sectors. Unbearably, there were are changeing landscape of activities ranging from the occupation and expropriation of large mining areas, the proliferation of community mining, to the decentralization of mining policies. However, a number of observers addressed the problems of environment problems, pollution, and the health of miners as consequences of the extensive mining in the community level. In response, the government took back district-level authority, and handed it over to regional governments at the provincial level. Some more considered important authorities were placed at the central government.

My observation in Central Kalimantan showed three effects of this recentralization policies. First, the provincial government is now stronger to regulate and control the granting of permits at lower levels. Second, entrepreneurs in the regions must travel a considerable distance to the provincial capital that led to the practice of licensing brokerage, which involved officials at the provincial government office. Three, while at the community level, mining seems to remain a livelihood option for residents; but most miners actually come from other areas outside the province.

SUBJECTIVITY AND FOREST FIRES GOVERNANCE IN INDONESIA:  
THE MAKING OF ENVIRONMENTAL INMATES?

*Sofyan Ansori*

*Northwestern University*

This paper investigates the struggle of Dayak people, an indigenous community who greatly depends on forest extraction for their livelihood, in articulating their responses toward the fire use regulation and positioning themselves as subjects. Following the 2015 massive forest fires, the Indonesian government promulgated a regulation and mobilized more than 25 state agencies to control forest fires. Emphasizing the responses and actions performed by the people, the analysis engages critically with the debate on environmentality and environmental subjects to unpack people's everyday experience, particularly the way they embrace, live, and escape the government's gaze. This paper draws from author's ethnographic fieldwork in 2015 and 2016 in Mantangai, Central Kalimantan, one of the most impacted environment by forest fires in Indonesia. The methods deployed in this paper includes participant observation in both farming and forest areas as well as interviews with Dayak people. The preliminary findings show that the new technologies of governance force indigenous people to reorient their positionality toward the state, their environment, and their livelihoods. This paper argues that the making of this new subjectivity is not only constituted by the way development intervention is situated or how oppression is lived and experienced, but also countered by indigenous people in an everyday setting. This paper attempts to exercise other possibilities in probing environmental subjects by proposing that it should not necessarily be attributed exclusively to those with a positive quality relationship between individuals and their environment. Instead, it should also allow space for other forms of positionality and inclusive to those whose thoughts and actions influence the environment in many different ways—including subjectivities as "environmental inmates." By tracing the formation of subjectivity, this paper offers a different optic in understanding the responses of indigenous people to the centralized efforts of forest fires governance.

*Keywords: Forest fires governance, Environmental subjects, Indigenous people, Ethnography, Indonesia*



PROTECTED ASSUMPTION: CARE FOR CULTURE BEHIND THE ECOLOGICAL VOCATIONAL COMMUNITY  
OF THE MOUNTAIN COMMUNITY IN ALLAKUANG VILLAGE

Zulkifli

*Department of Anthropology, Universitas Khairun*

*Pawennari Hijjang*

*Department of Anthropology, Universitas Hasanuddin*

The Economic needs and technological sophistication have an influence on ecological conditions that attract the attention of anthropologists to make the object of study. Anthropology studies the culture of society trying to examine the process of enculturation, acculturation and assimilation in interpreting changes in the culture of society. Through a critical Ethnographic approach, this article aims to explore and interpret the meanings behind the assumptions of the resistance of the stone of mountain craftsmen community in Allakuang Village, province of South Sulawesi. The results showed that ecological conditions tended to be dominated and neglected by the urgency of economic needs in the midst of technological sophistication to be considered negligent on patterns of environmental preservation along with the effects that endanger them in the future. Complaints by environmentalists were responded with a solid resistance effort from among craftsmen, diggers to excavated landowners through acts of resistance and statements that tended to integrate the urgency of their existence until now as if they indicated that those who criticized tried to enter and understand the dynamics, situations and feelings he experienced. Thus this study shows that the ecological awareness of the community of mountain stone craftsmen requires revitalization efforts to be in harmony with the efforts of economically conscious economies in caring for their identity as a symbol of the community that has been known up to now and still considers the impact of environmental ecosystems so that cultural identity and economic life are maintained promoting environmental ethics

*Keywords: Stone Craftsmen, Economic Efforts, Environmental Urgency, Assumption of Resistance, Community Identity*

## Structuring Diversity: Values, Political-Economic Order and Inter-Societal Relations in an Indonesian Archipelago

Coordinators: Imam Ardhiyanto (Universitas Indonesia)

& Geger Riyanto (Heidelberg University)

This panel aims to engage with recent discourse in the anthropological theory of values to understand how people in Indonesian archipelago organize their lives and manage inter-group interactions within a diverse cultural landscape and in relation to the transformation of broader political-economic arrangement. Inter-societies order and conflict, we believe, are profoundly influenced by valuation practices. Insights provided by anthropologists had established that value, as a category, is pivotal in social life as it prompts people to rank and structure their experience. Cultural differences are not simply marked by variations of the categories people use to organise their lived experiences but also the diverging ways they consider the importance of certain actions. Comparisons and competitions of the people's own values with "the Other," furthermore, constantly accompany cultural differences. Across different time and places, then, it is only natural that social dynamics between different groups revolve around realisation, contradiction,



adjustment, and accommodation of their values. The dynamics become even more complicated as capitalism order of values influences inter-society relations across the archipelago and perpetuated through intertwinement with decades of states' socio-economic interventions to Indonesian societies. By addressing the role values plays within various Indonesian locales, we expect to produce a more compelling explanation of social dynamics stemmed from a diverse and changing cultural landscape, which had been perpetually addressed by the country's prominent social scientists, as well as contributing to the anthropological theory of value, which, arguably, still lacking the insight from inquiries on inter-societies relationship. The topics, or cases, explored by this panel include but not limited to religious polarisation and conflict, inter-ethnic relation, myth, ritual and changing socio-economic order, the role of intermediaries ethnic groups migration (Hoakian, Fuchow, Javanese, Banjar, Bugis, Buton, Bajau, etc.), upland-lowland socio-political relationship, and the perpetual conflict between state, capitalism and indigenous minority.

PALM OIL TREE FETISH: A PLANTATION GOD IN THE PROCESS OF CONSTRUCTION IN WEST KALIMANTAN

*Atmaezer Hariara Simanjuntak*

*Northwestern University*

This paper examines decay and new fetish construction in Dayak Desa farmers' symbolic universe—from Tapang Madu (*Koompasia excelsa*) to palm oil trees (*Elaeis guineensis*). This deep-seated material change, which is reflected in a forest-use shift from heterogenous rain forest to expansive monoculture cash-cropping and a religious conversion to Christianity, has provoked symbolic responses from the Desa farmers. Moreover, such change also puts Desa farmers' dialectical turmoil of truth and being to challenge. The decay of the Tapang Madu fetish to an object of no significance opened a gap for the Desa farmers to fill with a new fetish. Here, palm oil trees appeared to be the perfect fit due to its current dominance over the Desa farmers' cultural landscape. For the Desa farmers today, palm oil trees are mystical and always in peril of the lurking devil in the form of black dog phantoms. Palm trees are prayed to in churches and aesthetically embodied by the farmers. This belief might come off as a repudiation of "modernity" and signal the Desa farmers' tendency to revert to their "traditional" state. Quite the contrary, the Desa farmers' construction and mystification of the devil contributes to a hybrid form of a fetish which helps them constitute a reality in which they come to terms with the changing mode of production, from pre-capitalism to industrial capitalism. It is a fetish that embodies their collective representations of what it means both to lose control over and to be subjugated by the means of production—a historical and on-going process of dispossession. The Desa farmers' sense of loss entails inescapable enticements, self-consuming passions, discriminatory tactics, and devastating social costs.

*Keywords: Desa farmers, commodity fetishism, subjugation, palm oil tree, religious conversion*

PAGATAN WOVEN TEXTILE: THE INHERITANCE OF MALAY CULTURES INTO THE BANJARMASIN COURT

*Dwi P. Sulaksono*

*Banjar Baru Museum*

In learning of why one culture diffused, make process in adherence trait at the encounter of each other content of traditions. One culture was tending to look similar with their neighbours but, another culture is showed as a solely different and could be differentiated by others. While, still





other cultures were quite to be an origin at the reflection of forms. The one can suggest that at between the long periode of acculturation caused by each other contact, it was important to know the background of one culture diffused. These third of questions should be defined into process: firstly, when was the west-ward of china trading diffused into the east of Indonesia? Whereas, the peninsular trade has had caused a cultural contact that were connect to the textile - Malay and Bugis clothing tradition? And thirdly, when was the partial migration acculturated deep into the origin of mid-west and east of Indonesian patterns of textile.

“Cultural diversity should be regarded as the set of distinctive spiritual, material, intellectual and emotional features of society or a social group, and that it encompasses, in addition to art and literature, lifestyles, ways of living together, value systems, traditions and beliefs” (Universal Declaration on Cultural Diversity, 2001; Cultural Convention of the UNESCO, 2005).

The old fashion replaced by the former tradition, is because of the developing issued in politic was enabled to turn of the national ideology but, it wasn't due to the changing life in orientations. There are the capabilities transformation in virtue up kind of art for a semiotic transformation. The inheritance of culture even reflects the rule of 'legacy' for the next generation. Clothing textile in Pagatan is becoming fact of structuring diversity that was restrained into the stratified group of Wajo, which always captive into the hereditarily back of traditions.

ASSIMILATING STRANGER, EXEMPLIFYING VALUE: THE REALIZATION OF IDEAL CULTURAL REPRESENTATION  
AND UPLAND-LOWLAND RELATIONSHIP IN NORTH SERAM, EASTERN INDONESIA

*Geger Riyanto*

*Institute of Anthropology, Heidelberg University*

Ultimate value is rarely fully realized as people have to maintain a balance between values in their everyday life. Robbins (2015) notes, however, that it may be perfectly exemplified through ritual. In this paper, I want to show that the perfect exemplification of a value that fundamentally matters to a society may otherwise be attained through the incorporation of an overwhelming stranger. Anthropologists have shown that the presence of a potent foreigner incites a sense of categorical disunity that leads to the dialectical counter movement to assimilate them. In this imaginary process of establishing a new unity, I argue, people are not simply attempting to incorporate the pervading stranger but also to encompass them within their hierarchically arranged idea of value. Subsequently, during the moment of assimilation—which can occur through myth, ritual, or other social forms—the community makes their ultimate value socially present. I will try to exemplify my argument by examining key cultural representations of the other among upland-lowland people in North Seram, Eastern Indonesia.

ADAPTATION BOTH SIDE: WHEN THE *GEREJA KRISTEN JAWA (GKJ)* MULTICULTURIZE ITSELF

*Harry Bawono*

*National Archives of the Republic of Indonesia*

The Javanese Christian Church or *Gereja Kristen Jawa (GKJ)* is one of the Javanese Christian representation. In the GKJ, the struggle between Christianity and Javanese Culture has been processed since the 1800s and continues to present day which has an impact on the process of adaptation that occurs in both sides. The adaptation process on Christianity side could be found when the GKJ change the primary reference from the Heidelberg Catechism which is totally



Calvinistic to the Principle of GKJ's Teaching in 1997 or *Pokok-Pokok Ajaran GKJ 1997 (PPA 1997)* then revised to the Principle of GKJ's Teaching in 2005 or *Pokok-Pokok Ajaran GKJ 2005 (PPA 2005)*. At least two adjustments in the Christianity side that could be identified, the salvation theology and how the church response to cultural and religious diversity. The salvation theology that fully Calvinism oriented which is "predestination" turn into Arminianism that totally contradicts because adopted "free will". On how church response to cultural and religious diversity, the GKJ revised its perspective from unappreciative to an appreciative angle. However, until present day the GKJ still a part of the global Calvinist Church community named World Communion of Reformed Church (WCRC). Meanwhile, in the Javanese Culture side, adaptation come through the method of transmutation of meaning which transforms the internal meaning of Javanese Culture practices in order to make the Javanese Culture and Christianity could mutually synthesize. Furthermore, the harmony value has a significant role in this whole process as an enabler that makes the multiculturalization within the GKJ possibly happen. The research was conducted from June 2013 to March 2015. Using qualitative methods through an in-depth interview and participatory observation, this research describes the dynamics of the adaptation process between Christianity and Javanese Culture that shaped the GKJ from monocultural into a multicultural church.

*Keywords: Christinity, Javanese Culture, Adaptation Process, Harmony, Multicultural Church*

COMPETITIVE HOSPITALITY:

*ADAT (CUSTOM), RELIGION AND ECOLOGICAL DEGRADATION IN A PERIPHERY INDONESIA*

*Hatib Kadir*

*Universitas Brawijaya*

My research focuses on two things, livelihood, customs, religions and its correlations to the coastal environmental degradation and how conservation institutions deal with the cultural habits and patterns that cause to the environmental degradation. The research location based is in Northern Raja Ampat, and the outermost islands, including Ayau Islands. Unlike in mainland Papua (*Tana Besar*), in the coastal Raja Ampat islands, people have a long and deep history to be connected with the outsiders and global traders. People in Raja Ampat, who generally come from Biak are fairly open. The coastal areas people are more enthusiast to participate in the greater economic system as what they have done for over centuries (Muridan, 2009). During my research, I found that people have been long connected with global traders and fishermen that come from Palau, Philippines, Hongkong and Taiwan. They have memories and stories regarding their encounters with these people when they search fish around the archipelagoes. The encounters with various foreigner fishermen have shaped their discourse and aspirations in treating their ecology. From foreigners and middlemen and foreign traders, Local Papuan learn on extending their livelihood beyond their subsistence needs. They learn to be integrated to the market exchanges by selling sea cucumber (*teripang*), giant clams (*kima*), mollusca (*lola*) that live around coastal areas.

This research is started from problematizing argument that economy and livelihood cannot be separated from customary, religion, and social activities. Through human-nature coexistence, I problematize the Karl Polanyian term of "embeddedness", where economy is not secularly separated from ethnic allegiance and religious communality. The embeddedness of economy (Polanyi, 1944) where economic livelihood embodies in a non-economic institution, such as family clan interests, church devotional practices, and community feasts have led to the paradoxical



conditions to the environment. On one hand, church helps to facilitate creative invented traditions, such as through *sasi gereja* (Bubandt, 2005). But on the other hand, church, which hand in hand with adat institution, they give a legitimation for people to explore more sea creatures for the sake of religious well-being. Through religion and *adat*, people are encouraged to consume more various sea creatures for the religious festive.

The exploitation of the coastal areas is even flourishes since people are given their privilege to mark their customary territories. Church and customary institutions, then have a sovereign space to govern the nature, whether it is exploited for social relations or for economic transactions. My research on December to January, 2019, collaborating with marine research shows that the degradation of the coastal environment is mostly because of the human factors regarding with their non-economic factors, such as livelihood, customary and religious activities, and economic economic transactions. To measure the nature degradation, I my research was conducted collaboratively with marine science, marine biology, and environmental science. We found coastal degradation in Ayu Island as follow: (i) We found coastal degradation in Ayu Island as follow: (i)The condition of coral reefs, coral fish and pelagic fish is mostly broken due to shipping, fishing and the use of trawlers and potassium (ii) Although the conditions of seagrass beds (*lamun*) are categorized healthy, the biota such as sea cucumbers, crabs, and shellfish could not be seen much on the seagrass. This is an indication of the high exploitation these animals are uncontrollable (iii) Coastal degradation occurred since potassium and bombing coral reefs. People bombed coral reefs because they need tonnage of fish. The bombing and potassium lead to the beach abrasion. That's why people build concrete stone (*talud*) around the island. In my own research, I found that the high levels consumption of *penyu belimbing* (*Dermochelys coriacea*) and *penyu hijau* (*Chelonia mydas*) during certain rituals, specifically for customary Christmas preparation have threatened of these protected animals. The festive seasons are conducted one month before Christmas, December 25. The length of the festive has allowed people to gather more turtles. Clans who are able to collect turtles and present them in large quantities to other family clans at Christmas are able to maintain pride and honor. I call this "competitive hospitality". Each of the clans compete for their hospitality in order to maintain family clan's prestige. In this case, the church allowed the hunting turtle given the congregation (*warga jemaat*) are also indigenous people (*masyarakat adat*) itself. Religion intertwines with custom affects to the ecological changes.

In Raja Ampat, there have been many global conservationist projects that attempt to change these particular customs that cause environmental degradation. Conservationists in Raja Ampat are collaborations among scientists, business, state regulators, the public intellectual or academia. Environmental activism flourished in Raja Ampat. They are part of the global movement on marine conservation. NGO'S such as TNC, CI such as *FFI* (Flora Fauna) and *Belantara* positively respond to the cultural capital such as *sasi* in conserving ecology. They circulate their universal global knowledge on nature preservation. Yet objective conservationist efforts have been impeded by cultural ethos, religious belief that has been embedded into both social relations and economic transactions. They have been ill-informed in responding to the customary activities such as turtle hunting that are often legitimated by church. As a cultural ethics: pride, honor and shame circulated at the competitive hospitality is not easily measured through the rules of scientific approach.

Thus, this research is concerning on two big problems. This article concerns on two big questions. First, what kind of paradox do both traditional and religious institutions (churches) have, when dealing with environment management and conservation? Second, how NGO-and



conservationists, including marine science, which have objective and universal discourse of science and ecosystem sustainability collide with local cultural practices? Especially when these two-contradictory backgrounds dealing with the nature management.

*Keywords: Adat and Church, Gift-Giving, Prestige, Conservationism, Environment Degradation*

THE PARALLEL AND SEQUENTIAL EMERGENCE OF HIERARCHY AND EGALITARIAN SOCIO-RELIGIOUS FORMATION: INTRA/INTER DENOMINATIONAL RELATION AMONG CHRISTIAN KENYAH IN CENTRAL BORNEO

*Imam Ardhianto  
Universitas Indonesia*

My study aims to explore the socio-religious formation dynamics as a starting point to trace the dynamics form of Christian value and religious authority among the Kenyah. The Kenyah live dispersed in Central Borneo, a region comprising both the border region of Indonesia Kalimantan and Sarawak Malaysia on the Island of Borneo, were considered as one of the examples of a stratified society of Borneo famous in their aristocratic institution of *Adat*. However, during the last decades, the ethnic groups were influenced by Pentecostal-evangelic Christianity that promotes an egalitarian vision of liturgy, institutional forms, and religious practices. Nowadays, Christian Kenyah community in Central Borneo has experienced both hierarchical and egalitarian socio-religious life in a diverse sphere of religious life as a result of the dialogic relation between *Adat* (former religious belief, institution and system taboo) and Pentecostal/evangelist self-planting church. Inter and Intra denominational relation cases among the Kenyah reveal the dialogic nature of the various socio-religious form. The hierarchic form of authority at some moment was a response to egalitarian aspect emerged within the dynamic of an institution, vice versa. Along with this parallel emergence of socio-religious form and its schismogenetics relation, what kind of insight we could obtain to understand the value of individualism and hierarchic that preoccupied the subfield of anthropology of Christianity? If so, what kind of ideological or paramount values could be produced? Or if we used another side point of view, what structure and form of values motored this dynamic of socio-religious formation?

CARING DIVERSITY IN THE CITY OF JAKARTA

*Lamtiur H. Tampubolon, Murniati Agustian, & Tri Warmiyati  
Universitas Katholik Atma Jaya Jakarta*

*This is an action research aimed at gaining an idea of how high school students in Jakarta practicing values of "Panca Sila" in relationship of promoting diversity. Jakarta was chosen as a research site because in this capital city there are many ethnic groups with a very diverse culture live together side by side and they are risk to conflict. The subject of the research was high school students as they are young generation who will inherit the value of togetherness and diversity. Research methods used in this research is quantitative and qualitative. The research instrument used in the quantitative approach is the dissemination of questionnaires to the five (5) selected high schools, based on religion, namely Islam, Catholicism, Christianity, and Buddhism. The questionnaire was about the fifth sila of Panca Sila. Total respondents were 200 students. For the qualitative approach, we used FGD (Focused Group Discussion) towards students and teachers (each 1 group).*



*Survey data on 200 high school students in Jakarta showed mixed results. The percentage of students who practice the Pancasila precepts is very varied for the five precepts; the majority is in a 'sufficient' level for second to fourth precepts, and only understanding of the first precepts is 'good', which is 44%. If we compare the level of practice of Pancasila values based on gender, it is seen that women have a 'good' category for the first precept, which is 53.7%; while male students have a 'sufficient' level in the fourth principle (65.8%). Another interesting finding is in the context of students' religion. The majority of students' religion who become our respondents are Islam (42%, n = 84), but the level of practice for the first precepts in the 'good' category is Catholic students (84.3%, n = 51). The practice of Pancasila for the second to fifth precepts are all in the 'sufficient' level: Moslem students are for the second precepts (50%), Catholic students are for the third precepts (49%), Buddhism students are for the fourth precepts (68.9%), and Protestantism students are for the fifth precepts.*

*Keywords: diversity, urban, youth*

## BACKGROUND

In recent years the socio-political dynamics in Jakarta have been characterized by acts of violence perpetrated by groups of people who impose their will and find it difficult to accept differences. This is a sign that the national slogan "Bhinneka Tunggal Ika" is undergoing crushing. In other words, differences in religion, beliefs, race, ethnicity, gender, social class and point of view become necessary. In fact, on this beloved Indonesian land, which is our common home, everyone has the right to a decent place and is united by the same common platform, PANCASILA and BHINEKA TUNGGAL IKA.

Yes, Indonesia is destined to be a multicultural nation that consists of hundreds of ethnic groups with a very diverse culture (including beliefs, religion, and ideology). This diversity must be good treated so that the Indonesian people can live peacefully in diversity. Since long ago the Indonesian people have shown a willingness to associate with various people from other countries so that other cultures easily enter such as India and China. Life with followers of other religions such as Hinduism and Buddhism has also shown high tolerance between religions, seen from adjacent Hindu Buddhist buildings in Java (Moedjanto, 1992; Nasikun, 1984; Ranjabar, 2006).

The nation's pioneers at the beginning of the establishment of the Indonesian state accepted that diversity as something that was 'given', but they realized there were still differences. Therefore, on October 28, 1928, young men such as Jong Sumatra, Jong Celebes, Jong Java, the Indonesian Catholic Political Association and nationalist groups such as Indische Party, and the Indonesian Association pledged the 'Youth Oath' which emphasized one language, one nation, and one homeland, namely Indonesia. Nothing in the statement said that they were "one religion" or "one tribe" (Tilaar: 2003, Moedjanto 1992).

Caring for diversity is also evident when the founders of the state were formulating the Pancasila and the opening of the 1945 Constitution. Those with the majority of Moslems had an open and broadening attitude to respect other religious beliefs. The agreement reached is the acceptance of Pancasila as the basis and ideology of the nation and state. With this, Indonesia is not a religious state nor is it a secular state, but a state of Pancasila, a democratic country with a belief.

Unfortunately, efforts to care for diversity are beginning to be ignored. In Indonesia, conflicts have been seen in various forms such as the 98 tragedy, Poso, Ambon, and Medan conflicts. Apart from



its positive benefits, social media also plays a role as an instrument that can increase division by "playing" differences in race, religion, even ideology. Even the Regional Elections and Presidential Election have also become a tool for inter-group conflict and instant ideology, resulting in divisions among friends and relatives. If all these things are not immediately stopped, and if efforts to care for diversity are not immediately revived, it is feared that KEBHINEKAAN or the togetherness and diversity of Indonesian people who have been treated with great difficulty will disappear. For this reason, new efforts are needed to stop the threat from being transmitted or spread to the younger generation. One of these efforts is to conduct an action research relating to the problem of togetherness and diversity in the younger generation in the city of Jakarta, namely high school students. The research team, which consisted of cross faculties, namely Elementary Teacher Education Study Program - FPB (Faculty of Education and Language), Business Administration Department - FIABIKOM and Faculty of Psychology felt the need to invite the young generation to explore the values of togetherness and diversity in order to overcome all differences and conflicts.

#### OBJECTIVE

In general, this action research is intended to contribute to solving practical problems in urgent problematic situations. Whereas specifically, the purpose of this action research is to 1) obtain a picture of how high school students practice the values of Pancasila in a diversity of relations as stated in the points of Pancasila. 2) Identifying the creative ideas of high school students in Jakarta in order to design efforts to care for the values of togetherness in diversity. 3) Produce input as the basis for film making (output).

#### DESCRIPTION

##### *Data Collection Methods and Techniques*

This action research uses a mix-method in the form of a combination of quantitative and qualitative methods. The quantitative method was done by distributing questionnaires to 200 high school students from 5 selected schools in the Jakarta area. The selection of schools is done purposively, namely: public schools and schools based on four religions namely Islam, Catholicism, Protestantism and Buddhism. The research team failed to find a Hindu-based school. For the North Jakarta region, schools that are based on Buddhism are taken, and for the South Jakarta region, schools are based on Islam. For the East Jakarta region, public schools are taken, and for the West Jakarta region, Protestant-based schools are taken. Whereas for the Central Jakarta region, schools based on Catholicism were taken. The questionnaire was compiled based on the Pancasila points relevant to treating diversity, with 47 items. Pancasila values can be seen in the 45 points of the Pancasila practice guidelines contained in the MPR Decree no. I/MPR/2003.

Qualitative data collection was carried out through Focus Group Discussion (FGD). The FGD was conducted both for students and teachers, each amounting to 1 group so that each school sent 2 representatives. The selection of students and teachers participating in the FGD was determined based on, 1) for students, coming from class 10 (new students) and 12 (students who were going to graduate), male and female. For teachers, it is a BK (Counselor) teacher, and a teacher who teaches Civic lessons, Religion and Social Studies such as Anthropology, Sociology, and History.

This action research results in the output of a short film. Why does it need to be output in the form of a film? Because film is one of the learning media that is powerful enough to convey concrete messages of togetherness and diversity.





## FINDINGS

### *Students' Understanding of Diversity*

The understanding of FGD participants of high school students regarding diversity is quite varied. Diversity is generally equated with the word "difference". "Differences" in question include differences in background, views, ethnicity, race, religion, life goals, skin color, and so forth. High school students participating in the FGD considered that although they had many differences, human beings were essentially the same, equal, so they did not deserve to mutate each other and should respect. This assessment is seen when discussing differences, students always associate with respect. Students' opinions about Unity in Diversity also vary, when reading or hearing the motto of Unity in Diversity, what students think about is that they come from different tribes, different skin colors, but still one Indonesia. Likewise, the opinions of students regarding shared values also vary. The values that emerge are: respect, tolerance, and respect, love each other, strengthen each other, sympathy and empathy, protect each other, equality, unity, and complement each other. All these values are found in the Pancasila points.

### *The level of practice of Pancasila values in diversity relations (P2RK)*

Survey data on 200 high school students in Jakarta showed mixed results. Diversity can be seen in the level of practice categorized as good, sufficient, and bad. The percentage of students who practice the Pancasila precepts is very varied for the five precepts; the majority is in a 'sufficient' level for second to fourth precepts, and only understanding of the first precepts is 'good', which is 44%.

If we compare the level of practice of Pancasila values based on sex, it is seen that women have a 'good' category for the first precept, which is 53.7%, while male students have a 'sufficient' level in the fourth principle (65.8%). Another interesting finding is in the context of students' religion. The majority of students' religion who become our respondents are Islam (42%, n = 84), but the level of practice for the first precepts in the 'good' category is Catholic students (84.3%, n = 51). The practice of Pancasila for the second to fifth precepts are all in the 'sufficient' level: Moslem students are for the second precepts (50%), Catholic students are for the third precepts (49%), Buddhism students are for the fourth precepts (68.9%), and Protestantism students are for the fifth precepts.

### *Creative Ideas for Caring for Diversity*

In the FGD, researchers also explored the views and opinions and creative ideas of students to treat diversity. The results of the FGD reflected the awareness of students about the importance of the role of the younger generation like them to care for diversity. The students are aware that Indonesian people are vulnerable to being pitted and divided, one of which is through hoaxes and dissemination of hate on social media. Students even recognize that parents and friends themselves can be a threat to division. Students acknowledge that there are still parents who limit their children to only associate with certain people or forbid their children to associate with people who are not the same religion, or not the same ideology.

To prevent division, students are aware of the need for special efforts to maintain and care for diversity starting from parents, schools, communities and the government. Parents need to be a



party that teaches children to live tolerantly in diversity. In addition, schools can provide seminars or workshops on "caring for diversity" to parents of students.

One effort that is considered beneficial is Character Education in schools where teachers can become role models to learn about tolerance or respect for diversity. The government is considered the most capable party to care for diversity.

Another interesting thing about student reflection is that the students themselves become role models for others, both for their peers and their parents. They believe that association with different people will not eliminate their identity. Students need to prove that association with different people will not reduce their performance at school.

## CONCLUSIONS

The results of this action research are very interesting to discuss. Quantitative data shows that the level of practice of Pancasila values is relatively low, less than 50%. Regarding the practice of the first principle, there are only 44% of high school students who practice consistently in everyday life, and 34.5% of students 'sometimes' practice it in daily life. Interestingly, there are students who never practiced the items in Pancasila in their daily lives (21.5%). It is shown by several behaviors; for example, never inform their religion frankly in public. However, even though the students' practice of Pancasila is low, it does not mean that they did not recognize Pancasila and Bhineka Tunggal Ika. For them, differences are not problems because all people are human being and they are all Indonesians.

In interpreting quantitative data, the research team must act very carefully. Why? First, because of the selection of religious-based schools. For schools that are based on religion non Islam, students can consist of various religions. But for schools that are based on Islam, it is certain that 100% of their students are Moslem. Second, for schools that are Catholic based, all students are female students; whereas for schools that are based on Islam, Protestantism, Buddhism and public schools, students consist of male and female. In addition, when we say that the level of practice of the Pancasila in schools with a particular religion is 'good', is it really caused by the religious factors adopted by students? The exclusivist of school (singular religion) does not bring them live solely but on the other hands, they learn how to respect each other. The research team realized that more in-depth discussion on sensitive matters was needed, and besides that, it was necessary to involve more non-religious schools to be involved in the next research. By doing this kind of research, it provides the issue of promoting diversity among youths.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

Agustian, Murniati., dkk. *Pengembangan Model Pendidikan Multikultural untuk Anak Usia Sekolah dengan Menggunakan seri Pustaka Anak Nusantara*. (Jakarta: PKPM Unika Atma Jaya bekerjasama dengan Public Affarirs Section U.S Embassy Jakarta Indonesia, 2006).

Ata Ujan, A.; Molan, B.; et.al. *Multikulturalisme. Belajar Hidup Bersama dalam perbedaan*. PT. Index Jakarta. 2011

Bok, Sessela. *Common Values*. Columbia: University of Missouri Press.1995



Derman-Sparks, Louise. "Culturally Relevant Anti-Bias Education with Young Children," dalam *Education Programs for Improving Intergroup Relations Theory, Research, and Practice*, eds, Walter G. Stephan and W. Paul Vogt. New York and London: Teachers College Press, 2004

Elfiky, Ibrahim. *Berpikir Positif*. Jakarta: Zaman, 2015

Fisher, Simon et al., *Mengelola Konflik* terjemahan S.N. Kartikasari dkk. Jakarta: The British Council, Indonesia, 2000

Maser, Chris and Pollio, Carol A, *Resolving Environmental Conflicts Second Edition*. Boca Raton: CRC Press Taylor & Francis Group, 2012

McCullough, M. E. *Beyond Revenge, The Evolution of Forgiveness Instinct*. San Fransisco: Jossey-Bass, 2008

Moedjanto, dkk, *Pancasila Buku Panduan Mahasiswa*. Jakarta: Gramedia, 1992.

Nasikun. *Sistem Sosial Indonesia*. Jakarta: Penerbit CV Rajawali, 1984

Nugroho, Alois, A. *Komunikasi & Demokrasi: Esai-Esai Etikka Komunikasi Politik*. Jakarta: Penerbit PT Kanisius, 2016

Nugroho, Alos A. *Rakyatisme: dan Esai-esai lain*. Jakarta: Penerbit Buku Kompas, 2017

O'Brien, Rory. *An Overview of the Methodological Approach of Action Research*. Faculty of Information Studies, University of Toronto - obrienr@fis.utoronto.ca. 1998. [http://www.web.net/~robrien/papers/arfinal.html#\\_edn1](http://www.web.net/~robrien/papers/arfinal.html#_edn1) (diakses 1 Maret 2017)

Ranjabar, Jacobus. *Sistem Sosial Budaya Indonesia: Suatu Pengantar* (Jakarta: Ghalia Indonesia, 2006)

Tilaar, H.A.R, *Kekuasaan & Pendidikan*. Magelang: Indonesiatara, 2003

PROCESSING BANANA TO CROSS STATE BORDER:  
ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT OF THE COMMUNITY IN THE BORDER OF NORTH KALIMANTAN

*Nugroho Trisnu Brata*  
*Universitas Negeri Semarang*

Border area of a country is commonly assumed as backyard of a house which is identical to being backward, dirty, and unorganized. Similarly, it happens to North Kalimantan that can be seen through a photo of a border village that is identical to being backward. This paper aims to discuss about social values of political-economic activities in the community that lives in a village located in state border and to study the narration of the community toward the existence of the state. This research uses qualitative method, and the data is collected through observation and interview. The research location is in Sungai Limau Village, Sebatik Tengah District, Nunukan Regency, North Kalimantan Province. This paper shows that in Sebatik Island, especially in Sungai Limau Village, there is meaning change on the environment that, besides oil palm and cocoa plantation, there are many banana trees in that village. In the beginning, banana is considered to have low economic value. But then, there is a creative idea from one of the local people, which is



initiating a processed banana. After being processed, banana turns out to have higher economic value. However, people then found difficulty in marketing the processed banana because their area is far from the market. They see a marketing opportunity in Tawau City, Sabah, Malaysia, across the state border, and it is hard for them to go through the border. In the midst of difficulty, they are finally successful to cross the state border and market the processed banana. For the local people, state border is no longer considered as 'sacred area' and forbidden to enter to. Based on the research, it can be concluded that environment may seem to have limitation in fulfilling people needs, but then, there is actually hidden potential of natural resources that can be processed to meet their needs.

*Keywords: economic value, to process, state border, state meaning.*

#### THE DEVELOPMENT OF IDENTITY IN JAVANESE-WHITE AUSTRALIAN FAMILIES LIVING IN AUSTRALIA

*Petra Elias*

*The University of Western Australia*

*Despite significant numbers of marriages between white Australians and Indonesians (ABS, 2016; Heard, Khoo, & Birrell, 2009; Giorgas, & Jones, 2002; Gunawan, & Yahya, 2016), little research and literature explores the issues of race and culture inevitably raised in such relationships. A white Australian woman, I have been married to a Javanese man for 21-years and we have two teenage sons. In my PhD, I am exploring how Javanese-white Australian couples negotiate the diverse cultural morè, both in Australia and in Java, to develop their cultural identity as a couple, family and individually.*

*My research focusses on exploring the way Javanese-white Australian couples negotiate their cultural identity/ies as a couple living in Australia. The research uses as its foundation the seminal International and Australian research examining mixed Asian-Australian identity conducted mainly in the 1990's and early 2000s by Duncan-Owen (2002), Luke (1994, 1993), Luke & Luke (1998, 1999), Luke & Carrington (2000), Fozdar (2011), Fozdar & McGavin, (2017), Fozdar & Perkins, (2014), Fozdar, F., Wilding, R., & Hawkins, M. (2009), Abidin (2017), Dragojlovic (2008, 2014) and Meyer (2017), Meyer & Fozdar (2017), Dragojlovic (2015), Heikkila, & Yeoh, 2011, and Australian-Indonesian identity by Penny(1993) and Penny & Khoo (1996), Winarnita Doxy (2015, 2007), Winarnita & Tanu (2015), Ida Bagus (2008) and Bicego (2016).*

*To gain an understanding of the way couples manage various cultural and socio-political influences in the development of cultural identity the study explored their engagement in domestic, family and spiritual life. Using purposive sampling and semi-structured interviews, I conducted 20 interviews with couples and individuals which focused on day-to-day life in Australia to investigate how couples from Javanese and white Australian backgrounds hybridised their cultures and how they perceive their identities in each society. Interim findings indicate multicultural societies such as Australia, support the integration of Javanese people making their life in Australia and developing unique identities which encompass relevant social and cultural practices and values. This paper will explore participants' perceptions of the aspects of Australian and Javanese culture that facilitated their integration into Australian and Javanese communities, as well as noting factors that act as barriers.*



*Keywords: Cross-cultural marriage, Inter-racial marriage, Australian-Javanese identity, Australian multiculturalism, Cultural hybridism*

## BACKGROUND

The study of identity can make a significant contribution to society as Anthropology refocusses from fixed communities to virtual and peripatetic movements of people (Axford, 2014; Baker-Cottrell, 1973, 1990; Berkowitz-King & Bratter, 2007). To understand how cross-cultural relationships, negotiate and navigate the various hurdles and barriers, we must understand the process people undertake to amalgamate their lives and forge new identities. In this study, I draw on the substantial literature which has arisen from the USA and the UK in the previous millennia reflecting the strong multi-racial makeup of those societies (Baker-Cottrell, 1973; Berkowitz-King & Bratter, 2007; Cheng & Lee, 2009; Crawley, 1998; de Munck & Korotayev, 2007; Fontaine & Dorch, 1980; Cross & Gilly, 2013; Harris & Kalbfleisch, 2000; Jankowiak & Fischer, 1992, Kong, 2012, McFadden, 2001; McFadden & Moore, 2001; Pascoe, 1991, for example). However, in the 21st Century Asian and Australian literature is more helpful in understanding the local context. A significant body of work was undertaken by Carmen Luke and her collaborators in the 1990s (Luke, C, 1994, 2003; Luke & Luke, 1998, 1999; Luke & Carrington, 2000) and which explored identity in offspring of Australian and Asian parents. Since then, Fozdar (with collaborators) has contributed further understanding exploring identity in mixed race (Fozdar, 2011; Fozdar & McGavin, 2017; Fozdar & Perkins, 2014; Fozdar, Wilding, & Hawkins, 2009; Sparrow, 2000). In very recent times, there have been specific contributions about relationships between Indonesians and Australians, most notably Winarnita Doxy (2015; Winarnita & Tanu, 2015) and Ida Bagus (2008) and Bicego (2016) and third culture children in Indonesia (Moore & Barker, 2011; Tanu, 2013).

The task of migration from Indonesia to Australia can be filled with challenges, hopes and fears. When that migration occurs in the context of cross-cultural marriage, the process of negotiation, adaptation and learning a new culture also come to the fore. The success of migration and marriage may be influenced by such things as the individual strengths of each partner in being patient during the long phase of a distance relationship, navigating the complex migration process, and the willingness to accept and adapt religious and cultural practices and beliefs, which may be different to one's own.

Once the Indonesian partner has arrived in Australia, the strength of the marital relationship is influenced by the willingness to accept, negotiate and adapt cultural practices, how well couples can compromise, the level of support from extended family and community and the ability of each member of the partnership to remain focused on making their cross-cultural relationship a success (Safilios-Rothschild, 1969; Hohmann-Marriott & Amato, 2008). As children are added to the family tensions can emerge in relation to raising mixed children (Caballero, Edwards & Puthussery, 2008; Edwards & Caballero, 2008, 2015; Edwards, Caballero & Puthussery, 2010; Crippen & Brew, 2013; Heikkila, & Yeoh, 2011; Lehmillier, Graziano & VanderDrift, 2014; Song, 2017).

In my PhD research, I am investigating the way Javanese people married to white Australians and who live in Australia negotiate day-to-day domestic, familial and social activities in their relationships and how this impacts their identity living in Australia and their relationship to Java. In this case, I use the Anthropological and Sociological definitions, as influenced by Erikson, of identity as encompassing the way a person sees and understands them self as a member of society and their social groups (Leary & Price Tangney, 2003). Following in the footsteps of Cultural Theorist, Stuart Hall, I am particularly focused on learning which cultural customs were retained



by participants in their life in Australia, whether they adapted customs and whether any traditions were abandoned as part of the hybridisation process (Hall, 1994). I am also interested to learn of any new customs acquired, particularly in the context of the broader expat Javanese community and whether the couples' relationship with Java changed as a result, particularly from the viewpoint of the white Australian.

#### OBJECTIVE

This paper/presentation will briefly outline discuss the foundations of identity research and the preliminary findings from the research project exploring some of the salient findings to discuss how people manage the cultural tensions that emerge in their relationships and find their Javanese-Australian identity.

#### DESCRIPTION

In 2018, I interviewed 20 white Australian and Javanese participants, either as a couple or as individuals representing a couple who were residing in Australia. Participants were from all over Australia and were interviewed in person, by telephone or using the video platform, Skype. Interviews were semi-structured with questions that were provided to participants prior to interview and interview lengths varied from approximately 90 minutes to 3 hours, depending upon how much the participants wanted to tell me.

#### FINDINGS

Purpose and snowball sampling was utilised to locate participants who were White-Australian and Javanese couples. Twenty interviews were conducted with couples and individuals across Australia, varying in ages from their 20's to their 80's, with the majority in their 30's and 40's, and who were married for 2 weeks to more than 60 years.

The couples did not necessarily consider their cross-cultural relationship in their daily activities. They were just like other couples – juggling domestic, parenting, professional and family demands. Like many couples, the participants held different expectations of domestic tasks such as cooking, cleaning and child care. For example, deciding who would stay at home to care for babies and children, who would be responsible for the cooking and cleaning, and who would engage in paid employment, or if they both worked outside the home, how they juggled it all. Javanese wives tended to take the initiative for decision making about domestic and family functioning, and often took on traditional responsibilities, although they may have pursued study and/or employment later in the marriage. Australian wives consulted their partners to divide tasks, particularly when she was working outside the home. Some Australian husbands reported that they enjoyed domestic tasks but were happy for their wives to take over though there was usually some negotiation that occurred early in the marriage. Javanese men married to Australian women experienced it differently. Often the Javanese male was required to undertake domestic duties upon arriving in Australia so that their Australian wife would be free to engage in employment and this required some adjustment to the Australian household.

In relation to extended family, Javanese partners in particular, made efforts to embrace their Australian spouse's family and sighted the absence of their own as the main motivation for doing so. But this was not always straight forward. Some couples talked about parents not being supportive of the relationship. This was complex because on the surface it looked like prejudice





but deeper understanding revealed that wiser parents were concerned about the challenges which might emerge. Some parents were in favour of the relationship but were not in favour of their offspring converting to another religion, particularly Javanese. Some Australian parents had particular concerns about converting to a different religion and in a few cases, participants reported defying their parents or having never told them about the conversion. Ironically, many Australian parents had no concerns about religious background which is reflective of the broader Australian view of religion, and is a view which can be concluded to contribute to support the marriage, but conflicts with the view of most Javanese that religion is a central aspect of life. In many cases, Indonesian spouses were wholeheartedly accepted into the extended family and where this occurred, the participants reported settling in more easily which is reflective of the high value Javanese place on family relationships but all couples reported negotiation and the adopting and shedding of practices and beliefs to shape their own version of religious observation.

The issues emerging from their being from different cultures tended to arise in the course of decision making which led to tension and conflict in, which was consistent with research of other Asian and Western couples (Atkeson, 1970; Abassi & Singh, 2006; Bodenmann, Kaiser, & Hahlweg, 1998; Deep, Salleh & Othman, 2017; Heikkila & Yeoh, 2011; Kline, Zhang, Manohar, Ryu, Suzuki & Mustafa, 2012; Rohrlich, 1988; Safilios-Rothschild, 1969; Wilkins & Gareis, 2005). The couples' ability to overcome these issues seemed to boil down to their ability to understand the different ways people deal with conflict. It was often reported that the Javanese partner would shut down emotionally and withdraw, sometimes becoming quite angry and that Australians wanted to openly 'talk it out' and make up. In each case, they reported a deep understanding of one another's cultural mores and demonstrated a strong commitment to working through the issues together. This study did not examine what happens when couples don't work it out and their relationship ends, but anecdotal evidence suggests that some Australian women find it difficult to cope with the Javanese cultural demands and ways of managing communication.

Also interesting, was to explore what is it about the participants that make them so committed to their relationships despite the challenges? And this revealed the 'feel good' part of the research. In every case, the couples viewed their partner's culture as a very positive aspect of their union and spoke in glowing terms about the opportunities to their mixed children. They viewed the cultural and religious customs as very important to their Indonesian-Australian identities, no matter how much or how little they took on those practices. Australian spouses in particular, valued the Javanese traditions and worked hard to incorporate them into their own and their children's experiences which added to their ability to engage with their spouse's family in Java and the expat community in Australia. This supports the research undertaken by Monika Winarnita who found that Australian husbands experienced greater engagement with the Indonesian community when they learnt to speak Bahasa Indonesia, ate Indonesian food and participated in community activities.

Anecdotal observation reveals that sometimes it is difficult for young people to feel comfortable straddling these two divides of their identity. Issues such as being Muslim in predominantly white Anglo societies such as Australia (Luke & Luke, 1999, p223) can be fraught for young people. This was not borne out in my research. I also did not seek to deeply study the identity formation of third space children, that is children of cross-cultural marriages. That is a study domain in its own right and deserves much greater attention than I could give in my thesis.



## CONCLUSION

I came to this study curious to find whether my marriage was different to other Javanese-Australian marriages – whether the types of challenges we experienced were similar to others and how other Australian spouses viewed the rich cultural experiences of their Javanese spouses. All the participants spoke to the challenges of cross-cultural marriage and the need for patience, compromise and an open heart and mind. I was surprised to hear of so many challenges, and heartened to hear that they were indeed similar to my lived experience. This led me to ponder what qualities people who enter such marriages might have. Perhaps one quality that stood out was having a curiosity about the world beyond their doorstep and a high threshold for challenging themselves to new experiences. Australians tended to have a strong affection for Indonesia and many of the participants met their future Javanese spouse whilst working or studying in Indonesia or during a vacation, others met while studying in Australia. Similarly, Australian participants reported a strong affection for Java and a sense of acceptance and belonging. This may be due to the multicultural mix of ethnic groups which form Indonesia and which provide its people with a sense of acceptance and open mindedness about different philosophies of life, including those informed by religion, geographic location and culture. Surprisingly, despite varying levels of engagement with the Indonesian community in Australia, all participants reported a strong interest in raising their children with a solid connection to Indonesia generally and Java specifically, and their heritage and culture. Eating Indonesian foods and learning the Indonesian language were most often cited by parents as being important to pass onto their children. And where couples did not have children, most valued strong links to family and community in Indonesia and continued to visit regularly.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Abassi, A. & Singh, R.N. (2006). 'Assertiveness in Marital Relationships Among Asian Indians in the United States'. *The Family Journal: Counselling and Therapy for Couples and Families*, Vol. 14(4), pp.392-399.
- ABS, (2016). 3310.0 - *Marriages and Divorces, Australia, 2015*. <http://www.abs.gov.au/ausstats/abs@.nsf/mf/3310.0>. Downloaded 10 June 2017.
- Atkeson, P. (1970). 'Building communication in intercultural marriage.' *Psychiatry*, Vol 33(3), pp.396-408.
- Axford, B. (2013). *Theories of Globalisation*. (1st Ed.) Oxford: Wiley.
- Baker Cottrell A. (1973). 'Cross-national marriage as an extension of an international lifestyle: A study of Indian Western couples.' *Journal of Marriage and Family*, Vol. 35(4), pp.739-741.
- Baker Cottrell A. (1990). 'Cross-national marriages: A review of the literature.' *Journal of Comparative Family Studies*, Vol. XX1(2), pp.151-169.
- Berkowitz-King, R. & Bratter, J.L. (2007). 'A path toward interracial marriage: Women's First Partners and Husbands across Racial Lines.' *The Sociological Quarterly*, Vol. 48(2), pp.343-369.



- Bicego, B.L. (2016). *Australian Women in Bali: A Phenomenological Study of Impacts on Lived Experience and Sense of Self*. Doctoral Dissertation, University of Sydney.
- Bodenmann, G., Kaiser, A., & Hahlweg, K. (1998). 'Communication patterns during marital conflict: A cross-cultural replication'. *Personal Relationships*, Vol. 5, pp.343-356.
- Caballero, C., Edwards, R., & Puthussery, S. (2008). *Parenting 'mixed' children: negotiating difference and belonging in mixed race, ethnicity and faith families*. London, UK: South Bank University.
- Cheng, C.Y. & Lee, F. (2009). 'Conflict and distance among multiracial individuals.' *Journal of Social Issues*, Vol. 65 (1), pp. 51–68.
- Crippen, C. & Brew, L. (2013). 'Strategies of cultural adaptation in intercultural parenting.' *The Family Journal: Counseling and Therapy for Couples and Families*, Vol. 21(3), pp.263-271
- Crawley, D. (1998). 'Biracial identity: Mythical or meaningful?' *Transformations*, Vol. 9(2). Downloaded 1st March 2015.
- Deep, S., Salleh, B. M., & Othman, H. (2017). 'Exploring the role of culture in communication conflicts: A qualitative study.' *The Qualitative Report*, 22(4), pp.1186-1198. Retrieved from <http://nsuworks.nova.edu/tqr/vol22/iss4/15>
- de Munck, V.C. & Korotayev, A.V. (2007). 'Wife-husband intimacy and female status in cross-cultural perspective.' *Cross-Cultural Research*, Vol. 41(4), pp.307-335.
- Duncan Owen, J. (2002a). *Mixed Matches: Interracial Marriage in Australia*. UNSW Press: Sydney.
- Duncan Owen, J. (2002b). 'Mixed marriages: Interracial marriage in Australia.' *The Sydney Papers*. Winter volume, pp.177-184.
- Edwards, R. & Caballero, C. (2008). 'What's in a name? An exploration of the significance of personal naming of 'mixed' children for parents from different racial, ethnic and faith backgrounds.' *The Sociological Review*, Vol. 56(1), pp.39-60.
- Edwards, R., & Caballero, C. (2015). 'An exploration of racial considerations in partnered fathers' involvement in bringing up their mixed-/multi-race children in Britain and New Zealand.' *Fathering*, Vol. 13(2), pp.164-181.
- Edwards, R., Caballero, C., & Puthussery, S. (2010). 'Parenting children from 'mixed' racial, ethnic and faith backgrounds.' *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, Vol. 33(6), pp.949-967.
- Fontaine, G. & Dorch, E. (1980). 'Problems and benefits of close intercultural relationships.' *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, Vol. 4, pp.329-337.
- Fozdar, F. & McGavin, K. (2017). "'Mixed race' in the Australo-Pacific Region' in Farida Fozdar & Kirsten McGavin (Eds.) *Mixed Race Identities in Australia, New Zealand and the Pacific Islands*. Routledge: New York.



- Fozdar, F. & Perkins, M. (2014). 'Antipodean mixed race', in Rebecca C. King-O'Riain Stephen Small, Minelle Mahtani, Miri Song & Paul Spickard. (Eds.) *Global Mixed Race*. NYU Press: New York.
- Fozdar, F., Wilding, R., & Hawkins, M. (2009). *Race Relations*. Oxford University Press, South Melbourne.
- Giorgas, D. & Jones, F.L. (2002). 'Intermarriage patterns and social cohesion among first, second and later generation Australians.' *Journal of Population Research*, Vol. 19(1), pp.47—64.
- Gunawan, T. & Yahya, I. (2016). *Footsteps of Indonesians in Victoria (Jejak Langkah Orang Indonesia di Victoria)*. Indonesian Community Association of Victoria Inc.: Melbourne.
- Hall, S. (1994). 'Cultural identity and diaspora'. In P. Williams L. Chrisman (Eds.). *Colonial Discourse and Post-Colonial Theory: A Reader*. London: Harvester Wheatsheaf, pp.222-237.
- Harris, T.M., & Kalbfleisch, P.J. (2000). 'Interracial dating; The implications of race for initiating a romantic relationship.' *Howard Journal of Communications*, Vol. 11(1), pp.49-64.
- Heard, G., Khoo, S.E, & Birrell, B. (2009). *Intermarriage in Australia: Patterns by birthplace, ancestry, religion and indigenous status*. Monash University: Clayton, Vic.
- Heikkila, E.K. & Yeoh, B.S.A. (2011). *International Marriages in the Time of Globalization*. New York, NY: Nova Science Publishers.
- Hohmann-Marriott, B.E. & Amato, P. (2008). 'Relationship quality in interethnic marriages and cohabitations.' *Social Forces*, Vol. 87(2), pp.825-855.
- Ida Bagus, M. (2008). 'Mixed marriages in Jembrana, Bali: Mediation and fragmentation of citizenship and identity in the post-bomb(s) Bali world.' *The Asia Pacific Journal of Anthropology*, Vol. 9(4), pp.346-362.
- Jankowiak, W.R. & Fischer, E.F. (1992). 'A cross-cultural perspective on romantic love.' *Ethnology*, Vol. 31(2), pp.149-155.
- Kline, S.L., Zhang, S., Manohar, U., Ruy, S., Suzuki, T., & Mustafa, H. (2012). 'The role of communication and cultural concepts in expectations about marriage: Comparisons between young adults from six countries.' *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, Vol. 36, pp.319-330.
- Kong, K. (2012). 'Cultural influences on intercultural relationships for women.' *International Proceedings of Economics Development and Research*, Vol. 58, pp.31-36.
- Leary, M.R. & Price Tangney, J. (Eds.) (2003). *Handbook of Self and Identity*. London: Guildford Press.
- Lehmiller, J.J., Graziano, W.G., & VanderDrift, L.E. (2014). 'Peer influence and attraction to interracial romantic relationships.' *Social Sciences*, Vol 3, pp.115-127.



- Luke, C. (1994). 'White women in interracial families; Reflections on hybridization, feminine identities, and racialized othering.' *Feminist Issues*, Fall, pp.49-72.
- Luke, C. & Luke, A. (1998). 'Interracial families: Difference within difference.' *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, Vol. 21(4), pp.728-754.
- Luke, C. & Luke, A. (1999). 'Theorizing interracial families and hybrid identity: An Australian perspective.' *Educational Theory*, Vol 49(2), pp.223-249.
- Luke, C. & Carrington, V. (2000). 'Race Matters'. *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, Vol. 21(1), pp.5-24.
- Luke, C. (2003). 'Glocal mobilities: Crafting identities in interracial families'. *International Journal of Cultural Studies*, Vol. 6(4), pp.379-401.
- McFadden, J. (2001). 'Intercultural marriage and family: Beyond the racial divide.' *The Family Journal: Counseling and Therapy for Couples and Families*, Vol. 9(1), pp.39-42.
- McFadden, J. & Moore, J.L. (2001). 'Intercultural marriage and intimacy: Beyond the continental divide.' *International Journal for the Advancement of Counseling*, Vol. 23, pp.261-268.
- Meyer, M. (2016). *Mixed Families: The Joint Construction of Cultural Identity within Intercultural/Interracial Migrant Families in Australia*. PhD Thesis, University of Western Australia: Perth.
- Meyer, M. & Fozdar, F. (2017). "A mini United Nations': Being mixed in multicultural Australia'. In Farida Fozdar and Kirsten McGavin (Eds.) *Mixed Race Identities in Australia, New Zealand and the Pacific Islands*. Routledge: New York.
- Moore, A. & Barker, G.G. (2011). 'Confused or multicultural: Third culture individuals' cultural identity.' *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, Vol. 36, pp.553-562.
- Pascoe, P. (1991). 'Race, gender, and intercultural relations: The case of interracial marriage.' *Frontiers: A Journal of Women Studies*, Vol. 12(1), pp.-18.
- Penny, J. (1993). *Indonesians in Australia 1947-1986 (Working Paper Series)*, Vol. 84. Centre of Southeast Asian Studies, Monash University: Clayton.
- Penny, J. & Khoo, S. (1996). *Intermarriage: A study of migration and integration*. Bureau of Immigration, Multicultural and Population Research: Canberra.
- Rohrlich, B. (1988). 'Dual-culture marriage and communication.' *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, Vol. 12, pp.35-44.
- Safilios-Rothschild, (1969). 'Family sociology or wives' family sociology? A cross-cultural examination of decision-making.' *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, May, pp.290-301.
- Song, M. (2017). *Multiracial Parents; Mixed Families, Generational Change, and the Future of Race*. New York, NY: NYU Press.



- Sparrow, L. (2000). 'Beyond multicultural man: Complexities of identity.' *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, Vol. 24, pp.173-201.
- Tanu, D. (2013). *Unpacking "Third Culture Kids": The Transnational Lives of Young People at an International School in Indonesia*. PhD Dissertation. Perth, WA: University of Western Australia.
- Wilkins, R. & Gareis, E. (2005). 'Emotion expressions and the locution "I love you": A cross-cultural study.' *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, Vol. 30, pp.51-75.
- Winarnita, M.S. (2007). 'From mail order bride to terrorist strategy: How portrayals of Indonesian Australian marriages affect identity and belonging.' *The International Journal of Diversity in Organisations, Communities and Nations*, Vol. 7(4), pp.209-215.
- Winarnita Doxey, M.S.W. (2007). 'From mail order bride to terrorist strategy: How portrayals of Indonesian Australian marriages affect identity and belonging.' *The International Journal of Diversity in Organisations, Communities and Nations*, Vol. 7(4), pp.209-215.
- Winarnita Doxey, M.S. (2015) 'Australia Indonesia Intimate Relationships: Intercultural Couples, Masculinity and Cultural Fluency,' *Linking People: Connections and encounters between Australians and Indonesians*, Eds. Missbach, A. and Purdey, J., Regiospectra, pp. 231-248
- Winarnita, M.S. (2015). 'The politics and poetics of authenticity: Indonesian migrant women and cultural representation in Perth, Australia'. *Bijdragen Tot De Taal-, Land- En Volkenkunde*, Vol. 171, pp.489-515.
- Winarnita, M.S. & Herriman, N. (2012). 'Caring and family'. *Indonesia and the Malay World*, Vol. 40(118), pp.372-387.

#### MODERNITY AND CULTURAL VALUES IN MINAHASANS SOCIETY

*Vissia Ita Yulianto*

*Universitas Gadjah Mada*

Having strong historical and cultural influence with the Wests, the Christian majority society of Minahasa maintain great dissimilarities with the rest of the Indonesians. Applying multi-sited ethnography, this study questions in what ways do distinct historical, socio-cultural and political situatedness, as well as actors' mental maps of the global world play out in everyday basis? And how are local cultural values are contested in this fast changing of global order?





## The State of Anthropology of Indonesian Education: Critical Reflections on Theories and Methods

Coordinators: Jessica Peng (University of Pennsylvania),

Jenny Zhang (University of California, Berkeley),

& Askuri Ibn Chamim (Indonesian Consortium for Religious Studies)

This panel seeks to reflect on the state of educational anthropology in Indonesia and offer new theoretical and methodological approaches through the discussion of four projects focused on different facets of contemporary educational issues. Upon a brief discussion of the state of the field, Jenny Zhang (University of California-Berkeley) will first discuss her comparative study on the practices, developmental processes, and outcomes of an influential childhood literacy campaign, Literacy Boost, in Kabupaten Belu, NTT, and in Jakarta Utara, DKI Jakarta. Drawing on ethnographic research, discourse analysis, and language socialization frameworks, Zhang will share her findings on the intended and unintended outcomes of the literacy intervention, which include how literacy was framed and assessed in classroom practice; the power dynamics and democratic practices at participating schools; and discipline and constructions of authority, both in classrooms and among adult stakeholders of the program. Second, Askuri Ibn Chamim (Indonesian Consortium for Religious Studies) and Joel Kuipers (George Washington University) will discuss their ongoing study on science education in Islamic schools at the junior high school level. Askuri and Kuipers will describe the unique ethnographic approaches they take to understand processes of student learning, and more specifically how religious motivation links to motivation in learning science. Third, Jessica Peng (University of Pennsylvania) will discuss her research on the “pedagogical labor” that goes into developing an outer island youth labor force under the current administration’s goal of “developing Indonesia from the margins” [membangun Indonesia dari pinggiran]. Through this presentation, Peng will offer ideas about how to approach a study on education outside of schools, drawing on theories of semiotics and social learning. Finally, Valentina Utari (SMERU Research Institute) will present on the RISE Indonesia's ongoing study on pre-service teacher education program. Through engaging with teacher journaling, this team seeks to follow student teachers over the course of two years to understand what shapes teacher identities.

THE DECLINE OF LECTURERS’ CRITICAL CONSCIOUSNESS UNDER NEO-LIBERAL AND NEW MANAGERIALISM  
REGIME IN CAMPUS

*Edi Subkhan*

*Department of Curriculum and Educational Technology, Universitas Negeri Semarang*

The penetration of the neo-liberalization and New Managerialism in most of Indonesia’s higher education lead the institution to run a more market-driven policy. In this case, neoliberalism in higher education has been a major object of criticism for years by few scholars, e.g. Nugroho (2002), Darmaningtyas et al. (2009, 2014), Gaus (2015), Subkhan (2016), dan Sakhiyya (2018). But there is no serious attention given to the implementation of New Managerialism in Indonesia’s higher education despite of it blatant evidences that changed the vision of the higher education, especially state university to be more compatible with lot of neoliberal’s assumptions, e.g. emphasizing on austerity, efficiency, performance, productivity, and accountability.



Besides that, those penetrations might also affect the lecturers, especially their way of thinking to adjust with the new vision of the institution or to resist it. The researcher always meets with some opinion and discourse among lecturers on the campus in which have several tendencies to accept or resist the existing policies. But, it seems that they do not know very well about what the really happen in their institution. Only a few of them try to seek out and criticize the phenomenon and then realized that there was a big power from the inevitable insistence of neoliberalism that changed the campus' vision, cultures, values and direction. So, it is important to identify how neo-liberalization and New Managerialism in higher education shape the lecturers' ways of thinking and its implication on the academic climate within the institution.

By employing phenomenological approach this article tries to describe and analyze critically the lecturers' way of thinking on several issues, i.e. the campus orientations toward internationalization, privatization, standardization and others policies that affect the curriculum, learning process, the roles, rights, responsibilities and ideal types of lecturers and students. The context of this research is in one of the state-funded Teacher College in Central Java Province who has an intention to be recognized as a legal entity state university (PTNBH) and also pursuing an international recognition. The researcher has collected five informants from various departments in order to enrich the perspective and experiences of the lecturers related to the implementation of some neoliberal policies and New Managerialism within the campus.

The researcher found that most of the lecturers agree with the new campus orientation taken for granted, it seems that they lack of critical consciousness on analyzing the issues influenced by neo-liberalization and the hegemony of New Managerialism around them. For instances, certain informants said that they agree with the government policy to compel all of the lecturers to publish their research in an international journal indexed by Scopus. They didn't see any negative side of the policy and didn't know about some criticism from many scholars toward this policy. Most of the informant also said that the obsession of their campus to be labeled as "legal entity state university" is an appropriate strategy to pursue a high-level class of higher education in Indonesia. They didn't know that this orientation is based on some basic assumptions of neoliberalism in which could allow the government to reduce their responsibility to finance public education, including state university.

Moreover, several policies such as the orientation toward research commercialization, teacher training professional program (PPG), the implementation of ISO 9001:2008, international accreditation (i.e. AUN-QA), and the recent issues like the industrial revolution 4.0 and 21<sup>st</sup> century skills also responded by the informant in various perspectives. The system also has a tendency to weaken the critical and political notions of student movement within the institution. Some informants said that the campus doesn't really have good academic and political climate. In the other hand, there were several lecturers whose way of thinking could not be shaped by the existing and dominating power of the system. Few lecturers also feel that there is something wrong with the campus policies, but they lack of language to describe it appropriately and finally, they didn't have any courage to make a change within the system due to their mindset, cultural and political barriers.

Most of the lecturers have been bounded by ageism mindset and culture in which always made them feel uncomfortable if they want to make a radical change or some political action against the existing and dominating power within the campus. This research found that the decline of the lecturer's critical consciousness wasn't only influenced by the penetration of neoliberal and New



Managerialism discourses and policies enacted by the government and university's top management, but also by the old existing culture and values in which tend to preserve the order and seek for harmony than changes.

The lack of critical tradition, the old mindset of the institution as a government's institution, feeling comfortable and safe as lecturers, feeling already having enough knowledge and being a professional lecturer, and also undemocratic controlling system lead by the top management of the university could be the main factors that lead to the decline of the lecturer's critical consciousness. Most of the lecturer's opinion who agreed with some neoliberal and New Managerialism policies on the campus because they didn't know what is neoliberalism and New Managerialism. Moreover, they didn't know because they didn't read about it and they didn't read because they feel already having enough knowledge as a professional lecturer to teach their student, conducting some research and giving some public service to the society.

*Keywords: critical pedagogy; lecturer perspective; neo-liberalism, New Managerialism; Teacher College*

CLOSING THE GAP: EDUCATING MUSLIM GIRLS TO BRING ABOUT SOCIAL CHANGE- LESSONS LEARNT  
FROM INDONESIA

*Farhat Hamid  
University of New South Wales*

The benefits of girls' education are endless as women have the knowledge, capabilities and potential to drive real solutions to the problems facing today's world. Education equips girls not only to become self-reliant and financially independent, but it unlocks their potential to bring about social and global change. Yet, developing countries exhibit considerable gender disparities in education; girls' education has been given little to no attention in almost all developing countries and a wide gap exists in enrolment rates for girls and boys. While this thesis acknowledges that almost all girls of the developing countries are excluded from earning an education, it illustrates how Islamic rhetoric has been used in Muslim majority developing countries to normalize gender disparity in education for Muslim girls of the developing countries. To argue that gender disparity is not a by-product of Islam, this thesis focuses on Indonesia (the largest Muslim dominant country in South East Asia) and how it has made exemplary progress in reducing gender disparity in education within its Islamic context. After its independence, Indonesia focused on building a literate and knowledgeable nation to emerge as a developed nation. Girls' education was recognised and appreciated as a crucial indicator of development. Therefore, Indonesia adopted policies to eliminate gender disparity in education. I highlight and discuss legal frameworks and educational policy reforms as the main drivers of social change in Indonesia. Even though this thesis aims to build a theoretical framework based on lessons learned from Indonesia to reduce gender inequalities in education for Muslim girls, its findings will benefit non-Muslim girls as well.

*Keywords: Indonesia, Gender disparity, Muslim girls, Developing countries.*



LITERACY IN DEVELOPMENT DISCOURSE AND PRACTICE

*Jenny Zhang*

*University of California, Berkeley*

BACKGROUND AND OBJECTIVE

The paper identifies and examines the synergies and discrepancies between the goals of Literacy Boost and the social practices of literacy in two sites in Indonesia. This paper is part of a larger study, which aims to discern the complexities of relationship between literacy and international development at three levels: 1) at the ideological level, by examining how childhood literacy is conceptualized as an absolutely integral component of international development agendas, 2) at the institutional level, by examining how schools, governmental bodies, and non-governmental organizations interpret and implement literacy-related policy and curricula, and 3) at the community and individual level, by considering how these interventions shape and in turn are shaped by schoolchildren, their families, and teachers through everyday practices.

Drawing upon thirteen months of ethnographic fieldwork in Jakarta and Belu, Indonesia, this paper examines the following research questions: How is the Literacy Boost program implemented and then taken up by communities in Indonesia? What processes, contestations, and compromises are entailed in the adaptation of the program by the Save the Children Indonesia Country Office and by field staff in Jakarta and Belu? The paper highlights the ways in which a literacy intervention is co-produced by local field staff, country office advisers, and “Global North” counterparts who dispense technical knowledge and curricular models. Importantly, it considers the roles of members of the recipient communities in the complex negotiations and adaptations entailed in program implementation, and how the literacy curricula were then translated (or not) into classroom practice focusing on literacy instruction.

This paper engages with scholarship on Expert Knowledge and International Development Practice, which takes a critical look at knowledge production processes and international development best practices. In particular, formulations of “calculative practices” (Miller, 2001), expert knowledge (Mitchell, 2002), and “rendering technical” (Li, 2007) – techniques for the translation of abstract, complex social problems into international development plans and concrete practices – are critical to understanding the top-down and bottom-up processes of knowledge production in literacy campaigns. In the Indonesian context, Tsing (2004) and Welker (2014) investigate the tangled, knotty relationships between communities and international actors and the ways in which universal standards and best practices mediate between the global and the local to produce unpredictable outcomes. Similarly, literacy scholars question the ways that assessments, benchmarks, and quantitative measures imply a universal literacy that is objective, scientific, and neutral across cultural and linguistic contexts (Robinson-Pant, 2008; Hamilton, Maddox, and Addey, 2015).

Alongside constructions of literacy by international development practitioners, the research engages with socially embedded accounts of literacy that ask how written forms are received and subsequently appropriated to fit existing local, social concerns. In the Indonesian context, scholars have highlighted the unstable relationships between text and authority, underscoring individuals’ subjective and situated experiences of interacting with writing, narratives, and semiotic systems (Rutherford, 2000; Florida, 1995; Rodgers, 1993).



Building upon these accounts that problematize deterministic definitions of literacy, this study investigates the sites of tension in a contemporary literacy intervention and incorporates the dynamic relationships between individuals, communities, and international development actors and organizations. By drawing upon language socialization research and analytic methods (Garrett and Baquedano-López, 2002; Sterponi, 2011; Duranti, Ochs and Schieffelin eds., 2012; and García Sánchez, 2014), the research underscores the ways in which a standardized literacy intervention reproduces and disrupts existing modes of knowledge acquisition and group socialization. Through a through examination of local educational conditions, literacy practices, and textual traditions, this study aims to place the local within pervasive, and indeed persuasive, international development discourses.

## DESCRIPTION

The dissertation draws on data collected during thirteen months of fieldwork (July 2016 – August 2017) in Jakarta and Belu, Indonesia. Extensive fieldnotes from participant observations, audio and video recordings of key activities (notably classroom lessons, teacher training sessions, and Reading Camps), pedagogic, policy, and planning documents, and over 80 semi-structured, in-depth interviews with parents, school administrators, teachers, and Save the Children staff comprise the data corpus.

To understand how literacy is conceptualized and operationalized by international development practitioners in the field, I collected Literacy Boost program documents, including curricula and other pedagogic materials, training manuals, monthly field office reports, monitoring and evaluations reports, and Literacy Boost programming documents. As such, Save the Children's own data, gathered through surveys, previous qualitative research, and assessments, are important sources of data for the current study. Field notes and audio and video recordings were gathered from observations at teacher training sessions and Literacy Boost public presentations (for example, to the Indonesian Ministry of Education and Culture). I also conducted 25 in-depth, semi-structured interviews with staff members at all levels of the organization: local/field office, country office, and international office. Finally, I did participant observation at the Save the Children field offices, observing the day-to-day activities of the staff.

In tandem with the focus on Save the Children Literacy Boost staffer's (as one community of practitioners), I conducted intensive ethnographic research at the two Literacy Boost implementation sites in Jakarta and Belu in 2016-17. In order to enrich understandings of how literacy development plans and bodies of knowledge are received, appropriated, and practiced, I systematically sought to include multiple voices and experiences of the Literacy Boost program participants. Over 60 interviews with staff, teachers, principals/administrators, parents, and community members allowed me to trace gaps between plans and implementation of the Literacy Boost program across the two research sites. At each school site, I conducted two months of daily classroom observations at the early grade levels in order to gain a broad perspective on early grade teaching and learning processes. During these classroom sessions, I also gathered textual artifacts from the schools, such as reading and writing lesson plans and samples of student writing. I also observed ten times at the Literacy Boost after-school Reading Camp.

## FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

The findings are organized into the following three strands: 1. Cultural adaptations (in which the Literacy Boost modules are made local, along the various scales of Indonesia, region, and even



school); 2. Linguistic adaptations (in which the Literacy Boost assessment and literacy curriculum as articulated in teacher training modules are made to fit Indonesian language, as well as further modifications based on multilingual contexts – of particular pertinence in Belu, Indonesia); and 3. Discursive adaptations (in which the mode of presenting materials and communicating directives are adapted along the implementation chain).

The cultural and linguistic adaptations were among the most discussed by the Literacy Boost staffers in teacher training sessions, and even leading up to the launch of new project sites. The chain of translations encountered a blockage, however, when it came to teachers' uptake of cultural translations. Though teachers *did* conduct everyday translations (linguistically and culturally) of all kinds of curricular material, the vast majority of teachers still had difficulty in adapting Literacy Boost activities to local languages, a context of multilingualism, and in using local materials and practices for those Literacy Boost activities.

The conclusions from this paper bear implication for Literacy Boost's implementation in Indonesia, in its current and future program sites. More broadly, this paper advances understandings of the relationship between literacy and international development processes, which can contribute to the better design, contextualization, and implementation of literacy initiatives globally.

*Keywords: literacy, international development, translation, multilingualism*

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Duranti, A., Ochs, E., & Schieffelin, B. (2012). *The handbook of language socialization*. Malden, MA; Wiley-Blackwell.
- García, G.E. and Pearson, P.D. (1991). *Literacy Assessment in a Diverse Society. Technical Report No. 525*. Illinois Univ., Urbana: Center for the Study of Reading.
- Garrett, P. and Baquedano-López, P. (2002). Language Socialization: Reproduction and Continuity, Transformation and Change. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 31, 339-361.
- Hamilton, M., Maddox, B., and Addey, C. (Eds.). (2015). *Literacy as Numbers: Researching the Politics and Practices of International Literacy Assessment*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Li, T. (2007). *The Will to Improve: Governmentality, Development, and the Practice of Politics*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Miller, P. (2001). Governing by numbers: why calculative practices matter. *Social research*, 68(2), 379-396.
- Mitchell, T. (2002). *Rule of Experts: Egypt, Techno-Politics, Modernity*. Berkeley and Los Angeles, CA: University of California Press.
- Robinson-Pant, A. (2008). Why Literacy Matters: Exploring A Policy Perspective on Literacies, Identities, and Social Change. *Journal of Development Studies*, 44(6), 779-796.
- Rodgers, S. (1993). Folklore with a Vengeance: A Sumatran Literature of Resistance in the Colonial Indies and New Order Indonesia. *Journal of American Folklore*, 116, 129-158.





- Rutherford, D. (2000). The White Edge of the Margin: Textuality and Authority in Biak, Irian Jaya, Indonesia. *American Ethnologist*, 27(2), 312-339.
- Schieffelin, B. and Gilmore, P. (Eds.) (1986). *The Acquisition of Literacy: Ethnographic Perspectives*. Norwood, NJ: Ablex Publishing Corporation.
- Sterponi, L. (2011). Literacy socialization. In A. Duranti, E. Ochs, & B.B. Schieffelin (Eds.), *Handbook of language socialization* (pp. 227-246). Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Street, B. (2002). *Literacy and Development: Ethnographic Perspectives*. London: Routledge.
- Tsing, A. (2004). *Friction: An Ethnography of Global Connection*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Winkel, H. and Widjaja, V. (2007). Phonological awareness, letter knowledge, and literacy development in Indonesian beginner readers and spellers. In *Applied Psycholinguistics*, 28, 23-45.

THE PEDAGOGICAL LABOR OF “DEVELOPMENT FROM THE MARGINS”:  
EDUCATION, LABOR, AND INFRASTRUCTURES IN INDONESIA

Jessica Peng

University of Pennsylvania

## BACKGROUND

In light of one of this panel’s key goal to offer theoretical and methodological considerations to the development of anthropology of education within the Indonesian context, this paper centralizes one of the core tensions in the subfield by asking: how do we define “education” and what, in turn, “counts” as objects of study for anthropologists of education?

In the United States, “education” is increasingly equated with “schooling,” despite the fact that many anthropologists of education have shown that schooling is only a subset of the education that occurs in everyday life (Pollock & Levinson 2011; Varenne 2008). An overarching goal of this paper is thus to denaturalize this association and offer one approach to anthropologically study processes of education outside of the context of schooling. I ground this discussion in a working concept that I have termed “pedagogical labor” in my research on infrastructures, education, and labor in contemporary Indonesia. First, I describe the research context and questions within which this concept is situated. Next, I discuss the two bodies of literatures that this concept is built upon: (1) the social practice theory of learning and (2) phatic labor and the social infrastructures of communicative channels.

### *Research Context*

Since 2014, the Indonesian central government has engaged in ongoing efforts to “develop Indonesia from the margins” (*membangun Indonesia dari pinggiran*), a national development motto that centralizes the longstanding issue of regional disparities between the core island of Java, where most of the country’s population and economic activities are concentrated, and the small islands of its historically marginalized eastern periphery. In an effort to stimulate economic



growth in outer-Indonesia, the government has identified key “economic potentials” (*potensi ekonomi*) for sectoral development across the eastern provinces. The government has additionally sought to invest in “connectivity infrastructures” (*infrastruktur konektivitas*) in the forms of inter-island transportation systems, regional development growth centers, and the expansion of the digital economy.

Despite recognizing the existence of high economic potentials at Indonesia’s margins, however, development experts have identified a severe education-to-workforce skills gap in the country’s outer islands, where the quality of education consistently ranks lowest (World Bank 2014). They further cite studies that suggest working-age youth are moving away from the peripheries and toward Indonesia’s center (Malamassam 2016). The government’s goal of “develop[ing] Indonesia from the margins,” these experts conclude, can only be met if education quality improves in the outer islands; *and* if “educated” and “skilled” outer-Indonesian youth are enticed to remain at and provide labor within their own “peripheral” communities. These technocratic concerns are being heard at the top. Re-elected president, Joko Widodo, has widely stated that the main focus of his second term will be human resource development (*sumber daya manusia* or *SDM*). “Infrastructure is already running [and] can be left (alone),” he has been quoted saying, “we are shifting to human resource development” (Kompas 2019).

In light of these issues, my research seeks to understand how an “educated” and “skilled” labor force is being produced at the margins of Indonesia. This inquiry is notably less concerned with the process through which formal training and preparation of an objectively more educated and skilled labor pool is taking place than with the everyday social and semiotic practices that go into making workforce “at the margins” legible and investible. By calling this everyday work “pedagogical labor,” I seek to draw specific attention to the ways in which teachings about what outer-Indonesia is, could, or even should be is both ubiquitous and essential to workings of the economic endeavors of “developing Indonesia from the margins.”

#### *Conceptualizing “Pedagogical Labor”*

Two bodies of literature centrally inform my theorization of “pedagogical labor”: (1) social practice theory of learning (Lave 1996, 2009); and (2) emergent theories on social infrastructures (Elyachar 2010).

First, I draw on the social practice theory of learning whereby learning (and by extension teaching and education) are considered ubiquitous in everyday activities. This theory of learning has grown out of a group of anthropologically-trained education scholars’ felt need to challenge cognitive theories of learning which dominate the field of education. Against the dominant understanding of learning as an individual process of knowledge acquisition that takes place in the minds of learners and in the decontextualized settings of schools, scholars of social practice theory of learning argued that there is no distinct process of “learning” but only changing participation in the culturally designed settings of everyday life (McDermott 1993; Lave 2009). In the words of Lave (1996), “wherever people engage for substantial periods of time, day by day, in doing things in which their ongoing activities are interdependent, learning is part of their changing participation in changing practices” (150). This body of work has pushed a subset of educational studies to move beyond the boundaries of schools to consider how students of various kinds learn through participating in everyday life. It has also pushed researchers to focus on mundane practices and relations among person, activity, and situation.



A second key body of literature that my theoretical framing of “pedagogical labor” draws on is Elyachar’s (2010) recent work on “phatic labor,” social infrastructures of communicative channels, and the economy. Within the context of Cairo, she shows that everyday communicative practices of sociality between Cairene women, resembling what Malinowski (1936) had once observed and termed as “phatic communion,” transmitted information loaded with economic value that crucially shaped how men in their communities pursued economic decisions. Given this observation, Elyachar argues for the need to incorporate these forms of everyday, “phatic” talk between women into our understandings of the economy. Specifically, she argues that through their everyday “phatic labor,” women are producing a network of communicative channels that function as a social infrastructure upon which more classic forms of economic activities can take place. These social infrastructures, she contends, are as essential to the economy as physical infrastructures like roads, bridges, or telephone lines.

Bringing these two bodies of literature together in my research on education and workforce development at the margins of Indonesia, I find immense productivity in the concept of “pedagogical labor.” Through the lens of social practice theory of learning, the kinds of educational processes that I am interested in are those that involve people of any age learning and teaching others to organize behavior in any social setting (Pollock & Levinson 2011). The “pedagogy” employed to build an “educated” and “skilled” labor force at Indonesia’s margins is thus understood to take place far beyond the confines of the school; it is instead made up of everyday practices of numerous individuals in various settings who all carry out the educational work of “developing Indonesia from the margins.” Then to consider Elyachar’s (2010) discussion of the relationship between “phatic labor,” social infrastructures, and the economy, I am additionally interested in the ways in which these mundane pedagogical activities shape outcomes of the economy, specifically those relating to the workforce. To understand how an “educated” and “skilled” workforce is being built at the margins of Indonesia, I turn to the questions: How do different social actors at national and local levels engage in daily practices that recast the role of outer-Indonesia in the nation’s development? What social ideas about the margins (*pinggiran*) and its human resource (*sumber daya manusia*) emerge from these activities? What material effects result from people’s subsequent uptake of these social ideas?

*Keywords: “pedagogical labor”; social practice theory of learning; social infrastructure; outer-Indonesia*

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Elyachar, Julia. 2010. “Phatic Labor, Infrastructure, and the Question of Empowerment in Cairo.” *American Ethnologist* 37 (3): 452-464.
- Lave, Jean. 1996. “Teaching, as Learning, in Practice.” *Mind, Culture, and Activity* 3(3): 149-164.
- Lave, Jean. 2009. “The Practice of Learning.” In *Contemporary Theories of Learning: Learning Theorists ... In Their Own Words*, edited by K. Illeris, 200-208. New York, NY: Routledge.
- McDermott, Ray. 1993. “The Acquisition of a Child by a Learning Disability.” In *Understanding Practice: Perspectives on Activity and Context*, edited by S. Chaiklin and J. Lave, 269-305. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.



- Malamassam, Meirina Ayumi. 2016. "Youth Migration in Indonesia: Decision to Move and to Choose Destination Areas." *Indonesian Journal of Geography* 48 (1): 62-71.
- Malinowski, Bronislaw. 1936 [1923]. "The Problem of Meaning in Primitive Language. In *The meaning of Meaning*, edited by C. K. Ogden and A. I. Richards, 296-336. New York: Harcourt, Brace.
- Pollock, Mica, and Bradley A. U. Levinson. 2011. "Introduction." In *A Companion to the Anthropology of Education*, edited by B. A.U. Levinson and M. Pollock, 1-8. Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Prabowo, Dani. 2019. "Setelah Infrastruktur, Jokowi akan Fokus Kembangkan SDM." *Kompas.com* website, March 31. Accessed June 26, 2019. <https://properti.kompas.com/read/2019/03/31/132251021/setelah-infrastruktur-jokowi-akan-fokus-kembangkan-sdm>.
- Varenne, Herve. 2008. "Culture, Education, Anthropology." *Anthropology & Education Quarterly* 39 (4): 356-368.

AN ETHNOGRAPHIC AND LINGUISTIC ANALYSIS OF SCIENCE EDUCATION IN ISLAMIC SCHOOLS  
IN THREE JAVANESE REGENCIES: A PRELIMINARY REPORT

Joel C. Kuipers

George Washington University

Askuri

UNISA Yogyakarta

According to the TIMSS survey in 2011, Indonesia is one of the countries with the lowest level of scientific literacy in the world. Even though Indonesia's economic growth continues to be robust (between 5-7% per year) and reading skills for both boys and girls are nearly 100%, in mathematics and science, Indonesia ranks near the bottom. Among the poorest performers are students in traditional, and underresourced, Islamic boarding schools or *pesantren*.

Islamic education in Indonesia has a long and complex relationship to science. While some of the earliest scientific discoveries were made by Muslims, many Indonesian Muslims adhere to a variety of Islam that does not regard scientific learning as obligatory. In the last 15 years, however, in an effort to better serve their students, increasing numbers of Islamic schools in Indonesia have adopted some or all of the national curriculum, a move that requires the teaching of science to all students.

This paper reports on preliminary results of a 3 year, National Academy of Science-funded experimental study of an innovative, Islamic themed curriculum unit implemented in 18 Islamic schools in three regions in Java (Yogyakarta, Malang and Lamongan). Ethnographic video, interview and achievement data were compared with Islamic schools receiving the "standard fare" science curriculum units. The results provide not only valuable quantitative information, but also an interesting and rare glimpse of student experience in a world that remains poorly understood. By examining transcriptions of video and audio data of actual student interactions in classrooms, we compare these with recordings of more traditional modes of Islamic pedagogy and evaluate their implications for an understanding of Indonesian Islamic education.



LEARNING (TO USE) THE LANGUAGES OF BEING YOUTHS AND BECOMING ADULTS: REFLECTIONS ON RESEARCH  
IN VOCATIONAL HIGH SCHOOLS IN CENTRAL JAVA

*Kristian Tamtomo*

*Department of Sociology Universitas Atma Jaya Yogyakarta*

*Reflecting on data collected from research in 2012-2013, I seek to discuss the multiple ways in which youths as students use multiple languages in their processes of learning and socializing within an educational institution. Using the notion that there are orders of indexical or social meanings of language, I argue that there are multiple orders of multiple language use present in vocational high schools. These orders can be emergent from student interaction and the practical/work-oriented purposes of vocational training or they can be instated by the institution of language classes in vocational high schools. While the institutional side of vocational high schools demands monolingual competence in multiple languages, paying ethnographic attention to actual language use points to a polylingual and translingual norm of communication. Here, the use of linguistic features from multiple languages to fulfill social communicative purposes is pragmatically more salient for participants than full competence in multiple languages. In both their peer group communication of “being youth” and their vocational training of “becoming adults”, students alternate between the multiple footings afforded by the indexical meanings they associate with Javanese, Indonesian and English. Instead of using a certain form of youth language, I show that students have a polycentric orientation to multiple social meanings of locality, tradition, nationalism, lifestyle and global connections in their polylingual and translingual uses of Javanese, Indonesian and English. Being youths and learning to become adults in 21<sup>st</sup> century Java is thus inherently multilingual, although with differences between institutional definitions and interactional practice, differences that tend to be put under erasure through various language ideological techniques and institutional power relations.*

*Keywords: youth language, order of indexicality, multilingualism, vocational education, language ideology*

## INTRODUCTION

Formal education in Indonesia is generally multilingual, particularly at the secondary level. Language classes in secondary schools focus on three language categories: local, national, and foreign or global. As Zentz (2014:240) reports, the slogan on language learning from the Indonesian Ministry of Education states that “citizens are to ‘love’ their local languages; ‘use’ their national language, Indonesian; and ‘study’ foreign languages, with extra emphasis on English.” In the case of Central Java, the main local language that high schools teach is Javanese. Like other provinces, however, the other main language classes are Indonesian, as the national language, and English, as the main foreign language. Both Indonesian and English are also the main language subjects that are present in the end of high school national examinations (*Ujian Nasional*).

Vocational high schools represent a unique case in the use of multiple languages in Indonesian secondary education. With its orientation towards producing ready-for-work graduates (Newhouse and Suryadarma 2011), vocational high schools present dual demands of using languages for youths as students in their process of becoming adults through vocational training. The first demand is the practical/pragmatic demands of following globalized industry practices in the use of technical/industry registers that combine linguistic features of English and Indonesian, while also including Javanese as part of the practical learning interaction in vocational classrooms.



The second demand is the state-backed institutional requirement for students to be monolingually competent in Javanese, Indonesian, and English (Nababan 1991; Darjowidjojo 1998). In parallel, students also use multiple languages in their popular or youth culture communicative practices of being youth (Smith-Hefner 2007; Djenar 2012).

This study seeks to investigate the different institutional demands on language use and learning as well as the popular culture communicative practices of students as constituting differing orders of socially meaningful (i.e. socially indexical) forms of language use. These differing orders also represent different levels/scales of social space and interaction, from local, national, and global, thus making vocational high schools a globalized sociolinguistic space (Blommaert 2010). In discussing the way students navigate the “push and pull” (Blommaert 2010:42) of these different orders and scales of social language use, this study contributes to the understanding of the sociolinguistic process of education, the notion of multilingualism, and the role of language in globalization.

#### CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

The mainstream (academic and public) notion of multilingualism often defines it based on linguistic competence (Edwards 2009:248), with an implicit implication that multilingualism consists of “multiple monolingualisms” (Juffermans 2011:166). In contrast, this paper adopts a practice-based notion of language (Hanks 1996) that emphasizes the use of linguistic features from multiple languages for the social purposes of communication, regardless of competence, as the foundation of multilingualism (Jorgensen 2008). This aligns with recent notions of multilingualism that emphasize it as forms of crossing, fluidity, and mixing across language boundaries (see Rampton 2005 on language crossing, Jorgensen 2008 on polylingualism, Otsuji & Pennycook 2010 on metrolingualism). This new perspective on multilingualism emphasizes more the social/indexical and communicative meanings in the use of multiple language forms by language users. Hence, I will use ‘register’ (Agha 2005) as more functional concept that connects these forms of language use to certain social types and domains. These social forms are internally ordered through norms of practice such as ‘interactional or language regimes’ (Blommaert, Collins & Slembrouck 2005). Moreover, this new perspective on multilingualism is an inherently ‘language ideological’ perspective (Schieffelin, Woolard & Kroskrity 1998), attuned to the social, cultural, and political evaluations of language forms. A further implication, due to the post-structuralist underpinnings of the language ideological perspective, is that the social meanings of registers are often hierarchically ordered based on stratified evaluations and unequal distribution of repertoires, i.e. ‘orders of indexicality’ (Blommaert 2007a). Likewise, different registers may also access/enact hierarchical scopes/levels of social space, i.e. ‘sociolinguistic scales’ (Blommaert 2007b). Within multilingual and globalized contexts, such as vocational high schools, language users can thus have ‘polycentric’ (Blommaert 2007a) orientations towards numerous registers and their attendant norms and orders of evaluation and scope. The potential tensions arising from the push and pull of different registers, however, can often be put under ‘erasure’ (Irvine & Gal 2000) to mask contradictions with the dominant language ideological order.

#### *Differing orders of multilingually being youths and becoming adults*

The findings of this study are based on ethnographic fieldwork in two state vocational high schools (*sekolah menengah kejuruan negeri – SMKN*) in Semarang, Central Java, from mid-2012 to mid-2013 (Tamtomo 2016). In the two locations, I did participant observations, interviews, and documentations of student and school texts. I focused mainly on students’ extra-curricular





activities but also observed classes and interviewed teachers. The study findings point to a number of orders of indexicality operating within these vocational high schools.

The first and most ideologically visible (and informant reported) order of indexicality is the state-backed institutional multilingualism, most clearly exhibited in the main language classes taught in both schools. In teaching Javanese, Indonesian, and English, vocational high schools refer to the government curriculum (both national and regional) that demands monolingual competence in these multiple languages, often based on a standard or culturally dominant variety (as in the case of *krama* Javanese). The curriculum also reflects an implicit hierarchical ordering of languages, with Indonesian and English playing instrumental functions for knowledge transfer, economic opportunity and cosmopolitan engagement (Darjowidjojo 1998; Nababan 1991), while Javanese functions to maintain local scales of tradition. In these classes, any language mixing is put under erasure by the teacher's demand for a monolingual end product. However, the degree of tolerance for language mixing and the ability to demand monolingualism differs between language classes, highlighting the gap between participants' repertoires and institutional demands, with the Indonesian class having the strictest monolingual standard, while the Javanese and English classes have more tolerance for grammatical mistakes and the use of other languages. Institutional multilingualism nonetheless represents the dominant idea in vocational high schools on both the notion of multilingualism and the monolingual standard of each language.

The second order of indexicality is the practical multilingualism of the 'productive' classes where students learn the technical skills of their respective vocational programs. This practical multilingualism operates using a 'polylingual' norm (Jorgensen 2008), in which speakers combine features from multiple languages to meet communicative purposes without requiring monolingual competence in all the languages involved. Written texts combine the use of English technical terms with broader Indonesian narration, often reproducing the multilingual practice of prominent multinational companies in their vocational fields. While Javanese is absent from these texts, it emerges and is tolerated in verbal interaction and instructions, functioning as a way to further vernacularize this practical multilingualism. In these productive classes, students are thus learning the specific technical register of their vocational field, a technical register that can combine features from multiple languages without necessarily requiring standard monolingual competence.

Running parallel to the two school-sourced orders is the third interactional order of indexicality based on the way students use languages to communicate among themselves. This interactional order exhibits norms of language mixing, hybridity, and fluidity in which students combine linguistic features from Javanese, Indonesian and English for their social communicative purposes in both speech and writing. In their spoken communication, students primarily combine Javanese and Indonesian in a bilingual register. However, we can still see the influence of the dominant institutional multilingualism in the way students use code switching to perform changes in footing for discourse and social identity oriented purposes. For example, students predominantly use Javanese for interpersonal scales of interaction. They then switch to a predominant use of Indonesian to change footing to an official or group/forum scale of interaction. This ordered hierarchy of scales is also exhibited in their written communication, with official texts predominantly being in Indonesia while informal texts increasingly feature mixing, hybridity and the playful use of Javanese, Indonesian, and English. For the students, these hybrid practices of language use do not necessarily pose as contradictions to the dominant institutional multilingualism. While students often use these hybrid practices as forms of scaffolding in their



learning interaction, they often compartmentalize or put these practices under erasure in the face of the dominant institutional language ideology.

## CONCLUSION

Being youths and learning to become adults through language use in vocational high school in Central Java is about being able to use multiple registers or social forms of language while also navigating their attendant language ideologies (interactional regimes, orders of indexicality, and scale). In learning to become state-acceptable adults, students learn registers associated with the ideal monolingual standard of Javanese, Indonesian, and English. In learning to become job-ready adults, students learn practical and technical registers that often combine these languages for the purpose of (and as a part of) learning how to perform vocational skills. At the same time, students as youths are also engaged in playful mixing of languages in their popular culture practices. Hence, students are learning to have a repertoire that consists of a continuum between standard monolingualism in multiple languages to playful polylingual mixing of multiple languages. This presents a 'superdiverse' (Blommaert & Rampton 2011) notion of multilingualism of vocational high schools as a globalized sociolinguistic field.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Agha, Asif. 2005. Voice, footing, enregisterment. *Journal of Linguistic Anthropology* 15:38-59.
- Blommaert, Jan & Ben Rampton. 2011. Language and superdiversity. *Diversities* 13(2): 1-21.
- Blommaert, Jan, James Collins & Slef Slembrouck. 2005. Polycentricity and interactional regimes in global neighborhoods. *Ethnography* 6(2): 205-235.
- Blommaert, Jan. 2007a. Sociolinguistics and discourse analysis: Orders of indexicality and polycentricity. *Journal of Multicultural Discourses* 2(2):115-130.
- Blommaert, Jan. 2007b. Sociolinguistic scales. *Intercultural Pragmatics* 4(1):1-19.
- Blommaert, Jan. 2010. *The sociolinguistics of globalization*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Darjowidjojo, Soenjono. 1998. Strategies for a successful national language policy: the Indonesian case. *International Journal of the Sociology of Language* 130:35-47.
- Djenar, Dwi N. 2012. "Almost unbridled: Indonesian youth language and its critics." *South East Asia Research* 20 (1):35-51.
- Edwards, John. 2009. *Language and identity: An introduction*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hanks, William F. 1996. *Language and communicative practices*. Boulder: Westview Press.
- Irvine, Judith & Susan Gal. 2000. Language ideology and linguistic differentiation. In Paul Kroskrity (ed.), *Regimes of language: Ideologies, politics, and identities*, pp. 35-83. Santa Fe: School of American Research Press.



- Jorgensen, J. Normann. 2008. Polylingual languaging around and among children and adolescents. *International Journal of Multilingualism* 5(3):161-176.
- Juffermans, Kasper. 2011. The oldman and the letter: Repertoires of literacy and languaging in a modern multiethnic Gambian village. *Compare* 41(2):165-179.
- Nababan, P. W. J. 1991. Language in education: The case of Indonesia. *International Review of Education* 37(1):115-131.
- Newhouse, David and Daniel Suryadarma. 2011. The value of vocational education: High school type and labor market outcomes in Indonesia. *The World Bank Economic Review* 25(2):296-322.
- Otsuji, Emi & Alastair Pennycook. 2010. Metrolingualism: Fixity, fluidity and language in flux. *International Journal of Multilingualism* 7(3):240-254.
- Rampton, Ben. 2005. *Crossing: Language and ethnicity among adolescents*. Manchester: St. Jerome Publishing.
- Schieffelin, Bambi, Kathryn Woolard & Paul Kroskrity (eds). 1998. *Language ideologies: Practice and theory*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Smith-Hefner, Nancy. 2007. Youth language, *gaul* sociability, and the new Indonesian middle class. *Journal of Linguistic Anthropology* 17(2):184-203.
- Tamtomo, Kristian. 2016. *The push and pull of language ideologies: Multilingual communicative practices among youth in an Indonesian city*. Unpublished dissertation. Albany: University at Albany, State University of New York.
- Zentz, Lauren. 2014. "Love" the local, "use" the national, "study" the foreign: Shifting Javanese language ecologies in (post-)modernity, postcoloniality, and globalization. *Journal of Linguistic Anthropology* 24(3):339-359.

STATE EDUCATION AND THE FUNNEL EFFECT: CHANGING DYNAMICS IN GAMELAN MUSIC LEARNING

Roberto Rizzo

University of Milan – Bicocca

*The role of state-sponsored institutions in the transmission of gamelan music knowledge in Java has been widely observed in the context of the great transition from being a matter of oral transmission and the social ties it entailed to a study program relying on writing and on the state apparatus. While the role of the educational institutions – notably the network of art academies Institut Seni Indonesia – has been framed largely in ethnomusicological terms, little has been said as of yet of the consequences it triggered sociologically. A few of the most historically-conscious contributions debating the recent developments of Javanese gamelan music have suggested an interpretative key which supported either a modernization paradigm or a transformation-incontinuity model, as formulated most recently by the work of Rachel Hand. Although both perspectives can provide important insights in the way socio-cultural change unfolds, the ethnography I sketch here offers a more nuanced viewpoint.*



*Therefore, the aim of this contribution is to shed light on the changing connotations of expertise and professionalism that the educational institution has brought about over the Twentieth century in which both elements of rupture and continuity can be identified, but in a quite different fashion than what anticipated by previous observers. Institutionalization participates in this process not as much in democratizing the access to formal music knowledge but rather in funneling along socio-economic lines pre-existing pathways to professional musicianship. I intend to do this by drawing on a period of fieldwork undertaken at ISI Surakarta in 2017, grounding the observations to follow on interviews, fieldnotes and literature review.*

*Keywords: Javanese gamelan; modernisation theory; education; knowledge transmission; ethnomusicology*

## INTRODUCTION

Javanese gamelan music has undergone substantial changes over the course of the last century. One of the most notable developments has been the drastic alteration of its once family- and neighbourhood-based form of knowledge transmission. The formation of the art academies (Institut Seni Indonesia – ISI) has gradually replaced the neighbourhood as the authoritative vehicle of knowledge transmission in Java, creating on the way not only new theoretical apparatuses and music hybrids supported by academic curricula, but also new sociological configurations in the access to the art form at large. While these state-sponsored institutions then have helped in keeping the renown music tradition from disappearing under the pressure of urbanization and mass-mediatic forms of entertainment, they have also altered the wider context in which gamelan music is learned and experienced in significant ways.

Previous observers have tended to frame this move through the trope of “modernisation theory”, drawing implicitly on the writings of Max Weber (1946). Accordingly, the advent of a monolithic notion of modernity was seen as intrinsically disruptive in its erasure of “tradition”, yet inevitable on the path to progress. The writings of Judith Becker, one of the most prominent and prolific scholars of gamelan music (see especially Becker 1980) can be contextualized within this strand of theory too. The recent works of, among others, Benamou (2010) and Hand (2018) have tacitly complicated this narrative, the former by reflecting on the enduring potency of *rasa* as an experiential and formational tool in gamelan music, the latter by pointing at the continuity between the family and the academic contexts as both learning “institutions”.

In this contribution I try to show how the purported avant-garde of modernisation (engendered by the academic institution, in this instance) may act in a less deterministic way, yet without dismissing the change it entails. I do so by focussing on the institutionalization process as articulated in the context of ISI Surakarta, which may shed a more encompassing light on the non-*kraton* professionalization of gamelan musicians and on the dynamics underlying the global phenomenon of degree education at large.

## ON METHODOLOGY

The observations of this contribution are the result of a ten-month ethnographic fieldwork in the city of Surakarta. Theoretically, it is informed by the anthropological literature on phenomenology, post-colonial studies and discursive analysis. Both participant observation in the classrooms of ISI Surakarta and interviews were used, as well as quantitative data in the form of



an online survey. Part of this material was also used for my larger M.A. work on gamelan music education “Playing with Culture”.

*From the kraton to the academia, via radio broadcasting. Institutionalizing gamelan music.*

In this section I reconstruct the history of the transition of gamelan music's imaginary centre of authority from the *kratons* to the academic institutions. This move, I argue, has its roots in the erosion of political power of the courts of Central Java as a result of pressing colonial dominance. Subsequently, the *kratons* invested greater energy in the arts, often in competition with each other. At the same time, they absorbed crucial influences from Europe, including the notion of “classical music” and of written notation as a tool for decoding and transmitting a music repertoire (cfr. Goody 2000). This more “portable” version of gamelan music, together with the urge to showcase royal artistic sophistication, merged with the appearance of radio broadcasting. The solonese royal family of Mangkunegara was one of the most opulent sponsors of gamelan radio shows. As the Dutch network of radio stations was taken over by the nationalist Radio Republik Indonesia, the bulk of pre-existing radio formats was kept intact, including the gamelan radio shows, with the major difference that now they reached well beyond the confines of Central Java (Puguh 2017).

The important sea changes that this transition points to, I argue, is a socio-economic one. That is, for the first time, the most competent and respected musicians could count on a comparable alternative source of income for livelihood, provided by government salaries. While this did not result into a desertion of the court performances, a viable and profitable alternative was now nonetheless available to technically proficient musicians. This alternative began to gradually trigger that emancipation and that uprooting necessary for individual economic mobility, which was paramount as music expertise began to migrate to the other institution being founded almost simultaneously to the state-run radio network: the music academy.

*Is ISI reshuffling music expertise?*

In this part, after revising the genesis of Institut Seni Surakarta and briefly describing its curriculum, I pause on the loop generated by the granting of academic degrees and the re-incorporation of the ISI graduates into its own staff. Although court performances were still kept in high regard, and many ISI teachers keep gravitating around the *kraton* to this day, the career opportunities and the comfort of a regular government salary elevated the status of ISI not only as a more desirable learning and working environment, but also as an authoritative one in setting the record for repertoire and playing styles over the court ensemble, which became now set apart as repository of a specific, delimited, “court tradition”.

*Learning gamelan music at ISI. The funnel of professionalization.*

Here I switch my focus from the historical and discursive aspects to the perspective and experiences of ISI gamelan students. One of the automatic implications of thrusting the entire process of gamelan learning into a four-year degree course is a considerable temporal compression. Whereas in the previous familiar pattern, learning was a slow process of osmosis and moments of active apprehension spread over many years, ISI introduced a model for which a great number of instruments and pieces had to be learned quickly, simultaneously and to a level considered satisfactory by the instructors. This generates distress among young students, who need to fulfil not only the expectations of the curriculum but also a moderate financial burden,



considered the modest economic background of the majority of them. The study shows how, in contrast with what earlier scholars predicted, the majority of ISI gamelan students does not descend from an artistic background, but enrolls out of personal acquaintance with gamelan music (often during high school classes) or the common preoccupation of cultural preservation. However, the effect of ISI is not merely a democratizing one as it would appear on the surface. I recover here the image of the funnel effect, as utilized by Giordano in the context of migration (Giordano 2018). Being the artistic job market a relatively meagre one, the considerable amount of students enrolling in ISI cluster through the academic funnel. Those who make it the easiest through the funnel, that is those who land teaching or stable performance jobs, are those who in the meantime manage to establish the best contacts. Establishing contacts is an essentially non-ISI affair, a result of intense networking outside of the classroom, including participation at music performances and *wayangs*. The minority of students coming from a family background steeped in gamelan or *wayang* have naturally a thicker address book of crucial connections, facilitating their transition into professional musicianship. Those who do not will tend to clump into the ISI funnel, often postponing their graduation of several years or, more rarely, drop out entirely.

From all this it becomes clear how in the transmission of gamelan music knowledge ISI did act as neither a thin veneer through which the older inheritance system of musicianship would be reproduced undisturbed, with the only addition of a degree title, nor as a completely democratizing educational institution, since, as I show, financial burdens bar the way to professionalization in ways that previously would not subsist and as networking is an essential auxiliary practice for landing jobs in the future more than dutiful classroom study. It is in this endeavour that family background comes back into the picture, by providing ready contacts integrating the formal prestige of the academic title.

## CONCLUSIONS

In this contribution I discuss the changing dynamics in knowledge transmission that Institut Seni Indonesia brought about in the acquisition of gamelan music musicianship. Previous studies have tended to frame the introduction of academic degrees for music knowledge either within the modernization paradigm, suggesting a democratic and standardizing turn in the access to musicianship, or a de-facto continuity of the older pattern of inherited expertise beneath the surface of academic education. With this work I try to show how the reality experienced by the music students lies somewhere in between, as ISI funnels applicants and students along economic lines at first and according to the extra-class contacts created, in which an artistic family background returns as a crucial factor.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Becker, Judith O. 1980. *Traditional Music in Modern Java: Gamelan in a Changing Society*. Second Edition. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.
- Benamou, Marc. 2010. *Rasa. Affect and Intuition in Javanese Musical Aesthetics*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Giordano, Cristina. 2018. "The Funnel Effect". *Limn*, Special Issue on *Chokepoints* 10: 58–64.
- Goody, Jack. 2000. *The Power of the Written Tradition*. Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press;





Hand, Rachel. 2018. "Schools and Families as Institutions of Learning in Central Javanese Gamelan". *Ethnomusicology Forum* 27 (1): 68-87.

Puguh, Dhanang Respati. 2017. "Radio Republik Indonesia Surakarta, 1945-1960s". *Indonesian Historical Studies* 1 (2): 138-153.

Weber, Max. 1946. *From Max Weber: Essays in Sociology*. New York: Oxford University Press.

## Methodological Dilemma on Studying Diversity

Coordinators: Elan Lazuardi (UNSW Sydney), Des Christy (Radboud University),  
& Wahyu Kuncoro (Universität Zürich)

In Indonesia, like elsewhere, ethnography works have increasingly been inseparable from global connectedness which influences people's way of thinking regarding their relationships with their surroundings (Appadurai 1996, Tsing 2004). At the same time, the so-called reflexive turns in anthropology (Clifford and Marcus, 1986) has called into question the often taken-for-granted positionality among the anthropologist. More than four decades have passed since legal anthropologist Laura Nader (1972) first called for anthropologists to 'study up', which calls into question the often taken-for-granted power relation between anthropologists and the people they research about (or rather, the people they do research with). Since then, Nader's question has been taken up, and even challenged by anthropologists working with those who hold 'more power'. Nader, herself, has further clarified her position that her call to 'study up' did not mean for the anthropologist to stop 'study down', but to study 'up, down, and sideways simultaneously' (2008). Anthropologists have discussed the challenges of doing 'anthropology at home'/'native anthropology', 'reverse anthropology', and other ethical dilemmas of doing ethnographic research. This panel invites abstracts that address the methodological dilemma anthropologists face in their search for 'anthropological knowledge', whether based on research in Indonesia and outside. The panel's learning objectives are as followed: - to share the methodological reflection in anthropological research in responding to increasing threat to diversity; - to learn about the methodological innovation in anthropology to document diversity; - to understand how anthropologists, negotiate consent in research; - to discuss the ways, one's positionality as a researcher define or limit our choice of methodology; and finally - to discuss the ways anthropologists (re)define research methodology in the era of 'dis'-integration.

### METHODOLOGICAL DILEMMA OF DOING FIELDWORK AMONG FISHERS IN THE UK

*Des Christy*

*Radboud University*

Abdullah (2018) in his reflexion on 50 years of Indonesian anthropology is reminding the readers that culture is not an object but a perspective used to understand human problems and concerns, which is essential for (Indonesian) anthropologist to expand their perspective. In my case, doing research outside Indonesia is part of the effort to expand and diversify the perspective. I have been doing fieldwork among fishers in the United Kingdom since July 2018, to see how their livelihood affected by European fisheries regulation and how they see their future after Brexit (Britain leaving the European Union).



However, doing fieldwork outside Indonesia means I started with zero experience. As Ball (1990) pointing out, students can be prepared, forewarned, or educated in ethnography, but the only way to learn it is to do it. However, could the skills and experience in one place be used in another place? What challenges will the anthropologist face if they want to do ethnographic fieldwork in a new place?

Based on my reflexion on doing nine months' fieldwork among fishers in North East England and previous research that I have done in Indonesia; this article tries to describe challenges that anthropologist may face during research process in new place. I will divide this article into three sections of the ethnographic fieldwork process: entrance, getting closer and dealing with power relations.

*Keywords: fieldwork, methodology, ethnography*

ON HOW NOT TO DO AN AUTOETHNOGRAPHY:  
STUDYING CHANGING URBAN INFRASTRUCTURE IN INDONESIA

*Elan A. Lazuardi*

*The Kirby Institute, University of New South Wales*

*Khidir M. Prawirosusanto*

*Universitas Gadjah Mada*

This paper will be based on our reflection of experiences in conducting an ethnography on informal sovereignty and the transportation-infrastructure transition in Yogyakarta. The study itself was a collaborative work between a number of researchers affiliated with Indonesian and Canadian universities, using participant observation, interviews, and archival work with different transportation mode around the research setting. Our position as a team member was not only defined by our background as anthropology graduates, but also our place (the field) in the social world we were researching (Hannerz 2010), as residents of Yogyakarta, user/former user, non-user of certain modes of urban transportations. In a way, as this panel suggests, this paper will discuss our positionality (as researchers and as resident), constraints, and challenges within collaborative fieldwork in anthropology such as in our case.

*Keywords: ethnography at home, autoethnography, anthropological fieldwork, methodology.*

WORKING AT THE MARGIN<sup>30</sup>: LONE WOLF ANTHROPOLOGIST IN PUBLIC HEALTH

*Elan A. Lazuardi*

*The Kirby Institute, University of New South Wales*

More than four decades have passed since law-anthropologist Laura Nader (1972) first called for anthropologists to 'study up', which calls into question the often-taken for granted power relation between anthropologists and the people they research about (or rather, the people they do research with). Since then, Nader's question has been taken up, and even challenged by anthropologists working with those who hold 'more power'. Nader, herself, has further clarified

---

<sup>30</sup> Inspired by Arthur Kleinman book title, detailing his experiences as medical anthropologist and physician working on mental health in China.



her position that her call to 'study up' did not mean for anthropologist to stop 'study down', but to study 'up, down, and sideways simultaneously' (2008). This paper takes up such challenges by reflecting on my experience, as a struggling scholar with anthropology as one of her education background who is trying for ways and places to fit in in her work in public health field in the last 5 years or so. In this paper, I asked what it means to 'study up, down and sideways simultaneously' for Indonesian anthropology today, particularly those who is working in interdisciplinary field.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

Kleinman, A.

- 1997 Writing at the Margin: Discourse between anthropology and medicine. Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press.

Nader, Laura

- 1972 Up the Anthropologist - Perspectives Gained from Studying Up. D. Hymes, ed. Pp. 284-311. New York: Pantheon Books.

—

- 2008 Keynote Address: Strategies of Subordination—In Reverse. *In* Fifth Annual Public Anthropology Conference: Supporting Social Movements. Washington: Department of Anthropology, College of Arts and Sciences, American University.

#### RESEARCH WITHOUT DOUBTS: DOING RESEARCH IN WELFARE STATES

*Inda Marlina & Salfia Rahmawati*

*Universitas Gadjah Mada*

Various collisions were often faced when a social researcher, especially anthropology, conducted field research by collecting data through participatory observation. Doing anthropology field work is not only about figure some comparisons, but the primary purpose of applying anthropology is to understand the world with all its uniqueness. However, it cannot be denied when an anthropologist who enters a society or community, for example in an area that is not from their place of origin, often has discomfort or confusion about how to be accepted by the community and how the community believes that an anthropologist is not a "secret agent." In this case, both academic researcher and corporation researcher will be faced with some dilemmas when facing the community and questioning whether a researcher can be separated from interests and value-free. Because an anthropologist is working with the community, research ethics is the main thing that must be considered when doing fieldwork.

As anthropology students, doing research in the welfare states with a system that is already stable and have a good governance has difference challenges. This experience also encourages us to respect and not taken for granted any communities. Language is not the only obstacle, but also the difference habit and some "inferiorities" sometimes make people unpleasant with stranger, particularly when we asked in English in non-English countries. In this case, strengthening selection of paradigms is one of the ways to learn and study with communities in these countries. Besides that, when doing research outside Indonesia, especially in post-industrialist societies, we must learn a lot to understand the culture of privacy with very clear boundaries. Doing research outside from Indonesia is a very valuable experience because we found that in the end there is no



superior or inferior culture. Every culture has its own uniqueness and distinctiveness. Knowledge can be accessed by everyone.

*Keywords: diversity, welfare state, paradigm, methodology, experience, power, knowledge*

## INTRODUCTION

European culture and social studies from Indonesian researchers are barely to be found. Indonesian social science researchers are mostly conduct research on their country (Schlehe & Hidayah, 2014, p. 261). Gobo (2008) on Schlehe and Hidayah (2014) cites that ethnography is identical with how Westerners see other people in outside their territory. The classical field research in Anthropology are dominated by Western social scientist or classical setting, then followed by some perspectives from “native anthropology” and “anthropology at home” (Godina, 2003). Godina states that the classical setting for ethnography is for a Western European who conducts research in non-West countries or other continent. On the other hand, “native anthropologist” is a term for a non-Western anthropologist who has research in their own country and “anthropologist at home” refers to a Western anthropology who has research in their country (Godina, 2003, p. 474). We’re still not sure and disagree on why should differentiate the classification of native anthropologist and anthropologist at home. Both refers to the same case, anthropologist who conduct research in other continent. It is similar with classification of classical anthropologist and “fourth possibility”. Godina classifies fourth possibility as a non-Western anthropologist who conducts research in Europe or Western society (Godina, 2003, p. 482). It bears a question: why should researchers are categorized by Western-Eastern thing? To what extend do that impact on the process of research?

This article is a reflection about research experience in the Netherland and Norway. Salfia has conducted research in the Netherland and Inda has finished her research in Norway. Both of us went to Europe in 2018. Our research topics are different. However, this article is about our position as Indonesian researchers in Western society and how we deal with different experiences and obstacles we face during fieldwork.

## DOES VALUE-FREE EXIST?

Putting gender, religion, and or race issue in this essay is not something that we wish and we expect to. Discourse of equality among researchers and specifically among European made us believe that it won’t affect the process of research. However, we need to admit that it matters, at least in these research we conduct in the Netherlands and Norway. Salfia faced the difficulties to approach informants when doing deep interview about sexuality not only because she is a women and from Indonesia, but also because she wears hijab (veil). This created a distance between her and her informant, because she showed her identity as female muslim. When it comes to the topic of sexuality, something turns into a very private ambiance. To go beyond the ‘gap’ and break the fear, she needed to ensure informants by numerous meeting and various approach that hijab and religion identity she wear won’t affect anything to collect data about private sexuality experience or even worse to force certain ideology to them. Inda needed to confront such thing when she conducts research about waste management in Norway. She faced a tension when conducting deep interview and observation with one of the waste management factory. When they knew that she comes from Indonesia, they reacted little bit different in tension, because Indonesia and Asia in general contribute in producing waste with very bad management (Said, 1979). Sensitivity between developed and developing countries comes up when talking about how to tackle the



environmental issue. Study about Indonesia from European scholars are easy to be found. On the other hand, as Indonesia scholars we barely know about European culture studies from Indonesia perspective (Hellawell, 2006).

Being Asian in Europe is indeed nothing special anymore. The exodus of people from other continent to Europe is one of the reason there are many expatriate in Europe. However, there are something different when we are conducting research there, rather than living in Europe, especially some of Indonesian have identity symbol, such as wearing veil or *hijab*. Some sensitive issues might be asked or discussed, but that do not mean the issues become data. Sometimes, the issues also a beginning or information to open other data.

#### DEALING WITH UNPREDICTABLE CASES

In every anthropologist's field work, there are always experience and unpredictable situation. In the non-English speaking language like Norway, some people prefer to have conversation with their own language. It is indeed very understandable. However, this is sometimes cannot be predictable because some people also insecure with foreign or 'others'. Since hundreds years, the anthropology knowledge is dominated by Western scholars. Godina writes "*Allowing a non-Western European anthropologist to do fieldwork on a West European field means taking that crucial step in the dislocation of anthropological knowledge*" (Godina, 2003, p. 483). Being 'white' presumably become an advantage, and as the opposite, being 'non-white' is assumed as others that do not have control over knowledge, especially when those 'non-white' conducting research about the 'white' in their territory. The gap coming up from different language is a barrier that needed to be handle by of course learning it before doing a fieldwork, as every anthropologist suggest to. However, as early scholars with limited time and funding of research, it is hard to prepare proper ability of local language existed in research site. Basic local language ability is something that so sure need to be prepared, but being advance on it is needed more to understand every context with deeper comprehension. For Inda, looking for informants was one of the struggles. Some residences in rural area are more insecure when she asked in English. To overcome with this obstacle, Inda asked her friend to introduce her to the other informants. A recommendation becomes mediator for researcher to gain other informants.

Aside language barrier, Salfia also face unpredictable issue in post-research. Months after doing research, one of her informant contacted her for many times, even contacted her university too. He was so afraid that Salfia will use the data for certain reason specifically related to the crime and law (Zadrozna, 2016). It was because in her research site, someone who deal with that issue will be imprisoned. Sensitive issue that she conducted need more intense and regular communication with informants even in post research. It means that maintaining trust through communication is necessary when dealing with sensitive yet risky issue (Clark, 2014).

Preparing documentation before research is depend on the context. For Inda, research permit and documentation are very important. Norway has strict law about confidential for informant, such as the researcher cannot cited the real name of informants. However, Inda still can cite their municipality's name. On the other hand, Salfia cannot use documentation for her research because her topic is too sensitive and dangerous for the informants. In this case, both of us understand that every place has its own rule to be followed and it depends on research context.



## CONCLUSION

There are various things that can be learned from research outside from Indonesia or abroad. First, it is eroding stereotypes against other countries, especially in Europe. Second, research abroad in Western countries such as countries in Europe, providing an understanding about European influence and relation in globally, including to Indonesia. However, as anthropologist we always become “outsider” for our topic contents. As Godina states, doing research in Western and Northern Europe brings some statement that in this position, the power of knowledge also can be claimed by non-Western European anthropologist (Godina, 2003, p. 484). Anthropology field works are wide. There are many places outside there that can be explored.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Agazzi, E. 2004. *Right, Wrong, and Science*. Amsterdam & New York: Rodopi.
- Clark, A. (2014). What Happens Next? Sustaining Relationships Beyond The Life of A Research Project. *Journal of Museum Ethnography*, 27, 63-77. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/43915863>
- Godina, V. V. (2003). Anthropological Fieldwork at the Beginning of the 21st Century. *Anthropos*, Bd.98(H.2), 473-487. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40467336>
- Hellawell, D. (2006). Inside-Out: analysis of the insider-outsider concept as a heuristic device to develop reflexive in students doing qualitative research. *Teaching in Higher Education*, 11(4), 483-494. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1080/13562510600874292>
- Lacey, H. 1999. *Is Science Value Free? Values and Scientific Understanding*. London & New York: Routledge.
- Proctor, R.N. 1991. *Value-Free Science? Purity and Power in Modern Knowledge*. Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press
- Said, E. W. (1979). *Orientalism*. New York: Random Huse.
- Schlehe, J., & Hidayah, S. (2014). Transcultural Ethnography: Reciprocity in Indonesian-German Tandem Research. In M. Huotari, J. Rüländ, & J. Schlehe, *Methodology and Research Practice in Southeast Asian Studies* (pp. 253-272). London : Palgrave Macmillan.
- Zadrozna, A. (2016). What are you really looking for? Ethnography While (feeling) under surveillance. *Zeitschrift für Ethnologie*, Bd.141(H.2 ), 215-232. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/26384583>
- Weber, M. 1992. *Value-Judgements in Social Science* in R. Boyd, Ph. Gasper & J.D. Trout (Ed.) *The Philosophy of Science* (pp. 719-731). Cambridge MA: MIT Press

METHODOLOGICAL AND ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS OF DIGITALLY BASED CROSS-CULTURAL RESEARCH

Petra Elias

The University of Western Australia

*Undertaking qualitative research about intimate relationships has the potential to raise a variety of ethical concerns. Entering this landscape in the digital era, although bringing convenience and*





*efficiency, can add an array of ethical concerns. In my study exploring Javanese-white Australian marriage, I utilised digital platforms both as a way of broadening my recruitment and as a method to interview participants. Whilst digital technology promises efficiency where participant populations are disparate, there exists little empirical literature proposing solutions for its unique pragmatic and ethical considerations particularly around privacy, participant identity, confidentiality and recruitment. This paper will summarise some of the practical and ethical issues which emerged in my doctoral research using digital tools to examine cross-cultural marriages and which challenged traditional research boundaries of geography, culture and communication.*

*Keywords: Qualitative research ethics, Digital research ethics, Qualitative research interviews, Cross-cultural research, Internet-based research.*

## BACKGROUND

My research focusses on exploring the way Javanese-white Australian couples negotiate their cultural identity/ies as a couple living in Australia. The research project builds on seminal Australian research examining mixed Asian-Australian identity conducted mainly in the 1990's and early 2000s by Duncan-Owen (2002), Luke (1994, 1993), Luke & Luke (1998, 1999), Luke & Carrington (2000), Fozdar (2011), Fozdar & McGavin, (2017), Fozdar & Perkins, (2014), Fozdar, F., Wilding, R., & Hawkins, M. (2009), Dragojlovic (2008, 2014) and Meyer (2017), Meyer & Fozdar (2017), Dragojlovic (2015), and Australian-Indonesian identity by Winarnita Doxy (2015, 2007), Winarnita & Tanu (2015), Ida Bagus (2008) and Bicego (2016). I used digital technology such as email, internet, social media and video conferencing to advertise, recruit and conduct 20 semi-structured interviews with couples and individuals across Australia and found that digital technology both enhanced and complicated the research process and raised pertinent ethical questions. This paper outlines some of the complications associated with using digital tools in qualitative research.

Australia is a large country which has three time zones. Conducting research across the country, particularly in rural and remote areas, can be expensive, time consuming and problematic (O'Connor, Madge, Shaw & Wellens, 2011; Duffy, 2002; Adams-Hutcheson & Longhurst, 2016; Aselton, 2012; Deakin & Wakefield, 2014; Matthews & Cramer, 2008). To address the barriers associated with these issues during advertising, I sent fliers in the post and used digital technology such as internet, email, social media sites and groups, website enquiry pages, blog sites, chat pages and other internet-based fora. During the recruitment phase, I used email, text messaging and made telephone calls. Starting out with a data base of expatriate organisations, such as Indonesian social and welfare groups across Australia – sourced from the internet, university schools of Social Science, religious organisations such as Indonesian churches and mosques, peak bodies and consulate offices, I also relied heavily on word of mouth and snowballing. Interviews were conducted in person, by telephone and using synchronous video platforms (Hooley, Wellens, & Marriott, 2012). Whilst the digital space efficiently facilitated these methods, it also created ethical dilemmas regarding relational ethics, confidentiality and identity verification (Schiek & Ullrich, 2019). It also created practical challenges such as language barriers. Shared language and understanding of culture, are comparable to those which emerge during in-person research, but these were amplified by the digital approach, particularly when the technology was unreliable or failed (Adams-Hutcheson & Longhurst, 2016; AlKhateeb, 2018; Deakin & Wakefield, 2014; O'Connor, et al., 2008; Reynolds & Lee, 2018).



As well, the landscape of institutional ethical review in Australia is currently conservative and cautious, resulting in a highly risk adverse consciousness among human research ethics committees, restrictive methods and many compliance requirements. Added to which, there is little understanding of the tools and methods utilised in digital media. For example, it remains unclear whether pre-existing digital data posted publicly can be mined for the purpose of research, and how best to treat digitally generated commentary so that issues of confidentiality and ethical use are resolved (Hunter, Gough, O’Kane, McKeown, Fitzpatrick, Walker, McKinley, Lee and Kee, 2018).

So while digital media can be a beguiling method and/or tool in research, there are many things to consider to adhere to ethical practice and yield beneficial data.

#### OBJECTIVE

This paper will summarise the methodological dilemmas I encountered in my study, particularly those relating to digital ethics, and share some proposed strategies.

#### DESCRIPTION

In 2018, I interviewed 20 White-Australian and Javanese participants, either as a couple or as individuals, who were residing in Australia. Participants were based all around Australia and were interviewed in person, by telephone or using the video platform, Skype. Interviews were semi-structured with questions that were provided to participants prior to interview and interview lengths varied from approximately 90 minutes to 3 hours, depending upon how much the participants wanted to tell me. Being a social media novice, I came across a range of practical and ethical issues for research utilising digital tools.

#### FINDINGS

I used digital media to advertise my study, undertake recruitment processes and conduct interviews with participants (O’Connor, et al., 2011; Adams-Hutcheson & Longhurst, 2017). Each phase of the process raised different practical and ethical challenges.

Utilising digital media to advertise the study and recruit participants was an obvious strategy. I found it difficult to conceive of other more efficient, cost effective and efficacious methods. I became aware of digital communities (Hine, 2011) in the form of closed and/or secret FaceBook groups for Australians and Indonesians in intimate relationships, where they talk about their experiences and share resources and information and these were particularly useful (Matthews & Cramer, 2008). Gaining membership was difficult with some of the Facebook groups because they are closed or secret and therefore cannot be found simply by searching. Membership occurs via a snowballing technique where existing members ask the administrators to invite a new member to join. One must meet the eligibility criteria and then be approved by the group administrators. Some group administrators did not respond to my request to join, or if they did, did not do so in a timeframe that worked for my study, or they allowed me to join but not advertise my study. One group administrator declined on the basis that she didn’t believe confidentiality could be assured which reflects the angst surrounding social media generally (Schiek & Ullrich, 2019). On the whole, I found the groups inclusive and receptive and people received the invitation to participate in my research with great enthusiasm and warmth.



Focus of the groups tend to be on sharing information about visa processes, but I also found strong communities (Hine, 2011) within the groups whereby people shared their joys and offered support to other members during challenging times. It is also clear that small friendship groups emerge within the larger FaceBook groups and 'meet ups' allow people in geographic areas to meet in person, usually over a meal. Reading the posts provided a fascinating insight into the kinds of issues facing couples and this provided further impetus for the study. However, closed and secret groups stipulate that what is posted and commented upon in the group cannot be shared outside the group. This was even the case when posts related to my study. I wanted to use some of the positive commentary in my thesis to demonstrate the perceived value of the study and sought extended ethics approval to do so and of course, had to seek permission because of course, covert research requires ethics approval and consent from the group owners and the individuals who made the comments (GSR, 2016). The people who commented, tended to use their true identity, so names, of course, had to be changed. However, this does raise another ethical dilemma which is that there is no way for a researcher to be sure that the identity created online is the authentic identity of the person, or even whether that person really exists. Identity becomes relevant when it is time to gain consent because some people will happily participate using a pseudonym, but ethical guidelines for this dilemma remain silent. So, when paper or emailed PDF consent forms couldn't be completed, usually because people didn't have a printer or scanner, I used an alternative digital method for gaining consent - an email from participants acknowledging the Participant Information Form and giving consent under the same conditions as the paper version (Hunter, et al., 2018). As well, my identity as researcher could not be concealed and that placed me in a vulnerable position. Trying to balance my privacy, and that of my family's, while participating as a member in the group continues to be a tension.

Another difficulty arises in relation to who owns the information on the pages (Hoser & Nitschki, 2010). If studies proposed using the rich data within these groups, ethics is unlikely to be granted because guiding policies and legislation lag behind the technology. The main concern of ethics review bodies would be ensuring no harm is done (Hunter, et al, 2018) which can not be guaranteed in a digital environment. As well, group administrators are unlikely to grant permission given that the groups are usually confidential and/or secret.

Having said that, the openness between study participants chatting on the pages was also an issue during the recruitment phase as friends communicated with each other openly on Facebook about such things as their interview times and venues. This was particularly an issue within the Indonesian community organisations where people tried to help me organise a schedule of interviews. As researcher, I of course, could not comment on who would be interviewed and when, as this would breach confidentiality - another area where ethics guidelines need review. However, I found that not being able to assist with participants arranging the interview schedule, particularly interstate, created a barrier to developing rapport and acceptance with the group. In the case of Indonesian women, I could see very much that this is the way they come together to organise things in Java – I felt very compelled to let them do it their way because I understood the cultural practice of doing so. I could see that this may not be appropriate in other areas of research, but I felt inclusive conversations were the cornerstone of my being accepted as an insider into the groups and by being aloof, people viewed me suspiciously.

After the interviews, some of the participants wanted to 'friend' me and keep in touch, but conventional ethical guidelines preclude such relationships, though I have maintained my membership of one of the groups and I continue to struggle with how much to participate. For the



most part, I try to remain neutral and not partake in gossiping or favouring individuals, but I am also conscious of being seen to be exploiting the group for my own ends without contributing, which seemed to go against the ethical grain for me and the purpose of the groups.

Perhaps because of the immediacy of Facebook, I found many people expressed an interest in participating in my research but had sometimes reacted quickly without thinking the ramifications through, or not having properly read the eligibility criteria. Despite my stipulation to Personal Message or email me, many participants chose to continue the conversation at a public level within the group page. Others did not follow through and I found it ethically challenging to know when to stop sending friendly reminders. In some cases, participants were interested but were not actively online and I had no other way of contacting them, which caused some stress. This highlights the unreliability of digital media and social media, in particular.

Another pragmatic issue that arose was gaining consent. Most ethics processes require an Information Sheet and Consent Form outlining the process of participation and its risks to participants be provided prior to interview. In the digital space this can be problematic because not everyone understands the requirement or access to a scanner, and insisting upon it can be disruptive to the establishment of rapport, particularly when the opportunities to communicate are limited. My solution to this was to offer people an email version of the consent form, but occasionally I did not receive consent prior to interview. Sometimes, I received consent in various forms, including by personal message or a photograph of the form, but neither of these are clear on reproduction, so again the ethics process has not stipulated that written consent must be legible and this remains a loophole.

In a face-to-face interview this risk can be mediated by explaining the risks to participants at the beginning of the interview. But when the interview is conducted over a video streaming platform such as Skype (Bertrand & Bourdeau, 2010), or by telephone, this process becomes more complex and discussion can be more difficult to follow (Seitz, 2015; Janghorban, Latifnejad & Taghipour, 2014). This rests on the researcher setting up the interview in a private space where confidentiality can be assured, just like an in-person interview. Ethics requirements may stipulate a room with a closed door is required, removing such options as open plan living spaces, cafes and public spaces. This can create barriers for the researcher and participants because they may not feel comfortable being interviewed in their home, and if they are, may not be comfortable conducting the interview behind closed doors, particularly if children who require supervision are in the home at the time. Participants know what they're willing to discuss openly and overly protective rules about where research can occur, undermines people's abilities to make responsible decisions for themselves and stifles the research. We've all been in public spaces where people are having loud conversations on their mobile phones. If a researcher is interviewing a participant, and the participant chooses to conduct that interview in a public space, I think ethics processes need to reflect that the researcher has consent and the participant is cognisant of the issues related to speaking in a public place about personal matters.

There are other pragmatic problems with using video platforms. They can create a sense of discomfort and self-consciousness by researchers and participants which can hamper the research and researchers and participants need a degree of digital competence (Janghorban, et al., 2014). Researchers and participants need to be mindful what other information is in the environment and being broadcast because this might breach privacy (Hoser. & Nitschki, 2010). As well, the quality of the video was often poor and even if we started that way, we usually reverted to audio



only which improved the quality of audio (Seitz, 2015). Even then there was interference and drop outs (O’Conaill, Whittaker & Wilbur, 1993; Sellen, 1995). I also found it difficult to pick up nuances in facial expressions and mannerisms, and for this reason alone, would reconsider this option for intimate interviews (Sedgwick & Spiers, 2009).

During the interview with participants using video streaming or telephone, it is difficult if not impossible for the researcher to monitor whether the room is private and whether the interview is confidential (Hay & Israel, 2009). Participants may not view the content as confidential so may be more relaxed about adhering to this requirement. This led me to wonder how important this really is in this type of research. Most of the couples had explored the complexities and challenges of their relationship, and family living in their home were aware of the issues too, so they didn’t see the need for it to be confidential. As well, in some cases, family provided to participants enlightened feedback about their observations of the relationships. In order to fit in with participants’ busy lives, I conducted interviews at all times of the day and night, on all days of the week, including public holidays and sometimes, I followed people around, or they took me with them digitally, as they undertook their daily tasks such as cooking, feeding their families and doing domestic chores whilst the shared with me details about their relationships. Though observation was not part of my data collection, it gave me a very special insight into the way participants interacted as a couple and with their families. This was invaluable for understanding who they were.

As well, ethics review processes proscribe the provision of referral options for psychological support, in the event that participants become distressed as a result of the interview (Hay & Israel, 2009). Whilst the internet comes into its own for providing information about such services anywhere in the world, it is impossible to assess how reliable and relevant such services might be for participants. Some of my participants were moved in some way about the things we talked about. I conveyed sympathy and offered psychological supports. This creates a dilemma for researchers because you can go from being a researcher to a counsellor very quickly and, which is not appropriate but the participant may find the researcher easy to talk to and the dilemma for the researcher then is whether it’s better to keep the participant engaged and offer a listening ear, or destroy rapport – and potentially the data source – to offer referrals. In my experience, talking about a difficult issue did not have ongoing ramifications. Quite the contrary, participants were quite resolved about it.

## CONCLUSION

Overall, a well-planned research project using digital technology can reap benefits, particularly when there are practical constraints such as when the population under study is hard to reach due to geographical distances, socially isolated or stigmatised (Duffy, 2002). For my study, I would have preferred face-to-face interviews with all of my participants, but without technology, the time and financial burdens would have precluded me from gaining such a representative participant cohort. Researchers are encouraged to embrace technology in compiling data, but to remain cognisant of exercising ethical caution in this burgeoning research context (Hay & Israel, 2009). Literature analysing the ethical considerations in particular, remains an area of growth for qualitative online research.



## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Adams-Hutcheson, G. & Longhurst, R. (2016). 'At least in person there would have been a cup of tea': Interviewing via Skype', *Area*, Vol. 49(2), pp.148–155.
- AlKhateeb, M. (2018). 'Using Skype as a Qualitative Interview Medium within the Context of Saudi Arabia.' *The Qualitative Report*, 23(10), pp.2253-2260. Retrieved from: <https://nsuworks.nova.edu/tqr/vol23/iss10/1>.
- Aselton, P. (2012). 'Using the Internet for Qualitative Research in Nursing'. Open Access Scientific Reports. 227. Retrieved from: [https://scholarworks.umass.edu/nursing\\_faculty\\_pubs/227](https://scholarworks.umass.edu/nursing_faculty_pubs/227).
- Bertrand, C., & Bourdeau, L. (2010). 'Research interviews by Skype: A new data collection method.' In J. Esteves (Ed.), *9th European Conference on Research Methods*, pp.70-7). Spain: IE Business School: Reading UK, Academic Publishing.
- Bicego, B.L. (2016). *Australian Women in Bali: A Phenomenological Study of Impacts on Lived Experience and Sense of Self*. Doctoral Dissertation, University of Sydney.
- Deakin, H. & Wakefield, K. (2014). 'Skype interviewing: reflections of two PhD researchers.' *Qualitative Research*, Vol. 14(5), pp.603 –616.
- Dragojlovic, A. (2008). 'Dutch women and Balinese men: Intimacies, popular discourses and citizenship rights.' *The Asia Pacific Journal of Anthropology*, Vol. 9(4), pp.332-345.
- Dragojlovic, A. (2015). 'Haunted by 'miscegenation': Gender, the white Australia Policy and the construction of Indisch family narratives.' *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, Vol. 36(1), pp.54-70.
- Duffy, M.E. (2002). 'Methodological issues in Web-based research.' *Journal of Nursing Scholarship*, Vol. 34, pp.83-88.
- Duncan Owen, J. (2002). *Mixed Matches: Interracial Marriage in Australia*. UNSW Press: Sydney.
- Fozdar, F. (2011). 'The 'Choirboy' and the 'Mad Monk': Christianity, Islam, Australia's Political Landscape and Prospects for Multiculturalism'. *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, Vol. 32(6), pp.621-636.
- Fozdar, F. & McGavin, K. (2017). "'Mixed race' in the Australo-Pacific Region' in Farida Fozdar & Kirsten McGavin (Eds.) *Mixed Race Identities in Australia, New Zealand and the Pacific Islands*. Routledge: New York.
- Fozdar, F. & Perkins, M. (2014). 'Antipodean mixed race', in Rebecca C. King-O'Riain Stephen Small, Minelle Mahtani, Miri Song & Paul Spickard. (Eds.) *Global Mixed Race*. NYU Press: New York.
- Fozdar, F., Wilding, R., & Hawkins, M. (2009). *Race Relations*. Oxford University Press, South Melbourne.
- GSR. (2016). *Using Social Media for Social Research: An Introduction*. UK: Social Media Research Group.





- Hay, I. & Israel, M. (2009). 'Private people, secret places: Ethical Research in practice'. In M. Solem, K. Foote & J. Monk. (Eds.) *Aspiring Academics: A Resource Book for Graduate Students and Early Career Faculty*. New York, NY: Pearson Merrill Prentice Hall.
- Hine, C. (2011). 'Virtual Ethnography: Modes, Varieties, Affordances.' In: Nigel Fielding, Raymond M. Lee & Grant Blank (Eds). *The SAGE Handbook of Online Research Methods*, pp.257-270. Access Date: July 2, 2018 Publishing Company: SAGE Publications, Ltd Print ISBN: 9781412922937 Online ISBN: 9780857020055 DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9780857020055>.
- Hooley, T., Wellens, J., & Marriott, J. (2012). *What is Online Research?: Using the Internet for Social Science Research*. New York, NY: Bloomsbury Academic.
- Hoser, B. & Nitschki, B. (2010). 'Questions on ethics for research in the virtually connected world.' *Social Networks*, Vol. 32, pp.180-186.
- Hunter, R.F., Gough, A., O'Kane, N., McKeown, G., Fitzpatrick, A., Walker, T., McKinley, M., Lee, M., & Kee, F. (2018). 'Ethical issues in social media research for public health.' *Public Health Ethics*, Vol. 108(3), pp.343-348.
- Ida Bagus, M. (2008). 'Mixed marriages in Jembrana, Bali: Mediation and fragmentation of citizenship and identity in the post-bomb(s) Bali world.' *The Asia Pacific Journal of Anthropology*, Vol. 9(4), pp.346-362.
- Janghorban, R., Latifnejad Roudsari, R., & Taghipour, A. (2014). 'Skype interviewing: The new generation of online synchronous interview in qualitative research.' *International Journal of Qualitative Studies on Health and Well-being*, Vol.9(1), 24152, DOI: 10.3402/qhw.v9.24152.
- Luke, C. (1994). 'White women in interracial families; Reflections on hybridization, feminine identities, and racialized othering.' *Feminist Issues*, Fall, pp.49-72.
- Luke, C. & Luke, A. (1998). 'Interracial families: Difference within difference.' *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, Vol. 21(4), pp.728-754.
- Luke, C. & Luke, A. (1999). 'Theorizing interracial families and hybrid identity: An Australian perspective.' *Educational Theory*, Vol. 49(2), pp.223-249.
- Luke, C. & Carrington, V. (2000). 'Race Matters'. *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, Vol. 21(1), pp.5-24.
- Luke, C. (2003). 'Glocal mobilities: Crafting identities in interracial families'. *International Journal of Cultural Studies*, Vol. 6(4), pp.379-401.
- Matthews, J. D., & Cramer, E. P. (2008). 'Using technology to enhance qualitative research with hidden populations.' *The Qualitative Report*, Vol. 13(2), pp.301-315. Retrieved from <http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR13-2/matthews.pdf>.
- Meyer, M. (2017). *Mixed Families: The Joint Construction of Cultural Identity within Intercultural/Interracial Migrant Families in Australia*, PhD Thesis. Perth: University of Western Australia.



- Meyer, M. & Fozdar, F. (2017). "A mini United Nations': Being mixed in multicultural Australia'. In Farida Fozdar and Kirsten McGavin (Eds.) *Mixed Race Identities in Australia, New Zealand and the Pacific Islands*. Routledge: New York.
- O'Conaill, B., Whittaker, S., & Wilbur, S. (1993). 'Conversations over video conferences: An evaluation of the spoken aspects of video-mediated communication.' *Human-Computer Interaction, Vol. 8*, pp.389–428.
- O'Connor, H., Madge, C., Shaw, R. & Wellens, J. (2011). 'Internet based interviewing.' In: Nigel Fielding, Raymond M. Lee & Grant Blank (Eds.), *The SAGE Handbook of Online Research Methods*, pp.271-289. Access Date: July 2, 2018 Publishing Company: SAGE Publications, Ltd Print ISBN: 9781412922937 Online ISBN: 9780857020055 DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9780857020055>.
- Reynolds (Taewon Choi), J. D., & Lee, M. (2018). 'Ethical and Methodological Issues Resulting from Recording Lapses in Qualitative Research.' *The Qualitative Report, Vol.23(7)*, pp.1509-1514. Retrieved from <https://nsuworks.nova.edu/tqr/vol23/iss7/1>.
- Schiek, D. & Ullrich, C.G. (2019). 'Using web forums for qualitative inquiries: Empirical findings on the conditions and techniques for asynchronous online group discussions.' *The Qualitative Report, Vol 24, Article 2*, pp.5-16.
- Sedgwick, M. & Spiers, J. (2009). 'The Use of Videoconferencing as a Medium for the Qualitative Interview.' *The International Journal of Qualitative Methods, Vol. 8(1)*, pp.1-11.
- Seitz, S. (2015). 'Pixelated partnerships, overcoming obstacles in qualitative interviews via Skype: a research note.' *Qualitative Research, Vol. 16*, pp.229–35.
- Sellen, A. J. (1995). 'Remote conversations: The effects of mediating talk with technology.' *Human-Computer Interaction, Vol.10*, pp.401–444.
- Winarnita Doxy, M.S. (2015). 'Australia-Indonesia intimate relationships: Intercultural couples, masculinity and cultural fluency'. In *Linking People: Connections and Encounters Between Australians and Indonesians*. Edited by Antje Missbach and Jemma Purdey, 2015. Regiospectra: Berlin.
- Winarnita Doxy, M.S. (2007). 'From Mail Order Bride to Terrorist Strategy: How Portrayals of Indonesian Australian Marriages Affect Identity and Belonging'. *The International Journal of Diversity in Organisations, Communities and Nations, Vol. 7 (4)*, pp.209-215.
- Winarnita, M. & Tanu, D. (2015). 'The missing link: Cultural performance and intercultural hyphenated identities of Australian-Indonesian youth'. In A. Missbach & J. Purdey (Eds). *Linking People: Connections and Encounters between Australians and Indonesians*. Germany: Regiospectra.



## BACKGROUND

Despite the Government of Indonesia's allocation of 20% of its national budget, the quality of education in Indonesia has stagnated at a low level. As part of its broader effort to understand how national and district governments in Indonesia are working together to implement policy towards improving teachers' welfare and student educational outcomes in the era of decentralization, the RISE Programme in Indonesia is seeking to document the educational reform practices of a leading district: *Kota* Yogyakarta of the Special Region of Yogyakarta. *Kota* Yogyakarta, also known as the city of education, has consistently designed and implemented promising educational reforms. The city is also known for their students' and teachers' high achievements as compared to other parts of Indonesia. This study will thus seek to document the process through which educational innovation occurred in *Kota* Yogyakarta and what factors have contributed to the existence of these local initiatives to date.

## OBJECTIVE

This presentation contributes to the panel's discussion on educational anthropology in Indonesia by offering insights from the domain of education policy research. Focusing on a case study that the Research on Improving Systems of Education Programme (RISE Programme) is conducting in Yogyakarta, Indonesia, this presentation will discuss the importance of ethnographic research in strengthening systems-based understandings of how education reforms are implemented within the context of regional autonomy in Indonesia.

## DESCRIPTION

Ethnography is employed in this study considering the wide range of factors and processes in the districts that we will examine. We will document and analyse, for instance, the implementation of the districts' education programmes and activities, then investigating factors and processes behind the success and failure of the programmes. The ethnographic approach supports us to have a better understanding on the districts as this approach respects the wholeness or holistic perspective of local people, their beliefs, and the place where they live in (Zaharlick 1992; Reeves et al. 2008).

Through ethnographic research, we will also be able to uncover the hidden curriculum and 'surrounding milieu' that usually influence the current practices of learning at schools and within communities (Sindell 1969; Otto 1985). Thus, we will also be able to find out the politics and governance of education that will be reflected on educational performance (Ogbu, 1981). Those aspects are paramount to obtain thick descriptions about the drivers of the study districts to innovate and the obstacles hindering the creation or sustaining local innovations in decentralized education of Indonesia.

For purpose of this study, we define innovation as a result of capacity from all stakeholders in the district to create, collaborate, and implement any programme which aims to improve or ensure the betterment of education.



## FINDINGS

Through ethnographic approach, the team seeks to understand the educational system of Kota Yogyakarta as well as the implementation of 3 relatively sustainable local initiatives: *Jam Belajar Masyarakat* (Community Learning Hours/JBM), *Konsultasi Belajar Siswa* (Student Learning Consultation/KBS) and *Pguyuban Orangtua* (Parents Group in each class). Furthermore, educational ethnography sees education as 'cultural transmission' which includes cultural learning at all levels: hidden, tacit, and implicit (Splinder & Splinder 1985). Previously, Kusanagi (2013) reported the difference teacher's engagement towards an educational reform called lesson study. The findings informed that the difference of sociocultural factors in Japan and Yogyakarta is somewhat different. Therefore, ethnography is suitable to address such problem to disseminate educational reforms.

We then examine the socio-cultural and political-economic factors and practices surrounding the decision-making on education practices at local government and community levels to investigate through which the local innovations occurred and see the community responses toward the initiatives. Apart from that, ethnography also allows flexibility for us to gain information from central government regarding the local innovations. Consequently, it becomes a big challenge for us to have wide range of stakeholders to be observed and interviewed because the unit of analysis of public policy is district level.

## CONCLUSION

All in all, ethnography enables us to specifically design to follow closely innovation trajectories in Kota Yogyakarta which is well-known for the high achievement in educational performance. This study examines the sociocultural context of the city and its surrounding milieu in order to have crystal clear understanding on how the environment contributes to a district's capacity to innovate. By doing so, this study will inform further analysis of political economic forces that have constituted an innovative district in Indonesia.

Through ethnography, we hope that this study would come up with adoptable lessons for other local government to innovate and maintain local initiatives. Therefore, ethnography has helped us to reach the preliminary findings which indicate educational reforms or innovations are possible to be replicated if a local government can hold commitment, integrity, and stimulate the development of local capacity to create innovations in improving the quality of education in Indonesia.

*Keywords: educational ethnography; local innovation; decentralized education; educational reform; innovative district; educational policy*

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Beatty, A., Berkhout, E., Bima, L., Coen, T., Pradhan, M., & Suryadarma, D. (2018). Indonesia Got Schooled: 15 Years of Rising Enrolment and Flat Learning Profiles. [Working Paper]. RISE Programme.
- Bjork, C. (2006). Educational decentralization: Asian experiences and conceptual contributions, Springer.



- De Ree, J., Muralidharan, K., Pradhan, M., & Rogers, H. (2017) Double for nothing? Experimental evidence on an unconditional teacher salary increase in Indonesia, Availabl
- Ogbu, J. (1981) School Ethnography: A Multilevel Approach. *Anthropology & Education Quarterly*, 12(1), Issues in School Ethnography, pp. 3-29
- Otto, Wayne. (1985) 'The Ethnography of Schooling'. *Journal of Reading* Vol. 28(5):476-479
- Sindell, P. (1969). Anthropological Approaches to the Study of Education. *Review of Educational Research*, 39(5), pp. 593-605
- Spillane, J. & Thompson, C. (1997) Reconstructing Conceptions of Local Capacity: The Local Education Agency's Capacity for Ambitious Instructional Reform. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 19(2), p.185.
- Splinder, G. & Splinder, L. (1985) ETHNOGRAPHY: An Anthropological View. *Educational Horizons*, 63(4), pp.154-157
- Zaharlick, A. (1985) Ethnography in Anthropology and Its Value for Education. *Theory into Practice*, 31(2), pp.116-125 *Qualitative Issues in Educational Research*.

“WHO AM I?": METHODOLOGICAL DILEMMA IN THE FIELD OF TRANSNATIONAL ISLAMIC MOVEMENT

*Wahyu Kuncoro*

*Social Anthropology Department, Universität Zürich*

In this so called “an accelerated world” (Eriksen, 2016<sup>31</sup>), most anthropologists realized that a clear demarcation between home and abroad is getting blurred. Therefore, some arguments stating that cultural identity is a fixed category has always been questioned since it is socially constructed and situated in a given context. This particular condition has shaped and reshaped the way ethnographers depicting the complexity and diversity of socio-cultural practices in one particular locality. Meanwhile, they seem to be less sensitive and/or ignoring the fast exchange of information and knowledge that has also been influencing their subjectivity – as a social being or a researcher, about the field. On the other hand, I assume that the field is not merely as a passive object but also the potential one distracting ethnographer’s subjectivity. This paper is the modification of methodological chapter of my dissertation, in which I engaged with multi-sited ethnography by following *Tablighi Jama’at* mission – an Islamic reformist group established in India performing “door to door missionary” style from Indonesia to Cambodia. This paper is somehow my reflexivity on how I deal with several positionalities since the early stage of proposal writing into the ongoing research in the field. In short, as a Muslim studying Islam and/or Muslim community will certainly put me into paradox, on one hand this shared religious identity somehow becomes advantageous for me to be easily accepted by board members of *Tablighi Jama’at*, but on the other hand, my subjectivity – personal social life, has also been distracting my view over this community. Besides that, I have to deal with the pragmatic choice where the *Tablighi jama’at* members often assure me that in order to understand them, there is no other choice than practicing what they do.

*Keywords: Methodological Dilemma, Subjectivity, Multi-sited Ethnography, Tablighi Jama’at*

<sup>31</sup> Eriksen, T.H., 2016. *Overheating: An Anthropology of Accelerated Change*. London: Pluto Press.



## Collective Violence, Peace Building and Reconciliation: Anthropological Perspectives

Coordinators: Yustinus Tri Subagya (Universitas Sanata Dharma),  
Herry Yogaswara & Cahyo Pamungkas (Indonesian Institute of Sciences/LIPI)

The collective violence has become the recurrence phenomenon in the post-colonial history of Indonesia. A different pattern of collective violence took place in different regime of government. Unlike Soekarno era that deployed military to fight against pogroms and rebellions, the regime of New Order under Soeharto used state apparatuses to perpetrate violence toward civil societies for creating stability. After the extermination of communist party sympathisers in 1965-1966, Soeharto oppressed people or groups that challenged his power such as Islam fundamentalism. People who opposed to the government plan were also forced to agree unless they were intimidated or executed. Moreover, the regime also put the deliberation of issues on ethnicity, race and religion under their control to prevent the intergroup conflicts. However, when the authoritarian regime of New Order begins to weak followed by the resignation of from his presidency in 1998, the ethno-religious violence erupted in several areas. Starting the riot in Situbondo which attacked the religious buildings, the violence wide spread in other cities such as Banyuwangi, Kebumen, Tasikmalaya, Lampung, Surakarta, Jakarta and Medan. Not only Chinese descent who were attacked or harassed, other ethno-religious groups and minorities drag and became victim of the violent conflicts. Some conflicts were resolved by the chase fire or peace accord with the intervention of the central government, some others were left ended without reconciliation. This panel is going to discuss the contribution of anthropological studies in the discourse of violent conflict and peace building approaches. We hope that we can learn and update new research and theoretical framework as well as methodological aspects in the study of violent conflict and peace.

### FAMILIAL TERRORISM: AN ANALYSIS ON FAMILIAL SUICIDE BOMBINGS IN SURABAYA 2018

*Al Chaidar Abdurrahman Puteh*

*Universitas Malikussaleh*

*Dedy Tabrani*

*Sekolah Tinggi Ilmu Kepolisian*

*Herdi Sahrasad*

*Universitas Paramadina*

*This article examines the three bombings in Surabaya, West Java on May 2018 where a few minor group of intellectual was behind the scene of this bombings plot. By utilizing the Gramsci's concept of organic intellectual and Hoffman theory of violent intellectual, we elaborate this bombing plot in an anthropological way of analysis. The Surabaya 2018 bombing was a series of bomb explosions in various places in Surabaya and Sidoarjo, East Java on 13-14 May 2018. Three places included places of worship in the Church of Santa Maria Tidak Bercela, GKI Diponegoro, and the Central Pentecostal Church of Surabaya (GPPS) Sawahan. Two other places each in the Wonocolo Flats complex in Taman, Sidoarjo and Surabaya Polrestabes Headquarters. Sociologically, the group of JAD (Jamaah Ansharu Daulah) in Surabaya was claimed to be responsible as perpetrators. JAD is an organisation where many of organic violent intellectuals is grouped to run a radical support for anti-establishment movement in Indonesia aspired for the*





*khilafah (caliphate, Islamic super state) in Syria and Iraq run under the banner of ISIS (Islamic State of Iraq and Syria).*

*Keywords: familial suicide bombing; ISIS; Surabaya; JAD; familial terrorism, organic violent intellectual*

## INTRODUCTION

Terrorism in Indonesia is still rampant and becomes a scourge of society. The terrorist bomb attack in Surabaya in May 2018 has shocked the public in Indonesia. Bomb attacks on three churches in Surabaya, also in Mapolrestabes Surabaya and Sidoarjo, show the ferocity of terrorism carried out by three families with very strong theological-ideological motives: where they were killed together in a suicide-structured climax action which feared inspired many Muslim families do the same thing. Not long after that, National Police Chief Tito Karnavian revealed, the National Police were still processing around 242 suspected terrorists who were arrested in several parts of Indonesia post-terror bombing in Surabaya, East Java in May 2018 ago. The arrest was carried out after a series of acts of terrorism in Surabaya. The arrests were carried out in a number of regions in the country. "To date, 242 people have been arrested (suspected terrorists) post-action in Surabaya," Tito said at that time. (*thejakartapost.com* 16/9/18 and *Kompas daily*, 17/9/18).

The terrorism movement still thrives in Indonesia. However, his character changed from era to era. According to Solahudin (2018), a researcher at the Center for Terrorism and Social Conflict Studies at the University of Indonesia (UI), before 2010, terrorist groups in Indonesia targeted western or far enemy symbols. They attack America and its allies, while any symbol of them must be attacked. But after 2010, terrorist groups changed their targets slightly from what was formerly enemy to near enemy. Their targets, namely the government, police and military. since the Bali Bomb 1, hundreds of people have been killed in Indonesia by terrorist attacks. So far, the suspected terrorists are still "entrusted" in the police offices of the area where they were arrested. Professor Tito Karnavian, The National Police Chief asserted that his party continues to monitor domestic terrorist networks affiliated with international terrorist networks such as ISIS (Islamic State of Syria and Iraq) and Al-Qaeda. In this regard, the Special Detachment 88 of the National Police Headquarters has maps of these terrorism networks and their affiliates.

The Detachment 88 has all its maps. Right now The Police have Jamaah Ansharud Daulah (JAD), Jamaah Ansharu Khilafah (JAK), Mujahidin Timor Indonesia and soon who have affiliated with transnational terrorist movement. " And, later we will see what affiliates are they and to what extent," Tito said. Radicalism and terrorism still thrive in Indonesia amid the recent economic worsening and the sharpening of the rich and poor widening gulf in the country. Many Muslims are disappointed and frustrated with this increasingly sharp economic gap. And their acts of terror as an option in the name of religion, are not merely ideological reasons, but also find their material reasons that injustice and economic inequality in Indonesia have been very painful and terrible, for example OXFAM's findings on economic disparity and injustice that jolt the people.

The results of the OXFAM survey (2017), one of the independent international NGO institutions, stated that the wealth of four Indonesian tycoons was equivalent to the wealth of 100 million poor Indonesians. Oxfam is a well-known social institution and released on Wednesday, February 23, 2017, that Indonesia is the most unequal country in the world. " Indonesia as one of the most unequal countries in the world," OXFAM reported.



In OXFAM's report, four of the richest tycoons in Indonesia are described as having the same wealth as 40% of Indonesians or the wealth of 100 million people who still live below the poverty line. OXFAM bases this calculation on the poverty standards issued by the World Bank. So far, the existence of the Antiterrorism Law that was just passed some time ago has made easier for the National Police to deal with terrorism crimes. The old law does not give Police the authority to take action. Now, with the Law Number 5 Year 2018, it will make it easier for the National Police to eradicate terrorism. But the problem is not so easy and simple, even though there is the legal umbrella to deal with terrorism in Indonesia. Precisely, what is important is how to prevent the growth of terrorism and how to overcome the rich and poor widening gulf in Indonesia now and future. Income inequality, economic disparity and social injustice felt by Muslims make them partially choose the path of violence and terrorism to fight anyone who is established or in power.

In Indonesia, as in the Middle East, many Muslims launch social movements to fight injustice and economic inequality in their own ways. Various Muslim groups such as Jamaah Islamiyah, Majelis Mujahidin Indonesia, Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia, Jamaah Ansharud Daulah (JAD), Jamaah Ansharud Khilafah (JAK), Mujahidin Indonesia Timur (MIT), Islamic Defenders Front (FPI) and so on, are trying to build strength to face and fight what they call liberalism, pluralism, secularism (Sepilis) and injustice of the *'thogut'* regime. *Thoghut* is an Islamic terminology denoting a focus of worship other than Allah. In traditional theology, the term often connotes idols, Satan and jinn. The term is also applied to profane tyrannical power, as implied in the Quran (surah An-Nisa verse 60).

#### *Islamic Activism*

Social movements in Islam are commonly referred to various literature on social movement with the term of "Islamic Activism". And there are no clear limits on Islamic activism in question. Definition on Islamic Activism in the frame of social movements can be interpreted as mobilization of resistance to support the Muslims' interests and goals.

Sociological studies on Islamic Activism generally are in several major domains, namely: first, violence and hostility. Second, violence and contention. Third, networks and alliances, and Fourth, culture and framing. Nevertheless, framing in studies of contemporary Islamic movements, especially the study of movements initiated and witnessed by radical Islamic groups, in general it has these three domains are used as tools analysis and commonly referred to as Islamic activism structure.

The network also plays an important role in the movement of radical Islam. Islamic activists are rooted in a networked society whose complexes tend to be more informal rather than formalized institutionalization. Formal Muslim organization such as the Muslim Brotherhood in Egypt, for instance, was established through networks that tended to exceed the size of the formally organizational scope linking activists with Islamists, friends, family, and other colleagues. In addition to incentives and networks, ideas also hold important role in Islamic Activism. This was expressed by Carrie Wickham (2003) when studying on the framing in the context of recruitment and expansion of Islamic *dakwah*. More specifically, even though at the beginning of individual youth and student interests often become an attraction for them to join the movement. This is supported by the ability of the movement to frame activism as a moral obligation that makes the movement a success, especially with regard to recruitment into high-risk activism.

Frameworks of moral obligations that encourage students and youth to embrace an ideology that commands participation as an obligation moral, demanding self-sacrifice, and encouraging



commitment keep going. The success of this framing and discussion was by Wickham called transvaluation of value - a realignment priority that guide individual actions. The success of this framing that Wickham calls the transvaluation of value - a realignment of priorities that guides individual actions. The resonance power of framing depends heavily on the disappointment of society due to political repression, economic difficulties, and feelings of helplessness before extraordinary powers and the faceless process of globalization.

The power of resonance of this framing is very much dependent on the society caused by political repression, economic difficulties, and feelings of helplessness in front of extraordinary powers and the faceless process of globalization. In sum, Islamic activism that undergoes radicalization turns into radicalist and fundamentalist groups which then to partially choose the path of terrorism in their struggle to uphold the Islamic State. Therefore, terrorism cannot be separated from the ideals of building an Islamic State which they believe to be an alternative ideology towards the Republic of Indonesia which initiated and based on the Pancasila (Five Principle) ideology since on August 17, 1945. In this connection, terrorist bomb attacks in Surabaya are the main point for this paper to analyze the terrorist actions of three churches in the city, which have become a new precedent, namely the emergence of family terrorism which shocked the Indonesian people.

#### *Surabaya Bombing in 2018*

The Surabaya 2018 bombing was a series of bomb explosions in various places in Surabaya and Sidoarjo, East Java on 13-14 May 2018. Bombings in three churches in Surabaya and also in Mapolrestabes Surabaya and Sidoarjo were a ferocity of terrorism committed by three families with motives very strong theology: jihad and wanting to go to heaven as a family together. All actors from a series of bomb attacks in Surabaya were carried out by a family of six, including Dita Upriyanto (48), his wife Puji Kuswati (43) and invited four of his children, Yusuf Fadil (18), Firman Halim (16), Fadillah Sari (12), and Pamela Rizkika (9). National Police Chief, Tito Karnavian, in his press conference stated that this family had just been back from Syria and was a sympathizer of the Islamic State of Iraq and Sham (ISIS) and was a network of the Daulah Ansharud Jamaah (JAD) and Jamaah Ansharut Tauhid (JAT).

In the division of his duties, Dita Upriyanto was the driver of the Avanza car who crashed into the GPPS of the Sawahan Congregation. Before committing the crime, Dita took down his wife Puji Kuswati and her two daughters, Fadillah Sari (12) and Pamela Rizkika (9), at the GKI Diponegoro. These three people have been paired with three bombs wrapped around the waist. In the police statement, his wife's body and two children were damaged in the abdomen. While the perpetrators in the Catholic Church of Santa Maria Tak Bercela are Dita's sons, namely Yusuf Fadil (18) and Firman Halim (16). They ride motorbikes and hold bombs to be blown up. The Islamic State of Iraq and Syria (ISIS) through its news agency, *Amaq*, stated that they were responsible for this attack. There is one big circle that is not revealed from this family suicide bomb network. The large network consists of clerics who provide recitations containing orders and encouragement to carry out family suicide bombings. Not yet known how and what the contents of their communication. They communicate through games to avoid the monitoring of security forces. This communication technique is very creative and the results are truly undetectable, unexpected and very terrible.

There is a statement accompanying the malignancy as jihad. God (Allah SWT) rejects the claim of jihad in the name of his religion which is noble and full of humanism. (Quran, Verse 22: 40). God (Allah SWT) strongly rejects the partial actions of some people over others where attacks on



monasteries, churches, synagogues and mosques are called malignancies. All cruelty, savagery, destruction without knowledge is not from Islam and not the teachings of Islam. In Islam warfare also has rules, not to damage, let alone houses of worship, while plants and animals are forbidden to be destroyed.

The words of the Prophet SAW stated that: "*You must not kill parents who are old, children and women ...*" (HR. Abu Dawud, no. 2614; Ibn Abi Syaibah, 6/438; al-Baihaqi 17932). Any religion must reject brutal terrorism involving children in a very brutal suicide bombing attempt with an obscure message to be conveyed to the authorities or the public. In Islam, there is never such a thing as terrorism, as can be justified by the most radical scholars or schools. As scientists studying terrorism, the writers were truly shocked, shocked by the events that claimed dozens of lives of the names of God in monasteries, churches, synagogues and mosques involving children who never knew hatred at a very young and pure age. Even Ustadz Aman Abdurrahman as the organic leader and ideologist of this terrorist group turned out to blame and never told his followers or worshipers to commit acts of terror by seeing their own wives and children. This ISIS support shows how great violent intellectuals are behind this case. Ustadz and ulama violence like this should be studied and detected as a social network of terrorism.

Bruce Hoffman (2005: 72) mentions that terrorists are "violent intellectuals" because they use violence that relies on authoritative sources of clericalness among those with referential references, though weak. And, the intellectuals who live and care for these terrorists are *ulama su* (rotten ulamas) who are real terrorists. Children and even their parents, father and mother, are also victims who are under the influence of compulsion in a terrible indoctrination. Terrorism carried out by JAD is a crime committed by intellectual actors who are anti-human and renegade.

For Gramsci (1971: 110), intellectuals consist of two regions, namely theory (traditional intellectual) and relate it to social reality (organic intellectual). Organic intellectuals are thus intellectuals who knowingly and are able to connect existing social theories and realities, and they join revolutionary groups to support and counter hegemony in a planned transformation. Traditional intellectuals are intellectuals who exist on campuses, in contrast to organic intellectuals who live in the midst of society such as monks and clerics and priests who try to answer every problem that arises from the lower-flowing society who want a simplistic answer.

Organic intellectuals often give fatwas in response to every question that arises. These answers or fatwas are then translated by the community in a simple way, with violence and ferocity for each solution of a complicated and controversial problem. Certainly the brutal and sadistic brutality and savagery is the *khawarij*, a deviant people in Islam. Attacking a *zimmi* infidel is wrong, especially when a house detonates a house of worship, what a surprise if one is in the name of Islam; but instead destroy what God forbids to destroy. The words of the Prophet Muhammad SAW strictly forbade barbarity and ferocity in any form and in any situation, even in war: "*Don't mutilate, do not kill children, or women, or elderly parents, or monks and pastors in their places of worship.*" (Hadith, narrated by Muslim, number 1731). Those who dare to violate this hadith are only Wahhabi who are referred to in Islam as the *khawarij*.

In the study of terrorism, Al Chaidar (2015: 255) stated that there are three types Wahabi: (1) Wahabi Shururi; (2) Wahabi Jihadi, and (3) Wahabi Takfiri. This takfiri Wahabi is an exaggeration in expressing his piety. It is Wahabi Takfiri who fonda to attack all religious people in all of his places of worship, even those who are fellow Muslims are brutally killed. This takfiri Wahabi



believes and misleads some people to support their political goals of reaching the position of caliph without thinking about ethical and legal processes. They straddle sharia legality openly.

If the *khawarij* organize, they like to make a name that seems to be a sacred institution that defends the establishment of *daulah* (state) and the caliphate. Even fighting in Islam must go through the command of Amir al-mukminin agreed upon by the Muslims not by small groups underground who are not clear who they are. The *khawarij* are people who diligently worship and dare to oppose the Prophet Muhammad. Their appearance seemed fierce but greatly damaged the image of Islam as a religious and humane religion. JAD as the *khawarij* has a Wahabi Takfiri ideology that dares to fight the Prophet and God at once. The victims killed by *Khawarij* were the best victims loved by Allah. The faithful security apparatus who succeeded in killing the *khawarij*, is the best killer who does not need to fear human abuse on any pretext.

#### RELATED RESEARCHES

This review literature was conducted to help plan our research on "Shifting motives and goals of terrorism: a case study of church bomb attacks in Surabaya." The main problem or research question that will be studied is how is the transformation of changes in motives and patterns of terrorist attacks in Indonesia? The concrete question is why does terrorism in Surabaya involve women and children as martyrs? Therefore, in general the purpose of this research is to analyze the evolution of changes in patterns and motives of terror attacks in Indonesia.

In order to answer the problem or research question, we propose two methods of literature review. First, tracking efforts on a number of literatures that discuss terrorism and radicalism. Second, tracking efforts on a number of literature discussing the involvement of women and children in terrorist suicide bombings. These two methods become approaches to review literature on a number of articles in several journals.

Schuurman, Bakker, Gill and Bouhana (2018) discussed the use of the term "lone wolf" which is attached and used by academics and observers in describing the phenomenon of a single attack of terror. The concept of lone wolf is a terror attack with single and independent actors inaccurate because in reality what is called the lone wolf attack is a planned terror attack. In fact, they generally have good social relations with the community. The analytic concept used in dissecting a single terrorist called "lone wolf" is a social analytic of perpetrators which includes the social ties of actors with society, social ties with other groups etc. This concept becomes important to understand so that radicalism never goes alone but there is a process that forms bonds between groups so as to make militant. The conclusions are: first, single actors tend not to care about the security system when operating. secondly, they are involved in interactions with others that allow their actions to leak or be known. Third, they have social relations to build motivation and ability to do violence. Fourth, there is no single actor attack carried out independently or unplanned. In contrast, the "lone wolf" terror attack was carried out in a planned and systematic manner.

Nava Nuraniyah (2018) dissected the process of radicalization of women in Indonesia, especially those belonging to the ISIS group. Including is the case of three Indonesian migrant workers who are members of the ISIS group through social media. why do women become extremist and radical? How far do they have a self-agency? Why do women play traditional roles as wives while others choose the path of activism to join the ISIS group? Are some of the questions raised in this article. This article aims to uncover the factors that cause women to be involved in radical and extremist actions. The research method used is a virtual ethnographic approach. The authors of





the article conducts interviews and observations of a number of women who are members of several communities on social media. The results of the study have some interesting findings such as the involvement of women in ISIS radicalism is a personal choice not for coercion, personal choices tend to be influenced by socio-economic conditions that allow women to choose choices radically, besides, it also shows gender bias in counter-radicalism programs that tend to regard women as victims of brainwashing, the fact is that women are not just victims but also agents of radicalism provocateurs.

Karen Jacques and Paul J. Taylor (2013) describe the social and educational background of women involved in acts of terrorism. In addition, the background of this research seeks to change the paradigm of patriarchal domination of terrorism. In the case examined by the authors, terrorism does not recognize gender. How is the involvement of women in acts of terrorism and how can terrorism be carried out by women into questions posed by Jacques and Taylor. Jacques and Taylor aim to show that the involvement of women in acts of terrorism is not just an act of frustration or pressure of life but is a rational action not just a mental disorder. The social concept of isolation is an instrument to find out the process of radicalization of women. This concept explains several variables; marital status, immigrant status and religious conversion. The results of the study found that the characterization of female terrorists as isolated individuals who have no attachment to social groups, lack of consistency in the level of education has a correlation to women's terrorism and the economy is not a single factor of women's involvement in acts of terrorism. Social, economic and educational dimensions are indeed important to know the involvement of women in acts of terrorism, but are not a single factor to be the reason for terrorism. It could be that women's involvement is precisely because of the dominance of patriarchal culture that makes women in husband and wife relationships become victims of the husband's doctrine of women to commit acts of terror.

Robert J. Brym and Bader Araj (2006) examined the intifada namely the Palestinian resistance against Israel. The Palestinian intifada movement is not infrequently carried out by carrying out suicide bombing. Social scientists tend to see the suicide bomb phenomenon as another frustrating and psychological act. This explanation in the Palestinian case is inaccurate because suicide bombings in Palestine have special characteristics that get religious justification. What factors make suicide bombings a Palestinian resistance against Israel? What are the motives and goals of suicide bombings in Palestinian-Israeli? Research offers the concept of the relationship between suicide bombings and the repressive actions of the Israeli government. This study provides one finding that suicide bombings in Israel are rational actions based on strategic calculations. In other words, the Palestinian suicide bombing is not just a form of frustration and stress, but an act of awareness to fight the repressive actions of the Israeli government against Palestinians. This article also shows the correlation between Israel's repressive actions will be followed by the ranks of Palestinian suicide bombings.

Tunde Agara (2015) discusses the relationship between women, gender and terrorism. The role of women in acts of terrorism can no longer be underestimated. Women's terrorism acts have tremendous strength but become a new history in the world about the involvement of women in terrorism today in the 21st century. Questions about the motivation of some women to be actively involved in terrorism organizations are the lighters in the discussion of this article. For example, do they participate on religious, political or personal grounds? Is the increase in the number of women involved in acts of terrorism carried out through the kidnapping mechanism? Therefore, the dimension of the relationship between gender, women and terrorism is a polemic in the





discussion of this article. The involvement of women in acts of terrorism breaks the patriarchal tradition in seeing the role of women merely in the domestic or secondary area. Women's actions in terrorism organizations actively generate new concepts about women's stereotypes that are active not static. This article gave birth to a new idea of female stereotypes that transcended the traditions of the patriarchal system. The involvement of women in acts of terrorism to suicide bombers should not be a form of deviation, but a rational choice with strategic calculations. This finding is the basis for formulating a counter-terrorism concept that is more egalitarian in gender. Counter-terrorism that is gender biased will become a gap for terrorist groups to enter by actively utilizing women's involvement.

Andrew Fraser (2017) discusses the problem of increasing the number of children involved in Afghanistan in the act of suicide bomb martyrs. The involvement of children in the actions of Taliban martyrs is a recent phenomenon in the conflict in Afghanistan. This problem became a polemic in the discussion of this article. Why are children involved in suicide bombings in Afghanistan? What factors are behind the martyr's action? The concept of the exclusiveness of the education system in Afghanistan has triggered a process of radicalization in Afghanistan. The results of the study found that some indications of child involvement in acts of martyrdom terrorism were caused more by the existence of poverty factors which then led children to an educational system managed by the Taliban network. This exclusive education system then provides a doctrine of the image of heaven, sex and welfare, which gave birth to militancy against the Taliban in order to change the family life of the child. In some cases, the role of community leaders was also found; mullahs and Taliban network scholars who facilitate children to enter education managed by the Taliban.

Burcu Pinar Alakoc (2017) discuss about a suicide bombing which is a deadly attack rather than a stationary controlled bomb. In particular, this article dissects suicide bombings as a strategic rational choice to destroy what is considered an enemy. Does the implementation of suicide bombing strategies correlate with goals? This question is a light discussion for this article. The author wants to see whether the suicide bombing strategy is a straggly instrument to kill the enemy or vice versa. The concept of lethality or lethal is an instrument to measure the success rate of suicide bombings. Therefore, this concept provides a meaning that sophisticated technology weapons do not compare with suicide bombings because they are relatively costly but have a deadly effect to destroy the enemy. The results of the study show that the strategy of suicide terrorism has more victim targets than other weapons instruments. Suicide terrorism is very difficult to control compared to other strategies. Therefore, the instrument of suicide is the weapon of terrorism groups by using special attributes inherent in the body.

Gray and Matchin (2008) explores the use of children as terrorists and the organizational structure of one of the most feared terrorist groups in the world, Hamas. In particular, this paper investigates terrorist children who are members of the Tamil Tiger organization in Sri Lanka. How are child soldiers in the Tamil Tiger organization trained and indoctrinated? The concept of child terrorism is an instrument for discussion of the author. Defining the concept of child terrorism will have consequences for counter-terrorism policies against children involved in acts of terrorism. The results of Gray and Matchin's research show that the involvement of children in Tamil Tiger organizations is more influenced by family conditions. In addition, the propaganda carried out by the leaders of the Tigers has been able to provide doctrine to the children from the outset to carry out combat against the Sri Lankan government.



Julie Chernov Hwang and Kirsten E. Schulze (2018) explore the development and evolution of the paths of the entry of radicalism in Indonesia through recitation, conflict, family and school relations. In addition, this article talks about how relational relationships play a role in each path. This research is an attempt to understand the Ambon conflict by understanding the evolution of the development of the entry of radicalism in Ambon. How do religious-based radicalism groups enter Indonesia? The concept that stands out in this article is the evolution of jihadism in Indonesia through four entrances namely recitation, school, local conflict and family relationships. These four concepts are the key to understanding the input of radicalism in Indonesia. The results of the study show that the entry of radicalism in Indonesia through four doors, among others: recitation, local conflict, family and school relations. Recitation instruments are the most prominent door in shaping the process of becoming radicalism.

#### RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study uses library research methods that utilize library resources to obtain research data. Strictly speaking, library research limits its activities only to library collection materials before we conduct field research. This research is a preliminary study of familial suicide terrorism, which is the first reality in the world that challenges science to find its theoretical explanation. The library research we did was not just about reading and recording literature or books as many people have understood so far. What we called as library research or often also called literature study, is a series of activities related to library data collection methods, reading and recording and processing research materials.

#### RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

Children are the most innocent, innocent, sincere, pure and never hate anyone who becomes his friend in a plural and multicultural environment. Damaging them by indoctrinating or taking them to participate in war or acts of violence is a crime. Children will never be able to be perpetrators of any crime, let alone those with a malignant nuance full of hatred. Exploding bombs in places of worship that are not fortified by weapons is an extraordinary crime. Inviting children to commit crimes is to sacrifice them. Children always fall victim to parental influence. And, parents are often under the influence of *ulama su'* (*rotten ulama*) fatwas whose work only indoctrinates and then runs away from their responsibilities. This kind of ulama is the real culprit.

The results of our research show that the scholars of Islamic radicals in Surabaya and surrounding areas are organic intellectuals who break the hegemony of the capitalist rulers in Indonesia. Seen through the concept of Gramsci, then in order to break the hegemony of the bourgeoisie and formulate a new world view of the proletarian class, Gramsci has a very important favorite instrument, namely "organic intellectual". This group played a significant role in waging a "position war" to take over hegemony.

Our research looks at how the influence of the ulema as using the concept of organic Antonio Gramsci. By using the term "intellectual" in a broad sense that is practically equivalent to the "intelligentsia" or all educated classes, Gramsci (1971: 53) sees generally every major class producing its own intellectual layer in charge of maintaining the continuity of its class culture and uniting them based on certain solidarity. Influential scholars in many cases of terrorism anywhere in the world have strong networks, references and followers. Unlike traditional intellectuals who do not have followers or worshipers, organic intellectuals have knowledge and can use and abuse their knowledge towards their own followers, students or worshipers.



Ulama as organic intellectuals are respectable circles and politically have a very crucial position in society. For Gramsci, organic intellectuals are intellectuals who not only explain external social life based on scientific principles, but also use the language of culture to express real feelings and experiences that cannot be expressed by the people themselves (Leszek Kolakowski, 1978: 240). Organic intellectuals are those who are able to feel emotions, enthusiasm and what is felt by the workers, side with them and express what is experienced and objective tendencies of society. In the Surabaya Bomb case (2018) this shows how Khalid Abubakar and also Yahya Khalid played a very organic role, attached and integrated and became a part which then escaped from the pursuit of security forces after the explosion of familial suicide bombs. There is no one who claims morally and intellectually responsible for this family suicide bombing incident where the wives and children of the pilgrims from this cleric recite.

Organic intellectuals such as radical clerics always have answers and reasons for each problem faced. In the effort of social change, it is necessary to formulate and organize an intellectual layer that expresses the actual experience of society with learned beliefs and language. It has the meaning that organic intellectuals will present the voices of the interests of the lower classes of society with high cultural languages so that the worldview, lower class values and beliefs extend throughout society and become a universal language. If this stage is successful, the road will be wider for the lower classes to make revolutionary changes, namely to seize political power.

These Gramsci ideas are very relevant both as literature and as a tool to build social movements, especially the terrorism movement. Antonio Gramsci saw the importance of that revolutionary will and determination in the hearts of the proletariat to overthrow the power of the bourgeoisie which had pervaded all dimensions of community life. Therefore, a group of intellectuals and revolutionary parties is needed to realize socialism which in the discussion of religion is known as khilafah or islamic super state.

Unlike traditional intellectuals such as lecturers or researchers or other educated people such as teachers, scholars are organic intellectuals who are full of the agenda for the struggle for extra parliamentary political power and even extra judicial. Thus it is something very important that the existence of intellectuals is not in the ivory tower, elitist, but must be united and on the side of the workers. Likewise, political parties do not have the duty to inject into the working class a true awareness, but make them aware of the implications of the awareness they already have and the aspects of the struggle. This is all due to the efforts of the workers to plant cultural and ideological hegemony before starting the struggle for political power.

Islamic scholars in Indonesia are always beside their followers and guide them to always be on the political path to achieve the goal of owning the state and the caliphate itself that implements the Islamic legal system. Because in Gramsci's view social change is not solely an attempt to deal with the problems of economic and physical strength, but also involves the struggle for cultural and ideological territories: an effort of the lower classes to free themselves from the culture of the bourgeoisie and to build their own cultural values together with the oppressed and intellectuals who take sides. In this context it can be said that intellectual supremacy is a precondition for achieving political power (Leszek Kolakowski, 1978: 242).

For Gramsci the process of social change is not merely a struggle for political power, but rather a struggle for cultural and ideological power. Gramsci's theory is very appropriate to use in seeing the role and characteristics of Islamic radical scholars in Indonesia in spreading ideology, awareness to live freely from the democratic legal system that has long been opposed. The ulamas



carried out a long struggle which was to change people's views from secular views to religious views even to sectarian views. The ulamas as organic intellectuals also planted certain values that were previously unknown to the public. Likewise, a socialist revolution cannot be carried out once through a struggle for political power, but requires a long time in a war of positions to change the views and values of civil society. If civil society has been hegemonized, actually de facto power is already in the hands of the working class, and political leadership can be easily taken over.

These organic scholars are very different from traditional intellectuals who often prostitute themselves in order to get a development project that is shared by the executive authorities. In addition, in the context of today's world order where all aspects of life are under the hegemony of neoliberal capitalism in the form of exploitation of workers to commodification and consumerism, the Gramscian idea of a counter-hegemonic transnational *blocco storico* (transnational historical block or progressive power) becomes very important. to be seen because it is attached to the group of organic scholars who are trusted, loved and protected by the radical Islamic community in Indonesia.

## CONCLUSIONS

Terrorism always appears in its very brutal and sadistic form. Terrorism also always emerges viciously, unpredictable before and present in the most perfect form: unrivaled savagery. This savagery is only able to be done by the Khawarij in the past and the Jamaah Ansharud Daulah in the present. The Jamaah Ansharud Daulah (JAD) is a modern khawarij which is very dangerous to the continuation of Islamic jihad and dakwah. JAD practices sectarian teachings that are very anti-human, namely violent terrorism. This ferocious terrorism was presented by people who claimed to struggle to uphold the religion of God, a religion full of love. This terrorism also appears always in its unpredictability and unpredictable form by reason and science.

Based on our study and research, it seems that a number of reviews were found which examined the phenomenon of the involvement of women and children in acts of terrorism. Thus, this phenomenon is new in the pattern and mode of terrorism attacks. However, in general this literature review has a correlation with the dissertation research plan that will be carried out specifically the involvement of women and children in acts of terrorism. Organic scholars always need organizations as their political vehicles to mobilize and also crush communities for their political goals which are considered noble and sacred. Likewise, the concept of Gramsci's hegemony is very useful and becomes an important lesson for party and intellectual politicians. If a party wants to be big and successful, all this when the party is able to articulate the real interests of its people. And it is the duty of intellectuals to become agents of change and social liberation.

Unfortunately, some rotten ulamas (*ulama su'*) in Indonesia use the party not as an instrument for achieving virtue, but rather use the Jamaah Ansharu Daulah organization and the Jamaah Ansharu Tauhid, for instance, as their cultural vehicle in organizing their followers to launch terrorism. So, the Surabaya bombing by familial terrorism was inevitable and this tragic terrorism act is a new phenomenon in Indonesia, even in the World.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

Agara, Tunde. "Gendering Terrorism: Women, Gender, Terrorism and Suicide Bombers," *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, Vol. Vol. 5, No. 6, (June, 2015).



- Alakoc, Burcu Pinar. "When Suicide Kills: An Empirical Analysis of the Lethality of Suicide Terrorism," *International Journal of Conflict and Violence*, Vol. 11, No. 8, (2017).
- Brym, Robert J. and Bader Araj, "Suicide Bombing as Strategy and Interaction: The Case of the Second Intifada," *Social Forces*, Vol. 84, No. 4 (June, 2006).
- Chaidar, Al. "Catatan Kritis atas UU Antiterorisme", *Kompas* 4 Juni 2018.
- Fraser, Andrew. "Martyrdom's Children: The Tragedy of Child Suicide Bombers in Afghanistan," *Canadian Military Journal*, Vol. 17, No. 3, (Summer, 2017).
- Gramsci, Antonio, and Quitin Hoare. *Selections from the prison notebooks*. Vol. 294. London: Lawrence and Wishart, 1971.
- Gray, David H. and Tom Owen Matchin, "Children: The new face of terrorism," *International NGO Journal*, Vol. 3, No. 6, (June, 2008).
- Hoffman, Bruce. *Inside terrorism*. Washington: Columbia University Press, 2006.
- Hwang, Julie Chernov. and Kirsten E. Schulze, "Why They Join: Pathways into Indonesian Jihadist Organizations", *Terrorism and Political Violence* (June, 2018).
- Jacques, Karen. and Paul J. Taylor, "Myths and Realities of Female-Perpetrated Terrorism". *Law and Human Behavior*, Vol. 31, No. 1, (2013).
- Kolakowski, Leszek, *Main Current of Marxism*, Vol. III, Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1978.
- Kompas daily*, 17/9/18.
- Nuraniyah, Nava. "Not just Brainwashed: Understanding the Radicalization of Indonesian Female Supporters of the Islamic State," *Terrorism and Political Violence*, (2018).
- Sahasrad, Herdi. Al Chaidar, 'Tamkin' terrorism a new security threat, *The Jakarta Post*, Saturday, Nov 17, 2018.
- Schuurman, Bart. Edwin Bakker, Paul Gill and Noemie Bouhana, "Lone Actor Terrorist Attack Planning and Preparation: A Data-Driven Analysis," *Journal of Forensic Science*, Volume 4, No. 4, (2018).
- Thejakartapost.com* 16/9/18.
- Wickham, Carrie. *Islamic Activism: A Social Movement Theory Approach*, Indiana University Press, (2003).
- Wiktorowicz, Quintan. "A Genealogy of Radical Islam." *Middle East Policy*, Vol. VIII, NO. 4. December 2001.



COMMUNAL VIOLENCE AS A STRATEGY OF LOCAL COMMUNITIES TO RESIST THE EXTRACTIVE MINING OPERATIONS IN MOROWALI, CENTRAL SULAWESI

*Bambang Hidayana*

*Department of Anthropology Universitas Gadjah Mada*

*Suharko & Andreas Budi Widyanta*

*Department of Sociology Universitas Gadjah Mada*

*This paper illustrates and explains that extractive nickel mining operations in Morowali District, Central Sulawesi have caused a variety of negative impacts that harm local communities both indigenous and transmigrants. The impact was in the form of the control of part of the local population's land by the company, and the loss of their access to obtain wood and gum resin, and sea fishing activities. Nickel mining operations have also caused damage to the environment such as air pollution, pollution of rivers and sea water and the collapse of dams which have damaged people's livelihoods, such as agricultural land, marine fisheries and ponds. Paper explains that local people are fighting to get material compensation from losses suffered. They also put political pressure on the company by using a communal violence approach rather than mere negotiation. This communal resistance arose due to distrust and social frustration experienced by local communities over mining operations and conflict resolution approaches carried out by the company through poor CSR programs, community empowerment, and security approaches that control freedom. Meanwhile, communal resistance is reproduced by local people in order to improve bargaining positions when they do not have adequate opportunities to get a job within the company and get compensation in their favor. No less important, communal resistance was rich in tactics and strategies that were able to force the government and companies to reduce dominance and violent practices in securing the mining business in Morowali.*

*Keywords: Communal violence, extractive nickel industry, local communities, CSR, distrust, social frustration*

TRACING THE ROOT OF VIOLENCE AND PEACE BUILDING IN PAPUA

*Cahyo Pamungkas*

*Indonesian Institute of Sciences (LIPI)*

This article started from a group of West Papua National Liberation Army attack on some Trans-Papua road construction workers in Nduga in December 2019, which resulted in 17 deaths including members of the Indonesian armed forces. The Nduga incident has added to the statistics of violence in Papua since the bloody Paniai incident in December 2014 which left eight Papuan students killed. The Amnesty International (2018) reports that between 2010 and 2018 there were 69 extrajudicial killings in Papua committed by security apparatus. Conflict and violence in the Land of Papua seem to be continuing since the resistance of the Free Papua movement in Manokwari in 1965 until the present day (May, 1978; Osborne, 1985; Budiarto & Liang, 1988). Referring to Galtung (1969), Bjorkagen said that it is the absence of negative peace.

Various policies, such as special autonomy, acceleration of development, and infrastructure projects have been implemented; yet have not been able to overcome the disappointment and trust of the Papuan people in the republic. Several research has been conducted including in the field of anthropology and other social sciences using ethnographic methods. However, such of studies are not referred by policymakers to resolve the Papua conflict peacefully. Therefore, this





article also aims to discuss the consequences of ethnographic research on peace-building in West Papua. My argument is there is a gap between the knowledge resulted from ethnographic research and state policies to solve the secessionist conflict of Papua.

Some studies analyzed in this article include the results of Rutherford's research (2012), Kirksey (2012), Hernawan (2013), Ondawame (2000), Viartasiwi (2016), Anderson (2012), Widjojo et al., (2008), and Rusdyarti & Pamungkas et al., (2016). These studies, we can identify the conceptual and practical implications of the findings of ethnographic research on the peace-building process in Papua. The first three studies discussed, namely Rutherford (2012), Kirksey (2012), and Hernawan (2013) narrate the situation of the Papua conflict sufficiently. All three studies employ concepts in the postmodern tradition, such as: audience, governmentality, abject, rhizome, and entanglement. If we use Rutherford's approach, Papuans are more defined by their position as object of colonialism. The performance of sovereignty conducted by the colonial government aimed to get recognition from colonized subjects. The implications of this study were Papuans must have the capability and struggle to be able to fight the performance of Indonesian sovereignty.

Unlike Rutherford (2012), Kirksey proposed the idea that the activists of the Free Papua Movement collaborate with the Indonesian side and global forces to achieve the goals of the struggle. Like a rhizome, it will grow and develop if it can twist itself in its parent tree. But the problem is Kirksey does not explore what collaboration strategies are effective for achieving Papuan freedom. As with Kirksey, Hernawan's findings (2013) have more practical implications, namely advancing the idea of transformation from theater to torture to theater of peace with a narrative based on *memoria passionis* which is a guide to reconciliation. However, the problem is that it is now difficult for the Government which is still dominated by conservative political elites who do not encourage reconciliation and listen to the narrative of the suffering of victims of Papuan political violence.

The Ondawame Study (2000), while focusing more on the analysis of the failure of the OPM before 2000, come up with the proposal that both Jakarta and Papua have a strong commitment to bring about peace. The best step is to start a dialogue to determine the types of associations that are shared. According to him, an independent Papuan political movement will disappear, if Indonesia truly recognizes the identity of the Papuans and protects their basic rights. The peace process which was born from the study of Hernawan (2013) and Ondawame (2000) has the same meeting point, namely dialogue for reconciliation and also for recognition the political identity of Papuans.

Two other studies, Anderson (2015) and Viartasiwi (2016) show different perspectives in analyzing the Papua conflict. Anderson (2015) sees that the main problem of insecurity in Papua is due to the absence of the state in the form of public services such as education and health and the absence of legal rules. While Viartasiwi (2016) views the conflict in Papua as not only vertical but more horizontal. Conflict continues because the main narrative built by the government is the narrative of separatism and the existence of predatory elites involved in the conflict industry. As an implication of these two studies, the state is required to present more in guaranteeing human security including providing education, health services, encouraging the development of the local economy and enforcing the rule of law. If the country is present by protecting the basic rights of Papuans, then the possibility of conflict's project will diminish.

The six studies above actually support the findings of Papua Road Map (Widjojo et al., 2008) or updating Papua Road Map (Rusdyarti & Pamungkas et al., 2017). Dialogue, reconciliation,



recognition, and cultural-based development are main ideas emerging from these studies of the Papua conflict. However, the national government have only taken one aspect of administratively recognition such as giving bureaucratic positions to Papuans and prioritizing education for indigenous Papuans.

Based on these studies, the further question then is why the government refuses a dialogue for reconciliation and discussing Papuan political identity. Also guarantees the fulfillment of the basic rights of Papuans and destroys the conflict industry in this area. I observe that there is still a wide gap between the results of research carried out by researchers and the peace policies implemented by the government including the Special Autonomy for Papua, the acceleration of Papua's development and infrastructure projects. To find out the gap we must retrace the history of integration and the construction of knowledge underline the current policies.

In addition to the political ideology of Indonesian nationalism, the roots of political violence against Papuans stem from knowledge constructed by anthropologists in the colonial period. A Russian Anthropologist, Miklouho Maclay has several ideas to save Papuans from the adverse effects of colonialism; Papuans must live in a region free from the control and exploitation of invaders. The simple indigenous peoples of Papua will be destroyed and destroyed by more advanced European societies or by "polluting influences" of Indonesian civilization. Unlike Maclay who wants to preserve Papuan culture from the destructive influence of the labor market and attacks by Europeans, D'Albertis sees the occupation project as an opportunity to replace the savagery of Papuans with civilization (Miklukho-Maklaï 1982, Kirksey, 2002).

The main reason for the absence of a relationship between ethnographic discourse and colonial policy is because colonial relations are characterized by internal contradictions (Kirsch, 2010). The Dutch say that Papuans are Melanesian races that are different from other Indonesian ethnicities because they have the motivation to defend the colony. In the same position, Indonesia also exploits the narrative of the differences between Indonesia and Papua to maintain its control of the region. The Indonesian narrative still tells us that Papuan civilization is still in the Stone Age, so the government has a mission to build and civilize Papuans. This narrative continues to influence politics in Papua. For example, the claim that Papuans inherently have violence is used to justify militarization in this area.

However, the mission of civilizing these Papuans in reality only emphasizes economic development oriented to capitalism. For example, the national government conducted some infrastructure projects in this region since 2015. The development of road construction massively has succeeded in increasing inter-regencies' connectivity. However, it has not been able to improve the lives and livelihoods of indigenous Papuans because migrant community is better able to utilize the road for economic activities. Road connectivity in the central mountains brings a new problem to the local population as more migrants arrive and the entry of liquor and drugs. Roads have not yet been fully utilized by Papuans, and even tend to be a source of threats in the future of Papuans.

The discussion above shows that there is still a gap between knowledge about conflict and peace in the Land of Papua and Government policies in resolving conflicts. As if, ethnographic research on the Papuan conflict stood in a space separate from state policy. In other words, ethnographic discourse seems to have no political consequences in encouraging the peace process in Papua. However, if traced further there are two fundamental differences that are difficult to meet between researchers and policymakers. The first party bases its knowledge to protect the basic



rights of Papuans through the construction of anti-violence ideas, dialogue, reconciliation, recognition, and human security. While the second party implements capitalistic development practices based on the politics of Indonesian nationalism and the mission of civilizing Papuans. In reality, the government's mission of civilizing Papuan is conducted in illiberal ways including the use of security approach. As a result, the political violence in Papua never end, refers to Appadurai (1998), legitimated by all forms of knowledge and convictions that increase inhuman degree of hostility.

*Keywords: violence, ethnography, modernity, and discursive formation.*

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Amnesty International. 2018. *Don't bother, Just let him die" Killing with impunity in Papua.* Jakarta: Amnesti Internasional Indonesia.
- Anderson, B., 2015. *Papua's insecurity: state failure in the Indonesian periphery.* Honolulu, HI: East-West Center.
- Appadurai, A., 1998. Dead certainty: Ethnic violence in the era of globalization. *Development and change*, 29(4), pp.905-925.
- Budiardjo, C., & Liong, L. S. 1988. *West Papua: the obliteration of a people.* Thornton Heath: Tapol.
- Björkhagen, M., 2016. *Understanding Illiberal Peace-building: An Analysis of Conflict, Peace and Reconciliation in North Maluku Province, Indonesia.*
- Galtung, J., 1969. Violence, peace, and peace research. *Journal of peace research*, 6(3), pp.167-191.
- Hernawan, Y.B., 2013. *From the theatre of torture to the theatre of peace: The politics of torture and re-imagining peacebuilding in Papua, Indonesia.* Dissertation in Australia National University.
- Kirksey, E., 2012. *Freedom in entangled worlds: West Papua and the architecture of global power.* Duke University Press.
- Kirksey, E. 2002. 'Anthropology and Colonial Violence in West Papua.' *Cultural Survival Quarterly*, 26(3).
- May, B., 1978. *The Indonesian Tragedy* (pp. 137-ff). London: Routledge & K. Paul.
- Miklukho-Maklaï, N.N., 1982. *Travels to New Guinea: diaries, letters, documents.* Central Books Limited.
- Ondawame, O., 2000. *One People, One Soul: West Papuan Nationalism and the Organisasi Papua Merdeka.* Dissertation in Australia National University.
- Osborne, R., 1985. *Indonesia's secret war: The guerilla struggles in Irian Jaya.* Pandora Press.



- Pamungkas, C. and Rusdiarti, S.R. eds., 2017. *Updating Papua road map: proses perdamaian, politik kaum muda, dan diaspora Papua*. Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia.
- Kirsch, S., 2010. Ethnographic representation and the politics of violence in West Papua. *Critique of Anthropology*, 30(1), pp.3-22.
- Rutherford, D., 2012. *Laughing at Leviathan: sovereignty and audience in West Papua*. University of Chicago Press.
- Viartasiwi, N., 2016. *Beyond Separatist Conflict: Political Economy of Violence in West Papua* (Doctoral dissertation, 立命館大学).
- Widjojo, M.S., Amiruddin, A.R., Pamungkas, C. and Dewi, R., 2008. *Papua road map*. Jakarta: Indonesian Institute of Sciences.

HARMONY IN DIVERSITY: CONFLICT MANAGEMENT IN THE OUTER ISLAND OF ENGGANO, BENGKULU

*Intan Permata Sari*

*State Institute of Islamic Studies, Bengkulu*

*Enggano community is a plural society, besides ethnic variety, it is also multi-religion. They have five indigenous tribes (Kauno, Katora, Kaarubi, Kaharuba, and Kahaoa) and one migrant tribe (Kaamay). Kaamay is a new tribe created by the indigenous Enggano community to accommodate migrants to become part of the social structure of the Enggano community. The impact of the large number of migrants entering Enggano is the shift of the majority of believers from Christianity to Islam. Although very multiethnic and multireligion, Enggano is able to maintain harmony within and ensure the peace of its people. Very rare conflicts occur within the Enggano community. This is because adat has local wisdom in regulating community values and norms so that potential conflicts can be prevented. All Enggano people (including Kaamay) must obey the traditional rules because they are conditioned as part of the Enggano tribe and must give up their previous cultural identity. This paper shows that the domination of adat which is managed and adhered to together can prevent the occurrence of frictions within the community. Adat successfully guarantees the rights, obligations and social status of the members of community so that there is no social jealousy between migrants and indigenous people.*

*Keywords: Conflict Management, Enggano, Adat, Local Wisdom*

## INTRODUCTION

Enggano Island is one of Indonesia's outer islands which has local intelligence in maintaining harmony in ethnic and religious differences in its community. In religious life, for example, adat regulates the freedom of the people to embrace a religion that is believed by someone so that the Enggano people are able to live side by side with followers of other religions. Mutual help in the construction of a new mosque / church can involve anyone regardless of ethnicity or religion. The harmony of the religious community is evident, for example, from the presence of the priests in the event of breaking the fast together every month of Ramadhan at the invitation of muslims scholars (*ulama*); and vice versa the ulama are involved in various Christian celebration events. In socio-cultural life, adat provides a large space for immigrants who want to become citizens of



Enggano. Adat allocates two hectares of land for each migrant family so that they can survive in Enggano.

Enggano, whose harmony and tolerance in society does not just happen. Enggano learns quite a lot from past historical experiences that always deal with conflict and tribal warfare. In addition, long interactions with other nations have also given birth to a new awareness to collaborate and make immigrants partners in solving tribal problems. The population of Enggano agreed to make immigrants part of them and immigrants subject to the customary rules of Enggano. Migrants must relinquish their cultural identity and become part of the Kaamay tribe, which is a tribe formed specifically for migrants. As a consequence of the appointment of tribal members, adat must provide the same entitlements as indigenous people to avoid social jealousy.

This paper aims to examine carefully how the local wisdom of the Enggano community works in managing conflict in its territory. Three aspects will be presented in detail in line with the adat-based conflict management, namely how the social status of members is conceptualized in the Enggano community, what rights are regulated by adat for each member of the community, and how custom defines the obligations of each member in a harmony framework enforced.

#### *Enggano: The Forgotten Outer Island*

Enggano is one of the outermost islands in Indonesia located in Bengkulu Province. The island is approximately 90 nautical miles or 156 kilometers from the city of Bengkulu. To reach Enggano, people are accustomed to using sea transportation by using ferries and pioneer ships that are taken within 12 hours. Ferries managed by PT. ASDP Indonesia Ferry (ASDP) operates twice a week (Tuesday and Thursday for departures from Bengkulu and Wednesday and Friday for departures from Enggano). However, they prefer to use government vessels which are managed by the Ministry of Transportation because the price is much cheaper and the port is close to the residential center. In addition, the Enggano community can also choose air transportation with Avianstar aircraft which operates every Monday with a maximum capacity of 15 people. However, transportation to Enggano is very much determined by the weather which often causes the ship to be delayed.

Enggano District has six villages, namely Kahyapu Village, Kaana Village, Malakoni Village, Apoho Village, Meok Village, and Banjarsari Village (Hutapea; Simangunsong, 1994; Sari, 2018). Kahyapu Village is the first village of Kahyapu Harbor. The distance from the port to the second village, namely Kaana Village is 7 km. Kaana village to Malakoni village is 10 km away. Malakoni Village to Apoho Village is 1 km away. Apoho Village is situated at the center of Enggano sub-district, there are many government facilities in this village. Apoho village to Meok for 3 km. From Meok Village to Banjarsari as far as 17 km.

Enggano community consists of five indigenous ethnic groups, namely Kaitora, Kauno, Kaahoao, Kaarubi, and Kaharuba (Ekorusyono, 2015; Sari, 2017). At first, the indigenous Enggano tribes were only 3 ethnic groups namely Kaahoao, Kaitora, and Kaarubi. For reasons of population development, the three tribes were divided into five indigenous tribes. The Kaahoao tribe is divided into Kaahoao and Kauno and the Kaarubi tribe is divided into Kaarubi and Kaharuba. Besides having five indigenous tribes, the Enggano community also recognizes an additional tribe called Kaamay (Kaarubi, 2007). Kaamay means sticking which signifies that the original Enggano tribe did not make a new tribe but only added it to classify immigrant tribes. Migrant tribes are



recognized legally by the Enggano community, have the same rights and obligations and even have tribal heads whose voices are also heard when compromising (Sari, 2017).

The Enggano community is a very open tribal community, different from other tribal peoples who are usually very closed to migrants. They opened up and were friendly with the migrants because they realized that they could not prevent the arrival of migrants from their territory. Therefore, making migrants as part of them is a form of political policy that they practice. Immigrants entering the Enggano region come from various ethnic groups in Indonesia. For example, Minang, Batak, Minahasa, Malay, Javanese, Bugis, and Rejang. People intentionally come to Enggano to improve their economy because Enggano still has a lot of land that can be cultivated.

The Enggano community apparently has local wisdom in managing conflict. This local intelligence is derived from their long history of experience in the face of war and also the experience of interacting with other nations from all over the world that makes Enggano a multicultural and multireligion region to date.

#### FINDINGS

Enggano has succeeded in becoming a center of trade for other nations such as Portugal, China, the Netherlands, Japan, and so on. (Keurs, 1995) wrote in his note, *Digital Publications of the National Museum of Ethnology*, that Enggano people have interacted with other nations throughout the world. Enggano community interaction with other communities began early in the 16th century when the Portuguese discovered this island. The name Enggano is believed to be given by the Portuguese, "Engano", which means disappointed because it did not succeed in finding gold. This name was unknown to the Malay people, they were more familiar with Enggano Island as Pulo Telangiang (island of naked people) (Modigliani, 1894).

Dutch ships arrived in 1602, 1614, 1622 and 1629 respectively to Enggano to trade but were not always successful. In 1771, British Charles Miller came to Enggano. His experience was published in 1778 and rewritten in Dutch in 1779 (Modigliani, 1894). From the record of Modigliani, we also know that during the reign of the Netherlands, Enggano would make plantation land (coconut and pepper) and livestock (pigs, buffaloes and cattle). Even Enggano has become the second Batavia for the Netherlands because Pulau Dua, which is located across the island of Enggano, managed to become the center of trade in the Netherlands.

Interaction with various nations that have been built since the beginning of the 16th century gives awareness to Enggano people that their lives will never be separated from immigrants. Therefore, they make customary rules that make migrants as friends not opponents and adat gives equal rights and obligations between indigenous people and migrants. Thus custom also regulates the economic, social, and political order which forms the framework of the relationship between Enggano's occupation and migrants.

First, in the economic order, the Enggano customary government provides two hectares of land for each family head for those who want to become citizens of Enggano (Sari, 2017). Before this land can be given, prospective residents are required to move their Identity Card (KTP) into the Enggano area. After that they are required to stay and work in Enggano for six months. Usually migrants live in advance or work with Enggano residents who already have land to manage it with a profit sharing agreement. In this way they were able to survive for six months. These migrants





are usually people who do not own land in their place of origin and complain of their fate to Enggano for farming or gardening. Migrants come from various ethnic groups in Indonesia.

After the migrants went through their six-month service period, the customary leader, hamlet head, and village head discussed to determine whether the migrants were entitled to land or not, if it was determined then the customary leader and head of government would find them vacant land (no the owner) so that they can immediately build a place to live and manage their land. This land is usually used to grow coffee, chocolate, or bananas. This makes the attraction for migrants to become permanent residents in Enggano. The average person who comes is people who are very limited economically, do not have assets so expect a piece of land to be cultivated.

Second, in the social order, Enggano adat regulates the existence of five indigenous tribes and recognizes 1 tribe of immigrants. In Enggano all migrants are not permitted to show their cultural identity because when they enter Enggano, they are required to give up their cultural identity in order to become part of the Enggano tradition. This rule is decided by customary institutions and applies to all parties in Enggano. For example, when carrying out weddings all Enggano people, both immigrants and natives, must follow the procedures for marriage according to the customary rules of Enggano. Marriage is not permitted, for example, using Javanese, Sundanese or Batak customs. This is different from other regions where migrant tribal identities remain strong even though they are outside their cultural area.

Third, the political order, immigrants have the same social status as the indigenous people of Enggano. They are recognized as part of the Kaamay tribe so they have the same right to manage Enggano Island. They also had their own tribal chiefs and tribal chiefs, so the Kaamay tribe had representatives to determine Pabuki (chief coordinator). In the election of chiefs, deliberations are usually held first among fellow tribesmen to determine who most understands Enggano customs and the most meritorious in their tribes. In addition, sometimes the chieftain has had a replacement candidate when he dies so that they can just confirm it according to the message delivered by the previous tribal chief.

In relations with other tribes, tribes in Enggano always involve other tribes by deliberation. When someone wants to get married from the Kamaay tribe, for example, the Kamaay tribe chief invites five other tribal chiefs to consult on traditional ceremonies and what needs to be prepared. When a citizen of Enggano wants to get married then all residents of Enggano contribute to enliven the wedding regardless of ethnicity or religion. The involvement of each person can be seen from the division of tasks which includes groups in charge of fishing, groceries collection, helping to cook, and so on, in line with the preparation for the wedding ceremony.

## CONCLUSION

Enggano's local wisdom in dealing with conflict is based on several factors. First, historical factors, namely past experiences of Enggano people who have always been tribal wars until finally Dutch intervention has succeeded in reconciling them. Second, political factors, namely the awareness of the Enggano community about the importance of collaborating with immigrants by giving them legality in forming new tribes. The three socio-cultural factors, namely the Enggano people, do not allow for any other customary rules other than the Enggano customary rules. The four factors of religious freedom, namely religion, are considered as individual rights of every community that is not regulated in adat. The five socio-economic factors that enable them to gain access to land



like the native population. The five factors are the wisdom obtained by the Enggano community from life experiences in a long historical trajectory.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

Ekorusyono. (2015). *Mengenal Budaya Enggano*. Yogyakarta: Buku Litera.

Hutapea; Simangunsong, P. M. (1994). *Sejarah Perkembangan Injil di Pulau Enggano*. Bengkulu.

Kaarubi, A. M. (2007). *Himpunan Hukum Adat Istiadat dan Seni Budaya Asli - Pulau Enggano*. Enggano.

Keurs, P. J. Ter. (1995). Enggano. *Digital Publications of The National Museum of Ethnology*, 0–27.

Modigliani, E. (1894). *L'Isola Delle Donne*.

Sari, I. P. (2017). Harmoni dalam Kebhinekaan (Kearifan Lokal Masyarakat Pulau Enggano Provinsi Bengkulu Dalam Mengatasi Konflik). *Jurnal Antropologi: Isu-Isu Sosial Budaya*, 19(2), 139. <https://doi.org/10.25077/jaisb.v19.n2.p139-147.2017>

Sari, I. P. (2018). *Kerukunan dan Toleransi Umat Beragama : Rekayasa Kearifan Lokal dalam Manajemen Konflik di Pulau Terluar Enggano*. Bengkulu: CV Zigie Utama.

#### CHANGING TIMES AND CHANGING PATTERNS OF COLLECTIVE VIOLENCE IN SUMBA, NTT

*Istutiah Gunawan*  
*Independent scholar*

*In this paper, two cases of collective violence in Nusa Tenggara Timur, occurring 15 years apart in 1998 and in 2013, will be compared. Both were cases of horizontal conflict in the Kabupaten (District) Sumba Barat dan Sumba Barat Daya, where regional loyalties were mobilized by candidates for Bupati (Head of the District) and Wakil Bupati (Deputy Head) in the Pilkada elections. In both cases, the candidates were of the same religion (Protestantism in the case of Sumba Barat and Catholicism in the case of Sumba Barat Daya), but from different ethnic groups. In the case of Sumba Barat, the cause of the violence was perceived corruption in the office of the Bupati and the Bupati's insensitivity to the demands for clean government; in Sumba Barat Daya it was corruption in the KPU (General Elections Commission). In Sumba Barat the violence was resolved by the Governor of NTT initiating a peace ceremony and compensation to families who lost members (numbers range from 26 to about 62 people died); in Sumba Barat Daya the conflict ended with the incumbent Bupati stepping down to avoid further bloodshed (3 people died). The incumbent Bupati and his opponent then held a reconciliation meeting.*

*Keywords: Kamis Berdarah, Bupati Rudolf Malo, Kisruh di Sumba Barat Daya, Pilkada di SBD, Kornelis Kodi Mete*

#### BACKGROUND

In the past, there had been many cases of wars between different (sub-)ethnic groups, usually about land. However, with the advent of almost universal education, intermarriages, world



religions, modern communications and market forces, there are forces that tend to unify the different ethnic groups.

Kabupaten Sumba Barat is predominantly Protestant while Sumba Barat Daya is predominantly Catholic. There is a small percentage of Muslims in both Kabupatens, mostly immigrants from Bima. Many also adhere to the indigenous faith called *Marapu* (ancestors).

#### *Sumba Barat 1998-1999*

In 1998-1999 the conflict in Kabupaten Sumba Barat started with demonstrations in late October 1998 in the capital, Waikabubak, by young graduates, mostly from the Loli ethnic group, who were disaffected by what they perceived as corruption in the selection of candidates for the civil service. Those who were accepted were mostly from the Wewewa (or Waijewa) ethnic group, and close to the family of the Bupati, Rudolf Mete Malo, a Wewewan. One Wewewan who passed the examination did not even sit in the test; she asked another person to sit for her (a practice known as '*praktek joki*'). In the euphoria after Reformasi in Jakarta in May 1998, the young graduates found this corruption unacceptable. When the demonstrations were not responded to by the Bupati (who said that the matter was not in his power to do anything about), the demonstrations became more heated.

The Bupati was a product of Suharto's New Order. Though born in Sumba, he grew up in Java, married a Sundanese and joined the Air Force. He was reported to be rather embarrassed by the "backwardness" of Sumba and keen to bring it to modernity. His appointment to the position of Bupati was part of the New Order's 'rule' that 4 of the 12 positions of Bupati in NTT must be occupied by appointed men from the armed forces. The appointment of Colonel Rudolf Malo in 1995 as Bupati sidelined the man voted by the local DPRD-II (local Parliament), a senior official from the Golkar Party, Timotheus Langgar.

As the demonstrations against Malo continued, the graduates demanded that the Bupati came out, calling out his name "*Giani Mete! Giani Mete!*" ('Where is Mete!'). This was considered very insulting, as they were using his '*nama keras*', *ngara katto*, which is only allowed to be used by his parents when they are angry. The following day 12 trucks with some 500 Waijewans arrived in Waikabubak, which is in Loli, to "defend the Bupati's name", but police intercepted them, and their machetes, spears and rocks were confiscated. In the increasing tension, several shop-owners from the Wewewa ethnic group were chased out of their shops in Waikabubak (there was also a rumor (untrue) that a Loli man was killed in the market in Wewewa). Although the leader of the demonstrators was a young graduate from Wanukaka, Bupati Malo suspected that behind it all was the hand of the Chairman of the DPRD-II, Toda Lero Ora, S.H., a Loli man from the Golkar Party. The conflict was seen to be a conflict between the Bupati and the Chairman of DPRD-II.

On Thursday 5 November 1998 several thousand Wewewans marched into Waikabubak. Most of the marchers thought that they were going to protect their relatives in Waikabubak, but on the way some of them burned 90 Loli houses to the ground. Then they marched on to target Tarung, the sacred mother village of Loli.

The Loli men successfully defended Tarung; in this they believed that supernatural forces were on their side, as the attack was mounted in the sacred month of *Poddu*, when people are not allowed to make a lot of noise, beat gongs or wage war. The Wewewa troops were defeated and several dozen Wewewans were killed on that one day, hence the term '*Kamis Berdarah*' (Bloody Thursday).



This conflict was horrifying to both Wewewans and Lolinese. Although there have been many conflicts about land in the past, in 1975 a peace agreement had been held in Wone where both sub-ethnic groups made a peace ceremony where they made an oath before God and their ancestors to cease warring. "If I break this vow, may I be struck by lightning as I cross the hills; If I betray my word, may I be struck by a snake as I cross the fields." That the many casualties were from the invaders, and none reportedly from the Loli side, was ascribed by many Lolinese (as well as by Wewewans), to the breaking of this oath by the Wewewans.

Yet more casualties would likely result if some traditional leaders from both Loli and Wewewa were not taking affairs into their own hands. An ex-Kepala Desa of Waikarou in Loli and the Kepala Desa of Mareda Kalada in Wewewa, upon hearing of the conflict, went to check the safety of students in the Agricultural High School in Kuriteppe, in Loli but near the border, to make sure that the Wewewa students staying in the hostel were safe. They quickly agreed that they would abide by the peace agreement of 1975 and would resist demands that their villages be dragged into the conflict.

Much criticism was pointed to the Government apparatus. The police and military did not act when the Loli villages were burned down by the Wewewans at the border between Wewewa and Loli. They were only stopped by the Loli men before they could climb the hill to reach Kampung Tarung, and many casualties happened only 200 meters from the Police Headquarters. The bodies lay there in the open for a day and a half; the shops were locked, their owners fled. The Government was paralysed and Bupati Malo was hiding in the police barracks.

This paralysis lasted until the Governor of NTT, Piet Tallo, flew in from Jakarta, and the Mobile Brigade flown in from Kupang. After peace was restored, a peace ceremony was held in January 1999 in the central stadium, attended by the Bupati, the Chairman of DPRD-II, and representatives of all religions and villages. Families whose members were killed (all Wewewans) were given compensation by the Government. Many Loli families felt bitter that no compensation was given to the families whose houses were burned down by the Wewewa mob. Many Sumbanese of the Marapu faith thought that the ceremony did not go according to Marapu and Sumbanese adat, but their concern was not taken seriously.

#### *Sumba Barat Daya, 2013-2014*

In 2013-14 in the Kabupaten Sumba Barat Daya violence erupted after the Pilkada election in 5 August 2013. Sumba Barat Daya (or SBD) was previously part of Sumba Barat; it became a Kabupaten in 2007. The popular incumbent Bupati, Dr. Kornelis Kodi Mete, was previously a Deputy Bupati of Kabupaten Sumba Barat. He is a medical doctor, a Catholic from the sub-ethnic group of Kodi. His main challenger, Markus Dairu Tallu (MDT) was an ex-army man, also a Catholic but from the Wewewa sub-ethnic group.

The incumbent Bupati was unexpectedly defeated by Markus Dairu Tallu. The Bupati and his candidate Deputy Daud Lende Umbu Moto challenged the result in the Constitutional Court (Mahkamah Konstitusi) in Jakarta. They requested a repeat count of the votes, and the Police and Bawaslu (General Elections Supervisory Body) found that there was a discrepancy of more than 13,000 additional fraudulent votes which benefited MDT. The case was brought to the local court in Sumba, which found the original vote count was fraudulent and jailed the Chairman of the Electoral Commission (KPU) for 13 months.



However, the Constitutional Court under Chairman Akil Mochtar in Jakarta overturned the finding of the recount, disregarding the 144 boxes of evidence, and awarded the victory to the candidate with the smaller number of votes, Markus Dairu Tallu. Followers of the incumbent Bupati waylaid the followers of MDT on the way home, victorious, from Jakarta. 3 people died, 19 houses were burned down and hundreds of people left their homes to look for protection in the police headquarters in the capital, Tambolaka.

Although the local DPRD-II refused to accept the Constitutional Court's decision, the DPRD-I in Kupang was of the view that the Court's decision was final, and instructed the local parliament in Sumba Barat Daya to install Markus Dairu Tallu and Ndara Tanggu Kaha as Bupati and Deputy Bupati on 6 August 2014 for the 2014-2019 period.

Kornelis Kodi Mete accepted the Mahkamah Konstitusi's decree, saying he'd rather step down than seeing more bloodshed. On 2 September 2013 he and MDT made a reconciliation, witnessed by the Chief of Police of Sumba Barat, Chief of the Military District of Sumba Barat and the Catholic Bishop of Waitabula.

## CONCLUSION

The conflict in Sumba Barat in 1998 may never have happened if the demands of the young graduates were not brushed aside by the Bupati, who saw these protests and the subsequent developments as "rekayasa" ('engineered') by his perceived opponent, the Chairman of DPRD-II. Some thought that he used New Order tactics of intimidation using his Wewewan relatives, but once he incited them he lost control of the process. The inaction of the Police and military in the conflict was puzzling; possibly because the Bupati, a Colonel, was of a higher rank than either the head of the Police or the Military.

The reaction of the Governor was swift in cooling down the temperature, and the peace ceremony provided a formal end to the conflict, though it was still not satisfactory for adherents of the Marapu faith. Many reports about the conflict did not mention the roles of traditional leaders in preventing the conflict from claiming more lives.

The conflict in Sumba Barat Daya probably also may never have happened if members of the KPU did their job properly, and the Constitutional Court was seen to be just and non-corruptible. The refusal of the local DPRD to accept its decision but that there was no mechanism to lodge an appeal caused many months of uncertainty. Many people were of the opinion that the conflict happened longer than necessary because MDT had lived in Jakarta as an Army man and knew his way around the judges in the Constitutional Court. That Kornelis Kodi Mete chose to step down to prevent further bloodshed was seen as an honourable act, which may have helped him win the Pilkada election 5 years later in 2018.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

David Mitchell & Tuti Gunawan, *Violence and Democratic Process in West Sumba Part I: The Road to Violence, 1995 to November 1998*. Paper for UGM/Flinders Lokakarya Reformasi Lokal, Yogyakarta, August 2000.

David Mitchell & Tuti Gunawan, 'Jalan Menuju Reformasi: Sumba Barat 1999-2000', in *Jalan Terjal Reformasi Lokal* (Jim Schiller Ed.), Program Pascasarjana Politik Lokal dan Otonomi Daerah, Program Studi Ilmu Politik, Universitas Gadjah Mada, Yogyakarta, 2003.



Jacqueline Vel, *Uma Politics: An Ethnography of Democratization in West Sumba, Indonesia, 1986-2006, Chapter VI: Violence in Waikabubak*. KITLV, 2008.

EXIT FROM VIOLENCE: RECONCILIATION AND PEACE MAKING IN INDONESIA

Y. Tri Subagya

Universitas Sanata Dharma

Violent conflicts become reoccurrence phenomenon in the post colonial history of Indonesia. However, the pattern of the conflicts are different in different periods and different regime of power and so do the approaches to take measure coping with it. Both state and non-state agencies initiated peace making activities to bring the conflicted groups into peace process. The most common model to reduce the violence so far use the security approach in which the government made chase fire and sponsored peace accord between the conflicted parties. As to follow up the program, they deployed military and state apparatuses to facilitate soio economic recovery for the communities affected by the conflict. To some extent, ethnic and religious leaders, social workers, academician and NGO activists also developed peace and initiated reconciliation in different level of societies. Since there were sometimes no coordination among the peace initiators, their works seem overlap one to another. This paper describes the violent conflicts and efforts to develop peaceand reconciliation in Indonesia in order to seach for anthropological perspective on conflict resolution. This paper is divided in three sections before it comes up to conclusion. First is to review the violent conflicts in the post colonial history of Indonesia with the special attention to ethno-religious violence and its peace process. Secondly I examine peace making activities in some area of Indonesia. I will highlightthe peace efforts initiated by both state and non state actors. Then I will take into account the common problems arising from the previous approach of peace making and search for appropriate model to prevent the humanitarian tragedy reoccurring in the future.

*Keywords: violent conflicts, peace making, reconciliation, anthropology of peace*

## Rethinking the Politics of Difference in Indonesia: Ethnicity, Religion, Class Relations

Coordinators: Budi Hernawan (Driyarkara School of Philosophy)  
& Thung Ju Lan (Indonesian Institute of Sciences/LIPI)

Whilst Indonesia was founded on the principle of *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika*, the politics of difference has not prevailed as the governing principle in law, society and polity. Instead domination of the powerful has claimed of assuming the right to govern. During the Suharto's New Order, the military dictatorship dominated Indonesia for more than three decades with complete impunity whereas in the post-reformasi era, majority-minority paradigm seems to rule the country. In both contexts, the rule of law has never been the top priority. Rather, the state of exception, as Carl Schmitt coins, governs and even condones the majority-minority paradigm. As result the Indonesia's diversity in ethnicity, religion and class has been subjected to the domination of the majority and its narrative. The element of class and its vested interests, however, has been overlooked in the discussion of politics of difference in Indonesia. Inspired by Christian Fuchs who delves into the nexus between class and social movement, this panel will rethink the power





struggle between ethnicity, religion and class that underpins the politics of difference. The panel is interested in addressing the following questions: • To what extent the class background of power players plays a key role in the political contests that have used ethnicity and religions to support their claim for domination? • How does the power struggle between ethnicity, religion and class shape and re-shape the politics of difference in Indonesia's future? • Does economic deprivation remain the main source of public protests and social mobilization? To what extent does it pose threats to the politics of difference? • To what extent is the relevance of Fuchs' assumption about "the emergence of 'post material' values [such as peace, gender inequality, ecological sustainability, sexuality, race and right-wing extremism, etc.] as well as the emergence of an 'immaterial labour class' in relation to the changing patterns of protest?

#### UNITY IN WHICH DIVERSITY? EXAMINING CLASS AND IDENTITY IN CONTEMPORARY INDONESIAN POLITICS

*Benny Hari Juliawan*

*Graduate School of Religious and Cultural Studies, Universitas Sanata Dharma*

#### BACKGROUND

Since the 2014 presidential election, Indonesian political landscape has increasingly been characterised as a battleground for competing identity-based groups. In particular Islam has become the most prominent marker of a popular collective identity, driving a wedge between the muslim and non-muslim electorate in the process. The 2017 Jakarta gubernatorial election and the 2019 presidential election confirmed this worry. Many popular groups were formed or reinvented around Islamic slogans and narratives. The incumbents in both executive elections were described as not Islamic enough, enemies of Islam or even communists.

This political development has troubled many pro-democracy activists and scholars alike. Those who oppose the trend were quick to organise rallies, workshops, seminars and press conferences condemning the so-called "politicisation of religion." In its place, they promoted the notion of Indonesia as a rainbow nation comprising of various ethnicities, languages, and religions. This campaign was centred around the promotion of the *Bhinneka* identity (deriving from the state's official slogan *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika* or Unity in Diversity) in contrast to the religious (Islamic) one.

In academia many scholars and observers quickly jumped to the conclusion that identity is indeed an important category to explain Indonesian politics. Loyalty to one's religion or ethnicity seems to be taken as an important, if not the main, explanation for political and economic behaviours, which transcends class differences. Much of the focus of their research is on the formation of those identities and how they are translated into people's choices and actions in the public realm.

The popularity of identity as a political category seems to ignore a long-standing source of division in Indonesian society, i.e. material inequality. As a deeply unequal society (Winters 2013) Indonesia is vulnerable to conflicts that potentially arise from the grievances of the marginalised and the struggles over resources among various groups. Indeed, in the early years of Reformasi a number of scholars identified similar structural inequalities at the root of the supposedly identity-based conflicts in the Moluccas (van Klinken 2001; Wilson 2005) and Poso, Central Sulawesi (Aragon 2001). It seems now that the focus has shifted almost exclusively to identity, particularly the religious one.



## OBJECTIVE

This paper seeks to consider the arguments for identity politics by examining existing literature on Indonesian democracy. How valid is identity in explaining current Indonesian politics? What is missing from the focus on identity? How would a study on identity politics that takes material inequality seriously look like? This research will contribute to the ongoing debate about the academic merit of non-material interests in explaining the struggle for power and resources. Anthropology is often understood as a discipline whose main interest is to study the social and cultural rather than the structural. This research will help narrow the gap between the cultural and structural approaches, and offer ways whereby both can complement each other.

## DESCRIPTION

In recent years, two major strands of literature on identity politics have come up quite strongly in the broader discussion on democratisation in Indonesia. The first group focuses on how the post-New Order political configuration has encouraged various interest groups, which would have been outside the New Order inner circle, to organise and make claims. Islamic groups (Hamayotsu 2011), ethnic groups (Wilson 2005), indigenous people (Murray Li 2000), women groups (Porter 2003), environmentalist groups (Di Gregorio 2014), LGBT (Ridwan and Wu 2018), and youth (Wallach 2008) mobilise their unique identities to extract political as well as material concessions.

Most of those studies employ social movement theories by the likes of Dough McAdam, Sydney Tarrow and Charles Tilly. According to this approach, individuals with shared interests organise themselves and demand state recognition, redistribution of assets, positions in public offices, changes in the law or other types of concession from the state. There were well documented cases of success (Rosser, Roesad et al. 2005), in which the movements created significant changes or received the recognition they desired albeit temporarily. These successes are interpreted as indications of the efficacy of identity. More importantly, those movements bring together people from various class backgrounds, giving the impression that their shared identity transcends economic inequality that might otherwise separate them.

Islam has definitely become the most important political identity in recent years. Rinaldo (2010) explains how Islam offers an acceptable and accessible vision of Indonesia amidst the ideological confusion that characterises the post-New Orde era. Islamic organisations and political parties serve as institutional vehicles that give shape to that Islamic vision by taking part in political contestations including elections (Hamayotsu 2011). This way, Islam becomes an established avenue for formal political participation. On the welfare side of things, Islamic organisations such as NU and Muhammadiyah run various basic services crucial to the survival and welfare of many impoverished populations in Java and Sumatra. Emotional and pragmatic loyalty to Islamic is built through repeated interactions with these services (Hicks 2012).

The second group of analyses view Islamic identity as an effective tool of manipulation of the masses. In his research on Islamic militia, Mudhoffir (2017) sees the origin of these violent groups in the capitalist proletarianisation which produces unemployed youths. They adopt an Islamic identity as a way to gain political and economic benefits in their local context. Manipulation of Islam also takes place in the hands of the elite in their quest for power. They use Islam as it is effective in covering up wealth disparities in society and in mobilising people across classes. Islam as a political identity enables the “suspension of difference” in which the faithful is imagined as a homogenous entity despite internal social and economic disparities (Hadiz 2018, 2).



## FINDINGS

The first group takes identity politics as the determinant of actions. Their description is rich and colourful as they recognise agency in individual organisers and activists, and consider organisational details important in mobilisation. They can be meticulous in description but sometimes at the expense of historical backgrounds, especially political-economic ones, that conditioned political institutions in a given context. In particular, those working with resource mobilisation theories often suffer from a narrow (administrative and legal) definition of politics.

The latter group of scholars doubt that Islam possesses an intrinsic mobilising power. They argue that identity (Islamic) politics mask the real conflicts in society, whose roots can be found in the dynamics of capitalist social formations. Their analysis focuses on revealing how those dynamics take the form of identity politics. As they are informed by the Marxist notion of class, their investigation generally concludes with the centrality of capitalist contradictions and this often renders their analysis rather predictable.

Arguments for identity politics can therefore pay more attention to certain configurations of power and material interests that have long shaped society, whilst respecting the significance that people attach to identity. Certain configurations of power may favour one type of articulation over the others, and this process cannot be determined *a priori*. Identity and class interests may interact in ways that are unique to a context. Therefore, it is argued here that we need to look at how resources are available to certain groups over time and how interests are articulated in collective terms in the struggles over those resources.

## CONCLUSION

Geertz's famous phrase describes how humans are "suspended in webs of significance" (Keesing 1987, 161). Where an anthropologist sees meaning, a Marxist sees exploitation and manipulation. Identity arguments must be situated in a context that historically, politically and economically favour certain social or cultural expressions. These expressions, in turn, help determine how resources are later contested and allocated.

*Keywords: identity politics, inequality, class, Islam, Indonesia*

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Aragon, L. V. 2001. "Communal Violence in Poso, Central Sulawesi: Where People Eat Fish and Fish Eat People." *Indonesia*(72): 45-79.
- Di Gregorio, M. 2014. "Gaining Access to the State: Political Opportunities and Agency in Forest Activism in Indonesia." *Social Movement Studies* 13(3): 381-398.
- Hadiz, V. R. 2018. "Imagine All the People? Mobilising Islamic Populism for Right-Wing Politics in Indonesia." *Journal of Contemporary Asia* 48(4): 566-583.
- Hamayotsu, K. 2011. "Beyond faith and identity: mobilizing Islamic youth in a democratic Indonesia." *The Pacific Review* 24: 225-247.
- Hicks, J. 2012. "The Missing Link: Explaining the Political Mobilisation of Islam in Indonesia." *Journal of Contemporary Asia* 42(1): 39-66.



- Keesing, R. M. 1987. "Anthropology as Interpretive Quest [and Comments and Reply]." *Current Anthropology* 28(2): 161-176.
- Mudhoffir, A. M. 2017. "Islamic Militias and Capitalist Development in Post-Authoritarian Indonesia." *Journal of Contemporary Asia* 47(4): 495-514.
- Murray Li, T. 2000. "Articulating Indigenous Identity in Indonesia: Resource Politics and the Tribal Slot." *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 42(1): 149-179.
- Porter, M. 2003. "Feminism is a Good Woman: Reflections on the Use of Ideas in the Women's Movement in Indonesia." *Asian Journal of Women's Studies* 9(1): 7-36.
- Ridwan, R. and J. Wu. 2018. "'Being young and LGBT, what could be worse?' Analysis of youth LGBT activism in Indonesia: challenges and ways forward." *Gender & Development* 26(1): 121-138.
- Rosser, A., K. Roesad and D. Edwin. 2005. "Indonesia: The Politics of Inclusion." *Journal of Contemporary Asia* 35(1): 53-77.
- van Klinken, G. 2001. "The Maluku Wars: Bringing Society Back In." *Indonesia*(71): 1-26.
- Wallach, J. 2008. "Living the Punk Lifestyle in Jakarta." *Ethnomusicology* 52(1): 98-116.
- Wilson, C. 2005. "The Ethnic Origins of Religious Conflict in North Maluku Province, Indonesia, 1999-2000." *Indonesia*(79): 69-91.
- Winters, J. A. 2013. "Oligarchy and Democracy in Indonesia." *Indonesia*(96): 11-33.

IN FEAR OF PURIFICATION IN REPRESENTATIONAL SENSE: RESHAPING POLITICAL PREFERENCES  
IN YOUNG CHINESE INDONESIANS POST-AHOK ERA

Irfan Nugraha  
Universitas Indonesia

In the midst of different ideologies, rational choices, and imaginary state, political preferences can be naturally expressed by many group and communities due to the openness of Indonesian society. Along with Indonesian political movement, the expression of political discourse is believed related to political preferences. The preferences often reflect the political identity based on their entity or community which are attached to the concept of self-identity. Nowadays, the sense of Indonesian politics tends to accommodate the practice of purity of its supporters, the political preferences echoes the generation matrix that regulates the relation between the visible and the invisible, the imaginable and the non-imaginable at a representational level. In the context of political preferences of Chinese Indonesians, political inclusion has been established in which reflects new hope giving a vocal voice in expressing political thoughts. However, this sphere is only an illusion due to the current political movement that creates the tendency of creating social groups based on people's political preferences. Based on our findings through ethnographical approach in digital and social media, personal sphere such as family chat groups and social media posts forces the existence of purity in the everyday life political condition which nurture a problem in defining political representation of a certain group. Defining 'the others' political identity based on imaginary self preference becomes a problem. Reshaping political preferences is an eternal struggle for Chinese Indonesians, as their struggle to escape from an act of being cautious in any



kind of situation which accepting the false consciousness that they are segregated and only a phantom in politics.

#### DISINTEGRATION FROM WITHIN AND OPEN INDONESIAN IDENTITY

*Sugeng Bayu Wahyono*

*Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta*

*Since the end of the New Order's authoritarian government regime, Indonesia has entered into a transitional democracy nation. For almost two decades since choosing the political system of democracy, the dynamics of contemporary Indonesian politics are colored by various upheavals that have led to the disintegration of the nation. Social conflicts continue to occur, ranging from interethnic conflicts in Ambon, Poso, Kalimantan, and several other areas related to different sentiments, religions, and also races. When ethnic-based horizontal conflicts began to recede, in the last ten years, the conflict with the background of the issue of religious differences became stronger following political moments such as the Choice of the Governor and even the Choice of the President and Vice President.*

*Even though the current phase of the development of these conflicts has not led to the disintegration of the nation which led to the breakup of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia, the potential social and political direction is still potential. Based on Benedick Anderson's thesis, Indonesia is a public project of various solidarity groups and will get a serious challenge. Solidarity groups based on ethnic, religious, racial, and other identity differences continue to prove the strengthening of identity debated in the nation's integration from within. Furthermore, the solidarity group that bases on one of the Islamic religious sects, that obsess in realizing the integration of religion and the state, continues to carry out various political, economic, social and cultural activities that result in internal disintegration.*

*This paper will try to analyze the existence and socio-political activities of various solidarity groups in the dynamics of contemporary Indonesian politics and what the subject positions in these groups are in discussions with the discourse of establishing an Indonesian identity. Various theories of ethnicity and identity will be used as provisions to analyze in depth the various solidarity groups, to find out and identify potential and risks related to the disintegration and integration of the nation.*

#### BACKGROUND

Sociological facts show that heterogeneity has become a well-established and strong characteristic in society in Indonesia. From religious, ethnic group, historical experience, and geographical conditions backgrounds, there are large variations seen in various population groups, and each has the potential to develop into a particularistic identity. Meanwhile, historical facts also show that what is referred to as cultural solidarity groups, also known as a sect, continues to color the history of the archipelago.

Realizing the sociological facts and historical facts, the founders of the nation have conducted political experiments several times to solve particularistic problems in the framework of developing nations. One of them was a political consensus initiated by all the pioneering figures of independence, known as the 1928 Youth Oath. However, on the next trip it remained less



effective in neutralizing the attractiveness of flow-based political interests. The process continues to this day, each still trying to practice group identity affirmation.

The strengthening of the symptoms of particularistic identity affirmation then led to the occurrence of identity conflicts, especially after the New Order. As it is known, after the New Order era, Indonesia entered as a country experiencing a democratic transition after more than 30 years in the situation of an authoritarian political system under the control of the military regime. Precisely towards the end of President Soeharto's administration, May 1998, Indonesia then entered an era agreed upon as a reform era, a different era diametrically with the previous era. If previously the state's control over the power of civil society was so strong, then in this reform era the political situation was so loose and therefore opened the space for all the forces of civil society to express their existence and articulate their interests.

Various political forces contradict each other over power both through formal political channels such as general elections, as well as through informal channels as manifested in various social and cultural spaces in living in society. This tendency then continues to show symptoms of potential inter-community conflicts based on primordialistic sentiments, such as ethnicity, religion, and even race.

Various incidents of riots with religious backgrounds such as in Ambon Maluku, Poso Sulawesi at the beginning of the reform era, and later followed by several other precarious areas such as mass amok in Cikeusik, Pandegelang, Banten which killed 3 Ahmadis; and then in Temanggung, which burned and damaged 3 churches a few years ago, showing that there is still the power of groups that deny diversity as an Indonesian identity. Likewise, ethnic background conflicts such as between the Dayak and Madura tribes in Sampit, Sanggau-Ledau Kalimantan in 2000 are evidence of a strong identity conflict.

Such primordialistic conflicts in the last twenty years have continued to fluctuate according to the dynamics of contemporary Indonesian politics. Moreover, after the enactment of Regional Autonomy in 2001, various ethnic and interfaith conflicts continued to color in the dynamics of local politics, especially at political moments such as the Regional Head General Elections (Pilkada). The sentiments of essentialistic identity conflicts such as the prominence of differences in male sons and immigrants continue to be exploited by the local elite for power struggles in the political contestation of the elections.

Religious and even racial nuances also color the dynamics of local and national politics as reflected in the 2014 Presidential Election (Pilpres) and the DKI Jakarta Provincial Election 2017. The 2014 presidential election was marked by a clear division between the Jokowi-JK and Prabowo-Hatta pairs using religious issues and race. Joko Widodo has always been rumored by Prabowo's stronghold as an ethnic Chinese and Christian. The nuances of the conflict by using essentialistic identity politics like that then continued to color the 2019 Presidential Election, and even felt stronger and more explosive.

Moreover, when the 2017 DKI Regional Election, the nuances of the conflict are openly racialistic. Basuki Tjahaya Purnama, popularly known as Ahok, received a racial political stigma which is expressly referred to as China. It did not stop at the title of China, but then the racist discourse was continuously produced by its political opponents as an instrument to bring it down. Ahok was accused of being a leader who harassed the religion of Islam, and later confirmed the identity of





his insults, the political contestation in the 2017 DKI Regional Election became an indicator of the strengthening of essentialistic identity politics.

Meanwhile, conflicts with primordialistic nuances that exploit religious differences also continue to occur in social and cultural life. In 2018 there were also many instances of intolerance, such as suicide bombings at the Santa Maria Church in Surabaya. Quoting information from the East Java Regional Police Head of Public Relations, Kombes Barung Mangera, the bomb blast killed two people (Kompas.com, 05-13/2018). Meanwhile, there was also an event of intolerance towards local beliefs, namely the sea alms ceremony on the coast of New Bantul, Jogjakarta, which was damaged by mobs riding alongside motorbikes. The mob had done damage to the residents and committee who were busy preparing for the sea charity event to become frantic and traumatized (Kompas.com, 10/15/2018).

Post New Order has brought far more loose political changes, so that various elements of civil society with ideological, religious, ethnic, racial and cultural backgrounds have had the opportunity to express themselves. However, the loosening of the socio-political system further opened up the possibility of interfaith, ethnic, racial, and clash of cultural values. It all indicates the existence of a process of internal disintegration which if it does not get serious attention could threaten the existence of Indonesia as a unitary state.

Therefore, this paper will analyze the internal disintegration process using constructivistic perspectives and some are also critical. Some key concepts will be used to understand identity conflicts originating from the theories of ethnicity, identity, and also identity politics.

#### THEORETICAL BASIS

There are various theoretical perspectives that attempt to explain ethnicity and ethnic identity. Starting from a theoretical perspective that refers to an essentialistic to anti-essentialistic view such as a constructive and critical perspective. Even more radical new theories that are anti-identity develop as well as the assumptions of queer theory, for example. In an essentialistic view, ethnicity and identity are something natural and permanent, and therefore ethnicity is often identified with body characteristics.

Also developing theoretical views, namely what can be called a defensive party. Here the logic of the state and the state system starts from the problem of claims by certain ethnic groups. Historically countries have been broadly defined in the territorial terms they occupy and the sources and populations they control. Therefore, the state needs strict boundaries between one country and another. In the meantime, the state must sensibly show a specific identity as a state and group which, if seen as a nation, is different from the others. Here, then there is a process of politicization of identity groups or the emergence of problems of ethnicity and ethnic conflict as an effort to defend themselves.

In the culturalist view it provides two essentialist and anti-essentialist perspectives. In an essentialist view, ethnicity is a cultural concept centered on the sharing of norms, values, beliefs, cultural symbols and practices. The formation of "ethnic groups" relies on shared cultural signifiers which have developed under specific historical, social and political contexts and which encourage a sense of belonging based, at least in part, on a common mythological ancestry. However, following anti-essentialist arguments, it is clear that ethnic groups are not based on primordial ties or universal cultural characteristics possessed by specific groups but are formed through



discursive practices. Ethnicity is formed by the way we speak of group identities and identify with signs and symbols which constitute ethnicity (Barker, 2000: 1995).

Furthermore, Barker said of the course, to suggest that ethnicity is not about pre-given cultural differences but a process of boundary formation and maintenance that is not contingent around signifiers which do universal conversations, territory and purity, for example metaphors of blood, kinship and homeland. A culturalist conception of ethnicity is an attempt to escape racial implication which is inherently in historically forged concept of race.

In the meantime, it became clear that ethnicity was not understood as something natural or taken for granted as constructed by groups who wanted to dominate and give social stigma. This presupposes that ethnicity is something that has the character of being, proceeding, discursive, because everything is historical and contextual. There is nothing fixed and moreover natural by referring to physical characteristics.

Such a view was also expressed by Hall. If the black subject is not historically stable, then it should be constructed historically, culturally and politically - the concept which refers to this is 'ethnicity'. The term ethnicity acknowledgment of the place of history, language and culture in the construction of subjectivity and identity, as well as knowledge (Hall, 1996: 466).

The concept of ethnicity from a culturalist perspective is more critical, not only open and inclusive, but also politically characterized so that it is related to power. Meanwhile, if the essentialist perspective is more often used by the dominant group in its efforts to establish power, while the anti-essentialist perspective is actually trying to shake the establishment. This critical anti-essentialist view is useful for strengthening political democratization as well as efforts to build community citizenship.

In this case a discussion of identity theory can also use the essentialism and anti-essentialism scheme, or a concept that says that identity is something permanent and natural; while also developing a more constructivistic view that identity is a dynamic, fluid, and discursive concept.

The Western search for identity is premised on the idea that there is such a 'thing' to be found, that identity exists as a universal and timeless core of the self which we all possess. We might say that persons have an 'essence' of the self which we call identity. Such essentialism assumes that descriptions of ourselves reflect an essential underlying identity. By this token there would be affixed essence of femininity, masculinity, Asians, teenagers and all other social categories. In contrast, it has been argued here that identity is cultural 'all the way down', being specific to particular times and places. This suggests that forms of identity are changeable and related to definite social and cultural conjunctures. The idea that identity is plastic is underpinned by arguments referred to as anti-essentialism. Here word is not taken as having referents with essential or universal qualities, for language 'makes' rather than 'finds'. Identity is not a thing but a description in language identities are discursive constructions which change their meanings according to time, place, and usage (Barker, 2000: 196).

Some identity theories that are in line with anti-essentialist assumptions, among others, were put forward by Anthony Giddens who said that the self-identity as project. Identity of attempts to interpret the critical questions: "What to do? How to act? Who to be?" The individual attempts to construct a coherent identity narrative by which the self forms a trajectory of development from the past to anticipated future (1991: 53). This means that self-identity is not something that has been made, but is a process that becomes dynamic.



Such an assumption of self-identity as a project is also used by Giddens in conceptualizing social identities, as he said as follows:

*Social identities ... are associated with normative rights, obligations and sanctions which, within specific collectives, form roles. The use of standardized markers, especially to do with the bodily attributes of age and gender, is fundamental in all societies, notwithstanding large cross-cultural variations which can be noted (Giddens, 1984: 282).*

Meanwhile, Stuart Hall in his article entitled *The Question of Cultural Identity*, identified three different ways of conceptualizing identity, namely (a) the subject of enlightenment; (b) the subject of sociology, and (c) the subject of postmodernism.

In the perspective of the enlightenment era the idea was that the person was seen as a unique agent of unity and allied to Enlightenment. Hall said:

*The enlightenment subject was based on conception of the human person as a fully centred, unified individual, endowed with the capacities of reason, consciousness and action, whose 'centre' consisted of an inner core .... The essential centre of the self was a person's identity (Hall, 1992: 275).*

In the subject's perspective as a sociological symptom, identity is not a self-generating or internal situation about self, but it is entirely a culture because it is formed through a process of acculturation. As a social self and the subject of sociology, self is not formed automatically through processes that occur in people, but self is formed in relation to others. In the process of interaction, the values, meanings, and symbols are internalized, and this is culture. The process of interaction with others first occurs in a family environment, such as learning starting from the price, punishment, imitation and language, how to enter into social life. The basic assumption of the subject of sociology is that the subject is a social creator where social and individual have their differences.

While the conception of identity in the view of postmodernism in principle corrects the deterministic view, that the self does not always remain a separate entity separate from the social environment as Cartesian assumptions, or self formed by the social environment as sociological culturalist assumptions. However, according to the subject of postmodernism, subjects are seen as having self-core (core self) capable of coordinating themselves reflexively into unity. According to Hall, self-decentralization or self-postmodernism includes subjects that continue to shift, split, and have multiple identities. The person is formed by not only one, but by several identities that are sometimes conflicting. Furthermore, Hall said:

*The subject assumes different identities at different times, identities which are not unified around a coherent 'self'. Within us are contradictory identities, pulling in different directions, so that our identifications are continually being shifted about. If we feel that we have a unified identity from birth to death, it is only because we construct a comforting story or 'narrative' of the self' about ourselves (Hall, 1992: 277).*

Hall also suggested that understanding the concept of cultural identity is also closely related to assumptions that developed in the flow of essentialism and anti-essentialism of culture. In the view of the essentialists, that individuals have the essence of self called identity. Essentialism assumes that our self-description reflects the essence based on identity. Thus it will be able to establish what is the essence of femininity, masculinity, Asians, adolescents and all other social categories. On the contrary, there is also the view that identity is entirely a culture, formed based on space and time. This is the view of the anti-essentialism which explains that forms of identity



are constantly changing and related to social and cultural conditions. Identity is constructions that are not interrelated, their meanings always change according to space and time, and their use.

This concept of identity, especially after the cold war, gave rise to the theory of identity politics which is gaining wide attention in cultural studies. Agnes Heller took the definition of identity politics as a concept and a political movement whose focus was difference as a major political category. After the failure of the grand narrative, the idea of difference has promised freedom, freedom and freedom of play, even though new threats emerge. Politics of difference becomes a new name for identity politics; race thinking, biofeminism, and ethnic disputes occupy a forbidden place by old big ideas. Various new forms of intolerance, violent practices, also emerged (Heller, 1995: ix).

Klaus Von Beyme (1996) analyzes the development of identity political movements in several stages, ranging from the modern to postmodern stages. The first stage was the modern political movement. Fundamental divisions, tribal groups, and nationalities gave rise to a comprehensive social political movement. In this case mobilization is ideologically initiated by leaders. The aim is seizure and the struggle for power from one ruler to the new ruler. In the modern stage, the movement emerged with the existence of a conditional approach, fragmentation requiring resources to be mobilized. There is a balance of mobilization from above and participation from below, the role of the leader is no longer dominant and the ultimate goal is the division of power. Then, at the postmodern stage, the emergence of the movement came from its own dynamics, protests arose over a variety of individual opportunities, there was no single dominant group or fraction. The pattern of actions and activities is based on autonomous self-awareness as the final goal (Abdillah, 2002: 17).

The rise of resistance symptoms from the small, local, and periphery to the big narrative, then encouraged social science to provide an explanation for the phenomenon as formulated in the theories of social movements. All social movements in various levels are products of culture. Various studies that have been conducted by academics show that the social movement process is carried out by individuals and groups who come together to fight for social change in the situation of establishment.

## DISCUSSION

Referring to several theories of ethnicity, identity, and identity politics as described earlier, then if it is then used to analyze various disintegration phenomena from within as happened in post-New Order Indonesia, there are some interesting thoughts. In general, it could be said that various social conflicts, politics, and cultural conflicts in the dynamics of people's lives indicate that essentialistic understanding has a significant contribution to the disintegration process from within.

The phenomenon of ethnic background conflicts between Dayak and Madura in Sampit and Sanggau Kalimantan, for example, indicates that understanding ethnicity is still essentialistic. Dayak and also Madurese understand that tribes are still natural, permanent, and of course refer to the characteristics of the body. Referring to the tribal character permanently like that then they construct their identity by exploiting differently through body characteristics. When each of them affirms the differences constantly like that, even in social life they become exclusive and assert that each is different. The result is the principle of we and others, if it does not have the same characteristics of the body it is considered not the group.



This situation becomes increasingly tense when it comes to economic issues, such as injustice and poverty. For example, the conflict in Sampit, the Madura tribe which was constructed as a migrant, is economically quite successful when compared to the Dayak tribe. At the same time, the stereo type view of the Madurese tribe that they were less willing to regulate, as they wished, lacked respect for Dayak customs, were rude, and other characteristics that were considered permanent became increasingly increasing the feeling that they were indeed different. On the contrary, the Madurese also had the same view of the Dayak tribe, which was constructed in a fixed manner, having the basic characteristics of being lazy, wasting time, primitive, and animistic.

Such a risk process takes place continuously in everyday social interactions, so that the feeling that they are indeed different from one another continues to settle. Such a situation is just waiting for the trigger to arise explosive conflict. The tension between the two tribes during the New Order could indeed be suppressed without massive and explosive conflict, because the state was able to effectively control all elements of civil society at any potential conflict. But when the New Order ended, the situation became out of control and immediately all negative prejudices towards each tribe gained momentum to be shed in open conflict.

The same situation also occurs in identity conflicts in Papua for example. Some conflicts that occurred during the post-New Order era also felt an essentialistic nuance. It is still developing in people's perceptions that ethnic Papuans are still constructed by their identity with reference to body characteristics and type stereo views. Papuans are constructed characterized by curly hair, black skin, stupid, lazy and drunk. Identity construction is involving self, other, and social structures that are relational in nature, namely the problem of how other people value themselves and on the basis of other people's judgments that he then judges himself. So when Papuans are constructed by others based on these essentialistic views, they also construct their identity as well as the construction of others.

The situation continues continuously, and therefore different feelings also continue to be maintained. The result is understandable if Papuans feel differentiated by other people and national-scale social structures so that feelings emerge differently on a regular basis. This practice of differentiation through the essentialistic concept of ethnicity and identity then led to a situation of socio-political relations engulfed by prejudice. Papuans then excluded themselves both territorially and culturally that they were indeed different, so the term indigenous Papuans appeared based on territorial dominance and body characteristics. Meanwhile those who are considered to be non-indigenous are referred to as immigrants.

Such an essentialistic construction of identity until the development phase is now still coloring in the dynamics of social and political life in Papua. The social conflicts that have occurred so far are also still in the scheme of essentialistic identity politics. Although the conflict is still sporadic, incidental, and localized, the potential for conflict towards internal disintegration remains strong and detrimental in terms of the unitary state. This situation also occurs in the Aceh Province region, which is politically potential for conflict and separatist potential as much as what happened in Papua.

The essentialistic understanding of the concept of ethnisism and identity is often also reflected in the political moment of the elections and the Presidential Election. In various regions local elites affirmed identity based on ethnic equality to gain support in seizing power through regional elections. By exploiting ethnic differences essentially, the elites claim that there are indigenous people and immigrants. Therefore, during the implementation of regional autonomy, the political process in almost all regions was colored by ethnic sentiments. This is why the configuration of



government leaders in the regions is always nuanced by the practice of identity politics that emphasizes tribal factors. In that case, the Javanese tribe always benefited because it was the largest tribe and spread to various regions. In some regions of Sumatra, Kalimantan, Sulawesi, NTT, and Papua there are not a few Javanese tribes who are deputy regents / mayors and deputy governors. There are even Javanese tribes who are governors like in North Sumatra, while it is almost impossible if a tribe other than Java can become a governor in a province in Java.

The same situation also occurs in the Presidential Election process, although it is often avoided but the tribal factor still feels its manifestation. After the New Order not one president in Indonesia came from a tribe other than Java. President BJ Habibei was indeed a president from a tribe other than Java, but the process did not go through direct election. During the Presidential Election carried out directly by the people, it is very unlikely that tribes other than Javanese could become president in Indonesia. This indicates that ethnic factors are still very dominant in the process of national leadership recruitment, and such national leadership constructs of essentialistic ethnicity also penetrate the minds of citizens in general.

Thus, a permanent understanding of essentialistic identity is often reflected in the society in Indonesia, which creates a variety of political and socio-cultural problems in a disintegrative direction. The various facts of conflict that occurred in Indonesia during the post-New Order indicate that every time a significant political change occurs, it is followed by the emergence of the disintegration phenomenon. Especially in countries that are experiencing a democratic transition, conflict continues to fluctuate, and even conflict has become part of the democratic transition process itself. Even one of the main characters of the conflict that follows the democratic transition state is identity conflict. This fact is in accordance with

It was revealed in a different sentence, that Indonesia is a heterogeneous society that has become a necessity, but history also shows that there are forces who want to deny that reality and then force a homogeneous society under the pretext of unity or the sake of the majority as state and religious power. What is imagined is then a dominant power and of course the choice taken is to make uniformity, anti-diversity, anti-locality, and also means anti-democracy.

The pluralistic facts are often denied and are not supported by the enthusiasm to accept differences. In fact, what often happens is that the differences are exploited for group political interests that do not prioritize common interests as a nation. As a result, in the course of the history of this nation it is often buffeted by a stream of uniformity imposed by interest groups that rely on autocratic authority and the power of religion. This situation then presents the problem of religious intolerance which has the potential to disintegrate from within.

### *Religious Intolerance*

Discuss religious intolerance, because it does not escape the two main entities, namely the state and religion itself. Both in the course of the history of the archipelago have a significant relationship in coloring the nation's journey. The state and religion as the dominant narrative, often appear fierce to control citizens according to their wishes. In Durkheim's terms, the two dominant narratives are structures whose existence is outside the individual, but have the compelling power to control people's actions both individually and in groups. In history, there are two main groups that dominate the discourse of state and religious relations. First, integralistic groups in the sense that the religion and state are to become one; and secular groups that want separate countries and religions.





In many cases, the first group often brought about problems of religious intolerance, or at least attracted debate around religious relations. Whereas secular groups in the Indonesian context take an ambiguous attitude. Therefore, it is no wonder that ambiguity presents the fact that the "official" is a religion recognized by the state, namely Islam, Protestantism, Catholicism, Hinduism and Buddhism. The attitude of this country also gave birth to serious problems in religious intolerance, especially those relating to the flow of beliefs and local religions.

Meanwhile, religion also presents the problem of intolerance itself. In its position as the dominant narrative, religion then uses purification-oriented strategies with the aim of regulating, controlling, and disciplining all production of locality. By inheriting the construction of forces that dominate and subordinate those carried out by modernization, religion then also appears as a dominant force that puts pressure on anything that has a locality spirit. Purification of religious teachings that are used as the main program, has the implication of taking the method of homogenization or uniformity of local cultural entities. Puritanization of religion as a political and cultural movement, after the New Order government regime which marginalized it, then appeared to become a photocopy of it by carrying out a movement model similar to the dominant power which subordinated the existence of local entities. The puritan religious movement also borrowed a hegemonic instrument from the forces that had been repressing it, to then use the same strategy to suppress and marginalize the production of locality.

In the next process religion then sees the local as having to be withdrawn and forced as it did in the center of origin so that the production of locality must be purified, straightened and fostered, as well as controlled. The implication of religion became a loss of local touch, so religion became fierce and lost its basic humanistic character. In fact, in an effort to build a tolerant Indonesia, it depends on how far religion opens up or is willing to get a touch of spirit of locality.

However, it must be acknowledged that empirically the role of religion today is significant in social and political life. For this consideration, however, there needs to be an effort to encourage religion to prioritize its human nature. If traced from the beginning of the history of his birth, religion in principle is a reaction to a dehumanistic political system, so that the basic character of a religion from the beginning is humanism. The prophets of any religion are basically humanist figures who are able to answer the challenges of the times, which in their time were in a dehumanistic situation. By doing reflection and contemplation in quiet places, the prophets received divine revelation which later became the main spirit against dehumanistic authoritarianism. So the spirit of religion carried by the prophets, in essence, is a divine power that frees humans from various forms of oppression, discrimination, and exploitation, not to standardize differences. Therefore, religion can be a measure of truth, depending on the extent to which religion has an emancipatory commitment and solidarity as evidenced in the practice of inter-cultural dialogue (including interfaith), and the struggle for liberation for the weak. However, religion in subsequent developments is often not spared from the pressure to legitimize sometimes dehumanistic actions.

It is interesting to note that at the praxis level of religion shows an ambiguous face, sometimes revealing what Gregory Baum (in his book entitled *Religion and Alienation*, Marquette: Paulist Press, 1975) is called liberating, but in sometime not infrequently it appears as enslaving. Following this thesis, a hypothetical statement can be expressed, that the more religion is normative-scripturalistic oriented, the more it shows the character of submission. Conversely, the



more religion opens itself to be understood historically in a scientific perspective, the more the character of its release will open.

Baum synthesizes between the theological paradigms which assume that religion is something standard and objective, not a subjective one, and a humanistic-historical paradigm that is always different in interpreting reality. With a synthetic framework between the normative and historical sides of reality through the glasses of Karl Mannheim's sociology of knowledge, Baum offers a synthetic point reflected in his view of emancipation and solidarity. That is, truth discourse is drawn away from only questions of objectivity and subjectivity to discourse to what extent the truth reflects the mission of liberation to the oppressed people based on emancipatory commitment and dialogue based on solidarity commitments.

A set of norms, whatever their background, whether political, traditional, or religion must be held accountable, why does a set of norms regulate human actions. Thus every normative system must open itself to discourse, not be a closed ideological entity. There have been many facts to show, the closure of an ideology, always produces followers who choose the way of violence, and unconsciously encourage the creation of dehumanization. What happens is nothing more than the subjugation of human consciousness which makes it an object and its authority is revoked. At that time, ideologies including religion began to be part of the process of human hegemonization.

It is this historiographic understanding of religion that will encourage religion to be accommodative of democracy and recognize local culture. In other words, a dialectical, inclusive and substantive understanding of religion will be able to make religion a component of a multiculturalism-based society system. In the context of Indonesian society, the emergence of the issue of the need for civil society development, for example, religion will be able to strengthen civil society as long as it does not have the pretense of merely labeling it as "civil society" which has historically been unknown in Indonesia.

#### *Open Indonesianness*

After all this time Indonesia has experienced an essentialistic process of identity formation, it's time to start constructing identity constructively. The thesis offered is, Indonesia is no longer a closed concept, but an open concept that gives space for every citizen to construct it. This means providing equal opportunities for all citizens as active subjects who construct their Indonesian identity.

The theoretical foundation used needs to refer to the notion of identity which is no longer permanent by referring to ethnicity, ideology, or even a normative system controlled by certain groups in the name of a single defender of the Pancasila or in the name of the majority religion. Rather it refers to an understanding of the concept of identity that is dynamic, discursive and fluid. By understanding such identity, there is no absolute claim that has implications for the emergence of Indonesia which is a central bias, Javanese bias, or Islamic bias as has happened so far.

That means providing the widest possible space for every citizen to construct their Indonesian identity according to their abilities and desires. So let the people of Papua or Aceh for example, construct their Indonesian identity according to their knowledge and conscience. Thus, there is no more they are forced to recognize their Indonesian identity in accordance with the central construction or construction of Jakarta which is Javanese or Islamic bias, for example.



Of course the construction of the citizen must still refer to the discourse about plural Indonesia. Because empirically Indonesia is not single, but full of diversity. Recognizing the fact that Indonesia is not a single entity, it will become a source of energy tolerance in any field. However, if you reject the empirical facts, what happens is intolerance and often will make uniformity controlled by a single force. Although for the time being the control by a single entity such as military or religious power, it can also create an integrative situation, but it has been proven that control is strict while making conditions disintegrative.

#### CLOSING

Thus, in the political and social dynamics of contemporary Indonesia, the tides are always tinged with various social and political conflicts. The assumption that the disintegrative situation is always caused by external factors involving the power of major countries with an interest in Indonesia is not all true. There are also internal factors which are disintegration processes from within. This fact is caused by the still dominant understanding of the concept of ethnicity and identity essentially. The problem is that such understanding continues to be maintained because it is deliberately produced by all political elites both locally and nationally. Ironically, such essentialistic understanding experiences reproduction precisely when the choice of its political system is democracy, so that the process of democracy experiences banality and even contradictions.

Indonesia's future will be largely determined by the tug of understanding the concept of ethnicity and identity between essentialistic and anti-essentialistic. If the dominance of essentialistic understanding of identity still continues both at the elite and grass root level, the disintegrative situation will remain potential and even at a certain moment can be explosive. Therefore, it is time to change understanding of identity constructively which is a manifestation of the concept of anti-essentialistic identity. Changes as well as development towards constructive understanding of identity will help create an open and inclusive Indonesian identity construction. The development of open Indonesian identity construction will neutralize the process of disintegration from within, and at the same time the social political process of democracy will take place more substantially.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Abdilah, Ibed. 2002. *Politik Identitas Etnis: Pergulatan Tanda Tanpa Identitas*. Magelang: Indonesiatara.
- Abdullah, Amin. 1996. *Studi Agama: Normativitas atau Historisitas?*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Barker, Chirs. 2000. *Cultural Studies: Theory and Practice*. London: Sage Publications. Ltd.
- Baum, Gregory. 1975. *Religion and Alienation*. New York: Puaulist Press.
- Giddens, A. 1984. *The Constitution of Society*. Cambridge: Polity Press
- Giddens, A. 1991. *Modernity and Self-Identity*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Hall, S. 1992. "The Question of Cultural Identity", in S. Hall, D. Held and T. McGrew (eds) *Modernity and Ist Futures*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Hall, S. 1996. "Gramsci's Relevance for the Study of Race and Ethnicity", in D. Morley and D-K. Chen (eds). *Stuart Hall*. London: Routledge.



POLITICS OF DIFFERENCE:  
ETHNICITY AND SOCIAL CLASS WITHIN THE INDONESIAN MIDDLE CLASS IN DIGITAL ERA

Thung Ju Lan  
Indonesian Institute of Sciences (LIPI)

Today the issue of ethnicity is considered “weaker” compared to religious issues, particularly after the 2017 Jakarta Governor election which was followed by the emergence of the so-called 212 movement. Nevertheless, the fact shows that it’s still as strong as ever.

The issue of socio-economic gap between ethnic groups is now being complicated by digital divide between those with access to social media and those without. Information and opinion are mostly constructed by surveys conducted among those with access to internet or social media. Even though, as Carmen Steele (2018) said, “[d]ifferences in income and literacy are most significant contributors to the digital divide, but group differences are not marked by poverty per se like the era of 1980s and 1990s.

Politics of difference has been dictated by new type of communication which, according to Christian Fuchs (2013), is both an ideology and a capital accumulation strategy through a promise of participatory internet prosumers. It disguised the strategy of targeted advertising and the crowdsourced exploitation of digital labour. Study by Yong-chan Kim, Joo-young Jung and Sandra J. Ball-Rokeach (2007) confirmed the effect of ethnicity on internet connectedness: individuals who reside and congregate in a particular place collectively influence the area’s communication infrastructure. In comparing whites, African Americans, Latinos and Asians in Los Angeles metropolitan areas, they found that whites and Latinos connected to the internet more for business and finance related goals, while Asians and African Americans connected more for entertainment related goals. It means that internet connectedness is “embedded in specific spatial and temporal contexts”.

In this paper I would like to discuss the issue of ethnicity and class within the context of the changing Indonesian middle class, which according to McKinsey, “presents an intriguing paradox”; Indonesia’s digital denizens are among the world’s most active (time spent on internet 3.5 hours per day, time spent on social media 2.9 hours per day, 90% of internet users are Facebook visitors, Jakarta is widely considered as the Twitter capital of the world), and it has a vibrant startup ecosystem, but overall the country lags in embracing the benefits of modern technology. Indonesia’s internet penetration rate is “half of Malaysia”, i.e. 34 % only.

In the last few years, we see the public emergence of the term “Indonesia Middle class Moslem” with the argument that since the majority of Indonesians are Moslem (87.13% or 2017,176 million people in 2010), it is appropriate to talk about Indonesia’s middle class Moslem. Even though there is no standard definition of the middle class, based on Asian Development Bank criteria, the majority of Indonesia’s middle class Moslem is at lower middle level with \$2-\$4 expenditure a day. Based on their survey over 1.200 respondents (586 males and 613 females), Hasanuddin Ali & Lilik Purwandi defined middle class Moslem as “a group of population, who has both purchasing power and a degree of religiosity. Munawir Aziz’s observation suggested that the growing of Moslem middle class in Indonesia has been “supported by a positive trend on the *sharia* economy market: the increasing economic circulation in the market with *sharia* label to the rapid development of the *sharia* bank. Wasisto Raharjo Jati believes that middle class Moslem who hold onto *shar’i* as their guidelines in values and norms is a consequence of their desire to be recognized as modern



Moslem with modern symbols. But, *shari'ah* consumerism among middle class Moslem, for Jati, is an indication that Islamic teachings is still at the scriptural level, because *shari'ah* is just an icon to persuade people to become a 'modern' Moslem middle class. As reported, Indonesia's Moslem majority has embraced more overt signs of religiosity and shifted toward Arab-style devotion (flowing clothes and veils, Arabic names and Middle Eastern devotional architecture). According to Mr. Ulil of the Liberal Islam Network, "Salafism is a magnet for people because it's very simple and easy to understand". Many students in Mr. Zaenal Abidin's Islamic school, which is part of a Salafist community build on the outskirts of Jakarta in 1998, are middle class government employees. According to him, "We were colonized for so long by Christians, so we have an inferiority complex, but this is a country with the world's largest number of Moslems, so we must show our true Islamic nature". The issue of "being Moslem" and "becoming more Moslem" is a new political trend which governs people's life in Indonesia today. It has become the most significant trait for identifying friends, working partners as well as community and state leaders. But, seeing class distinction as the core determinant for middle class Moslem grouping, we could safely say that Moslem identity is just an 'ethnic factor' that has been created for the purpose of distinguishing a certain group from the general Indonesian middle class. Hence is the beginning of what I will call class-based ethnicity.

If we look carefully at the underlying issue about the needs for "decent employment" and "well-paid job" which was raised by Muhammad Chatib Basri as the reason for the growing discontentment of [Moslem] middle class, we could argue that the statement is clearly targeting economic disparities of ethnic based majority and minority which has long been established since before the Indonesian independence, namely between indigenous and non-indigenous, as well as between those were economically weak and dominant, albeit now between the 'poor' Moslem majority and 'rich' non Moslem minority.

## Host, Guest and Stranger: Exoticization and Exploitation at Tourism Indonesian Practice

Coordinators: Irfan Nugraha, Sundjaya, & Febrian (Universitas Indonesia)

As a subject of anthropology, tourism had its dynamic perspective, from interest in culture contact (Smith, 1989), form of imperialism (Nash, 1989), into representation problem (Urry, 2002). Through its dynamic, the host-tourist relation seems could not escape from its dilemma, which the two groups are likely to encounter and the less natural they are likely to act. As Theodossopoulos (in Salazar, 2014) described, the situation led to exoticization, "limiting vision of indigenous host as passive recipient of tourism imagination; appreciate the agency of host in renegotiating their self-identity during tourism encounter". Exoticization often co-exist in parallel in the tourist imagination, producing contradictions that set in motion the imagination of local host. The local is constructed in contradictory ways and has always been, at least in part, the product of outside influences (Appadurai, 1996:178–199), yet the exchange of values happens in this relations. In contemporary Indonesia, the tourism is imaged as instrument of beneficiary. Since Jokowi's era, Indonesia's tourism boom considered positive for the economy as can be seen in the flood of overseas visitor, massive investment, and acceleration of tourism infrastructures. In that situation, this panel wants to elaborate and present cases on the Indonesia's tourism acceleration and its impact. This panel want to discuss how the host and guest relations in tourism at the time of Indonesia's booming tourism? How and what kind of values exchange that happened in contemporary Indonesia, present and future? And also, how we reflecting the



stranger at the tourism, in which we could not simply as socio-economy scape, but also correspondence on the nature and things that ironically a source for tourism industry itself.

#### HOST AND MIDDLE EAST GUEST INTERACTION

*Aminah*

*Universitas Padjadjaran*

Cipanas Puncak Area is famous for the beauty of nature and becoming a tourism destination for tourist from the Middle East, such as Saudi Arabia, Yaman, Kuwait, Qatar, and so on. There is an effect relation between host and guest. Cipanas Puncak Area has a strong influence from Middle East guest on infrastructure, economic, social and culture. It was a controversial issue in society internally of maintaining Middle East tourist in Cipanas Puncak Area. Therefore, there are some questions about how interaction practice between Middle East guest and host in Tourism context and who have received more benefit from this practice.

Through the framework of the practice theory, in every practice by every human did that will not be released by their system and structure, which is the actor on this issue is host and Middle East guest who will not be released from their system and power structure, and system and structure which connect them each other. But Individual will not always act follow by his structure, beside that the power has absorb characteristic in every individual (ubiquitous), the power can be destroyed. So there is a possibility that the practice of individual will be out of his structure and showing his agency.

Base on the data research, there is some actor in Cipanas Puncak Tourism. They are host and Middle East guest, then the stranger from outside of Cipanas Puncak Area who related on tourism, including government existing. In general, travel style that the Middle East chose was different from other tourists in Cipanas Puncak Area. Middle East guest more like to look at facilities and entertainment which is similar to their culture. So host must adjust of desire and need Middle East tourist specifically, such as foods, drinks, accommodations, entertainment, then prostitution and marriage with local people. The power relation between host and Middle East guest can be called domination. However, there is some agency by the host to Middle East guest for coming out from that power structure, such as the cases of the host who prosecute their rights and host who take advantage from Middle East tourist for social business, such as a foundation. Although there has some agencies to resist or protect the structure practices of Middle East guest in Cipanas Puncak. In the last analysis it seen that the domination of Middle East guest is still strong in the tourism industry of Cipanas Puncak.

*Keywords: Host, Middle East Guest, Practice, Interaction, Domination*





## WHO GOVERN THE GRAVE: THE CONTESTATION BETWEEN GOVERNMENT AND LOCAL COMMUNITIES IN MANAGING RELIGIOUS TOURISM PLACES

Aria Atyanto Satwiko

Universitas Indonesia

### INTRODUCTION

This paper wants to see how conflicts regarding the management of a religious tourist place between the community and the government can occur. When we talk about religious tourism, we cannot let go of the culture of the Javanese people who glorify people who in their lifetime are considered to be credited with the interests of the public by visiting the burial site. Not infrequently, the site is not the actual location of the tomb, it can also be in the form of *petilasan* (temporary resting place). Local people as funeral administrators also often benefit from the existence of pilgrimage activities like this, because they can open a side business such as food stall services, motorcycle taxi services to deliver pilgrims, or as a source of village income. Meanwhile, the local government feels that it has more power in managing this tourism activity and overrides the existence of the community around the tourist sites. The data that I use in this paper comes from the research that I did during June 2018 regarding the life of the farming community at the foot of Mount Muria.

### METHODS

The method that I did in this research was to use in-depth observations and interviews in a village located at the foot of Mount Muria, precisely in the Japan village, Kudus District, Central Java Province. Through observation, I saw how visitors to the funeral site arrived, saw what activities they were doing while at the cemetery location, and positioned myself as one of the visitors by participating in the pilgrimage activities. Meanwhile for in-depth interviews I selected a number of informants who were considered to have an important role in managing the burial sites, such as the *kuncen* (tomb caretaker), the local village head, and the management of the funeral foundation.

### FINDINGS

Historically, the name of the Village of Japan originated from the word *Japani* which in ancient times many shamans or paranormal gathered and tried to fight visible and invisible disturbances in the eastern part of Mount Muria. Hearing this, Sunan Muria sent one of his students named Surogonjo to settle in the area as the location of his horse stable and livestock. The area was originally only a place to guard horses and livestock, then gradually developed into a settlement. This is due to the large population around Mount Muria who came to settle down and help Surogonjo carry out his duties.

The three-flavored water and the tomb of Syech Syadzali are tourist attractions found in protected forest areas in Japan Village. The management of this tourist attraction was originally self-help by the local community. The management was carried out through the Syech Hasan Sadzali Cemetery Foundation chaired by Mr. Didik, with the tomb caretaker named Mbah Surono. Perhutani then took over this tourist attraction on the grounds of revamping the location, in collaboration with third parties who also managed the tourist attraction of Monthel Waterfall. With this third party, tourists who come to Air Tiga Rasa are charged a fee of IDR 7,500.00 per person to enter it.



Mbah Surogonjo's tomb near the village settlement is another sacred tomb located in Japan Village. Because of its location which is not included in the Perhutani work area, the management of the tomb is still held intact independently by the community. For the past 2 years the Mbah Surogonjo Cemetery has undergone several renovations. The most visible renovation was the construction of a gate and revamping at the grave site which was previously a simple brick hut. At present, *kuncen* from the tomb of Mbah Surogonjo is held by Mr. Suwardi.

#### DISCUSSION

Tourism is a big industry that involves millions of people every year, who spend millions of dollars. For many countries, this industry is the main element supporting the economic sector (Lagarens & Daud, 2009). The tourism industry drives labor absorption and income for local communities, and serves as a medium for preserving culture and the environment, supporting infrastructure development, and helping maintain political stability (Litchfield 1988); and gradually being promoted as a driver of development and poverty reduction (Tepelus, 2006).

Contrary to the driving spirit of development and poverty reduction, the Air Tiga Rasa religious tourism complex and the Syech Syadzali Tomb and the Mbah Surogonjo Tomb which are tourism objects in Japan Village have their own problems related to this. This happens because the community considers Perhutani to directly bypass the village government and foundations in implementing tourism location management agreements to third parties. Villagers themselves feel disadvantaged by the existence of these third parties because there is no profit sharing system between third parties and villagers. Even though the infrastructure to get to the tourism location uses village roads. This causes when there are road repairs caused by landslides, the ones who intervene to make improvements are ojek and foundation organizations with self-help funds from the Japanese Village Community.

According to the community, currently there is a transition period for third party changes because the contract with Perhutani will end in 2018. Many residents who expect these attractions can be re-managed by residents of Japan Village.

#### CONCLUSION

When discussing the location of tourism, we cannot rule out the existence of communities around the location. This is because they are the first circle that has a close relationship with the existence of these tourism locations in daily life. If the government is ignorant of their existence, it is likely that sustainable tourism activities will be difficult to achieve, especially if there is no support from the government. And the government should focus more on empowering the surrounding community in tourism location management activities that can support the economy of the local community.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

J.R. Pahlano Daud and B.E. Lagarens (2009). *Research paper-presentation for side event World Ocean Conference, Manado May 2009 – symposium session of Sustainable Marine Tourism: Challenges for Sustainable Marine Tourism Development; Human-induced Alterations and the Crown-of-thorns Starfish Threats in Bunaken National Park, Indonesia.*

Litchfield, N. (1988). *Economics in urban conservation*, New York: Cambridge University Press.



Ricklefs, M.C. (1991). *A History of Modern Indonesia since c.1300, 2nd Edition*. London: MacMillan. pp. 12.

Tepelus, C. M. (2006). A model for multi-stakeholder partnerships on human rights in tourism, in J. Jonker and M. de Witte, *Management models for corporate social responsibility*, Berlin: Springer.

McKercher, B. (1993). "Some fundamental truths about tourism: understanding tourism's social and environmental impacts", *Journal of Sustainable Tourism* 1(1): 6-16

DIENG CULTURE FESTIVAL: REPACKAGING LOCAL TRADITIONS TO STRENGTHEN TOURISM IMAGE  
DESTINATIONS

*Destha T. Raharjana, Heddy Shri Ahimsa-Putra, Djoko Wijono and H. Adji Kusworo*  
*Universitas Gadjah Mada*

The Dieng Plateau region is very well known for having the charm of Hindu temples, natural beauty, and horticultural potential as well as geothermal energy. Not only that, the Dieng community has long had a unique tradition of cutting dreads. In its development, this cultural performance was packed in cultural tourism. This article tries to examine how the relationship between the image of the destination and the holding of a cultural festival. The case raised in this study was Dieng Culture Festival (DCF) which was held in the Dieng area, Central Java.

To strengthen the destination image needs to be balanced with the development of events continuously and has a unique value. Through the perspective of cultural tourism, this article reviews the concept of organizing Dieng Culture Festival (DCF), such as the content and form of the show, how the audience reacts, how it impacts after the implementation of DCF while seeing how it continues. The focus of the analyst is directed at the importance of event planning to strengthen the destination image. Data collection is done by conducting observations, literature studies, and in-depth interviews.

The results of this study found that the Dieng Culture Festival (DCF) which started from the initiation of the Pokdarwis Dieng Pendawa has been carried out regularly and included in the National Tourism Agenda. The highlight of the event is cutting hair from children who have dreadlocks. Local governments and communities and tourism operators acknowledge that Dieng Culture Festival (DCF) is strategically supported to strengthen the destination image of Dieng Plateau while at the same time lifting the economy of the local community.

*Keywords: Tourism Destination Image, Local Culture Tradition, Dieng Culture Festival, Dieng Plateau, Central Java*

LINGKO LODOK TOURISM DEVELOPMENT IN MANGGARAI, EAST NUSA TENGGARA: BLESSING OR CURSE  
*Hardian Eko Nurseto, Dede Tresna Wiyanti, and Budhi Gunawan*  
*Department of Anthropology Universitas Padjadjaran*

Sustainable tourism development is often regarded as one of the manifestations of the idea of sustainable development which in addition to emphasizing the aspects of economic benefits, also gives attention to environmental sustainability and social equity. However, anthropologically,



tourism development can also cause problems that are detrimental to many parties. It is recognized that the development of the tourism sector has the potential to cause socio-cultural transformation that harms communities in tourism destination area. In this regard, this paper discusses issues related to *Lingko Lodok* tourism development in Manggarai District, East Nusa Tenggara Province. The results of the study show the magnitude of economic potential that can be obtained from *Lingko Lodok* tourism development, however, at the same time, such development has led to social friction among the stakeholders. In order to be able to achieve the optimal benefits of *Lingko Lodok* tourism development, the application of the principles of collaborative management and community-based rural tourism development is a fundamental thing to do.

*Keywords: Lingko Lodok, Community-based, Rural, Tourism.*

#### EXOTICIZATION OF LOCAL & GLOBAL: EXPLOITATION AT WEST JAVA TOURISM PRACTICE

*Imam Setyobudi*

*Institut Seni Budaya Indonesia*

*West Bandung Regency is the youngest district that was only established in 2007 in West Java Province. An administrative autonomous region resulting from the expansion of Bandung Regency. Entrepreneurs see business opportunities for the location and position of West Bandung Regency between the City of Jakarta and the City of Bandung.*

*West Java Province is focusing on handling development projects located in some of the former tea plantations owned by PT Perkebunan Nusantara VIII (Cikalong Wetan Subdistrict, West Bandung Regency) in the Walini area, which covers an area of twice that of Cimahi which was initially unproductive and insignificant built into Mega-City.*

*First, the construction of the Jakarta-Bandung high-speed railroad corridor, which is one of the stops in Walini. Second, the construction of international cities and the capital city of the new West Java Province (Walini City). Third, the development of recreational parks of Disneyland Park and agro-industrial tourism destinations that are still in the Walini area. Fourth, development is based on the concept of Eco Green and Cyber City.*

*The Regional Government Work Unit (SKPD) in the West Bandung Culture and Tourism Sector is aggressively exploring all the potential of its regional tourism. The head of West Bandung Disbudpar has collaborated with the PT-Kereta Api Indonesia-China consortium (KCIC) to realize West Bandung tourism promotion. Offer to fast train passengers consisting of domestic and foreign tourists regarding a package of visits to agro-tourism and cultural tourism in West Bandung District.*

*The rapid development of West Bandung Regency as Mega City raises two questions. How has the practice of exploiting the potential of tourism been going on? How does local and global exoticization become the attraction of a region to increase local revenue?*

*Keywords: exoticization, local, global, exploitation, tourism*



## BACKGROUND

This research is about the exoticization of something that is perceived as local and global. The realization of exploitation in tourism practices in West Java. The research case focused on the development of tourism that took place in West Bandung Regency. However, what happens and takes place automatically reflects a tourism policy at the level of West Java Province, as well as nationally.

At present, West Bandung Regency is the youngest district in West Java Province. Officially established as a district-level autonomous region, Tuesday, January 2, 2007. An autonomous administrative region resulting from the expansion of the Bandung Regency area. The administrative area is 1,311.31 km<sup>2</sup> with coordinate points of 6053'14 "S - 107025'58" E and the population has reached 1,531,072 inhabitants.

Entrepreneurs see business opportunities for the location and position of West Bandung Regency between the City of Jakarta and the City of Bandung. So, the West Java provincial government is focusing on handling development projects located in some of the former tea plantations owned by PT Perkebunan Nusantara VIII (Cikalong Wetan Sub-district, West Bandung Regency) in the Walini area, which was twice as Cimahi City as a non-productive area into Megacity.

Initially, Walini was just an area without productivity located on the edge of the Cipularang Toll Road (Cikampek-Purwakarta-Padalarang). A toll road access that connects the City of Jakarta and the City of Bandung. Development of an unproductive area is a large project involving many parties consisting of national governments, regional governments (provinces and districts), BUMNs, and private entrepreneurs (national and foreign). The involvement of many parties resulted in the establishment of a consortium.

The purpose of the consortium is business cooperation that provides mutual benefits for their respective interests. The background of the establishment of the consortium is based on four cases. First, the construction of the Jakarta-Bandung fast train corridor, which is one of the stops in Walini. Second, the construction of international cities and the capital city of the new West Java Province (Walini City). Third, Disneyland development projects and agro-industrial tourism destinations are still in the Walini area. Fourth, the development of Mega City, which is Eco Green and Cyber City in Walini.

In connection with this, SKPD (Regional Government Work Unit) Office of Culture and Tourism (Disbudpar) of West Bandung Regency actively explores all of the potential of its regional tourism in the form of arts and local cultural traditions. The Head of West Bandung Disbudpar has collaborated with the PT-Kereta Api Indonesia-China (KCIC) consortium to realize West Bandung tourism promotion.<sup>32</sup> They have prepared a draft program package for agro-tourism visits and cultural tourism for domestic and foreign tourists.

---

<sup>32</sup> Explanation of the Head of the Sub-field of Culture at the Disbudpar West Bandung Regency, Drs. Hernandi Tismara (Ngamprah, West Bandung Regency, on Thursday, January 18, 2018).



## OBJECTIVE

Simple economic law says that positive economic growth occurs if the money that enters a region is far greater than the amount of money coming out of an area. Income is greater than expenditure. The thought that arises is an effort to make as much money as possible into an area.

In the logic of the tourism industry, the main component of tourism objects is something that makes people from other regions arise the desire to visit a place to see, enjoy the atmosphere, and spend their money (Ko & Liu 2011). Similar to tourist attraction are all factors that cause tourists to enter certain locations. Factors related to tourism facilities are elements of tourism products that can motivate tourists to make visits (Goeldner et. al. 2000: 364).

Tourist destinations as tourism objects can attract a variety of business people according to their respective fields. The higher the frequency of tourists visiting a tourist attraction encourages more investors interested in investment. Every tourism object requires a strategic partner in an effort to bring in tourist visits. The desire of collaborating partners is affected by the potential for this attraction along with the support of stakeholders in providing comfort to partners in business investment (Erislan 2016: 254).

Kadin Chairperson (Indonesian Chamber of Commerce and Industry) Rosan P. Roeslani said the tourism sector has the potential to contribute the largest and most important foreign exchange earnings in Indonesia (Thursday, September 27, 2018 at Raffles Hotel, Jakarta). I quote Rosan's words to give an overview of exploitative and local and global tourism practices in West Bandung Regency (West Java Province).

The author studies the relationship between tourism policy, regional development, and the interests of employers raises a problem statement. The practice of exploiting the potential of tourism by means of exoticization of the local and global becomes the attraction of a region in order to increase local revenue.

Exoticization signifies something isolated, different, unique, and strange in its way of life and culture. Intentional distinction is emphasized to those who are considered different (other people) with the aim of producing a narrative of difference which has implications for the emergence of existence imagined as the differentiator (Debarbieux, et. Al. 2012: 85; Marushiakova & Popov 2011: 96-97). Distinction is always reflected in the meaning between global versus local and in various respects closely related to global tourism and globalization (Dimova & Gillen 2017: 60; Salazar 2013: 690). Distinction does not mean that distance is truly separate, but global and local are closely intertwined between them in a process of globalization (Chaubet 2015: 100-108; Robertson 1995: 25-44; Salazar 2005: 628). Sociological, anthropological, and historical studies of the socio-cultural aspects of globalization can refer to a number of previous literature (Appadurai 1996; Arizpe 1996; Bauman 1998; Chaubet 2015; Eriksen 2003; Featherstone, Lash and Robertson 1995; Friedman 1994; Hannerz 1996; Inda and Rosaldo 2002; Lewellen 2002; Tomlinson 1999; Waters 2001).

The situation of globalization as a fabric of social relations that is undergoing expansion, and its intensification at the world level. A process in which events and events in other places can have significant consequences for individuals and communities that are very far away in the world (Giddens 1990). Global coherence and interdependence open a gap for cross-cultural production opportunities from local meaning, self-image, representation, and ways of life that are typical of





various groups and individuals (Appadurai 1996). Direct implications of globalization arise from local transformations (Miller 1995; Wilson & Dissanayake 1996). Contradictory, the increased interest in the forces of global currents helped push local ideas forward far ahead, than before. Local is not just referring to spatially limited locations (Salazar 2005: 629).

The practice of tourism exploitation rests on exoticism as a cognitive process that builds, controls, organizes, and frames the world according to certain interpretive schemes. Exoticism follows hierarchical dichotomous logic as binary opposition. Exoticization involves symbolic domestication and the material world (Debarbieux et. al. 2012: 88). It takes part in world charm that is exploited by international tourism, television broadcasts, and marketing to sell exotic material or immaterial products that are presented as the uniqueness of an ethnic tribes (Debarbieux et. al. 2012: 89). Thus, exotic is not a characteristic of an object, place, or human being, but is characteristic of views and discourses (Gauthier 2008; Staszak 2008).

#### DESCRIPTION

Thursday, May 2, 2019, in a seminar in the city of Bandung, staff of the Ministry of Tourism of the Republic of Indonesia, Budi Setiawan said, Indonesia has 74,910 villages that have great potential for the development of cultural tourism that expresses the attractions of tradition, rituals, traditional arts and local cultural products. He said further, the development of tourist villages and cultural tourism could advance the village economy. Communities can be directly involved in the construction of tourist villages in various regions. "Tourism villages are able to maintain and preserve the environment and its culture," said the doctor of Hospitality Management and Sahid Polytechnic lecturer (Jakarta).

The government policy of West Java Province strives towards the center of world tourism destinations. Its potential, the area of West Java Province is 35,400 km<sup>2</sup> or the eighteenth largest province in Indonesia. Various traditional ritual ceremonies take place in West Java. Serentaun ceremonies are in Cigugur (Kuningan), Ciptagelar (Sukabumi), Sindang Barang (Pasir Eurih, Taman Sari, Bogor Regency), and in Kampung Naga (Tasikmalaya). Ngertakeun Bumi Lamba on Mount Tangkuban Perahu (West Bandung Regency) and Ruwatan Bumi Kampung Banceuy Ceremony (Sanca Village, Ciater, Subang). Ngalaksa ceremony in Rancakalong, Sumedang.

Rituals that are closely related to water such as the Miasih Bumi Mountain Nagara Padang ritual (Rawabogo, Ciwidey, Bandung Regency), Ngala Cai Kukulu in Sindang Barang (Eurih Sand, Tamansari, Bogor Regency), Nyepuh Ciomas in Panjalu (Ciamis), Cai Marriage (Kabuyutan Cipageran, Cimahi City), Salamatan Solokan in Cihideung (Parongpong, West Bandung), and Hajat Overtime Rempug Tarung Adu Tomato in Cikareumbi Village (Cikidang Village, Lembang, West Bandung). The rituals are self-defeating such as Ngabungbang in the Cisukawayana River Estuary (Cikakak, Sukabumi) and Ngabungbang in Pangadegan waterfall (Subang).

SKPD Data Collection Disbudpar West Bandung Regency has recorded at least 27 cultural tradition rites that receive stimulant budget funding every year on the basis of recommendations from West Java Province Disparbud. This policy is related to the promotion of culture which can be a potential for developing cultural tourism in tourism villages. The main objective is the sale of regional tourism potential to increase local revenue. The ability of the rhetoric as a trading strategy business is something very important. Tourism development is taking place especially in West Bandung Regency, and generally in West Java Province there are similarities to different phenomena that occur in Yogyakarta (Indonesia) and Arusha (Tanzania).



A study using a comparative case study between global tourism discourse and local tourism guides in Yogyakarta (Indonesia) themed cultural heritage tourism destinations and Arusha (Tanzania) themed nature reserve destinations, basically, tour guides as key actors deliberately mediate tensions between ongoing globalization process and local differentiation. Tour guides are creative producers of tourism rhetoric. They sell authenticity narratives about the traditional culture of local heritage. Seducing tour guides to tourists through cultural tourism tales in tourist village areas or tourist destinations in the village (Salazar 2007: 23).

But in the case of tourism in West Bandung Regency (West Java Province) there is another side in the same coin. The West Java Provincial Government is doing a mega project (lighthouse) about the construction of Kota Raya Walini along with the Rapid Railroad project that connects the City of Jakarta with the City of Bandung through West Bandung Regency. Kota Raya Walini takes the theme of a city that provides a green environment alongside the construction of Disneyland. The new prospective city design of the new West Java Capital City requires an area of 10,000 hectares, of which 3,000 hectares are tea plantation land managed by PTPN VIII and the remaining 7,000 hectares are land acquisition by the West Java Provincial Government in collaboration with other private companies.

Head of West Java Regional Development Planning Agency (Bappeda) Deny Juanda Puradimaja (Tempo Magazine, Friday, 11 November 2015) said the first phase of the master plan was compiled by PTPN VIII, one of which was the division of tea plantation blocks which became the forerunner of Kota Raya. "There is Disneyland, a government office complex, partly for research institutions. Not only are ITB interested, IPB too," said Deny. The Disneyland development project is needed to become the icon of the new area. "Every tourist area has an icon," said Deny.

The West Java government designed the development of the Greater Bandung Metropolitan by developing a number of satellite cities. Deny said, in addition to Kota Raya Walini in the west, there are at least two more areas projected to become new satellite cities, namely Tanjungsari in Sumedang, and Pangalengan in Bandung Regency.

## FINDINGS

Tourism development policies deliberately maintain a viewpoint that dichotomizes between traditional versus modern, or local versus global, authentic (authentic) versus made. Distinction is important as part of a trading political strategy. The practice of tourism exploits these two things, so that between the global and the exotic local, as if, two characters who have authentic differences. Both provide a sense of dreams about something to fulfill the desires of tourists. The purpose of differentiation between global and local produces a variety of taste narratives that can satisfy the desires of different foreign and domestic tourists. The tourism market share does not consist of one taste, but there are many variations of tastes and desires. Every time tastes and desires change dynamically.

Thus, the dichotomy between global versus local, modern versus tradition, and original (authentic) versus fabricated (artificial), in principle, is not to ignore the one and be more partial to the other. The general view deliberately maintains the dichotomian in order to remain contradictory (binary opposition). Globalization becomes something that looks exotically due to the presence of a different one. Locality becomes something that looks exotic due to the existence of a different side. Both can be merchandise material (selling) worth selling high. So, dichotomy is not something that takes place naturally, but rather engineering and rhetoric.



Deny said that the Disneyland development project as an icon for Kota Raya Walini intends to globalize various local cultural tourism and village tourism in various regions in West Bandung District in particular, and generally West Java Province. The West Java provincial government policy towards tourism development is a global and global tourism center. Disneyland is an exotic and global fairy tale anglosaxon mother tongue. The key to opening the window of globalization. The local ritual attraction is local exoticism.

The practice of cultural tourism and village tourism enters the vortex of global capital networks that cross borders between countries. Cultural tourism exploits the diversity of local traditions not in order to maintain, maintain, and develop values of local wisdom, but processed material for spectacle attractions for tourists. The values of local wisdom do not necessarily experience further development. Moreover, inheritance of wisdom values to the next generation. Everything is just a trade political jargon. The importance of tourism policy is an effort to increase foreign exchange.

However, self-realization sees the fact that economic growth does not necessarily coincide with the improvement of the economic well-being of the households and the equal distribution of social justice for all citizens. Another issue that requires serious attention from the government and cannot be ignored. If this is neglected, then there is no meaning in the development of tourism carried out, because it does not provide benefits to all citizens. In fact, tourism only creates socio-economic disparities, due to the ownership of land or land that is only focused on a handful of people.

#### CONCLUSION

Walini City is a dream land of global identity. Global city. Exoticization of the global through the construction of Disneyland which will be built in the City of Walini. So West Bandung Regency, Bandung City, and West Java Province stepped up to the global level to join several other cities in the world that became the branches of these famous entertainment venues, including Anaheim, Lake Buena Vista, Paris, Hong Kong and Tokyo.

The problem is not just to make it easier for Indonesians to visit Disneyland, so there is no need to go to Hong Kong. Indonesians simply go to Walini City. The Capital of the new West Java Province. But the case is mainly about its symbolic and representational aspects (Zukin 1991, 1996a: 11, 1996b: 43). Disneyland and Disney World go beyond ethnic, class, and regional identities that offer a national public culture based on aesthetization of differences (Zukin 1996a: 49; Barker 2000: 398-403).

Paradoxically, the dream land of global identity, a fairyland based on the mother tongue anglosaxon, Disneyland is present among other identities rooted in uniqueness and authenticity that are not universal and not global. Exoticization of local, unique, and the ethnic tribes' peoples attaches itself to something that comes from the global world so that it can be sold globally as well.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Appadurai, A.  
2001 *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.



- Arizpe, L., ed.  
1996 *The Cultural Dimensions of Global Change: Anthropological Approach*. Paris: UNESCO.
- Barker, Chris.  
2005 *Cultural Studies: Teori dan Praktik*. Penerjemah Tim KUNCI. Yogyakarta: Bentang Press.
- Bauman, Z.  
1998 *Globalization: The Human Consequences*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Chaubet, François.  
2015 *Globalisasi Budaya. (La mondialisation culturelle)*. Penerjemah Feybe I. Mokoginta. Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.
- Debarbieux, B., J.J. Fall, F. Giraut, E. Sohier, J-F. Staszak.  
2012 Framing globalization and constructing the world: cultural and political approaches. *Geographica Helvetica* Jg. 67 Heft 1-2. pp 85-92.
- Dimova, Dessislava & Eckhart J. Gillen.  
2017 *Globalization and Cultural Identity: The perspective of contemporary Art*. Trilogue: Salzburg.
- Eriksen, T., ed.  
2003 *Globalisation: Studies in Anthropology*. London: Pluto Press.
- Erislan.  
2016 Tourist attraction and the uniqueness of resources on tourist destination in West Java (Indonesia). In *Review of Integrative Business & Economics Research* Volume 5 No 1. pp 251-264.
- Featherstone, M., S. Lash, and R. Robertson, eds.  
1995 *Global Modernities*. London: Sage.
- Friedman, J.  
1994 *Cultural Identity and Global Process*. London: Sage.
- Gauthier, L.  
2008 L'Occident peut-il être exotique? De la possibilité d'un exotisme inversé. - In: *Le Globe* 148: 47-64.
- Giddens, A.  
1990 *The Consequences of Modernity*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Goeldner, R., Ritchie Charles, J.R. Brent, Robert Woodrow.  
2000 *Principles, Practices, Philosophies*. In Edition 8. McGraw-Hill.
- Hannerz, U.  
1996 *Transnational Connections: Culture, People, Places*. London: Routledge.
- Inda, J., and R. Rosaldo, eds.



- 2002 *The Anthropology of Globalization: A Reader*. Malden: Blackwell.
- Ko, Pen, Fa., Liu, Yung, Lun.  
2011 A visitor-focused study of tourism attraction in Taiwan: Empirical evidence from outbound Chinese tourist. In *Journal of Hospitality Management and Tourism* Volume 2 No 2. pp. 22-33.
- Lewellen, T.  
2002 *The Anthropology of Globalization: Cultural Anthropology Enters the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*. Westport: Bergin & Garvey.
- Marushiakova, Elena & Veselin Popov.  
2011 Between Exoticization and Marginalization: Current Problems of Gypsy Studies. *BEHEMOTH: a Journal on Civilization*. Volume 4 Issue No 1. pp. 86-105.
- Miiler, D., ed.  
1995 *Worlds Apart: Modernity through the Prism of the Local*. London: Routledge.
- Robertson, R.  
1995 Glocalization: Time-Space and Homogeneity-Heterogeneity. In *Global Modernities*, M. Featherstone, S. Lash and R. Robertson, eds., pp. 25-44. London: Sage.
- Salazar, Noel B.  
2013 Imagineering Otherness: Anthropological Legacies in Contemporary Tourism. In *Anthropological Quarterly* Volume 86 No. 3. pp 669-696.  
2007 Towards a Global Culture of Heritage Interpretation? Evidence from Indonesia and Tanzania. *Tourism Recreation Research*. Volume 32 (23). pp. 23-30.  
2005 TOURISM AND GLOCALIZATION "Local" Tour Guiding. *Annals of Tourism Research*. Volume 32 No 3. pp. 628-646.
- Staszak, Jeang-François. (sous la direction de)  
2008 L'exotisme. - *Le Globe* 148.
- Tomlinson, J.  
1999 *Globalization and Culture*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Waters, M.  
2001 *Globalization*. London: Routledge.
- Wilson, R., and W. Dissanayake, eds.  
1996 *Global/Local: Cultural Production and the Transnational Imaginary*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Zukin, S.  
1991 *Landscapes of power: from Detroit to Disneyworld*. Berkeley: University of California Press.  
1996a *The culture of Cities*. Oxford: Blackwell.



1996b Space and symbol in an age of Decline in A.D. King(ed.) *Representing the City*. London: MacMillan.

THE POWER OF WORLD CULTURAL HERITAGE:  
IN BETWEEN HEGEMONY AND CONSERVATION OF SUBAK, BALI BY UNESCO

Masdar Faridl AS  
*Humaniora Institute*  
Adi Prasetijo  
*Universitas Diponegoro*

*In 2012, the Balinese's Subak was declared as World Heritage by UNESCO. This was a process proposed by the Indonesian government since 2006. Subak, a traditional irrigation system which is based on indigenous knowledge Balinese society, namely 'Tri Hita Karana', is a manifestation of the idea of harmony between nature, culture and spiritual values of the people in Bali. Subak is also supported by a robust institutional system, which is rooted in the community. Having declared in 2012 by UNESCO as a World heritage because it has outstanding value for the world, several new problems appears. Interpretation of heritage embedded in the Subak system was not understood by the farmers who cultivate rice there.*

*This paper will be talking about how the concept of heritage comes into a contest of power relation where the Subak has becomes the property of the of tourism capital owners and commercial landowners who are not farmers in Bali, rather than to strengthen the farmers as rice cultivators who are the owner of the tradition. UNESCO and the Indonesian government failed to manage this issue so that with the World Heritage recognition.*

*Keyword: Subak, Bali, World Cultural Heritage, UNESCO, Tourism*

INTRODUCTION: BACKGROUND AND METHOD

This paper conducted from comparative research in two locations: Pakerisan watershed landscape in Gianyar, and Catur Angga Batukaru (Jatiluwih) landscape in Tabanan. The choice based as both have almost same characteristics: extensive agricultural land with the existence of subak community, yet supportive environment. Pakerisan watershed encompasses Basangambu, Pulagan, and Kumba. The sites are, Pura Pagulingan, Pura Mangening, Pura Tirtha Empul, Gunungkawi Temple. While in the Catur Angga Batukaru landscape, there are Jatiluwih subaks with Pura Luhur Batukaru, Luhur Pecak Petali Temple.

The method used is *rapid ethnography*. *Rapid ethnography* in anthropology is a limited-time data collection technique that is preceded by analysis of various problems through literature studies and the results of previous studies. (David R. Millen, 2000). Furthermore, rapid ethnography will deepen the problem through a comparative diachronic (past and present) test in order to reach certain depth from new problems that arise. (Isaac, 2013: 93). The author conducted a review study concerning to community participation in the establishment of subak as World Cultural Heritage by UNESCO. Observation and interviews also conducted with subak community such as the chairman of subak (*pekaseh*), members (*kelihan*), traditional leaders, and other stakeholders.





### *Subak and Landscape Changes*

The impact of establishing a World Cultural Heritage on subak is the presence of new tourism and economy. Subak landscape, which known for its natural panorama has become known internationally. The following is an analysis of landscape changes in two subak locations:

**Tabel 1. Landscape Changes in Subak**

<b>Landscape Changes</b>	<b>Pakerisan</b>	<b>Catur Angga Batukaru (Jatiluwih)</b>
Agricultural Landscape	Rice fields to hotels, restaurants and tourist attractions, owned by tenure changes	Decreasing land ownership annually from 60 acres to 50 acres (land acquisition)
Cultural Landscape	Declining members due to rice fields sold (cultural changes)	Functional subak change from agriculture to agribusiness
Religious Site	Subak sites change from worship place to tourist attractions (ritual changes)	Site functional changes from religious area (religion zone) into a public (common zone)
Economical Pattern	Declining interest in farming because landless, prefer working in hotels or tourism (livelihood changes)	Tourist farming communities with subak tourism commodification (mass tourism)

The greatest impact of World Cultural Heritage in subak is a change in the agricultural landscape. In Subak Pulagan and Kumba (Pakerisan watershed) most of the agricultural land in strategic locations has been controlled by outsider investors. Hotels and restaurants built leads water reserves decline through PDAM. Likewise, in Jatiluwih, land acquisition by the bank emerged as a result of loan failure. The loan was intended for tourism businesses. Changing the agricultural landscape leads to cultural landscape changes. In Pulagan and Kumba subak members gradually decline because of the land that had been sold and converted massively. In Jatiluwih, many subak organizations changed their functions from traditional institutions to customary economic institutions.

Another changing landscape is the sites itself. Tirtha Empul site in the Pakerisan watershed, since the establishment, developed as the expansion of tourist areas. The previous site was a Hindu worship place. As a result, many sites were damaged. The final is a change in the people economical pattern. As in Jatiluwih, a tourism farming community has emerged. They deliberately do farming with traditional techniques to be shown in tourism.

### *Between Hegemony and Conservation*

Since the establishment of subak as World Culture Heritage by UNESCO, there has been a pattern of changes in spatial structure in subak. The changes are based on UNESCO rules that all subak landscapes are designated as conservation zones. In these zones, should not be built any additional building together with activities that can damage the ecology. This regulation from



UNESCO is still in the form of an announcement, but it has been legalized by local government to take conservation actions.

In fact, many of these rules contradict *awig-awig* as customary law which regulates the existence of subak. Previously in Kumba and Pulagan Subak, cattle integrated farming facilities (*silvopastura*) and forms of economic security through cattle sales are allowed through *Awig-awig*. However, since UNESCO rules apply, many farmers have changed to chemical fertilizers obtained through loans. Farmers also end up selling their land because of the difficulty in applying new rules.

Conservation zone by UNESCO interpreted differently by local governments and communities. For the government, conservation can actually be done by presenting tourism: Through tourism subak values that fading can be revitalized again. So, the local government contracting investors even the spatial planning policies unclear. This can be seen from the appearance of *PT. Daya Tarik Wisata Jatiluwih* in the following columns:

PT.DTW Jatiluwih was formed in 2014 by local people and governmental support. This company utilizes WCH status as a tourist attraction. Through a revenue sharing agreement with the government and locals, they developed tourism. Many restaurants, hotels and various tourist attractions are built. The development was done because there was tenure vulnerability. There is no definite agreement in the use of subak conservation. The impact of the development of the mass tourism: the agricultural landscape in Jatiluwih changed, damage and commodification of farm culture are occurred.

It can be seen that the presence of UNESCO through the green zone political conservation actually lead to hegemony. The World Cultural Heritage status then interpreted by the government, investors, and communities as a new form of capital that can be used for economic accumulation. This is important because it will present new forms of hegemony such as: (a) the perception that WCH is the exoticism of foreign tourism, (b) the crisis of cultural values as a result of social change, and (c) damage to the landscape due to mass tourism.

According to Smith, the presence of UNESCO in the establishment of WCH is colonialism legacy. Which, conservation carried out by UNESCO actually raises control and power through new rules that conflict with local values, bringing the impact of capitalization to the WCH region, and creating a global to local control (Smith, 2003: 82). It was in accordance with the conditions in Subak, there were different perceptions in the rules between UNESCO and *Awig-awig*.

## CONCLUSION

The establishment of Subak as a World Cultural Heritage by UNESCO has changed the agricultural landscape, culture, site, and economic pattern of the community. This is due to the emergence of tourism. The emergence of tourism is a form of UNESCO hegemony through the WCH status that forms capitalism through land tenure.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

Albert M. Salamanca, et.al. Managing a Living Cultural Landscape: Bali's Subaks and The UNESCO World Heritage Site. Stockholm: Stockholm Environment Project 2015.



Ellen Isaacs, "The Value of Rapid Ethnography"., in *Advancing Ethnography in Corporate Environments: Challenges and Emerging Opportunities*, edited by Brigitte Jordan, Left Coast Press Inc.

Gilbert Pwiti, Webber Ndoro. "The Legacy of Colonialism: Perceptions of the Cultural Heritage in Southern Africa" *African Archaeological Review*. Vol. 16, No. 3, 1999

Lansing, J. 2006. *Perfect order: recognizing complexity in Bali*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

\_\_\_\_\_, 2007 (1991). *Priests and programmers: technologies of power in the engineered landscape of Bali*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

\_\_\_\_\_, M. Cox, S. Downey, M. Janssen, and J. Schoenfelder. 2009. *World Archaeology* 41(1):112–133.

Melanie K. Smith. *Issues in Cultural Tourism Studies*. London: Psychological Press, 2003.

Michael Hitchcock, Victor T. King and Michael Parnwell (eds). *Heritage Tourism in Southeast Asia*. Copenhagen, Nias Press, 2010.

UNESCO World Heritage Centre (n.d.). *Cultural Landscape of Bali Province: The Subak System as a Manifestation of the Tri Hita Karana Philosophy*. <http://whc.UNESCO.org/en/list/1194>.

Windia, I. W. W. (2010). *Sustainability of subak irrigation system in Bali (Experience of Bali Island)*. Presented at the Seminar on the History of Irrigation in Eastern Asia, organized by ICID.IID, Yogyakarta, 13 October.

#### MEANING OF SIKKA IKAT WEAVING MOTIF IN THE EYES OF YOUNG WEAVERS

*Meinar Sapto Wulan*

*Universitas Indonesia*

This articles reveals how to interpret the woven ikat motif, for young weavers in Sikka District, East Nusa Tenggara. The meaning of Sikka's weaving shows a shift in value on the meaning of Sikka's weaving motifs. Shifting cultural values to religious and economic values, as a result of massive tourism, regional development programs, economics, religious distribution, and issues of originality such as Geographical Indications (IG). Data was collected using a qualitative approach with in-depth interviews and involved observations. The informants consisted of four young weavers in four Sikka areas, native people, and Sikka cultural experts. The results of this study are the meaning of Sikka's weaving motifs has undergone a change of function, both social, religious, economic and tourism functions. This is because of the influence of government programs, churches, NGOs (NGOs), and tourism.



ORIGINALITY REVISITED: *RUMAH ADAT* AND TOURISM DEVELOPMENT BY THE STATE

Mochammad Arief Wicaksono

Universitas Indonesia

*The originality imagination of traditional/ceremonial houses (Rumah Adat) in Eastern Indonesia has tended to become one of the main capitals for the development of cultural and tradition-based tourism by the state, both the central government and the regional government. This condition then tends raise to the perspective that the Rumah Adat – the traditional/ceremonial house – is a passive structure, only has the functions as a centre of ritual and kinship, rather than as a dwelling for the people who inhabit it. Based on ethnographical research for six months in Sumba, East Nusa Tenggara, my research shows that in the context of Sumba society in particular, houses are active subjects and cannot be separated from the changes and transformations. This transformation can be in a physical and socio-cultural context and structure. Unfortunately, this change and transformation by the state is seen as a “decline or reverse” to the potential for cultural and tradition-based tourism development because it is getting far away from the originality. This paper will try to unravel the complexity of discussing changes, physical, social, and cultural transformation in the context of the Sumbanese’s Rumah Adat: how far changes and transformations occur and how far these changes and transformations can be said to threaten the potential for cultural and tradition-based tourism development by the state?*

*Keywords: Change and Continuity, Traditional/Ceremonial House, Originality, Tourism*

#### INTRODUCTION

For Sumba people, The Houses are the past and the future. It is not just an inanimate object, but something that must be thoroughly cared for because it contains the value of how they behave towards their ancestors. If it is injured it must be treated, if it broken it must be rebuilt. In one day, early in the morning, because it's cold, I don't take a shower, then go straight to the gathering point near the market in Waikabubak. That day, I along with hundreds of other villagers will leave for the forest to pull together a large pole. The large pole is not just ordinary pole. It is the most sacred pole in the structure of the traditional Sumba house. Daughter-in-law who lives in a traditional house, may not touch that sacred pole.

There are four large pillars that will be drawn, and not messing around because of their large and long size, plus the location of the wooden presence at the bottom of the cliff. I, who had the wrong costume wearing sandals, should have shoes or bare feet, had to struggle down the steep terrain. The problem is that there is no stone as a foothold, just relying on tree roots or logged-over tree trunks that appear on the surface. Fortunately, residents who saw me were in trouble, were light enough to extend their hands. Hundreds of people attended to help, coming from various villages. Far or near, directly or not, these people mostly have kinship ties with the main house to be built. The house to be built is *Umma Kabatana*, which means the border house. This house is indeed located between two villages: Tarung and Waitabar, West Sumba. *Umma Kabatana* is one of 24 other houses to be built, of course, requiring hundreds of people to work.

Tarung, in 2017, experienced a fire accident. This fire, for its residents, is not merely considered a disaster, but a connection point of past history with the future. The centuries-old houses that have stood up and burned, will be rebuilt because it is a manifestation of how their ancestors were respected until the future. His effort to pull the pole is nothing compared to the services of the ancestors to build houses and villages in the past so that they can exist until the present. Hundreds



of villagers in one day pulled the big pillars, also will be remembered by their children and grandchildren in the future.

#### *Preserving Tradition: What Will Be Preserved?*

"If there is no funding support, the houses will still to be built as before", said a resident about the village that was burned after receiving funding support from the government for revitalization. I will explain the issues – in reflective way - that relate to how the Tarung people maintain and "negotiate" the value of traditions in the present and in the future. This note is important as our forgiveness of the fact that an element and unit of tradition must experience change and even transformation for one reason or another. This change, we do not have to rush to value as something bad, but we must first look at social and cultural contexts: why changes and transformations of tradition and culture can occur, how changes and transformations take place, to what impact on the overall social structure of the community concerned. This is also an important note for all of us in reviewing what is meant by "preserving culture".

There are two important things concerning the change and transformation of this tradition and culture. *First* are things that related to the beliefs, which means they are related to religious matter. *Second* is things that concern the social life of the people of Sumba itself which are so complex, which when viewed in a material-economic perspective. However, the first change, which concerns beliefs, will affect the second, the social life of the community itself. This is none other than what I have said in the early part of this paper, that belief affects many aspects of the social structure of society, including talking about traditional houses, from the process of building to the rituals that surround them.

While I was in this village, I divided the changes into two categories: micro changes and macro changes. Instead of the word "change" I actually feel more appropriate using the word "transformation". The word "change" reflects something completely different from its origin, but in reality, in an element of tradition and culture there are things that change but there are things that are maintained. In other words, it doesn't change at all. I take an example, the replacement of horses into motorbikes when paying for the wedding dowry, the substitution of betel nut into candy, or even in the context of traditional houses, the replacement of concrete for wood as a house pole, should not be seen in a material perspective the economy, but also needs to be considered the cultural elements (meaning) and the context on them. What needs to be considered is whether the transformations also occur changes in the lifestyle of the people. Therefore, as I said earlier, there are two types of transformation: micro: which does not affect or change the pattern of life to the social structure of society and macro transformation which can change the social structure of the community. From macro transformations, more micro transformations occurred. These small things are small changes that society can still tolerate.

As with macro transformations, the things that "change" are related to customs or beliefs. In the process of reconstruction the traditional houses in Kampung Tarung, for example, there are simplified traditional rituals that are completely eliminated, of course, with realistic considerations, for example dealing with material issues. Matters that concern this are usually not just taken for granted, but "requested" permission to the ancestors who have overtaken them. This is what I mean by traditional and cultural negotiations: all "changes" carried out must be communicated to the ancestors through certain rituals and then anything simplified or eliminated can be tolerated.



In plain view, perhaps the problem above by ordinary people is seen as something that impresses that indigenous peoples no longer preserve their customs or traditions. A tradition and culture is considered sustainable if it is carried out as originally - its origin - without any difference whatsoever with its origin. In fact, nowadays, which is full of changes, dynamics, and complexity, people are increasingly difficult to find "originals" themselves. Of course, "change" and transformation occur throughout time depending on the social and cultural context that occurs around it. I have visited Prailiang or Prainatang Village in East Sumba. The traditional village is said to be said to be the second village that stood on Sumba, after Wunga Village which was also in East Sumba. Accompanied by a resident from Kampung Tarung who used to be a guide for a number of guests, he said that "this is the original traditional house on Sumba". What he said and I saw were traditional Sumba houses whose were not too high and the houses were not big.

Comparing traditional houses in one of the oldest villages in Sumba with traditional houses in Kampung Tarung is certainly very different, from the size, type of wood used, and the shape. However, the absence of a house in these two places does not make us rush to label a house or an element of tradition and culture with original or not authentic, even sustainable or unsustainable. There are things that should concern us before giving such labels, including the location or geographical context, and certain social conditions in a certain time dimension. Of course, there are many things that cause a "change" and transformation can occur. Likewise, when talking about the process of building a traditional house in Tarung.

Likewise, when starting to talk about things that are materialistic in nature, such as pegs or ropes that are used and become components of the structure of the house. Seeing things like this, once again, many people assume that when encountering elements that did not exist in the past, such as pegs, we immediately think that a house is as if "not original anymore". Of course there are certain considerations as to why an element is used and is not used anymore, that is what we must investigate or examine further. In onther words, we talked about "possible or not possible". Regarding this matter, let me ask a question that is sufficiently answered by the readers themselves in a reflective way: if nails and stakes were widely known in the past by the ancestors, they would or would not use them to build houses? I think they will consider it.

As I have said, "change" or micro transformation is possible if he is not too concerned with customary issues. In the context of the Tarung village, "change" and transformation of the structure of the house (including material and form or spatial layout) is possible if the house is *Ana Umma* or secondary house from The Main House. As long as the house is not included in 12 *Tuba* or has a task in the *Wulla Poddu* ritual, "change" and transformation are possible. Increasingly to the present, the relevance of traditional culture is increasingly contextual. The authenticity of a region's culture or ethnicity is maintained in several contexts, for example religious, kinship and marriage contexts. Perhaps because it is in the Indonesian social cultural space which is generally adaptive, the contexts of the authenticity of culture and tradition can coexist with changes that come from outside and from within the community itself. Take the example of a stone grave that weighs tons on the *Marapu* people, who once (and still some today) must be transported from the mountain to the village, now can be made from sand and cement and formed by mountain rock. Not an important change in means and equipment, but the essence of the meaning of tradition contained in the local cultural system that is maintained.





Socio-cultural changes always occur in any societies and will continue to happen at any time. Therefore, we must consider that socio-cultural change is something natural. Socio-cultural changes are read as alterations or transfers of behaviours and values in various aspects of order, institutions and organizations in society. There are four basic characters from the process of socio-cultural change. First, socio-cultural changes are always occurring. Second, socio-cultural changes occur because of intentions and some (more) because of accident. This is because a culture or tradition is the result of an ancestral error trial in living a life in the past. The third, social cultural change raises the pros and cons among the community itself. The four, social-cultural changes provide benefits to certain parts of society. Beyond that, there are changes that run slowly (evolution) and some run in a revolutionary manner.

Socio-cultural changes usually also occur unnoticed by the community concerned. They experience and deal with it as a process of adaptation. In addition to changes that do occur naturally, there are also changes that occur because they are intentional and planned. Some people may have ideas to change the (micro) structure of life to be (considered) more advanced, good, and easier. The effect of change (mainly intentional) is the emergence of controversy. Controversy is the effect that always occurs in every socio-cultural change. Pros and cons are dynamics that always arise as a result of the basic character of change.

#### *The Orientation of Cultural Tourism Development: Conclusion*

Physical and cultural transformation that includes traditional houses indirectly impacts on how the government builds a tourism perspective in its area, in this case related to traditional village tourism. Does the government want to build an imagination of originality about a cultural element or rather accommodate and make the dynamics of cultural transformation an important part of their tourism? The trend of developing traditional house-based tourism (in particular) in Indonesia still emphasizes originality as an important part in minimizing possible changes that can occur. The government seems to forget that the traditional houses that are elements of tourism are also places of residence for the people inside them (as a dwelling). As a dwelling, a house has its own dynamics depending on the context of the people who inhabit it and their lives. Indeed, in the context of ceremonial houses, there are certain limitations that cause small or large amounts of change and transformation to occur. The cultural tourism paradigm should have accommodated the elements of dynamics and cultural transformation as an important part of him but while maintaining certain cultural wisdom values. The government does not need to worry about the changes and transformations that occur in the community to the extent that it does not harm the community itself.

SURFING THE AMBIVALENCES: HUMAN-WAVES RELATIONSHIP IN MENTAWAI'S SURF TOURISM

*Sarani Pitor Pakan*

*Wageningen University/Universitas Pelita Harapan*

Studies about surfing and surf tourism in Mentawai Islands have been full of numbers, profiles, and conflicts. However, the most basic materiality of surfing itself, namely waves, is rarely emphasized. Besides, academic discourses have long portrayed Mentawai's association with land and forest, while their relationship with the sea and waves has been overlooked. Thus, this paper explores the waves as the focus, aiming in understanding how Mentawaians relate with waves within the context of surf tourism.



Drawing on Tim Ingold (2000), dwelling perspective and engagement provide theoretical tools to situate the relationship between Mentawaians and the waves. Siberut is the case studied here; through field research and by employing classic qualitative methods of participant-observation, everyday conversation, and interviewing.

This paper explores the way Mentawaians relate with the(ir) waves through various ambivalences. Surf tourism mediates the processes of engagement with and perception of waves among Mentawaians. In Siberut, waves are engaged and perceived ambiguously through contradiction in 'good waves', contrasts of fearful/playful waves, and confusing association with (mis)fortune. All of those lead to the nature of Mentawai human-waves relationship. Both human and waves relate with such intimacy, but within the dilemma of avoidance/encounter. All in all, surf tourism has played its role in complicating and (re)producing ambivalent relationship between human and waves in Siberut.

This paper adds a new case to the body of research on the human-environment relationship, while offers a different point of view to understand surf tourism phenomenon in Mentawai Islands. Moreover, this paper intends to encourage scholarly quests on seemingly trivial nonhuman being, such as waves, and emphasis on local people's voices, practices, and perceptions within ever-growing tourism settings.

*Keywords: waves, surf tourism, human-environment relationship, engagement, perception*

#### THIS IS US: TOWARD TOURISM IMAGINARIES CONSTRUCTION IN SIAK AND SINGKAWANG<sup>33</sup>

*Ayu Dewanti*

*Ikkon Bekraf-Siak*

*Syarifah Ratnawati*

*Ikkon Bekraf-Singkawang*

This paper examines the tourism imaginaries constructed from the host perspective. While there are many kinds of research look at the tourism issue from the interaction between the host and guest, in this paper, we would like to propose an examination of the response between the hosts themselves in terms of constructing tourism imaginaries for their areas. This paper will focus on hosts' perspectives from two field sites in Indonesia, Siak and Singkawang.

Tourism imaginaries is arguably considered as the narrative that defines and affects the tourist consumption in certain tourism destination (Chronis et al. 2012). Salazar and Graburn (2014: 1) define tourism imaginaries as the act of meaning-making by people based on '...socially transmitted representational assemblages'. Furthermore, they argue that imaginaries have two main points, which is shared by society and manifested through products, what people say and do.

We choose Siak and Singkawang, two regencies (kabupaten) in Indonesia to compare the different response being articulated by communities whose identity is not shown through the common

---

<sup>33</sup> We would like to thank Deputy 1 of Indonesian Agency for Creative Economy and related parties in Ikkon (*Inovatif dan Kreatif Melalui Kolaborasi Nusantara*) project for giving us the opportunity to do research in our field sites.



tourism imaginaries in each area. The response consists of self-commodification and negotiation which can be examined from different social situation. For this research, we examined two situations which are when tourism imaginaries are constructed by 1) the emergence of opponent imaginaries (Siak) and 2) the regulation and agendas like festival (Singkawang). The reason that we focused on the host of a certain tourism destination is because we would like to show the situation where agency is activated when there is an unfit situation. This is to contribute more on the discussion about the unfit identity in a diverse community, not only in terms of tourism. Especially because by studying the tourism imaginaries, we can see the latent relation in contestation between economy, social, and identity in a society (see Salazar and Graburn 2014: 35).

For Siak case study, we would like to examine the situation which the tourism imaginaries constructed from self-commodification (see Bunten 2008) in the community level. Located in Riau province, tourism in Siak is famous for their Malay tradition and heritage, like the Siak Palace and Malay tradition that is still done by local people, especially those who consider themselves as Malay ethnicity. The palace and the tourism event initiated by the local government is usually held in the capital city of the district (which is also a *kecamatan*), called Siak Sri Indrapura. Despite the dominance of Malay ethnic groups, there are others live there like Batak, Minang, and Javanese.

One of the districts who has prominent Javanese people is Bungaraya. Javanese people are known for their agriculture tradition, hence Bungaraya landscape is dominated by extensive rice fields. In terms of tourism, not until a few years ago that Bungaraya initiated their own specific tourism imaginaries. With the capital comes from themselves, not from outside investment, they constructed agriculture tourism. The spot that has the most establishment is the area located in the middle of the rice terrace with pond and tower of view, which they called Taman Bunga Mekar Lestari (TBML). The emergence of TBML as the new tourism destination has shown that they have the agency to construct their own tourism imaginaries, to contrast with the common tourism imaginaries in Siak, which is Malay Tradition.

As a social field, tourism has given a new sphere for migrant people to articulate their agency. This is to counter the previous situation where the dominant culture in Siak is shown through the common tourism imaginaries in Siak, which is Malay culture. Furthermore, tourism has also giving a space for people in Bungaraya to articulate their response, which is to commodify their own land, and changing it into a tourism destination. Making them able to self-commodified themselves. When talking about changing value in commodification, this case also shown that there are value changing of landscape in Bungaraya, from cultivation into a tourism activity (i.e fruit orchard which its fruit is used to be sold into experience of fruit picking from tourist). The term of self-commodification here is used to not limited to just a person, or a society (which is used by Bunten in her term: *commodified persona*), but also for what they have, in this case is their landscape.

The other site is Singkawang, which is known as a multicultural city. Various ethnic groups consisting of Malays, Dayaks, Chinese, Javanese, and Bataks, inhabit this city. The interesting thing about Singkawang is the ethnic diversity that there can live a life of mutual respect and respect. Also, the Singkawang government policy that promotes the value of tolerance and cultural diversity is one of the supporters of the creation of a harmonious life in Singkawang. On that basis, too, in 2018, Singkawang has been named as one of the Tolerant Cities in Indonesia.



Another uniqueness in Singkawang, besides multicultural cities, is the thick Chinese culture there. If you first track your feet in Singkawang, you will see a variety of Chinese cultures attached to house buildings, houses of worship and ethnic Chinese rituals that can still be found. The life of the Chinese community which is characteristic of this city is being worked on specifically by the regional government to introduce this city to the outside world as an icon of tourism (Rahmayani, 2014). In addition, presenting Chinese culture as a tourist attraction, the city also builds images of a multicultural city that is tolerant by showing a harmony between ethnic groups in Singkawang, one of the ways through the Cap Go Meh Festival.

The Cap Go Meh Festival is an annual celebration of Chinese culture and is also one of the tourist attractions of Singkawang City. We track that the study of the Cap Go Meh festival is pretty much reviewed, especially regarding the whereabouts of *Tatung*. Varanida (2016) explains that *Tatung* is a communication medium that reflects inter-ethnic integration in Singkawang. Through the attributes used by *Tatung*, it became a symbol of communication that the Chinese tradition in Singkawang had been assimilated with other local culture, in this case is Dayak culture (see also Purmintasari and Yulita, 2017). Ong, et al. (2017) saw the Cap Go Meh Festival as a tourism performance by displaying Chinese identity in the celebration. The Cap Go Meh Festival is a manifestation of culture in Singkawang because the celebration is a medium to showcase not only Chinese culture but also the mixing of cultures (as a part of negotiation) that occur in Singkawang. By involving various ethnic groups and allowing them to show their culture at the festival, Singkawang is a city that has a "face" that is diverse and can live together in harmony. In the context of tourism, through Cap Go Meh, is also seen not only as an attraction but on the other hand; it becomes a social, cultural and economic space for the community to realise togetherness and security in the city.

Our research is about the interaction between hosts regarding tourism imaginaries for their area tourism imaginaries, and the tourism imaginaries constructed by prominent communities are responded differently by certain communities in the host themselves. Being unfit with prominent tourism imaginaries, a certain community in Siak is making a self-commodification in terms of constructing their own imaginary, while another community in Singkawang is responding to the situation by doing negotiation. Furthermore, we would like to give more consideration on the study of interaction in tourism between the host itself, as the Anthropology of Tourism should already move from the study of global tourism imaginaries made by the west to the non-west to the situation happened between host itself.

*Keywords: Host, Negotiation, Self-Commodification, Tourism Imaginaries*

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

Bunten, Alexis Celeste

2008 Sharing Culture or Selling Out? Developing the Commodified Persona in the Heritage Industry. *American Ethnologist*, Vol, 35, No. 3 pp. 380-95.

Chronis, Athinodoros, Eric J. Arnould, and Ronald D. Hampton

2012 Gettysburg Re-imagined: The Role of Narrative Imagination in Consumption Experience. *Consumption Markets & Culture* Vol. 15, No. 3, pp. 261-86.

Ong, Chin Ee, Ormond Meghann Ormond and Dian Sulianti



2017 Performing 'Chinese-ness' in Singkawang: Diasporic Moorings, Festival and Tourism. *Asian Pacific Viewpoint*, Vol. 58, No. 1, April 2017.

Purmintasari, Yulita Dewi and Hera Yulita

2017 *Tatung: Perekat Budaya di Singkawang*. *Sosia: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial*, Vol 14, No. 1, Mei 2017. Hal: 1-7.

Rahmayani, Ani

2014 *Permukiman Tionghoa di Singkawang: dari Masa Kongsi hingga Masa Kolonial*. Yogyakarta: Penerbit Ombak.

Salazar, Noel B., and Nelson Graburn.

2014 *Tourism Imaginaries*. Oxford: Berghahn Books.

Varanida, Dea

2016 *Komunikasi dalam Integrasi Sosial Budaya antar Etnis Tionghoa dan Pribumi di Singkawang*. *Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi*, Volume 14, Nomor 1, Januari – April 2016, Hal: 13-21.

## Oral Tradition in the Discourse of Ethnic, Race, and Religion Diversity

Coordinator: Pudentia Maria Purenti Suniarti (Asosiasi Tradisi Lisan),  
Ninuk Kleden & Sri Murni (Universitas Indonesia)

This panel is questioning the positions, roles, and contributions of oral traditions in dealing with and responding to the development of ethnic, religious and class diversity in Indonesia. Empirical data on oral tradition shows that many traditions that are originally considered as local have disappeared or transformed due to various causes and purposes. Some oral traditions, were used to support practical political interests. For example, in Flores, the *wuat wai* tradition were utilized to support candidate running for the head of regency during regional election's campaign. On the other hand, oral traditions such as the *Tabuik* ceremony in Pariaman are used by the government as tourism objects to support tourism industries in the region. In another cases, many form and function of oral traditions have been disappeared or changed example as a result of cross-cultural encounters/collision between local culture with outside cultures or divine religions such as the *Saba* ritual of Badui in Banten and *Rambu Solo* in Toraja. There are also expressions of rejections to the existence of oral traditions in which can develop into conflict or at least have potential to be latent conflicts. The burial ceremony in Bantul, Palu namoni in Donggala Sulawesi and *gawai* Dayak in Kalimantan are among the example. Thus, oral tradition can be appropriate for different purposes; as tools to develop regional potential, but it can also be a source of conflict due to the different interpretations of various groups that exist in this country. In other words, oral traditions can lead to the integration or disintegration of the nation. After reformation era, which shape democracy in this country, have its own impact related to diversity and oral tradition. Almost every groups are struggling to maintain their existence, especially those whose existences are threatened by the rejection from the outsiders, which can lead to extinction. After reformation era, movements like that are increasingly widespread throughout the country. Those movements could become a capital or on the contrary it can be a source of conflict if there are collisions. The



argument of equality as a label of democracy causes the problem solving become complex. Questions that can be asked about this situation include: How is the position of the tradition from the local tradition? What is the contribution to this country? Does the oral tradition have to be maintained as a cultural capital of this country? Should oral traditions be maintained on the basis of equality? Should the oral tradition be developed? How did this tradition survive or be maintained or developed without inviting conflict? How to overcome threats related to maintaining and developing oral traditions that clash with outside/foreign culture? What policies should the government take as an effort to maintain oral traditions in the context of encounters and developments with the outside world? Studies related to the questions above are expected to maintain the cultural assets of this country as well as the issue of equality in the diversity of groups in this country without inviting conflicts or creating latent conflicts.

#### THE EXPRESSION AND EMOTIONS OF MADURESE AS AN AUSTRONESIAN LANGUAGE

*Amirul Auzar Ch.*

*Universitas Indonesia*

#### INTRODUCTION

Administratively, Madura is part of East Java residency, which consisted of many large and small islands. Madura also has small islands which are mostly in Sumenep districts, such as Kangean, Masalembu, Ra'as, Gili Raja, Poteran, and many other small islands. Geographically, the large of Madura Island is approximately 5.168 km, with a length of approximately 200 km and a width of approximately 40 km. Madura has different climate from the other regions in Java Island. Madura is situated in an arid region with infertile soil. If there are many mountains on Java, then in Madura we will only find highlands and hills. The condition of the soil is infertile and the water highly contains lime (Abdurrachman, 1977).

Madurese people tend to migrate, hence we can see that horseshoe area (*daerah tapal kuda*) in East Java such as Probolinggo, Bondowoso, Jember, and Banyuwangi are inhabited by many Madurese and northern Surabaya is also dominated by Madurese. Some Madurese - especially who live on that islands - live from agricultural products and grow crops such as rice, corn, beans, and yams. From the aspect of livestock, they mostly raise cows, goats, and poultry. However, it is undeniable as an island area, the people in the coastal area are very dependent on fishing and salt making.

Related to their religious belief, Madurese people are very infamous as strong believers in their Creator. Therefore, there are many assumptions which are given to Madurese as religious people. In the economic development context, it would be relevant to Yang's statement that "... in some regions in the world, not all economic societies are hijacked by western capitalism" (2002:477). The western economic system with the power of state hegemony does not influence the development of an economy in a particular society.

In my humble opinion, we can find that excessive belief in religious ritual does not inhibit the creation of an advanced economy in Madura. Madurese are working and earning money because they are encouraged by a religious spirit. It could be because they have a will to go on pilgrimage (*umrah* or *naik haji*) for many times, celebrate *haflatul imtihan* festival in boarding schools, arrange a marriage, or hold a funeral. Generally, when Madurese will go out of the island, they will *sowan* (say goodbye) to *kiai* (the clerics) to ask for permission and prayer which become their





blessing for working outside Madura. They have a highly emotional connection when they are outside of Madura Island, even the phenomenon of Madurese who live in Malaysia as Indonesian laborers has a unique tradition, such as inviting *kiai* from their hometown to preach in that country and of course, the incurred cost for the event is not a little.

### *Madurese Language*

Madura island is located in the limestone hills in northern East Java. Politically, for centuries, this region has become a subordinate of nature which the center is located in Java. Around 900 and 1500, it fell within the scope of Hinduism-Buddhism's influence in East Java, Kediri; Singasari and Majapahit kingdom. Around 1500 and 1624, Madurese kingdoms were depended on a certain point on kingdoms such as Demak, Gresik, and Surabaya. In 1624, that island was conquered by Mataram, and in the first half of the eighteenth century, it came under the Dutch hegemony. There are some stereotypes about Madurese given by Dutchmen which describe their physical characters compared to Javanese and Sundanese. They said that Madurese look rougher, stronger, more muscular, and braver as people who have physical strength (Hub De Jonge, 1995). However, besides the physical character, for the language, they are also different from Javanese and Sundanese. The Madurese language seems rude, if someone is new to the Madurese language, most of them will feel the language and intonation that used represent anger.

Language has an important role in seeing the culture. Thus, language is functionated to express the emotion which delivered to people. In addition, language can also describe a culture which exists in society. It is one important aspect to study an individual or a group of people. We can study them by how they express themselves through language. Language is not created in one night, it goes through several stages from the process of age, the process of social environment, and depends on the feelings which have been formed through the people. The things taught, learned, and observed which are obtained from childhood become a benchmark for seeing a language in society. Indonesia is a country which consists of ethnicities and this is the reason why it has many languages and cultures. We can find many language differences or language equations but have a different meaning. In the Javanese language, the word *cekel* means to hold, but if it is expressed in Madurese language, *cekel* will be meant as hold hardly and has its own place to hold (*men-cekel*), which is at the neck. If it is translated to Bahasa Indonesia, it changes from "to hold" (*memegang*) to "to strangle" (*mencekik*). This is the reason why Indonesia must have a unifying language because in every area the differences in emotions and languages are difficult to understand if Indonesian interact on a national level. This research discusses the study of Madurese's expressions and emotions as part of Austronesia language. The focus of research is motivated by my curiosity about whether the emotions which Madurese want to convey through their language expressions have similarity with other Austronesia language, both from the word forms and the expressions of the cultural pattern which represent many things. Therefore, as far as I get from the book – more precisely a collection of papers – entitled "*Expressions of Austronesian Thought and Emotions*" as a first step to find out some of the predecessor ethnographic figures about emotions themselves.

The most basic thing to know Madurese concepts in expressing emotions in the language form is to compare with Javanese. In the reference book I mentioned above, I feel that I have found enlightenment as a comparative and reflective material, a research conducted by Clifford Greetz in his attempt to find a systematic way to clarify aspects of personal expression between Java and Bali. In the discussion of emotional studies in Madurese language, I want to underline that there



are words related with the expression of fear, anger, shame, and love when contextualized in Madurese will be translated as *todus/sengkah*, *pegghel*, *takok*, and *lebur/seneng* and in the Javanese language they are the same words as *isin*, *nesu*, *wedi*, and *tresno*. From those basic words, based on my study, they have the same concept, at once they also have very different expression in their disclosure. Furthermore, I feel that there are many sub-words from the basic words mentioned before independently cannot be represented by other languages.

The Madurese language I researched about the emotion cannot reach the objective truth of each region or district, but precisely the collective awareness of language expression among Madurese. There are many dialects in Madura Island, such as Bangkalan, Sampang, Pamekasan, and Sumenep. The most striking is Sumenep dialect. Sumenep itself has two different, they are the coastal and land dialect. The coastal dialect – in this case, I map Sumenep the part of the regency city to the east – and the land dialect – the regency city to the west – there is an assumption between the coastal and the land – the coastal people consider that the land people are *sangghit*. On the contrary, the land people consider the coastal people *sangghit*. In fact, *sangghit* expression is a word attributed to a dialect which is not the same as their origin (both coast and land).

It cannot be denied that I need a lot of references from researchers who have discussed Austronesia emotional studies in other regions. There is Madurese language which clearly has the same basic words, but there are different functions in expressing the word according to an area in which they live, whether it is in land, coast, islands, or each district. So far, there is no standard Madurese dictionary has ever been written by the Madurese. Instead, you will find Madura-Indonesia dictionaries which are very diverse both in terms of meaning and word forms according to where the authors were born, whether they were born in Bangkalan, Sampang, Pamekasan, or Sumenep. In this paper, I hope to find the literal and philosophical meanings in the Madurese language related to shame, fear, anger, and love expression.

#### *Emotion from shame (Todus) and fear (Tako')*

According to Fox (2018), shame has significant value among Austronesia people. Shame and fear are emotions that must be learned even though they have circumstances, causes, and conditions which vary from society to society. He refers to Holland and Wellenkamp's research on the life cycle of the Toraja tribe entitled *The Thread of Life* (1996). In the book, it is stated that the shame of Toraja people initially developed from sexual behavior. Parents teach their children the importance of being ashamed of the opposite sex and parents have a responsibility to give them the right instructions. In addition, Geertz (1959) also in his book *The Vocabulary of Emotion: A Study of Dutch Socialization* mentions that Javanese children are taught how to be *wedi* and *isin*; they will get praise because they have a sense of *wedi* and *isin*, they consider an older person to be their superior.

If we see in general how Madurese express shame and fear, they have similarities with Austronesia people in general, which is constructed from childhood. Nevertheless, if it examined more deeply, the shame of the Madurese seems to have a quite striking difference. The difference is because Madurese consider shame to represent emotion from pride or prestige. In addition to express their shame because they are reluctant to meet, Madurese people often express shame about something related to self-esteem. For instance, in the sentence "*enjek engkok 'todus' katemoa ben oreng roah*" which means (I am ashamed to meet that person). The sentence is related to someone who has a debt that has not been repaid for a long time in the context of daily life or is a basic reason for someone who is not present at a friend or family wedding for not contributing



economically or physically. Generally, they will avoid friends and family not because they are afraid but because of *todus* or shame.

There are two kinds of shame in Madurese, *todus* and *sengkah*. *Todus* is more commonly used in four districts on Madura Island. Usually, they will better understand *todus* in the context of shame rather than *sengkah*. *Sengkah* has two very different versions of the meaning. In Pamekasan district, the word *sengkah* is interpreted as hatred, there is a feeling of dislike for others while Sumenep will interpret *sengkah* as shame. *Sengkah* in the context of Sumenep is used for older people or for community leaders, such as *kiai* and headman.

### *Emotion from Anger*

The more vocabulary that is related and hidden with certain feelings or attitudes, the more it will represent ethnic identity, and it will not be far from the experience they have. Humans both individuals and groups have feelings that are reflected in their behavior. As social beings, the human cannot be separated from each other. Between socio-cultural aspects, they cannot be separated because what is expressed and done by the group is based on the rational of experience and behavior. How they try to express anger to others through language is the evidence that there is something implicit in the expression of a particular ethnicity or culture.

There are two categories in the Madurese language which represent anger. First, the expressed anger is *ghighir* and the second is hidden anger as I will mention below. For the Madurese, *ghighir* is an expression when there is no place in the heart to hold anger and the climax of anger for the Madurese is to do *carok*. *Carok* is a tradition of fighting one on one until one of them dies. The tool or weapon that must be carried out for the *carok* tradition is a typical Madurese sickle. On the other hand, hidden anger has at least five kinds of represented words and each word has slightly different meaning to each other: *seddhi*, *blenget*, *regghet*, *caremet*, *bajhi* '. In the Madurese language, I do not provide specific language explaining the word 'revenge', but I see that there are several languages of hidden anger that can be categorized in the revenge. I will describe the words represented hidden anger with the following levels:

1. *Seddhi* is the lowest expression of hidden anger but can be also functioned in the context of revenge in Indonesian. I describe the word as anger which is not so calculated on every issue, only feeling hurt but not so deep.
2. *Ngosok* is the feeling (very deep) which cannot be controlled due to the behavior of others to us, usually occurs in children who are bullied by their friends but it can also occur in adults.
3. *Blenget* / *blenyet*, in this context, there is an excessive dislike for someone which causes anger. Usually, someone does not like to see the appearance of others (more than the word sick).
4. *Regghet* is when someone wants to make physical contact with someone else. For instance, by pinching or hitting, but not at the level of behavior. There is a condition or response of a person where the object seen does not agree with him/her.
5. *Caremet* is someone else's fault which cannot be forgiven, and that will impact to long anger.
6. *Pegghel* is a thought of anger in you that affects other people.
7. *Bjejhik* is anger causes emotions which are very deep so that the person does not want to relate to the person he/she means.



### *Emotion of Love*

Every expressed language has emotions delivered. There is something interesting from the Madurese understanding about emotion from love. So far, I do not find the word that implements the emotions of love for a lover, wife, and child in Madurese language. In general, Madurese assumption in expressing the love word is something taboo. You will not find the vocabulary of affection or romantic appellation in Madurese language like other languages. Even if there is one, this is because the person adopts it from another language such as *sayang* (the term in Indonesian), *ummi* (a term adopted from Arabic), *nduk* (taken from the Javanese language) and so on. A husband calls his wife only as "he" and the word has no meaning, as does the word "heh" in Indonesian language. There are some *priyai* and *kiai* call their wives "nak-kana'en" which means "hi wife who has children", this is not a romantic expression to a wife.

In addition, the expression of love for a lover (*burleburen*) is not as universal as word 'love' in English. In the use of the word *cinta* or love, they can be used at any time to someone they love. Conversely, Madurese language has a specific expression and different words about the feelings of love for a lover or wife. If someone falls in love with the opposite sex then they will use the word *terro* to express it - in this context, they do not have it -, but if someone has it, the word *terro* will no longer function to be expressed. Next, they will use the word *niser* to express their love. It should be underlined that the word *terro* and *niser* do not have a meaningful association with the word *cinta* or love. If they lose a lover but still love them, then the Madurese generally will express it with *estoh*, and the word *terro* and *niser* will no longer function.

I have two hypotheses to answer the problem above. First, one of the factors why there is not universal word that represents of love in the Madurese language is because in the process of marriage the Madurese generally have it through the matchmaking process (*perjodohan*). The tradition of the Madurese in the past to get a partner was through an arranged marriage by their parents, the matchmaking happened since childhood. In fact, it is not uncommon in ancient Madurese traditions that parents have paired their children from the womb. One of the speakers named Cak Sonar said:

"I was arranged for nearly 19 years until the marriage stage, but in the end, I chose to break my engagement because it was not based on love."

There is a Madurese expression:

*Tal ontalan amain betoh*

*Lurghuluran amain leker*

*Kalbekalan ghitak tantoh*

*Mon burleburan jet tak koat mekker*

(Which means: the engagement process does not certainly happen to the wedding stage, but a lover (*burleburan*) will be eternal).

Second, it is because Madurese are very aware and not taking lightly about their self-esteem. In the *carok* tradition, the things that cause *carok* to occur are because there are three factors, including the issue of religion, family and wealth. Even though 'family' is one of the causes of *carok*,



the concept of love itself according to Madurese is not appropriate to be expressed to oneself. Wife and child have become part and responsibility of them, expressing love to wife and child means expressing love to themselves then Madurese do not need the love word to their wife and child. Eliminating the name and eliminating the love word in the relationship of husband and wife in the Madurese tradition is a manifestation of upholding his pride. Meanwhile, a wife is not allowed to call her husband's name. This can be tested by reality. In the case of *carok*, a husband is willing to sacrifice his body and soul for self-esteem. If there is an affair in the family, in general someone will solve it by divorce. Moreover, for a Madurese man, it is not enough to just divorce, there must be a deep emotional release by fighting to the death.

#### *Contributions to present-day ethnography*

The reflective effort I mentioned above is not only an obligation to fulfill the Austronesia course assignments taught by James J. Fox. I hope this will be the beginning of the ethnographers' agenda, especially me, to do more research about the expression and emotion of Madurese language. As far as I see, there is still no ethnographer who is concerned in the emotion of the Madurese language area. There are several dictionaries and books of Madurese language collections that I found such as the Contemporary Madura-Indonesian Dictionary by Muhri Mohtar, MA., Asis Safioedin's Dictionary of Madura-Indonesian Language, but I did not find the meaning of *blenget*, *caremet*, *ngosok*, *seddhi*, and so on. Even if there is a word like *bejhik*, it is only interpreted as hate, but it does not really represent the actual emotion and does not show precisely to whom it is for and in what condition is used.

In addition, it is hoped that this paper will become one of the researchers' references in the future when someone wants to examine Austronesia language populations which show similarities in patterns or differences in an Austronesia language family. All of the explanations mentioned before, contribute to the ethnographic understanding of the Austronesian-speaking population. The little research I write in the form of this essay becomes the lighter for further research that is greater for the field as a whole. This article is also a typical offer to be raised on a broader issue regarding the Austronesia family language in a larger forum. I am well aware that this paper is very far from perfect, both from the writer's lack of awareness about linguistics and the method. I admit that this research is still not finished, and still needs a lot of input and revision to show ethnographic works which are worth reading. Nevertheless, for the responsibility, I am sure that my data and analysis about the emotions of the Madurese language that focus on shame, fear, anger, and love is the result of the collective agreement of the Madurese people.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Asis Safioedin. (1977). *Kamus Bahasa Madura-Indonesia*. Jakarta. Pusat Pembinaan dan Pengembangan Bahasa. Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan.
- J Fox, J. (2018). *Expressions of Austronesian Thought and Emotions* (p. 210). ANU Press.
- Koentjaraningrat, P. A. I. (1985). *Ritus Peralihan di Indonesia*. Jakarta: Balai Pustaka.
- Muri Mohtar. (2010). *Kamus Bahasa Madura-Indonesia Kontemporer*. Bangkalan.
- Van Dijk, K. (1995). *Across Madura Strait: the dynamics of an insular society* (Vol. 2). Koninklyk Instituut Voor Taal Land.



Yang, M. M. H., Cooper, G., Dutton, M., Feuchtwang, S., Gibson-Graham, J. K., Perry, R., ... & Souchow, Y. (2000). Putting global capitalism in its place: economic hybridity, Bataille, and ritual expenditure.

ADAT NARRATIVES, RITUAL AND COMMUNITY CIVILIZATION

*Budi Setiyono*

*Indonesian Institute of Art (ISI) Surakarta*

The portrayal of Balinese as a religious community with many ceremonies, inheriting high artistic talent, is responded critically as a romantic picture as in the tourist guide books. Changes that occurred in Balinese society due to colonialism, Indonesian independence and tourism often loosed of attention. The criticism actually ignores the historical reality that communities in Bali have the power to shift cultural forms that are present along with the presence of a wave of civilizations that once influenced the Balinese people.

Through an ethnographic study of indigenous narratives and practices in large ceremonies held by the Bali Aga community in the village of Tenganan Pegringsingan, this paper intends to show some cultural forms and practices that can be interpreted as community strategies to respond to influences that come from outside. Customs, ceremonies and other cultural forms are narrated as something that occupies such a high, important and sacred position in the community as a strategy to align with cultural or ideological forms that come from outside. Inherited and practiced such a strategy serves to care for sociality and shape the style of society that is considered ideal. Doctrines, ideologies and cultural forms from the outside are transformed into new forms that ideologically fit to the environment and tipe of the community idealized.

*Keywords: Custom, narration, ceremony, civilization, sacred, tactics, transformation*

The Preserve of Larungan Ritual in Suryabahari Vellage, Pakuhaji District,  
Tangerang Regency, BANTEN

*Endin Saparudin*

*Faculty of Humanities Universitas Indonesia*

This study discusses the efforts to *Larungan* ritual preserve, carried out by the Suryabahari fishing community. By using the concepts of ritual, oral tradition, and performance studies, this research examines the social context and the dynamics of the lives of complex fishing communities, especially those relating to beliefs, myths, and sacred symbols that they believe in. This research attempts to show various aspects that contribute to *Larungan* ritual preserve, so that it can take place continuously. Data were obtained from the results of ethnographic research conducted in several visits in February-August 2017, and continued on October 25<sup>th</sup>-November 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2017. From the analysis conducted, this study showed that there were five important aspects that were influential in *Larungan* ritual preserving. The five aspects are: (1) believe in/religion, (2) customer role, (3) funding management, (4) myth and narrative accident, and (5) *Larungan* ritual procession itself. The five are intertwined and mutually reinforcing each other. In addition, a comparison between the *Larungan* ritual at Suryabahari was carried out in a similar ritual in four other coastal villages in Banten, the ritual has various forms of change, such as being objectified





as being merely a festival for the sake of tourism, or even extinct altogether, each of which had different qualities and complexities.

*Keywords: ritual preserve, fishing community, larungan, Banten*

INCULTURATION IN TENSIONS BETWEEN TRADITION AND RELIGION:  
CASE STUDY OF THE *SILEK* TIGER CASE IN PAINAN, WEST SUMATRA  
*Madia Patra Ismar and Pudentia Maria Purenti Suniarti*  
*Universitas Indonesia*

Oral traditions including rituals, need to be seen in two related matters, namely first, the environment which is the context of the existence of tradition and the second is the community of owners and supporters of the tradition living and developing. If all things are harmoniously then certain oral traditions can live and develop, but if there is one factor such as religion that turns out to be incompatible with other norms, the traditional life will experience problems. From the various findings that have been carried out in the Oral Tradition Studies, it appears religion and tradition although there are various exceptions, but in general it can run harmoniously with certain adjustments and management from the traditional owner community. *Silek*, is a martial art originating from the Minangkabau culture. In its development, *silek* is an oral tradition learned in the *surau* after learning to recite the Qur'an. The expression *alam takambang manjadi manuruik teacher alua jo patuik uses the raso jo pareso, adaik basandi syarak, syarak basandi kitabullah* reflects that there has been an adjustment between old beliefs with Islam which only entered around the 17th century..This paper will try to express the values of spiritual inculturation which is a unification of old values that are in harmony with Islamic beliefs and practices that can be present together in the spirit of the *silek* tiger through a unity of the soul of the *raso*. This research aims to find special utterances from the rituals of initiation of the *silek* harimau whose patterns show spiritual inculturation that preserves the oral tradition of *silek* tiger in the present times.

*Keywords: Inculturation, spirituality, oral traditions, silek harimau, Minangkabau*

ORAL TRADITION: THE SAMIN PEOPLE'S MORAL DILEMMA ON WAYANG ART PERFORMANCE  
*Mikka Wildha Nurrochsyam*  
*Ministry of Education and Culture*

Some Saminism followers, known as *Sedulur Sikep*, like to watch wayang art performance. However, on the other hand, the wayang arts performance visually displays many scenes of war that are contrary to the local wisdom of Saminism anti-violence. The problem of this research is how to develop wayang arts performance in the Samin community? This study has three objectives: First describing the Samin people's art concept. Secondly, explaining the dilemma of Samin's moral thought of wayang arts performance. Third, formulating a strategy for developing wayang arts performance for Samin people. This research uses a qualitative approach, namely by conducting in-depth interviews with community leaders Samin. Meanwhile, in the data analysis used the theory of moral development by Lawrence Kohlberg (1927-1987). The results of the study show that for Samin people the choice of wayang arts performance is the only alternative arts because no other arts are considered capable of conveying moral teachings in their environment. In the dilemma of Samin's moral teachings on wayang arts performance, Samin people are more



likely to be at the conventional level in the structure of Lawrence Kohlberg's theory of moral awareness, namely showing the awareness of groups that are more dominant in their community. Meanwhile, for the development of puppets for Samin people can be done by conducting an appropriation strategy that is by by doing innovation and creativity wayang arts performance both aesthetically and ethically according to Saminsme's teachings.

*Keywords: puppet, moral, aesthetic, saminism*

#### MADIHIN PRESERVATION OF LOCAL TRADITION AND POLITIC

*Mu'jizah*

*Ministry of Education and Culture*

In South Kalimantan live a few ethnic groups, including Malays, Dayaks, Bakumpai, Bugis, Madurese, and Javanese. *Madihin* is one of a local tradition belongs to the Malay tribe, called Banjar. As an oral tradition, *madihin* contains local wisdom that recorded knowledge, values, and culture which had been passed down through generations. This local wisdom lives and is well-nurtured by the community. *Madihin* in one of oral tradition takes the form of folk poetry which is delivered in the local language, the Banjar dialect. According to Syukroni (2006) in the past, the *madihin* performers were also attached to the mystical world. It was believed that those people have supernatural power, known as *pulung* (fortune gift). It was said that the power was given by *Datu Madihin*, a supernatural figure.

Now, *madihin* lives and develops by its people. When compared with *karungut*, and *lamut*, *Madihin* is considered better survived. *Madihin* is still actively performed in public. There are also more *madihin* maestros compared to other oral tradition's maestros. *Madihin* also develops and has been spread from Banjar to other areas in South Kalimantan, such as in Balangan, Banjarmasin, Barito Kuala, Kota Baru, Tabalong, Tanah Bumbu, Tanah Laut, tapin, Hulu Sungai Selatan, Sungai Tengah, and Banjar Baru.

The development of *madihin* will have an impact on the research. In the last few years, *madihin* has become the object of study, for example in 2010, Yulianto examined the history of the development of *madihin*. In 2013, Herawati observed the structure of *madihin*. Another study was carried out by Faridah in 2017 focusing on "The Pragmatic Functions of Oral Humor." In the same year, *madihin* was also the object of study by Sani. The latest study, in 2018, was conducted by Rossi for her thesis at Muhammadiyah University of Yogyakarta.

With the well-maintenance of *madihin* and its dynamics in the community, *madihin* is still contextual to be the object of research, especially from its preservation. Preservation is the protection of tradition without any interference in its original state. This kind of activity is usually carried out for the sake of cultural legacy (Pudentia, 2006: 7). Preservation is an important step in the development of *madihin*, and this has never been discussed or studied before. For this reason, this paper discusses how *madihin* containing local wisdom exist in the community and what has been done to the work so that *madihin* live sustainably as an oral tradition until now.

The aim is to find local wisdom in the text and context, as well as to know how this work has been preserved in the community. This model of preservation is important to apply to other oral traditions that have been endangered nowadays. To achieve this goal is used a descriptive analytical method with literary studies and field studies. Field studies were conducted through in-



depth interviews, watching live-performance, recording or documenting the performances, and analyzing their contents.

From the study of the performance of *madihin*, it is known that *madihin* has unique texts and context as well as its own method of preservation. There are verbal and nonverbal, while the context provides integral meaning as a tradition. Context is a condition which envelopes the oral tradition to make it alive and exist. Within what context should *madihin* be performed. In this context, it is important to note where, when, who, and what purpose the *madihin* is performed. Context also relates to function, contextual situations, culture, social structures, and ideology (Sibarani dan Talhah, 2015:25).

The more detailed context is quoted from Hymes (1964, pp. 99-138 and 1972, pp. 21-44). He connected the contexts to speech event or language event. There are eight elements in the speech act, namely the setting and the scene, the participants, the objectives, the act sequence, tone instruction or key speech, instrumentality, and speech norms.

*Madihin* derives from the word *madah* which means to praise someone. This concept involves not only to praise, but also to advise, to educate, and to entertain. *Madihin* is a rhythmic poem with final rhyme a-a-a-a. This song is accompanied by *tambourine* (kind of drum). *Madihin* is usually performed at night or during the day with the duration of 2 through 3 hours by 1 through 4 performers. The show is usually in the open stage, but now *madihin* is also staged indoors.

*Madihin* has become the local identity of the Banjar community and is considered important and beneficial for the community's life. They are proud of this oral tradition because of its functions as a means of education, social interaction for togetherness, social criticism, and sometimes even a tool for government propaganda including politics. Another important function of *madihin* is to be some sort of entertainment for public (Saepudin, 2016). The function of *madihin* as a social interaction and for togetherness is known from the audience of *madihin* who come from various groups and religions, not just the Banjar tribe who are Muslim. *Madihin* already accommodates the diversity of its people who love *madihin*.

*Madihin* show is grouped into three types, classical *madihin*, *madihin* for preaching, and comical *madihin*. These three types can be identified from songs during its show. According to Maswan, et. al. (1995: 9) the structure of text the *madihin* consists of four elements; in other words the opening, the *batabi* (the homage), the *mamacah bunda* (sowing flowers as part of the content) and the closing.

*Madihin* is performed in traditional ceremonies relating to the life cycle and traditional feasts, such as harvest festivals, charity offerings, rituals to ward-off catastrophe, and vow fulfillment. In its development, *Madihin* is also performed on important days and often used for political reasons and for education as well as entertainment. The life span of *madihin* is relatively safe because of the number of maestros. Instead of Jhon Tralala and Hendra, there are many famous *madihin* artists in South Kalimantan, including Mat Nyarang and Masnah, the most senior *madihin* artists in Martapura, Rasyidi and Rohama (from Tanjung), Imberan and Timah (in Amuntai), Nafiah and Mastura (in Kandungan), Khair and Nurmah (also in Kandungan), Utuh Syahiban (from Banjarmasin), Syahrani (also from Banjarmasin), and Sudirman

Almost every day there are *madihin* performances in Banjarmasin. Even in a traditional market in Martapura, *Madihin* is performed every day. *Madihin* is quite popular among the communities in



South Kalimantan and almost every student knows it. Those who support *madihin* have positive attitude to protect its viability. They have invited *madihin* artists to perform in various events.

The dynamics of *madihin* show can be seen from the high frequency of the shows through various events. For example, *madihin* is broadcasted on various radio programs, such as Radio Smart FM, KM 5, TVRI Banjarmasin, regular broadcast *madihin* every weekend: in the program *Ambil Hikmahnya aja* that is broadcasted on various topics. The same thing has been done by Private TV agencies. In addition, *madihin* is also reproduced for commercial use in cassette, VCDs, and DVDs. *Madihin* has become more lively, and it appears annually in the competitions held by the city municipality with millions of rupiah worth of prizes.

It was found out from research on *madihin* that the success of this oral tradition was due to the support of various factors. The first factor is its simple rhyme which is usually ended with a-a-a-a. These simple verses are easily created and adapted by professional *madihin* maestro. The structure of the poem is very flexible and smooth. Flexibility are also known from the contents of the text of *madihin* which do not show SARA (ethnicity, religion, race, and intergroups). Therefore, *madihin* can be accepted by various and makes *madihin* easy to deliver in various ceremonies and events and easily adapted and developed through times. Therefore, during election period and election regional, *madihin* can be performed according to the election.

The other factor is the supportive attitude of the people in Banjarmasin who are proud to have *madihin* as their identity. With this positive attitude, they fully support the existence of *madihin* by frequently calling and performing, as well as watching it enthusiastically. The next factor is the positive attitude of *madihin* maestros or artists. They have open mind and support each other, and respect each other's skills.

*Madihin* maestro has the good skills to process words, themes, and messages according to the *madihin* structure and events. They are also good at processing vowels and reciting the verses without reading during their performance, composing songs and the music accompaniment (beating the drums), and creating harmony on stage. Their creativity is seen in the process of developing *madihin*. With this creativity, the form of *madihin* becomes more diverse. Those *madihin* artist feel responsible for the viability of this oral literary tradition, and they hand down these skills to their descendants and also to Banjar community as the next generation of this oral tradition.

The younger generation, mostly students, also has a great interest in preserving *madihin*. They are never reluctant to study *madihin* workshops. Generally, they will study with the maestro of *madihin*. During this activity, the maestro transfers his or her knowledge and expertise to the younger generation. This transfer of knowledge is also carried out into the formal domain of teaching syllabus at school in elementary and junior high school. The next event is *madihin* competition or festivals among those workshop participants. They will have competitive advantage to improve the quality of *madihin* performance.

Transformation of *madihin* also happened creatively. One form of its transformation is to perform *madihin* with complete musical accompaniment, such as with guitar and drum. Its transformation into the genre of songs makes *madihin* more popular.

Its popularity was proven by *madihin* performance at the national level in the Academic 2 program broadcasted in Indosiar. *Madihin* has also appeared a few times on live-show during some state



events, such as state ceremonies held by the late President Soeharto and ex-President Susilo Bambang Yudoyono. At the international level, *Madihin* has represented Indonesia in the Art Festivals in Malaysia, Brunei Darussalam, and Singapore.

The various activities and performances of the *madihin* mentioned above are concrete evidence in the development of *madihin*. The same strategy can be adopted as a successful role model of revitalization in the preservation of oral traditions. Because of this, the life force of *madihin* continues to develop and is irreplaceable by modern art, and it also preserves various kinds of local wisdom in it.

As a conclusion, there are a number of important points. *Madihin* is an oral tradition in literature which is the local identity of the Banjar community in South Kalimantan. This kind of literature can survive well as shown by its spread, its quantity of performance, and the number of *madihin* maestros. As an oral tradition, the text and its context are very supportive for its development. The text is so flexible. The flexibility is also known from the contents of the text of *madihin* which do not show SARA (ethnicity, religion, race, and intergroups). *Madihin* can be accepted by various tribes and makes *madihin* easy to deliver in various ceremonies and events. Therefore, the maestro of *madihin* can develop their performances at the regional and national scopes.

The success of *madihin* preservation among the community is due to people's pride and positive outlook towards *madihin* as their local identity. The efforts of preserving *madihin* have been done through various activity, one of them is through special workshops for students. Naturally, this oral tradition was handed down through generations within the family of the artists, and this is another factor that supported *Madihin* preservation. Other methods include research as a feasibility study for its development.

Its transformation into song is one of the ways to popularize *madihin*. Its frequent performance in various festivals and competitions at the regional and national level has been the evidence of its existence as an oral tradition among the communities. Accordingly, any support and commitment from the government will become the key for the success of oral literature as our local identity.

*Keywords: preservation, local tradition, analytical method, oral literature, local identity*

DODENGO AS A DOCUMENT OF MEMORY

*Ninuk Klenden*

*Universitas Indonesia*

Dodengo is a martial art of the people of Gamkonora, a minority group living in the western part of the district Halmahera, the province of North Maluku. As a performance Dodengo is already known among people before the advent of Islam in this area. Dodengo is often associated with war. In its performance people use *salawako* which is shield and *goola*, a bamboo weapon to hit the opponent. The Gamkonora people have always been used to the situations of warfare. Since the Kingdom of Ternate was founded in 1250, Gamkonora became one of its vassals and was involved in various wars. In the course of later development, the warfare situations are maintained in Dodengo performance. The initial appearance of Dodengo is still unknown. However, an old woman, born in 1928 has watched the performance since her childhood. This show of fight disappeared during the Ambon horizontal conflict in 1998. Not until 2003 a young man from Talaga revived Dodengo in a performance to celebrate Idul Fitri. This paper aims to demonstrate



how the memory of Gambkonora people, who have been very often involved in various wars, can be analysed with a historical- and oral history approach, whereby the people put their memory on the record in Dodengo as a cultural document.

*Keywords: Dodengo, history, oral history, cultural document, memory.*

#### SAFEGUARDING OF MAK YONG AS SHARED CULTURAL HERITAGE

*Pudentia Maria Parenti Suniarti*

*Universitas Indonesia*

There is a possibility the cultural expression owned by one province is also owned by another province. We have also to keep in mind that one cultural expression can spread in various geographical boundaries in different provinces. The fundamentals of the nomination of cultural heritage is done with the geo cultural view and not the geo political concerns. The geo cultural view thus enables various countries to manage and protect cultural heritage together more efficiently and effectively. Also it enables the process of nomination as a collaboration to the level of UNESCO. This endorsement of collaboration in cultural heritage has significantly made cultural diplomacy and safeguarding a possibility. An effort to guard an in-material treasure is usually difficult since cultural heritage is identified as something owned by people in the past and is considered irrelevant to current times. That is the reason as we all know, UNESCO as a cultural official worked organization has felt the need for an international level convention for safeguarding intangible cultural heritage that is indeed in danger of disappearing and to protect the heritage.

*Keywords: oral tradition, tension and memory*

#### NARRATIVE ABOUT JEW

*Sri Murni*

*Department Anthropology Universitas Indonesia*

The story of the sacredness of a *Jew* was inherited from generation to generation by Asmat people. *Jew* is "Rumah Bujang" (house for men), but more precisely it is a traditional house because that is where various issues are decided customarily. The *Jew* is occupied by men who represent the tribe in a village. Qualitative approaches through in-depth interviews and observations of a Bisman tribe *Jew* in Suwru village, Agats subdistrict, Asmat district were undertaken. The daily *Jew* leader is outside the *Jew*, but every time a problem arises, Bisman people will immediately gather in the *Jew* and immediately position themselves and take place to sit or just be outside the *Jew*.

*Keywords: Jew, bisman, asmat, narrative*





Jakarta, as the capital city of the country, is a large place that brings not only the ethnic groups from Indonesia, but also people from all nations. In this city, the progress earned by Indonesia is reflected through various sectors of life. That is why, the Jakarta city gets the nickname as "metropolitan" and slowly leads to become a "megapolitan." This situation occurs because of the influence of knowledge and technology that comes in the form of living equipment, communication devices, and transportation so that it has a direct impact to the lifestyle of the people. They continue to move to be more modern with the popular culture as its foundation. No wonder if the people who settle and live in Jakarta are more dynamic and flexible toward the lifestyle changes. No exception to the lifestyle of the Betawi people. As a native, the Betawi people cannot be separated to the development of Jakarta. As the host of the capital city of the country, the Betawi people inevitably live in the midst of various policy, planning, and targets that may be beyond the wishes of this ethnic group. All of them must be accepted as a consequence, even though the "disruption" on their culture is getting harder.

Even so, one positive thing that has been noticed in the Betawi society and culture is its flexibility in accepting outside influences. For hundreds of years, the history of Betawi culture is an instance of a long journey of acculturation before achieving its present form. Several aspects from the Chinese, Indian, European, and Arabic cultures that entered the archipelago were culturally absorbed by the Betawi people so that the results are clearly visible in various forms of culinary, fashion, decoration, as well as arts-culture. One among the many forms of acculturation is the existence of a pair of giant dolls called *Ondel-ondel*. These dolls, that can be controlled and driven by humans from inside, occupy an important position in the life cycle events of the Betawi people. Its presence is always awaited in every party, especially a party that requires a parade. Its big and eye-catching shape make it able to attract people's attention so that it is appropriate if the DKI Jakarta government sets this big doll as the icon of Jakarta. Likewise, with the events organised by the Jakarta government, *Ondel-ondel* is always present and takes part.

Nevertheless, observing its development recently, *Ondel-ondel* seems to be in a "pathetic" situation; from the position as a part of various life cycle ceremonies and the icon of a city, it downgrades because it is used as a busking tool by a group of people on the streets. The question is, why does this happen? What is the underlying background? Based on a field research conducted and several interviews with the perpetrators, two conclusions can be drawn. First, the presence of *Ondel-ondel* with a high posture is big and eye-catching in terms of appearance to be a powerful 'magnet' in attracting the attention of the people who see it. Second, busking by including *Ondel-ondel* as a demonstration aid and music from Betawi as an accompaniment is proved to promise a decent income. This was stated by Ilham (11 years) and two friends named Intan (10 years) and Eko (9 years). These three Pulogadung residents are ones of the many "teams" who are active as *Ondel-ondel* buskers. Every day, they operate along a three-kilometer road, starting from the Pulogadung Terminal straight to the Klender Market.

Ilham, whose body is the largest, is in charge for carrying the *Ondel-ondel* to control, so it appears alive. Eko is tasked to push a small lorry containing simple tape radio equipped with loudspeakers, while Intan, is tasked to ask for pity from those around them. Equipped with a used, five-kilograms sized, plastic container of paint, the girl asks 'sawer' (donation) money to the people around them.



All of that is done by Intan in a way that is pleasing but with a little bit of force. Her thin body and dirty appearance seem to get a pity from anyone she asked for money.

When after the *isya* (evening), the container for money that was hours in Intan's grasp was spilled with its contents into the sidewalk floor by those three children. Immediately, coins of one thousand and two thousand were poured into the asphalt. With their little hands, they swiftly picked up the money and separated it into small piles based on their nominal value. This was done by them to ease the calculation and classify them at the same time. The amount of money collected at that time was Rp175,500, larger for Rp52,000 than the amount they got at the first count at five o'clock. So, in total, Ilham, Intan, and Eko got a total of Rp299,000.

After counting, Ilham was the most courageous among the three chattered that they would fairly share the same amount of money when they got home. Iwan also said that every day they get at least Rp200,000 to Rp250,000 if they are singing on weekdays, Monday to Friday. If the busking is done on Saturday or Sunday, the income can reach Rp300,000 because more people are on the road than on weekdays. They achieved that amount of income for five hours of busking, from 4 p.m. to 9 p.m.

When asked whether the *Ondel-ondel* used was their own, Ilham and Eko simultaneously replied that they rented it from a neighbour called 'Boss'. This person was their neighbour. He opened an *Ondel-ondel* rental business plus a portable sound system for busking purposes. He rated Rp30,000 for one-time rental. The period was five hours for one rental, from 4 p.m. to 9 p.m. with a one-hour return tolerance. This policy was taken to provide an opportunity for the renters whose were far away to return the items. So actually, the rental time given by the boss was 6 hours. Intan said, the Boss had a lot of *Ondel-ondel* for rent. In fact, the renters can choose *Ondel-ondel's* size; large, medium, or small, according to the size needed. A renter with a relatively tall body size will be directed to take on a large *Ondel-ondel*. Conversely, if those who rent are children, the Boss will give a small-sized *Ondel-ondel*.

Viewed from this aspect, it appears that busking activity involving *Ondel-ondel* and Betawi music is planned and coordinated business. Inside it, there is turnover of money, which is not few, if seen from the number of *Ondel-ondel* buskers on the streets of Jakarta, whether it is in the morning, afternoon, evening and night. In addition, a promising marketplace has also triggered the production of *Ondel-ondel* to supply the demands of the street buskers. That is why, various sizes of *Ondel-ondel* with various colours of clothes are increasingly roaming around in the streets of Jakarta.

The problem is, is this a positive or negative phenomenon? What is the attitude of the Betawi people to this phenomenon? What kind of cultural policy that is suitable for returning the *Ondel-ondel's* essence to its original function? These questions will be answered if social, ethnographic, and cultural inheritance changes are examined in depth. All the three are important because the people of Jakarta continue to change, the Betawi people also change, while the Betawi culture requires heirs so that its cultural identity of the Betawi people is maintained.

*Keywords: Ondel-ondel, Betawi, transformation, tradition, culture, acculturation.*



## SAHIBUL HIKAYAT – BETAWI ORAL TRADITION CAPTURING THE HEART OF THE MULTICULTURAL ETHNICS

IN JAKARTA

*Yasmine Zaki Shahab*

*Universitas Indonesia*

Sahibul Hikayat is a disappearing oral tradition of Betawi who are known as a strict Islamic indigenous people in Jakarta. During the prime era of the sahibul hikayat, the Betawi are recognized as an inferior ethnic group in the capital city of Indonesia, hence the sahibul hikayat is perceived as a consumption of the low economy class. As a matter of fact, the overlap of the tradition with the low class people is a character of oral tradition in general. My research findings, however, does not support this argument since Betawi elite are also consumer of sahibul hikayat. I was also encountered with two sahibul hikayat performances among educated non Betawi, who enjoyed these events although the sahibul hikayat was presented in its authentic forms with strong Islamic sense in terms of content and performance. Apparently, this islamic character created no problem for the viewers. Usually many traditions have been modified for the sake of the outsiders. It is, therefore, interesting to identify the strength of this oral tradition which successfully capture not only the heart of the Betawi, but also the heart of the multi ethnic and multicultural people in Jakarta. But, unfortunately this Betawi oral tradition is disappearing in her own home. Hopefully this writing could contribute for the oral tradition literature in terms of the strength of oral tradition to attract the elite multicultural urban.

*Keywords: oral traditions; authenticity; multi-ethnic; multicultural*

### On The Making of Commodities Under Category: Resource Exploitation

Coordinator: Rahardhika A. Utama & Perdana P. Roswaldy (Northwestern University)

After the fall of Soeharto and followed by decentralization, Indonesia still faces a serious challenge from natural resources conflicts that are still on the rise. Indonesia indeed has potentials to develop policies for the advancement of the situation. The question remains why after the democratization, natural resources continues to be a prominent issue in Indonesia's governance. While the natural resource is an umbrella concept, it is important to trace back the idea of commodities. Commodities can refer to both material and immaterial objects in our everyday life, but in this context, the focus is emphasized on staple and vital commodities that epitomize "natural" resources such as timber, land, rubber, and rice. Recent studies about commodity centers on the social life of thing approach that emphasizes how commodity has its own social life and equally interacts with the humane society to affect social changes. For instance, vast arrays of studies on how the flow of commodity reconfigures the landscape and social reality of people who involved in producing, distributing and consuming the commodity from the cradle to the grave. While tracing the social life of commodity and its consequences in social relations is crucial, the vice versa quest to investigating how the social relations mold certain things as commodities is also puzzling. This panel aims to explore the latter puzzle by examining the many ways the social relation comprises of manifold actors as well its multidimensional contexts of economics, politics and culture affects the evolution or transformation of things to become commodities; and how these commodities prevails. Empirical questions to be addressed in this panel are:



1. In under what circumstances the production of commodity lead to specific policy and social change in Indonesia?
2. How does Indonesia historically molded and produces its natural resource to be the (global) commodity?
3. What actors who are always ever-present in the process, how do they interact, and why are they important in the making of commodities in Indonesia?
4. What kind of relations or contentions that shape the politics of commodity today? How do different stakeholders navigate these contentious arenas given their own interests and existing institutions?

#### ATOMIZATION OF PRODUCTION AND WORKERS' FRAGMENTATION IN INDONESIA'S COMMODITY POLITICS

*Fathimah Fildzah Izzati*

*Indonesian Institute of Sciences (LIPI)*

Commodity production processes and politics have changed due to the emergence of platform capitalism and logistics revolution. Some of these changes include the expansion in the chain of production and the rise of job diversifications. Consequently, these changes affect the existing political relations, including within the working class. Employing Silvia Federici's social reproduction -based analytical framework, this paper analyzes such changes. Using contemporary Indonesia as a case study, this paper advances two findings. First, the disjuncture within production processes from its beginning (the extractive industry) to its end (the creative industry) has led to the atomization of commodity production processes. Second, reproduction work, despite its importance, remains hidden and unacknowledged in current commodity politics, has shaped the face of Indonesia's politics of commodity.

*Keywords: commodity, platform capitalism, social reproduction, working class, Indonesia.*

#### MAKING MONEY THROUGH "DOMPENG": SMALL-SCALE MINING AND LOCAL LIVELIHOOD IN JAMBI

*Manggala Ismanto*

*Universitas Brawijaya*

Small and traditional gold mining has become one of the alternative livelihoods for local communities in several regions in Indonesia. In Jambi, precisely in Sarolangun the people who live in the Batang Asai river area have a close relationship with the gold mine. In addition to being a farmer, the community is also involved in extractive gold mining activities. The journey of community relations with mining activities is a form of utilization of local resources. When the mining phenomenon emerges the state responds by attaching it to illegal activities. This article wants to see how the experience of local communities and state view the position of gold commodities. Then this article will also focus on how gold commodities are able to exert influence on socio-cultural relations in the community especially after resource extraction technology undergoes changes, such as shifts in livelihoods, land ownership relations, and relations between owners and mine workers.

*Keywords: Gold Mining, Illegality, Land property, Livelihood.*



## BACKGROUND

In several regions in Indonesia, illegal gold mining is a problem for regional governments because it is considered to be a contributor to environmental damage (Aspinall, 2001). But on the other hand from the perspective of the community being a gold miner is a way of survival when uncertainty arises from agricultural and plantation production. The presence of mining managed by the people raises a variety of social changes in the community. In terms of governance, the government sees by making policies with the aim of legalizing the gold mine, the problem will be resolved. This paper wants to explore the forms and characteristics of extractive resource management carried out by local communities and see how the government views the management of resources that are beyond their reach.

## OBJECTIVE

This study discusses how people manage their natural resources in this case a gold mine. The question posed is about what social relations have changed when people extracted gold? In addition, this study also explores the perspective of local government governance in looking at the phenomenon of the gold mine. Does the government always view this as illegal? Or is there a shift in perspective in addressing the gold mine?

## DESCRIPTION

### *Gambling and Risking Life for Gold*

Looking for gold or gold panning is the economic activity of the Kasiro Village community which has been going on for generations. This village is located on the edge of the Batang Asai river, Sarolangun, Jambi. Around 2004, Kasiro residents began searching for gold using dompeng machines. According to residents who once owned a gold-mining business, HB's youth, the dompeng method originally originated from the Bungo area which had known gold for a long time. In the area there are many people from Kalimantan to help residents assemble dompeng machines. A resident named Pak L said that it was the Borneo people who first introduced the method of searching for gold using a dompeng machine.

The first time Dompeng operates in the Kasiro Village area is a boat, which is often called dompeng air. Then later because the results were not so much, they shifted to the land where the operational area was on the edge of the river. Income from working on a gold club cannot be predicted. When the research was conducted, the price of one gram of gold reached Rp. 450,000.00.

"Sometimes you can get Rp. 2,000,000 for two weeks, sometimes you can get Rp. 4,000,000. Later, we will cut food and cigarette bills too. Uncertain, often called magical items, people say gold is genie. Yes, it can be said like gambling too, we cannot see the [gold] form, the lucky chunk of work. "

The job of looking for gold on the "lubung" has a considerable risk for the safety of its workers, both workers and residents who do nebeng. The most frequent accidents are land and rocks that fall from cliffs



### *Gold Commodities, Land and Labor*

For the first time starting a landfill business, the owner must find the location of the land. Then he must find out who the owner of the land is whose location is considered to have gold content. The dompeng owners will then give them some kind of 'land acquisition' and 'land rent' money to the land owners. For tanah land acquisition', people know the term money for plunging. This money is given to landowners where there are rubber gardens at the dompeng location. Usually if the land belongs to someone else, then you have to pay a flat amount of Rp 5,000,000. Later the landowner will tell the owner that he is his land and where he will be placed. "

There is an unwritten rule about who can be nebeng in a location of gold plated. According to the explanation of several residents, the person who has the right to nebeng is a family member of the land owner, whose land is used as a location for gold searching by dompeng owners. People who are nebeng usually come to the location of the golden veil during the day. They will wait on the sides of the hole and around in the afternoon they will begin to enter into the hole that is being abandoned by dompeng workers. This nebeng work sometimes gets greater benefits than dompeng workers who work full day, from morning to evening. The owner of Dompeng also has a strategy so that the gold leaf left behind is protected from sand extraction carried out by loggers. The left golden hole will be filled with water so that the people who do nebeng have difficulty taking the sand at the bottom of the hole.

### *From "Dompeng" to WPR (People's Mining Area): Between Illegality and Legibility*

Illegal gold mining in Sumatra, especially in Jambi Province is a problem faced by the regional government. In the perspective of the regional government, gold mining activities have an ecologically negative impact. This requires efforts to eliminate the practice of illegal mining. In 2012, the Jambi Regent was committed to eradicating illegal gold mining in Jambi, especially in the Batang Asai river basin. The plan was carried out by the local government in collaboration with the police to conduct raids on the Batang Asai river. The control of the illegal gold mine was carried out at the beginning of October in 2013. There was a dispute between the police and the community in Mengkadau area, Sarolangun. Clashes occurred between residents who worked as gold miners and policemen who carried out the curbing.

The Jambi government understands that the issue of illegal gold mining can no longer be handled with a repressive approach. Reflecting on the cases of conflict that led to fatalities in Mengkadau in 2013, the approach taken by the current Regional Government is negotiation through policy design. In 2016 the Regional Government sought to find a solution by planning a People's Mining Area. Through the formation of the region, gold mining became legal because it was regulated through regional government policies (Saputra, 2016)

### FINDINGS

The gold mine carried out by the people around the Batang Asai river is an effort to survive. As a small-holder, as Peluso (2017) said, the community tries various efforts to optimize the resources available on their land. In addition to being a rice farmer and rubber tappers, the community also uses their land to conduct extractive businesses in the form of gold mines. I agree with Peluso (2018) that small scale mining is a form of resource frontier carried out by the community.





In Scott's (1998) perspective, the state has a tendency to regulate people's lives. The important thing to know the population is to make people become legible. Something that can be known beforehand before it can be regulated through the state scheme and planning. Regarding something illegal such as illegal mining, it must be legalized so that the state can benefit from that mode of production, such as taxes.

## CONCLUSION

The gold mine in Sarolangun is a form of livelihood that is closely related to people's lives. Historically the people in Jambi cannot be separated from extractive production modes looking for gold. Even though gold livelihoods are said to have high risks and a degree of uncertainty, the profits obtained are quite tempting. Mining gold is one alternative to people's lives when agricultural and plantation products fluctuate, such as uncertainty in rubber prices.

From the perspective of the local government, the mining carried out by the community in the Batang Asai river is illegal. A raid was carried out in the area to curb the many illegal mines. Then there is a change in perspective from the regional government that the solution to illegal mining is by proposing the management of the People's Mining Area (WPR). By governing the mining through policy, government hopes this problem will be solved.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Aspinal, Clive. 2001. "Small-Scale Mining in Indonesia". in *Mining, Mineral and Sustainable Development Report. September 2001 No. 79*.
- Peluso, Nancy Lee .2017. "Plantations and Mines: Resource Frontiers and The Politics of the Smallholder Slot. In *The Journal of Peasant Studies*, 44:4, 834-869, DOI: 10.1080/03066150.2017.1339692
- Peluso, Nancy Lee. 2018. Entangled Territories in Small-Scale Gold Mining Frontiers: Labor Practices, Property, and Secrets in Indonesian Gold Country. in *World Development* 101 (2018) 400–416. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2016.11.003>
- Saputra, Dodi. 2016. "Pemprov Jambi Bentuk Wilayah Pertambangan Rakyat". Antara. Accessed from <https://jambi.antaranews.com/berita/312663/pemprov-jambi-bentuk-wilayah-pertambangan-rakyat>
- Scott, James. 1998. *Seeing Like A State: How Certain Schemes to Improve the Human Condition Have Failed*. Yale University Press.

GUARDIAN OF MOTHER EARTH: SHIFTING IDEAS OF PROGRESS AMONG SMALL FARMERS IN NORTH  
KENDENG  
Mokh Sobirin  
Universitas Indonesia

The post-developmentalism movement emerged as a criticism of the concept of development. However, the concept of development continues to persist as a picture of ideas and the road to progress. In post-New Order Indonesia, the concept of developmentalism was adopted by the



regional government with an extractive project, as happened in North Kendeng. The peasant movement that collaborates with academics conducting many activities to produce alternative ideas about development as a response.

*Keyword: development, social movement, production of knowledge, shifting, progress.*

## BACKGROUND

The expansion of global capitalism gave birth to social movements that voiced "another world is possible." The adoption of neoliberal ideologies that encourage market logic in all aspects of life has marginalized the role of the state. Under such conditions, the notion of immanent fields introduced by Deleuze and Guatarri took concrete forms when countries and global institutions joined forces to define a broad range of globally bound regulatory domains that established the superiority of capitalist axioms that apply axiomatic of local customs, traditions, and rules. Policymaking by the state and various multinational institutions and corporations often exclude citizens who inhabit an area called deterritorialization efforts (Chester and Welsh: 2006).

The idea of progress in development concept was promoted by World War II winner states that cooperated in IMF and World Bank after Bretton Woods agreement in the 1960s. Even the statistical, technocratic, and top-down ideologies that emerged in the 1950s and 1960s were widely criticized, the neoliberal thinking that was dominant in development organizations over the past three decades remained attached to the overall goal of linear economic and social 'progress' (Yarrow and Venkatesan 2006). The development approach that separates humans from their ecological context raises collective political expression in the form of social movements with reterritorialization efforts as the main agenda. Since the early 1900s, more social movements have been approached through sociology and political science approaches to refer to two approaches that see social movements as collective political expressions. These two approaches produce macro readings on the existence of social movements. While psychology studies represent micro studies of social movements, the development of anthropological studies of social movements has experienced ups and downs.

In the 1970s Richard Clemmer reminded the importance of anthropology to return to discussing social movements because of the importance of this study position in the scientific development of anthropology because social movements became a space for anthropology to be able to synthesize theory and practice (Burdick 1995). Contemporary social movement theory has analyzed the broad contour of contemporary activism concerning dimensions such as resources, problem framing, and political opportunities (see, McAdam, McCarthy, and Zald 1996). However, this grand theory is not enough to see the daily practice of social movements that occur. Anthropology began to shed light on the importance of studying social movements as expressions of culture. At least the study of social movements will strengthen anthropological studies in two ways; First, theoretically social movements will provide new input for anthropological studies. Second, the study of social movements from anthropology will provide valuable input for social movements to achieve their mission (Burdick 1995). Arturo Escobar argues that anthropologists are well positioned to explore how specific "cultural practices/texts" relate to the redistribution of social forces, and, by implication, the extent to which they can function as a kind of resource or stepping stone for community organizing and collective action (Casas-Cortes 2013).

A social movement is an event that has ontological and epistemological complexity because it must be able to create knowledge that continuously influences reality and is organizationally ensured to work in various networks and social spaces (Casas-Cortes 2013). At this stage, social



movements seen as meeting spaces between various identity and social groups. This meeting often brings together various kinds of interests in an agreed agenda. Interaction between different groups is a prerequisite for the formation of new knowledge. Furthermore, social movements are perceived as networks, webs, or polycentric fields, which consist of individuals, collectives, discourses, and so on, rather than as separate entities separately. (see S. Alvarez 1999; Escobar 2008). In the North Kendeng context, a meeting between Kendeng farmers and cave researchers in generating knowledge about karst shows a change in position between academics and knowledge outside of them. We build upon the implications of growing literature on social movements as knowledge producers and practitioners (see Casas-Cortés 2009; Escobar 2008).

## OBJECTIVE

One important thing is the occurrence of "activism turn." Anthropologists see the existence of social movements as an essential space for the birth of new knowledge called Donna Haraway as situated knowledge. In the political context, the production of new knowledge as a result of this collaboration is a territorialization effort by an epistemic group that works within the framework of co-production of knowledge (Lozano 2013). Furthermore, this paper seeks to show "ecology of knowledge", namely a critical dialogue between knowledge that is different from producer knowledge, in this case, academics and members of the movement (Lozano 2013) to disseminate the idea of differentiation of development.

## FINDINGS

The concept of development in the decentralization era is inseparable from the development model practiced during the New Order era which was marked by the construction of various large infrastructure projects, one of which was the water supply infrastructure. With the idea of self-sufficiency as a strategic political campaign, the issue of water is essential. Armed with a loan from the World Bank, Indonesia built many large dam projects. One of these large dams is the Kedung Ombo Dam, which began construction in 1985 with the support of the World Bank. In addition to the reservoir building, the project also built hundreds of kilometers of irrigation canals which are part of the water management project from the Jragung, Tuntang, Serayu, Lusi and Juwana Rivers, also known as Jratunseluna. The project is an essential part of efforts to balance economic growth between Pati North and South Pati, which is known as a dry and economically disadvantaged area.

This South starch condition is very different from North Pati. Although there is the Juwana River, which is the largest river in Pati Regency, it does not provide enough benefits for the agricultural economy in South Pati. To accelerate the construction of irrigation projects and reduce the resistance of landowners who will be affected by the project, Regent Muhammad Joesoef (1996-2001) popularized the term "Basahi Pati Selatan." The defining agenda for South Pati by the regional government in Pati North was a vital part of the idea of development in South Pati. This stage is essential because development is not only concerned with physical development but also the system of knowledge (Escobar 2008). This slogan has used for various interests of the government and other actors outside it.

After the momentum of self-sufficiency in the 1980s, the New Order began to push the agenda of industrialization and modernization with the concept of "take-off era." Agriculture is a model of development that is marginalized and replaced by large industries with a focus on the exploitation of natural resources, especially mining. Many local governments replicate this concept as a model of development in the era of decentralization. In this era of regional autonomy, many local



governments issued mining land concession permits, one of which was Pati district which issued a mining permit for PT Semen Indonesia in 2006.

In addition to using bureaucratic instruments, the Pati district government in the Tasiman regency year served again using the slogan "*Basahi Pati Selatan/ Wetting South Pati.*" However, the context of "wetness" this time was different from "wet" during the Regent Muhammad Joesoef. This concept encourages the need for local governments to wet South Pati with industrial development projects which are believed to have the effect of trickle-down effects. Remembrance of the dried South Pati is being rebuilt so that residents accept the project as well as an "obligation" of the local government to push the agenda of "soaking" South Pati. Since 2006, PT Semen Gresik has been disseminating plans for the construction of its factory. The land development scheme will be used in four sub-districts, namely Sukolilo District, Kayen District, Gabus District, and Margorejo District with a total land area of 1,560 hectares. Cement manufacture requires at least three raw materials, namely limestone, clay, and iron sand. Unfortunately, limestone (karst) is an essential agent because of its essential function as water storage. Besides the reduced water catchment area, the research conducted by the Speleology community stated that the presence of underground rivers in the karst area, which has complex tissues. Mining activities in one area can cause the depletion of water sources in another area. Because doing proper air storage, however, the appearance of a dry surface often occurs due to policy errors (Paripurno 2010).

In the context of the idea of "Wetting South Pati," Jaringan Masyarakat Peduli Pengunungan Kendeng (JM-PPK), the Mount Kendeng Concerned Community Network, argued that South Pati was not a dry area as stated by the cement factory and Pati regency government. The concept of "wetness" is now seen in the context of expanding development by placing an industrial point in the North Kendeng Mountains region. According to JM-PPK, this argument is misleading to regard to the conditions of the North Kendeng environment. They proved on many occasions that their land is already wet and fertile. Contestation of ideas about progress gives birth to action in various spaces. At the level of knowledge regarding the Pati South region, the local government described this region as a dry area that would not be able to progress if it did not make an industrialization effort while JM-PPK sees that the industrialization agenda, especially mining, will eliminate the agricultural potential in South Pati.

Driven by farmers from various backgrounds of faith groups, they built networks between villages that use multiple methods were used to fight the expansion plan. One of the critical resistance methods was producing alternatives knowledge regarding North Kendeng landscape. JM-PPK that supported by Acuntyasunyata Speleological Club (ASC) was accomplished some research upon several caves found in the Kendeng Mountains. This research strengthens the daily struggle of the JM-PPK members stating that there are many springs in each village along the Kendeng Mountains. Not only they are aware of the cave protection, but the residents also map springs along the area. The findings of this independent research then became an argument for why Kendeng Mountain needs to protect from destructive activities, one of which was the construction of a cement factory.

The peasant movement in post-New Order Indonesia was a combination of the agrarian and environmental movements (Peluso 2008). Agrarian issues are a sensitive issue in the New Order political landscape, so they do not have the opportunity to become a common issue. Then this issue was wrapped up in environmental issues that were more acceptable to the New Order regime. Later environmental issues remain one of the crucial strategies to push the agrarian problems into public discourse. As also happened in the North Kendeng movement, which



narrated the process of marginalizing their existence as farmers in the discussion of karst damage as a store of water by mining cement raw materials.

This concept inspired Simbar Wareh, JM-PPK's women group, to determine the form of household economic strengthening activities to run. The backyards have finally become one of the potentials they manage more intensively. Maintained garden in a more integrative manner, it would meet the nutritional needs of many households. Simbar Wareh encourages its members to plant chilies, vegetables, papayas, and medicinal plants. Although not yet sufficiently reliable, managing backyards to meet families' nutritional needs began to be a choice activity of Simbar Wareh. During limited rice fields accessible by farmers, owning a backyard garden can have a supporting value for fulfilling the nutrient needs of families and minimize kitchen expenses. Since initiated at the end of 2009, Simbar Wareh currently has two hundred members and continues to grow as the network extends to Kayen and Tambakromo districts.

The activities held by JM-PPK and its member impacts various actions on the ground. One of the main events is to visit villages to convey information about the dangers of a cement plant mine. For this purpose, several people become speakers ready to attend various citizens' meetings. Before these visits, they prepare materials that will be to deliver to villagers such as information about the nature damage that will occur, the Environmental Analysis process, and others. Campaigning fairly complex material by using relaxed and communicative local languages has made far more women understand the issues they are facing. The result is that more and more farmers are interested in joining the movement. For example, Rasmi, an elderly woman who is always actively participating in the various activities of this Simbar Wareh, "I have to fight for my grandchildren," Rasmi said eagerly. The idea of progress has gradually shifted from economic welfares to generational prosperity among the small landholders in North Kendeng hills. They notice the development concept from another way than government bureaucracy (Yarrow and Venkatesan 2006).

## CONCLUSION

The concept of development planned by the local government does not get a response from the target community. The community offers an alternative idea of "progress" that is different from the idea of "progress" by the local government. This alternative concept gained a legitimate basis when it succeeded in laying a vision of development based on the knowledge generated through the understanding of the local needs.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Arribas Lozano, Alberto. "Knowledge Co-Production with Social Movement Networks. Redefining Grassroots Politics, Rethinking Research." *Social Movement Studies* 17, no. 4 (July 4, 2018): 451–63. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14742837.2018.1457521>.
- Alvarez, Sonia E. 1999. "Advocating Feminism." *International Feminist Journal of Politics* 1 (2): 181–209.
- Burdick, John. "Uniting Theory and Practice in the Ethnography of Social Movements: Notes toward a Hopeful Realism." *Dialectical Anthropology* 20, no. 3–4 (December 1995): 361–85. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01298535>.



- Casas-Cortez, Maribel. "Social Movements as Sites of Knowledge Production: Precarious Work, the Fate of Care and Activist Research in a Globalizing Spain." Dissertation, North Carolina at Chapel Hill, 2013.
- Chesters, Graeme, and Ian Welsh. *Complexity and Social Movements Multitude at the Edge of Chaos*. London: Routledge, 2006. <http://www.myilibrary.com?id=64829>.
- Escobar, Arturo. *Territories of Difference: Place, Movements, Life, Redes*. Durham; London: Duke University Press, 2008.
- McAdam, Doug, John D. McCarthy, and Mayer Zald, eds. *Comparative Perspectives on Social Movements: Political Opportunities, Mobilizing Structures, and Cultural Framings*. Cambridge Studies in Comparative Politics. Cambridge [England] ; New York: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- Osterweill, Michal. "In Search of Movement: Italy's 'Movimento Dei Movimenti,' Theoretical-Practice and Remaking the Political." Dissertation, North Carolina at Chapel Hill, 2010.
- Paripurno, E.T, P Wacana, D Mesah, A.B Rodialfallah, and R Raimon. "Kajian Potensi Kars Kawasan Sukolilo—Pati, Jawa Tengah. Artikel Ini Dimuat Di:" Official. *Kajian Potensi Kars Kawasan Sukolilo Pati Jawa Tengah* (blog), 2010. <http://psmbupn.org/article/kajian-potensi-kars-kawasan-sukolilo-pati-jawa-tengah.html>.
- Peluso, Nancy Lee, Surayya Afif, and Noer Fauzi Rachman. "Claiming the Grounds for Reform: Agrarian and Environmental Movements in Indonesia." *Blackwell Publishing, Journal of Agrarian Change*, 8, no. 2 & 3 (July 2008): 377–407.
- Venkatesan, Soumhya, and Thomas Yarrow, eds. *Differentiating Development: Beyond an Anthropology of Critique*. First paperback edition. New York: Berghahn Books, 2014.

INTO THE LAND: BAJO PEOPLE AT THE CULTURAL INTERSECTION

Muhammad Reza Hilmawan

Universitas Indonesia

Back in 2014 at Kendari, Southeastern Sulawesi, a day after the Indonesian Anthropology Kinship Network Congress, I took a vacation to Wakatobi with some of my friends from Padjadjaran University. When I was there, a local resident offering us to visit the Bajo village with his boat. My curiosity arises within my blood to see the Bajo people straight from their land, so I accepted the offer.

Once I arrived at the Bajo village, my imaginations about the Bajo fell off one by one. I was told that the Bajo people were a sea forager with their own unique traditional way of living. But, what I see there was very different. I saw a motorized engine ships owned and used by them, a cellular phone credit shop, mom and pop store with so many industrial and non-marine resources items, a public elementary school, a set of billiard table which played by the Bajo people, and also modern money used by the Bajo people. Although I was fascinated by Sampela village which located in the middle of the sea, those things make my curiosity bigger. How did they change?





How did they survive in the sea? Because as we all know, the sea is not an easy place to live for human.

In 2018, once again I confronted to the Bajo people by attending and watching a documentary film screening, a film called “Our Land is the Sea”, which took place in Universitas Indonesia. This film tells a story about the change and the recent condition Bajo people way of life in Wakatobi. A scholar named Dr. Kelly Swazey along with Matt Colaciello in conjunction with The Global Workshop collaborates in creating this 30 minutes’ movie inside the “Voicing Diversity Project”, a project which is a cooperation from The Centre of Religion and Cross Cultural Study of Universitas Gadjah Mada with The Centre of Southeast Asia Study of Hawai’i University.

This film shows us the recent conditions of the Bajo people and how they started to change, since they started to think that the sea is not really promising anymore to become the most reliable resource to provide their life. They think that the sea is not really accessible anymore as before the Republic of Indonesia established. Furthermore, they feel that scarcity of the marine resources happens along with its access. They see nowadays, there are too many people extracting the marine resources. There are also fishing activity that using explosives and pesticides which destroying the ecosystem, hence, creating scarcity. So, they prefer that their kids to attend the public schools and graduated, so they can get a job and work in the city. They see that the public school offers an alternative and access to jobs in the land, which is more promising for the future of their kids.

Based on this situation, I see that the Bajo which famously known by its way of life with the sea is facing a cultural intersection. Territorialization and access limitation were created, the sea and its resources scarcity haunting them, and promises for a better future from the land are whispering to them. As an anthropologist, I think this is a challenge in explaining why did this happened. What complex factors and relations herding them into this condition? As stated by them, I see that the modern state is important to become a starting point to explore the whole things. But how? Is it only just because of the modern state?

In doing so, this paper will try to explain how the Bajo people, which widely known as a sea foragers and also part of Austronesian speaking people, begin to leave their traditional way of life. In order to explain this transformation process, this paper will start with the history and the traditional way of living of the Bajo people compared to its present condition, specifically in the islands of Wakatobi, Southeast Sulawesi, Indonesia.

Furthermore, I will try to explore and analyze certain factors which conditioning the transformation, along with historical materialism approachment. This paper founds that there are certain factors that forcing the Bajo people to the land, which is: biological prerequisite of human adaptation, territorialization, inherent capital expansion, and a constructed alternative from the land.

*Keywords: Bajo, adaptation, territorialization, capital, alternatives*

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abrams, Philip. 1988. Notes on the Difficulty of Studying the State (1977), in *Journal of Historical Sociology*, 1: p. 58-89.

Acheson, James M. 1981. Anthropology of Fishing, in *Annual Review of Anthropology* (10), p. 276.



- Anderson, Benedict, C. 2006. *Imagined Communities*. Verso Publishers: London.
- Atmadja, Mochtar Kusuma. 1993. Rights over Natural Resources in Southeast Asia: Managing Fisheries in Indonesia, in Seda, Maria, eds.: *Environmental Management in ASEAN*. Institute of Southeast Asian Studies: Pasir Panjang, p. 63-65.
- Gupta, A. 1995. Blurred Boundaries: The Discourse of Corruption, the Culture of Politics, and the Imagined State, in *American Ethnologist* 22(2): p. 375-402.
- Harvey, P. 2005. The Materiality of State-Effects: An Ethnography of a Road in the Peruvian Andes, in Krohn-Hansen and Nustad, eds. *State Formation: Anthropological Perspectives*. p. 123–141.
- Helanda, Franciska von. Clifton, Julian. 2015. Whose Threat Counts? Conservation Narratives in the Wakatobi National Park, Indonesia, in *Conservation & Society*, Vol. 13, No. 2 (2015), p. 154-165
- Lowe, Celia. 2006. *Wild Profusion: Biodiversity Conservation in an Indonesian Archipelago*. Princeton University Press: New Jersey, p. 141-144.
- Marx, Karl. 1887. *Capital: Volume I*. Progress Publishers: Moscow, p. 118-120 & 128.
- Marx, Karl. 1972. *Pre-Capitalist Economic Formations*. International Publishers: New York
- Migdal, Joel S. 2004. *State in Society: Studying How States and Societies Transform and Constitute One Another*. Cambridge University Press: Cambridge
- Mulyanto, Dede. 2015. *Di Balik Marx: Sosok dan Pemikiran Friedrich Engels*. Marjin Kiri Tangerang Selatan
- Nuryadin Taufik, La Ode. 2010. *Kapital Sosial komunitas Suku Bajo: Studi Kasus Komunitas Suku Bajo Di Pulau Baliara Provinsi Sulawesi Tenggara*. Disertation. Universitas Indonesia: Jakarta, p. 48.
- Popkin, Barry M. D’Anci, Kristen E. Rosenberg, Irwin H. 2010. Water, Hydration, and Health, in *Nutrition Reviews*, Volume 68 (8), 1 Agustus 2010. International Life Sciences Institute, p. 439
- Read, R. 2014. Images of Care, Boundaries of the State: Volunteering and Civil Society in Czech Health Care, *Social Analysis*, 58(3): p. 90-106.
- Ricklefs, M. C. 1993. *A History of Modern Indonesia since C. 1300*. MacMillan Press: London: p. 284.
- Sather, C. A. 1997. *The Bajau Laut: Adaptation, History and Fate in a Maritime Fishing Society of South-Eastern Sabah*. Oxford University Press: New York, p. 17-18.
- Sather, C. A. 2006. Sea Nomads and Rainforest Hunter-Gatherers: Foraging Adaptations in the Indo-Malaysian Archipelago, in Bellwood, Peter. Fox, James J. Tryon, Darell, eds. *The Austronesians: Historical and Comparative Perspectives*. ANU Press: Canberra, p. 256-264.



- Scott, J. 1998. *Seeing like a State: How certain Schemes to Improve the Human Condition Have Failed*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Stacey, Natasha. 2007. *Boats to Burn: Bajo Fishing Activity in the Australian Fishing Zone*. ANU Press: Canberra, p. 10, 12-24, 85, 87, 106, 118, 124.
- Tahara, Tasrifin. 2013. *Kebangkitan Identitas Orang Bajo di Kepulauan Wakatobi*, in *Antropologi Indonesia: Indonesian Journal of Social and Cultural Anthropology*, 34 (1): p. 42
- Trouillot, Michel-Rolph. 2001. *The Anthropology of the State in the Age of Globalization (1999)*, in *Current Anthropology*, 1: p. 125-138.
- Utina, Ramli. 2012. *Kecerdasan Ekologis Dalam Kearifan Lokal Masyarakat Bajo Desa Torosiaje Provinsi Gorontalo*. Konferensi dan Seminar Nasional Pusat Studi Lingkungan Hidup Indonesia: Mataram, p. 14-20
- Vandergeest, Peter and Nancy Lee Peluso. 1995. *Territorialization and State Power in Thailand*. *Theory and Society* 24 (3): 385-426.

COFFEE AND IDENTITY: CONSUMING COFFEE, BUILDING IDENTITY, MAINTAINING VARIETY  
(CASE STUDY IN PALINTANG COMMUNITY, CIPANJALU VILLAGE, CILENGKRANG SUB-DISTRICT, BANDUNG  
DISTRICT, WEST JAVA)

*Rahman Latif Alfian*

*Freelance Researcher*

*Johan Iskandar*

*PSMIL & DIL Universitas Padjajaran*

*Budiawati Supangkat Iskandar*

*Anthropology, Universitas Padjajaran*

Arabica coffee was introduced and farmed in the *Perhutani* forest of Palintang hamlet, Cipanjalu village, Cilengkrang sub-district, Bandung district, West Java fifteen years ago. The local people of Palintang have been involved in the farming coffee of *Perhutani* forest to get better the household income of local people and to improve the local environment of the *Perhutani* forest. This article discusses the impact of the coffee crop farming in the *Perhutani* forest conducted by local people to various aspects of social, cultural and ecological aspects of Palintang area, Cipanjalu Village, Cilengkrang District, West Java. This study used an ethnographic approach that aims to reveal meaning from the standpoint of cultural stakeholders. Some techniques of collecting data, including observation, in-depth interviews, non-planned interviews, and casual interviews were applied. The results of the study showed that coffee cultivation in the forest of *Perhutani* conducted by Palintang community has been an important role not only in economic aspect but also influence on social and ecological aspects of the Palintang community. Initially, the main purpose of introduction and the farming of coffee crops in the *Perhutani* forest that involve in the participation of the local community was to increase the income of the Palintang community. Yet, the commodity of coffee farming has been popular and providing good economic value for local the community and has been an identity of Palintang community. Palintang locals have considered their coffee has very distinctive characters that are different from that other coffee produced in other areas. As a result, the coffee produced in the *Perhutani* forest has become an identity of the



Palintang. The Palintang coffee has been recognized as special distinctive coffee by other communities in West Java. Moreover, the distinctive coffee crop planted in the *Perhutani* forest has been an important role in enhancing the high diversity of coffee varieties (landraces) in West Java particularly, and Indonesian in general.

*Keywords: Construction of Identity, coffee diversity, local knowledge, Perhutani forest, Palintang community.*

## Beyond Disciplinary Diversity and Debates in Parallel Universes: Anthropology and Political Science in Conversation

Coordinator: Gde Dwitya Arief Metera (Northwestern University)  
& Iqra Anugrah (New Mandala)

An enduring critique of the phenomenon of disciplinary diversity, nay fragmentation, in social sciences and humanities is one regarding the lack of conversation across the boards. Disciplinary boundaries render disciplines at times impervious to interdisciplinary borrowings and innovations. This situation severely hampers accumulation of knowledge and often led scholars into “debates in parallel universes” (Robison 2016). Anthropology and Political Science are no exception: tension exists between these disciplines resulting in, for instances, marginalization of ethnographic method within political scientists’ methodological toolkit (Bayard de Volo & Schatz 2004, but see Laitin 1998) as well as uneasiness on the part of anthropologists regarding social science’s claim on causal inference and its generalizability. And yet there always seem to be leading maverick scholars in Anthropology and Political Science successfully breaking disciplinary straitjacket to produce exemplary works cherished in both disciplines. To mention a few, some leading anthropologists have interrogated the state (Gupta 2012), explored the practice of governmentality (Li 2007), traced democratic transition (Hefner 2000), or charted the topography of globalization (Appadurai 1996, Tsing 2005).

Similarly, there are also political scientists utilizing ethnographic method to study peasant resistance (Scott 1979, 1985, 1990), understand the poetics of power (Weeden 1999), or claim meaning embedded in commodities as a causal factor driving mobilization (Simmons 2016; Wood 2003), all the while generally claiming how meaning-making can be a powerful independent variable. In addition, a methodological literature on how to wed Anthropology and Political Science as disciplinary practices or how to craft causal inference using ethnography begin to emerge (Aronoff & Kubik 2013, Aronoff 2006, Katz 2001, 2002, Schatz 2009). Thus, this panel aims at starting a conversation between political scientists and anthropologists working on Indonesia taking stock of issues pertaining to possible interdisciplinary engagements. The set of questions to be explored includes but is not exclusively limited to the following: (i) What are the objections regarding disciplinary practices from both disciplines that could possibly hamper mutual interdisciplinary engagements? (ii) What are the most fruitful areas of conceptual, theoretical, and methodological intersections between the two disciplines that inform practitioners and benefit their research? (iii) Are there examples of current works from actual practitioners—political ethnographers or political scientists drawing from ethnographic methodological toolkit—conducting research from which we can draw lessons regarding challenges and possibilities?



Our panel invites papers that explore questions and concerns above. We also welcome papers presenting results of studies utilizing conceptual, theoretical, and/or methodological innovations borrowed from both Political Science and Anthropology.

#### PATRON-CLIENT RELATIONSHIP: BETWEEN ANTHROPOLOGY AND POLITICAL SCIENCE

*Heddy Shri Ahimsa-Putra*

*Department of Anthropology, Universitas Gadjah Mada*

Since the publication of Foster's ethnography on patron-client relationships among the Tzintzuntzan in Mexico (1963), many anthropologists had followed his step to study, describe and analyze patron-client relationships within the societies they studied. Various terms have been used for those relationships, such as: clientship, clientelism, clientage and patronage. Studies of this phenomenon flourished further as some political scientists used patron-client model to explain political dynamics in non-western countries, as they found that the model they have used in studying political phenomena in western countries could not cope with the socio-political realities and problems in many non-western settings (Scott, 1972).

Fourteen years after Foster's patronage ethnography, *Friends, Followers and Factions: A Reader in Political Clientelism* was published. A collection of articles on patron-client relationships in anthropology, sociology and political science -mostly from 1960-1970s-, the book is a landmark in patron-client studies. A lot has happened in patron-client studies since then, as anthropologists, sociologists and political scientists continue their research on that topic. The question then is: What perspectives (paradigms) have been used by social scientists in studying patron-client relationships? What kinds of insights have been gained? What kinds of problems have been solved? What kinds of theories have been produced?

In this paper the author attempts to answer those questions. The paper will elucidate further how ideas, views, theories on patron-client relations were developed further by anthropologists, sociologists and political scientists in their studies.

#### STRADDLING BETWEEN DIFFERENT WORLDS: NAVIGATING DIVERSE FIELDWORK MODES

*Iqra Anugrah*

*New Mandala*

Social science fieldwork is often seen as a challenging and often-misunderstood intellectual enterprise. Long seen as the domain of the few, fieldwork – more specifically, its major component, immersion – has made a comeback in social science despite the enduring drive toward quantification in the discipline (Morgenbesser and Weiss, 2018; Schatz, 2009). But misperceptions regarding fieldwork, such as its perceived machismo and inability to offer generalizations, still persist among social science researchers and readers while in reality fieldwork entails different types of work and modes of engagement with local interlocutors and social realities.

This paper therefore aims to debunk the myths surrounding fieldwork and contextualizes it. Focusing on my own fieldwork experience in Indonesia since 2015 as an early-career, anthropologically-inclined political scientist, I will discuss my experience conducting fieldwork for three different types of research: policy, dissertation, and advocacy research. In particular, I will



highlight the serendipities that I encountered on the field, the fieldwork logistics, and my experience in gathering data and dealing with various stakeholders and interlocutors. It is hoped that this self-reflexive narrative will shed some light on the relationship between researchers and their field sites, demystify fieldwork process, and better situate fieldwork within social science methodological arsenals.

A MULTISTAGE STRATEGY FOR THE INTEGRATION ETHNOGRAPHIC AND QUALITATIVE METHODS IN  
ANTHROPOLOGY AND POLITICAL SCIENCE

*Mark Woodward*

*Center for the Study of Religion and Conflict, Arizona State University*

Cultural Anthropology and Political Science typically employ different methods to address similar issues. It is difficult to imagine an article relying entirely on linear regressions appearing in the pages of the *American Ethnologist*. It is equally difficult to image an article describing political advertisements as discursive strategies for marginalizing subaltern subjectivities appearing in the pages of the *American Journal of Political Science*. Since the 1980s the gap between the two disciplines has widened as they moved in nearly opposite methodological and epistemological directions. Some anthropologists moved away from rigorous data collection and analysis and towards interpretive cultural analysis theoretically formulated by David Schneider and popularized by Clifford Geertz. Many are quite content to called unscientific. Political Science moved towards ever more complex statistical methods to demonstrate that it is “genuinely” scientific. At its worst, positivist Political Science confuses correlation with causality, dismisses qualitative data collection and analyses as inherently biased subjectivism and is obsessed with “sciencism” and statistical rigor. At its worst Interpretive Anthropology becomes “anti-sciencism” denying the possibility of explanation and defining the discipline as intersubjective reflection on shared otherness based on what Geertz termed “deep hanging out” research technologies. The result is that inter-disciplinary conversation, let alone collaborative research, has become increasingly difficult. Proponents of extreme position do not, and indeed cannot, talk to each other because the lack a common intellectual language. This has impoverished both disciplines.

There is, however a middle ground between these extremes that many scholars in both fields are comfortable with. This convergent intellectual space is defined by shared concerns with empirical generalization, theoretically driven explanation and recognition of the difference between scientific method and research technologies. Philosophy of science provides a common meta-language that makes collaborative research possible.

Philosophical Considerations: Theory, Method and Research Technologies

Empirical generalization, theory driven explanation and falsification are critical components of the scientific method. There is also a critical distinction between scientific method, which is generally applicable and research technologies that are problem and discipline specific. This distinction is particularly important in the case of generalization. There are cases in which scientific method can be applied to a single case or event others in which theoretical insight precedes empirical observation. Einstein’s contributions to physics and astronomy are clear examples. In the social sciences, there are multiple strategies for generalization. Statistical analysis of large data sets is one example. It is typical of Political Science research strategies. Another, more common in ethnographic research, is that when you ask the same question many times in multiple settings





and get the same response of set of responses – you can reasonably conclude that you have arrived at a level of generalization comparable with that attainable with statistical methods.

As Popper and others have shown, theories are explanatory devices that explain, but do not emerge directly from, empirical generalizations. There are no formal discovery procedures for theories. The classic, though probably mythic, example is Newton's apple that *inspired* the theory of gravity. It follows from this that theory and method are independent and that observation based on one set of research technologies and lead to theoretical insights that can only be tested by the application of others. This being the case, surveys and deep hanging out can be equally valuable social science research technologies. Finally, theories can be falsified by but not proven by empirical observation. In most cases, multidisciplinary falsification tests are appropriate. As Kuhn notes, scholars tend to cling to paradigms and theories for reasons that have little to do with intellectual concern. The same is true of the occupants of methodological silos. A commitment to interdisciplinary research requires us to abandon this intellectual arrogance.

To illustrate points of convergence, I rely on an interdisciplinary study of traditional and modern modes of political authority in the Javanese cities/kingdoms of Surakarta (Solo) and Yogyakarta (Yogya) that I conducted together with colleagues with disciplinary orientations in political science and social psychology. It combines methods including historical analysis, deep hanging out and surveys.

Yogya and Solo are adjacent principalities in south central Java. They share a common culture, and history. Their royal families are branches of the Mataram dynasty that diverged when the kingdom was divided between rival claimants to the throne in the mid-18<sup>th</sup> century. Since the Japanese conquest of the Netherlands Indies in 1942, they have followed divergent paths. Solo has consistently been on the wrong side of history welcoming first the Japanese invaders and in 1945 siding with the returning Dutch colonialists. Yogya resisted the Japanese and was the center of the Indonesian revolution. The result has been that Yogya remains a "kingdom within a republic" while in Solo, the dynasty is now a political anachronism.

Decades of deep hanging out, most of it in Yogya, led me to the hypothesis that political history might have led to divergent views of not only the dynasty but also on nationalism and national identity. Survey research conducted in 2013 provided statistical evidence supporting this position. It also indicated that regional identity is stronger in Yogya than in Solo.

The methodological point here is that multi-method research combining those typical in the two disciplines is not only possible, but that it can also lead to findings that would not be possible by either set of methods standing alone.

*Keywords: Philosophy of Science, Anthropology, Political Science, Indonesia*

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

Hakim, M., Liu, J., Isler, L. and Woodward, M. (2105) "Monarchism, National Identity and Social Representations of History in Indonesia: Intersections of the Local and National in Yogyakarta and Surakarta," *Asian Journal of Social Psychology*.

Chibnik, M. (1985) The Use of Statistics in Sociocultural Anthropology, *Annual Review of Anthropology*.



- Geertz, C. (1973) *The Interpretation of Culture*, Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Kuhn, T. (1962) *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Tarrow, S. (1995) Bridging the Quantitative-Qualitative Divide in Political Science, *American Political Science Review*.
- Popper, K. (1934/2002) *The Logic of Scientific Discovery*, London: Routledge Classics.
- Woodward, M. *Java, Indonesia and Islam* (2011) New York: Springer.

#### PERFORMATIVE ACTS IN INDONESIA'S ELECTORAL DEMOCRACY

Yoes C. Kenawas

Northwestern University

This paper addresses an empirical puzzle in Indonesia's democracy. On the one hand, the public have repeatedly shown that they have a low level of trust in key democratic institutions. On the other hand, Indonesian electorates have a high level of optimism in electoral democracy, and the turnout level in elections remains robust. How should we explain this paradox? This paper argues that the regular displays of democratic rituals help to shape the identity of Indonesian electorates as members of a democratic society. The repeated displays of democratic rituals maintain the electorates' excitement and belonging in Indonesia's electoral democracy. The paper uses ethnographic observation on the 2019 Indonesia presidential debate public screenings (*nonton bareng/nobar*) to understand the paradox in Indonesia's electoral democracy. The author finds that the ethnographic method can help political scientists to answer questions that are difficult to answer when one relies only on traditional political science's quantitative and qualitative methods. Based on the findings from ethnographic observations, one can formulate more sensitive questions that can be further interrogated through both qualitative and quantitative methods that are familiar to political scientist. In doing so, this paper contributes to the development of the interdisciplinary approach in understanding political phenomena that are difficult to answer by using traditional approaches in political science.

*Keywords: elections, democracy, performativity, ethnography*

### Governmental Practices in Indonesia: Non-Calculative Modality, State Power, and the (Im)Possibility of Politics

Coordinator: Hestu Prahara (University of Auckland),

Sari Ratri & Sindhunata Hargyono (Northwestern University)

Discussant: Jesse H. Grayman (University of Auckland)

Political anthropologists' attention to the state has been informed by the ideas that impersonal, calculative, and rational techniques are the primary way for the state in ruling its subjects (Foucault 2004, Scott 1998). Recent literatures on the state's technologies of rule, however, have disrupted this understanding by decentering calculative practices (i.e., surveillance and statistics) in their ethnographic investigations to the state's ruling practices. This disruption takes form in



various analytical vocabularies--among others are morality (Fassin 2015), aesthetics (Ghertner 2015), affect (Jakimow 2018, Shoshan 2016, Masco 2014), and materiality (Fehérváry 2013, Hull 2012). Nevertheless, little of these contributions have been borne out of Indonesian-based ethnographic works. This panel is an attempt to use contemporary theoretical development on variations of ruling techniques to comprehend governmental practices in Indonesia. Thus, our first question is, how does the Indonesian government(s) rule? What are the spectrums of governmental practices that we can unearth from ethnographic cases in Indonesia? The answers to this question shall not be unitary as we define the state as a multi-spatial, multi-scalar, and disaggregated entity (Gupta 2012, Ferguson & Gupta 2002).

Furthermore, over the last decade, the question of (im)possibility of politics (e.g. practices that challenge or furthering state power) has always been a specter for scholars dealing with the modalities of rule. This specter has been addressed in two ways. First, deriving from Foucauldian conception of power, the state appears as a ubiquitous entity leaving no room for individuals to exercise their politics (i.e., governmentality; see Rose 2006; Foucault 2004). Second, deriving from a less invasive conceptualization of power, the possibility of subversive politics can be found in diminutive practices that challenge the state power (Scott 2009, Li 2007, Scott 1987). While both frameworks are fruitful in thinking about the implication of state power to the practice of politics, we wish to transcend this binary of domination and resistance. Given the dearth of sustained conversation of the implication of introducing new analytical vocabularies to the question of the modality of rules to the practice of politics, we arrive at our second question: how can investigating non-calculative modality of rule contributes to our anthropological understanding of the (im)possibility of politics? Can we possibly transcend the binary?

Our panel invites papers that concern non-calculative modality of rule (i.e., forms of governing technique not anchored in scientific, mechanical, and rational practices), politics beyond domination/resistance, or both. We welcome papers from various topics of ethnographic research including health, politics, economy, education, infrastructure, development, non-governmental organizations, and gender and sexuality across times.

CORPORATE GOVERNMENTALITY AND THE WILL TO ACCUMULATE:  
ANTHROPOLOGY OF CORPORATION IN THE LAPINDO MUDFLOW DISASTER

*Fathun Karib*

*Department of Sociology, Binghamton University*

*Department of Sociology, Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta*

*This paper proposes the concept of corporate governmentality as a possibility to rethink forms of governance other than the state. Reformulating La Perriere (Foucault 2007, 96), corporate governmentality refers to a set of groups, collectives or institutions that we called the corporations and how these corporations conduct power and using methods with its specific relations to men, material things and events. In recent years, anthropologists shifted their interest on power from focusing on state actors to corporate actors and forms of power practices shaping societies and engages in people's daily life (Benson & Kirsch 2010a; Partridge et al.2011; Rajak et al.2011; Welker et al.2011). Anthropologists observe the disastrous impact of corporate operations toward the environment (Kirsch 2014; Welker et al. 2011, Benson & Kirsch 2010b), while in the field of disaster studies, scientists from various disciplines also examine the role of corporations in industrial and technological disasters (Gephart 1993, Rajan, 1999 & 2002, Dyer 2002, Button*



2010). The paper, combining the anthropology of corporation and disaster studies, will examine corporate power, through corporate governmentality, deal with disastrous mudflow and managing affected Sidoarjo population in East Java. I want to propose the Lapindo mudflow disaster as an object of governmentality conducted by the Corporation. While the State has the reason to exist (*raison d'Etat*), which is called the governmental reason "to improve the condition of the population, to increase its wealth, its longevity and its health" (Foucault 2007), the case study offers that corporation also has the reason to exist. Its reason and main objectives are to improve its internal members by gaining maximum profit, provide wealth to its shareholders and owners of the mode of production, and to secure the continuation of capital accumulation. This is the nature of corporations and their tendency to do everything to secure the continuation of profit and accumulation. This is not the will to improve (Li 2007) but to accumulate...corporate governmentality and the will to accumulate!

*Keywords: anthropology of corporation, disaster studies, corporate governmentality, mudflow disaster, and accumulation.*

## BACKGROUND

Corporate activities in natural resource extraction are potentially destructive to human and its surrounding environment. The case of Lapindo Mudflow disaster demonstrates that corporations are facing the risk to become destructive in their daily extractive operations. Lapindo Brantas Inc., one of the subsidiary company of Energy Mega Persada (EMP) Corporation, owned by Bakrie family, hold the Brantas Block concession since the 1990s. After ten years conducting a successful operation in Wunut village, Porong, Lapindo Inc in 2006 expands their natural wells drilling operation in the village of Renokenongo, Porong, East Java. The drilling well operations in Banjar Panji 1 (BJP-1), Renokenongo turn into a disaster. The mud from the drilling well spread fast and became a tragedy for villagers living around the drilling area. The earth continues to produce the mudflow, and geological scientists predict that it will last for two decades (Davies et al.2011, 523).

## OBJECTIVE

The case of Lapindo Mudflow disaster is an example of corporations as powerful actors in the contemporary capitalist society. This paper will focus on corporate power in deploying tactics and strategies in the post-disaster situation to avoid responsibilities and further damages to their corporate existence. Corporate ability to deploy tactics and strategies by calculated means, programs, and technology of power is a form of power that I identify as *corporate governmentality*. Reformulating La Perriere (Foucault 2007, 96), *corporate governmentality* refers to a set of groups, collectives or institutions that we called the corporations and how these corporations conduct power and using methods with its specific relations to men, material things and events. The qualitative data gathered from fieldwork visit in Porong for two months in 2011-2012 and eight months in 2018-2019. The research also uses primary and secondary documents from the media, government institutions, and corporate reports to observe government and corporate behaviors and policy.

## DESCRIPTION

If we follow Foucault the object of state's governmentality is the population. Population as an abstraction or conceptual category is central for social scientists since Malthus and followed by Marx in his critique of political economy (Foucault 2007, 77). I would argue that in Marxian



sensibility, the object of capital, i.e., capitalist enterprise, i.e., corporation, is also the population. The next logical question is that what is the difference between the standpoint of the state and capitalist corporation toward population? The state as Foucault and his followers (Scott 1998, Tania Li 2007), assume population as an object of improvement where the state rationality is to generate prosperity and wealth for its entire population. While from the standpoint of capital, the population is the source of value creation, and its surplus population becomes an endless source of storage for labor power (Marx 1990, 796). Thus, for capitalist enterprises, their rationality toward population is to ensure the accumulation of capital.

Both state and capitalist enterprises have a similar interest in the population but have different rationality and objective. Our attention should re-orient toward the relation of power between state, capitalist enterprises, and population. The Lapindo Mudflow case study will illustrate how state and capitalist enterprises hand in hand cooperating to resolve the crisis and managing affected population. Michel Foucault described a *program* as a “set of calculated, reasoned prescriptions in terms of which institutions are meant to be recognized, space arranged and behavior regulated” (2000b, 231 see Li 2007, 2, 6, 270-281). In the case of Lapindo Mudflow, I define *programming disaster* as the power making in the network between state-corporation-population relations by producing calculated plans and operating mechanisms to achieve specific aims and rationality in normalizing disaster.

## FINDINGS

Program or calculation plans are not working automatically. There are actors involved through various programming phase in designing, implementing, and operating corporate objective in managing the disastrous event and affected population. One anonymous financial security institution published a research document and clearly outlined several possible scenarios for the Corporation in managing the post-disaster event (Anonymous 2006, 31, 37). *First*, the mudflow needs to be known as a natural disaster. *Second*, an independent party declares natural disaster status. *Third*, state funds can be used to tackle the cost of the disaster. These three solutions are the perfect calculability for the Corporation in handling the disaster. There are three features of corporate power in achieving its primary objective preventing further losses in terms of financial and business operations. The three features are 1) the ability to influence the political decision through the political network, 2) reducing business risk with strategy, and 3) deploying the technology of power toward the affected population.

1. The ability to influence political decisions in political networks is one of the primary keys of corporate strategies in implementing the program objective. One of the mechanisms in influencing the political decision is through *political barter* exchanging interests and needs in the political marketplace. The main objective of this political barter is to gain disaster status as natural. In 2008, the Legislative Monitoring Team for the Mudflow affair concluded the disaster was a natural phenomenon (Tempo 2008, 23). One of the legislators and politician from one of the political parties in the Parliament admitted that there was some compromise in conclusion outlined by the Monitoring Team (Setyarso 2008, 28).
2. The Corporate objective in the business network was to minimize the impact of Lapindo Mudflow on the entire corporate structure and business network. The strategic action is to cut “the infected” network from the main corporate business network. EMP Corporation, as the mother corporation made a spin-off (separation) by selling the share ownership of Lapindo to another corporation or investment group. The spin-off attempt finally happened in July



2007 when EMP was no longer financially consolidating Lapindo (ENRG, 2007). EMP Corporation press release on 14 November 2006 appointed MLC (Minarak Labuan Co. Ltd) to undertake Lapindo's responsibility toward the affected villagers and the mudflow affairs (ENRG 2006b). MLC's responsibility in the agreement also covered all the operational costs of Lapindo in Brantas PSC and Lapindo's financial requirements relating to Sidoarjo mudflow mitigation effort (ENRG, 2007).

3. Although the Corporation can consolidate its power in the political and business network to secure cooperation in the national level, the Government cannot make regulations if affected villagers do not accept and recognize government solutions to the problems. The Government needs consent from the population of the affected villagers since it is related to the government's credibility, position, and image as a political authority. The Corporation deploys two forms of technology of power to execute the program at the local level. In dealing with village politics, the first strategy is to borrow the state's political technology by using the village as the technology of power.

The village as a technology of power has a similar administrative function to the "police" and the same objective in controlling population (Breman 1980, 10; Foucault 200d, 412- 14, 415-16). The village as a political and administrative unit and its actors from village leaders to local brokers or intermediaries play important roles as the local operators. They are effective devices to control and conduct the affected villagers to follow the scenarios based on the corporate land deals program.

The Corporation installs Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) as the instrument of submission toward the affected population. Marina A. Welker (2009) revealed the importance of Corporate CSR in managing the security of the local population around Newmont's copper and gold mine in West Nusa Tenggara. She identifies "the CSR industry implicitly endorses drawing civilians into the sphere of corporate security through community development" (2009, 147). From the corporate security manager, Welker finds out that "Corporate security begins in the community" (2009, 147). The Corporation is conducting CSR as the second technology of power in making submissive affected 3 villagers. One of the village leaders from affected villages cooperating with the MLC Company created a community development program by establishing a CSR center.<sup>34</sup> The village leader said that during 2009 both affected villagers and the Corporation were mediated in a meeting. The meeting resolves that both the Corporation and affected villagers became brothers, and the creation of community development facilitates this brotherhood. The Javanese values of cooperation and mediation through the community forum between the Corporation and affected villagers should be work as a mechanism in resolving disputes. The discourse of cooperation and brotherhood between corporations and affected villagers through the medium of community development are effective to make the affected villagers submissive. In the case of Lapindo mudflow, both village and CSR as technologies of power deploy as part of corporate governmentality instruments to arrange the relationship between the Corporations and affected villagers.

---

<sup>34</sup> In-Depth interview, 2 February 2012





## CONCLUSION

Power relations in the contemporary capitalist society are complex. Instead of thinking the State as the only powerful actor in managing the population, we should also consider corporations as one of the non-state actors capable of controlling the population. We might call this power *corporate governmentality* or put another name *corporationality (corporate – rationality)*, *corporate mentality (corporate mentality to borrow govern – mentality)*. Perhaps the word “Corporation” itself is sufficient and adequate to represent power embodied inside this institution, but the aim is to illustrate that “govern,” the art in governing or “conduct of conduct” does not exclusively belong to the state. The Lapindo Mudflow case study offers to re-orient our view that Corporations also has the, ability, intelligibility and capacity to deploy some technology of power in the relations with the state and population.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

Antlov, Hans. 1995. *Exemplary Centre, Administrative Periphery; Rural Leadership and the New Order in Java*. Richmond, Surrey: Curzon Press.

Anonymous Source. 2006. *Bakrie Group: Riches to Rags to Riches to...*

Badan Pengawas Pasar Modal dan Lembaga Keuangan (BAPEPAM-LK). 2007. *Penjelasan BAPEPAM-LK Tentang Hasil Penelahaan Transaksi Divestasi PT MEDCO E&P Brantas oleh PT MEDCO International TBK*. [press release], 10 May 2007. Available at <[http://www.baepam.go.id/pasar\\_modal/publikasi\\_pm/siaran\\_pers\\_pm/2007/pdf/PR\\_Medco.pdf](http://www.baepam.go.id/pasar_modal/publikasi_pm/siaran_pers_pm/2007/pdf/PR_Medco.pdf)>[Access ed 26 September 2012].

Badan Pemeriksa Keuangan (BPK). 2007. *Laporan Pemeriksaan Penanganan Semburan Lumpur Panas*

*Sidoarjo*. [press release], 29 May 2007. Available at <[http://www.bpk.go.id/web/?page\\_id=1285](http://www.bpk.go.id/web/?page_id=1285)> [Accessed 3 August 2012].

Benson, Peter, and Stuart Kirsch. eds. 2010.a Corporate Oxymorons: Entry points into the ethnography of capitalism. *Dialectical Anthropology*,34(1).

------. 2010b. Capitalism and the Politics of Resignation, *Current Anthropology*, 51(4), pp.459-486.

Breman, Jan. 1980. *The Village on Java and The Early -Colonial State*. Rotterdam: The Comparative Asian Studies Programme (CASP) at Erasmus University Rotterdam.

Button, Gregory V. 1999. “The Negation of Disaster: The Media Response to Oil Spills in GreatBritain”. In: Anthony-Oliver Smith and Susanna Hoffman, eds. 1999. *The Angry Earth; Disaster in Anthropological Perspective*. New York and London: Routledge. Ch.6.

------. 2002. “Popular Media Reframing of Man-Made Disasters: A Cautionary Tale”. In: Anthony-Oliver Smith and Susanna Hoffman, eds. 2002. *Catastrophe & Culture: The Anthropology of Disaster*. Santa Fe and Oxford: School of American Research Press and James Currey Ltd. Ch.7.



- . 2010. *Disaster Culture: Knowledge and Uncertainty in the Wake of Human and Environmental Catastrophe*. Walnut Creek, CA: Left Coast Press Inc.
- Coronil, Fernando. 2001. "Smelling Like a Market," *The American Historical Review*, Vol. 106. No.1(Feb. 2001), pp. 119–129.
- Davies, Richard J. Simon A. Mathias, Richard E. Swarbrick & Mark J. Tingay. 2011. Probabilistic longevity estimate for the LUSI mud volcano, East Java. *Journal of the Geological Society*, London, Vol.168 2011, pp. 517–523.
- Dick, Howard and Jeremy Mulholland. 2011. "The state as marketplace; Slush funds and intralite rivalry". In: Edward Aspinall and Gerry van Klinken, eds. 2011. *State and Illegality in Indonesia*. Leiden: KITLV Press. pp.65 - 85.
- Dyer, Christopher L. 2002. "Punctuated Entrophy as Culture-Induced Change: The Case of the Exxon ValdezOil Spill". In: Anthony-Oliver Smith and Susanna Hoffman, eds. 2002. *Catastrophe & Culture: The Anthropology of Disaster*. Santa Fe and Oxford: School of American Research Press and James Currey Ltd. Ch.8.
- Energi Mega Persada (ENRG). 2006a. *ENRG Reports Well Control Issues at Banjarpanji-1 Stabilizing, Losses Minimized* [press release], 30 May 2006. Available at [http://www.energimp.com/press\\_releases\\_files/Press%20Release%20Lapindo%20well%20eaks%2030%20May%2006.pdf](http://www.energimp.com/press_releases_files/Press%20Release%20Lapindo%20well%20eaks%2030%20May%2006.pdf) [Accessed 20 July 2012].
- . 2006b. *ENRG Signs and Agreement to Sell Lapindo to Freehold*. [press release], 14 November 2006. Available at [http://www.energimp.com/press\\_releases\\_files/ENRG%20Press%20Release%20Lapindo%20Divestment%20\(ENG\).pdf](http://www.energimp.com/press_releases_files/ENRG%20Press%20Release%20Lapindo%20Divestment%20(ENG).pdf) [Accessed 20 July 2012].
- . 2006c. *Arbitration Proceeding*. [press release], 17 November 2006. Available at [http://www.energimp.com/press\\_releases\\_files/Press%20Release%20%20%20Arbitration%20Proceeding.pdf](http://www.energimp.com/press_releases_files/Press%20Release%20%20%20Arbitration%20Proceeding.pdf) [Accessed 20 July 2012].
- . 2006d. *Surat Lapindo ke Tim Nasional Penanggulangan Semburan Lumpur Sidoarjo*. s.n.
- . 2006e. *ASPERMIGAS Facsimilie to Financial Times*. [press release], 14 Desember 2006. Available at [http://www.energimp.com/press\\_releases\\_files/CovLetMedrelDec1406.pdf](http://www.energimp.com/press_releases_files/CovLetMedrelDec1406.pdf) [Accessed 25 July 2012].
- . 2007. *Lapindo Brantas is No Longer Consolidate in ENRG's Book*. [press release], 12 September 2007. Available at [http://www.energimp.com/press\\_releases\\_files/2007\\_09\\_12%20@%20Lapindo%20No%20Longer%20Consolidated%20in%20ENRG.pdf](http://www.energimp.com/press_releases_files/2007_09_12%20@%20Lapindo%20No%20Longer%20Consolidated%20in%20ENRG.pdf) [Accessed 20 July 2012].
- . 2008. *Minarak's Debt to Equity Swap Circular*. [report/circular], February 2008. Available at [http://www.energi-mp.com/reports\\_files/EMP%20Tbk%20-%20Abridged%20Circular%20Letter%20-%202015%20Feb%202008.pdf](http://www.energi-mp.com/reports_files/EMP%20Tbk%20-%20Abridged%20Circular%20Letter%20-%202015%20Feb%202008.pdf) [Accessed 29 April 2012].



- Federici, Silvia. 2014. *Caliban and the Witch; Women, the Body, and Primitive Accumulation*. Brooklyn: Autonomedia.
- Foucault, Michael. 1997. "Technologies of the Self." In: Paul Rabinow, ed. *Ethics; Subjectivity and Truth: Essential Works of Foucault Vol. I (1954 – 1984)*. New York: The New Press. pp.223-251.
- . 1980. "Power and Strategies." In: Collin Gordon, ed. *Power/ Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings (1972 – 1977)*. New York: Pantheon Books, pp. 134–145.
- . 2000a. "Governmentality." In: James D. Faubion, eds, *Power: Essential Works of Foucault Vol. III (1954 – 1984)*. New York: The New Press. pp. 202 – 222.
- . 2000b. "Question of Method." In: James D. Faubion, eds, *Power: Essential Works of Foucault Vol. III (1954 – 1984)*. New York: The New Press. pp. 223 – 238.
- . 2000c. "The Subject and Power." In: James D. Faubion, eds. *Power: Essential Works of Foucault Vol. III (1954 – 1984)*. New York: The New Press. pp. 326 – 348.
- . 2000d. "The Political Technology of Individuals." In: James D. Faubion, eds. *Power: Essential Works of Foucault Vol. III (1954 – 1984)*. New York: The New Press. pp.403- 417
- . 2007 *Security, Territory, Population; Lectures at the College de France 1977 – 1978*. New York: Picador and Palgrave Macmillan.
- Gephart, Jr. Robert P. 1993. "The Textual Approach: Risk and Blame in Disaster Sensemaking" *The Academy of Management Journal*, 36(6), pp. 1465-1514.
- Kirsch, Stuart. 2014. *Mining Capitalism; The Relationship Between Corporations and Their Critics*. Oakland, California: University of California Press.
- Kompas.2006a. Freehold Batal Beli Lapindo, Rapat Komisi VII DPR Panas. *Kompas newspaper*. 29 November. p.1.
- .2006b. Lapindo Penuhi Tuntutan. Pertanggungjawaban Lapindo Normatif. *Kompas Newspapers*. 05 December.p.1.
- Li, Tania. 2007. *The Will to Improve Governmentality, Development, and the Practice of Politics*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Marx, K. 1990. *Capital, vol 1*. New York: Penguin Books
- Marx, Karl. 1993. *Grundrisse; Foundations of the Critique of Political Economy*. New York: Penguin Books
- Medco Energi. 2006. Letter to Lapindo BrantasInc.; Banjarpanji 1 well drilling incident. 5 June 2006. s.n. s.l.
- Partridge, Damani J., Marina Welker, and Rebecca Hardin. Eds. 2011. *Corporate Lives: New Perspectives on the Social Life of the Corporate, Current Anthropology*,52(S3).



- Prasetyo, Anom B. 2012. Politik Barter Lapindo. *Prioritas News*. [online] Available at <<http://www.prioritasnews.com/2012/04/10/politik-barter-lumpur-lapindo/>> [Accessed in 20 October 2012].
- Rajak, Dinah, Catherine Dolan, and Christina Garsten. eds. 2011. Special Issues: Ethnographies of Corporate Ethicizing, *Focaal Journal of Global and Historical Anthropology*, Vol. 60.
- Rajan, S. Ravi. 1999. "Bhopal: Vulnerability, Routinization, and the Chronic Disasters" In: Anthony-Oliver Smith and Susanna Hoffman, eds. 1999. *The Angry Earth; Disaster in Anthropological Perspective*. New York and London: Routledge. Ch.13.
- , 2002. "Missing Expertise, Categorical Politics and Chronic Disasters: The case of Bhopal" In: Anthony-Oliver Smith and Susanna Hoffman, eds. 2002. *Catastrophe & Culture: The Anthropology of Disaster*. Santa Fe and Oxford: School of American Research Press and James Currey Ltd. Ch.11.
- Rifai, Bahtiar, Isfari Hikmat, Rizal Maslan, Monique Shintami, Evi Tresnawati. 2012. Komando Balik Arah Dari Cikasungka. *Detik Magazine*. 2-8 April. [online] Available at [http://majalah.detik.com/cb/26cf16e7e2116e392d232e0b9f9e4026/2012/20120402\\_MajalahDetik\\_18.pdf](http://majalah.detik.com/cb/26cf16e7e2116e392d232e0b9f9e4026/2012/20120402_MajalahDetik_18.pdf) [Accessed in 18 October 2012].
- Schiller, Jim, Lucas, Anton and Sulistiyanto, Priyambudi. 2008. Learning from the East Java Mudflow: Disaster Politics in Indonesia. *Indonesia*, 85(April 2008), pp.51-77.
- Scott, James C. 1998. *Seeing Like State: How Certain Schemes to Improve the Human Condition Have Failed*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press.
- Setyarso, Budi, Gunarto ES and Muh Syaifullah. 2008. Lapindo Lumpur Meluap, Fulus Mengucur. *Tempo magazine*. 3 March.
- Tempo. 2008. Bermain Lumpur Lapindo, *Tempo magazine*, 2 March 2008, p.23.
- The Australia Exchange (ASX). 2008. *Santos Brantas to transfer interest in Brantas PSC*. [press release], 11 December 2008. Available at <http://www.asx.com.au/asxpdf/20081211/pdf/31f4nzb5n2ql90.pdf> [Accessed 21 October 2012].
- Welker, Marina, Damani J. Partridge, and Rebecca Hardin. 2011. Introduction to Supplement 3: Corporate Lives: New Perspectives on the Social Life of the Corporate, *Current Anthropology*, 52(S3), pp.S3-S16.
- Welker, Marina. 2009. Corporate Security Begins in the Community: Mining, the Corporate Social Responsibility Industry, and Environmental Advocacy in Indonesia. *Cultural Anthropology*, 24(1), pp.142-179.
- Wibisono, Ardian. 2007. Lapindo Brantas Lepas Dari Tuntutan Arbitrase. *Detik Finance*. [online] Available at <<http://finance.detik.com/read/2007/06/15/145349/794224/6/lapindo-brantasbebas-dari-tuntutanarbitrase>> [accessed in 14 October 2012].
- Setyarso, Budi. 2008. Berseluncur Diatas Lumpur Lapindo. *Tempo magazine*, 2 March. p.28.



THE CONSPICUOUS FACE OF PUNISHMENT: SPECTATORSHIP AS A MODE OF GOVERNANCE IN PUBLIC CANING  
IN ACEH, INDONESIA

*Febi Rizki Ramadhan*

*Department of Anthropology Northwestern University*

*This paper investigates the role of the spectators of public caning in Aceh in regard to the practice of punishment and governance. As the only province that formally implements Islamic law in Indonesia, Aceh prescribes public caning as a form of punishment toward individuals who violate Qanun Jinayat No. 6/2014, a local regulation that legislates Islamic Criminal Jurisprudence. The central argument of this paper concern the role of the spectators, as part of a particular public, in punishing the violator of Qanun Jinayat by attending to their caning and surveilling them. This paper demonstrates that the practice of punishment and surveillance is not merely conducted by the state as the sole, unitary actor. Rather, the spectators also take part in the punitive and surveillance practice in the context of public caning in Aceh. Furthermore, this paper situates the spectators as deliberate moral subjects who further state's mode of punishment and governance toward the violators of Qanun Jinayat and challenges the prior literatures' assumption that the state is the only actor in the punitive practices.*

*Keywords: punishment, spectatorship, public caning, Islamic law, morality*

## INTRODUCTION

As a province with Special Autonomy in Indonesia, Aceh has been granted the authority to implement Shari'a law. At the local level, the regional regulation that legislates Islamic law is referred to as *qanun*. One *qanun* that particularly influences social and cultural system in Aceh, especially to the local punitive practices, is Qanun Jinayat No. 6/2014 on Criminal Law. Qanun Jinayat codifies ten categories of *jarimah* or violation and prescribes three types of *'uqubat* or punishment toward the violators. The punishment comprises of fine, imprisonment, and public caning. This research focuses on the practice of public caning because of its conspicuous and explicit manifestation of the role of the public in punitive practices. While Qanun Aceh No. 7/2013 on Jinayat Procedural Law instructs that the caning must be held in a public place, the government of Aceh does not mandate the spectators to come. The spectators, therefore, attend the performance of public caning without any formal obligation by the government.

The role of the spectators in the punitive practice is the one that foreshadow my discussion in this research. Earlier academic literatures have sought to define what punishment is. Among other literatures, there are three authors whom arguments' I incorporate in this study to exemplify the recent assumption of punishment, which consist of: (1) H. L. A. Hart; (2) Michel Foucault; and (3) Didier Fassin. First, according to Hart's (1959) standard, five elements are necessary to characterize punishment in criminal matters. His last element is "punishment must ... be imposed and administered by an authority constituted by a legal system against which the offense is committed" (Hart, 1959). In his argument, the authority stipulated by a legal system plays a role as the actor that legally-able to impose and administer punishment. The case of spectatorship in Aceh, however, demonstrates that the spectators also take part in the act of punishing, albeit using a different mechanism. Second, in Foucault's analysis regarding 18th century French ceremonies of execution, he argues that "the main character was the people, whose real and immediate presence was required for the performance" (Foucault, 1995: 57). However, the case of Aceh and the 18th century French is clearly different. Whereas the spectators in Foucault's



analysis were summoned by the state, the spectators of public caning in Aceh attend the performance of public caning without the government of Aceh mandated them to come and witness others' infliction of pain. Third, following Hart's argument on the actor of punishment, Fassin (2018) argues that punitive practices are not always performed by the state. Rather, vigilant individuals can also participate in certain punitive practices. However, in his discussion on this matter, the vigilant act derives from the actors' dissatisfaction with the state's mode of justice. Therefore, they put the law into their own hands. In the case of Aceh, the spectators further the state's vision of punishment. The intended objective of this research is to fill the gaps of these three studies, particularly regarding the role of the spectators in punitive practices in the context of public caning in Aceh.

## RESEARCH FINDINGS

### *Codification of Moral Misconducts*

As the Government of Aceh describes in the Explanation of Qanun Jinayat No. 6/2014, one of the reasons of the codification of this *qanun* was that the Government of Aceh's response to the pervasive acts of frontier justice toward several acts that deemed immoral by the people from September – December 1999, which include the activities of *khamr* (alcohol production, distribution, and/or consumption), *maisir* (gambling activity), and *khalwat* (illicit intimate activity between premarital couples). This correspondence that was conducted by the Government of Aceh demonstrates that the issue of morality, as well as decency as self-honor, plays a pivotal role in the codification of Qanun Jinayat No. 6/2014. In the conceptual context, I refer to this phenomenon by using Fassin's (2015) analysis regarding the state often incorporates moral framework in regard to its administrative works.

It should be noted, however, that within anthropological discussion, morality is not a theoretically homogeneous realm (Fassin, 2012:7). In my research, I am particularly influenced by the Foucauldian approach (Foucault, 1990), partly because I found that morality binds its subject not just by its authoritative nature, but rather both morality and its moral subjects have a co-constitutive relationship that define each other. In the context of the codification of moral misconducts in Aceh's Islamic law, the government of Aceh utilizes the narrative of "frontier justice" by the "people" to epitomize the importance of Qanun Jinayat; situating the *qanun* as an end to fulfill the people's demand, which in turn led to the punitive practices that include public caning.

### *Expressed Excitement of the Spectators*

Throughout the process of the caning, the spectators often excitedly jeer and taunt, as well as make derogatory remarks. Such repertoires can be found in the caning toward two men who engaged in *liwath* or the sexual activity between two consenting men that occurred on May 23, 2017. During the process of the caning, the spectators often shouted "homo!" in its most derogatorily way. Drawing on the expressed excitement by the spectators, I argue that the spectators actively demonstrating their moral stance by producing shame and embarrassment toward the violator of Qanun Jinayat. I situate the production of shame, in this context, as a form of affective governance that is conducted by the spectators. Affective governance itself refers to the ways in which the state agencies, civil servants, and public services uses emotional negation, excess, dilemma, rhetorical fantasy, as well as emotional celebration and commitment (Jupp, Pykett, and Smith, 2014). However, instead of situating the state agencies or the civil servants as





the main actors behind the affective governance process, I argue that the spectators play a role in affectively governing the violator of Qanun Jinayat by producing shame and embarrassment in them and producing the notion of deterrence.

### *Pervasive Surveillance Practices*

During the process of the caning, the spectators often recorded the process of the caning, which later followed by the dissemination of the video footage. This pervasive act of recording and disseminating the video footage demonstrate that the spectators engage in a surveillance practice, in which I refer as the gathering of information of subject populations in organizations (Dandeker, 1990). The information of subject populations, in this context, refers to the personal information of the violator being caned that often announced by the government official, which include their names, addresses, parents' names, religions, jobs, educational background, as well as their violations and the number of strokes for them. These are information that announced by the government of Aceh and later being made public by the individuals who spectate and surveil the process of the caning. Align with the previous studies on surveillance, I argue that surveillance practices are strongly related to governance and/or discipline (Monahan, 2010). Monahan (2010:97) argues for two types of surveillance that directly challenge ideals of democratic governance, which consist of differential control and automated control. The differential control can be understood with the social sorting functions of the surveillance system as it explained by David Lyon (2003, 2007). In this regard, surveillance operates as a mechanism for differentiating society by discerning or actively constructing differences among the populations and regulating the populations in accordance to their assigned status (Gandy, 2006; Haggerty and Ericson, 2006). However, the discussion of surveillance as governance tends to focus on the surveillance practice by governments or private corporates, whereas the case is different from that of the spectators in Aceh. Nevertheless, despite the differential locus between these cases and the case of Aceh, I find the analytical framework useful to explain the function of surveillance toward homosexuality by the spectators in Aceh.

Both punishment and surveillance, then, fall under the same categorical umbrella that Foucault (1995) discusses: discipline. He argues that discipline is a technique of control that connected to the logic of maintaining power relation (Foucault, 1995:23). However, as Foucault (1995:215-216) argues, discipline is not confined to institutional body per se, but rather a type of power that comprises of a whole set of instruments, procedures, and levels of application.

### CONCLUSION

The involvement of spectators in the governance practices toward the violators in the context of public caning in Aceh shows that the act of punishing crime is not only conducted by the state. This argument is beneficial to challenge the underlying assumption on crime and punishment. Hart's (1959) classification shows that the state lies at the heart of the punitive system, yet as Fassin (2018:43-44) argues, whereas the state typically exercises the monopoly of the use of legitimate violence, it actually faces the presence of other actors who also claim a right to mete out justice or more exactly to take the law into their own hands. The case of spectatorship in Aceh, however, demonstrates otherwise: while the spectators are actively jeering and surveilling the violators being caned on the stage, they are not completely separated from the state's mode of punishment. Rather, the spectators further the state's vision of the subject of violation of Qanun Jinayat and exercise their moral ground through their everyday performed repertoire.



## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Ericson, Richard V, and Kevin D Haggerty. *The New Politics of Surveillance and Visibility*. University of Toronto Press, 2006.
- Hart, Herbert LA. "The Presidential Address: Prolegomenon to the Principles of Punishment." Paper presented at the Proceedings of the Aristotelian society, 1959.
- Foucault, Michel. "Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison" *Trans. Alan Sheridan*. New York: Vintage. 1995
- Fassin, Didier. "Towards a critical moral anthropology." *La Lettre de l'École des hautes études en sciences sociales* (2012).
- Fassin, Didier, *et al.* *At the Heart of the State*. Pluto Press, 2015.
- Fassin, Didier. *The Will to Punish*. Oxford University Press, 2018.
- Gandy Jr, Oscar. "Data Mining, Surveillance, and Discrimination in the Post-9/11 Environment." *The new politics of surveillance and visibility* (2006): 363.
- Lyon, David. *Surveillance Studies: An Overview*. Polity, 2007.
- Monahan, Torin. *Surveillance in the Time of Insecurity*. Rutgers University Press, 2010.

FROM EFFECTIVE TO AFFECTIVE BROKERS: RETHINKING DEVELOPMENT BROKERS IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF  
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT IN INDONESIA

*Hestu Prahara*

*Department of Anthropology, Universitas Indonesia*  
*Development studies, University of Auckland*

*The end of Indonesia's authoritarian New Order regime in 1998 marked a new era of democratisation and decentralised governance. This process was parallel with development interventions from international donor agencies such as the World Bank that introduced new development approach as community-driven development (CDD). This shift in development and mode of governance allowed for the proliferation of new social actors who situated themselves at the interface between village communities, state, and donor agencies. These new social actors have been recognised by scholars within the discipline of anthropology and development studies as development brokers. In such accounts, the brokers' role is described as either distorting the system or enabling the system to work but somehow overlook actor's subjectivity regarding their involvement in development. Using the case study from the implementation of community development in Manggarai village, this paper will discuss the role of development brokers such as project facilitators, interface bureaucrats, and village development cadres within current development scheme. In doing so, I will pay attention to actors' subjectivity as an important locus to understand complexities of social practices in development, power relations, and potential for social transformation.*

*Keywords: community-driven development; development brokers; subjectivity*



Preceded by a decade experience of the implementation of community-driven development (CDD) program supported by the World Bank, Indonesian government enacted the new Village Law (Law 6/2014) which granted relative autonomy and a generous portion of resources to all 75,000 Indonesian villages to manage their own designed development projects. Through the enactment of this new law, participatory approach in the development introduced by CDD programs is institutionalized into village government routines, such as the introduction of village assembly as a mechanism to bring people's aspiration into village development planning. Development buzzwords popularized throughout the implementation of CDD programs in Indonesia since the late 1990s such as 'community empowerment' and 'good governance' (transparency and accountability) continue to circulate within current policy landscape and become critical discourses surrounding social practices of development in the village.

Moreover, some critical studies have described the use of participatory approaches in development as not merely a mechanism for resource allocation but also a peculiar enterprise in knowledge production and representation (Mosse, 2001). That is, participatory development purifies messy knowledge and experience into a clean and structured representation (Kothari, 2001) and renders social life apolitical while overemphasizing technical problems (Ferguson, 1990; Li, 2007). Tania Murray Li (2007:7) famously describes development programs as 'rendering technical' that she defined as "...a whole set of practices concerned with representing 'the domain to be governed as an intelligible field with specifiable limits and particular characteristic... defining boundaries, rendering that within them visible, assembling information about that which is included and devising techniques to mobilize the forces and entities thus revealed'." When I started my fieldwork in May 2019 observing village development programs in Manggarai District, East Nusa Tenggara Province, I was immediately overwhelmed with technical and bureaucratic terms used by my interlocutors in their explanations about the implementation of development projects in the villages. In this regard, the practice of rendering technical—particularly administrative-centered activities—appeared as a dominant feature in the implementation of village development programs under the new Village Law.

Normatively, the new law supposed to grant all villages with relative autonomy to decide activities or development projects based on their needs. However, as noted by Vel and Zakaria (2017) village autonomy granted in Law 6/2014 was reduced significantly due to competing regulations issued by the two ministries responsible for village development, i.e., Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Village, Development of Disadvantaged Regions, and Transmigration. This situation has created confusion both for the district and village governments, particularly regarding how village funds can be spent. Moreover, in addition to regulations from ministries in Jakarta, village government have to hold activities and projects in accordance with the implementing regulations issued by province and district government. With abundant regulations issued by supra village government institutions to control the use of village funds and the design of village development projects, participatory approach used within current village development policy tend to serve outsider agendas by producing representation 'to legitimize action, to explain, to justify, validate higher policy goals, or mobilize political support' (Mosse, 2001:27).

It is not my intention, however, to disclose contradictions in the intentional development by contrasting it to the implementation realities. Instead, in this presentation, I am more interested in diving into the subjective experiences of locally situated actors involved in development practices in the village. It is partly because subjectivity is often overlooked in some literature within the discipline of development studies and anthropology of development. But mainly



because recently, as we have observed in the implementation of Law 6/2014, the state's efforts to improve the population's welfare through development are delegated to governance institutions closer to the targeted population. In such situations, development projects are now managed by groups of actors from within the communities working on behalf of the state, such as village head and his/her staffs, village development cadres, and village facilitators. In many ways, considering their 'in-betweenness,' these locally situated actors can be categorized as development brokers: "connective agents who actively bring together the different elements of development assemblages they operate in and are targeted by" (Koster & van Leynseele, 2018).

In this regard, I contend that by paying close attention to the subjectivity of actors involved in development practices can bring us into a more nuanced description concerning the intricate process of social (de)constructions. Following Ortner (2005), subjectivity refers to "ensemble mode of perception, affect, thought, desire, fear, and so forth that animate acting subject" (31). In contrast to the 'unconscious' governmentality subject (see Li, 2007), Ortner (2005:34) see actors as "partially 'knowing subject[s]'" in a sense that "they have some degree of reflexivity about themselves and their desires, and that they have some 'penetration' into the ways in which they are formed by their circumstances." In this sense, subjects never fully internalize social norms imposed upon them, nor do they passively subjugate themselves to power because they always partially reflect upon the circumstances where they find themselves. The critical issue at hand in this formulation is the intimate relationship between subjectivity and power: by considering the subject's reflexive capability, the constitution of the subject by disciplinary power, therefore, must be seen as a contingent and provisional mechanism.

Ethnographic exemplars that I will provide in this presentation are derived from semi-structured interviews with village government officials and village facilitators in Manggarai District, East Nusa Tenggara (NTT) Province. Also, I had opportunity to do some participant observation in several important events related to the management of village development such as workshops held by district government for village government officials, monitoring of village development projects by village facilitators, and an annual village-to-village survey activity undertaken by village facilitators to measure village development status. As expected, most activities that I observed revolved around the production and circulation of inscriptions, such as village development planning documents, budget design, financial reports, etc. From my experience, observation of these activities is essential not only to understand how documents are produced but also how document production was subjectively experienced by people involved (Hull, 2012). My initial findings suggest that people's engagement in the production of documents involving not only administrative procedures in village development but also shaped by and influenced local politics within the village level and beyond. Additionally, as documents became a paramount element in the evaluation of village governance, they also play an essential part in the constitutions of development subject.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Ferguson, J. (1990). *The anti-politics machine: 'Development', depoliticization, and bureaucratic power in lesotho*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hull, M. S. (2012). *Government of paper: The materiality of bureaucracy in urban Pakistan*. Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press.



- Koster, M., & van Leynseele, Y. (2018). Brokers as assemblers: Studying development through the lens of brokerage. *Ethnos*, 83(5), 803-813. doi:10.1080/00141844.2017.1362451
- Kothari, U. (2001). Power, knowledge and social control in participatory development. In B. Cooke, & U. Kothari (Eds.), *Participation: The new tyranny?* (pp. 139-152). London, New York: Zed Books.
- Li, T. M. (2007). *The will to improve: Governmentality, development, and the practice of politics*. North Carolina: Duke University Press.
- Mosse, D. (2001). 'People's knowledge', participation and patronage: Operations and representations in rural development. In B. Cooke, & U. Kothari (Eds.), *Participation: The new tyranny?* (1st ed., pp. 16-35). London, New York: Zed Books.
- Ortner, S. B. (2005). Subjectivity and cultural critique. *Anthropological Theory*, 5(1), 31-52. doi:10.1177/1463499605050867
- Vel, J., & Zakaria, Y. (2017). *New law, old bureaucracy* Inside Indonesia.

#### ISLAMIC DIFFERENCE AND PUBLIC RELIGION IN THE BUREAUCRATIC ERA

Julian Millie  
Monash University

In the 1970s, Indonesia's Ministry of Religious Affairs announced that more post-graduate students of Islam were to be sent for post-graduate study to western universities, as opposed to the centres of Islamic learning such as Egypt's Al-Azhar. The motivation behind this was to create Muslim graduates with 'modern and critical attitudes'. The paper reflects on this decision, drawing on discussions with graduates about their study trajectories, and also on our reading of the (currently flourishing) genre of 'Islamic study-travel literature'.

The Minister's decision was a salient moment in the process whereby Indonesia's Muslim sphere acquired the categories of public and counter-public. Graduates of western universities return, we find, prepared with 'modern, critical attitudes' shaped in high quality research centres dedicated to enhancing the individual's potential as researcher. The paradigmatic career path for such graduates is that of researcher (university, survey company). Al-Azhar graduates return with the goal of giving service in the routines of everyday Islamic practice. The paradigmatic career path is preacher (Middle-East graduates far exceed western graduates in the ranks of successful preachers). The minister's decision is useful, we argue, for understanding how the former religious subjectivity ('modern and critical') came to acquire such public approval, while the latter is frequently represented as retrograde and even subversive.

There is a substantial critique of the policy turn under examination here, produced through critical writings by academics affiliated with the *Nahdlatul Ulama*. Reflecting on the tension between the religious concepts preserved within NU settings and the purified notions of subjectivity shared by the state and Islamic modernists, NU scholars have been sensitive to the cultural specificity of the subjectivity the Minister was trying to create with this decision. For some NU thinkers, their rejection of the supremacy of the 'modern and critical subject' was sufficient reason to argue that religion should not become a normative basis of political participation in the Indonesian state.

*Keywords: Islam; Religious practice; Public spheres; Islamic Education; Governance of Religion*



DIALOGICAL POLITICS: GENDERED SUBJECTIVITIES AND PUBLIC SPEAKING IN WEST TIMOR

Rafadi Hakim

University of Chicago

Among political anthropology's long-standing insights, Indonesianist anthropology has contributed to how power is performatively constituted: the "state," for instance, derives its ritual authority from monological spectacles (Geertz 1980; see also Errington 2000; Keane 2003). This monological performativity of politics, however, could be further examined by asking how politics operate dialogically (cf Bakhtin 1986); that is, by asking how claims to political legitimacy operate by invoking powerful audiences and their potential responses (cf Rutherford 2012). Taking the performance- and spectacle-like qualities of rule as a starting point, this paper suggests that political subjects are contingently differentiated and recognized through the dialogicality of communicative practices. Drawing from feminist insights (e.g. Landes 1998; Spivak 1988), I will pay attention to how gendered political subjects become asymmetrically differentiated from subjects deemed general and universal. In particular, by paying attention to gendered consequences of public speaking in a rural locale near Kupang (West Timor), I will ask how the subject of the "woman" (perempuan) and the "mother" (ibu/mama) are performatively gendered in public forums ("musyawarah") and in the circulations of public political discourse. I contend that contemporary figures of the Indonesian "mother" and "woman," which are often conflated, stand in relation to two processes: (1) national imaginings of motherhood as a feminized form of national belonging (Shiraishi 1997; Suryakusuma 2011); and (2) local histories of asymmetrical gender relations (e.g. Kuipers 1986). This paper thus contends that situated notions of governance emerges out of processes that are power-laden and yet persistently dialogical: processes that fragment and splinter ways of belonging as they invoke contingent forms of diversity.

Among Indonesianist anthropology's contribution to the study of politics is the idea of performativity: "The state ceremonials of classical Bali were metaphysical theatre: theatre designed to express a view of the ultimate nature of reality and, at the same time, to shape the existing conditions of life to be constant with that reality; that is, theatre to present an ontology, and by presenting it, to make it happen - make it actual" (Geertz 1980, 104). In this paper, I contend that such forms of performative theatricality are not past; in fact, such forms of performative theatricality are central to how contemporary Indonesian democracy is both idealized as and falls short of "rule by all." Through an ethnographic study of how governance practices are performed within an administrative "village" (BI: desa), I contend that new political subjectivities emerge in public forums, such as meetings (BI: musyawarah). These new subjectivities are not only represented or reflected in these interactions; rather, these emergent subjectivities are produced, differentiated, and splintered by the interactions and exchanges that constitute these very meetings. Through five months of ongoing fieldwork in Oelbaun (a pseudonym),<sup>35</sup> a multi-ethnic locale in West Timor, I contend that democratic political forums, such as the "town-hall meeting" (BI: musyawarah perencanaan pembangunan), becomes a performative modality through which new forms of gendered political subjectivities emerge (cf Butler 1990). In the two ethnographic examples that I will analyze in this paper, I argue that "gender" as a form of political subjectivity emerges out of meetings and other discursively mediated interactions – following feminist scholarship on publics and political discourse, I analyze "gender" beyond preconceived notions of sexual difference between male-bodied and female-

---

<sup>35</sup> All village names and names of persons in this paper are pseudonyms to protect my research subjects' privacy.





bodied persons (cf Landes 1998, Scott 1999). Rather, as I will demonstrate, “gender” in its local understanding emerges out of how one performs and relationally situates one’s self as “male” or “female” participants of local political processes. Thus, gender is not merely a descriptor of persons; rather, issues, genres of speech, and other forms of interaction are also gendered (Gal 1991, 1995). Thus, in response to this panel’s call for non-calculative practices of rule, I will pay attention to how performatively constituted subjectivities characterize relations of governance across a heterogeneous populace.

#### THE PRODUCTION OF GENDERED DIFFERENCES

My aim in this section is to provide an analytic of dialogicality (cf Bakhtin 1986)– one that is based on the recognition of speakerhood and an anticipation of other’s response in the performance of governance practices (cf Rutherford 2012). These forms of subjective speakerhood, in turn, are mediated by numerous institutions that operate as sites of governance in my field site – NGOs, churches, village governments, and kin ties, among others. In Oelbaun, I counted no less than 4 NGOs that already have conducted projects dedicated to “women’s empowerment” (Bahasa Indonesia [BI]: pemberdayaan perempuan) in different parts of the same village. In my view, however, what is particular (though not unique) to Oelbaun is the fact that women are quite well-represented in local leadership positions (i.e. 40% of all chiefs of neighborhoods [ketua RT/RW] are women). According to Oelbaun’s village chief, “these women are now brave enough to speak in public although they were shy in the past” (BI: mama-mama sudah berani berbicara di depan umum meskipun dulunya malu-malu).” Especially among women in Oelbaun who have interacted extensively with feminist NGOs, they claim that, now, women can “speak in public” (Bahasa Kupang [BK]: baomong di depan umum) after they “have understood gender” (BI: sudah mengerti gender). The question, therefore, is how women recognize themselves and be recognized by others as those who speak efficaciously as a representative of “women’s interests” (BI: kepentingan perempuan) in public. I contend that gendered forms of public speakerhood emerge as subjectivities that are contested, differentiated and unpredictably called upon during interactions in political forums. Though almost all NGO staffers and village officials would describe these as changes as a process that takes years, I would like to emphasize how these performances are also organized spectacles – one that allows an imaginary of democracy as being inclusive and transformative of gendered differences to emerge. At the same time, these spectacles also constrain and limit how one can perform one’s self as being attentive to “women’s issues” while being a participant in political processes.

In one recent meeting where I observed a village legislation (BI: perdes) being drafted and discussed, I was party to a rather tedious session where an NGO staffer was tasked with reading a multi-page draft of two draft legislations: one on maternal health and another on child marriage. The NGO staffer, a woman named Ina, was tasked with reading these two documents word-by-word and allow for village council members to interrupt her and ask for clarifying details, or even to add additional suggestions on how to “use words correctly” (BI: penggunaan kata yang baik”). In Oelbaun, village council members are notorious for their dislike of the village chief, which is the NGO’s key ally in lobbying for village regulations that proactively include women in local governance structures. In a meeting that I witnessed, Ina was asked to define “postpartum bleeding” (BI: nifas) for a 50-something year-old male councilmember, much to the chagrin of women public health volunteers who were present (and have aided the birth of countless babies in the village). Another council member asked for a “mother who is a health volunteer” (BK: mama kader) to provide an explanation. In response to the roaring bouts of laughter that followed, the



councilmember said that “this is something that is reasonable for a man to ask” (BI: wajarlah kalau laki-laki bertanya hal ini). At this moment of interaction, governance is performed as a dialogue: one not only responds to what has been said, but one anticipates what others will say. Furthermore, in this particular instance, it is not only women and men who are differentiated by their responses to the question what “postpartum bleeding” is; rather, by assigning the labor of explicating and translating to women who are public health volunteers, childbirth and safe labor were gendered as a women’s issue. This brief exchange illustrates how gendered subjectivities are performed during a public meeting, which is one of local democracy’s defining spectacles. Through this local spectacle, Ina’s NGO claims that women’s voices” (BI: suara perempuan) are performed as part of local democracy, though in a position that is inextricable from the masculine forms of knowledge presumed by the village council member.

#### A FAILED SPECTACLE

One of democracy’s defining spectacles is the Habermasian idea that anyone can become public speakers in deliberative forums that are supposedly based on rational principles of debate (Habermas 1989). In the following example, I would like to point how “women’s voices” (BI: suara perempuan) that seem to be unitary in meetings are constituted by the exclusion of certain groups of women from these decision-making forums. Following feminist scholar who have extensively described women and those presupposed as irrational have been excluded from public political life (Fraser 1990, Landes 1998, Warner 2002), I would like to point out that exclusions do not neatly classify political subjects as those who rule and those who resist : these democratic practices, such as meetings, are not one-off performances that fully enact a form of political totality, but forms of discourse that animates political life even among those who are excluded from privileged decision-making forums. In Oelbaun, for instance, invitations to the town-hall meetings (BI: musyawarah perencanaan pembangunan) where budgetary decisions are made are politically charged – one could be invited or even expelled from one. Such practices demonstrate how political subjectivities are constituted through disagreements and exclusions, even when a village has supposedly embraced the importance of including women’s voices in deliberative forums.

Even with Annie, a woman representative in the Oelbaun village council, many Oelbaun women were only reluctantly incorporated as part of town-hall meetings, including Mariah, Jane, and her neighbors, all of whom run businesses out of their homes for a living. In 2018, Mariah and her neighbors were not invited to the last town-hall meeting (BI: musyawarah perencanaan pembangunan), but they showed up anyway, though they were severely reprimanded when they were about to get food during lunch time. Annie, a village council member and the chief of a women’s co-op, reprimanded them by asking “why are you here eating our food” (BK: bosong buat apa makan makanan katong). Offended, Mariah and her friends left. This, however, was only the start of a long series of interactions with Annie that left Mariah feeling incredibly disappointed. Among others, budgetary appropriations from the village’s annual fund were decided in the town-hall meeting, which they were expelled from.

In Oelbaun, Mariah, Jane, and a group of women who all belong together to the same coop (BI: koperasi) were surprised one day when their village chief showed up with Annie to distribute cooking equipment and ingredients for a kind of banana jelly (BI: dodol pisang). One woman, Jane, received a set of cooking equipment, including large kerosene stoves that people normally use for large functions. Another one, Mariah, received a whole shipment of ingredients for the banana



pudding - according to Annie, the instigator of this enterprise, the ingredients are worth Rp 1,800,000 (~\$ 130), and coop members are expected to return the money within a span of one year to the village government. That way, the money is supposed to become part of a rotating fund that could be accessed by other members of the women's coop in the village as start-up capital. Mariah was incredibly baffled because, in effect, she received an order not only to cook for the village, but also to pay the village government a substantial amount of money. She refused to obey Annie's instructions and instead began to investigate how the spectacular amount of Rp 1.8 million came into being.

In this instance, the village's centralized form of rule ruptured as soon as it fails to materialize the money that Annie and her collaborators wanted to collect from villagers. In fact, it splinters the women villagers who belong to the same coop, SP, into several different factions: the ones who have access to lobbying the village government (Annie), and the ones who do not (Mariah and Jane). Annie, who was assigned by the village government to coordinate food production by household cottage industries, subsequently gave Mariah a list of ingredients and their prices to justify the 1.8 million Rupiahs that needs to be returned to the village. Mariah, however, was shocked, because the value of the ingredients was severely overestimated. For instance, rice flour, which should cost only Rp 9,000 per kg, was listed as Rp 20,000 per kg in the manifest that Annie submitted. According to her, Annie said that these increases are due to "taxes" (BI: pajak), which Mariah didn't believe. Mariah was even baffled by how she was told to cook banana jellies using these ingredients, because the process involves stirring a vat of thick liquid non-stop for hours - something that would exhaust her group of 4 women who are all above the age of 50. Making these jellies, according to her, is a "man's job" (BI: tugas laki-laki).

Although Annie technically has a leadership position in both the village and the women's coop, her credibility was damaged by this one interaction - she is said to no longer be one "who fights for women's rights" in the village. Furthermore, the banana jelly, albeit more long lasting than other forms of preserved foods, spoiled only after one week, which made it impossible to raise the US\$ 130 demanded by Annie and the village government. Weeks later, Mariah was still diligently accounting for the made-up differences that caused the cost of ingredients to blow-up - she meticulously asked the owner of a dry goods kiosk about how much these ingredients should cost in the local market. These details were recounted to me during one meeting of the women's coop, and I labeled this instance as "robbery by way of banana jelly" (BI: ditodong dengan dodol pisang).

In this incident, forms of democratic ruling through budgetary decision-making splintered a supposedly coherent social grouping ("the women's coop) into factions who disagree. Though the village government has incredible powers to form financial decisions and entangle its own citizens in financial quagmires, its legitimacy was thrown into question as soon as Mariah refused to cook for the village and Jane returned the set of cooking equipment. The sheer material force by which the village exerted itself as a governing entity - the command to cook banana jellies - fails to get reciprocated with labor and money, but this incident manages to incite a set of debates and dialogues among those who are excluded.

#### CONCLUDING REMARKS

The two ethnographic vignettes I drew from demonstrate how politics operate as dialogical practice: one's own actions are always evaluated relationally according to one's own interlocutors, although they might not always be co-present in the same space or time. I draw this analytic from



Bakhtin's (1986) notion of dialogicality: that all voices do not stand as total representations of an individual or a singular entity, rather, all voices are mediated through the voices of others. Through this paper, I contend that voices are essentialized as taxonomically organized forms of political subjectivities. Many institutions that claim "democracy" as their key value thus claim that governance needs to include an ever-increasing variety of voices in governance – women's voices, the voices of those with disability, the voices of sexual minorities, and others. At the same time, once these voices are recognized as a separate entity, they are already given a discursive slot in which their political roles are circumscribed. Echoing Geertz's insight on how performances constitute governance itself, the ever-increasing multiplicity of voices in public staging's of democracy demonstrate how these performances define the terms through which democracy's political subjects could be recognized. Thus, going beyond how a voice is understood as a form of representation, analyzing voicing as dialogical phenomena in which actions are always already relational and political would allow ethnographers to analyze the power-laden relationalities that emerge across emergent political subjectivities.

Secondly, I have emphasized how political subjectivities are constituted not only by becoming part of performances of governance, but also by citing and reanimating such performances. In both ethnographic vignettes I have presented, meetings, public forums, negotiations, and other discursively mediated performances are privileged sites where legitimate governance supposedly emanates from. In the first example, I have shown how "women's voices" are performed and restricted in a forum that is seen as a legitimate gathering of decision makers. In the second example, I have demonstrated even those who are excluded from decision-making forums also voice the same aspirations to be included in these performances of democratic governance. Rather than understanding these phenomena as hierarchical schemes that neatly divide those who rule from those who resist, I would like to point out how these performances demonstrate how political subjectivities are performed and differentiated through contestations and disagreements.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Bakhtin, M. M. 1986. "Forms of Time and of the Chronotope in the Novel." In *The Dialogic Imagination*, edited by Michael Holquist, translated by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist, 84–258. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1986.
- Butler, Judith. 1990. *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. New York: Routledge.
- Fraser, Nancy. 1990. "Rethinking the Public Sphere: A Contribution to the Critique of Actually Existing Democracy." *Social Text*, no. 25/26:56–80.
- Gal, Susan. 1991. "Between Speech and Silence: The Problematics of Research on Language and Gender." In *Gender at the Crossroads of Knowledge: Feminist Anthropology in the Postmodern Era*, edited by Micaela Di Leonardo, 175–203. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Gal, Susan. 1995. "Language, Gender, and Power: An Anthropological Review." In *Gender Articulated: Language and the Socially Constructed Self*, edited by Kira Hall and Mary Bucholtz, 169–82. New York: Routledge



Habermas, Jürgen. 1991 [1962]. *The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere: An Inquiry into a Category of Bourgeois Society*. 1st MIT Press pbk. ed. Studies in Contemporary German Social Thought. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press.

Landes, Joan B. 1998. "The Public and the Private Sphere: A Feminist Reconsideration." In *Feminism: The Public and the Private*, edited by Joan B. Landes, 135–63. New York: Oxford University Press.

Rutherford, Danilyn. 2012. *Laughing at Leviathan: Sovereignty and Audience in West Papua*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Scott, Joan Wallach. 1999. *Gender and the Politics of History*. Rev. ed. New York: Columbia University Press.

Warner, Michael. 2002. "Publics and Counterpublics." *Public Culture* 14 (1):49–90.

"THEY CALL IT A REVOLUTION": AFFECT IN REPRODUCTIVE GOVERNANCE AND HEALTH POLITICS IN  
INDONESIA  
Sari Ratri  
Northwestern University

*This paper explains how health metrics are used as technologies of rule to shift women's perception from homebirth to clinical birth in East Nusa Tenggara, Indonesia. The Maternal and Neonatal Health Revolution is a bilaterally funded program between the Australian and Indonesian governments, initiated in 2009 and formally ended in 2015. This "revolutionary" program works through advancing strict rules and regulations, bureaucratic procedures, guidelines, and metrics. Yet, if a massive maternal mortality intervention should lead to more women accessing healthcare and thus reduce maternal mortality, why is it that so many women in this village still hesitant to go to the clinic? Considering the heavy reliance on statistically robust results in global health projects, what do numbers do when they are used to make women change their decision regarding place of birth? In this paper, I describe how people react to, reflect, and challenge the apparent function of numbers intended to change women's child birthing practices. As the circulation of numbers is attached with certain values, people's encounter with numbers influences their experience of the world. To answer my questions, I use the concept of affective numbers to see people's sensorial and spatial experiences in the supposedly vital moment of childbirth. I draw my framework from the phenomenological approach of counting or being counted to underline how numbers are constructed, experienced, and understood by different actors.*

*Keywords: affect, metrics, maternal and child health, Indonesia*

## INTRODUCTION

It was noon on a day in July 2017. Elena, a woman in the small village of Tengku Lese, nestled in the Manggarai highlands of Indonesia, had given birth at her home. I accompanied Maria, one of the two nurses stationed at the Tengku Lese health post (and who was herself pregnant at the time) as she went to check on Elena's condition. Maria was upset. When we travelled from the village health post to Elena's house, she complained about the difficulty of making people change their preference from birthing at home to using the village health clinic. Since 2009, the state-





initiated project called Revolusi Kesehatan Ibu dan Anak (Maternal and Neonatal Health Revolution, hereafter, Revolusi KIA) has promised to bring women a healthier pregnancy and childbirth experience, by, among other things, mandating that all births must be in clinics. Maria could not understand why Elena, and many other women in Tengku Lese, apparently did not desire a clinical birth, as she considered it the safer and healthier birth process. I heard Maria yell, sounding frustrated, to the women who were with Elena in the bedroom, “How could you do this to us?!”

Revolusi KIA, used the metaphor of *revolusi* to invoke the long perceived nationalistic value that highlights the transition from post-colonial toward the aspirational “developed” (*maju*) country.<sup>36</sup> More specifically, the metaphor reflects the promise of getting the most effective solutions for the enduring problem of maternal and infant deaths in East Nusa Tenggara, Indonesia. The local government of East Nusa Tenggara defines *revolusi* as “rapid reduction in maternal and neonatal mortality through extraordinary efforts by providing adequate health services for 24 hours” (District Health Office 2009:22). This definition, I suspect, is intended to direct the attention of the people, national governments, and donors to get in line with the idea that this province is the place most in need of a maternal intervention program.

The Health Department of East Nusa Tenggara (District Health Office 2009), notes in Revolusi KIA’s project guideline that the province’s maternal mortality rate was higher (306 per 100,000 live births) than the national rate (228 per 100,000 live births). The guideline highlights specific local characteristics of the province: that the majority of births (77.7 %) took place at home; and more than 46% of births were assisted by *dukun* (“traditional” birthing attendants), almost 10% more than the 36.5% births with “biomedical skilled attendants” or *bidan* (Health Department 2009). When I visited the district’s capital city, Ruteng, I found banners and posters promoting the value of Revolusi KIA. Those pieces were showcased in the lobbies of most government offices, some even citing the Governor’s Regulation No. 42 of 2009 which declared “all births must be in the clinic,” or sometimes, “all births must be in adequate facilities.” Under the Revolusi KIA’s implementation, giving birth at home is no longer acceptable in this region. Darsi (44 year-old), one of family health cadres, once told me, “We don’t know what it is, they call it *revolusi*.” The comment was not about her being unfamiliar with the program; rather, it was her critique of imposing a policy to lead women to make a decision for clinical birth without knowing that in many cases, births happened, as she said, “unexpectedly.” What do numbers do when they are used to make women change their decision regarding place of birth? In this essay, I will try to answer that question by applying what I call affective numbers.

---

<sup>36</sup> The metaphor of *revolusi* is everywhere in Indonesia. Referring to different ideologies of intervention, it can be found in various state projects from the era of the country’s first president to those of the current president. Indonesia’s first president, Sukarno, in a speech in 1957, called for *revolusi mental* (mental revolution) to sustain the refusal of any form of neo-colonialization in the country. “Mental Revolution: Developing an Independent Soul Toward A Bigger Nation. [https://kominfo.go.id/index.php/content/detail/5932/Revolusi+Mental%3A+Membangun+Jiwa+Merdeka+Menuju+Bangsa+Besar/0/artikel\\_gpr](https://kominfo.go.id/index.php/content/detail/5932/Revolusi+Mental%3A+Membangun+Jiwa+Merdeka+Menuju+Bangsa+Besar/0/artikel_gpr) Accessed on Monday December 3, 2018 at 19.00 pm. Sukarno told the audience that Indonesia should no longer be “*een native van koelies, en een koelie onder de naties*; a nation of coolies and a collie amongst nations,” provoking self-awareness about class consciousness, empowerment, and development. The second president, Suharto, considered the continuing heavy plight of farmers and established “supports” through what was called Green Revolution by providing farmers with improved seeds, farm technology, irrigation system development, and chemical fertilizers (Winarto 1995). Joko Widodo, the current president of Indonesia, has maintained the use of the term *revolusi* in many of his programs, including *revolusi biru* (blue revolution) as a shifting from “land-minded” to “sea-minded” (Antaranews.com).





## AFFECTIVE NUMBERS: HOW NUMBERS CIRCULATE CERTAIN VALUES

Affective numbers refer to how morality is imbued into the practices of producing, referring to, and enacting statistical data for health policies and practices. The process unfolds by involving how people react to, reflect, and challenge the alleged function of numbers. Roald and colleagues define affect as "the orienting feature of the whole body-subject" (2018:207) in Merleau-Ponty's phenomenology. Merleau-Ponty, according to them, refuses a strict theoretical dichotomy between subject and object when dealing with human perception, experience, and consciousness. For Merleau-Ponty, the body always bears the capacity "for sensing and being sensed" that indicates the openness of the body "to the world of objects" (Roald et al. 2018:209). I aim to capture the affective dimension of numbers by looking at how numbers can be put to social use by people and institution. I would like to follow Roald et al.'s suggestion to understand how numbers are perceived through the "intersubjective movement" of perceptual objects in the world as "fundamental to prereflective meaning-making" (Roald et al. 2018:209). Emphasis on the "prereflective" allows me to see that as an object in the world, numbers have come to appear to have the quality to influence people's consciousness and shape their experience, in this case about maternal and infant deaths. I note two ways this influence occurs: outwardly, or through centrifugal movement, expressed through their practices; and inwardly, or through centripetal movement, by carving their inner world of selfhood. In other words, people may sense or evaluate the body differently by their being in contact (Ahmed 2004) with the circulation of maternal "facts" presented by the use of numbers.

Returning to Elena, with whom this paper began, hers is a dramatic yet familiar story about a woman's struggle during labor. The vignette exposes tension between people in the village and health care providers. The unease presented in that moment, expressed by Maria's utterance "How could *you* do this to *us*?!" represents the context in which women's decisions regarding place of birth have affected the way Maria assess her self-accountability (Jakimow 2018) as a provider who carries the responsibility of making women chose clinical births. It was not merely a question about why Elena did not go to the village health post. Rather, it was an emotional reaction sensed by Maria whose credibility was being affected by the apparent act of *non-compliance*. Furthermore, Maria's emotions did not necessarily point toward Elena *per se*, who was at that time unconscious. Instead, I believe, Maria was displeased by the image of *non-compliant* subject(s) which was triggered by Elena's giving birth at home. In short, Maria was incriminating each of the individuals present in that moment, invoking the notion of opposition to *us* (health providers) by *you* (people in the village).

## CONCLUDING REMARKS

Frameworks for discussing development projects use mostly about the calculative of development as rationalized practices of governance (Mitchell 2014; Li 2007; Rose 1999:4), and they tend to treat the body as the object of governance. Inquiry involving affect as an analytical tool gives attention to analyzing the quotidian experiences of individuals within development practices who are often treated in passing. In this paper, I have tried to direct attention to how maternal mortality rates are used as a technique of governance, to ignite "...feelings that are processed as guilt, shame, foolishness, or satisfaction when engaged in activities...or the sense that one is expected to or assumed to..." (Jakimow 2018:50) be responsible to reduce maternal deaths. As I have shown, numbers are used as the foundation to create interventions directed toward changing women's practice of giving birth from a space deemed inadequate. To make people



desire the space delineated by Revolusi KIA, numbers are interpreted into an iconic figure of *non-compliance*. This icon bears certain properties that are loaded with a predominantly moral quality. It is in the moment when people interpret numbers and associate them with the icon of non-compliance that, I suspect, the affective quality of numbers exists. When this icon is put into practice (as ways of saying or punishing), it is transmitted through a lexicon of emotion such as pride, shame, and fear. This lexicon is indexing to the external stimuli registered by people's sensory apparatus (Csordas 1990:8). In my case, it is the moral ideology in maternal health development that gives numbers affective power.

This analytical excursion does not mean to treat women or development agents as passive bodies. In contrast, affect shows that individuals are not only moved and governed by floating abstract discourses. Instead, as my ethnography indicates, subjects embody this quality (permeate in numbers) and even use it to achieve a variety of ends, such as navigating problems and construing their personhood. By incorporating affect in the anthropology of metrics, I refuse to see numbers as having an aura of objective truth and scientific authority (McCann 2017:15) or as fixed indicators (Merry 2016). It is people's encountering and learning the meanings of numbers that does or does not sustain their "objective" value. In this sense, women (or people in general) are constantly shifting from subject to object; they do not chronically occupy subjectivity entirely, nor do they solely objectify themselves under the regime of quantification. Affect allows me to engage with how people experience and apprehend the world numerically. It seems that we experience, organize, and assess our bodies less rigidly than in the (fictitious) rational/calculative way that purely mathematical logic would impose. Apparently, as Terence Turner (1994:46) suggests, the body is "at once subjective and objective, meaningful and material, personal and social, an agent that produces discourses as well as receive[s] them." In today's global health regime that embraces statistics more than sustainable health services, as the body is moved from being subject to being object, in fact it has never been a singular corporeal entity.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Ahmed, Sara. 2014. *The Cultural Politics of Emotion*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Csordas, Thomas J. 1990. Embodiment as A Paradigm for Anthropology. *Ethos* 18 (1):5-47.
- Jakimow, Tanya. 2018. Being Harmed While Doing Good: Affective Injuries in A Community Development Programme, Medan, Indonesia. *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 24 (3):550-567.
- Li, Tania Murray. 2007. *The Will to Improve: Governmentality, Development, and the Practice of Politics*. Durham and London: Duke University Press.
- McCann, Carole R. 2017. *Figuring the Population Bomb: Gender and Demography in the Mid-twentieth Century*. Seattle and London: University of Washington Press.
- Mitchell, Timothy. 2014. Economentality: How the Future Entered Government. *Critical Inquiry* 40 (4):479-507.
- Roald, Tone, Kasper Levin, and Simo K ppe. 2018. Affective Incarnations: Maurice Merleau-Ponty's Challenge to Bodily Theories of Emotion. *Journal of Theoretical and Philosophical Psychology* 38 (4):205.



Rose, Nikolas. 1999. *Powers of Freedom: Reframing Political Thought*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Turner, Terence, ed. 1994. *Bodies and Anti-bodies: Flesh and Fetish in Contemporary Social Theory*. Edited by T. J. Csordas, *Embodiment and Experience: The Existential Ground of Culture and Self*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

THE AESTHETIC TURN IN INDONESIAN BORDER GOVERNANCE: BORDER-CROSSINGS BEAUTIFICATION,  
INFRASTRUCTURAL VIOLENCE, AND GENERATIVE RUIN  
*Sindhunata Hargyono*  
*Northwestern University*

In 2014, the majority of Indonesian voters elected Joko Widodo as the seventh Indonesian president. Widodo won the president seat with the campaign promise of ensuring the state's presence in the everyday lives of the Indonesians, something that the previous regime purportedly could not assure. One way to translate this promise is to ensure the intensification of the state's presence in places deemed as marginal and neglected. Thus, Widodo promised to finally materialize the promise of post-authoritarian decentralized development paradigm by stressing that he seeks to develop Indonesia from its margin. While margin can mean anything, Widodo has a very cartographical conceptualization of what constitutes the margin: the Indonesian border space. Thus, under Widodo's administration, state officials reamplify border development paradigm conceived by the Indonesian National Planning Agency in 2005, that is to transform the Indonesian border from the backyard into the front yard of the nation.

This repositioning of the border within the national imaginary signifies two things. First, the Indonesian border space is currently a backyard of the nation, and thus occupying a deficient condition. Second, the border space needs improvement to ensure its propriety to occupy the ideal position as the front yard of the nation. These points can only be understood in a culturally-specific logic of common architecture norm in Indonesia. The front yard of the house is commonly understood as representative to the quality of its inhabitant and it belongs within the public space. It is in the front yard that the house owner would place its well-managed garden. Meanwhile, the backyard belongs in the private space and is nothing visible from outsiders unless the house owner grants permission to it. For this reason, the backyard often serves for dirty work such as laundry, clothes drier hangs, and kitchen. Thus, this analogizing of the territory as a house, and its edges as the front yard, is a way for the current administration to problematize the border as a deficient object in need of developmental intervention.

The state presence on the Indonesian border space is characterized by circular temporality, in that, it waxes and wanes over time (Eilenberg 2012). The election of Widodo marks a moment of waxing state presence on the Indonesian border space. I argue that this moment of waxing state presence marks the aesthetic turn in Indonesian border governance. This aesthetic turn is characterized by the intensification of appearance and aesthetic judgment in informing governing decision regarding the border space. Furthermore, I argue that this turn becomes a structural failure when it results in the spotlighting of certain geographical spots on the border while neglecting the others, especially the rural border area. Amid the celebration of the successful border governance, lives in the rural border area is characterized by infrastructural disconnection and violence. The condition of being exposed to structural violence, however, does not end the



possibility of political actions. In the last part of the paper, I argue that infrastructural ruins which are emblematic to the continuation of the state's structural violence in border village inaugurate space for the possibility of generative political action.

#### THE AESTHETIC TURN IN INDONESIAN BORDER GOVERNANCE

In this section, I argue that the election of Widodo marks the aesthetic turns in Indonesian border governance. By aesthetic turn, I am referring to the increasing reliance of sensorial perception, aesthetic judgment, and appearance in formulating ruling decision regarding border development. Elsewhere, Asher Ghertner names this technique of governance as "ruling through aesthetics" (Ghertner 2015). I pursue this argument to continue the political anthropologists' tradition to investigate different modalities of ruling (see Hull, 2012; Masco, 2014; Shoshan, 2016), especially techniques that are beyond the grid of rational and calculative technique of governance (see Foucault, 2004; Scott, 1998).

In order to demonstrate this argument, I will look at the Widodo's hallmark technique of ruling, blusukan. As a technique relying on high-level state official direct visitation to development sites, I pin down Widodo's election as the marker of aesthetic turn of Indonesian border governance. In that, blusukan relies on high-level state officials' aesthetic judgments to inform governing decisions. Blusukan differs with the usual high-level official ceremonial visits for blusukan does not only disrupts the scalar formation of places, but also pregnant with the potential of further surprise visits. The latter, I argue, produces a panopticon effect, meant to minimize the possibility of stalling projects.

#### THE STRUCTURAL FAILURE OF THE AESTHETIC TURN: A SERIES OF INFRASTRUCTURAL VIOLENCE ON A BORDER VILLAGE

The president or high-level state officials cannot be everywhere at every time. There are places they cannot or fail to visit for many reasons. This simple fact points to the limit of aesthetic technology of rule. In this section, I look at such limit by looking at the non-immediate violence that it begets. I argue that the aesthetic turn in border governance excludes the concern of infrastructural disconnection in other border spaces, especially in the rural border area. This silencing of infrastructural disconnection is not only a form of infrastructural violence, but also a form of structural violence. To demonstrate this argument, I will slowly narrow my geographical focus from the national scale to the sub-national scale and later to the village-scale.

I will look at the baptism of border crossings lauded as the icon of successful border governance and argue that this hypervisibility (the logic of spotlighting at the expense of erasure) constitutes the perpetuation of infrastructural and structural violence on border villages. I will make this argument by exploring the life of beautified border crossings in state publication and state officials' speech. Furthermore, I will juxtapose this exploration with a series of infrastructural ruinations in a border village lauded as a future economic border pole.

#### THE GENERATIVE EFFECT OF INFRASTRUCTURAL RUINS

In this section, I attempt to go beyond the discussion of infrastructural violence by illustrating how such a condition can be politically generative for the people who are exposed to this form of violence. In so doing, I draw some scholarly thoughts on the issue of failure, infrastructure, and ruin to analyze my ethnographic engagement in Long Nawang village.



Here, I propose to investigate infrastructural time as circular, oscillating between ruin and renewal (Gupta 2018). I argue that through looking at the infrastructural time this way, we can consider the generative political effect of ruination that is driven by the future of infrastructural renewal. I will illustrate this argument through my investigation to the rise of development watch apparatus in Long Nawang village. Mainly, I will look at how this organization works towards tricking the infrastructural time, from ruin to renewal.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Eilenberg, Michael. 2012. *At the Edges of States: Dynamics of State Formation in the Indonesian Borderlands*. Leiden: KITLV Press.
- Foucault, Michel. 2004. *Security, Territory, Population: Lectures at the Collège De France 1977-1978*. Edited by Graham Burchell. New York: Picador.
- Ghertner, D. Asher. 2015. *Rule by Aesthetics: World-Class City Making in Delhi*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Gupta, Akhil. 2018. "The Future in Ruins: Thoughts on the Temporality of Infrastructure." In *The Promise of Infrastructure*, edited by Nikhil Anand, Akhil Gupta, and Hannah Appel, 62–79. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Hull, Matthew S. 2012. *Government of Paper: The Materiality of Bureaucracy in Urban Pakistan*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Masco, Joseph. 2014. *The Theater of Operations: National Security Affect from the Cold War to the War on Terror*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Scott, James C. 1998. *Seeing Like a State: How Certain Schemes to Improve the Human Condition Have Failed*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Shoshan, Nitzan. 2016. *The Management of Hate: Nation, Affect, and the Governance of Right-Wing Extremism in Germany*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

## Youth and Social Life of Chemicals

Coordinator: Nurul Ilmi Idrus (Universitas Hasanuddin)  
& Anita P. Hardon (University van Amsterdam)

This medical anthropological study consists of comparative ethnographies of how youth use chemical and pharmaceutical compounds in everyday life to manage not only pleasure, but also sex, moods, vitality, energy, work, appearance, and health. Contemporary anthropological theory tends to focus on the body as text, in the process diminishing its material significance. With the focus on what bodies culturally represent and their symbolic meanings, representation has been privileged over materiality and embodied experience, with little consideration for how bodies are lived, both socially and biologically.

A handful of sociological and anthropological studies have given us insight into what chemicals do for youths in their everyday lives. They help generate desired gendered subjectivities (such as



being a beautiful and sexy woman or a brave and strong man), increase concentration and stamina, ease social interaction, create desirable moods, relieve aches and pains, and regulate fertility. The current inquiry will place both chemical materiality and sociality centre stage. Why do youths use chemicals in their everyday lives? What effects are they seeking? What role do chemicals play in calming their fears, in achieving their dreams and aspirations? There is a grave scarcity of ethnographic experience-near studies of youths' use of chemicals in their daily lives.

“IS IT NECESSARY TO TAKE POSTINOR TOO?”: THE USE OF POSTINOR-2 BY INDONESIAN YOUTHS  
AND THE IMAGINATION OF EFFICACIOUS CONTRACEPTIVE METHOD

*Annisa Dinda Mawarni*

*Universitas Indonesia*

In this provisional paper, I investigate how Postinor-2, as an emergency contraceptive, mediates Indonesian youths' anxieties of the ineffectualness of other birth control methods. By focusing on diversified questions concerning Postinor-2 by youths in Twitter, I argue that the use of Postinor-2 by Indonesian youth does not only based on the intention to prevent pregnancy, but also to diminish their uncertainties and doubts. An anxious statement such “although we already used a condom and counted my fertile days, is it necessary to take postinor too?” show that the lack of information about contraceptive methods influences youths' use of Postinor-2. This lack of information mainly derived from the common assumption attached to contraception, in which contraceptive methods often perceived as only accessed by married, adult persons. This common assumption also affects youths' purchase of Postinor-2. While legally Postinor-2 can only obtain with a medical prescription, many online drug stores sell Postinor-2 without requiring a prescription. Since youths purchase Postinor-2 without prescription, an interactive consultation with a medical doctor is absent. Instead of consulting with a doctor, youths who intend to obtain Postinor-2 gain their knowledge on it by reading the experience of other Postinor-2's users, particularly in regard to its indication and contraindication. In this paper, I formulate the preliminary analysis by incorporating the conceptual framework from the anthropological study of the body in order to understand how youths' bodily use of Postinor-2 to overcome their anxiety by rendering them efficacious.

*Keywords: Emergency contraceptive, Indonesian youth, anxiety, experience, anthropology of body*

SOMADRIL, “MAINANNYA PEREMPUAN”

*Fajriani Amin*

*Universitas Muslim Maros*

While the state is aggressively fighting against *narkoba*, and although other kinds of medicines are also consumed by youth and become addictive. Prescription drugs are increasingly consumed by youth for various purposes, particularly for high. One of the most popular prescription drugs consumed by teenagers is Somadril. This article explores how Somadril consumption differs by gender and how the consumption of drugs is related to femininity and masculinity.

This research was conducted in the city of Makassar, a metropolitan city with a myriad of many social problems, including the use of prescription drugs, such as Somadril. There are participants





in this study, comprising seven women and men respectively. Data was collected using in-depth interview and observation.

This study indicates that although Somadril is consumed by male and female youth, its use is more identical to women than men. For women, Somadril is significantly important in their daily lives, so they always try to get it to make them happy, to get along comfortably, and to easily express their feelings, especially if they have problems. While for men Somadril was consumed solely because they are offered by their female friends and the presence/absence of Somadril does not affect their daily lives. This shows that Somadril is a social medicine for both men and women. Among fellow men, their main drug is narcotics. From a male perspective, Somadril is "women's toy" and enhancing women's sexual desire, while *narkoba* is "men's toy" since taking *narkoba* is not only for high, but also indicating their masculinity. For women, even though they consume Somadril, they still maintain their femininity, which is expressed by not consuming extreme drugs such as *narkoba* simply because they are considered too naughty and excessive. Somadril has a sleepy effect for both men and women. However, for women sleepiness is not a significant problem and can be tolerated, while for men the effects of sleepiness are very disturbing and make them unproductive, especially for men who often work late at night.

"FIT ON THE BODY, FIT FOR THE POCKET":

INTERNAL CODE, EFFECT OF CHEMICAL USE, AND TRIAL PRACTICES AMONG YOUTH IN MAROS, SOUTH  
SULAWESI

Muhaiminatul Ajriani

Universitas Muslim Maros

Misuse of prescription drugs for non-medical problems is increasingly widespread. Users are dominated by youth, and this is not only spread in big cities, but also in districts level, such as Maros. Consumption of prescription drugs has become a part of the daily lives of many youth in Maros and has become an open secret in the wider community. How they maintain their confidentiality in such practice is the the focus of this article.

The study was conducted in Maros, South Sulawesi, between March and August 2018. There are 16 male youth participants in this study, whose age ranging between 13 and 23 years. Data was collected using the the combination of in-depth interview and observation.

The research findings show that they use internal codes in the practice of chemical use, and they include products, actors and activities in order to maintain confidentiality as their main concern. Chemicals are not only used for fun, but also as a form of solidarity among their peers. Therefore, they use certain codes, which includes codes of products, actors and activities. The product code consists of four categories: *harkos* (for glue), *ocang* (for psychotropic), *pulsa* (for shabu) and *getok* (for marijuana). The actor code consists of five categories, consisting of "doctors" (who offer products), patients (product buyers), and those who offer services, such as launchers ("doctors" re-sellers), couriers, and *banpol* (police spies). The codefor activities are varied according to the purpose (i.e. to invite for using chemicals, to ask about availability of the products). Hierarchically, *harkos* users are in the lowest hierarchy (cheap drunkenness), followed by *ocang* users. *Pulsa* users ranks in the top hierarchy, considering that the drugs included in this category is narcotics and are relatively more expensive than the other two types of products. In the process of finding suitable products, they experiment various kind of products. Factors such as expected effect,



social environment, and financial conditions play an important role in the selection of products. Some switch from one product to another because such products have been socially known. Others products suitable for the body, but not suitable for the pocket, and therefore they mix two types of cheap products to get the same effect from one type of expensive drug. The best product is one which "fit on the body, fit for the pocket".

*SINTE'*: REASONS, SELF-CONTROL, AND REPENTANCE

M. Akbar Alamsyah

Universitas Hasanuddin

The circulation and development of narcotics continues to grow significantly throughout the world. Synthetic marijuana, known locally as *sinte'*, is one of the "new narcotics" types that are becoming a worldwide phenomenon, including in Indonesia. Synthetic marijuana is not a type of cannabis plant, but tobacco mixed with certain chemicals to have an effect similar to marijuana. While much of the literature on marijuana refers to the abuse of marijuana that is included in the narcotics list of Narcotics Law, this article focuses on the use of synthetic marijuana. It explores the reasons for use, how they control themselves and how their repentance processes occur.

The study, which was conducted in Makassar, the capital city of South Sulawesi, was carried out in 2017 involving 13 youth who used to be drug users, drug users, and drugs users as well as drug dealer. They consisted of nine male students and two female students whose age range between 20 and 23 years, and who consumed and are consuming synthetic marijuana. They were recruited by snowball sampling. Data was collected using in-depth interviews.

The study shows that drug users do not know for sure what is synthetic marijuana (*sinte'*), and/or try to find out more about the item. They use *sinte'* for a variety of reasons, namely to get a relaxed sensation, to have fun, or to stimulate creativity. Time, place and with whom *sinte'* is used depend on the purpose of its use. To be relax, for example, they choose a more private place, for fun to use with friends and to stimulate work, they use *sinte'* before or during work. In the process, they realise that *sinte'* is relatively dangerous not only for health, but also because it has narcotics like effect. They have several ways for self-control in order to anticipate the potential effects, such as dripping eyes by using eye drop or not using *sinte'* to look after friends which is under the influence of the *sinte'*. Intense and long-term use, making the majority of drug users stop using *sinte'* partly because of their own experience and/or witnessing the effects experienced by their fellow users. *Sinte'* has become a symbol of masculinity and is related to how far one can control himself and his peers from the effect of *sinte'*. It is argued that the use of synthetics marijuana is strongly influenced by social environment, both from the beginning of using *sinte'* and the cause of terminating the use of *sinte'*.

BEAUTY PRODUCTS AND SOCIAL EXISTENCE

Nur Pratiwi

Universitas Muslim Maros

While we use various chemicals every day, many of us are even unaware of it. In our daily consumption, we use chemical products from primary to the secondary needs, including the needs for social existence. Many consumers nowadays are prioritizing the fulfillment of their secondary



needs than their primary ones for their existence and use various chemical products. While many existing literatures deal with the use of chemical products to enhance beauty and one's persona for their work such as an actress, dancer, or performer in the specific research area, this article deals with how youth consume beauty products in order to be socially existed.

This study was conducted in Makassar. There were 10 participants involved in this study and they were all adolescent whose age ranging between 18 and 23 years. Data were collected using in-depth interview and observation.

The study shows how youth's subjective norms and believe are shaped by their social environment, and this encourage them to enhance their beauty in order to "fit in", to be accepted and to be existed in their social circle. While most of them are aware of the long term effect of chemical contained in these beauty products, their obsession to enhance their beauty is stronger. When they consider that they already fulfill the society's beauty standard, such as having slimmer body, whiter teeth and/or brighter skin, this has enhanced their self confident. Through this outer performance, they consider that they have been socially existed. Thus, they start exposing themselves through social media (i.e. selfie), hanging around with friends, making more friends, etc. This is like the ugly duckling turn Cinderella effect with this beauty product and some chemical contained as the fairy godmother. However, as in the Cinderella fairy tale, the effect doesn't last forever. It is arguing in this article that outer performance has played helps in enhancing one's self-confident as well as help one to be socially existed

*Keywords: Chemicals, social existence, beauty products, and social standard*

TOTALITY IN COSPLAYING

*Riska Tahir*

*Universitas Hasanuddin*

Cosplay is a type of Japan's soft power that is used to spread their popular culture around the world, including Indonesia. This unique popular culture has become one of the most popular youth cultures in Makassar. In general, cosplay is an activity of wearing costumes resembling fictional characters, in the form of characters such as anime, cartoons, games, movies, etc., by imitating all aspects of the character being cosplayed, including the appearance and behavior of the cosplayed characters. This article deals with how cosplayers try to appear totally in cosplaying.

This research was conducted in Makassar between February and October 2017. The study involved ten cosplayers, consisting of five female and male respectively. Their age is between 20 and 25 years, and from various relevant organization. In-depth interview is combined with observation as my data collection techniques.

The study indicates that desire to have fun, to express themselves and to add more friends have become the main reasons why youth do cosplaying. Totality is an important point for cosplayers. In order to be totally in cosplaying, three aspects have to be taken into account: costumes, wigs, and make up. For costumes, cosplayers display their totality in choosing handmade and elaborate costumes, and make it as detail as possible as the look of the original character. For wigs, cosplayers spend a lot of time in the process of styling (forming) in order to be as closely as possible with the hair of the cosplayed character. For make-up, cosplayers use various types of cosmetics and non-cosmetics to get a look that resembles a cosplayed character. It is argued that totality does not only combine the three main aspects in presenting themselves as cosplayers, but



totality is also associates with sincerity, dedication, and self-enlightenment, as well as the complexity, the method, the authenticity, the details and the process in integrating all three aspects of totality in cosplaying.