Social Media and Poverty: Paradoxes of Communicating Poverty Issues on Social Media

Rutiana Dwi Wahyunengseh
Study Program of Public Administration, Universitas Sebelas Maret; Indonesia

Sri Hastjarjo
Study Program of Communication Science, Universitas Sebelas Maret; Indonesia

Didik G. Suharto
Study Program of Public Administration, Universitas Sebelas Maret; Indonesia

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarhub.ui.ac.id/jbb

International Journal of Administrative Science & Organization, September 2018
Bisnis & Birokrasi: Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi dan Organisasi

Volume 25, Number 3

Social Media and Poverty: Paradoxes of Communicating Poverty Issues on Social Media

Rutiana Dwi Wahyunengseh[1], Sri Hastjarjo[2], Didik G. Suharto[3]
Study Program of Public Administration, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Indonesia[1,3]
Study Program of Communication Science, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Indonesia[2]
rutianadwi@staff.uns.ac.id[1]; sri.hastjarjo@staff.uns.ac.id[2]; didikgsuharto@staff.uns.ac.id[3]

Abstract. From the democratic theory perspective, social media is a means to improve collaborative public governance between government, society, and business sector, in order to ensure effective public issues management as well as public services. On the other hand, there are preconditions for the effective use of media social; in the context of addressing poverty issues, these preconditions have potential to generate certain paradoxes. This article aims to answer a question "Is the use of social media effective to the poverty alleviation mainstreaming issue?" This study was conducted in one of the cities that won Smart City Award in Indonesia; using content analysis on the "Monggo Lapor" Facebook group combined with the mapping of Local Government Apparatus and poor people group's perception on the use of social media for poverty issue through focus group discussion. The data then was analyzed using Institutional Theory approaches to identify the paradoxes that emerge from the using of social media in process of communication addressing poverty issues. The result shows that poverty issues were marginalized in the discussion using Facebook group, because of the culture of the bureaucracy in the local government and the culture of the society. The paradoxes arising were, i) democratic-elitist; ii) functional-artificial ones. The emerging paradoxes resulted from the inconsistency of the Local Government in implementing e-government for addressing poverty issues and the elitism in using the social media as a tool for power control by society. Social Media "Monggo Lapor" has not functioned intensively as the means of expressing voice and communicating between people and government for poverty issue, but it had functioned intensively for non-poverty issues, so that non-poor group enjoy its usefulness more. It indicated that the group with excess power had a higher ability of using social media. This paper recommends further research focusing on building social media readiness model, particularly for developing an inclusive regulation for poverty alleviation.

Keywords: poverty, paradox, social media, institutional theory

Abstrak. *Dalam perspektif teori demokrasi, media sosial menjadi alat meningkatkan public governance yang kolaboratif di antara pemerintah, masyarakat, dan dunia usaha, untuk menghasilkan efektifitas dalam penanganan isu publik atau dalam penyelenggaraan pelayanan publik. Di sisi lain, penggunaan sosial media yang efektif memiliki prasyarat tertentu yang memunculkan paradoks ketika digunakan dalam konteks penanganan isu kemiskinan. Artikel ini bertujuan menjawab permasalahan apakah penggunaan sosial media efektif bagi isu pengarusutamaan penanggulangan kemiskinan? Mengambil lokasi di sebuah kota di Indonesia yang pernah menerima Smart City Award, penelitian ini menggunakan metode analisis isi atas group Facebook "Monggo Lapor" dan pemetaan persepsi aparat Pemerintah Kota dan kelompok masyarakat miskin tentang pemanfaatan media sosial untuk isu kemiskinan melalui focus group discussion. Data yang terkumpul dianalisis menggunakan pendekatan Teori Kelembagaan untuk mengidentifikasi paradoks dalam proses komunikasi isu kemiskinan menggunakan media sosial. Kebaruan dari penelitian ini adalah pada usaha mengungkap potensi paradok dalam penggunaan media sosial untuk membahas isu kemiskinan. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa dalam group Facebook yang diteliti, isu kemiskinan justru terpinggirkan karena faktor kultur dalam birokrasi Pemerintah Daerah dan masyarakat. Paradok yang muncul adalah, i) paradok demokratis-elitis; ii)paradok fungsional-artificial. Penyebab paradoks yang muncul adalah inkonsistensi Pemerintah Daerah dalam komitmennya mengimplementasikan e-governance untuk isu kemiskinan dan elitisme pemanfaatan media sosial. Media sosial "Monggo Lapor" belum berfungsi sebagai sarana menyampaikan suara dan komunikasi diantara masyarakat dan pemerintah secara intensif untuk isu kemiskinan, namun intensif untuk isu-isu non kemiskinan, sehingga kelompok non misin lebih menikmati kemanfaatan. Hal ini menunjukkan kelompok yang memiliki kelebihan akses kekuasaan dapat menggunakan media sosial sebagai alat kontrol kekuasaan. Inilah paradoks demokrasi, media sosial yang diasumsikan demokratis, namun tetap mendukung kekuatan elit. Penelitian selanjutnya disarankan untuk menemukan model social media readiness secara khusus bagi kebijakan penanggulangan kemiskinan yang inklusif.*

Kata kunci*: kemiskinan, paradoks, media sosial, teori kelembagaan*

INTRODUCTION

The use of information technology in governance (e-governance) is believed to improve the bureaucracy's ability of managing government and public service, as well as the quality of people and business performers' engagement with solving public affairs issues. Although the role and advantages of the use of informaion and communication technology (ICT), in this case social media, in public service has been acknowledged by many studies, but

there is still few number of studies that discuss the use of ICT in addressing poverty issues in the society. What we could infer from recent studies is that social media can be a mean of expanding the development of an issue and raising support from community group with shared ideology and world view. This might result in positive and negative implications. In a democratic public sphere, public communication on social media could also result in a paradox. A Paradox is a statement opposite the common argument or the truth, but in fact containing truth. Paradox in this article explains about the inconsistent utilization of public complain forum through facebook by government and people. The intended inconsistency is a phenomenon of social media-based forum developed officially by government that should represent democratic values including government's direct responsibility, public active participation, and inclusive network but in practice instead perpetuates conventional development approach and mainstreams the dependency on government in online space.

Monggo Lapor (https://id-id.facebook.com/monggolapor/), which means "please report to us", is a Facebook Group initiated and managed by Tim Penanganan Pengaduan Masyarakat (Public Complain Management Team) of a local government in Central Java, Indonesia. The group is used by local government to gather complains, comments, and information from the public regarding various issues concerning public services. The group's administrator then distributed the complaints or information to the mayor or to related offices. This article explores the result of content analysis on public complaints in the Monggo Lapor which are related to poverty issues. In analyzing the data, this study use institutional theory to explain paradox characteristic of information technology (particularly social media) in e-governance, particularly in developing inclusive poverty alleviation policy. This article aimed to answer the question "Is the use of social media effective to the poverty alleviation mainstreaming issue?" This study also provides notes for further research on social media use for solving contemporary e-governance dilemma.

In Indonesia, the growth of internet use occupies the rank in the world, with growth rate of 10% (Katadata, 2018). "Essential Insights Into Internet, Social Media, Mobile, and E-Commerce Use Around The World" published on January 30, 2018 suggests that the number of social-media active users reaches 130 millions or 49% of 265 millions populations. Considering the mean site traffic per month, Facebook (FB) is the social media mostly visited, with the following user profiles, i) number of visitors is more than 1 millions per month; ii) mean access time is 12 minutes and 27 seconds; iii) about 92% access Facebook via mobile; iv) proportion of users by gender consists of: 44% female and 56% male; v) dominants users aged 18-24 years, with gender identity: 20.4% female and 24.2% male (Kompas, March 1, 2018). Those figures indicate that Indonesians are ready to support one of the targets of National Development Roadmap, where all cities throughout Indonesia should be qualified to be technology and local culture-based smart cities in 2045.

Viewed from theoretical aspect, the implementation of e-governance and e-democracy improves public perception on government effectiveness and democratic responsiveness. Although the implementation of ICT is inseparable from the existing shortages, the development of information technology-based interaction between government and people is inevitable to improve transparency, public participation, collaboration between stakeholders, and social accountability. A shortage often found is the smoothness of communication function is dependent on the activation of response among actors involved (Eggers, 2004; Noveck, 2009, 2011).

One of the format of information technology-based interaction between government and people, among others, is social media. Social media, according to McGraw Hill Dictionary, is a means used by individuals to interact with each other by means of creating, sharing, and exchanging information and idea in a virtual network and community. Social media is defined as an internet-based application group building on Web 2.0 ideology and technology, and enabling the creation and exchange of user-generated content. This platform encourages the government to develop social media for a two way-communication with the public (West, 2004; Bryer, 2010). Definition of social media from communication and other studies often refers to three main points, i) digital technology emphasizing on user-generated content or interaction; ii) multi-media characteristic; and iii) social network. Social media is essentially a communication between human beings having participation, opened, conversation, community, and interconnectedness characteristics (Kaplan & Haenlein, 2010; Carr & Hayes, 2015; Eggers, 2004; Noveck, 2009, 2011). Proponent of social media believes that its use was considered as advantageous due to its low cost to explore varying ideas, information, and opinion from the other people and to give an opportunity of communicating in a group of people, even during communication crisis (Wright & Hinson, 2009). On the other side, some of its opponent argues that ICT penetration results in new imperialism and technology power deification (McLennan, 2016), as well as its potential to become a threat against privacy (deOliveira, 2013).

Besides the pros and cons of the use of ICT, especially n social media, there is also a prevalence concern on its ability to give positive implications on encountering social problems. A very crucial social issue, such as poverty in Indonesia, is no exeception in this case. World Bank records Indonesia into the top three states contributing urban poor people, following China and Philippines in East Asian and Pacific areas in 2018. Among ASEAN states, about 90% of poor people live in Indonesia and Philippines. In 2018, Indonesia occupies the 92nd poorest state in the world in IMF and World Bank Version. With 10.6% of the population living below poverty line, Indonesia is positioned at the 35th in the world's poorest country list (total of 126 countries) by the World Bank (Focus Economics, 2018).

Lopez and Stack (1998) explain that social structure of poor group is indeed real, but social structure of poverty is not autonomous and does not determine human behavior, but its existence is constantly built in the meaning of words frequently communicated and behavior within society. Consequently, poverty and poverty culture can be strengthened through the existing social network. This perspective seems to support statement that social media use for poverty issue will deal with more complex challenge to adapt to and to adopt it due to inferior social-cultural

122 **International Journal of Administrative Science & Organization, September 2018**
Bisnis & Birokrasi: Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi dan Organisasi

Volume 25, Number 3

environment the poor group has.

Referring to Lopez and Stack's (1998) opinion that social structure of poverty affects the production of poor group's word, meaning, and behavior, the truth of such assumption still needs further study. Social media and poverty issue have not been studied specifically in the study of the use of social media. Based on this condition, the study on social media and poverty is still relevant and urgent to discuss.

As stated above that using social media provides positive and also negative effects. De Oliveira and Welch (2013) review 6 studies finding that the advantage of social media use is to "enhance the quality of government", by improving civic engagement, citizen participation in government, mobilization against authoritarian regimes, and customer service. Another study (Sobaci, 2016) conducted literature review on the advantages and the disadvantages of social media use by local government, with majority facebook and twitter users. He referred to 42 researches conducted in 8 states on social media and local issues finding that the topic discussed included, i) Presence and use; ii) Adoption and diffusion; iii) Communication and citizen engagement; iv) Transparency, accountability, and participation; v) Local election, campaign, and politics; vi) City planning; vii) Emergency. The finding of studies mention that the advantages of social media use for the media of communication with people in the attempt of getting input to the local government policy are, i) improving efficiency and productivity; ii) improving local public services; iii) improving policy making; iv) strengthening the local democracy; v) collaboration and knowledge management.

On the other hand, the study conducted in eight states also found that the use of social media in local government has several disadvantages as well due to, i) leadership, organizational culture and political culture; ii) lack of sufficient resources; iii) Information and Content Concerns; reputational risks. Furthermore Wahyunengseh's (2016) study found that ICT use for public service and providing public participation space for monitoring government's performance do not always run effectively because social, environment, value order, and cultural environment underlying government and people's behavior are not always compatible to the characteristics of ICT. The propositions formulated from the study are as follow, i) ICT application not automatically results in a democratic public service when bureaucratic patriarchic culture is still dominant; ii) bureaucratic cooptation and public distrust trigger the inception of pseudo e-governance. Transparent and reliable value order is the basic requirement of ICT-based relation between the government and the citizens.

Although studies on strength and weakness of social media use, one form of which is facebook, have been revealed by previous researchers, study on social media and poverty issue has not been explored widely. Some of previous studies found that social media contributes to poverty issue in three ways (Afridi, 2011), 1) being a channel for sharing information about resource (time, expertise, support) and job information; 2) being information channel to provide learning support and opportunity, skill training or prior support for business development; 3) creating collective power or action or voluntary support

for social campaign or escorting aspiration for an area's development affairs. This study builds an assumption that the use of social media to make poverty issue the agenda of setting government and people's discourse should be promoted. Nevertheless, its use should anticipate the variables inhibiting and supporting the strength of character owned by social media.

This study proposes a proposition that the effectiveness of social media intervenes with poverty issue, depending on the intensity of poverty issue information stimulation and the quality of feedback management. The intensity of information on poverty issue can be indicated with the publication of poverty data and poverty overcoming program through the government-officially owned social media. The quality of feedback management refers to local government's response and facebook account organizer's simulation in involving other communities in responding to poverty issues threw by participants in social media. The proposition putatively characterizing the function of social media in the term of poverty issue is that it cannot ensure social justice in this case, poverty issue, but it can influence the intangible factors that are actually inhibiting the effectiveness of social justice issue management, for example: people's apathy. In this matter, social media can be use to campaigning against people's apathy.

The next section will be explained about utilizing social media related to the issue of poverty alleviation in the green of institutional theory. From the perspective of institutional theory, studying the effectiveness of social media for addressing poverty issues should include analysis on environment factors affecting the institutional function of social media, including components of a communication process, such as communicator, message, medium, and audience or receiver.

Basic principle of institutional theory used to explain it is that individual and institutional actions as well as aspects of administrative and management practices are affected by symbolic, culture, and broader social aspect where the organization lives. Institution variable reflects the pattern of cultural factors that is inherent to and is legitimated in the institution and society. Therefore, institutional theory concerns with the effect of regulation order, social aspect, norm, belief, and culture in strengthening an organization's sustainability and its institutional practice legitimacy (Dacin, Goodstein, Scott, 2002; Kostove, Roth, Dacin, 2008; Fung, 2010). A component of institutional theory is isomorphism concept as "constraining process" compelling one unit of population to have shape or characteristic similar to other units dealing with the same environment (DiMaggio and Powell, 1983). An organization, in institutional theory, will maintain its existence from external pressure with self-adaptation. One of its examples is mimetic isomorphism, the process in which an organization imitates other successful organizations, despite not due to a motivation to be more efficient. The establishment of city government's official facebook account for people is an example of mimetic isomorphism, as it imitates other areas considered as "smart" when operating social media as a means of communicating with people.

This use of institutional theory to explain the phenomenon of social media use by city government is inspired with Orlikowski and Barley's (2001) opinion that this

analysis can be used to "develop a more structural and systemic understanding for how technologies are embedded in complex interdependent social, economic, and political networks, and how they are consequently shaped by such broader institutional influences". In this context, institutional theory is used to explain variables putatively contributing to create the social media using behavior among city government and society (people). This builds on the proposition that adoption and implementation of information technology is not merely technical issue, but also affected by the following factors, i) social environment context of the organization; ii) human's capability of mastering technology; iii) technology use incentive; and iv) enforcement of technology implementation (Welch & Pandey, 2006; Fountain, 2001; Garson, 2000).

In the context of social media use, the collaborative strategy of overcoming poverty is affected by the culture of local bureaucratic and community. The extent to which the information related to poverty data and poverty policy is transparently and massively published through social media is affected by the transparency, belief, and commitment to the optimization of social media function by Tim Koordinasi Penangulangan Kemiskinan Daerah or TKPKD (Local Poverty Alleviation Coordinating Team). Whether or not TKPKD is committed in making social media as the instrument of communicating, informing, educating and advocating poverty issue will affect its function optimization. Similarly, this local culture will legitimate the public officials based on the level of comfort and acceptance of the society in using the social media as an open, transparent, and egalitarian media in communicating with the government about poverty issues. The more active and critical use of social media by the citizen will enable them to put pressure to the government concerning poverty issues.

In this article, institutional theory is used to explain the government's and social media users' perception on the incentive leading them to use social media in poverty issue and how the power relation affects the incentive. What the article means by the power relation includes the one between governmental organizations and community, and the power relation between groups in the community.

RESEARCH METHOD

This research was conducted in one of the city in Central Java, Indonesian that has won Smart City Award twice in the past 3 years for small city category. This research employed mixed methods: content and perception analyses, and the reason underlying the actor's behavior of using facebook account "Monggo Lapor". Content analysis was conducted on 196 postings in facebook "Monggo Lapor. The informants of research were, i) society group (S) consisting of 60 community members included into the list of city's poor family according to the Mayor's Decree; ii) Government (G) element as an administrator in charge of responding to the complaints from 29 OPDs (Organisasi Perangkat Daerah/Local Government Agency) consisting of 29 persons. The informants of research were ensured that their name and identity would not be mentioned related to the information they gave.

The procedure of data collection was as follows.

Firstly, the data was collected using documentation technique by capturing posts and comments published during May 2017 - May 2018 in the Monggo Lapor Facebook group which is the social media-based complain management system initiated and managed by the city's Tim Penanganan Pengaduan Masyarakat or TPPM (Public Complain Management Team). The categories used in the content analysis are, a) the issue addressed in the post/comments; b) the gender of the user posting the information/comments; c) the governments responses to the posts/comments.

Secondly, alongside with content analysis, this study also used questionnaire, interviews and focus group discussion (FGD) to explore government's and community's preference in using social media for addressing poverty issues. Technique of collecting data used was firstly questionnaire distributed to the organizer of city government's facebook account and several city government apparatuses having duty and function related to the organizer of public information, and local poverty overcoming team. Questionnaire was distributed to identify the apparatuses' perception on the operation of Facebook account "Mongo Lapor" including: reason of use, facebook use frequency, and feedback mechanism. Having processed the questionnaire and categorizing the result, the author contacted again the informants to be interview via whatsapp, phone, or face-to-face meeting, to confirm anything needing further explanation. Quantitative data measuring the perception was processed using frequency tabulation to score average perception of apparatuses and people on the facebook media use.

Perception was identified through 12 question items to measure whether or not the implementation of social media facebook "monggo lapor" contributes significantly to involving public participation and sharing information in the attempt of speeding up the poverty alleviation program. The questions posed to government and people are as follows, i) what are the reasons of using official account facebook "Monggo Lapor'?; ii) do local government/society think that using social media technology "monggo lapor" is able to "promote the effective involvement of citizens in the improvement of poverty reduction program?; iii) do local government/society think that using social media technology "monggo lapor" is able to promote the sharing knowledge needed to improve poverty reduction program effectively?

From the result of content analysis and questionnaire, several propositions were developed to be the material of confirmation and result triangulation in Focus Group Discussion Program, and followed with qualitative analysis. The qualitative data collected by interviews and FGD was analyzed using constructivism interpretative approach, in order to identify and to explain contextual factors resulting in biased behaviors and tendencies of paradox in the use of social media to improve the public service and governance related poverty reduction policy. Data validation was conducted using triangulation of data sources and data collection methods.

The propositions used as basic analysis framework was developed from the institutional a theory approach, which assume that the effectiveness of technology implementation is affected by the following environmental

factors, 1) the use of social media by the government in communication with the citizens is affected by the need to build an image of a "smart city", which is an image that is complied with the global value; 2) the use of social media by the citizen is affected by their belief in the social media's usefulness for fulfilling their needs; 3) the social media users' response is affected by the adequacy of information supply; 4) the optimization of dialog in the social media dialog is affected by the level of sensitivity of the issue discussed.

The reference used to interpret the result of FGD and interview was the component of institutional theory stating that individual and institutional actions as well as the aspects of administrative and management practices are affected by symbolic system, culture, and broad social aspect where the organization lives. The elements underlying the interpretation are, 1) value, norm, and culture: what value, norm, and culture elements do affect city government and people's behavior and action related to the use of social media "Monggo Lapor"; 2) what the implication of the effect of value, norm, and culture is to the effectiveness of social media "Monggo Lapor" substantive function for poverty alleviation issue discourse.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This study finds during the period of May 2017 - May 2018, there were 196 users who posted complains, information, and comments about various public service issues in facebook account "monggo lapor". Among the users, there are 170 (87%) males and 26 (13%) females. Based on the issues discussed, the majority of the users' posts (70%) are addressing the issues related to public facilities, such as damaged street lights, congested sewer, and jammed public water service, and only 30% of all the posts that contain poverty issues. The lack of posts concerning poverty issues is quite interesting, because information concerning poverty data and issues are readily provided online by the local Bureau of Statistics, NGO (such as Strategic Alliance for Poverty Alleviation or SAPA Indonesia), and several online news media (jateng. merdeka.com, radarsemarang.com). The presence of information related to poverty in the online media has caught the social media users' attention. Why is the proportion of discussion about poverty issue so small in the social media?

Institutional theory stated that regulation order, social aspect, norm, trust, and culture affect institutional practice. Departing from this theory, the author identifies the apparatuses and the people's perceptions to explain their behavior of using facebook "Monggo Lapor", thereby can explain the logical framework of "Why is the proportion of discussion about poverty issue so small?" The author conducted triangulation by interviewing the members of TKPKD (Local Poverty Alleviation Coordination Team), consisting of combined government and community elements. The result of interview can be summarized below.

The result of identification on local government informants' perception related to the question "What is the reason of using official facebook account "Monggo Lapor'?" shows that most informants follow time development like other areas to meet the mandate of city's image as smart city (70%). The second reason is in order to be closer to and to communicate with community more quickly (30%). Informants have similar answers as well:

"Monggo Lapor is a component meeting the assessment element of smart city. Social media official account owned by government is a trend following the time development".

This data confirms the assumption built by institutional theory that a surviving mechanism of an organization is to adapt to external pressure. This measure is called institutional theory as mimetic isomorphism, the process in which an organization imitates other successful ones, despite not due to motivation to be more efficient. The establishment of city government's official facebook account for people is an example of mimetic isomorphism, as it imitates other areas considered as "smart' when operating social media as a means of communicating with people.

Meanwhile, viewed from community aspect, out of 60 poor family samples, 65% (39 persons) have facebook account, 48% (19 persons) of which or 31% of total poor family samples know and are connected to "Monggo Lapor". The low proportion of poor families connected to "Monggo Lapor" potentially confirms the emergence of democratic-elitist paradox. This paradox occurs when social media that should be a means to carry on democracy overthrowing the stratification of social-economic group instead is still dominated by the groups with excess power (elitist), so that the poor group issues have not been revealed adequately.

The result of research shows that 100% informants state that the reason of why poor group is connected to facebook "Monggo Lapor" is to find out information from City Government. From this data, it can be seen that facebook media seems to be a very potential means of communicating with people from poor group, because those connected to this account say that their reason is to follow the development of information from city government. Thus, the information coverage of government's facebook account should be socialized more broadly, particularly among poor groups. It is intended to cope with information discrepancy among poor groups. Those who know information from social media can be an agent of disseminating information conventionally, using words of mouth, through neighbor or coworker chains.

The low intensity of discussion about poverty issues in government's facebook account "Monggo Lapor" as aforementioned seems to be affected by apparatus environment as a result of mimetic isomorphism, the action of imitating despite subtleness. This phenomenon can be categorized into the problem of apparatuses' poor commitment to optimizing the function of social media. Consequently, facebook "Monggo Lapor" has not functioned optimally yet as dialogic media between government and community (people), despite the clear organizer of facebook account structurally, Public Relations Division of Local Secretariat.

The result of analysis on the response to question "Do policymakers / society think that using social media technology "Monggo Lapor" is promote the effective involvement of citizens in the improvement of poverty reduction program?" shows that generally apparatuses

are sure that social media is very useful to reach public support and participation in poverty alleviation program (90%). However the result of content analysis shows that government does not give adequate information stimulant to attract the group participants in facebook. The constraint the administrator of "Monggo Lapor" encounters is that it cannot publish information bravely as long as there is no instruction from superior or other Service memo. As a result, "Monggo lapor" account is still a one-way information rather than dialogical forum. Bureaucratic cultural environment generates functional-artificial paradox. This paradox represents a condition in which formally the form of social media as the symbol of e-governance characterized with multistakeholders participation in dealing with public affairs based on information has been existent, but functionally it still indicates the domination of one-way communication. In other words, the presence of facebook "Monggo Lapor" is still on artificial level, rather than on functional substantive level.

The data from interviews and FGD were analyzed to identify informants' perception on the importance of social media to poverty policy advocacy. Some informants from government offices (G) state that poverty-specific complaint should be properly responded and addressed, but the government has difficulty to provide special staff to manage the posts / comments from the citizen through social media. The other issue identified from the interview data is the inconsistency of the answers concerning the presence of social media dealing specifically with poverty issues. One informants said that the social media is managed by the Social Service office, yet another informant pointed that the BAPPEDA (Local Development Planning Agency) who has the social media account, and still another informant said that the social media concerning poverty issues are present in the kalurahan (sub district) office, and finally some informants said that they do not aware of any social media use to address poverty issues.

The inconsistent answers from informants could be interpret that there has been no clear regulation governing the use of social media and no collective belief within the government in the importance of social media use particularly to address poverty issues. Nevertheless, all government informants stated that they know the existence of city government's Monggo Lapor official account in Facebook. They have similar answers: Monggo Lapor is a component fulfilling the element of smart city assessment, and the government-owned social media account is an effort to follow the trend in the recent era. This explanation is consistent with institutional theory in which ICT application by local government is triggered by incentive to be obtained. This findngs support to proposition 1 which is stated above: "The use of social media by the government in communication with the citizens is affected by the need to build an image of a "smart city".

Viewed from poor family community, very few (30%) questions the problem related poverty alleviation policy, the problems of education grant and health service for poor families. Meanwhile, 70% of "Monggo Lapor" account room is accessed by people to report some cases indirectly affecting the poverty alleviation. The result

of in-depth interview with informants of poor families shows that they are afraid of being blamed when posting something in the group. The informant from community element responded similarly:

"I am reluctant to question or to comment about something in "monggo lapor", because I am afraid to be false, I feel that I do not know much, and I am afraid of being blamed.

The poor group informants' reluctance reflects on their inferiority, so that culturally they think that it is better for them not to speak up to avoid the infringement of politeness order. It is a part of cultural environment affecting the behavior of a social institution's members, as suggested by Institutional Theory.

Online interview with the members of community who have utilized Monggo Lapor explains why they do not report the cases of poverty or do not ask for information about poverty. Generally the informants coming from society group give similar answer: they do not ask for information because they do not experience the problem directly and do not know any information about poverty, and there is no information from both government and other society group that trigger the discussion about poverty issues.

This phenomenon shows that message concerning poverty from communicator (both government and other related parties) is very limited; this limitation then inhibits the response from the public. Government does not post enough information on poverty issue because of susceptible political risks. Consequently, social media user activists acquire inadequate information; therefore they cannot give advocacy about poverty issue through social media. This situation is matched to proposition 3:"the social media users' response is affected by the adequacy of information supply." Furthermore, this condition proves what the theory calls as non-technical variable inhibiting ICT. Analysis on the profile of the users of Monggo Lapor indicates that they do not belong to the poor group, thereby proving that ICT use and its institutionalization are affected by the users' social environment. The findings support to proposition 2 stated above: "The use of social media by the citizen is affected by their belief in the social media's usefulness for fulfilling their needs"

Although cellular phone and internet access has penetrated into all classes of society, the "oral" habit, which is one of the society's cultures, inhibit the utilization of ICT for poverty issue. From the result of FGD with members of community group, this study finds that they prefer to come directly to the mayor or the members of the Local Legislative Council to discuss public issues and to ask for help. An informant from this group stated that he actually has a Facebook account, but he never writes about poverty issue on social media as he has no self confidence and he is afraid to write a report that can be read by many people. Some informants said that they have no social media account. It indicates that social-cultural environment affect the effectiveness of social media use, as stated in proposition 2, namely "The use of social media by the citizen is affected by their belief in the social media's usefulness for fulfilling their needs."

The result of analysis on the answer to question "Do

policymakers/society think that using social media technology "Monggo Lapor" is able to promote the sharing knowledge needed to improve poverty reduction program effectively" shows that apparatuses and community has an expectation to the usefulness of facebook as a means of sharing experience. Informants from Government state:

"social media has evidently accelerated the flow of information and complaint from people to government for public service problem, so social media should also be used to disseminate concern with poverty alleviation issue to community, business realm, and academician."

Meanwhile the answer of informants from community (poor family group):

" I am glad to follow the writings posted in government group… because I can know much information… and then can deliver it to my friends needing the information…"

Nevertheless, there are some constraints coming from social and bureaucratic cultures affecting the effectiveness of social media use for poverty issue. The constraint coming from bureaucratic environment is information confidentiality risk factor.   Further analysis on Monggo Lapor shows that the issues and answers posted in are those having no adverse risk to government's image. The user posts/reports that are immediately responded and followed-up by the account's Administrator are those that can be handled easily, such as repairing physical damage of road; tree cutting; and light repairing. It indicates that although there are some interactions between the government and the citizen using social media, but mainly about "soft/easy" or general issues, while sensitive issues such as poverty are not touched in the communication using social media. This is findngs support proposition iv: "The optimization of dialog in the social media dialog is affected by the level of sensitivity of the issue discussed."

The findings of this research generally show that social media use for addressing poverty issue has not been effective. Other interesting finding is the presence of paradox of social media. Social media is egalitarian and transparent to everyone, but in practice it becomes a means of reinforcing legitimacy and interest of groups who possess excessive power source, for example: government, non-poor group, and group with broader social network. User's profile in this case also showed that women are less participative than men, so there is gender gap in the using of social media.

CONCLUSION

This study concludes that social media use for e-governance is encouraged massively by global imperialism of communication technology, which is penetrating through smart governance discourse and reinforced with incentive system imposed by Indonesian government in the form of "Smart City Awards". The findings of this research generally show that social media use for addressing poverty issue has not been effective.

There are two types of paradoxes found in social media use for poverty issues, i) democratic elitist; ii) functional-artificial paradoxes. The paradox of the social media is that although its character should be egalitarian and can be used to support the public interest, but on the other hand it has been used as a means of reproducing power and fulfilling group interest for those possessing excessive power. It can be seen from the substance of messages in the social media which reveal the self-interest or group-interest reinforcement phenomenon in the group with stronger social network therefore has a capability of voicing their interest more confidently. It indirectly reinforces elitist domination in the utilization of e-governance supporting social media. The author calls this phenomenon found the democratic-elitist paradox.

Another paradoxical phenomenon can be inferred from the type of information posted by government and follow-up response expressed in social media containing issue not harming the stability and impacting on the government's negative image. Thus, government can use social media as a means of reproducing power and reinforcing the well-established power relation. The author calls this phenomenon found the functional-artificial paradox. In other words, in formal-artificial manner, there has been a format of social media for government-community relation, but functionally there is biased usefulness.

This study recommends city governments to reinforce the management aspect of information publication and feedback response. The use of official / government social media account to support poverty overcoming policy strategy should increase the frequency, variety, and quality of information disseminations, in order to trigger open public discussions on poverty issues. Government should put administration staffs that manage and respond to information / reports, complaints, aspirations, and comments from the citizen quickly as the representation of government's social accountability to the public. Further researches are recommended to explore and formulate social media readiness model particularly for an inclusive poverty alleviation policy.

REFERENCES

Afridi, A., 2011. Social networks: their role in addressing poverty. *In JRF programme paper Poverty and Ethnicity*. York, UK: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Bryer, T.A. 2010. *Across the Great Divide: Social Media and Networking for Citizen Engagement*. In Connected Communities: Local Governments as a Partner in Citizen Engagement and Community Building, A White prepared for the Alliance for Innovation, James Svara and Janet Denhardt (eds.), pp 73-79.

Carr, C.T. & Hayes, R.A. 2015. Social Media: Defining, Developing, and Divining. *Atlantic Journal of Communication*. Vol. 23, No. 1, pp. 46-65.

Dacin, M.T., Goodstein, G., Scott, W.R. 2002. Institutional Theory and Institutional Change, Introduction to Special Research Fotum. *Academy of Management Journal*. Vol. 45, No. 1, pp. 45-57.

de Oliveira, G.H.M., 2013. The Paradox of Social Media: Risks for the Public Sector. Paper presented for *the PAT-NET 2013 Conference*, San Francisco, May 30 - June 2.

DiMaggio, Paul J. and Walter W. Powell. 1983. The Iron Cage Revisited: Institutional Isomorphism and Collective Rationality in Organizational Fields.

American Sociological Review 48:147–160.

Eggers, W.D., 2004. *Government 2.0: Using technology to improve education, cut red tape, reduce gridlock, and enhance democracy*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield.

Focus Economics. 2018. *The poorest countries in the world*. Online source: https://www.focus-economics.com/blog/the-poorest-countries-in-the-world. Retrieved on April 7, 2018.

Fountain, J.E., 2001. *Building the virtual state: Information technology and institutional change*. Washington, DC: Brookings Institution.

Fung, T., 2010. Asian Management Research needs more Self Confidence: Reflection on Hostede and Beyond. *Asia Pacific Journal of Management*, Vol. 27, No. 1, pp. 155-170.

Garson, G.D., 2000. Information systems, politics and government: Leading theoretical perspectives. In *Handbook of information systems*, ed. G. David Garson, pp. 591-609. New York, NY: Marcel Dekker.

Kaplan, A.M. & Haenlein, M., 2010. Users of the world, unite. The challenges and opportunities of Social Media. *Business Horizons*, Vol. 53, No. 1, pp. 59–68.

Katadata. 2018. Berapa jumlah pengguna internet di Indonesia? Online source: https://databoks. katadata.co.id/datapublish/2018/02/20/berapa-jumlah-pengguna-internet-di-indonesia. Retrieved on May 20, 2018.

Kompas. 2018. Riset ungkap pola pemakaian medsos orang Indonesia. Online source: https://tekno.kompas.com/read/2018/03/01/10340027/riset-ungkap-pola-pemakaian-medsos-orang-indonesia. Retrieved on May 20, 2018.

Kostova, R.; Roth, K.; Dacin, M.T., 2008. Institutional Theory in the Study of Multinational Corporation: A Critique and New Direction. *Academy of Management Practices and Social Change Review*. Vol. 33, No. 4, pp. 994-1006.

Lopez, M.L. and Stack, C.B. 1998. *Social And Cultural Theories of Poverty: Community Practices and Social Change. Paper prepared for the Aspen Roundtable Project on Race and Community Revitalization*. Online source: https://www.aspeninstitute.org/content/uploads/files/content/up-load/18Stack.pdf.

McLennan, S.J., 2016. Techno-optimism or Information Imperialism: Paradoxes in Online Networking, Social Media and Development. *Information Technology for Development*. Vol. 22, No. 3, pp. 380-399.

Mehmet Zahid Sobaci, M.Z. 2016. *Social Media and Local Governments Theory and Practice*. USA: Springer

Noveck, B.S., 2009. W*iki government: How technology can make government better, democracy stronger, and citizens more powerful*. Washington, DC: Brookings Institution Press.

Noveck, B.S., 2011. *Defining open government*. Online source: http://cairns.typepad.com/blog/ 2011/04/whats-in-a-name-open-gov-we-gov-gov-20-collaborative-government. Retrieved on May 20, 2018.

Orlikowski, W. J., & Barley, S. R. 2001. Technology and institutions: What information systems research and organization studies can learn from each other. *MIS Quarterly*. Vol 25, pp. 145–165.

Wahyunengseh, R.D., Mulyono, A. 2016. ICT and Pseudo-Governance Trap (A Case Study of SMS Pandan and Ulas in Surakarta City), 3rd International Conference on Social and Political Sciences. *The Impacts of Information Technology on Social and Political Dynamics*. Surakarta, November 2-3, 2016. https://knepublishing.com/index.php/Kne-Social/article/view/890/2306.

Welch, E.W. & Pandey, S.K. 2006. E-Government and Bureaucracy: Toward a Better Understanding of Intranet Implementation and Its Effect on Red Tape. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*. Vol. 17, No. 3, pp. 379-404.

West, D.M. 2004. E-Government and the Transformation of Service Delivery and Citizen Attitudes. *Public Administration Review*, Vol. 64 No. 1, pp. 15-27.

Wright, D.K. & Hinson, M.D. 2009. Examining How Public Relations Practitioners Actually are Using Social Media. *Public Relations Journal*, Vol. 3, No. 3, pp. 2-32.