AN UNDESIRED IMPLICATION FROM GLOBALIZATION: ISIS, AN ADAPTIVE THREAT IN A DORMANT PHASE

Abel Josafat Manullang
Universitas Padjadjaran, abeljosafat@gmail.com

Raden AP Wicaksono
Universitas Padjadjaran, rdagungprio@gmail.com

Arfin Sudirman
Universitas Padjadjaran, arfin.sudirman@unpad.ac.id

AN UNDESIRED IMPLICATION FROM GLOBALIZATION: ISIS, AN ADAPTIVE THREAT IN A DORMANT PHASE

Abel Josafat Manullang, Raden Agung Prio Wicaksono, & Arfin Sudirman

Universitas Padjadjaran

Email: abeljosafat@gmail.com

ABSTRAK

Globalisasi telah membawa berbagai perubahan ke dunia. Namun, perubahan dan kemajuan tersebut juga dinikmati oleh kelompok teroris, salah satunya adalah ISIS yang menggunakan hal-hal tersebut pada aksi terornya. Artikel ini bertujuan untuk memahami bagaimana ISIS telah beradaptasi dan berkembang sebagai akibat dari globalisasi. Artikel ini menggunakan metode penelitian kualitatif dengan menggunakan konsep dan teori seperti globalisasi, terorisme, dan teori James D. Kiras mengenai bagaimana globalisasi memengaruhi kapasitas terorisme. Artikel ini fokus membahas pada tiga perkara, yakni terkait ISIS sebagai ancaman terhadap keamanan nasional dan internasional, bagaimana ISIS berkembang sebagai dampak dari globalisasi, serta bagaimana terlepas dari kondisinya sekarang, ISIS tetaplah ancaman yang patut diwaspadai. Artikel ini menemukan bahwa pertama, ISIS merupakan ancaman yang unik karena kapasitasnya untuk beradaptasi dengan globalisasi dan perhatiannya terhadap penguasaan wilayah. Perhatiannya pada penguasaan wilayah mendorongnya untuk memanfaatkan kapasitasnya yang telah berkembang untuk memperkuat kontrol di area yang telah dikuasainya. Selanjutnya, kapasitas ISIS pada aspek mobilitas, letalitas, menyebarkan pengaruhnya, koordinasi, dan keamanan. Kemudian, terlepas dari kondisinya kini, komunitas internasional masih dihadapkan dengan sisa-sisa ISIS serta kemungkinan bangkitnya ISIS.

Kata kunci: *Ancaman Non-negara, Globalisasi, ISIS, Keamanan, Terorisme*

ABSTRACT

Globalization has brought about numerous changes to the world. However, those changes and advances have also been enjoyed by terrorist groups, one of them is ISIS which uses those things in its terror acts. This article seeks to explain how ISIS has adapted and enhanced its capacity as a result of globalization. Apart from employing the qualitative research method, this article also uses concepts and theories like terrorism, globalization, and James D. Kiras's theory on how globalization enhances terrorism. This article would then proceed to the three matters of ISIS as a threat to national and international security, how ISIS has developed as a result of globalization, and how despite its current state, it is still a threat to reckon with. First, ISIS has shown its uniqueness as a terrorist group in its capacity to adapt to globalization and concern with territories. The latter pushed it to utilize the former to strengthen its grasp on the territories it has taken over. Moving on, ISIS has grown in its mobility, lethality, proselytizing, coordination, and security. Finally, despite its decline, the international community is left with ISIS's remnants as well as the prospect of its reemergence.

Keywords: *Globalization, ISIS, Non-state Threat, Security, Terrorism*

INTRODUCTION

The emergence of globalization in the world is forcing states in the world to face a new reality. The rapid development of transportation, information, and communication technology is increasingly blurring the boundaries that previously limited human movement. These blurred boundaries can then be subtly interpreted as meaning that physical boundaries between states are not so important anymore because these boundaries are no longer limiting many human movements and types of interactions (McGrew, 2020; Mohanty et al., 2018). This renewal due to globalization has had a tremendous impact on the world. Access to information is more effortless, moving from one location to another is getting easier and faster, and globalization brings many more conveniences.

Unfortunately, the many advances and changes globalization has brought have also been enjoyed by actors like terrorist groups. One group, in particular, is ISIS. Globalization has allowed ISIS to thrive as a transnational non-state actor threatening numerous security dimensions, from national to international. The existence of ISIS is increasingly known to establish an Islamic caliphate, or a state ruled by Muslim rulers worldwide. It aims to eradicate other states that use modern state systems with substantial technological utilization worldwide (Widiatmaja & Rizqi, 2019). They also then show a very high level of aggressiveness, more aggressive than any other terrorist group in the world, with various kinds of attacks that they claim to spread terror throughout the world, such as lethal attacks on a big state like the United States and this is then used as an inspiration for other terror groups in carrying out their actions (Cengiz et al., 2022). Furthermore, ISIS is known for spreading of videos of brutal jihadists executing captives on the internet to spread further terror and gain legitimacy for their power and existence (Cengiz et al., 2022; History, 2017). The existence of ISIS is a continuing problem for Al-Qaeda, which had collapsed a few years earlier.

Amid globalization, ISIS has remained a delicate threat to many states. This is apparent in the many instances ISIS has conducted terror acts, either directly or indirectly, in numerous countries outside the Middle East. It is also not a rare case that many of those terror acts were done by the people who live in those countries. They did so due to ISIS's strong influence through the internet that transcends traditional boundaries. Its capacity to do so is one of the things that make it a formidable threat for states to overcome even following its decline. This statement can be seen in research by Kibtiah and Yustikaningrum (2018) titled "ISIS Defeat in The Middle East: Its Impact on The Increase of ISIS Power in Southeast Asia," which shows that despite its decline, ISIS remains a prevalent threat in other regions, including Southeast

Asia. As a result of its influence that transcends traditional borders (where it utilizes social media to amplify its influence), ISIS managed to blend in with terrorist groups in Indonesia and the Philippines, in which it also built up its members. As apparent in the research, its relevance shows how it has adapted well and remained a threat to the states mentioned earlier.

Against the backdrop of ISIS's enhanced capacity to conduct its terror acts as well as the threat it poses to national and international security, the article seeks to understand how and in what areas ISIS's capacities have grown. Moreover, examples of how it has grown due to globalization are also laid out. In doing so, the article also seeks to understand ISIS's identity as a threat to security and the threat it currently poses, considering its decline.

ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK

Terrorism and Globalization

Defining terrorism with certainty is very difficult because of the broad range of meanings and developments in terrorism. Even so, several previous studies have provided their views on this matter. One perspective from Bruce Hoffman (2017) defines *terrorism* as "the deliberate creation and exploitation of fear through violence or the threat of violence in the pursuit of political change." Another view on this came from Martha Crenshaw & Gary LaFree (2017), that defines it as "a method or strategy of violence, not tied to any particular political actor or type of actor," they continue by referring to the definition of terrorism from Global Terrorism Database, that "the threatened or actual use of illegal force and violence by non-state actors to attain a political, economic, religious, or social goal through fear, coercion, or intimidation.". Regardless of the many definitions, an essential feature of the rise of terrorism in the 21st century is how states have struggled to face it. It can be seen in how states have used their set of anachronistic measures, an inheritance from the Cold War, against terrorism (Cronin, 2002). The nascent, albeit enhanced, characteristic of terrorism as a non-state can be pointed to as its primary source. Globalization is an important background factor in the rise of this new non-state threat (Zimmermann, 2011).

Similar to terrorism, globalization also has a vast meaning due to various related things. Steger (2020) views this broadly as a multidimensional set of expanding and intensifying social relations, consciousness, and interdependencies worldwide. Another view also came from Campbell et al. (2010), that see globalization as "a complex web of social processes that intensify and expand worldwide economic, cultural, political and technological exchanges and connections." From these definitions, at first glance, globalization strengthens global

interconnectedness that renders traditional boundaries somewhat obsolete. However, such a positive image does not thoroughly understand globalization.

Globalization allows non-state actors, including terrorist groups, to procure weapons and their components to fuel their terror acts from abroad. A good example is the access to international or foreign markets where they can obtain sophisticated armament or other components. This phenomenon also allows the proliferation of the capacity to engage in terror acts. From this, it can be seen that there are several aspects where terrorism has been enhanced by globalization. The aspects mentioned above are proselytizing, coordination, security, mobility, and lethality, as laid out by James D. Kiras (2020). The theory that James D. Kiras posited connects terrorism and globalization. Apart from seeing the two on their own, Kiras believes that globalization is essential in enhancing terrorists' capacities in numerous fields. From that connection, globalization also affects terrorism, enhancing its capacity to inflict terror.

Proselytizing refers to how globalization, through the vast networks of communication technologies and the internet, empowers terrorists in their growth. The growth refers to how the group can grow by attracting new members. Coordination points to how terrorist groups can coordinate their terror acts despite the distance between their staging base and the designated areas. The communication technologies that have been made more accessible due to globalization, like phones, radios, and emails, allowed the terrorist groups to coordinate their attack either in separate locations or in a convergent manner. Security is another area in which globalization has benefited terrorist groups. What is meant by that is how the technological advances brought about by globalization, like encryption technology, has also supported terrorist in their activities. In this case, the technological advancements allow them to remain challenging to track and maintain their anonymity, especially in their activities throughout the net, either in communicating with other members or engaging with their soon-to-be volunteers. These technological advancements are also seen in their encryption software that keeps their messages encrypted, making them only readable by ISIS fellow members.

Another area globalization affect is the mobility of terrorist groups. In this aspect, globalization makes international travel, primarily through international flights and other means of transportation, more accessible and cheaper. The ease of travel makes it viable for terrorist groups to not only widen the scope of their operations but also allow them to interact with other terrorist groups. The final aspect of terrorism that globalization affects is lethality. As previously mentioned, globalization allows the ease of movement and communication that

nullifies traditional borders and other hindrances. This ease of movement and communication allows them to procure deadlier arms they could use in their acts of terror. Aside from physical armament, terrorists can also conduct their teachings on practical terror skills or propaganda through the internet. Through this, those terrorists can make themself more globalized or allow them to spread their values to a broader audience or candidates for their terror campaigns.

RESEARCH METHOD

The article employs a qualitative research method in providing its analysis. The qualitative research method can be understood as a method that allows the researcher or writer to examine events, phenomena, and other matters to give more depth (Lamont, 2015). The method is chosen to generate analysis and contentions qualitatively from the procured data (Bryman, 2008). Document and internet-based research, in the form of previous studies and cases, is the mode of collecting the needed data to proceed with the analysis. Relevant concepts like terrorism and globalization are also included in the analysis. The article will focus on the following points regarding ISIS's identity as a threat to international security, how it has adapted and grown with globalization, and the troubling traces it left behind for the international community.

DISCUSSION

Breaking The Fork on The Road: ISIS's Uniqueness as An Actor

As a terrorist group, ISIS is quite the distinct one that sets it apart from other categories of terrorist groups. It has developed and adapted itself to the dynamic international system, like the many changes brought about by globalization. What is meant by that is how ISIS has utilized the many fruits of globalization (information, communication, transportation technology advances) in its terror campaigns. A notable example is how ISIS has used information technology to spread its actions and ideology to the attention of many people around the globe (Wood, 2015). Because of that, it is no surprise that back then, ISIS would make it to the headlines of countless media coverages worldwide and even take the spotlight for state deliberation over efforts to eradicate it. Given its capacity, it is crucial to understand ISIS as a threat to global security. In understanding its capacity as another threat to global security, it is essential to consider some aspects, like its identity, objective, and the response it has attracted.

Regarding its identity, ISIS can be seen as another example of modern or new terrorism. What makes it different from the previous waves of traditional terrorism lies in the capacity and area of operations (Chermak & Freilich, 2016). Traditional terrorism can be understood as terrorist groups that operate with considerable capacities, albeit not to the military level, and have a limited scope of their base of operations. The two features result in its actions' limited impact as they would not have significant effects beyond national borders. ISIS, as an example of modern terrorism, has more enormous capacities to conduct its terror campaign as well as to execute them across borders. More detailed elaborations on that will be provided in the following sections. Another attribute of its identity worth noting is its concern with territories (Radil & Pinos, 2019). This territory is another area of divergence from previous kinds of terrorism, which tend to disperse quickly following its strikes. ISIS's concern with territories is also connected to its objective.

As a terrorist group, ISIS has a unique trait resulting from its objective, which is the construction of a caliphate, an ISIS caliphate, to be specific. In short, ISIS seeks to establish an Islamic state which requires it to procure lands or territories (Lister, 2015). Such objective results from the spread of belief imbued with its radical interpretation of religious values. Unlike other terrorist groups that prefer to remain mobile or not establish themselves in one specific area, ISIS did the opposite back then. Its interest in establishing an Islamic state is the driving force for its confrontations with states. Through its militant forces, ISIS managed to overrun Iraq's military and gain control of numerous cities in Syria (BBC, 2014). In those cities, ISIS also took charge as the overarching authority over those living there. Through such conduct, ISIS has made itself appear like a state or a unit in the international system (Siegel, 2014). In seeing them as a "state," ISIS has two components that somewhat support its identity: its territory (along with the authority it established) and its military force, which has proved to be quite a threat as it has taken over numerous cities. Moreover, this particular trait remains persistent despite its decline. As reported in the 2023 Global Terrorism Index, there have been reports of ISIS captured and controlled territories in Northern Iraq (Institute for Economics and Peace, 2023).

In responding to ISIS, the US, one of the most active states in the dynamics of the Middle East, has made numerous attempts to deal with the terrorist group. In its approach, the US has relied mainly on traditional or military-based approaches. In fact, ISIS is one of the terrorist groups the US has been dealing with in its Global War on Terror campaign. As mentioned before, ISIS is not like the traditional terrorist groups that would succumb in the

face of heavy armaments or military operations. ISIS, as a novel threat both towards global security and as a terrorist group, would be something that not only proves how traditional means of counterterrorism that rely on a militaristic approach is insufficient but also show how even with the eradication of the terrorist group (especially using the aforementioned traditional counterterrorism), global security is still at risk with the mess left behind.

A Sophisticated Actor in The Midst of a Globalizing World

Apart from its unique character as a non-state actor in the international system, another noteworthy trait of ISIS is its adaptability to globalization. Globalization allows the rapid exchange of ideas and goods globally through technological advancements. States have taken advantage of it to develop itself and its capacity to deal with nascent threats brought along by globalization. Just like what globalization brings to the table for states, it also opens up many opportunities for the conduct of terrorism.

As explained in the previous section, Kiras's explanation (2020) regarding the five aspects globalization has brought to terrorist groups would be present in how ISIS conducts its activities in the international system. The way ISIS has adapted and used developments brought by globalization makes it possible for them to be immortalized in the virtual world of the internet. This capacity contrasts with traditional terrorism, where it is easy to eradicate its presence through death or imprisonment. The differences do not stop there; while it is true that traditional terrorism also has some international or globalized features, it is limited to only its neighboring states or regional landscape. As mentioned above, globalization allows contemporary or present-day terrorist groups to perform beyond their traditional counterparts. In this sense, despite how they also benefited through globalization, states are struggling to effectively tackle this new threat that lurking around the international system, making it a threat to global security.

ISIS has also shown how it can attract countless sympathizers from all around the world through the internet. In using the internet as its hunting ground (Piazza & Guler, 2021), ISIS is also aware of the potential available in the forum and users across the net. For the latter, ISIS takes advantage of it through its capacity to manipulate the minds they caught on the internet that many people, even outside the Middle East, volunteer to fight for its cause. ISIS has established its recruitment institutions in the vast world of the internet with countless audiences, notably youngsters. That particular segment of society has been susceptible, partly due to their still-developing identities (Milevsky, 2014).

Moreover, over the many recruitments involving them, numerous social media with which they are no strangers has also been ISIS's recruitment channels, like Twitter, Ask.fm, Tumblr, and many others (Kaplan, 2015). Cases involving three girls from Denver who attempted to join ISIS can be understood through such channels. Unsurprisingly, with such conditions and ISIS's universal presence on the internet, even youth outside the region partake in its cause.

ISIS has also used the internet to attract volunteers and as an instrument in its lethal acts of terror. One of the ways it does this is through hacking US military accounts and leaking the personnel information so other members can attempt to hunt them down (Souza, 2015). More secure conduct also accompanies this lethality on its part. Past terror attacks like those in Paris and Brussels demonstrated how plans for those attacks were done without being detected (Cruickshank, 2017). Those acts of terror are not the end of the ISIS campaign; ISIS would also utilize them as publication materials to maintain its presence in cyberspace.

Moreover, ISIS also uses the internet to spread information about its activity. The purpose is to gain publicity and attention, especially from the international community, of what ISIS is doing. Twitter is one of the social media ISIS uses to publish its views and attract volunteers. ISIS also attempted to provide an alternative image from those provided by media outlets through social media, one of which is called Mujatweets (Anti-Defamation League, 2014). ISIS would also attempt to project itself as the ideal Islamic state, where it would spread its take on Islamic values in its social media content. There also exists a more blatant propaganda of them where ISIS would call out people to join in its cause by showcasing its armed or military capacity. The many faces and views ISIS has would be of great use in its attempts to attract volunteers. This way is also to say that, despite the numerous negative media framings and coverages on ISIS, ISIS could offset it through direct (though done through the internet) interaction with its soon-to-be volunteers. That way, ISIS could better project itself by manipulating and socializing its radical values to its targets (Windsor, 2020).

Table 1. Areas affected by Globalization which ISIS made use of

	Affected Areas	Enhancements
ISIS	Coordination	Improve communication in the conduct of the terror act.
	Security	Keeping information regarding its terror act safe/encrypted.
	Proselytizing	Immortalize themselves on the internet and gather followers.
	Mobility	Able to conduct its acts abroad.
	Lethality	Able to produce advanced armaments and materials.

Source: Author

In the case of its proselytizing, many ISIS attacks taking place in the US can be used as a good example. In some cases, many ISIS sympathizers claimed to have sworn their loyalty to ISIS following their encounter with them and their values on the internet. From that interaction, ISIS gained access to conduct terror, albeit indirectly, in foreign lands. Although the attacks were not made in one huge assault, as one or two individuals carried it out in a case, it showed how strongly ISIS can influence its prey. The damage could vary from taking no victim at all to more than 100 people in a single attack like the one in Orlando in 2016 (Sonawane, 2016). While the damage did vary, it still did the job of spreading fear and giving ISIS attention, as apparent in media coverage.

Encryption plays a vital role in providing security for ISIS. Since encryption has been increasingly embedded in electronic devices and messaging apps, it has become something that terrorist groups like ISIS use. Such a feature would keep their information sharing a secret, even from third-party interception (Graham, 2016). Hence, it is unsurprising that ISIS has been using encrypted apps for its proselytizing needs. In its operational planning and execution, ISIS has also included encryption software like *TrueCrypt* and apps like *CCleaner* to erase any communication trace (Ratliff, 2016).

Regarding to its lethality, ISIS has procured armament from numerous channels abroad. ISIS would use its mediators with fake identities to conduct transactions and even make payments through international payment channels (Falk, 2020). The weapons it procured could range from small arms to even artilleries used in its terror acts. Apart from procuring armament, ISIS's lethality can also be seen in its capacity to use the internet to provide lessons or tutorials on building explosive devices. A recent arrest of an ISIS sympathizer in May 2023 in Italy is an excellent example, where the authority found videos on making explosive devices and weapon manuals (Fox News, 2023).

Mobility also plays avital role in terror acts ISIS partakes in, either directly or indirectly. ISIS has made use of vehicles in its ground assaults in order to improve its mobility on the field. A good example is the battle in Jalula, Iraq, where it gained the upper hand due to massing its forces quickly, thanks to its mobility (Gunter & Zagros, 2020). Similar to its enhanced lethality, it has also used international channels to procure vehicles (Kumar, 2015). The ease of international travel allows people to travel by sea or the sky across the globe. People from numerous countries have traveled to Iraq and Syria to join ISIS, resulting from its successful proselytizing.

Communication and coordination are essential parts of ISIS activities. Nowadays, communication can quickly be done considering the ease of access to purchase communication devices and the presence of the internet. It also allows ISIS to coordinate its actions while overcoming traditional barriers easily. It is no surprise, therefore, that some terror acts may happen in countries outside the Middle East, yet ISIS still claims responsibility for it. The 2016 attack on Brussels Airport can an example (CBS News, 2016). Moreover, as previously explained, the presence of encryption software also allows them to coordinate with little to no fear of being intercepted.

As elaborated above, despite bringing in many opportunities to combat the new non-state threats like terrorist groups, globalization also increased its capacity to a much higher level. Eventually, it posed a threat to the international system. The manner in which ISIS, in particular, has taken advantage of the fruits of globalization should demand an innovative way for states to tackle it.

The Footprint Left Behind in The International System

Now, as the US has inflicted damages on ISIS both in its structural and general presence, ISIS is only a shadow of its former self. However, it is incorrect to consider them gone or eradicated from the world. It is safe to consider that ISIS has scaled back its presence and influence only in Iraq and Syria. Even so, its presence there is considered relatively dormant and pale compared to its former capacity (Asharq Al-Awsat, 2017). There may still be fear among governments, but it has also been taken care of with some diplomatic works done with the US government to station a handful of units. However, despite its current state, it is also essential to look into its legacy and what it has left behind for the present international system.

As elaborated before, ISIS has attracted countless volunteers from across the globe. Many volunteers came from states that do not recognize or outlaw their citizens from participating in unsanctioned groups like ISIS. At times, there would even be sympathizers who went as far as to burn their passports, which can be taken as a gesture that showed how they no longer care or value their citizenship to their former homeland (Nasution, 2020). However, such action was taken back when ISIS was still growing. When ISIS finally ceased to exist in its former capacity or state of existence, many of its volunteers became stateless. With no way of returning home, most stay in refugee camps across Syria and Iraq (Luquerna, 2020).

Considering many refugees' status as former ISIS volunteers or sympathizers, the camps where they reside can be considered radicalism hotspots. Suppose the issue of ISIS refugee camps is not appropriately handled. In that case, it will not only be a manure pile for the hosting state in the future but also for the international community and global security. One of the most prominent ISIS refugee camps in Syria is the al-Hol Camp which is home to thousands of ISIS foreign fighters or sympathizers. Many of them are living in the camps with no way of returning to their home country. In early 2019 alone, there were already more than 74.000 residing there (Ahmad & Darwich, 2021). This condition is caused by how the related governments perceive them as a threat if they were to be brought back and integrated into society. Moreover, many of the inhabitants of the refugee camp have been brainwashed beyond the point of no return.

Given the state of the problem, it is not a good move to leave it as it is. Primarily as doing so may provide the leeway to threaten Syria's national and global security. Against that backdrop, necessary measures must be taken to handle the issue. Deradicalization efforts have been one of the ways local authorities use in taking care of the refugee camp (Speckhard & Ellenberg, 2020). The program aims to deradicalize the refugees, especially the women, and children, so they can eventually be integrated into society. However, for the goal to materialize, it would be daunting for the hosting states. This is because the entire deradicalization scheme would take up vast amounts of resources, not which most hosting states could not provide on a whim as they also have other matters to take care of. Such was the case of Syria, as apart from the issue of ISIS refugee camps in its land, it is still in the middle of a civil war that already takes up many of its resources. (Martínez & Eng, 2017)

On top of that, the ongoing Covid-19 pandemic also has made things worse at the refugee camps by being another outbreak hotspot in Syria (Sisk, 2020). The government would not welcome the addition of more infection within Syria, considering how its healthcare system has been struggling in the face of the Covid-19 pandemic (Qaddour & Fallon, 2021). The international community, especially the hosting states, faces a conundrum dealing with the ISIS refugees. On the one hand, to keep caring of the refugees in the camp will not be a good plan in the long run as it would drain enormous resources that could have been used elsewhere (Azevedo, 2020). Moreover, looking at the bleak prospect for repatriation of the refugees and how many of them have yet to leave their faith in the ideology makes it difficult for the international community to decide what to do with them. On the other hand, not putting much thought into them in haphazard and quick measures would be a recipe for disaster. It would

allow those who have been influenced by the radical values of ISIS to roam free and spread its ideology to society.

Hence, despite the current state of ISIS, taking care of the mess it has left behind is another work the international community must address. Indeed, ISIS is no longer in its past capacity to conduct terror acts that could attract worldwide sympathizers (Tulga, 2022). Unfortunately, as shown in the many ISIS refugee camps across Syria and Iraq, the mess it has brought must be handled thoroughly. If the international community refrains from addressing the issue properly, it may become another breeding ground for radicalism or, at worst, the reemergence of ISIS.

CONCLUSION

In summary, as a threat to national and international security, ISIS can be seen as so considering its capacity to conduct its terror acts across traditional boundaries and how it was also concerned with controlling territories, unlike other terrorist groups. The two traits mentioned above result from its adaptation to globalization, leading to its enhanced capacity. Its enhanced capacities are apparent in ISIS's mobility, coordination, security, proselytizing, and lethality. ISIS's proselytizing capacity can be seen in how it utilizes the internet to spread its influence worldwide. Regarding mobility, ISIS has used international channels to procure vehicles and their components. Security-wise, ISIS has used encryption software, a notable one is TrueCrypt, which allows them to communicate safely. Aside from its capacity to procure communication devices, this is important in its coordination. As for its lethality, it can be seen in how it can procure armament as well as spread information on how to construct and operate it. Moving on, while it is true that ISIS has declined in the past few years, its remnants remain a problem to be taken care of. Especially given the possibility that should the problem be left untreated; it may provide a leeway for ISIS to re-emerge. In the coming times, more studies can be done on this matter. One, in particular, can be done in assessing how sanctioned non-state actors like NGOs and international organizations may partake in the effort to fight terrorism.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Ahmad, J., & Darwich, S. (2021). *Al-Hol Camp: Release, Return, and Reintegration of Syrian residents.* Berlin: IMPACT Civil Society Research and Development. Retrieved from IMPACT Research: https://impactres.org/al-hol-camp/#:~:text=By%20early%202019%2C%20Al-Hol%20camp%20housed%20almost%2074%2C000,5906%20Syrians%2C%20and%20

Anti-Defamation League. (2014). *Hashtag Terror: How ISIS Manipulates Social Media.* New York: Anti-Defamation League Center on Extremism. Retrieved from Anti-Defamation League Report: https://www.adl.org/resources/report/hashtag-terror-how-isis-manipulates-social-media

Asharq Al-Awsat. (2017, December 17). *ISIS Dormant Cells Pave Way for Open US Presence in Iraq.* Retrieved from Asharq Al-Awsat: https://english.aawsat.com//home/article/1117636/isis-dormant-cells-pave-way-open-us-presence-iraq

Azevedo, C. V. de. (2020). ISIS Resurgence in Al Hawl Camp and Human Smuggling Enterprises in Syria: Crime and Terror Convergence?. *Perspectives on Terrorism, 14*(4), 43-63. Retrieved from https://pt.icct.nl/article/isis-resurgence-al-hawl-camp-and-human-smuggling-enterprises-syria-crime-and-terror

BBC. (2014). *Syria conflict: Isis 'overruns' Raqqa Military Base*. Retrieved from BBC News: https://www.bbc.com/news/world-middle-east-28481283

Bryman, A. (2008). Social Research Methods (3rd Ed.) New York: Oxford University Press.

Campbell, P. J., MacKinnon, A., & Stevens, C. R. (2010). *An Introduction to Global Studies.* New Jersey: Wiley-Blackwell Publishing.

CBS News. (2016). *Brussels attacks: Photo, wanted notice released for suspect*, *CBS News*. Retrieved from CBS News: https://www.cbsnews.com/news/brussels-attacks-isis-claims-responsibility-deadly-bombings-airport-subway/.

Cengiz, M., et al. (2022). The ISIS Model and its Influence Over Global Terrorism. *European Scientific Journal, 18*(7), 14-35. doi:10.19044/esj.2022.v18n7p14

Chermak, S. M., & Freilich, J. D. (2016). *Transnational Terrorism*. New York: Routledge.

Crenshaw, M., & LaFree, G. (2017). *Countering Terrorism.* Washington, DC: Brookings Institution Press.

Cronin, A. K. (2002). Behind the Curve: Globalization and International Terrorism. *Quarterly Journal: International Security, 27*(3), 30-58. Retrieved from Belfer Center for Science and International Affairs: https://www.belfercenter.org/publication/behind-curve-globalization-and-international-terrorism

Cruickshank, P. (2017, October 30). *The inside story of the Paris and Brussels attacks*. Retrieved from CNN: https://edition.cnn.com/2016/03/30/europe/inside-paris-brussels-terror-attacks/index.html

Falk, T. O. (2020). *ISIS armed itself with deadly weapons while Turkey turned a blind eye.* Retrieved from InsideOver: https://www.insideover.com/terrorism/new-report-reveals-how-isis-got-its-weapons.html

Fox News. (2023). *Underage ISIS terrorist planned bomb attack in Northern Italy, authorities allege*. Retrieved from Fox News: https://www.foxnews.com/world/underage-isis-terrorist-planned-bomb-attack-northern-italy-authorities-allege

Graham, R. (2016). How Terrorists Use Encryption. *CTC Sentinel*, *9*(6), 20-25. Retrieved from Combating Terrorism Center at West Point: https://ctc.westpoint.edu/how-terrorists-use-encryption/

Gunter, M., & Zagros, N. (2020). *How formidable is ISIS?*. Retrieved from Middle East Policy Council: https://mepc.org/commentary/how-formidable-isis.

History. (2017, July 10). *ISIS*. Retrieved from History.com: https://www.history.com/topics/21st-century/isis

Hoffman, B. (2017). *Inside terrorism* (3rd ed.). New York: Columbia University Press.

Institute for Economics and Peace. (2023). *Global Terrorism Index 2023: Measuring the Impact of Terrorism*. Sydney: Institute for Economics and Peace.

Kaplan, R. (2015, March 10). *ISIS recruiting teenagers: Why the government is sounding the alarm*. Retrieved from CNBC News: https://www.cbsnews.com/news/isis-recruiting-teenagers-why-the-government-is-sounding-the-alarm/

Kibtiah, T. M., & Yustikaningrum, R. V. (2018). ISIS defeat in the Middle East: It's impact on the increase of ISIS power in the Southeast Asia (case study: The increasing number of ISIS member in Indonesia). *Journal of Strategic and Global Studies*, *1*(2), 43-65. doi:10.7454/jsgs.v1i2.1009.

Kiras, J. D. (2020). Terrorism and Globalization. in J. Baylis, S. Smith, & P. Owens, *The Globalization of World Politics: An Introduction to International Relations* (8th ed., pp. 449-465). New York: Oxford University Press.

Kumar, C. (2015). Islamic State of Iraq and Syria (ISIS) a Global Threat: International Strategy to Counter the Threat. *Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 1(4), pp. 345–353.

Lamont, C. (2015). *Research Methods in International Relations*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publishing.

Lister, T. (2015). *What does ISIS really want?*. Retrieved from CNN: https://edition.cnn.com/2015/12/11/middleeast/isis-syria-iraq-caliphate/index.html.

Luquerna, A. (2020). The Children of ISIS: Statelessness and Eligibility for Asylum under International Law. *Chicago Journal of International Law, 21*(1), 148-193. Retrieved from University of Chicago: https://chicagounbound.uchicago.edu/cjil/vol21/iss1/5

Martínez, J. C., & Eng, B. (2017). Struggling to perform the state: The politics of bread in the Syrian Civil War. *International Political Sociology, 11*(2), 130-147 doi:10.1093/ips/olw026

McGrew, A. (2020). Globalization and Global Politics. in J. Baylis, S. Smith, & P. Owens, *The Globalization of World Politics: An Introduction to International Relations* (pp. 19-33). Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Milevsky, A. (2014, September 8). *Why Are Teens Joining ISIS?*. Retrieved from HuffPost: https://www.huffpost.com/entry/why-are-teens-joining-isi_b_5773668

Mohanty, S., et al. (2018, December). *Irrelevant Borders: Perspectives of Globalization.* Retrieved from Research Gate:

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/329982271_Irrelevant_Borders_Perspectiv es_of_Globalization

Nasution, M. A. R. (2020). Repatriation Plan for ISIS Members of Indonesian Citizenship from Iraq and Syria to The Homeland in the National Security Perspective. in *Proceedings of 3rd International Conference on Strategic and Global Studies* (pp. 328-344). Jakarta.

Piazza, J. A., & Guler, A. (2021). The Online Caliphate: Internet Usage and ISIS Support in the Arab World. *Terrorism and Political Violence, 33*(6), 1256-1275. doi:10.1080/09546553.2019.1606801

Qaddour, A., & Fallon, K. (2021). *Covid-19: Compounding 10 Years of Health Crises in Syria.* Center for Strategic and International Studies. Retrieved from CSIS: https://www.csis.org/analysis/covid-19-compounding-10-years-health-crises-syria

Radil, S. M., & Pinos, J. C. (2019). Reexamining the Four Waves of Modern Terrorism: A Territorial Interpretation. *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism, 45*(4), 311–330. doi:10.1080/1057610x.2019.1657310.

Ratliff, E. (2016). *The strange origins of TrueCrypt, ISIS's favored encryption tool*. Retrieved from The New Yorker: https://www.newyorker.com/news/news-desk/the-strange-origins-of-truecrypt-isiss-favored-encryption-tool.

Siegel, J. (2014, October 22). *Has ISIS Peaked as a Military Power?* Retrieved from Daily Beast World | Turning Tide: https://www.thedailybeast.com/has-isis-peaked-as-a-military-power

Sisk, R. (2020, August 13). *COVID-19 Has Hit Syria's Biggest ISIS Prison Camp, US General Says*. Retrieved from Military.com: https://www.military.com/daily-news/2020/08/13/covid-19-has-hit-syrias-biggest-isis-prison-camp-us-general-says.html

Sonawane, V. (2016). *Full list of ISIS attacks in US*. Retrieved from International Business Times: https://www.ibtimes.com/isis-attacks-us-full-list-incidents-related-islamic-state-group-2452726.

Souza, R. D. (2015, November 23). *ISIS Releases Another Kill List of US Military and Security Officials*. Retrieved from Hackread.com: https://www.hackread.com/isis-leaks-us-military-security-officials-kill-list/

Speckhard, A., & Ellenberg, M. (2020). *Spontaneous deradicalization and the path to repatriate some ISIS members*. Retrieved from Homeland Security Today: https://www.hstoday.us/subject-matter-areas/counterterrorism/perspective-spontaneous-deradicalization-and-the-path-to-repatriate-some-isis-members/

Steger, M. B. (2020). *Globalization: A Very Short Introduction* (5th ed.). Oxford: Oxford Academic.

Tulga, A. Y. (2022). Hard and Soft Terrorism Concepts: The Case of ISIS. *Pakistan Journal of Terrorism Research*, *3*(2), 109-132. Retrieved from https://nacta.gov.pk/wp-content/uploads/2021/09/Hard-and-Soft-Terrorism-Concepts-The-Case-of-ISIS.pdf

Widiatmaja, A., & Rizqi, F. H. (2019). The Rise of Non-State Actors in Globalization and Democratization Era: Terrorist Group versus State Actors. *SentriS: Academic Journal of International Relations Students, 2*(2), 1-16. doi:10.26593/sentris.v2i2.4180.47-62

Windsor, L. (2020). The Language of Radicalization: Female Internet Recruitment to Participation in ISIS Activities. *Terrorism and Political Violence, 32*(3), 506-538. doi:10.1080/09546553.2017.1385457

Wood, G. (2015). *What ISIS really wants*. Retrieved from The Atlantic: https://www.theatlantic.com/magazine/archive/2015/03/what-isis-really-wants/384980/.

Zimmermann, E. (2011). Globalization and Terrorism. *European Journal of Political Economy, 27*(1), S152-S161. doi:10.1016/j.ejpoleco.2011.09.003