Journal of Strategic and Global Studies

Volume 5 Number 2 July

Article 3

7-31-2022

Work Conditions and Problems of Former Care Workers After Returned to Indonesia

Eldwita Nofrelia University of Indonesia, eldwita.nofrelia@ui.ac.id

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/jsgs



Part of the Asian Studies Commons, and the Migration Studies Commons

Recommended Citation

Nofrelia, Eldwita (2022) "Work Conditions and Problems of Former Care Workers After Returned to Indonesia," Journal of Strategic and Global Studies: Vol. 5: No. 2, Article 3.

DOI: 10.7454/jsgs.v5i2.1097

Available at: https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/jsgs/vol5/iss2/3

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the School of Strategic and Global Studies at UI Scholars Hub. It has been accepted for inclusion in Journal of Strategic and Global Studies by an authorized editor of UI Scholars Hub.

Work Conditions and Problems of Former Care Workers After Returned to Indonesia

Eldwita Nofrelia¹•,

¹Program Studi Kajian Wilayah Jepang, Sekolah Kajian Stratejik dan Global,
Universitas Indonesia

Abstract

Based on Indonesian-Japan Economic Partnership Agreement (IJEPA), Indonesia sends some nurses who would be employed either as hospital nurses or as care workers for the elderly. Nurses who work in Japanese hospitals are required to meet Japanese nursing standards, through a competency test of Japanese nursing standards. This article discusses how Indonesian care workers adapt to working conditions while being in Japan and about the problem of nurses with Indonesian qualifications working with Japanese competency standards. This study is qualitative research using a survey method. The data collection technique used in this study was a questionnaire via google form. This study uses the theory of liminality to explain the adaptation process and the problems faced by Indonesian care workers in Japan. This study found out that there was a gap between what had been expected and what had been faced by Indonesian nurses (especially who were originally medical nurses) working in Japan, so that the "care workers" chose to return home and started to build a career in Indonesia.

Keywords: IJEPA; liminality; care worker

1. Introductions

In 2007, IJ-EPA (Indonesia-Japan Economic Partnership Agreement) was ratified as a bilateral cooperation between the governments of Indonesia and Japan. According to Nisa (2019), this program opens investment opportunities in the form of goods and services. This collaboration covers the health sector, especially sending care workers for elderly to work in Japan (Aminah, 2018). From 2007 to 2020, a total of 13 batches have departed to Japan. These care workers, who have been in Japan, can choose to continue working or return to Indonesia when their work contract period has expired. According to Efendi (2019), in standardizing the competence of nurses, Japan has a policy that any medical personnel, either Japanese or foreigners, must pass the national competency test for nurses. However, foreign workers can still work in Japan even though they do not pass the selection and immediately return to their home country when the work contract period expires.

• Correspondening Author : Eldwita.nofrelia@ui.ac.id

Elderly care is a well-known profession due to the large number of elderly people in Japan. Therefore, the Japanese government developed a science school for elderly care, insurance for the elderly, and elderly protection facilities (Iskandar, 2016). These conditions are not found in Indonesia, where anyone holding a mere high school or junior high school diploma can be recruited to become the elderly care workers (Iskandar, 2016). Thus, it is not surprising that the care workers in elderly homes had been recruited without certain skills required, because the applicants were from non-nursing education levels. In Indonesia, the pattern of parenting for the elderly tends to be carried out by any family member who is willing to care. Therefore, in Indonesia, the elderly nursing profession is not very well known, and there is no obligation to pass the national competency test as in Japan (Iskandar, 2016). Thus, the program for sending elderly care workers had been a very challenging step for Indonesian elderly nurses to be sent to Japan. As a result, they must quickly adapt to pursue the competency target of Japan's domestic workforce (Iskandar, 2020).

The problems experienced by former elderly nurses are the topics analyzed in this paper. The subjects are not only former elderly care workers who have returned to Indonesia, but also the elderly care workers who are still in Japan and plan to not continue the working contract period. This paper explores more about the conditions during work and the reasons behind their return to Indonesia, focusing on the problems they experienced in Indonesia after returning from Japan along with the reasons for not continuing the work contract in Japan, as well as the job prospects they wanted to go to when they returned to Indonesia.

The transition for both while being in Japan and after returning to Indonesia requires good adaptation from the care workers. Therefore, the theory used in this paper is the theory of liminality by Victor Turner, which is an extension of the transitional theory proposed by Arnold Van Gennep. This theory of liminality discusses the process of adaptation during the transition from a foreign country to the country of origin. This transition is in the form of a person moving to a new environment and returning to the old environment after adapting to new conditions. This process will observe self-adaptation to find out more about a person's ability to adapt back to his old environment. There are three stages in this transition process. The first stage is the separation phase (preliminal), namely when a person leaves his or her original environment. The second stage is the liminal phase, which happens when one adapts as a new person in a new environment so that one experiences a transition situation (Sairin,

2002). The third stage, namely post-liminal, is when a person returns to the old environment and consider it as a new environment and adapts again (Sairin, 2002). According to Chick & Meleis (1986: 239), liminality focuses on the second phase, that the transition phase encapsulates the entire process of being a journey from one phase of life or condition to another.

The term "adaptation" in this paper refers to a challenge faced by Indonesian health workers who become foreign workers in other countries. This is a virtue of the cooperation agreement between Indonesia and Japan which creates a situation between the sender of labor and the employer. Therefore, this paper also employs the dual labor market theory as a reference to observe the emergence of interest in migration. This theory analyzes that, in fact, migration abroad tends to be due to the demand for labor in developed industrialized countries (Piore, 1979). This theory states that the dispatch of labor occurs because of mutual need between regions or countries of origin and developed industrial countries as destination countries (Puspitasari & Kusreni, 2017). Therefore, there is an interrelationship between the demand for labor according to specifications and the delivery of labor that tends not to be broken.

2. Literature Review

This research will pay attention to a different aspect compared to previous research, namely the conditions and problems of former Indonesian care workers after returning to their country. Regarding care worker, there are previous studies mentioned in this study, titled Japanese Aging Issues, Long-Term Care Insurance (LTCI), and Migration of Indonesian Nurses to Enter the Japanese Labor Market. Indonesian nurses who did not pass the exam are losing their opportunity to reach higher skill as care worker in Japan (Iskandar, 2020). While The Indonesian government is still sending nurses to Japan, but only 30% of them are able to keep their track in the Japanese labor market. The next research referenced for this research is IJEPA After A Decade: A Case Study of Indonesian Care Workers' Rights Fulfillment in Japan. The next research that is referred for this research is: IJEPA After A Decade: A Case Study of Indonesian Care Workers' Rights Fulfillment in Japan. IJEPA in a decade increasing number of dispatch for Indonesian nurses and care workers for the elderly population to work in Japan in the recent years (Nisa, 2019). Care worker candidates who pass are still relatively low when compared to the number of candidate care workers sent to Japan. Those

candidates are vulnerable to losing their careers and decrease low skill when they return to Indonesia.

3. Research Method

This paper employs qualitative research method, a method that uses textual data and is described descriptively. This method analyzes social events, phenomena, or circumstances, and provides facts on the ground based on facts for former elderly care workers who have returned to Indonesia. In collecting data, the author conducted semi-structured interviews, namely interviews consisting of a number of questions that can be answered freely by the informants. These questions are the operationalization of the theory used, namely liminality and the dual labor market. These interviews can be conducted face-to-face, in written format, or through Internet surveys (Bryman, 2012).

The data analysis technique used in this paper attempts to describe the data in detail and draw conclusions to fulfill the purpose of writing. The stages of data analysis consist of categorizing the data, displaying the data, and interpreting the data (Judge, 2011). First, the data obtained from the interviewees will be filtered according to the writing needs. The informants were selected using a purposive sampling technique, with certain considerations such as being elderly Indonesian care workers who chose to go home because the work contract period had expired or workers who were still working but planned not to continue the work contract. The informants were selected from different batches of departures, while the reason for choosing different departures was to get more diverse writing results because they departed in different years.

The resource persons in this paper are 5 people (four women and one man) who work as elderly care workers who have returned to Indonesia or who plan to discontinue their work contracts. Since the characteristics of the informants are having the same educational background and working experience in the health sector, they are worthy of being considered as representative to help answer the problems in this paper. Sources of data obtained from interviews, literature data, and the internet. The interviews were conducted online with five sources. Next, the literature data can be in the form of previous research that has topics related to the reference sources of this paper, both textbooks and other journals to complete references and supporting articles from trusted research journal sources.

4. Results

There are several data from this study to explain and examine the working conditions and problems of former care workers, especially after returning to Indonesia. The results of this research are in the form of answers obtained through the following questions: what are your impressions and experiences while working in Japan?; how was your experience while working and were you free to worship?; how is your relationship with other coworkers?; how do you feel about the national care worker competency exam?; how satisfied are you with your salary while working in Japan?; what was the reason that made you return to Indonesia?; are you going to open a business or what job are you interested in after returning to Indonesia?; what is the message and hope you want to say to the government in Indonesia?. The answers and explanations in these questions will be explained more detail in the discussion section below.

5. Discussion

International migration is an activity of sending labor from sending countries to countries in need. The sector of work can also be diverse, as is the case with the IJEPA scheme by the Japanese and Indonesian governments regarding the delivery of health workers. This is what can encourage mobility and movement of people from their areas of origin to more developed areas. Socio-cultural differences that exist in the destination country require migrant workers to be able to adapt to existing standards in order to survive.

In this paper, Indonesian nurses as migrant workers sent to Japan are nursing graduates with Indonesian nursing skills. Different nursing fields can make prospective migrant workers required to have the same standards as the competence of workers from the destination country. So in the liminality process of nurse migrants is the process they go through starting from leaving for Japan until returning to Indonesia. Japan as a recipient of labor has regulations to determine nurse workers so that they have the ability according to Japanese nursing standards. However, Japan also has its own views on foreign workers. This is what makes the regulations tighter regarding the ability of workers and the views of the public who are less confident in the abilities of foreign workers (Iskandar K., 2016). Thanks to strict regulations, the fate of the nurses tends to be inflexible because it depends on the results of the selection of Japanese nursing competencies (Iskandar K., 2016). Therefore, nurses sent from Indonesia need to adapt even to the pattern of Japanese regulations.

Japan is known as a country with a large number of elderly population, therefore Japan has an elderly nursing profession that specializes in caring for and treating the elderly. In the liminality process, Indonesian elderly nurses who are foreigners in Japan can feel a different atmosphere from that in Indonesia. Priyadi (2019: 580) added that living in Japan can provide knowledge of Japanese culture and language and add new insights. As well as information and the field of nursing science for the elderly that they do not get in Indonesia. The interviewees, N (female 30 years old) and A (female 28) said that while in Japan, they received various new insights, especially the world of elderly nursing. While working, A (female 28 years) said that elderly nursing is rare in Indonesia. So it is not uncommon for nursing knowledge taken in Indonesia to be unused and gradually forget the lessons during college first (Arisanova, 2013).

This is the implication of receiving incomplete information regarding regulations from the Japanese government and the lack of socialization by the Japan International Corporation of Welfare Services (JICWELS) and the National Agency for the Placement and Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers (BNP2TKI), which are recruiters. The lack of coordination and supervision causes the weak work contract they get so that it can lead to not fulfilling the rights that must be obtained (Nisa, 2019). However, according to (Horn, 1980), these migrant workers have had the same job since their first start working. In different conditions, they tend to continue to do the same work even when they have changed places of work. In relation to the dual labor market theory, this can lead to ambiguity in the career paths to be taken by migrant workers. This can lead to a career path that does not increase with the same portion of work.

According to Iskandar (2016), the work contract status of the nurses or care workers will not necessarily state them to become permanent workers, but they rather must undergo a period of 3 to 4 years working as a trainee or contract. Therefore, their careers will only be stuck in that position. So that Indonesian elderly nurses sent to Japan have limitations in career prospects. This is not very promising, even though the speakers before leaving for Japan had a great impression because there were different expectations from Indonesia, for example, to experience the four seasons, learn about local customs and cultures. There is an assumption

that it is possible to live abroad even if the achievement of abilities is not increased or even neglected.

The unused nursing knowledge can be a new thing that must be adapted to the adaptation process during work. As workers in Japan, they must follow a highly disciplined work ethic that teaches them to be responsible for their work and work together in a team. So, social skills are important to build smooth communication patterns between fellow workers, and foster a sense of mutual need for one another. Knowledge that is not used can also be assisted with the help of the role of other colleagues to create a conducive work atmosphere with familiarity and sharing information with each other. According to A (female 28 years), familiarity with fellow co-workers creates a conducive work atmosphere. In this case, he found good co-workers and helped each other in terms of work, friendly and supportive of each other in a work team. Other informants also assumed that their co-workers were fellow migrant workers or Japanese people who mutually supported each other. Even though we don't have a lot of recreation together when we are off work, it is enough to just communicate smoothly when we are working.

In addition to the relationship between co-workers, adaptation to working conditions can also be seen from the freedom of worship. Worship is one of the important life values that connects humans with God. An article written by Pearce (2018) says that in Indonesia religion is considered an important value that has been taught since childhood. Therefore, the aspect of worship is one of the points of concern. On the freedom to worship during working hours, F (Female 31 years) said that she did not get the freedom to carry out worship. Meanwhile, A (female 28 years) in order to be able to perform prayers while working, they must combine prayers (*Zuhr and Asr, Maghrib and Isha*) at certain hours such as breaks. A (28 years) and N (female 30 years) think that most of their superiors who are Japanese, do not understand their religious needs. So they have to discuss first so that they can understand each other in order to get time and be given a place to worship. In this case, they have to adapt to different conditions from Indonesia, where they can freely worship on time because in Japan it can only be done during breaks. In contrast to other informants, S (female 28 years) and W (male 38 years) said that they were quite free to worship while working.

Regarding the national competency test held in Japan, sociologically it can be explained by liminality theory. The liminality process itself is the initiation of these former elderly nurses who leave their zone, which is to bring Indonesian nursing education, and choose to work in Japan with different educational standards and mechanisms. Therefore, they must adapt to existing regulations in Japan, such as the requirement to pass the national competency test in order to continue working after the employment contract period has expired. In the five interviewees, it was found that they answered the competency test difficult, and there were three sources, namely F (31 years old woman), S (33 years old woman) and A (28 year old woman) who answered difficult because of language barriers. Furthermore, according to W (38 years old male), the test is difficult to answer well, even for Japanese people.

On the point of job satisfaction, salary is one of the important things that must be considered. As foreign workers, their rights must be fulfilled in accordance with the employment contract (Nisa, 2019). Elderly nurses who pass the competency test will have a standard Japanese salary but those who do not pass will get a lower salary. According to Iskandar (2016), there are differences in certification in the case of elderly nurses, so they tend to have lower wages. Therefore, passing the competency test held by the Japanese government is an important factor for elderly nurses to continue to work and have a standard Japanese salary. Even so, when compared to wages in Indonesia, Japan is known to provide a higher salary. So, on average, the respondents answered that they were quite satisfied with their salaries. If they do not pass the competency, the findings obtained by Nisa (2019) stated that the nursing home for the elderly still provides opportunities for migrant nurse workers to continue working at their place but there are no career prospects or an increase in wages. This condition gives rise to two options, namely, 1) continue the contract even though the salary does not increase; or 2) return to Indonesia.

Related to the option number 2) above, there are separate problems in the form of concerns about the difficulties and impacts experienced by former elderly nurses who want to work in Indonesia after returning from Japan. The prospect of working in Indonesia is an important point in the field of work other than nurses that they can apply to so they don't become unemployed and continue to live in Indonesia. The elderly nursing profession in Indonesia is still not standardized nationally, so the profession is still not widely known and it can be said that the prospects are not clear (Iskandar, 2016). Job opportunities are narrow and do not

vary, so they have to be really prepared for the conditions in Indonesia if they want to choose option 2) above. This problem will become a new social problem if the situation does not change and continues.

Research conducted by Arisanova (2013) says that in general, elderly nurses return to Indonesia because they do not pass the competency exam. In addition to being faced with the two options above, there are several other reasons behind them to go home. There are several reasons, such as seniority, falling sick, limited worship and other religious needs, as well as family members being left behind in Indonesia. As a wife, N (Female 30 years) said that she could not leave her husband in Indonesia for a long time and felt that working as an elderly nurse was not suitable for women because of the risk of injury to the waist. Statistically, Iskandar (2020) found that not many workers survived and 30% who passed the competency test did not necessarily continue their careers because their energy had been exhausted from work. Regarding falling ill, S (a 33-year-old woman) who is currently suffering from typhus and is still under a work contract said that she did not receive treatment for the disease in Japan, so she chose to return to Indonesia for treatment. In the statement above, it can be seen that there are different types of diseases between Japan and Indonesia. Therefore, it is important to maintain health and eat regularly. Regarding food, A (female 28 years) chose to go home because of the limited halal food in Japan. Furthermore, A added another religious need, namely worship more freely in Indonesia than in Japan.

Given that Japanese regulations require health workers to pass the competency test, foreign workers who do not pass must return to their country of origin. There is a consequence if you don't pass, you have to return to Indonesia and can continue working in Japan. If you pass the test, this competency will be very important. The next step is that the continuation of their lives after returning to Indonesia is a case that must be considered, one of which is the difficulty of being able to work again in Indonesian hospitals. Arisanova (2013) also found that workers who do not pass the competency test can still work and will face different expectations, such as not doing medical work and only doing non-medical work while working in Japan. Saito (2014: 48) adds that there are elderly nurses who pass the competency exam and even have a work permit, but choose to return to Indonesia instead of staying in Japan. In this case, based on the theory of liminality when they return to Indonesia, they must be able to readjust one of them by choosing a suitable job in Indonesia. Regarding

the transition period back to the old environment once the work contract period expires and returns to Indonesia, the author looks for some of the sources' plans to continue living in Indonesia.

When they return to Indonesia, there are other professional choices in Indonesia besides nurses that are in accordance with their competence and Japanese language skills. Like F (a 31-year-old woman) has an interest in becoming a medical interpreter with the Japanese language capital that she has mastered. Then N (a 30-year-old woman) said that she was interested in becoming a Japanese teacher in Indonesia. In contrast to F and N, W (38 years old male) said that he is interested in working for a Japanese multinational company and is currently working in a multinational finance group under a Japanese company. Each resource person also considered starting their own business apart from their Japanese language competence, except for W (38 years old) who had absolutely no interest in starting a business.

Various dynamics they faced while working in Japan and then returning to Indonesia gave rise to new hopes for continuing to live according to the theory of liminality in their home environment. The author also states the messages and hopes that the speakers want to convey to the Indonesian government. A (female 28 years) said that as a program of cooperation between the governments of Indonesia and Japan, the two governments should renegotiate to ensure freedom of worship while working in Japan. N (a 30-year-old woman) said that before leaving for Japan, prospective workers should be better equipped with knowledge about Japan and the main tasks that will be imposed on the work they will undertake later.

This is important so that there is no information and knowledge gap when dealing with work situations in Japan so that they are mentally prepared. S (a 33-year-old woman) asked that the age limit for taking the CPNS (prospective civil servant) test be changed to 35 years and over, so that after returning to Indonesia they could still participate in the recruitment. F (a 31-year-old woman) hopes that the government will be more responsive when Indonesian workers experience problems at work. Finally, W (38 years old male) believes that there are a lot of Indonesian diaspora scattered in every corner of Japan, so the government should have a place to provide more protection for Indonesian citizens (WNI) in various prefectures in Japan. The role of the government can also help these former elderly nurses to adapt back in

Indonesia. In accordance with the dual labor market theory, this migration seems to run in place if the former worker returns to Indonesia with skills that do not increase and do not develop. The former workers are expected to be able to readjust to be able to work in Indonesia.

6. Conclusion

The cooperation between Indonesia and Japan (IJEPA) on the delivery of workers need each other based on the interests of their respective countries. Japan gets workers while Indonesia gets a solution for the excess number of nurses. Indonesian nurses who become elderly nurses in Japan are figures in the movement of people from their original areas to new areas. So not infrequently this adaptation process creates a culture shock that can be experienced by Indonesian elderly nurses who work in Japan. The years of work contracts make them learn many new things and experiences.

However, the author found something different. In the results section and the previous discussion, there were problems faced by Indonesian nurses during and after not working in Japan. These problems can be summed up in the following five points. First, the expectation of applying nursing knowledge when working in Japan was not met because it was unused and inappropriate. Second, the lack of freedom in worship is a serious problem, given the misunderstanding of superiors. Third, the barriers to passing the competency test while working in Japan so that there is a risk of being sent back to Indonesia. Fourth, there is still a burden of responsibility for the families left in Indonesia so they choose to return home and may not be able to continue working in Japan. Fifth, accessibility to health services is relatively limited in Japan for those who suffer from tropical diseases such as typhus.

This issue needs to be followed up by the government in the context of evaluating the IJEPA program whose main objective is to improve workers' skill competency as a nurse. Another alternative is to provide training specialized for the national competency test and job skills training, so that after returning to Indonesia, they can return to be a nurse back or can choose any other labor sector based on their own interests. Therefore, coordination from the government is needed in overcoming this, both in the form of training before leaving and after returning to Indonesia, so that the former elderly care workers can get jobs easily and properly in their own countries. In addition to the practical suggestions above, this paper also

suggests academically about using the dual labor market theory and liminality as a theory for other research. However, the author realizes that there are drawbacks remaining in the form of a small number of informants, and the limited use of theory that only focuses on liminality and dual labor market. A structured interview method is best expected to provide richer data. Therefore, the authors would suggest to add any form of additional informants and the use of stronger concepts to further analyze any cases alike.

References

- Aminah, S., Wardoyo, S., & Pangastoeti, S. (2018). Pengiriman Tenaga Perawat dan Careworker Indonesia ke Jepang dalam Kerangka Indonesia-Jepang Economic Partnership Agreement (IJ-EPA). *Bakti Budaya*, 92.
- Arisanova, M. (2013). Peningkatan Daya Saing Indonesia di Bidang Keperawatan Melalui Implementasi Indonesia-Japan Economic Partnership Agreement (IJEPA). 1-22.
- Bryman, A. (2012). Social Research Methods. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Chick, N., & Meleis, A. (1986). *Transitions: A Nursing Concern*. New York Aspen Publication. Nursing Research Methodology.
- Efendi, F., Nursalam, N., Ulfiana, E., & Fauziningtyas, R. (2019). Situational Analysis of Career Choices among Indonesian Nurses Returnees. *Indian Journal*.
- Hakim, A. (2011). Survival Strategy of Former Women Migrant Worker. *Widyariset*, 14(1), 257-265.
- Horn, R. (1980). A Case Study of the Dual Labor Market Hypothesis. *Journal of Economic Issues*, 14(3), 615-630.
- Iskandar, K. (2016). *Trajektori Sosial Ekonomi TKI Perawat ke Jepang dalam Perspektif Global Value Chain*. Depok: RIngkasan Disertasi, Departemen Sosiologi FISIP Universitas Indonesia.
- Iskandar, K. (2020). Japan Aging Issues, Long Term Care Care Insurance (LTCI) and The Migration of Indonesian Nurse to Enter Japan Labor Market. *Journal of Strategic and Global Studies*, Article 2.
- Nisa, H. Z. (2019). Analisis Satu Dekade IJEPA: Studi Kasus terhadap Pemenuhan Hak-Hak Careworkers Indonesia di Jepang. Depok: Tesis, Program Kajian Wilayah Jepang Universitas Indonesia.
- Pearce, J. M. (2018). *The Chequered Picture of Religion Around The World*. Dipetik Agustus 12, 2021, dari https://www.patheos.com/blogs/tippling/2018/10/19/the-chequered-picture-of-religion-around-the-world/
- Piore, M. J. (1979). *Bird of Passage: Migrant Labor in Industrial Societies*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- Priyadi, E. S. (2019). Tenaga Kerja Indonesia Di Jepang; Studi Tentang Motivasi Yang Melatarbelakangi Seseorang Menjadi Traine. *Jurnal Renaissance*, 4 (02), 572-582.
- Puspitasari, W., & Kusreni, S. (2017). Faktor-Faktor yang Mempengaruhi Migrasi Tenaga Kerja. *Jurnal Ilmu Ekonomi Terapan*, 02(01), 49-64.
- Sairin, S. (2002). *Perubahan Sosial Masyarakat Indonesia: Perspektif Antropologi.* Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Saito, A. (2014). Problems in Accepting Indonesian Candidates for Nurses and Certified Caregivers in Japan: Career Achievement of the Candidates Based on Qualitative Interviews. *Global: Jurnal Politik Internasional*, 16(1), 48-68.
- Tjiptoherijanto, P. (2000). Penduduk dan Pembangunan Ekonomi. *Mobiilitas Penduduk dan Pembangunan Ekonomi*(20), 176.