

August 2022

The Quality of Rhyme and Rhythm in Song Lyric Translation

Aulia Fitri

Faculty of Humanities, Universitas Indonesia, auliafit03@gmail.com

Haru Deliana Dewi

Faculty of Humanities, Universitas Indonesia, harudd.dewi7@gmail.com

Rahayu Surtiati Hidayat

Faculty of Humanities, Universitas Indonesia, rahayu.surtiati@gmail.com

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/paradigma>



Part of the [Archaeological Anthropology Commons](#), [Art and Design Commons](#), [Fine Arts Commons](#), [History Commons](#), [Library and Information Science Commons](#), [Linguistics Commons](#), and the [Philosophy Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Fitri, Aulia, Haru D. Dewi, and Rahayu S. Hidayat. 2022. The Quality of Rhyme and Rhythm in Song Lyric Translation. *Paradigma: Jurnal Kajian Budaya* 12, no. 2 (August). 10.17510/paradigma.v12i2.507.

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Faculty of Humanities at UI Scholars Hub. It has been accepted for inclusion in *Paradigma: Jurnal Kajian Budaya* by an authorized editor of UI Scholars Hub.

THE QUALITY OF RHYME AND RHYTHM IN SONG LYRIC TRANSLATION

Aulia Fitri, Haru Deliana Dewi, and Rahayu Surtiati Hidayat

Faculty of Humanities, Universitas Indonesia;

auliafit03@gmail.com, harudd.dewi7@gmail.com, rahayu.surtiati@gmail.com

DOI: 10.17510/paradigma.v12i2.507

ABSTRACT

This research is a development of Low's theory (2008) on assessing the quality of song lyric translation based on its translation method. The objective of the study is to discover the quality of rhyme and rhythm of song lyrics in the album *We Love Disney* which have been translated from English to Indonesian. Therefore, this study focuses on the quality of rhyme and rhythm of the translation because these elements are significant parts of the songs. Low's theory has been applied in the present study to measure the song lyric translation quality using three translation methods: communicative, free, and semantic methods. The study employs a qualitative approach through comparative analysis. Data in the analysis are the song lyrics and their translation, and their rhymes and rhythms. The values of the rhyme and rhythm in the translations were obtained from the comparative analysis. The findings reveal that song lyrics translated using the communicative translation method have a higher rhyme value than the original song lyrics; in contrast, the lyrics translated using a free method yield a rhyme value with a considerable difference. The assessment of rhythm reveals that a song translated using the free method shows a substantial difference in value compared to translations using the other methods.

KEYWORDS

Quality of song lyric translation; translation methods; rhyme; rhythm; assessment.

ABSTRAK

Penelitian ini merupakan pengembangan rubrik milik Low (2008) untuk menilai kualitas terjemahan lirik lagu berdasarkan metode penerjemahannya. Tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah untuk menemukan kualitas rima dan ritme lirik lagu dari album *We Love Disney*, yang telah diterjemahkan dari bahasa Inggris ke dalam bahasa Indonesia. Oleh karena itu, penelitian ini berfokus pada kualitas rima dan ritme hasil terjemahan karena bagian-bagian ini secara signifikan disajikan dalam sebuah lagu. Teori Low diterapkan dalam penelitian ini untuk mengukur kualitas terjemahan lirik lagu dengan tiga metode terjemahan, yaitu komunikatif, bebas, dan semantis. Penelitian ini menggunakan pendekatan kualitatif dan metode analisis komparatif. Data dalam analisis adalah lirik lagu dan terjemahannya, dan rima serta ritme. Dari analisis komparatif, nilai rima dan ritme diperoleh. Temuan ini mengungkapkan bahwa lirik lagu yang diterjemahkan dengan metode terjemahan

komunikatif memiliki nilai rima lebih tinggi daripada lirik lagu asli. Sebaliknya, lirik yang diterjemahkan dengan metode bebas menghasilkan nilai rima yang lebih baik pada lirik terjemahan. Dalam penilaian ritme, lagu diterjemahkan dengan metode bebas menunjukkan perbedaan nilai yang substansial dibandingkan metode lain.

KATA KUNCI

Kualitas terjemahan lirik lagu; metode penerjemahan; rima; ritme; penilaian.

INTRODUCTION

Lyrics of a song that catch the interest of its listeners are those that rhyme like a poem. A song with good rhymes will attract the interest of many listeners. Lyrics have a compact structure showing a great rhyme in them (Oliveira et al. 2005). Being able to compose a well-structured rhyme is an achievement for songwriters because their creativity is presented there. Johnson et al. (2014) assert that rhyme can be regarded as something extraordinary for having phonemic similarities. Obviously phonemic similarities will be different in each language, but the determinant factor in a phonemic similarity is the last syllable in a word. Bogucki (2016) argues that when translating a song, the most important aspect for the translator to consider is the lyrics, so the result will achieve a level of communication accepted in the target language.

This present study was conducted to analyse the translated songs from the album *We Love Disney*, released by Universal Music Indonesia. This album is a collection of Disney songs translated into the Indonesian language. This study focuses on the quality of the rhymes and rhythm of these songs as aspects influencing the quality of the translated lyrics. The results of this research could be used as a reference when making a general assessment of rhyme and rhythm in songs with translated lyrics. Low (2003) only used one stanza of a song lyric as data to assess its quality, whereas assessing the quality of song lyrics requires a thorough analysis of the lyrics in its entirety. Thus, this study applies his theory to assess the whole lyrics of several songs. Moreover, this paper focuses on the calculation of a song's rhyme and rhythm because those aspects are close to the musical elements when assessing whether the translation of lyrics have been successful or not.

In 2003, Low discussed song lyric translations, and his research discussed the harmonization between the translated song and the music when sung in accordance with five aspects (rhyme, rhythm, singability, naturalness, and sense). Then, another study focused on song lyrics translation by Akerstrom (2009), utilizing a corpus tool to find out how many translation strategies were used in the 12 translated song lyrics from the *Three Musicals*. Akerstrom is of the opinion that the most widely used strategy is paraphrasing. Furthermore, a study by Aminoroaya and Amirian (2016) on 29 song lyrics translated from English to Persian concludes that direct translation and adaption are the most commonly used strategies. Based on the three previous studies, it can be concluded that no research has been conducted on the quality of song lyric translation, specifically with regard to the effect of rhyme and rhythm on a song as a whole. The present study attempts to measure the quality of rhyme and rhythm of the songs from the album *We Love Disney*, translated from English to Indonesian. In the study, the rhymes and rhythm of the translated lyrics will be analysed using a rubric designed by Low (2008), the only rubric so far specifically designed to assess the quality of song lyric translation.

This research specifically examines the quality of rhyme and rhythm which are important parts of translating lyrics. The good quality of rhyme and rhythm result in interesting and wonderful lyrics to listen to. Rhyme and rhythm are very important parts of a lyric, yet they have not been considered by previous researchers as vital parts to create good songs and lyrics. This research aims to find out the influence of the use of translation methods from Newmark (1998) on the quality of song lyric translation. There are three out of eight methods discovered in the translation of song lyrics in this album, namely semantic, communicative, and

free translation methods. According to Newmark (1998), the semantic method places emphasis on the source text message; the translation is already flexible but uses neutral words, so it is not suitable for texts with cultural content (Dewi & Wijaya 2021, 32–35). Communicative and free translation methods emphasize on the target language where the cultural content can be expressed in other cultural contents in the target language (Dewi & Wijaya 2021, 34–37). The difference is the communicative translation still keeps the whole message from the source text, although the structure and meaning may not be the same. On the other hand, free translation tends to paraphrase, so the translation can be shorter or longer than the source text (ST) (Dewi & Wijaya 2021, 37). Based on the research, it can be seen which method is the most suitable to produce quality lyrics for the translation of song lyrics from English into Indonesian. This research on rhyme and rhythm quality has been developed by using a rubric designed by Low (2003) equipped with a table of values for each type of rhyme and rhythm that exists.

A song translator should accurately follow the source text with regard to the length of the text and the number of syllables; furthermore, according to Nida (1964) the translator must also maintain and ensure that the balance between the syllables and the tone stays the same. It means that the tone and the number of syllables must match the original song. However, sometimes the number of syllables may not conform to the original song, which is acceptable as long as the tempo matches that of the original song. However, when translating a song, Low (2013) believes that many translators do not realize that rhythm is part of the translation. Rhythm is often overlooked because when a singer manages to sing the translated song like the original song, it is considered normal, where in fact the success occurs because of the correct rhythm calculation in each tone. In terms of rhythm, the translation of the lyrics of a song is considered a success if the tone or melody does not stray from the source melody. There are two different ways to assess rhyme and rhythm. Rhyme is assessed by awarding points according to how close the words sound; meanwhile, rhythm is assessed by subtracting points based on the rhythm difference between the source and target texts.

According to Low (2008, 13–16), rhyme assessment in source and target texts is done by observing the syllable format at the end of the lines in the lyrics. The format consists of two groups, namely open and closed syllables. A closed syllables is an ending with a consonant. Meanwhile, an open syllable is a syllable ending with a vowel. Rhyme assessment as proposed by Low (2008) is illustrated in the table in Appendix. Examples of rhyming sounds between words are listed from the highest point to the lowest according to the criteria specified in Table 1 and Table 2. The tables list words with closed and open syllables, arranged according to the similarity of the sounds at the end of syllables.

Options for closed syllables in English and Indonesian		Options for open syllables in English and Indonesian	
Love/glove Jauh/jatuh	Vowel and consonants on both sides	Belie/rely baru/biru	Consonant and vowels on both sides
Love/shove Selaput/siput	Good rhyme	Lie/fly Nama/sama	Good rhyme
Love/rough Siput/laut	Final consonant is close but not identical	Lie/rye Nama/sukma	Consonant is close but not identical
Love/move Asyik/berisik	Vowel is close but not identical	Lie/die Baru/tahu	Consonant is different
Love/lug Laut/lambat	Different final consonant	Lie/lay Sekali/landau	Vowel is close but not identical
Love/have Laut/sehat	Vowel is different	Lie/lee Laut/sempat	Vowel is different

Table 1. Rhyme closeness in English and Indonesian

English	Point	Indonesian
Love/glove & belie/rely	10 points	<i>Jauh/jatuh & baru/biru</i>
Lie/fly	9 points	<i>Nama/sama</i>
Love/shove	8 points	<i>Selaput/siput</i>
Lie/rye	7 points	<i>Nama/sukma</i>
Love/rough	6 points	<i>Siput/laut</i>
Lie/die	5 points	<i>Baru/tahu</i>
Love/move	4 points	<i>Asyik/berisik</i>
Lie/lay	3 points	<i>Sekali/landau</i>
Love/lug	2 points	<i>Laut/lambat</i>
Love/have & lie/lee	1 point	<i>Laut/sehat & sekali/ramai</i>

Table 2. Points scheme for rhyme sound closeness.

According to Low (2008, 1–2), song emphasis is also important in song lyric translation; it is done by observing any similarity in rhythm emphasis between the source and target texts. The rhythm is clearly apparent from the number of syllables in the lyrics. A similar number of syllables produces a tone closely resembling that of the source song. However, in addition to syllables, there is another aspect that must be taken into account by the song lyric translator, namely the melody. A different melody produces a song that is quite different from the source song; in other words, it alters the message of the source song.

Rhythmic variants already present in a song	—minus 0 point
Slight alteration to rhythm	—minus 1 point
Slight alteration to melody	—minus 3 points

METHOD

Data for the study are taken from the lyrics of songs in the album *We Love Disney*, released in the Indonesian language by Universal Music Indonesia in 2015 and the original English lyrics of the songs as the source text. This album has been chosen because it is the only album consisting of translated songs from English into Indonesian. In the analysis, the song lyrics in the source and target texts are paired. Of the twelve translated lyrics, three samples were selected based on the translation methods used. The three samples consist of one song translated using the communicative translation method, one song translated using the free translation method, and one song translated using the semantic translation method. The samples for each method will be elaborated in the section Results and Discussion below.

The method used in this study is comparative analysis with a qualitative approach. The study of the quality of rhyme and rhythm is intended to discover the difference in the quality of the rhyme and rhythm occurring in the translated song lyrics. The issue revolves around the translated song lyrics, and to answer the question why, unlike the movies, the songs have failed to attract the interest of Indonesian listeners. One apparent factor is the quality of the rhyme and rhythm in the translated lyrics. In the comparative analysis, this study compared each line of the lyrics in the source and target texts to identify any difference in the values of rhyme and rhythm based on the assessment criteria proposed by Low (2008).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

In the study, we conducted an analysis on the three song lyrics revealing a difference in quality that varies for each aspect of the assessment. The results of the analysis on the quality of rhyme and rhythm of song

lyrics, translated from English to Indonesian, are presented in the following table. The assessment was done according to the method proposed by Low (2003) on assessing the quality of rhyme and rhythm with a slight modification to accommodate a larger number of data. The modification was carried out on the final assessment requiring an average value as the final value for each song lyric that is totalled (without decimals). From these results, the values of rhyme and rhythm for each song are presented (see Table 3).

No.	Song's title of the source text/ target text	Translation method	Rhyme value	Rhythm value
1.	A Whole New World <i>Dunia Baru</i>	Communicative	6 7	8
2.	Can You Feel the Love Tonight <i>Dapatkah Kau Rasakan Cinta</i>	Free	5 6	9
3.	Do You Wanna Build a Snowman? <i>Yuk Buat Boneka Salju</i>	Semantic	7 5	8

Table 3. Results of rhyme values and the difference in rhythm values.

The acquisition of rhyme values in the source text and target text is different. This occurred due to inequality of rhymes from one language to another. The evaluation of each lyric is based on Low's (2008) assessment discussed in the method section of this paper. Each line of each song was assessed by referring to the rhyme proximity value table. After the lyrics of each song were assessed, all the rhyme values of each song were summed up to figure out the average value as the final value of the lyrics. This method of assessment is explained more fully in the rhyme analysis section. In addition, the rhythm assessment was done by comparing the number of beats between the source text and the target text. To get the final rhythm score for the lyrics of one song, the calculation method was conducted in the same way as the rhyme method, namely by calculating the overall average value of the difference in the number of rhythm values, and this is explained in depth in the rhythm analysis section below.

a. Methods for Song Lyric Translation

In the album *We Love Disney*, three different translation methods are used to translate the lyrics of the 12 songs on the album, and they are the communicative, free, and semantic methods. The methods used aimed to determine the quality of rhyme and rhythm of the translation. However, in this section of the analysis, only fragments of the paired song lyrics are presented to demonstrate how the methods have been applied.

The title of the song *A Whole New World* was translated into Indonesian as "*Dunia Baru*" (a new world) (see Table 4). Overall, the communicative translation method was used to translate the lyrics because the outcome is not too rigid and places more emphasis on the target language message. From the first to the fourth line, the translator managed to convey the message in full without sounding too rigid or straying too far from the original. The line "I can show you the world ... shining, shimmering, splendid..." was translated into "*Kan ku perlihatkan ... Dunia yang gemerlap*" (I will show you a shining world). In this communicative translation, the entire message from the source text (ST) was translated into the lines within the target text (TT). For example, the translation of the eighth line in the source text is found on the sixth line in the TT. In this communicative translation, the translator does not translate each word or line. The translator may convey the core message of the lyrics without being fixated on the ST as a whole.

Source text	Target text
A Whole New World	Dunia Baru
I can show you the world	<i>Kan ku perlihatkan</i>
Shining, shimmering, splendid	<i>Dunia yang gemerlap</i>
Tell me, princess, now when did	<i>Katakan puteri kapan hatimu</i>
You last let your heart decide?	<i>bebas memutuskan?</i>
I can open your eyes	<i>Betapa indahny</i>
Take you wonder by wonder	<i>Permadani Ajaib</i>
Over, sideways and under	<i>Bawa kita melayang</i>
On a magic carpet ride	<i>Terbang tinggi di awan</i>
A whole new world	<i>Dunia baru</i>
A new fantastic point of view	<i>Indah bersamamu</i>
No one to tell us no	<i>Tiada yang melarang</i>

Table 4. Communicative translation method in the song lyrics of *Dunia Baru*.

The lyrics of the song titled *Can You Feel the Love Tonight* (see Table 5) were translated using a free translation method. The use of this method is already apparent from the first line of the paired lyrics between the source and target texts. In the first line of the lyrics, the sentence “There’s calm surrender to the rush of day” was translated into Indonesian as “*Hari telah tiba dipenghujungnya*” (the day had come to its end). The opening of the paired lyrics conveys a sense of sadness, although the words of the source and target texts are not the same. In general, the song lyrics in the target language present the same message as in the ST. However, some of the lyrics have been changed by the translator to make them more singable in Indonesian, also to allow the translated lyrics to be sung in the same rhythm as the lyrics of the original song.

Source text	Target text
Can You Feel the Love Tonight	Dapatkan Kau Rasakan Cinta
There’s a calm surrender	<i>Hari telah tiba</i>
to the rush of day	<i>Di penghujungnya</i>
When the heat of the rolling world	<i>Ketika langit menjingga</i>
can be turned away	<i>Redakan dunia</i>
An enchanted moment	<i>Saat magis ini</i>
and it sees me through	<i>Jawaban mimpi</i>
It’s enough for this restless warrior	<i>Tak lain yang ku ingin hanya</i>
just to be with you	<i>Kau di sampingku</i>
And can you feel the love tonight?	<i>Dan rasakan getar cinta</i>
It is where we are	<i>Antara kita</i>

Table 5. Free translation method in the song lyrics of *Dapatkan Kau Rasakan Cinta*.

The semantic translation method is clearly apparent in each line of the translated lyrics in the target text of the song titled *Under the Sea* (see Table 6). In this translation, each line of the source and target texts has the same meaning. The translator does not skip any line of the message in the translated lyrics. Only one or two words are not translated because eliminating them does not change the message in the TT. For example, the line “Out in the sun they slave away” was translated into “*Mandi peluh sinar matahari*” (*bathing in sweat in the sun*). Although the translator is quite faithful with regard to the core message, the method may not be entirely suitable for translating song lyrics since the outcome may seem a bit too rigid.

Source Text	Target Text
Under the Sea	Bawah Laut
In somebody else's lake	<i>Di danau orang lain</i>
Right here on the ocean floor	<i>Dasar samudera ini</i>
Out in the sun they slave away	<i>Mandi peluh sinar mentari</i>
Full time to floatin'	<i>Berenang-renang</i>
The fish on the land ain't happy	<i>Ikan di darat sengsara,</i>
Nobody beat us	<i>Tak ada yang kan bisa</i>
Fry us and eat us	<i>Membahayakan kita</i>
In fricassee	<i>Kita dikejar disantap,</i>
Under the sea we off the hook	<i>Di bawah laut kita aman</i>
Even the sturgeon an' the ray	<i>Ikan pari dan petelur</i>
They get the urge 'n' start to play	<i>Mereka semua bermain</i>
The plaice play the bass	<i>Si pipi main bas</i>

Table 6. Semantic translation method in the song lyrics of *Bawah Laut*.

b. Rhyme Analysis

The findings of the study revealed that song lyrics translated using the communicative and free methods yielded better rhyme values than the ST. Using the communicative method, the lyrics of *A Whole New World* obtained a value of 6, while the translated lyrics in *Dunia Baru* got 7. In the free method, the lyrics of *Can You Feel the Love Tonight* got a value of 5, whereas the translated lyrics in *Dapatkah Kau Rasakan Cinta* obtained a value of 6. An increase in rhyme quality in both of these translated songs was observed compared to the original song lyrics. The increase in rhyme quality is due to fact that the communicative and free methods provide the translator with more varied word choices. The translator has more room to maneuver and is not fixated to any word in the original lyrics.

The findings of the study reveal that the results of the semantic method yield a lower rhyme value than the original song. The semantic translation method only provides the translator limited room to maneuver. Word choices under this method are more restricted; therefore, the resulting rhyme value is lower than that using the other translation methods. The translated lyrics of *Do You Wanna Build a Snowman* obtain a value of 5 in the TT, whereas its ST gets a value of 7. Meanwhile, the lyrics *Under the Sea* get a value of 6, whereas the original song obtains a value of 7. These findings show that the lyrics translated using the semantic method cannot deliver a rhyme value that matches or is higher than the source language, as the translation emphasizes the message of the original language. Consequently, according to the result of the study, the use of the semantic method is not recommended due to its inability to produce lyrics with good rhymes in songs translated from English to Indonesian.

c. Rhyme with Open Syllables

Rhyme with open syllables consists of words where the last syllable in the lines contains a vowel sound 'a, e, i, o or u'. We can see that the translator put in rhymes in the TT despite the absence of rhyme in the ST.

Example:

Source text	Target text
"The fish on the land ain't happy"	" <i>Ikan di darat sengsara,</i> "
"They are sad 'cause they are in their bowl"	" <i>Sedih di kotak kaca</i> "

In this example, we can see that the two lines of the lyrics in the ST do not rhyme. Meanwhile, in the TT, we can see the rhyme consists of paired open syllables, in this case the vowel /a/. The translator chose to translate the line 'ain't happy' into 'sengsara', although the translator had the option to match 'ain't happy' with 'tidak bahagia' (*unhappy*) or 'sedih' (*sad*). In the second line, the translator chose the word 'kaca' in the TT to create a rhyme in those two lines. A match, basically, for the word 'bowl' ending with /a/ is limited to 'kotak kaca' (*glass box*) or 'mangkuk kaca' (*glass bowl*) to describe a type of container where fish are usually kept.

The selection of words in the first and second lines in the above example created a rhyme with /a/. The value for this pair is three (3) because the words do not have the same number of syllables and different onset. A value of 3 is awarded to open syllables without sound similarity in the first sound of the syllable; hence, sound similarity only occurs in the last sound of the syllable. The words 'sengsara' and 'kaca' have sound similarity only in the vowel, namely /a/.

Example:

Source text	Target text
"A whole new world"	"Dunia baru"
"A new fantastic point of view"	"Indah bersamamu"

In the above example, the translated lyrics have a rhyme ending with /u/, while the original is preceded by the same vowel (A). The differentiating aspect of this paired rhyme is the number of syllables affecting the scoring of the paired rhyme in the TT. This is an example of song lyrics translated using a communicative method. Although it does not faithfully conform to the message in each line of the original song, the translation of the lyrics still adheres to the core context, i.e. the core message of the song is still conveyed to the listeners. The translator uses the words 'baru' and 'bersamamu' to create a rhyme ending with /u/ in the TT by using the communicative method.

The value for these paired rhymes is 7 because they have the same consonant at the beginning of the words and the same vowel at the end of the words, although the sounds of the words are not similar as a whole. In the reference-scoring table, these paired rhymes are referred to as 'close but not identical consonants'. However, keep in mind that song translation requires a high degree of creativity to create an interesting rhyme. One may argue that the method chosen by the translator is the crucial factor in creating a good rhyme in the target song.

d. Rhyme with closed syllables

Rhymes with closed syllables contain words where the last sound of a line is a consonant. Just like in open syllables, the rhyme assessment in closed syllables will yield specific scores in the translated lyrics.

Example:

Source text	Target text
"I'm like a shooting star"	"Bagai bintang jatuh"
"I've come so far"	"Ku tlah jauh"

In the above example, the rhyme of both lines in the English words ends with the same rhyme /ar/; meanwhile, in the target language, the rhyme is /uh/. The English and Indonesian lyrics are examples of paired rhymes ending with a consonant, albeit in a different category of value. Words in the English lyrics

have the same end, which is /ar/, but begin with a different sound; therefore, these rhymes in English get a value of 8. However, the paired rhymes in Indonesian receive a value of 10, because of the /uh/ and /uh/ endings and the syllables that begin with /ja/. Paired words with the same syllables in the beginning and the end are seen as excellent translation based on Low's assessment method. From this example, we can see that the translator has managed to pair the rhyme better than the original song without altering the message. When it comes to rhyme, the ability to compose a good rhyme also affects the quality of rhyme assessment in song lyric translation.

Example:

Source text	Target text
"The plaice play the bass"	"Si pipi main bas"
"The bass play the brass"	"Si bas main bras"

In the example, we can see that the translator was helped by the ST in the search for the rhyme in the TT. However, the assigned values are still based on the translation result. In the ST, these two lines in the lyrics are rhymed, namely 'bass' and 'brass'. Those two words are types of musical instruments, and the Indonesian words for these instruments are quite similar. The words 'bas' and 'bras' are the Indonesian adaptation of the English words and as such they were used in the translated song lyrics. The paired words in the translation were assigned a value of 10. This highest score was awarded because both sounds are very close, with only one sound difference. Both words start with /b/, followed with /a/ in the middle, and end with /s/. Rhyme value distribution according to Low are those words with sound closeness in the beginning and at the end of the final syllable will get a score of 10.

In the above examples, the assessment was carried out in lines containing the rhyme and rhythm in accordance with the assessment method proposed by Low. The development of the assessment method was conducted to find the average of the rhyme values, which were used as the final value, and because the study was not limited to a single line, but it covered the lyrics of the whole song. Meanwhile, with regard to rhythm analysis, after the difference between the source and target songs was established, the mean value was calculated to be used as the final value for the lyrics of the entire song. Both results for the rhyme and rhythm are presented in Table 4. In addition to developing a method for calculating the values, the study also endeavored to examine the quality of rhyme and rhythm in the translations using the three translation methods used in the album *We Love Disney*, and from there we found which translation method was the most suitable for translating song lyrics from English to Indonesian. We used the following formula and the calculation results can be seen in Tables 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, and 12 (see the Appendix).

$$\text{Rhyme value} = \frac{\text{Total acquisition of rhyme points in one song lyrics}}{\text{Frequency of rhyme pairing occurrences}}$$

e. Rhythm Analysis

In rhythm assessment, we can see that the free translation method yielded a value of 9, which was the highest value of rhythm quality compared to that produced by the other methods. The rhythm in the lyrics of the two translated songs was almost identical with that of the source song. The free method used in translating the lyrics was not restricted to the context in each line; instead, it covered the context of the lyrics of the whole song. Using the free method, the translator had the freedom to play with the words and substitute them as necessary so as not to significantly change the rhythm of the original song. The different number of syllables

in both lyrics of the ST and TT may have occur because one or two lines of the lyrics were erased or added; therefore, the number of syllables in the Indonesian texts could be shorter or longer. The difference occurred due to the unique word characteristics in each language. In English, a single syllable may form a word. Meanwhile, in Indonesian, one word usually consists of two or three syllables. For example, the word 'to' in English consists of only one syllable, whereas its Indonesian equivalent '*kepada*' consists of three syllables.

On the other hand, lyrics in the target language, translated from the ST using the communicative and semantic translation methods, received the same or lower rhythm values compared to the one translated using the free method. The song lyrics translated using the communicative and semantic methods produce a rhythmic difference occurring frequently in each line of the translation, albeit with a small difference in the number of rhymes or syllables (-1). Both obtained a lower value than the free method because the translator might have been too fixated on the lyrics of the source song and followed them in sequence. In the case of lyrics translated using the communicative method, the translator followed the sequence of the story line. Similarly, in the semantic method, the lyrics were translated in sequence following each line in the ST.

Rhythm assessment was carried out by counting the number of syllables in each line of the lyrics because the number of syllables affected the rhythm. If the translated lyrics and the lyrics in the source language have the same number of syllables in each line, then the rhythm of the translated lyrics will be the same as that of the source language. The use of the communicative and semantic methods will present quite a challenge for the translator to create rhymes that match the original lyrics in the source song. When using a free method, the translator does not have to be fixated on the lyrics in each line of the source song; they just have to follow the message of the song. In that way, the free method will not yield great syllabic differences in the target lyrics. However, a translator using the free method might find difficulties when confronted with a line of lyrics containing more syllables. A long string of syllables may lead to a translation that is shorter or even longer than the source lyrics.

Example:

Source text	Target text
"A hundred thousand things to see"	" <i>Banyak yang ku harus tahu</i> "
ā hun·dred thou·sand 'thiŋs tə 'sē (8)	Ba·nyak yang ha·rus ku ta·hu (8)

The above example was taken from song lyrics translated using the communicative method. The number of syllables in the example above is the same, i.e. 8 syllables. It means that both have the same rhythm; therefore, the song in the target language can be sung in the same rhythm as the source song. In the ST, we see the phrase 'a hundred thousand', translated into Indonesian as '*banyak*' (*many*). In this case, the translator has attempted to retain the rhythm or the number of syllables in the song lyrics by omitting some elements in the translation. This is a correct procedure that ensures that the rhythm stays the same, and the message in the lyrics does not change.

The words in the ST had different characteristics from those in the TT. In the TT, the words consisted of more than one syllable, whereas in the ST there were quite a few words consisting of only one syllable. When both ST and TT had the same number of syllables, the rhythm of the translated and original songs was the same; thus, the translation in the target language was not be deducted for rhythm quality. Furthermore, the translation has successfully responded to the challenge of translating English song lyrics into Indonesian.

Example:

Source text	Target text
"In fricassee"	"Kita dikejar disantap"
in fric·as·see (4)	ki·ta di·ke·jar di·san·tap (8)

ST and TT had a different number of syllables. The number of syllables in the ST was 4, while the TT has 8 syllables. A translation of song lyrics with more than a difference of 3-syllables is considered to alter the melody. Therefore, the translated line will be deducted by -3 because there was more than the 3-syllable difference out of the total score of 10 for the lyrics. A difference of 3 syllables in the TT made the translated lyrics different from the original lyrics when sung; therefore, the line got 5 points after point deduction.

The above example is taken from the song lyrics, translated using a free method. The source and target texts had a syllabic difference of 4, making the rhythm of the song in the TT differ from the ST, which in turn affected the quality of the translation. The word 'in fricassee' means fine meat for eating, yet the translation in the TT did not convey the same meaning, and the rhythm was not the same as in the ST. However, the Indonesian translation still followed the context in the lyrics, namely 'dikejar' (*being chased*) and 'disantap' (*eaten*). Nevertheless, the translator actually had other options to ensure that the song lyrics would still adhere to the context with the appropriate rhythm (four syllables) for 'dan disantap' (*and eaten*) or 'dihidangkan' (*served*).

Example:

Source text	Target text
"Just look at the world around you"	"lihat dunia sekitarmu"
	li·hat du·nia se·ki·tar·mu ·

The above example is a song lyric translated using the semantic method which emphasizes the message of the ST. In the example above, we can see that the translator translated the line of the ST into a command just like the original lyrics. The translator attempted to match the rhyme so it could be sung in Indonesian just like the original song. In this song, each line was translated in the same line position; therefore, the Indonesian lyrics become 'lihat dunia sekitarmu' (*look at your surrounding*). The translator omitted the word 'just' so the lyrics could be sung just like the source song without changing the meaning. In this example, the song lyrics had no difference. Because of the translator's faithfulness to the rhyme, no point was deducted from these lyrics. In this line, there were no syllabic or rhythmic differences between the target and source lyrics. In the semantic method, there were no significant syllabic differences, and the frequency of syllabic difference was quite small.

Based on the analysis of rhythm quality in translated song lyrics, we may conclude that the communicative and semantic methods are not suitable for translating song lyrics from English to Indonesian. In contrast, the free method obtained the highest score in terms of rhythm. It means that the free method may be the best option for composing translated song lyrics from English to Indonesian while still maintaining a good rhyme. Although it did not faithfully adhere to the ST, song lyrics translated with the free method manage to produce lyrics with a better rhyme than with any other methods.

CONCLUSION

Based on the data and the rhythm aspect, the translator successfully translated some of the songs, while some other songs were not successfully translated. This is clearly apparent from the small differences in tone made by the translator when translating the lyrics into Indonesian. The song lyrics with the best value in rhythm quality are

the lyrics translated using a free translation method because they were not too dependent on the ST. Although the free method obtained the highest score among the other methods, there is another aspect, namely, rhyme that also determines the quality of a translated song. In translating English song lyrics into Indonesian, the paired rhymes, translated using communicative and free methods, tend to be better. Meanwhile, lyric translation using a semantic method tends to yield a lower score because the translator is too fixated on the words of the source language, which stifle the translator's creativity in selecting and using the words. When translating song lyrics, the translator should not be too attached to the ST because they will not be able to create a good rhyme. Overall, the free method yields better scores with regard to the quality of rhyme and rhythm in the translated song lyrics. The free method has the capacity to deliver the messages without being fixated on the original text; therefore, it is suitable for translating song lyrics from English to Indonesian.

Translating song lyrics is a challenge for translators because they have to consider rhymes and rhythms, including the challenge of the listeners' tastes that differ from one culture to another. From the study above, it can be concluded that the translation of song lyrics in the *We Love Disney* album can be said to be partially successful. The success is seen from the rhythm that has obtained high scores in the three sample translation methods used in the album. Meanwhile, in terms of rhyme, among the three sample translation methods used there was only one translation method whose value became worse than the rhyme value in the song of the source language, namely the semantic method. The diverse tastes of the listeners for the song lyrics translation require the translator to be more proficient in translating rhymes in songs to increase the audience's interest in the song. The research on the translated lyrics of this song is interesting but still very much needs to be developed in other aspects to measure the translation quality of the song lyrics.

REFERENCES

- Akerstrom, Johanna. 2009. *Translating song lyrics: A study of the translation of the Three Musicals by Benny Anderson and Bjorn Ulvaeus*. Swedia: Sodertorns University.
- Aminoroaya, Shiva. & Zahra Amirian. 2016. Investigating the translation of songs in Persian dubbed animated movies. *SKASE journal of translation and interpretation* 10: 44–68.
- Bogucki, Łukasz. 2016. *Areas and methods of audiovisual translation research*. 2nd Revised Edition. Frankfurt: Peter Lang.
- Dewi, Haru D. & Andika Wijaya. 2011. *Dasar-Dasar Penerjemahan Umum (Introduction to General Translation)*. Edisi Revisi. Bandung: Penerbit Manggu.
- Johnson, Randolph, David Huron, & Lauren Collister. 2014. Music and lyrics interaction and their influence on recognition of sung words: an investigation of word frequency, rhyme, metric stress, vocal timbre, melisma, and repetition priming. *Empirical musicology review* 9, no. 1: 2–20.
- Low, Peter. 2003. Singable translations of songs. *Perspectives* 11: 87–103. DOI: 10. 1080/0907676X. 2003. 9961466.
- Low, Peter. 2008. Translating songs that rhyme. *Perspectives* 16: 1–2.
- Newmark, Peter. 1988. *A textbook of translation*. London: Prentice Hall International.
- Nida, Eugene. 1964. *A. Toward a science of translating*. Leiden, the Netherlands: E.J. Brill.
- Oliveira, Hugo Gonçalo, Amílcar Cardoso, & Francisco C. Pereira. 2005. Tra-la-Lyrics: an approach to generate text based on rhythm. *PROCEEDINGS OF THE 4TH. INTERNATIONAL JOINT WORKSHOP ON COMPUTATIONAL CREATIVITY*. London: Goldsmiths, University of London.

APPENDIX

Source Lyric	Target Lyric	Rhyme
A Whole New World	Dunia Baru	
I can show you the world You last let your heart decide?	<i>Kan ku perlihatkan bebas memutuskan?</i>	7
A whole new world A new fantastic point of view	<i>Dunia baru Indah bersamamu</i>	5
A whole new world A dazzling place I never knew	<i>Dunia baru Yang belum pernah ku tahu</i>	5
But when I'm way up here It's crystal clear	<i>Dan jelas sekali Dari sini,</i>	5
I'm like a shooting star I've come so far	<i>Bagai bintang jatuh, ku telah jauh</i>	10
A whole new world With new horizons to pursue	<i>Dunia baru Dengan cakrawala baru</i>	9
I'll chase them anywhere There's time to spare	<i>Ku kan mengejanya, Ada waktunya</i>	7
Total of Rhyme		48
Average Mistakes of Rhyme		7
Rhyme Value		6.8
Even Value		7

$$\text{Rhyme value} = \frac{\text{Total acquisition of rhyme points in one song lyric}}{\text{Frequency of rhyme pairing occurrences}} = \frac{48}{7} = 6.8$$

Table 7. Recapitulation of the role value of song lyric translation titled *Dunia Baru*.

Source Lyric	Target Lyric	Rhyme
Color of the Wind	Warna Angin	
You think I'm an ignorant savage I guess it must be so	<i>Pikir bung, ku orang yang tak berada ke seluruh dunia</i>	5
And you've been so many places But still I cannot see	<i>Memang kau telah pergi Tapi ku tak mengerti</i>	5
How can there be so much that you don't know You don't know	<i>Mengapa banyak hal yang kau tak tahu yang kau tak tahu</i>	9
Has a life, has a spirit, has a name You think the only people who are people	<i>Berjiwa, punya hati, bernama Kau anggap yang kau lihat itu sama</i>	9
You'll learn things you never knew, you never knew Have you ever heard the wolf cry to the blue corn moon	<i>Kau belajar hal yang belum kau tahu, kau tak tahu Dengarlah tangis serigala di bulan biru</i>	5
And for once, never wonder what they're worth And we are all connected to each other	<i>Tanpa harus kau peduli nilainya Kita diciptakan untuk bersama</i>	5
The rainstorm and the river are my brothers The heron and the otter are my friends	<i>Hujan badai dan sungai saudaraku Bangau dan berang-berang temanku</i>	7
Total of Rhyme		45
Average Mistakes of Rhyme		6
Rhyme Value		6.8
Even Value		7

$$\text{Rhyme value} = \frac{\text{Total acquisition of rhyme points in one song lyric}}{\text{Frequency of rhyme pairing occurrences}} = \frac{45}{7} = 6.8$$

Table 8. Recapitulation of the role value of song lyric translation of *Warna Angin*.

Source Lyric	Target Lyric	Rhyme
Can You Feel the Love Tonight	Dapatkah Kau Rasakan Cinta	
There's a calm surrender to the rush of day	<i>Hari telah tiba Di penghujungnya</i>	5
When the heat of the rolling world can be turned away	<i>Ketika langit menjingga Redakan dunia</i>	5
An enchanted moment and it sees me through	<i>Saat malam ini Jawaban mimpi</i>	5
And can you feel the love tonight? It is where we are	<i>Dan rasakan getar cinta antara kita</i>	7
How it's laid to rest believe the very best	<i>Alam saksinya Kita selamanya</i>	10
if they only learn moves us all in turn	<i>Jalani ini untuk temukan hati</i>	5
to the wild outdoors beats in time with yours	<i>Masa bahagia Tak berdetak sama</i>	5
Total of Rhyme		42
Average Mistakes of Rhyme		7
Rhyme Value		6

$$\text{Rhyme value} = \frac{\text{Total acquisition of rhyme points in one song lyric}}{\text{Frequency of rhyme pairing occurrences}} = \frac{42}{7} = 6$$

Table 9. Recapitulation of the role value of song lyric translation titled *Dapatkah Kau Rasakan Cinta*.

Source Lyric	Target Lyric	Rhyme
Dream is A Wish Your Heart Makes	Mimpi adalah Harapan	
When you're fast asleep In dreams you will lose your heartaches	<i>Kata hatimu Tak ada sakit dan sendu</i>	7
Have faith in your dreams and someday Your rainbow will come smiling through	<i>Percaya mimpi-mimpimu Kisah nyata yang menunggu</i>	7
No matter how your heart is grieving If you keep on believing	<i>Tak akan terhindari lelah percaya dan senyumlah</i>	9
Total of Rhyme		23
Average Mistakes of Rhyme		3
Rhyme Value		7.6
Even Value		8

$$\text{Rhyme value} = \frac{\text{Total acquisition of rhyme points in one song lyric}}{\text{Frequency of rhyme pairing occurrences}} = \frac{23}{3} = 7.6$$

Table 10. Recapitulation of the role value of song lyric translation titled *Mimpi adalah Harapan*.

Source Lyric	Target Lyric	Rhyme
Do you wanna build a snowman	Yuk Buat Boneka Salju	
Do you wanna build a snowman? Come on, let's go and play!	<i>Yuk buat boneka salju Mainlah denganku</i>	5
We used to be best buddies And now we're not	<i>Dulu kita bersama, Kini beda</i>	5
I've started talking to The pictures on the walls!	<i>Bosan dan ku mulai Bergurau sendiri</i>	3
All these empty rooms Just watching the hours tick by ...	<i>Aku tanpamu Hanya menghitung waktu</i>	5
They say, 'have courage' and I'm trying to I'm right out here for you	<i>Semua mencarimu Mereka ingin (mereka ingin)</i>	9
It's just you and me What are we gonna do?	<i>Sekarang yang tersisa hanya kita Harus bagaimana...</i>	5
Total of Rhyme		32
Average Mistakes of Rhyme		6
Rhyme Value		5.3
Even Value		5
Rhyme value = $\frac{\text{Total acquisition of rhyme points in one song lyric}}{\text{Frequency of rhyme pairing occurrences}} = \frac{32}{5} = 5.3$		

Table 11. Recapitulation of the role value of song lyric translation titled *Yuk Buat Boneka Salju*.

Source Lyric	Target Lyric	Rhyme
Under the Sea	Bawah Laut	
Just look at the world around you Such wonderful things surround you	<i>lihat dunia sekitarmu, yang terindah di sekelilingmu,</i>	7
Right here on the ocean floor What more is you lookin' for?	<i>dasar samudera ini apa lagi yang kau cari</i>	3
The fish on the land ain't happy They sad 'cause they in their bowl	<i>ikan di darat sengsara, sedih di kotak kaca</i>	3
One day when the boss get hungry Guess who's gon' be on the plate	<i>apabila si bos kelaparan tebak siapa dimakan</i>	2
Nobody beat us Fry us and eat us	<i>tak ada yang kan bisa membahayakan kita</i>	3
Under the sea The newt play the flute	<i>di bawah laut kadal tiup flute,</i>	4
The plaice play the bass The bass play the brass	<i>si pipi main bas si bas main bras,</i>	6
The trout rockin' out They know where it's at	<i>ikan trout goyang, berenang-renang</i>	6
Each little slug here Under the sea	<i>setiap siput di bawah laut</i>	6
Total of Rhyme		45
Average Mistakes of Rhyme		9
Rhyme Value		5
Rhyme value = $\frac{\text{Total acquisition of rhyme points in one song lyric}}{\text{Frequency of rhyme pairing occurrences}} = \frac{45}{9} = 5$		

Table 12. Recapitulation of the role value of song lyric translation titled *Bawah Laut*.