Recruitment Analysis Through Open Bidding Announcement in the Selection of Prospective Echelon II

Bhasir Azhzhahiri

Integrasi Tritama Cendikia, Jakarta, Indonesia; Indonesia

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/jbb

Recommended Citation
DOI: 10.20476/jbb.v19i3.1870
Available at: https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/jbb/vol19/iss3/8

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Faculty of Administrative Science at UI Scholars Hub. It has been accepted for inclusion in BISNIS & BIROKRASI: Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi dan Organisasi by an authorized editor of UI Scholars Hub.
Recruitment Analysis Through Open Bidding Announcement
in the Selection of Prospective Echelon II

BHASIR AZHZHAHIRI
Integrasi Tritama Cendikia, Jakarta, Indonesia
bhasir.azhzhahiri@gmail.com

Abstract. To get quality manpower, several phases of human resources management activity are needed. The initial phase of human resources management itself is started with recruiting to get eligible candidate. Currently the process of position fulfillment in government agency has been applying open position system, which is known as open bidding. Open position is a promise process that gives opportunity to employees outside the organization to hold position in the organization. The purpose of this system is to expand the scope of employee resources. Thus, the recruiting process in open tender that determines the candidate’s success can be categorized into selection phase. If this phase runs well, good quality human resources will be attained as the result.

Keywords: human resource management, recruitment, open bidding

INTRODUCTION

The attempt to get a competent and professional civil servant is needed in various human resources management activities. The steps include recruitment, selection, capacity building, compensation, rights and obligation implementation, reward and punishment, until employee dismissal. Those series of activities affect each other and the whole process in those steps is inseparable if we are to get a quality civil servant. In the initial step, a good human resources management is begun with recruitment system that may create prospective quality employees. In organization’s perspective, recruitment system is a process of finding the most talented and motivated people (Berman et al., 2006), because this is the initial process in selecting and getting the needed employee. Sondang (2008) argued that if an organization manages to select the right recruitment method, it will receive as consequence numerous applicants that meet the requirements to fill various positions in the organization. To run an effective recruitment process, there should be accurate and sustainable information on the number and qualification of individuals needed to undertake various main tasks and functions within the organization. Once these prospective employees acquired, they shall be provided with capacity building.

Getting state apparatus with sound quality is not an easy task, and so far it has not been completely achieved. There is prevailing impression in human resources recruitment, particularly when it comes to placement, that it is not done in accordance with the specification and competence of the task and position itself. Positioning, in brief, is not truly based on objective parameters. Violation in positioning is caused by several factors. First, civil servant placement into structural position that is done upon political consideration. Second, there is still a practice of civil servant placement into structural position that is done through sectoral ego which prioritizes the natives as the impact of local autonomy. Third, the remaining old paradigm, i.e. close relationship and shared value as the basis of placement (www.bkn.go.id). All the above indicate that placement in government institutions is not done professionally, and it even violates ethical considerations. Violation in placement may give impact to the quality of the person in charge in the position. A civil servant can be considered as of high quality if he possesses all the competence needed for a position.

In placement, it is very important to assess an
individual’s competence to figure out whether that particular individual is capable to undertake a task in a given position. Competence assessment is vital as it is the key and determinant factor for an individual to produce excellent performance. In collective situation, competence is the determining factor to the organization’s success (Sedarmayanti, 2010). The challenge is then how to ensure this placement process to run well to get a competent civil servant that is worth to be placed on that particular position. The government is ceaselessly taking measures to create a placement system that may result in excellent quality civil servant while still complying with the administrative requirements specified in the Indonesian Government Regulation No.100/2000 on Civil Servant Placement in Structural Position, which was already renewed with the Government Regulation No.13/2002 on Amendment of the Government Regulation No.100/2000.

The currently structural placement process implemented in institutions such as several ministries is open bidding system, in which any civil servant may offer his/her service for a position through bidding process. This process is a recruitment step used to get the name of prospective officials which truly meet the requirements and possess the needed quality to be selected and placed in a vacant structural position. Basically there is yet any terminology that explains the definition of open bidding, yet in simple manner, position open bidding may be defined as a structural placement system for a particular position that is done in open manner through recruitment process for civil servant working within and outside organization who want to offer his service for a vacant position in a government agency. In simpler term, it means that every civil servant has the right to offer his service for a vacant position as long as that person meets all the administrative requirements as specified in the Indonesian Government Regulation No.100/2000 on Civil Servant Placement in Structural Position which has been amended with the Government Regulation No.13/2002 on the Amendment of Government Regulation No.100/2000. Open bidding is done as alternative in filling the position while emphasizing on the applicant individual initiative (www.reform.depkeu.go.id).

The Ministry of State Apparatus Empowerment and Bureaucracy Reform (PAN and RB) as the mover of bureaucracy reform has applied a placement system with open system which is available not only to its own civil servant, but also for other officials/civil servants from other ministries. This open process is a placement model that really provides opportunity for officials from other ministry to offer their service in available position in the Ministry of PAN and RB. The difference lies between this system and the previous one is that this open process is a recruitment process that may accept human resources from other ministries. This open bidding recruitment system implies how an organization such as the Ministry of PAN and RB attempts to recruit employees from outside so that the organization can extend the scope of prospective employees to be recruited into it. Recruitment through open bidding is a new thing for the Ministry of PAN and RB, and it is expected to serve as example for other institution/agency that wants to apply the same system. The open bidding applied in the Ministry of PAN and RB is different with the previously closed system, in which prospective candidates consisted only of civil servants form the Ministry of PAN and RB itself. Open bidding of positions in the ministry aims to extend the scope of prospective candidates which is then later followed by selection process until a particular individual is accepted for a position or not. This recruitment process becomes very important as it is for the first time the Ministry of PAN and RB offers such positions to outsiders to serve as echelon II in the ministry. This recruitment determines the number of candidates that can go further into selection step. If this process runs well, the ministry as the result will get many applicants that already have proper quality.

Recruiting may be defined as the process of seeking, attracting and identifying a pool of qualified candidates in sufficient numbers to fill current and future work forces needs (Harvey and Bowin, 1996). The basic rule of recruitment system should be able to harmonize the organization’s different goals and policies and make it as advantage to achieve the organization’s goal (Rachmawati, 2008).

A good recruitment process should include the availability of information relating to the offered position to attract candidates who have the qualification (Yullianti, 2009). For this, a proper planning and strategy is needed. There are three steps that should be done in recruitment process: planning and approval of the position, preparation of the position announcement, and selection and use of specific strategies (Berman et all, 2006). Planning and approval for staffing includes two types of planning in a well-managed organization. First, organization should have the strategy concerning its future need, challenges, and opportunity of workforce recruitment. Second, organization should operate strategic plan before the recruitment process is undertaken (Berman, et all, 2006). Recruitment planning includes the estimated time needed, analysis on the position currently needed, which includes the minimum qualification needed for the job, determining number of position to be filled, and determining how to conduct the recruitment process. Preparation position announcement: after the recruitment planning, the next step is conducting preparation to announce the available
position or the posts needed to be filled. Currently there is yet any regulation on the minimum standard of information that should be provided in position announcement. In an announcement, information should be sufficiently complete. A high quality announcement standard should include: institution or organization’s name, description and responsibility of the job, the minimum qualification needed, application procedure, and equal work opportunity.

Another thing that shall be considered is the description of the works in the position or job offered. In recruitment, job vacancy often shows bias in describing the job itself. This leads people who actually have the skill and knowledge to be reluctant to apply due to the unspecific work description. Even more fatal is when the work description announced turns out to not really meet the needs of human resources expected from the job (Triyono, 2012). Recruitment strategies, on this step organization determines the method or strategy used in conducting recruitment. A good strategy should consider several things, namely selecting the source of employees (within or outside of organization), taking into account the budget needed during the recruitment and selection process, and taking into account the strategic means to actually make a job announcement.

Recruitment sources come from inside and outside organization. Internal sources include the existing employees whom can be proposed to fill the position by promotion, mutation or rotation, as well as former employees that can be reassigned to serve again in the company. External recruitment, on the other hand, is the process of acquiring work force from labor market outside the organization or company. External recruitment sources include individuals who are currently not the organization’s members. The utmost benefit of external recruitment is more numerous applicants will be available for recruitment.

**RESEARCH METHODS**

This research applies quantitative approach; an approach that prioritizes more on the measurement and sampling method as it is based upon deductive hypothetic frame of thinking that stresses on details of data collection and analysis. Quantitative research is started by collecting literatures and hypothesis needed and use them in deductive manners (testing theory and hypothesis in causal relations). To determine the type of research, one should consider several aspects are the goal, benefit, and time dimension (Prasetyo and Janah, 2005). Based on the research goal, this research is included into descriptive research, which aims to get clear description on how the recruitment process is undertaken through open bidding in the Ministry of PAN and BR. As it is based upon its time dimension, this research is included into case study research, as it highlights some particular cases within unlimited time span. Data collection technique used is qualitative method, which collects both primary and secondary data. The data collection techniques applied in this research are in-depth interview and literature study.

**RESULT AND DISCUSSION**

The important point that needs to be discussed in conducting a proper recruitment, particularly with a new and different recruitment system with the previous one are; (1) the prevailing regulation that governs recruitment procedures and regulation that highlights the duty and authority of the person to be recruited; and (2) recruitment steps started from planning until the recruitment method used. In addition, there are several points need to be considered: the factors that may affect the recruitment itself and an organization should also pay more attention to the recruitment sources to figure out the positive and negative impacts of the recruitment process that has been done previously.

The prevailing regulation on recruitment through open bidding is indeed not explicitly mentioned in the regulation due to the absence of regulation governing or obliging a placement to be done openly. It does not necessarily mean, though, that the open bidding done by the Ministry of PAN and RB is not based upon the existing policy. Open bidding recruitment done by this ministry in acquiring the prospective officials for echelon II is not yet regulated under any rules or legal umbrella that provides procedures, as up to now, it remains only in form of instruction to accelerate the bureaucracy reform in the open civil servant promotion system and to run the roadmap of bureaucracy reform program at microlevel.

There are three steps applied to run a recruitment process such as, recruitment planning, position announcement, and recruitment strategy. In planning step, recruitment should include the estimated needed time, analysis of the currently needed position in form of minimum qualification needed for the job, and determining the number of position to be filled. In term of time, the Personnel Division of the Ministry of PAN and RB shall specify the time frame since the beginning of open bidding announcement, so that the submission of participants name shall be started on 30th October 2011-11th November 2011. The time span is given upon the estimation of the open bidding announcement dissemination to relevant parties such as BKN (State Employees Board), ANRI (State National Archive), LAN (State Administrative
Agency) and BPKP (Financial and Development Supervisory Agency). In recruitment planning, position analysis is important to be undertaken particularly in analyzing the position to be filled with new employees so as to make sure that all things relevant to tasks and authorities in that position can be undertaken properly by the holder. During the open bidding recruitment in the Ministry of PAN and RB some time ago, the Personnel Division of the ministry did not conduct position analysis for fulfilling the Echelon II position in the ministry, but it stucked with the existing position analysis guidance despite the fact that it was the 2008 position analysis. The next step in recruitment system planning is determining the number of vacancy or position to be filled. In so doing, all are recorded in the Personnel Division of the Ministry of PAN and RB, specifically, in the Sub-Division of Planning and Mutation which is assigned to prepare the materials for employees need and procurement plan, placement administrative management, dismissal, ranks, mutation and pension as well as employees record. After the recruitment planning is done, i.e. a definitive time frame is made, position analysis particularly for those that will be filled through open bidding and the designation of the number of vacant position, the next step is to make a job announcement to find potential applicants.

In a job announcement, information provision gives a significant contribution to the process of decision making in recruitment; information that needs to be given in an announcement, particularly if such an announcement is done openly does not only have to do with the sought position, description of the job, but it needs also to consider various information that may make the job more attractive to applicants. The next step is determining the recruitment strategy to be used in recruiting prospective employee in strategy used in recruiting echelon II in the Ministry of PAN and RB, which complies with the instruction given by the Deputy Minister of PAN and RB, i.e. through position open bidding, which aims to accelerate bureaucracy reform started from micro to international levels. The open method is when the recruitment is widely informed by putting advertising on printed and electronic mass media in order to reach wider audience. Recruitment strategy will affect significantly to the number of applications submitted to the organization.

The open bidding for echelon II position in the Ministry of PAN and RB is not only addressed to civil servant in the ministry itself, but also for those from the sub-agencies under the Ministry of PAN and RB such as BKN (State Employees Board), LAN (State Administrative Agency), ANRI (Indonesian National Archive) and BPK (State Audit Agency). The recruitment sources come from both within the Ministry of PAN and RB as well as outside.

Several factors influencing a recruitment system, both those from within the organization as well as outside. The Echelon II open bidding in the Ministry of PAN and RB are felt by some as still affected by political factors, which concern is mainly expressed by the open bidding participants. Although this open bidding is done openly by giving the opportunity to employees outside the Ministry of PAN and RB to serve a echelon II in the ministry, the reality somehow shows differently. Participants from outside of the Ministry of PAN and RB, once they figure out that there is open bidding for echelon II in the ministry, cannot directly come over and register him/herself personally (application at the gate) to the Ministry of PAN and RB, in which case applicants come by their own initiative to an organization to apply. For those coming from outside of the Ministry of PAN and RB, they often still have to rely on their institution of origin which determines whether that individual has the right to be applicant as candidate for Echelon II in the Ministry of PAN and RB or not. Individuals can never directly register himself/herself to Echelon II open bidding, yet those registered as echelon II candidates are actually have been selected through spoil system from their respective agency/institution.

Currently there is yet any firm regulation on recruitment through open bidding nor there is other regulation concerning matters relating to open bidding placement both in term of selection as well as the authority of selection team. It suffices to say that position appointment has been governed in Article 17 Paragraph (2) in Law No.43/1999 on amendment of Law No.8/1974 on the Civil Service Principles which specifies that Appointment of Civil Servant for a position shall be conducted in compliance with the principle of professionalism, the position of which shall fit with the individual’s competence, work achievement, and the ranks designated for the position and other objective requirements regardless sex, ethnic, religion, race, or group.

Then Article 18 paragraph (4) and (5) specify that there are some requirements for promotion, namely work achievement, work discipline, loyalty, dedication, experience, and other objective requirements; it shall also comply with the position he/she is currently in charge with by taking into account the rank order. In addition to that law, administrative requirements on structural position appointment is also specified in the Indonesian Government Regulation No.100/2000 on Civil Servant Appointment in Structural Position, which has been amended with Government Regulation No.13/2002 on Amendment of Government Regulation No.100/2000, which include the following: Having status as civil servant, at least currently serving at the rank one level
below the designated rank, meeting the quality and level of education designated, all assessment and work achievement elements should at least be considered as good over the past two years, Having the competence for the vacant position to be filled.

The firm regulation on recruitment through open bidding and other regulations on various matters relating to open position placement both in term of selection and authority of selection team shall be clearly regulated in a legal product so as to enable its implementation in accordance with the procedure that has been set up. Thus, such firm regulation shall be clearly governed in a legal product. Although there is yet any governing regulation, the proper legal umbrella for this purpose is the Government Regulation, which should be enacted at national scale so as to make it able to serve as guidance for other agency that also attempts to do position placement through open bidding. Other than firm regulation, there is also need to strengthen the apparatus human resources management information system to support the personnel management objectively. Every agency/institution should develop an up-to-date apparatus human resources management information system. If apparatus human resources management at national level has implemented a proper information system, data and information concerning apparatus human resources in each agency both at central and local level can be integrated with the data stored at central level, in this regard the Ministry of PAN and RB. Thus, in such a condition, the time needed to find out the prospective officials will also become shorter since the Ministry of PAN and RB as central agency has already had data of employees both at central and local levels who are deemed eligible to be candidate for a certain position.

In recruitment through open bidding announcement in the Ministry of PAN and RB, the Personnel Division should provide a clear, accurate and mature design of position analysis and need analysis. This way, the ministry will obtain applicants who are closest to the expected knowledge and skill, or those who fit the set up requirements (the right man in the right place).

Information given during the socialization concerning position open bidding needs to be taken care of thoroughly. To attract prospective applicants, there should be proper information, for instance, one that reflects organization’s image as well as accurate information on the organization, job specification and the qualification needed for the vacant position. Complete information supported by work information enables the organizations to obtain applicants whose profiles match with the expectation. External recruitment has its own advantage and disadvantage, and the same case applies also to this open bidding recruitment. On the advantage, technically, employees of sub-agencies under the Ministry of PAN and RB obtain more opportunity to fill a position if the individual already meets the requirements and competence needed.

CONCLUSION

The analysis derived from the applied theory shows that recruitment in open bidding does not really work as expected yet. Other than the absence of clear regulation on open bidding recruitment, time constraint also remains a major challenge for the Personnel Division of the Ministry of PAN and RB.

The timeline provided to prepare recruitment is still considered insufficient, in consequence affects to the overly-short timeline from the initial socialization of the open bidding until the receipt of candidates’ names. In preparation phase, socialization is also deemed insufficient. The Personnel Division has already specified the list of vacant position, administrative requirement and information flow of the open bidding which function as information for the applicants that will enable them to prepare better if accepted as candidate of officials. However, the information does not specify yet the job description of the vacant position and the minimum qualification needed. Furthermore, the media used for socialization of open bidding still cannot reach out wider audience to disseminate the information, i.e. civil servants outside the Ministry of PAN and RB.

After the analysis on previous chapter, the author suggests that it is important to pay more attention on several aspects in recruitment and open bidding. First, it is crucial to realize the importance of the standard regulation on the open bidding itself, the Ministry of PAN and RB should make regulation pertaining to position open bidding which includes regulation /guideline on how to run good recruitment. Secondly, Personnel Division shall provide position analysis and need analysis that are clear, accurate, as well as well-prepared job design in recruitment phase. This way, the Ministry of PAN and RB will get applicants that are really close to the expected criteria about in term of knowledge and skill which meet the requirements made. Third, addition of information content disseminated through circular letter such as information on position job description and clear qualification of each vacant position, thus it won’t rely merely on administrative requirements. Fourth, other than through circular letter, Ministry of PAN and RB can also socialize the open bidding through official web page of the ministry so that people can easily find out when there is open bidding or position in the Ministry of PAN and RB.

REFERENCES


